

SHRI A. D. MANI : The hon. Minister in reply to part (a) of the Question said no. That may be true as far as the Ministry is concerned but my information is—and this has been published in the papers by some of the colleagues of Dr. Khorana—that he applied for a job in the Council of Indian Agricultural Research in 50s and he was denied. Then he went to the United States. The Minister does not seem to know about that. I want him to investigate that matter and lay the information on the Table of the House because this is a matter which concerns the loss of a scientist or the country.

DR. TRIGUNA SEN : I am not aware of that. But I must repeat what I said before that one need not be too unhappy about Dr. Khorana's wisdom in declining the offers made to him. If he had agreed to return to India it was not at all certain that we would have made the grade to win the Nobel Prize with the facilities that he received here.

SHRI G. A. APPAN : May I know from the hon. Minister the salary that Dr. Khorana was getting at the time of the offer from other countries and the maximum salary that was offered in this country? May I also know from him if the serious brain drain that we are facing in this country is due to the fact that these technical people and eminent scientists and technologists are put under the charge of some so-called IAS people, who are in no way better than these people in talent, who would not like these technologists and scientists of great eminence and who would not approve of their schemes to give them sufficient scope to improve their talent for the country's cause.

DR. TRIGUNA SEN : What is the question? I could not follow it.

SHRI G. A. APPAN : The salary that Dr. Khorana was getting in other countries by the time we offered it and the maximum that we offered.

DR. TRIGUNA SEN : When I quoted from his letter it was evident that it was not the money or the salary that attracted him. It was the laboratory and other facilities to do research, which were made available to him. That was the main thing. I do not believe that

Dr. Khorana was drawn to America only for the sake of salary or money.

SHRI AKBAR ALI KHAN : It is evident from your answer that he went out because there were no facilities. Is the Ministry doing something to provide those facilities, as far as possible, so that other brilliant men may not leave this country?

DR. TRIGUNA SEN : We tend to become emotional and subjective in our approach and even forget that we already in our country have a million of them. Are we doing enough to recognise the competence of those who have chosen to stay at home? We have not done so. Most of them, who have gone abroad, are patriots, I believe, but we cannot expect them to live by patriotism alone. Facilities must be there. In India, in our existing economic . . .

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : It is a very dangerous doctrine that he is advocating.

DR. TRIGUNA SEN : What is the dangerous doctrine, I do not understand. To my mind the real solution lies in the economic growth of the country on the basis of which there can be enough opportunities which we can offer to our young scientists. Now, Mr. Arora is raising the point, again and again, about this nationality business. For his information, I can tell him this. The important point about the American Nobel Laureates is that of the 66 American Nobel awardees, 23 or more, i.e.; one-third, were not Americans by birth. In Physics out of 23 Americans Nobel laureates, 11 come from other countries; in Medicine and Physiology ten out of thirteen American Nobel laureates are from other countries. So, it does not matter to which country he belongs. It is an international scientific body.

REPORTS OF ADMINISTRATIVE REFORMS COMMISSION

*212. **SHRI KRISHAN KANT† :**

SHRI RIZAQ RAM :

SHRI R. P. SINHA :

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state the number of reports which have so far been submitted by the Administrative

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Krishan Kant.

Reforms Commission and the subjects to which these reports relate?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA) : The Administrative Reforms Commission has so far submitted the following seven reports :—

1. Problems of redress of citizens' grievances.
2. Machinery for planning (interim report).
3. Machinery for planning (final report).
4. Public sector undertakings.
5. Finance, accounts and audit.
6. Economic Administration.
7. The machinery of the Government of India and its procedures of work.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : May I know from the Government what was the period within which the Administrative Reforms Commission was expected to complete its work and how much work it has yet to complete? At the moment not even half the work has been done. Is it going to work for a hundred years? How much money has been spent by the ARC up till now?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : No time-limit was stipulated in the original terms of reference and the Commission was expected to submit its report as soon as practicable and as soon as possible. They have taken more time than they themselves expected. But looking to the novelty of the work and the persons who have been involved in the study teams, working groups, etc., who are busy people in their own fields, some delay is bound to take place. Neither the Commission nor we are happy about it. But looking at the job they have undertaken, this amount of delay was probably inevitable.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Expenditure.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : So far, up to last month, the expenditure was a little more than half a crore . . .

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : How much in foreign exchange?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : . . . and it is expected that they will need about Rs. 9,48,400 more by the time they finish their work.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : May I know from the Minister if it is a fact that the ARC was appointed by a Resolution of the Ministry of Home Affairs—because 'administration' is in charge of the Home Ministry—and one of the reports of the ARC—the machinery of the Government—stipulates that the implementation of the ARC reports has to be done not by the Home Ministry, but by somebody else? Is he going to divest himself of this work? Why are they reporting like that?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : They are free to recommend anything. That does not affect their original appointment. The decision to appoint the Administrative Reforms Commission was naturally that of the Government and not that of the Home Ministry. But if they make that recommendation, it can be examined. That recommendation has no bearing on our present working and it does not reflect upon our relationship with them. How can the hon. Member or anybody else question how they should feel or how they should not feel? In their own wisdom they have studied the matter and have made a recommendation which we shall examine.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : The question is whether they have made such a recommendation.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I am not at present aware of it. I will have to find out.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : This is a very important recommendation and it concerns the Home Ministry. He says he does not know it.

MR. CHAIRMAN : All right. Mr. Dharia.

SHRI M. M. DHARIA : Is it a fact that, while deciding the terms of reference, the Government has nowhere spelt out the social objectives and the sense of purpose for which the ARC is meant? When his House and the other House have resolved that we want a socialist society in this country, a democratic, socialist country, may I know whether the ARC has been told

that we want a socialist democratic society in this country and it is on those lines that we want reports from them? Secondly, is it not a fact that the terms of reference are absolutely wide? It is not only administration of the Central Government, but also the administration of the State Governments has to be looked into. If it is true, may I know from the hon. Minister how it is possible for the ARC to do that job within the Rs. 9 lakhs which they have demanded and how is it possible for them to submit reports for years together? Will the Ministry consider steps to revise their terms of reference which are absolutely wide? Instead of having some purposeful job—with due respect to the ARC—they have been doing more harm than good.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : The terms of reference were laid on the Table of the House. It is true that no social objectives have been spelt out in this.

SHRI M. M. DHARIA: What is the use of this Commission?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : That is a different question. Secondly, the additional sum of Rs. 9 lakhs, which has been demanded, is not for looking into the State administration or district administration. They have already appointed working groups and task forces to do the work. The additional money they require is to finish the remaining work.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : When do they expect to finish?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : We have allotment and continuation reports till the end of the current financial year. As to whether it will be possible for them to submit all their reports and finish their work by this time they have not indicated in so many words, but that is our expectation.

(Interruptions).

SHRI M. M. DHARIA : Mr. Chairman, my submission is that, having regard to the terms of reference, it will not at all be possible for the ARC to submit all their reports, as has been said just now. Under these circumstances will the Government reconsider the terms of reference? My question was very specific. I have not received any reply. Instead of looking at the admini-

stration as a whole many times certain individuals are kept before the eyes and in order to accommodate them the reports are submitted. That is the state of affairs.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : The Commission's work is now in the finishing stages. This is not the stage in which the terms of reference can be revised.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : From the reply of the hon. Minister it appears that already seven reports were complete or interim reports have been submitted by the A.R.C. May I know from the hon. Minister whether those reports have been taken into consideration by the Government and, if considered, whether they have come to any decisions so far?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Yes, Sir. We have considered the reports that have been given, and we have also taken decisions on certain reports. We have made statements from time to time on the progress about these things. For instance, on the report on problems of redress of citizens' grievances a Bill was drawn up and it was brought to the hon. House. Now it is under the consideration of a Joint Select Committee. About machinery for planning the hon. Prime Minister made a statement about it and then it has also been examined and certain decisions have been taken.

SHRI CHITTA BASU : What are those decisions?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : If the hon. Member wishes and if you permit me, Sir, I am prepared to lay a statement on the Table of the House giving particulars about this.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Sir, I would like to submit. . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : You have already put your question. I do not like a Member to intervene many times. You have been given an opportunity. You put two questions. Therefore, you should restrain yourself. If you have any more doubts, ask the Minister outside.

SHRI KRISHAN KANT : Sir, I have a submission to make. When a statement is laid on the Table of the House, you will kindly permit us a discussion.

SHRI RAM NIWAS MIRDHA : As was just now mentioned, seven reports have been submitted by the A.R.C. and some of the suggestions have also been accepted by the Government. Those reports are very learned in tone, impressive in size and also contain some useful suggestions. What I feel is that these big volumes may just lie in the Secretariat collecting dust. May I know whether the Government has evolved any machinery by which these reports could be processed. Whether individual Ministries would do it or whether the Home Ministry would do it, whether there is going to be any procedure by which the various suggestions given are processed and some use made of the sum of half a crore that has been given to this shady enterprise?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : It is wrong to say it is a shady enterprise. It is very unfair to say anything like that. Definite machinery and definite procedure have been set up in Government to examine and process these reports quickly.

AN HON. MEMBER: What is that?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Please hear me. Do not be impatient. Committees of senior Secretaries under the Chairmanship of the Cabinet Secretary were formed, and the Cabinet has also referred matters to teams of its own to look into it, and for final decisions it goes to the entire Cabinet, and the Department of Administrative Reforms which is in the Home Ministry processes, services and co-ordinates the entire thing.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : May I know if the Government realises that to hurry in a matter like this may be dangerous . . .

SHRI AKBAR ALI KHAN : No question of hurry.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : . . . because the Government should be aware—though Mr. Chandra Shekhar is not—that the Hoover Commission in America took seven years to submit its report on the Central Administration in the U.S.A. Here the terms of reference of the Administrative Reforms Commission are so wide that they have to make recommendations about Central administration, States administration, Local administration and Panchayat administration. Their terms are much wider

than those of the famous Hoover Commission of America. If the Hoover Commission took seven years, why are we worried after three years?

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : As has been rightly pointed out, this Administrative Reforms Commission has not been given specific terms of reference particularly in regard to economic and social conditions and our aims in that direction. Whatever reports have been published, is the Government at least aware that particularly the report on co-operation is absolutely a report to liquidate the entire Department? In this connection may I humbly request the Government to put all those reports in cold storage and close the Administrative Reforms Commission and ask the gentlemen to work in Parliament itself because there is no other work that can be achieved by this Commission, because in every respect the private sector attitude has been reflected in all the reports on economic activities?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : This is the opinion of the hon. Member.

SHRI A. D. MANI : we have repeatedly tried to find out information on how much the Administrative Reforms Commission has cost the exchequer. Each member of the Commission has a motor car at his disposal. This is a thing which I want to bring to the notice of the Minister, and we have accepted that this Reforms Commission is a part of our Constitution as Parliament is a part of our Constitution itself. May I ask on what basis did he say that the Commission is expected to conclude its deliberations by the end of the year? In the same answer he has said that the Commission has not intimated any time limit. My information is that more study teams reports are being contemplated. Will the Minister deny that?

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : I have made the whole position very clear. I have said that we have renewed the posts of officers who are working in the Commission till the end of the current financial year. It is our expectation that work would be over by then, but the Commission itself has not indicated any time limit so far. This is what I have already said.

SHRI AKBAR ALI KHAN : You said they wanted it to be finished soon, by the end of the year.

श्री राम सहाय : क्या मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जान सकूंगा कि अभी आपने यह फरमाया कि इस कमीशन के टर्म्स आफ रिफ्रेंस बहुत वाइड हैं और उनके बहुत वाइड होते हुये क्या यह विचार आपका है कि वे जो कुछ कर रहे हैं वह अपने टर्म्स आफ रिफ्रेंस के अन्दर ही कर रहे हैं ।

श्री विद्या चरण शुक्ल : जी, हाँ ।

MR. CHAIRMAN : Next question.

OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY OF INDIAN AIRLINES

*213. SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : Will the Minister of TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION be pleased to refer to the reply to Starred Question No. 471 given in the Rajya Sabha on the 14th August, 1968 and state :

(a) whether further steps have since been taken to pursue and attain the higher operational efficiency in the working of the Indian Airlines ; and

(b) whether it is a fact that the Chairman of the Indian Airlines attends sparingly to the day-to-day working of the Indian Airlines and thus the Management of this huge Public Sector undertaking is left to the bureaucracy ?

THE MINISTER OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (DR. KARAN SINGH) : (a) Various measures are taken from time to time to attain a high level of operational efficiency. The inventory levels, for instance, are constantly under review. A study of the consumption of fuel by the Aircraft has also been recently made by a Consultant. Similar studies in regard to management matters, i.e. about the organisational structure, marketing and selling methods, exploring new routes and creating additional capacity have also been made with the help of the Administrative Staff College. Besides, proposals for augmentation of the fleet capacity of the Indian Airlines by purchase of more modern and operationally more economic aircraft are under consideration. The replacement of uneconomic Dakotas by HS-748 is also proceeding according to plan.

(b) No, Sir. The Chairman attends to all policy matters as well as important matters of administration, leaving

to the Management the day-to-day administration of the Corporation.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : On this very special type of efficiency questions were raised in the House on 14-8-68 and the hon. Minister had made a statement. In that statement he had given for 1967-68 certain figures which are estimates. May I know from the hon. Minister whether the final figures have been arrived at and, if so, what are they ? That is number one. Secondly, I want to know—what the hon. Minister has stated, that might be a pious wish that the I.A.C. should develop like that. But is he aware that in the Indian Airlines many pilots are without jobs a majority of them are without jobs and that only a few pilots are getting overtime because the pilots who are without work are not trained for 400 flying hours? That is why they could not run these new, what you call, skymasters which have been available with the IAC.

You say that efficiency is being arrived at by the Indian Airlines. May I know from the Minister whether it is not a fact that there was a recent proposal from a Kuwait party to charter from the Indian Airlines one or two planes? Rupees fortyeight lakhs of foreign exchange would have been earned by the IAC. I know very well that the IAC has denied this. May I know whether it is a fact ?

DR. KARAN SINGH : Sir, the hon. Member has raised three different points. Firstly with regard to the final figures for 1967-68, the final figures have in fact been received. I do not know which particular figure he is referring to. But I think the most important figure is the final profit or loss of the Corporation. Last year, that is 1967-68, the revised figures come to a loss of Rs. 38 lakhs.

The second point is with regard to the pilots. Sir, I am not aware of the fact that a large number of pilots are unemployed. The total number of pilots employed by the Indian Airlines is 428. I do not have immediate information as to how many hours each one of them flies.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI : You can enquire.