

MR. CHAIRMAN : There must be some reasonableness on the part of Members in putting their question. The question has been repeated. The answer has been given and the answer has been repeated. Why do we waste the time of the House? Mr. Chatterjee.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Are you satisfied with the answer?

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE : It is admitted that in the report of the Kothari Commission, which is known as the Education Commission, it was clearly and specifically recommended that the students should have a share in the management of Universities. In view of that recommendation, will the hon'ble Education Minister inform the House of the steps the Education Ministry have taken to implement that recommendation of the Kothari Commission. The importance of the question has increased in view of the fact that in certain Universities the management is not quite desirable as in the case of the Burdwan University, in the case of the North Bengal University. It is known to the hon'ble Education Minister that in the latter the Vice-Chancellor imported rowdies and goondas inside the campus of the University in order to beat up the students, and the same rowdies and goondas beat up certain Posts and Telegraphs workers who went there to lay a line, and for that there were some administrative difficulties also. So will the hon'ble Minister enlighten the House of the steps being taken by him to implement the recommendations of the Kothari Commission to associate students in the management of the Universities?

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD : As I stated earlier the Education Commission recommended that the students should have more association in the Academic Council and also the University Court. We have recommended that to the different Universities. Now it is they who will implement. The Education Ministry cannot force them to implement. We have requested them and we have persuaded them. We have called a conference of the University Grants Commission and it is for them to implement. We can only recommend.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want your protection. I have specifically asked and Mr. Chatterjee

has specifically asked that it is not to be done by the Universities but it is to be done by the Government of India.

MR. CHAIRMAN : And an answer has been given.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : But, Mr. Chairman, my question...

MR. CHAIRMAN : You should bring a motion or a resolution if you have to discuss in detail. I cannot allow the question time to be wasted in this way.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Mr. Chairman, are you satisfied with the answer?

MR. CHAIRMAN : He has given the answer. I cannot compel him to answer in the way in which you want him to do. Please sit down. Next question.

STAFF IN AIR INDIA

*354. **DR. BHAI MAHAVIR :** †
SHRI A. D. MANI :

Will the Minister of TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that Air India is the most heavily staffed airline in the world whereas the Indian Airlines is carrying on its work with much less staff;

(b) whether it is a fact that the staff strength in Air India has doubled since 1957 whereas its fleet strength is the same; and

(c) if so, what are the reasons therefor?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (SHRIMATI JAHANARA JAIPAL SINGH) : (a) to (c) A comparison between Air-India and I.A.C. will not be realistic for the reason that Air-India is operating international services in a highly competitive field, whereas Indian Airlines mainly caters to the domestic services.

At the end of March 1958, Air-India had a fleet of 8 Super Constellations and one Dakota, a staff of 4,266 and an operating revenue of 10.81 crores. Ten years later, at the end of March, 1968, they had 9 Boeing 707 aircraft, a staff strength of

†The question was asked on the floor of the House by Dr. Bhai Mahabir.

8,265 and an operating revenue of 55.01 crores. No conclusion about Air-India being overstaffed or otherwise can be drawn from the above figures, specially because some of its staff is employed to service the aircraft of foreign operators at Delhi, Bombay and Calcutta, on maintenance work for the Indian Air Force in respect of their super Constellation aircraft, and for overhaul of Avro engines for the Indian Airlines.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR : Sir, the first part of my question has been ignored. What I asked was whether it is a fact that the Air-India, compared to other international airlines, is overstaffed. If the Air-India cannot be compared to the Indian Airlines at least it can be compared to other international airlines and we would like to know how that comparison stands. I would request the Minister to say something about this before I ask my second question.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, the absolute number of staff, on which an airline really depends, depends upon the extent of operation of that airline and the type of fleet and so on. One of the ways in which a comparison can be made is to work out what is known as "available ton kilometre per employee",—AT Km per employee. On that basis for Air-India, for example, it is 54,000; for Air France it is 56,000; for the Japanese Airlines it is 62,000. Therefore, from this reckoning this does not show that the Air-India is really in any way very greatly overstaffed as compared to the other international Airlines. Air-India is a small airline in international terms; it has only nine planes. Nevertheless, it has got to function in a very extended manner. Therefore, airlines with larger number of planes will necessarily have less people per aircraft. That does not prove that the Air-India is overstaffed.

DR. BHAI MAHAVIR : I could not follow perhaps. I do not know if the second part of the question has been answered as to whether since 1957 the number of employees has doubled but the number of fleet has remained the same. But if it has been answered, I will check up.

My second question is this. May I know, Sir, whether in the appointments in the Air-India there is some mode of appointment, some basis of selection, or is it left to the sweet will and discretion

of the top executives? May I further ask the hon'ble Minister whether he is aware of the reports that some of the chief men at the top executive ladder not only select people but they sell jobs for huge considerations in the form of graft? If that has come to the notice of the hon'ble Minister I would like to know if it is a news to him or if it has already been brought to his notice earlier?

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, the employment rules of the Corporation are laid down by the Government and the assumption necessarily is that they should follow the rules that are laid down.

As for the second problem of selling jobs I must admit, Sir, that this is the first time that I have heard of this. It is an extremely serious matter. If there is any such thing happening and if the hon'ble Member could substantiate his charge I would be very grateful. I would get it very carefully examined. To the best of my knowledge no such incident is reported to me or mentioned in public to me till today.

SHRI A. D. MANI : Sir, this comparison of the staffing of the Air-India and other airlines in the world has been done by an efficient book on air travel. Statistics have been published and they point out that the Air-India is the most heavily staffed airline. The hon'ble Minister said that for servicing the foreign craft which come to India some staff has got to be engaged. We also have got reciprocal facilities in New York, London, etc. One item cancels out the other. May I ask him how many persons are employed—I want him to give an approximate idea of the number of personnel employed—for servicing foreign aircraft.

The second point I would like to ask is how do we compare in regard to the salary structure of our airlines and the salary structure of the airlines of other countries in the world.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, as far as the employees who are working on the maintenance of foreign aircraft is concerned, I do not really know exactly how many people there are. But I will give some indication. We handle on the whole nine international carriers in Bombay. We earn an income from that. For example, Rs. 21 lakhs was earned by Air-India

as a result of the handling of the foreign aircraft at the Indian stations. But it is a remunerative thing because this work is done on payment. Four hundred employees are used on the maintenance of the Air Force super-constellation also. Then, Sir, with regard to the question of the salary structure, I do not really think it is possible to have an international comparison of the salary structure—at least I do not have the information available with me—because the living standards in various countries differ. It may be, for example, that the American pilots or the German pilots or the Russian pilots are paid more than our people because they are more affluent countries. But I do feel that the salary structure in comparison with our own salary scales in India is extremely favourable and extremely satisfactory.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Sir, as the hon. Minister himself has stated that the available ton kilometre per employee is the standard system of calculating the staffing pattern, may I know whether it is not a fact that the staffing expenses of Air India are round about 21 per cent as against 25 per cent in the other international airlines and, if so, how does he want to justify his statement that Air India's expenditure on staffing is low? In India you are paying one-third of what is being paid abroad. So it seems your expenditure is something like 60 per cent as against 25 per cent in the other international airlines. As Mr. Mani pointed out . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : You are making a speech again—"as Mr. Mani pointed out", "as somebody else pointed out", and so on.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : No, Sir, that is the prerogative of the other side. I am only putting a specific question. May I know whether he is aware that this 21 per cent in the present standard of living compares very well with the 25 per cent in the other international airlines in the Western countries and whether he is satisfied with it?

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, if our staffing expenditure is 21 per cent as compared with 25 per cent abroad, that, in fact, proves that our staff expenditure is less.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : You are paying less.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, it is only the percentage figure which is relevant here. What we actually pay is not a relevant point. The relevant point is what percentage of our expenditure is on staff. And the hon. Member himself has given statistics which I do not have and pointed out that we are spending 21 per cent whereas the others are spending 25 per cent.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : The hon. Member is helping you.

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : I would like to know whether the attention of the Government has been drawn to the recent report of the Public Undertakings Committee wherein they have suggested that Air India should be allowed to carry internal traffic also in view of the fact that the Indian Airlines is unable to cater adequately to the needs of internal traffic; and, if so, I would like to know whether the Government is paying attention to it.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Yes, Sir, in continuation of the recommendations of the Public Undertakings Committee, we issued a directive last month to the effect that spare capacity in Air India in internal routes would be utilised for carrying internal passengers because, as was pointed out quite correctly, this was available accommodation which was going absolutely unused. So we have issued that directive.

SHRI BIREN ROY : Sir, the hon. Minister said that there are rules framed by the Government for the recruitment of Air India staff. May we know if he is prepared to lay these rules before the House? I am asking this because except for a few persons in the top echelon of Air India, others are not allowed to express their independent views as to how appointments in the higher grades will be made. Secondly, I would like to know whether recruitment in Air India is made on a State-wise basis, because Air India carried on from the time of Tatas and, therefore, recruitment should now be made on a State-wise basis in the present context of things.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Is the hon. Member suggesting that recruitment should be done State-wise?

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, the Minister cannot question a Member.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, I am asking for clarification of his question. I just wanted to understand whether the hon. Member was suggesting that Air India should recruit people on a State-wise basis ?

SHRI GODEY MURAHARI : That is what he said.

SHRI BIREN ROY : Sir, the Minister said that there are Government rules for recruitment in Air India. And Air India being owned by Government and not by a company, new recruitments should be on a State-wise basis, because otherwise these top officials will recruit their own persons.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, my impression is that not only in the Government of India but in public sector corporations also, the question of State-wise recruitment is not only not accepted, but it is perhaps illegal also because after all the whole country is one single unit. But I will certainly look into the points raised by the hon. Member.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Next question.

†IMPORT OF IRON ORE BY JAPAN

*164. SHRI GANESHI LAL CHAUDHARY : Will the Minister of TRANSPORT AND SHIPPING be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that Japan is experiencing difficulties in the matter of import of iron ore from India due to the deteriorating conditions of draft position at the Paradeep Port; and

(b) if so, what action Government have taken to ease the situation?

THE MINISTER OF TRANSPORT AND SHIPPING (PROF. V. K. R. V. RAO) : (a) and (b) Due to heavy siltation in the last monsoon, the permissible draft for ships entering Paradip Port had to be reduced in stages from 34 ft. available before the 10th July, 1968 to 28 ft. by the 15th August, 1968. The reduction in the draft resulted in the slackening of iron ore exports through this port. Various steps were immediately taken to remove

the siltation and increase the permissible draft. As a result of these steps, the permissible draft has been progressively increased to 35 ft. by the 30th November, 1968. The difficulties in effecting shipments through this port have been ameliorated to a large extent and shipments are expected to pick up.

SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA : May I know whether the export of iron ore to Japan from other ports is going on according to the target?

PROF. V. K. R. V. RAO : Sir, I would like to have notice of that question. I have not got that information readily available.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : Sir, in the last session when we discussed the deteriorating condition of Paradip Port, the Minister assured the House on the basis of the Sukrani Committee Report that contract dredging would be undertaken immediately and he would contact different parties to undertake that. In view of that assurance and in view of the fact that contract dredging should be completed by the end of March or before the monsoon, may I know from the Minister what steps have been taken by the Department concerned to see that contract dredging is undertaken immediately? May I also know in this connection whether it is not a fact that the Transport Ministry approved the question of contract dredging and contacted some foreign parties, the matter was referred to the Finance Ministry and the Finance Ministry have turned down the suggestion for the time being and have referred it back to the Transport Ministry, and the file is now lying in the Transport Ministry; as a result, the problem has not been solved up till now?

PROF. V. K. R. V. RAO : Sir, first of all, I do not think I gave an assurance that contract dredging will be undertaken immediately. I am not in a position to give any such assurance because it involves Finance . . .

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : You gave such an assurance.

PROF. V. K. R. V. RAO : Not "immediately." If you look up the record, you will see that I said 'I will try my best to see that Capital dredging is undertaken as soon as possible.' I am in no position to give any assurance of "immediate"

†Transferred from the 25th November, 1968.