

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have now mentioned what you wanted to mention. Now Mr. Abid Ali.

SHRI A. P. JAIN (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I also noticed this news item and I must say that I was greatly perturbed. I . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry. I had permitted him to mention it. I have made a rule that when I give permission to a Member to raise a certain matter he can raise it and then I do not allow any other Member to rise and speak on it.

SHRI A. P. JAIN: Sir, I have given notice of a motion calling attention to this matter and . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall look into it.

SHRI A. P. JAIN: I am rising on a point of procedure. Sir, there is a method of raising such matters and that method is to give notice calling attention to the particular matter. I have already given a calling attention notice and . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes. I say I shall look into it. Now Mr. Abid Ali.

RE ALLEGED BREACH OF PRIVILEGE BY SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE

SHRI ABID ALI (Maharashtra): Sir, yesterday while speaking on the Finance Bill, Shri A. P. Chatterjee made certain statements about which I have to say something in order to invite your attention for you to take appropriate action.

श्री राजनारायण (उत्तर प्रदेश): श्रीमान्, आपने श्री भंडारी जी का प्वाइन्ट मुन लिया और उस पर फैसला नहीं दिया।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing more, Mr. Rajnarain.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं आपसे कहता हूँ कि जो कालिंग अटेंशन है उसका क्या होगा?

SHRI ABID ALI: Sir, the hon. Member should sit down. I have been called by you, Sir, and I am on my legs.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down, Mr. Rajnarain.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं हिसार से आ रहा हूँ। (Interruptions.) हमने भी इस संबंध में कालिंग अटेंशन नोटिस दिया है। मैं आपसे पूछना चाहता हूँ . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Rajnarain, nothing more. You sit down.

SHRI RAJNARAIN: Why?

क्यों बैठ जाऊँ ?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have asked Mr. Abid Ali to speak.

श्री राजनारायण : हमारा प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर यह है कि इस तरह से हरियाणा के चुनाव में कांग्रेस का पक्ष नहीं लिया जा सकता है। आज कांग्रेस रूल के जरिये वहाँ पर चुनावों को प्रभावित किया जा रहा है और उत्तर प्रदेश के अधिकारों का हनन किया जा रहा है।

AN HON. MEMBER: When the Chair is on its feet the Member should sit down.

श्री राजनारायण : सारी की सारी संसदीय मर्यादाओं नहीं की जा सकती है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sit down Mr. Rajnarain. I will not allow you. When I stand you cannot stand up. Please sit down.

SHRI RAJNARAIN: Point of order . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would like to tell you when the Chairman is standing you should sit down. Now, Mr. Abid Ali.

SHRI RAJNARAIN: Point of order . . मैं आपसे निवेदन करता हूँ कि हमारा वाइन्ट ऑफ ऑर्डर है . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have allowed you to raise your matter and I have allowed Mr. Bhandari to raise his matter also. Now I shall not allow anybody else to whom I have not given permission to raise a matter.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं आपसे कहता हूँ कि हरियाणा में चुनाव चल रहे हैं और कांग्रेस पार्टी उसका नानायक फगुदा उठा रही है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. no. If you go on you will be absolutely irresponsible. If this is the case I shall not allow anything to be raised which is not on the agenda for the day.

श्री राजनारायण : वहाँ पर वोटों को प्रभावित करने के लिए इस तरह की कार्यवाही की जा रही है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then you can go. This is being irresponsible and this is absolutely being indisciplined. This is very wrong. What is all this? I want to tell you this. I have given the privilege to some Members on special occasions when they have come to my chamber and said that there is an important matter which they want to raise, I give them permission. Then only the Member will raise it and sit down so that the attention of the Government may be drawn to the matter. (Interruption) Please sit down. But hereafter if people insist on getting up and talking about the matter on which I had given permission to a certain Member, then I shall not allow any discussion on any matter not mentioned in the agenda for the day. There is no question about it. Otherwise the work of the House can never go on. If things that are not on the agenda are discussed at great length it is impossible to run the House at all. I

shall not allow it or give room to anybody to go against my wishes in this manner. Nothing of that kind.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं आपसे यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि वहाँ पर इस तरह से पानी ले जाकर कांग्रेस पार्टी वोटों को प्रभावित करना चाहती है। यह सारी की सारी चीज . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am trying to be as accommodative as possible and the senior Members at least should not go against the spirit of it.

1 P.M.

श्री राजनारायण : आप अल्लिमिटेड पर्सनलिटि नहीं हैं, आप चेयरमैन हैं राज्य सभा के इस नियम में आपसे निवेदन करूंगा अपने अधिकारों के लिए निवेदन करूंगा कि मैं इस सदन का सदस्य हूँ, मैं भी एक पार्टी का प्रतिनिधित्व करता हूँ, हम वहाँ चुनाव लड़ रहे हैं और कांग्रेस पार्टी आज नहर का पानी वहाँ ले जाकर के वोटों को प्रभावित कर रही है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You put a separate motion for it.

श्री राजनारायण : अच्छा वत है, बल बहम होगा।

SHRI ABID ALI: I was mentioning that yesterday during the course of the speech Shri A. P. Chatterjee . . .

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, on a point of order. I do not know actually, how Mr. Abid Ali . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: I allowed him.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: Mr. Chairman, then you should have called me also before you gave him this permission because . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: You never came to me to discuss about anything.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: That is true, but this mainly refers to an observation made by me yesterday and before you gave him any permission I should have . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: What I am going to tell him is this. I am going to tell him that I shall look into the matter. And later on if necessary, if you are involved in the matter I shall call you.

SHRI ABID ALI: I did not speak before him; I did not utter a word when he was speaking. In spite of that he said "Mr. Pande and Mr. Abid Ali who both are of the American lobby . . ."

श्री राजनारायण : तों क्या हुआ ।

II श्री आबिद अली : घरे साई,
सुन तो लो, हम भी सुनते हैं ।

Then he says: "It is a little uneasy for them whenever there is a censure of the American interests . . . Let them not listen always to their master's voice and . . ." Then I started speaking having been called upon to speak and then he said: ". . . it is the voice of Washington." And again he remarks: ". . . and he is a person who always jumps up at the bidding of his masters . . . We know who are the CIA agents . . . Take wisdom from Washington." And lastly he says—and it is very serious—"I treat the words of a CIA agent with the utmost contempt."

Sir, only a minute I will take. It is unbecoming of a Member to make such a statement particularly concerning a Member of this hon. House and to make such aspersions continuously. These are not only untrue but also defamatory. Apart from that it is a question of privilege as well. I want this. Let the hon. Member accept this challenge and come before you and I request you to kindly . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI A. D. MANI (Madhya Pradesh): Privilege Committee.

SHRI ABID ALI: If he has any grain of decency he should accept the challenge either to prove it or he should apologise.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, I shall look into the matter.

The House stands adjourned till 2 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at four minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at two of the clock. **THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN** in the Chair.

THE FINANCE BILL, 1968—contd.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr Saiyid Nurul Hassan. I am afraid Members will have to restrict their speeches to the time-limit. Even if it is a maiden speech, it will have to be done within fifteen minutes.

PROF. SAIYID NURUL HASAN (Nominated): Madam Deputy Chairman, I am grateful to you for giving me this opportunity to address this august House for the first time. The Finance Bill has painted, I am afraid, a gloomy picture of our financial resources, a gloomy picture of the country as a whole. I would like to take the time of the House to draw your attention, Madam, to an important goal which the country had set before itself a long time ago. That goal is still accepted in theory, but in practice it is not given as much attention as should have been given, i.e., our investment in science and education is far from adequate. We are proud of the fact that when during our national movement we thought in terms of planning our economy, the Planning Committee appointed in 1938