

under certain terms. So when Mr. Chester Bowles attacked the Communists, he was attacking the Communist Party of India and he was interfering in the internal affairs of this country. So I request you, Sir, to accept the point of order of Mr. Rajnarain which is a valid one. It rarely is, but it is valid today.

SHRI RAJNARAIN: You have seen it today only.

SHRI ARJUN ARORA: Kindly direct the Minister of Foreign Affairs to come forward with a fuller statement and to lodge a proper protest against that article with the Government of the United States of America and see that this American Reporter does not repeat the mischief.

SHRI P. N. SAPRU: Ma, I say a word?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall give my ruling later. Next question.

*438. [Withdrawn.]

*439. [The questioner (Shrimati Sarla Bhadauria) was absent. For answer, vide cols. 3556-3557 infra.]

*440. [Withdrawn.]

DUTIES OF MINISTER WITHOUT PORTFOLIO AND DEPUTY MINISTERS

*441. SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether any specific responsibilities or duties have been given to the Minister without Portfolio;

(b) whether all the Deputy Ministers have been allotted portfolios; and

(c) if the reply to Parts (a) and (b) above be in the affirmative, the details thereof?

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI): (a) to
(c) A statement giving the information is laid on the Table of the House.

STATEMENT

CABINET SECRETARIAT

DEPARTMENT OF CABINET AFFAIRS

Minister without Portfolio

1. Shri Satya Narayan Sinha	Minister without Portfolio performs such functions as are assigned to him by the Prime Minister from time to time.
---------------------------------------	--

Deputy Ministers

Name of the Ministry/ Department attached to

1. Shri Bhakt Darshan	Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Transport and Shipping.
2. Shri Rohanlal Chaturvedi	Deputy Minister in the Department of Parliamentary Affairs.
3. Shri D.R. Chavan	Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Law.
4. Shri D. Ering	Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Food, Agriculture, Community Development and Cooperation.
5. Shrimati Jahanara Jaipal Singh	Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Tourism and Civil Aviation.

Deputy Ministers

6. Shri S.C. Jamir

7. Dr. (Shrimati) Sarojini Mahishi

8. Shri B.S. Murthy

9. Shri Mohd. Shafi Qureshi

10. Shri K.S. Ramaswamy

11. Shri J.B. Muthyal Rao

12. Shrimati Nandini Satpathy

13. Shri Bhanu Prakash Singh

14. Sardar Iqbal Singh

15. Shri Surendra Pal Singh

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Sir, the first item on this Statement shows the name of Shri Satya Narayan Sinha, an outstanding personality in the outgoing Cabinet and also in the present Cabinet and who also carries a lot of perfume about him when he walks.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You need not mention about perfumes.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: He is a Minister, Sir, and he is subject to any comment.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL: You can mention anything in heaven and earth and a little reference to per-fumess will not do any mischief.

(Interruptions)

SHRI A. M. TARIQ: Sir, on a point of order. The two Members are present in the House. The question

Name of the Ministry)
Department attached toDeputy Minister in the
Ministry of Railways.

Deputy Minister attached to the Prime Minister and performs such functions as are assigned to her by the Prime Minister from time to time.

Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
Health and Family Planning.Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
Commerce.Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
Home Affairs.Deputy Minister in the Department
of Parliamentary Affairs.Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
Information and Broadcasting.Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
Industrial Development and
Company Affairs.Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
Works, Housing and Supply.Deputy Minister in the Ministry of
External Affairs.

has been put by one Member (Interruptions) I
am talking to the Chair.

(Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: Sit down.

SHRI A. M. TARIQ: The point is this. The hon. Members are present in the House and the question is the property of the House. (Interruption) Please let me finish my argument. Who is in the Chair here? Is the hon. Mr. Chairman in the Chair or my hon. friend over there? Please sit down. I am addressing the Chair.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: All of you sit down please.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: The hon. Member who used to be a Member of this House and who temporarily went to the Jammu and Kashmir Government probably has forgotten all procedures here.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You go ahead.

SHRI A. M. TARIQ: How can you-----

AN HON. MEMBER: You sit down.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: The point is this. The Statement says that Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha is "Minister without Portfolio" and he "performs such functions as are assigned to him by the Prime Minister from time to time." Sir, here I would like to know what are the particular specific assignments given to him by the Prime Minister from the time he was appointed a Minister and whether these assignments were conveyed to him through any letter or any documents and, if so, the contents thereof.

SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA: Sir, on a point of order. It is absolutely the right of the Prime Minister to assign any work to any Minister during any period and it is not incumbent upon the Prime Minister to reply to the question put by Shri Lokanath Misra.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: No, no. The President issues the Notification in each case.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: I am sure Shri Satya Narayanji would not be offended at his perfume being mentioned here. Sir, this is not the first time that there is a Minister - without Portfolio either in this country or in any other country. There is nothing extraordinary about it. In this country, for instance, Shri V. K. Krishna Menon was Minister without Portfolio for fourteen months. Shri "T. T. Krishnamachari was there and Shastriji also.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri N. Gopalaswamy Ayyangar was also there for some time.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: You all know more about this than myself. I do not think it is necessary for me to trouble the House about the internal working of the Cabinet,

nor is it necessary to issue any document on this. The Minister without Portfolio will assist the Prime Minister and do whatever the Prime Minister may ask him to do.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: That is all right. But in the case of those that were mentioned here just now, for instance, Shri Lai Bahadur Shastri or even Shri Gopalaswamy Ayyangar, they were Ministers without Potfolio representing the Government in foreign countries on certain occasions.

"SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Prime Minister has the right to give such work as she pleases to the Minister without Potfolio and that cannot be questioned.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: I am not questioning that, Sir, I am not questioning that at all. What I want to know and what I want the House also to know is—since hon. Members do not know about it—*(Interruptions)* I find sir, that even Ministers are getting into the crowd, one of the Ministers at least. My point is, I want this country also to know what are the specific responsibilities given to him. *(Interruptions)* What is this? Is this a mob attack?

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is an internal matter.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: That will not do.

(Interruptions)

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: I have got to get an answer, Sir. Let me put my question.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: You may allow me to at least to put my question and get an answer.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Put a specific question.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: In the case of other Ministers we have been that, for instance, Shri Shastri was working on behalf of Shri Jawahar-lal Nehru in the House. He was replying to debates, sponsoring motions and piloting Bills. But in this case, Sir, of Shri Satya Narayan Sinha, I have not seen his face here ever since he was appointed Minister without Portfolio. I do not know if he is performing any responsibility on behalf of the Prime Minister in the other House. I would like to know that. Another question is, how much has been drawn by him since he became the Minister without Portfolio, in the shape of emoluments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That question does not arise. You put a separate question about it.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Here, Sir, you see, I am not at all questioning the right of the Prime Minister to have any Ministers without Portfolios. It is not at all questioned by me as such. Therefore, there should not be any digression. Here it is stated:

"Minister without Portfolio performs such functions as are assigned to him by the Prime Minister from time to time."

It is a statement of theory, constitutional valid theory. I am not disputing it. It does not say that the Minister without Portfolio performed such functions as had been given. It is only a general statement. Now we have a Council of Ministers and the normal conventions are followed. And the convention is that the Prime Minister assigns certain jobs. Analogy has been given of the earlier cases but in every case there was a statement from the Rashtrapati Bhavan. It had been given out that at the instance of the Prime Minister Shri Lai Bahadur Shastri will be fulfilling such and such functions, and often Prime Minister Nehru, when asked such questions, told us exactly

what the Ministers without Portfolio were doing. We are certainly entitled to have broad information; not the internal arrangement of a domestic nature, nothing of the kind. No information we have been given yet. For several months, there has been a Minister without Portfolio but to the knowledge of Parliament no function seems to have been assigned to him. Either he is surplus and needs to be retrenched or the Government has not got a function suitable for him. It must be either of the two things. Either he is not suited for the functions which the Government have on hand and which is liable to be given to others or he is patently a surplus staff in the Ministry. I should like to know why the public exchequer should bear the expenditure on a surplus staff at the Cabinet level while we find in the Government offices and other places the surplus staff is being retrenched and their retrenchment is justified by the authorities. Will the Prime Minister kindly explain this double standard?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Would you like to answer?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: Yes, I would. It is not true that any Minister is surplus or that there is no suitable work for him. But as I said, I did have certain specific things in mind when I appointed him. Unfortunately he has been in indifferent health since that time; therefore although he has attended to some of those matters but naturally he has not been able to do all that was expected.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: I would like to know from the Prime Minister, since Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha is under cloud and serious charges have been levelled against him by Mr. Arjun Arora, it is not fair either to Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha or to Mr. Arjun Arora and I would request the Prime Minister to make a statement regarding this. *(Interruptions)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is an internal matter in the party. We have nothing to do with it here.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Charges were also made by Mr. S. M. Banerjee and the Communist Party.

(Several hon. Members stood up)

MR. CHAIRMAN: How many more people would like to rise?

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: Sir, this is not an internal matter. It has been published in the Press. In the Lok Sabha charges have been levelled against that Minister and Mr. Arjun Arora, according to Press reports, has made those charges. He also appears to have written to the Prime Minister giving the details and substantiating those charges. It is not fair either for this House or for the Prime Minister to keep quiet. The Prime Minister should make a statement to clear the position of Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha or she should dismiss Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha from the Ministry.

SHRI B. K. P. SINHA: Sir, on a point of order.

(.Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would like to again ask the Members whether this is the way of allowing me to conduct the business of the House. If 10 people get up and begin to put questions I cannot hear anyone at all. It is confusion worse confounded.

"(Interruptions)

Mr. Chandra Shekhar, yes.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: Mr. Chairman, my question has not been answered by the Prime Minister.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Reddy, I will come to you. Mr. Chandra Shekhar there wants to say something.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: But, Sir, you called me to put the question and I have put that question. The Prime Minister has not answered that question. Let her answer the question first.

(Interruptions)

SHRI B. K. P. SINHA: Sir, on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are so many points of order leading to disorder.

(Interruptions)

What is all this? The Prime Minister will say something.

SHRI B. K. P. SINHA: I have a point of order.

SHRI NIREN GHOSH: Let the answer be given from the Treasury Benches.

SARDAR RAGHBIR SINGH PANJHAZARI: Sir, Mr. Sinha is raising a point of order. You must listen to the point of order first.

(Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have put your question; there is no answer coming.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: I have not heard anything at all; there is so much noise here.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Chandra Shekhar, you have a point of order?

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: No; I am asking a supplementary.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: Sir, you called me first and I put the question. The Prime Minister says that she did not hear me. I will repeat that question again. My question is this. Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha, Minister without Portfolio, is now under a cloud and serious charges

have been levelled against him by Mr. Arjun Arora, an hon. Member of this House, and I understand that Mr. Arjun Arora has substantiated his charges and an hon. Member in the Lok Sabha also has made these charges against Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha. So I would ask the Prime Minister to make a categorical statement with regard to these charges that have been levelled against Mr. Satya Narayan Sinha by Mr. Arjun Arora. It is not an internal matter; it is a matter which concerns the country.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Sir, on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, Mr. Kulkarni.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: Sir, may I submit . . .

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: Let the Prime Minister answer my question.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI: I am on a point of order and, Sir, you have allowed me. The hon. Member has put that question but has it got any relevance to the main question? That is what I want to know.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: It is relevant.

(Interruptions)

श्री राजनारायण : श्रीमान्, आपने तीन मर्तबा प्राइम मिनिस्टर को इशारा किया, तीन मर्तबा प्राइम मिनिस्टर से कहा कि : Are you going to answer, Are you going to answer जब चेयर क्वेश्चन सुन लेते हैं तो चेयर कहते हैं : The Minister should reply अगर मिनिस्टर रिप्लाई नहीं करता है तो मिनिस्टर पहले कह देता है कि हम रिप्लाई नहीं करेंगे। मगर तीन मर्तबा चेयर ने प्राइम मिनिस्टर की ओर इशारा किया कि जवाब दें और प्राइम मिनिस्टर चुप्पी साध कर बैठी रह

गई —यह जबरदस्त अपमान है चेयर का।

(Interruption)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Prime Minister will say something.

कुमारी मनीषेन बल्लभभाई पटेल : मेरे बगल में बैठे ये महाशय खड़े हो कर बार बार प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर के लिए कहते रह गये मगर आप उनकी सुनते ही नहीं हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: So many Members are rising at the same time on points of order that I cannot hear any of them.

श्री राजनारायण : चेयर के बार बार कहने पर प्राइम मिनिस्टर ने जवाब नहीं दिया, यह अपमान है, रिफ्लेक्शन है।

SARDAR RAGHBIR SINGH PANJHAZARI: Sir, on a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.

SARDAR RAGHBIR SINGH PANJHAZARI: I am on a point of order. It is my privilege to raise a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

NUCLEAR GUARANTEE FOR INDIA

*433. SHRI P. K. KUMARAN: Will the Minister of EXTERNAL AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

(a) whether a Government spokesman has recently made a statement in Delhi to the effect that even unilateral guarantees against nuclear blackmail and attack would be acceptable to India and that such guarantees