

Pande, Shri C. D.
 Pande, Shri T.
 Parthasarathy, Shri R. T.
 Patil, Shri G. R.
 Patil, Shri P. S.
 Patra, Shri N.
 Pattanayak, Shri B. C.
 Pillai, Shri J. Sivashanmugam
 Punnaiah, Shri Kota
 Pushpaben Janardanrai Mehta,
 Shrimati
 Puttappa, Shri Patil
 Ramaul, Shri Shiva Nand
 Ray, Shri Ramprasanna
 Ray, Shri S. P.
 Reddy, Shri K. V. Raghunatha
 Reddy, Dr. M. Channa
 Reddy, Shri Yella
 Sadiq Ali, Shri
 Sahai, Shri Ram
 Salig Ram, Dr.
 Sanjivayya, Shri D.
 Seeta Yudhvir, Shrimati
 Shah, Shri M. C.
 Shanta Vasisht, Kumari
 Shervani, Shri M. R.
 Shukla, Shri M. P.
 Shyam Kumari Khan, Shrimati
 Siddhantalankar, Prof. Satyavrata
 Siddhu, Dr. M. M. S.
 Singh, Dr. Anup
 Singh, Shri Dalpat
 Singh, Dr. Gopal
 Singh, Shri Jogendra
 Singh, Shri S. K.
 Singh, Shri Santokh
 Singh, Raja Shankar Pratap
 Singh, Shri T. N.
 Sinha, Shri Awadheshwar Prasad
 Sinha, Shri B. K. P.
 Sinha, Shri R. B.
 Sinha, Shri Rajendra Pratap
 Sukhdev Prasad, Shri
 Swamy, Shri N. R. M.

Syed Mahmud, Dr.
 Tankha, Pandit S. S. N.
 Tapase, Shri G. D.
 Tiwary, Pt. Bhawaniprasad
 Tripathi, Shri H. V.
 Untoo, Shri Gulam Nabi
 Usha Barthakur, Shrimati
 Vaishampayan, Shri S. K.
 Varma, Shri B. B.
 Vidyawati Chaturvedi, Shrimati
 Yajee, Shri Sheel Bhadra
 Yashoda Reddy, Shrimati
 Zaidi, Col. B. H.

The motion was negatived.

THE CONSTITUTION (TWENTY-
 FIRST AMENDMENT) BILL, 1967
 (To amend the Eighth Schedule)

SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA (Uttar Pradesh): Mr. Chairman, may I suggest that the next item be now taken up because it is a Constitution (Amendment) Bill which was already passed by this House but which lapsed because the Lok Sabha was dissolved and so it has come back. If you think, we might take it up now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Of course, I will take it up now because it is the immediate thing afterwards and we still have the time. If we can finish it now, we can take up the discussion on The Untold Story in the afternoon and give it a little more time.

SHRI ABID ALI (Maharashtra): Sir, we were informed that this division will take place at one o'clock and the other will be in the afternoon.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Who informed you?

SHRI ABID ALI: Not officially, but unofficially that was what was circulated.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I do not know. It is on the agenda and I think it can be taken up. The Home Minister.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN): I beg to move:

"That the Bill further to amend the Constitution of India be taken into consideration."

The Constitution (Amendment) Bill for the inclusion of Sindhi in the Eighth Schedule was first introduced in the Rajya Sabha in the month of November, 1966. It was considered and passed by the House on 9th December. The Bill remained pending in the Third Lok Sabha, but it lapsed because of the dissolution of the third Lok Sabha on 3rd March, 1967. It is because of this this Bill has had to be again brought forward for the consideration of this hon. House. As a matter of fact, for commending this Bill for the acceptance of this hon. House no long speech is necessary and I am not going to make a long speech. We know that nearly a million Sindhi people, who are residents of India, speak Sindhi language. It is a very well-developed language and a rich Indian language with a considerable cultural heritage. There is no special area in which this language is spoken as such, but before the partition of India in the State of Sind this language was a regional language. The Sindhi-speaking people, really speaking, sacrificed their identity of State for the sake of the freedom of India. Because of the patriotic contribution of these people and the cultural heritage of Sindhi language, it is our duty to accept it as our own language and accept it as one of the national languages. This Bill seeks to achieve that and I commend it for the unanimous acceptance of this hon. House, without much of a discussion.

The question was proposed.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, . . .

SHRI P. N. SAPRU (Uttar Pradesh): I would like to say one

word. I was the first to suggest that Sindhi should be one of our languages . . .

HON. MEMBERS: We are grateful to you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhupesh Gupta is in possession of the House.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (spoke in Bengali

*[Mr. Chairman, I am very happy today to support this Constitution (Amendment) Bill, which includes Sindhi as one of our national languages in the Eighth Schedule of our Constitution. The whole country will support this measure. Sindhi has been one of our national languages and yet the makers of the Constitution did not include it in this Schedule. I am not going into the reasons for this, but it was a most unfortunate thing. I do not wish to go into the past and I would like the House to look forward. It is, however, not enough to include Sindhi as a national language in our Constitution. We must give it every assistance at all levels, more especially in view of the fact that in the past years we had shown neglect to this language. I hope that the Central Government and all the State Governments will do everything necessary in their power to encourage and promote this language in its own sphere.

The Sindhi people find mention in our National Anthem. Poet Tagore always preached for unity in diversity and unity in diversity cannot be brought about without showing all due respect to the mother-tongues of the people. The genius of the nation and its people can never flower in full measure unless they are in a position to express themselves in all spheres of life in their own mother-tongues. In India we have got many

*[]English translation of the hon. Member's speech.

[Shri Bhupesh Gupta.]
languages enriching our civilization and culture and every language has made a great contribution in the making of what we are today. In this respect India is like a garden where a variety of flowers blossom and we hope that now that Sindhi language has been at last placed in the proper place in our Constitution, we shall nurse it like a gardener who nurses flowers in his garden.

In this connection I would also emphasise the need for allowing speeches in Parliament and other Legislatures to be made in the different national languages. That one knows a foreign language, namely, English, should not debar him from making speeches in his mother-tongue. When we speak to each other in our own mother-tongue we express ourselves better and what is more, we strengthen and develop a certain emotional bond which strengthens and promotes and serves national integration. I am proud of being a Bengalee and of my mother-tongue. But I have equal respect for all our national languages. Bengalee can fulfil its role as a language only in the context of the larger unity of the country and by associating with other languages. In this connection mutual respect and mutual assistance are very essential.

After the general elections representatives of workers, peasants and others have come to our Parliament and other Legislatures, who do not know how to speak except in their own mother-tongues. Hence all necessary arrangements should immediately be made so that they do not suffer on that account and to see that they get equal opportunity of speaking in their own mother-tongues and to be understood when they speak in their mother-tongues.

Once again I fully support this measure and welcome the Sindhi

language coming into its rightful place in our Constitution].

1 P.M.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is it the wish of the House that we should adjourn or that we should go on with this?

SHRI M. N. KAUL (Nominated): We should continue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Normally I would adjourn the House and have it afterwards if you agree. I am in your hands.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA (Orissa): We can adjourn.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am asking for the opinion of the House.

श्री राजनारायण (उत्तर प्रदेश): भाषा का सवाल बड़ा अहम सवाल है। इसलिए अच्छी तरह से बहस हो जाने दीजिए।

श्री सभापति: बहस तो पूरी होगी।

श्री राजनारायण: आप चाहे लंच करें या न करें, लेकिन भाषा के सवाल पर खुल कर बहस होनी चाहिए, क्योंकि हमको तो खतरा है कि कांग्रेस की सरकार बराबर भाषा के सवाल पर बंगलिग करती चली जा रही है।

श्री सभापति: मैं तो एक सादा बात कह रहा हूँ। इस पर बहस तो होगी। मैं यह नहीं कह रहा हूँ कि मैं एडजर्न करके वोट ले लूँगा। मैं यह कह रहा हूँ कि अभी एडजर्न कर लें, बाद में रिएसेम्बल होने पर डिस्कशन जारी रहेगा।

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, I would like to say...

MR. CHAIRMAN: When I am speaking, you please sit down.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: You are asking for opinion. If I stand up to say something, is it wrong?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let me explain. Do not be angry. It seems to me that Members would like to make long speeches. I thought that Mr. Bhupesh Gupta could speak briefly in his own language, but he made a long speech, and a wonderful speech, which we all liked.

AN HON. MEMBER: Because we did not understand.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Therefore, I have a feeling that other Members also would want to make long speeches. If that is so, I would adjourn the House. If you can make your speeches brief and finish the thing, I am ready to continue. I would like to have the consensus.

SHRI A. P. CHATTERJEE: We feel that this is a point on which many of us would like to make some statement. If that is so—and then again at 3.30 discussion on Gen. Kaul's book is coming up—it is better we sit through the lunch hour.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I adjourn the House. The House meets at 2.30 again.

The House then adjourned for lunch at five minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at half-past two of the clock, THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL (Gujarat): Madam, may I point out that there is no Minister in the House . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am looking round.

SHRI DAHYABHAI V. PATEL: . . . with such a crowd of Ministers?

SHRI P. N. SAPRU: It is not any usual phenomenon even though we have the largest number of Ministers that we have ever had.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is a great discourtesy to the House that no one on the Treasury Benches is present, either Minister of the Cabinet rank or Minister of any other rank. Therefore, I want to adjourn the House till 2.45 p.m.

The House then adjourned at thirty-three minutes past two of the clock till forty-five minutes past two of the clock.

The House reassembled at forty-five minutes past two of the clock, THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN: Madam, I am sorry that I was late by a couple of minutes and I apologise to the House that the House had to be adjourned because of this.

श्री विमलकुमार मन्नालालजी चौरङ्गिया (मध्य प्रदेश) : उपसभापति महोदया, सारी बातें हो जाने के बाद कुछ कहने की गुजायश रहती नहीं। जब से इस वर्ष यह राज्य सभा का अधिवेशन बुलाया गया है, चौथी बार यह घटना घटी है। मैं चाहूंगा कम से कम एक मंत्री इसी काम के लिये नियुक्त किया जाए कि जो सदन में उपस्थित रह सके।

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा (उत्तर प्रदेश) : नया मंत्री बनाया जाय इस काम के लिये।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anyway, the Home Minister has apologised for what has happened. But I want to draw his attention that this has been happening not once but repeatedly and therefore I think they should

[The Deputy Chairman.]

treat this House with greater respect, due courtesy, propriety and dignity and such things should not happen; especially when Cabinet rank Ministers have to be here, they can send their junior Ministers. That is what I want to say. And I accept that Mr. Chavan was late by just a minute or so and he has apologised for it. So, we go on with our business.

श्री विमलकुमार मन्नालालजी चौरङ्गिया :
महोदया, विश्लेषण लगाये ठीक है।
मगर ऐसा लगता है, उनका इरादा
ट्रेजरी बेंच पर बैठने का नहीं है और उनका
इरादा बाहर बैठने का है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mulka Govinda Reddy. Please be very brief.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY (Mysore): Madam Deputy Chairman, I support the Constitution (Twenty-first Amendment) Bill, 1967.

AN HON. MEMBER: In Canarese.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot force him, please.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY: (Spoke in Kannada).

*[Madam Deputy Chairman, I have great pleasure in supporting the Constitution (Twenty-first Amendment) Bill, 1967 which seeks to include Sindhi as one of the national languages in the Eighth Schedule. This should have been done long back.

Even though there is no region or State where the Sindhi language is

*[English translation of the hon. Member's speech.

spoken, the Sindhi-speaking people are found in all the States. The linguistic States are not treating the linguistic minorities in their States properly. Adequate facilities for the development of the minority languages in the States and facilities for the linguistic minorities should be provided.

Facilities for providing simultaneous translations of all the languages should be provided in the Rajya Sabha. Meanwhile, reporters in different languages should be appointed to take down the speeches made by Members in their different regional languages.

Since the 'lame-duck' session of the Lok Sabha was cancelled, this Bill has been brought before us again.

I whole heartedly support this Constitution (Twenty-first Amendment) Bill.]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Lokanath Misra.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: Madam Deputy Chairman . . .

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Oriya.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA: (Spoke in Oriya) for the benefit of hon. Members of the House, I would translate it into English because it is only one sentence. I said that I am wholeheartedly supporting this Bill.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I wish everyone to be as brief as Mr. Lokanath Misra.

श्री शुक्देव प्रसाद (उत्तर प्रदेश) :
मैं यह चाहता हूँ कि जैसे हर भाषा में लोग
अपनी अपनी बात कह रहे हैं वैसे ही हमारे
गृह मंत्री भी अपनी भाषा मराठी में जवाब
दें।

उपसभापति : दे सकते हैं।

श्री विसलहामार मन्नालालजी चौरङ्गा: उपसभापति महोदया, मुझे बहुत प्रसन्नता है कि संविधान में सिंधी को अन्य भाषाओं के साथ जोड़ा जा रहा है। जहां तक संस्कृत की पुस्तियां हैं, उनमें सिंधी ही उसके बाहर थी। वैसे तो "जन गण मन अधिनायक" जो हम गाते हैं, उसमें पंजाब और सिंधु का उल्लेख है, लेकिन अभी तक सिंधी छूटी हुई थी और प्रसन्नता की बात है कि उसका अब स्वीकार किया जा रहा है। भारतीय जनसंघ हमेशा इस मत का रहा है कि सिंधी भाषा को हमारे संविधान में सम्मिलित किया जाना चाहिये। मैं इसका हार्दिक समर्थन करता हूं।

साथ ही हमारे जिन मित्रों, श्री भूपेश गुप्त, श्री मुल्क गोविंद रेड्डी आदि ने अपनी अपनी मातृ भाषाओं में ही, अंग्रेजी की अपेक्षा भाषण दिये, मैं उनको बहुत बहुत बधाई देता हूं और इन संघर्ष में निवेदन करूंगा कि भविष्य में उनके भाषणों का अनुवाद कराने की व्यवस्था करेंगे। धन्यवाद।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Kumari Shanta Vasisht. Please be very brief.

KUMARI SHANTA VASISHT (Delhi): Madam Deputy Chairman, I extend my welcome to this amendment to the Constitution to bring Sindhi . . .

AN HON. MEMBER: Why not in Urdu?

KUMARI SHANTA VASISHT: . . . In line with the other languages in India, and this is a step that should have been taken even much earlier. But I am very glad that this has come now. I think some special consideration should also be given to Urdu.

In this connection, I may also remind the Government that they had at one time almost considered very seriously to promise that the assurance

given by Pandit Nehru to the people of the South would be honoured and it would be given some sort of a statutory status. And I think when this has been considered that could also be given some attention and those assurances given to the people of the South should be honoured by the Government. This negligence on the part of the Government of India has cost them very heavily in the recent general elections. And I think when the people do not have a sense of security that they would be either dominated by the Hindi-speaking people or by the people of the North or that certain things would be imposed upon them, they are bound to react in a certain manner, which is not really something that brings credit to the Government. Therefore I think that those assurances also should be carried out by the Government as early as possible, without any delay, because that is a very serious matter and it affects the people, the integrity of the country very much.

I extend my welcome again to this Bill. I would again emphasise this point about our assurances to the people of the South—I feel it is very important—and of putting them in a statutory form as Panditji had said.

Thank you.

SHRI KOTA PUNNAIAH (Andhra Pradesh): (Spoke in Telugu).

*[Madam Deputy Chairman, I am extremely happy to support this particular amendment of the Constitution which provides the Sindhi language an equal footing along with the other languages of India. Sindhi is a rich language which has contributed to the enhanced prestige of this great country which has its traditional cultural background in the world. Everybody loves his mother-tongue as he loves and respects his mother and motherland. We have already taken a decision to improve the regional languages

*[English translation of the hon. Member's speech.]

[Shri Kota Punnaiah.]

and run the administration too in the regional languages in the different States and we can very well understand the latest trends about the improvement of the regional languages. It is good that the Government has taken the decision to include the Sindhi language in the Eighth Schedule. I appreciate their stand and support the amendment wholeheartedly.

Thank you.]

SHRI G. P. SOMASUNDARAM
(Madras): (Spoke in Tamil).

*[Madam Deputy Chairman, I am glad for the opportunity given to me to speak in Tamil over the Constitution (Amendment) Bill giving equal rights to Sindhi along with other 14 languages. English must be a common language to all. The downfall of Congress in Tamilnad is due to the introduction of Hindi as a compulsory language in Tamilnad.]

SHRI ABID ALI: Madam Deputy Chairman, I am also happy and glad that the Government have agreed to the proposal put forward by our good colleague, Shri Jairamdas Daulatram, and this Constitution (Amendment) Bill has come. It has the support of every section of the House. I am also glad that some hon'ble Members have chosen to speak in their mother-tongue here. I hope they will stick to it always.

Madam, each language is for the purpose of understanding each other and not for the purpose of not understanding or misunderstanding. Anyway, it is their choice, their right and they have exercised it. I cannot say anything more than that. Somebody suggested that Mr. Chavan should speak in Marathi. But Mr. Chavan does not believe in stunts. He is a straight forward person and an intelligent man and I hope that his being in the Ministry will be helpful in fulfilling the purpose of the Amending Bill.

*[English translation of the hon. Member's speech.

Languages, as have been adopted in the Constitution, have some purpose, not only for the purpose of being mentioned there as my sister here has just mentioned with regard to the suggestion that she has made. I fully support her and submit to the Home Minister that the purpose for which these languages have been mentioned in the Constitution, we should be more serious to ensure that it is fulfilled and does not remain merely in the Constitution. With this request I conclude my observation because the time is very much limited.

श्री देवी सिंह (राजस्थान) : उप-सभापति महोदया, अभी जो सिन्धी को स्वीकार करने का प्रस्ताव आया है, उसका मैं हृदय से स्वागत करता हूँ और आपके द्वारा सरकार से यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि इसी प्रकार वह राजस्थानी को भी स्वीकार करेगी।

श्री महावीर प्रसाद शुक्ल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : प्रस्तुत विधेयक का हृदय से स्वागत और समर्थन करते हुए मैं आज इस सदन में अपने माननीय मित्र श्री भूपेश गुप्त और मुल्क गोविन्द रेड्डी तथा अन्य मित्रों को जिन्होंने अपनी मातृ भाषा में इस सदन को सम्बोधित किया और हमारी मानसिक दासता-स्वरूप विदेशी भाषा अंग्रेजी का आज जो बहिष्कार किया, उसके लिए मैं उनकी बधाई देता हूँ। मेरी समझ में आज का दिन सदन के लिए मुबारक दिन है, जब इस सदन में इस बात की एक तरह से परिपुष्टि हुई कि हमारे देश की जनता की भाषा ही इस देश के शासन की भाषा हो सकती है। वास्तव में यह एक उपहास है कि हम कहते हैं कि हमारे देश में जनता का राज्य है, लेकिन जनता के लिए शासन करते हुए जो हम यहाँ बैठे हुए हैं, वे जनता की भाषा का प्रयोग नहीं करते और उस भाषा का प्रयोग करते हैं, जो इस देश की भाषा ही नहीं है। आज सदन का यह दिन मुबारक दिन होगा, इस देश की जनता के

लिए। मैं पहले समझ रहा था कि हमारे साथी जो आज बोलने वाले हैं, वे अपनी मातृ भाषा में ही बोलेंगे, लेकिन अभी कुछ सदस्य ऐसे हैं, जिनके अन्दर अंग्रेजी का मोह शेष है, उन्होंने अंग्रेजी का प्रयोग करना ही प्रसन्न किया। जनता विदेशी शासन की ठुकरा चुकी है, विदेशी भाषा अंग्रेजी को भी ठुकरा रही है।

इस देश में हमने भाषावार प्रान्तों का निर्माण किया। उसका मुख्य उद्देश्य यह था कि देश में प्रत्येक प्रदेश का शासन उस प्रदेश की भाषा में ही और उस प्रदेश की जनता के नजदीक जाने के लिए शासन का काम उस प्रदेश की जनता की भाषा में चले। ऐसा करेंगे तभी अंग्रेजी का मोह छुटेगा।

सिन्धी हमारे देश की उन भाषाओं में है, जिनका बहुत पुराना इतिहास है। वह संस्कृत से निकलने वाली उन भाषाओं में से है, जिनका साहित्य बहुत अच्छा है। यह हमारी भूल थी कि राष्ट्र भाषाओं में उसका स्थान अभी तक नहीं था। इस विधेयक के द्वारा हम सिन्धी को जो स्थान दे रहे हैं, उसके लिए हम माननीय गृह मंत्री जी को धन्यवाद देते हैं। संविधान में जो विभिन्न भाषाएं दी हुई हैं, हमारे इस सदन में उनके अनुवाद की व्यवस्था शीघ्र ही की जाय ताकि भाषा की समस्या जो अपने आप अपना हल निकाल रही है, उसका हल हो जाय और भाषा के सम्बन्ध में जो कठिनाई अभी तक कायम रही है वह दूर हो।

3 P.M.

हिन्दी बोलने वाले कभी भी किसी भी प्रादेशिक भाषा के विरुद्ध नहीं रहे हैं। मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि हम प्रत्येक प्रादेशिक भाषा को अपनी मातृ भाषा के समान समझते हैं और हम उसका बराबर आदर करते हैं। जिस प्रकार बंगाल के लोग, चावल खाने वाले लोग गेहूं खाने की आदत नहीं डाल सकते, केरल के चावल

खाने वाले लोग गेहूं खाने की आदत नहीं डाल सकते, पंजाब के लोग चावल खाने की आदत नहीं डाल सकते। उसी प्रकार हमारी विभिन्न भाषाएं अपने स्थान पर रहेंगी, वहां के लोग दूसरी भाषाओं में बोले और बात करें यह बहुत सम्भव नहीं है। साधारण तौर से इस बात को स्वीकार करना होगा और जब हम इसको स्वीकार करेंगे तभी हमारे देश में ऐसी भाषा का उदय होगा, जिसको हम सब लोग जानेंगे और सीखेंगे, जो सही माने में भारतीय भाषा होगी और हमारी राष्ट्रीय भाषा होगी।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Rajnarain. The time is very limited and I cannot call every one to speak. Mr. Rajnarain, please be very brief.

श्री राज नारायण माननीया, मैं श्री जैरामदाम दौलतराम जी से यह निवेदन करना चाहूंगा आपके द्वारा कि अब तक जो सिन्धी उचित जगह पर नहीं आ सकी थी, उसका साग दोष कांग्रेस सरकार पर जाना चाहिए और यदि वे कांग्रेस पार्टी के मेम्बर हों, तो उनको अपने हिस्से में लेना चाहिए।

मैं आज बहुत ही आल्हादित हूँ, बहुत ही प्रफुल्लित हूँ, मुझे ऐसा लगता है कि आज हम भारत की संसद् में बैठे हुए हैं। इसके पूर्व कभी कभी लगता था कि कहीं अंग्रेजी संसद् में तो नहीं बैठे हुए है जबकि यहां अंग्रेजी का ही बोलबाला होता था। आज वह शुभ घड़ी है, वह शुभ दिन है जबकि मैं बंगला भी सुन रहा हूँ, तमिल भी सुन रहा हूँ और शायद तेलुगू भी सुन रहा हूँ, मराठी भी सुन रहा हूँ। ये सब हमारे देश की भाषाएं हैं। मुझे अफसोस है, आज मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि अगर इसी के साथ उर्दू के बारे में भी कोई रेफरेंस आ गया होता—उत्तर प्रदेश में संयुक्त विधायक दल ने कहा है कि उर्दू हमारी सरकार की दूसरी भाषा होगी, यह बात हमने अपने

[श्री राजनारायण]
कार्यक्रम में लिखी है—;तो ज्यादा अच्छा होता। वह लेनी ही पड़ेगी—‘सर्वस्य कारणम कालः’ समय करेगा।

श्री शीलभद्र याजी (बिहार) : ये क्या बेमुरी शहनाई बजा रहे हैं ?

श्री राजनारायण : बँडो टें-टें। वह आत्माराम अक्सर टें-टें किया करता था। महाबोर प्रसाद द्विवेदी ने उस पर लेब लिखा और लोगों को सन्नाह कि आत्माराम को टें-टें हर वक्त नहीं होना चाहिए। जब गम्भोर विशय पर चर्चा हो रही है, अनावश्यक चीजें उठा कर सदन का समय नष्ट करना इन्हों को शोभा दे सकता है, हमको नहीं। मैं आज भी कहना चाहता हूँ (Time bell rings)

उपसभापति : आप कह चुके हैं, आज का दिन शुभ दिन है, अब आपका भाषण भी समाप्त होना चाहिए।

श्री राजनारायण : मैं आपके द्वारा अपने मित्र भूश गुप्त को बधाई दूंगा और उनसे कहना चाहूंगा कि जरा सोचिए, 'ते बले मातुर्भि' श्रवण क्या यह कहने में कम अच्छा लगता है। आप अंग्रेजी में ट्रांसलेशन करके बोलिये। हम उसको बोलेंगे नहीं। तुमको बोक कोन कहता है। हमें अपनी मातृभाषा में ही बोलना चाहिए। माननीया, 1956 . . .

उपसभापति : 56 की बात छोड़िए, आज की बात कहिए।

श्री राजनारायण : यही एक पार्टी रही है संयुक्त सोशलिस्ट पार्टी जिसमें 1956 से कहा है कि सभी मातृभाषाओं में संसद् में बोलने का अधिकार होना चाहिए। हमरा विरोध अंग्रेजी से है। यह गुनामी का प्रतीक है, यह गुनामी का चिन्ह है और जब तक अंग्रेजी भाषा में हमारे देश का सारा कारोबार बन्द नहीं होगा, तब तक सही माने में हमारी मातृभाषा अपने स्थान पर प्रतिष्ठित नहीं हो पाएगी। हिन्दी और इन

भाषाओं का सम्बन्ध छंटा बहिन और बड़ी बहिन का है। इन शब्दों के साथ जो चर्चा का विषय है, उसका मैं स्वागत करता हूँ।

DR. B. N. ANTANI (Gujarat): Shah I entertain the House with Kutchy?

HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

SHRIMATI YASHODA REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I congratulate the Home Ministry and the Home Minister in particular for having included this language of Sindhi in the Eighth Schedule as it has been done earlier. As some of my friends have said to-day about Urdu also, I would like to add . . .

AN HON. MEMBER: It is already there.

SHRIMATI YASHODA REDDY: Not about the Schedule. Shri Rajnarain said that it is not being accepted in U.P. I hope it is done because coming from Andhra Pradesh, I will say that we Telugu people had given Urdu the first place as an equal language and I am glad that U.P. followed it later.

Before I sit down I would say that I am very happy that every language is being used no doubt as it should be used and encouraged but Parliament is not a place where one could sit and talk together. We are here to discuss important problems and we have to give more serious thought. Certainly I do agree that everybody has a right to express in his mother tongue but this is not a place where we are to sit and enjoy each speaking in the different languages and the other person not knowing what is happening. We have got many other problems. Even if we introduce simultaneous translations, this should not become a joke of the day. I am talking with all seriousness and just because it has been allowed, of course it has to be allowed—and every Indian language—and everybody has a right to speak in

the mother tongue but there is a time for us to use the languages. Of course Hindi and English have been accepted. Hindi has not yet become the national language and that is why we want English. If there is one language to-day in which the whole country can communicate with one another, from Kashmir to Cape Comorin, it is the English language. It is because of English, not that I love English more. The other languages have their own literature but to-day if India is India, if India is one, if I am able to talk with others, it is because of that language. Let us not hate that language before you develop some other language. Of course I am prepared to talk in my own language but how many of you are going to understand my problem? Please let us not decry any other language. Language has a place. Of course the other languages also. Hereafter at least I hope till all of us try to understand all the other languages, let us confine as far as possible to Hindi and English. I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity.

SHRI JAIRAMDAS DAULATRAM (Nominated): I will not take up any time of the House to-day because I have already spoken on this subject last December and I will not repeat what I said then. I will only say that I must thank the Government, the Prime Minister, the former Home Minister, the present Home Minister, the Congress Party and all the Opposition Parties for the support they have given to this Bill. I resist the temptation of speaking in my own language on this occasion but to make friends understand the kinship of the Sindhi language with their language, I will give just one or two illustrations. In Bengali we say: "हे मानस भानो आछे" He is a good man. In Sindhi we say: "ही माणू भानो आछे।"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you referring to Mr. Gupta?

SHRI JAIRAMDAS DAULATRAM: Yes. In Marathi we say: "हे मानस भानो आछे।" He is a good man. In Sindhi we say: "ही माणू भानो आछे।"

In Marathi we say, "तुझा भाव कुठे"।

In Sindhi we say: "तुहिजो भाव किय"।

In Marathi we say, "पाणी आण" Bring water. In Sindhi also we say the same words: "पाणा आण"

I do not want to take up more time of the House as we have little time left for the voting. The kinship of the Sindhi language is not known to many. In due time they will come to know. I heartily support the Bill and thank you all again for your support.

श्री वाई. बी. चव्हाण : महोदया, मुझे बहुत खुशी हुई है कि इस सदन के सभी दलों के नेताओं ने इस बिल की, इस विधेयक की ताईद की है। इस समय इससे ज्यादा कहने की आवश्यकता नहीं। एक नयी भाषा जब हमारे परिवार में आ रही है, तो कुदरती तौर पर सबों ने अपनी अपनी मातृभाषा में बोल कर उसका स्वागत किया। मुझे बहुत खुशी हुई और मैं आशा करता हूँ कि यह सिन्धी भाषा हमारे परिवार की एक सदस्या बन कर अपना नाम और अपनी शान बढ़ाती रहेगी।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Under article 368 of the Constitution, the motion will have to be adopted by a majority of the total membership of the House and by a majority of not less than two-third of the Members of the House present and voting. The question is:

"That the Bill further to amend the Constitution of India be taken into consideration."

(The House divided)

Ayes : 136

Noes : Nil.

AYES—136

Abdul Samad, Shri A. K. A.
 Abdul Shakoor, Moulana
 Abid Ali, Shri.
 Abraham, Shri P.
 Ammanna Raja, Shrimati C.
 Anandan, Shri T. V.
 Annapurna Devi Thimmareddy, Shri-
 mati.
 Antani, Dr. B. N.
 Arora, Shri Arjun.
 Atwal, Shri Surjit Singh.
 Baghel, Shri K. C.
 Bhargava, Shri M. P.
 Bhatt, Shri Nand Kishore.
 Chagla, Shri M. C.
 Chaman Lall, Diwan.
 Chandra Shekhar, Shri.
 Chatterjee, Shri A. P.
 Chatterji, Shri J. C.
 Chavda, Shri K. S.
 Chengalvaroyan, Shri T.
 Chetia, Shri P.
 Chinai, Shri Babubhai M.
 Chordia, Shri V. M.
 Das, Shri Banka Behary
 Dass, Shri Mahabir.
 Desai, Shri Suresh J.
 Devaki Gopidas, Shrimati.
 Dharam Prakash, Dr.
 Dharia, Shri M. M.
 Diwakar, Shri R. R.
 Doogar, Shri R. S.
 Ghosh, Shri Niren.
 Gilbert, Shri A. C.
 Gujral, Shri I. K.
 Gupta, Shri Bhupesh.
 Hathi, Shri Jaisukhlal.
 Iyer, Shri N. Ramakrishna.
 Jagat Narain, Shri.
 Jairamdas Daulatram, Shri.
 Kakati, Shri R. N.

Khan, Shri Akbar Ali.
 Khaitan, Shri R. P.
 Koya, Shri Palat Kunhi.
 Krishan Kant, Shri.
 Kulkarni, Shri B. T.
 Kurre, Shri Dayaldas.
 Lalitha (Rajagopalan), Shrimati.
 Mahammed Haneef, Shri.
 Mallik, Shri D. C.
 Mallikarjunudu, Shri K. P.
 Mangladevi Talwar, Dr. (Mrs.)
 Mani, Shri A. D.
 Maniben Vallabhbhai Patel, Kumari.
 Mariswamy, Shri S. S.
 Mary Naidu, Miss.
 Mehta, Shri Om.
 Mishra, Shri L. N.
 Mishra, S. N.
 Misra, Shri Lokanath.
 Misra, Shri M.
 Mitra, Shri P. C.
 Mohammad, Chaudhary A.
 Momin, Shri G. H. Valimohmed.
 Mookerjee, Shri Debabrata.
 Muhammad Ishaque, Shri.
 Neki Ram, Shri.
 Pande, Shri C. D.
 Pande, Shri T.
 Panj hazari, Sardar Raghbir Singh.
 Parthasarathy, Shri R. T.
 Patel, Shri Dahyabhai V.
 Pathak, Shri G. S.
 Patil, Shri G. R.
 Patil, Shri P. S.
 Patra, Shri N.
 Pattanayak, Shri B. C.
 Phulrenu Guha, Dr. Shrimati.
 Pillai, Shri J. Sivashanmugam.
 Punnaiah, Shri Kota.
 Purkayastha, Shri M.
 Pushpaben Janardanrai Mehta, Shri-
 mati.
 Puttappa, Shri Patil.
 Ramaul, Shri Shiva Nand.
 Ray, Shri Ramprasanna.

Ray Shri S. P.
 Reddy, Shri K. V. Raghunatha.
 Reddy, Dr. M. Channa.
 Reddy, Shri M. Govinda.
 Reddy, Shri Mulka Govinda.
 Reddy, Shri Y. Adinarayana.
 Ruthnaswamy, Shri M.
 Sahai, Shri Ram.
 Salig Ram, Dr.
 Sapru, Shri P. N.
 Sarla Bhadauria, Shrimati.
 Seeta Yudhvir, Shrimati.
 Shah, Shri M. C.
 Shakuntala Paranjpye, Shrimati.
 Shanta Vasisht, Kumari.
 Shervani, Shri M. R.
 Shukla, Shri M. P.
 Shyam Kumari Khan, Shrimati.
 Siddhantalankar, Prof. Satyavrata.
 Siddhu, Dr. M. M. S.
 Singh, Dr. Anup.
 Singh, Shri Dalpat.
 Singh, Shri Devi.
 Singh, Dr. Gopal.
 Singh, Shri Jogendra.
 Singh, Shri Santokh.
 Singh, Raja Shankar Pratap.
 Sinha, Shri Awadheshwar Prasad.
 Sinha, Shri B. K. P.
 Sinha, Shri Ganga Sharan.
 Sinha, Shri R. B.
 Sinha, Shri Rajendra Pratap.
 Sukhdev Prasad, Shri.
 Sundaram, Shri K.
 Sur, Shri M. M.
 Swamy, Shri N. R. M.
 Syed Mahmud, Dr.
 Tankha, Pandit S. S. N.
 Tapase, Shri G. D.
 Tiwary, Pt. Bhawaniprasad.
 Tripathi, Shri H. V.
 Untoo, Shri Gulam Nabi.
 Usha Barthakur, Shrimati.
 Vaishampayan, Shri S. K.

Varma, Shri B. B.
 Varma, Shri Nirnanjan.
 Venkateswara Rao, Shri N.
 Vero, Shri M.
 Vidyawati Chaturvedi, Shrimati.
 Yajee, Shri Sheel Bhadra.
 Yashoda Reddy, Shrimati.
 Zaidi, Col. B. H.

NOES—Nil

The motion was adopted by a majority of the total membership of the House and by a majority of not less than two-thirds of the Members present and voting.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration.

The question is:

"That clause 2, stand part of the Bill".

(The House divided)

Ayes—134

Noes—Nil

AYES—134

Abdul Samad, Shri A. K. A.
 Abdul Shakoor, Moulana.
 Abid Ali, Shri.
 Abraham, Shri P.
 Amanna Raja, Shrimati C.
 Anandan, Shri T. V.
 Annapurna Devi Thimmareddy, Shrimati.
 Antani, Dr. B. N.
 Arora, Shri Arjun.
 Atwal, Shri Surjit Singh.
 Baghel, Shri K. C.
 Bhargava, Shri M. P.
 Bhatt, Shri Nand Kishore.
 Chagala, Shri M. C.
 Chaman Lall, Diwan.
 Chandra Shekhar, Shri.
 Chatterjee, Shri A. P.
 Chatterji, Shri J. C.
 Chavda, Shri K. S.

Chengalvaroyan, Shri T.
 Chetia, Shri P.
 Chinai, Shri Babubhai M.
 Chordia, Shri V. M.
 Das, Shri Banka Behary.
 Dass, Shri Mahabir.
 Desai, Shri Suresh J.
 Devaki Gopidas, Shrimati.
 Dharam Prakash, Dr.
 Dharia, Shri M. M.
 Diwakar, Shri R. R.
 Doogar, Shri R. S.
 Gadgil, Dr. D. R.
 Ghosh, Shri Niren.
 Gilbert, Shri A. C.
 Gujral, Shri I. K.
 Gupta, Shri Bhupesh.
 Hathi, Shri Jaisukhlal.
 Iyer, Shri N. Ramakrishna.
 Jagat Narain, Shri.
 Jairamdas Daulatram, Shri.
 Kakati, Shri R. N.
 Khan, Shri Akbar Ali.
 Khaitan, Shri R. P.
 Koya, Shri Palat Kunhi.
 Krishan Kant, Shri.
 Kulkarni, Shri B. T.
 Kurre, Shri Dayaldas.
 Lalitha (Rajagopalan), Shrimati.
 Mahammed Haneef, Shri.
 Mallik, Shri D. C.
 Mallikarjunudu, Shri K. P.
 Mangladevi Talwar, Dr. (Mrs.)
 Mani, Shri A. D.
 Maniben Vallabhbbhai Patel, Kumari.
 Mariswamy, Shri S. S.
 Mary Naidu, Miss.
 Mehta, Shri Om.
 Mishra, Shri L. N.
 Mishra, Shri S. N.
 Misra, Shri Lokanath.
 Misra, Shri M.
 Mitra, Shri P. C.
 Mohammad, Chaudhary A.

Momin, Shri G. H. Valimohmed.
 Mookerjee, Shri Debabrata.
 Muhammad Ishaque, Shri.
 Neki Ram, Shri.
 Pande, Shri C. D.
 Pande, Shri T.
 Panj hazari, Saradar Raghbir Singh.
 Parthasarathy, Shri R. T.
 Patel, Shri Dahyabhai V.
 Pathak, Shri G. S.
 Patil, Shri G. R.
 Patil, Shri P. S.
 Patra, Shri N.
 Pattanayak, Shri B. C.
 Phulrenu Guha, Dr. Shrimati.
 Pillai, Shri J. Sivashanmugam.
 Punnaiah, Shri Kota.
 Purkayastha, Shri M.
 Pushpaben Janardanrai Mehta,
 Shrimati.
 Puttappa, Shri Patil.
 Ramaul, Shri Shiva Nand.
 Ray, Shri Ramprasanna.
 Ray, Shri S. P.
 Reddy, Shri K. V. Raghunatha.
 Reddy, Dr. M. Channa.
 Reddy, Shri M. Govinda.
 Reddy, Shri Mulka Govinda.
 Ruthnaswamy, Shri M.
 Sahai, Shri Ram.
 Salig Ram, Dr.
 Sapru, Shri P. N.
 Seeta Yudhvir, Shrimati.
 Shah, Shri M. C.
 Shakuntala Paranjpye, Shrimati.
 Shanta Vasisht, Kumari.
 Shervani, Shri M. R.
 Shukla, Shri M. P.
 Shyam Kumari Khan, Shrimati.
 Siddhu, Dr. M. M. S.
 Singh, Dr. Anup.
 Singh, Shri Dalpat.

Singh, Shri Devi.
Singh, Dr. Gopal.
Singh, Shri Jogendra.
Singh, Shri Santokh.
Singh, Raja Shankar Pratap.
Sinha, Shri Awadheshwar Prasad.
Sinha, Shri B. K. P.
Sinha, Shri Ganga Sharan.
Sinha, Shri R. B.
Sinha, Shri Rajendra Pratap.
Sukhdev Prasad, Shri.
Sundaram, Shri K.
Sur, Shri M. M.
Swamy, Shri N. R. M.
Syed Mahmud, Dr.
Tankha, Pandt S. S. N.
Tapase, Shri G. D.
Tiwary, Pt. Bhawaniprasad.
Tripathi, Shri H. V.
Untoo, Shri Gulam Nabi.
Usha Barthakur, Shrimati.
Vaishampayan, Shri S. K.
Varma, Shri B. B.
Varma, Shri C. L.
Varma, Shri Niranjana.
Venkateswara Rao, Shri N.
Vero, Shri M.
Vidyawati Chaturvedi, Shrimati.
Yajee, Shri Sheel Bhadra.
Yashoda Reddy, Shrimati.
Zaidi, Col. B. H.

NOES—Nil

The motion was adopted by a majority of the total membership of the House and by a majority of not less than two-thirds of the Members present and voting.

Clause 2 was added to the Bill.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The question is:

"That clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Tittle stand part of the Bill."

(The House divided)

Ayes : 136

Noes : Nil.

AYES—136

Abdul Samad, Shri A. K. A.
Abdul Shakoor, Moulana.
Abid Ali, Shri
Abraham, Shri P.
Ammanna Raja, Shrimati C.
Anandan, Shri T. V.
Annapurna Devi Thimmareddy, Shrimati.
Antani, Dr. B. N.
Arora, Shri Arjun.
Atwal, Shri Surjit Singh.
Baghel, Shri K. C.
Bhargava, Shri M. P.
Bhatt, Shri Nand Kishore.
Chagla, Shri M. C.
Chaman Lall, Diwan.
Chandra Shekhar, Shri.
Chatterjee, Shri A. P.
Chatterji, Shri J. C.
Chavda, Shri K. S.
Chengalvaroyan, Shri T.
Cheita, Shri P.
Chinai, Shri Babubhai M.
Chordia, Shri V. M.
Das, Shri Banka Behary.
Dass, Shri Mahabir.
Desai, Shri Suresh J.
Devaki Gopidas, Shrimati
Dharam Prakash, Dr.
Dharia Shri M. M.
Diwakar, Shri R. R.
Doogar, Shri R. S.
Gadgil, Dr. D. R.
Ghosh, Shri Niren.
Gilbert, Shri A. C.
Gujral, Shri I. K.
Gupta, Shri Bhupesh.
Hathi, Shri Jaisukhlal.
Iyer, Shri N. Ramakrishna.
Jagat Narain, Shri.

Jairamdas Daulatram, Shri.
 Kakati, Shri R. N.
 Khan, Shri Akbar Ali.
 Khaitan, Shri R. P.
 Koya, Shri Palat Kunhi.
 Krishan Kant, Shri.
 Kulkarni, Shri B. T.
 Kurre, Shri Dayaldas.
 Lalitha (Rajagopalan), Shrimati.
 Mahammed Haneef, Shri.
 Malik, Shri D. C.
 Mallikarjunudu, Shri K. P.
 Mangladevi Talwar, Dr. (Mrs)
 Mani, Shri A. D.
 Maniben Vallabhahai Patel, Kumari.
 Mariswamy, Shri S. S.
 Mary Naidu, Miss.
 Mehta, Shri Om.
 Mishra, Shri L. N.
 Mishra, Shri S. N.
 Misra, Shri Lokanath.
 Misra, Shri M.
 Mitra, Shri P. C.
 Mohammad, Chaudhary A.
 Momin, Shri G. H. Valimohmed.
 Mookerjee, Shri Debabrata.
 Muhammad Ishaque, Shri.
 Neki Ram, Shri.
 Pande, Shri C. D.
 Pande, Shri T.
 Panj hazari, Sardar Raghbir Singh.
 Parthasarathy, Shri R. T.
 Patel, Shri Dahyabhai V.
 Pathak, Shri G. S.
 Patil, Shri G. R.
 Patil, Shri P. S.
 Patra, Shri N.
 Pattanayak, Shri B. C.
 Phulrenu Guha, Dr. Shrimati.
 Pillai, Shri J. Sivashanmugam.
 Punnaiah, Shri Kota.
 Purkayastha, Shri M.
 Pushpaben Janardanrai Mehta,
 Shrimati.

Puttappa, Shri Patil.
 Ramaul, Shri Shiva Nand.
 Ray, Shri Ramprasanna.
 Ray, Shri S. P.
 Reddy, Shri K. V. Raghunatha.
 Reddy, Dr. M. Channa.
 Reddy, Shri M. Govinda.
 Reddy, Shri Mulka Govinda.
 Ruthnaswamy, Shri M.
 Sahai, Shri Ram
 Salig Ram, Dr.
 Sapru, Shri P. N.
 Sarla Bhadauria, Shrimati.
 Seeta Yudhviri, Shrimati.
 Shah, Shri M. C.
 Shakuntala Paranjpye, Shrimati.
 Shanta Vasisht, Kumari.
 Shervani, Shri M. R.
 Shukla, Shri M. P.
 Shyam Kumari Khan, Shrimati.
 Siddhantalankar, Prof. Satyavrata.
 Siddhu, Dr. M. M. S.
 Singh, Dr. Anup.
 Singh, Shri Dalpat.
 Singh, Shri Devi.
 Singh, Dr. Gopal.
 Singh, Shri Jogendra.
 Singh, Shri Santokh.
 Singh, Raja Shankar Pratap.
 Sinha, Shri Awadheshwar Prasad.
 Sinha, Shri B. K. P.
 Sinha, Shri Ganga Sharan.
 Sinha, Shri R. B.
 Sinha, Shri Rajendra Pratap.
 Sukhdev Prasad, Shri.
 Sundaram, Shri K.
 Sur, Shri M. M.
 Swamy, Shri N. R. M.
 Syed Mahmud, Dr.
 Tankha, Pandt S. S. N.
 Tapase, Shri G. D.
 Tiwary, Pt. Bhawaniprasad.
 Tripathi, Shri H. V.
 Untoo, Shri Gulam Nabi.

Usha Barthakur, Shrimati.
Vaishampayan, Shri S. K.
Varma, Shri B. B.
Varma, Shri Niranjan.
Venkateswara Rao, Shri N.
Vero, Shri M.
Vidyawati Chaturvedi, Shrimati
Yajee, Shri Sheel Bhadra.
Yashoda Reddy, Shrimati.
Zaidi, Col. B. H.

NOES—Nil

The motion was adopted by a majority of the total membership of the House and by a majority of not less than two-thirds of the Members present and voting.

Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN: I move:

"That the Bill be passed."

The question was proposed.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS
(Orissa): (Spoke in Oriya).

*[Madam Deputy Chairman, I am extremely happy to support the Constitution Amendment Bill which gives the Sindhi language its proper place. But in this connection I want to warn the Hindi-speaking people that though we all have accepted the three-language formula, yet actually they have not accepted it wholeheartedly in practice. Whereas non-Hindi-speaking people are learning three languages, Hindi-speaking people have accepted only two languages, that is, English and Hindi. As long as the Hindi-speaking people do not accept one of the languages of the non-Hindi-speaking areas, they will be doing an injustice to others. I hope in the interest of unity, the Hindi-speaking people

*[English translation of the hon. Member's speech in Oriya.

282 RS—5.

will accept this suggestion without further delay.]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The question is:

"That the Bill be passed."

(The House divided),

Ayes : 135

Noes : Nil.

AYES—135

Abdul Samad, Shri A. K. A.
Abdul Shakoor, Moulana
Abid Ali, Shri.
Abraham, Shri P.
Ammanna Raja, Shrimati C.
Anandan, Shri T. V.
Annapurna Devi Thimmareddy,
Shrimati.
Antani, Dr. B. N.
Arora, Shri Arjun
Atwal, Shri Surjit Singh
Baghel, Shri K. C.
Bhargava, Shri M. P.
Bhatt, Shri Nand Kishore.
Chagla, Shri M. C.
Chaman Lall, Diwan.
Chandra Shekhar, Shri.
Chatterjee, Shri A. P.
Chatterji, Shri J. C.
Chavda, Shri K. S.
Chengalvaroyan, Shri T.
Chetia, Shri P.
Chinai, Shri Babubhai M.
Chordia, Shri V. M.
Das, Shri Banka Behary
Dass, Shri Mahabir.
Desai, Shri Suresh J.
Devaki Gopidas, Shrimati.
Dharam Prakash, Dr.
Dharia, Shri M. M.
Diwakar, Shri R. R.
Doogar, Shri R. S.
Gadgil, Dr. D. R.
Gilbert, Shri A. C.

Gujral, Shri I. K.
 Gupta, Shri Bhupesh.
 Hathi, Shri Jaisukhlal.
 Iyer, Shri N. Ramakrishna.
 Jagat Narain, Shri.
 Jairamdas Daulatram, Shri.
 Kakati, Shri R. N.
 Khan, Shri Akbar Ali.
 Khaitan, Shri R. P.
 Koya, Shri Palat Kunhi.
 Krishan Kant, Shri.
 Kulkarani, Shri B. T.
 Kurre, Shri Dayaldas.
 Lalitha (Rajgopalan), Shrimati
 Mahammed Haneef, Shri
 Mallik, Shri D. C.
 Mallikarjunudu, Shri K. P.
 Mangladevi Talwar, Dr. (Mrs.)
 Mani, Shri A. D.
 Maniben Vallabhbhai Patel, Kumari.
 Mariswamy, Shri S. S.
 Mary Naidu, Miss.
 Mehta, Shri Om.
 Mishra, Shri L. N.
 Mishra, Shri S. N.
 Misra, Shri Lokanath.
 Misra, Shri M.
 Mitra, Shri P. C.
 Mohammad, Chaudhary A.
 Momin, Shri G. H. Valimohmed.
 Mookerjee, Shri Debabrata.
 Muhammad Ishaque, Shri.
 Neki Ram, Shri.
 Pande, Shri C. D.
 Pande, Shri T.
 Panjhazari, Sardar Raghbir Singh
 Parthasarthy, Shri R. T.
 Patel, Shri Dahyabhai V.
 Pathak, Shri G. S.
 Patil, Shri G. R.
 Patil, Shri P. S.
 Patra, Shri N.

Pattanayak, Shri B. C.
 Phulrenu Guha, Dr. Shrimati.
 Pillai, Shri J. Sivashanmugam.
 Punnaiah, Shri Kota.
 Purkayastha, Shri M.
 Pushpaben Janardanrai Mehta, Shri-
 mati.
 Puttappa, Shri Patil.
 Ramaul, Shri Shiva Nand.
 Ray, Shri Ramprasanna.
 Ray, Shri S. P.
 Reddy, Shri K. V. Raghunatha.
 Reddy, Dr. M. Channa.
 Reddy Shri M. Govinda.
 Reddy, Shri Mulka Govinda.
 Ruthnarswamy, Shri M.
 Sahai, Shri Ram
 Salig Ram, Dr.
 Sapru, Shri P. N.
 Sarla Bhadauria, Shrimati.
 Seeta Yudhvair, Shrimati.
 Shah, Shri M. C.
 Shakuntala Paranjpye, Shrimati.
 Shanta Vasisht, Kumari
 Shervani, Shri M. R.
 Shukla, Shri M. P.
 Shyam Kumari Khan, Shrimati.
 Siddhantalankar, Prof. Satyavrata
 Siddhu, Dr. M. M. S.
 Singh, Dr. Anup.
 Singh, Shri Dalpat.
 Singh, Shri Devi
 Singh, Dr. Gopal.
 Singh, Shri Jogendra.
 Singh, Shri Santokh.
 Singh, Raja Shankar Pratap.
 Sinha, Shri Awadheshwar Prasad.
 Sinha, Shri B. K. P.
 Sinha, Shri Ganga Sharan.
 Sinha, Shri R. B.
 Sinha, Shri Rajendra Pratap.
 Sukhdev Prasad, Shri.
 Sundaram, Shri K.
 Sur, Shri M. M.

Swamy, Shri N. R. M.
 Syed Mahmud, Dr.
 Thankha, Pandit S. S. N.
 Tapase, Shri G. D.
 Tiwary, Pt. Bhawaniprasad.
 Tripathi, Shri H. V.
 Untoo, Shri Gulam Nabi
 Usha Barthakur, Shrimati
 Vaishampayan, Shri S. K.
 Varma, Shri B. B.
 Varma, Shri Niranjana.
 Venkateswara Rao, Shri N.
 Vero, Shri M.
 Vidyawati Chatruvedi, Shrimati
 Yajee, Shri Sheel Bhadra.
 Yashoda Reddy, Shrimati.
 Zaidi, Col. B. H.

NOES—Nil

The motion was adopted by a majority of the total membership of the House and by a majority of not less than two-thirds of the Members present and voting.

SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION Re "THE UNTOLD STORY"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think this august House can, when it wants, work with great speed and efficiency. We are now going on to the next item on the Order Paper—"The Untold Story."

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): The other part of the story will now be told.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have quite a number of names. I hope with the same speed and efficiency, we shall unravel "The Untold Story." The first speaker will get 15 minutes and the rest, 10 minutes each.

SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairman, I rise to raise a discussion on the dis-

quieting disclosures contained in the book "The Untold Story" by Lt. General B. M. Kaul in relation to the NEFA operations of 1962 and the Government's stand thereon. I shall invite the attention of the hon. Members to the first sentence in the book which says, "Destiny is not always kind." I beg to disagree with the first sentence in the book because I will show in my subsequent speech that destiny was extra-kind to this general, Mr. Kaul. He says "Many great statesmen, soldiers and saints have been its victims and their worth ridiculed" Again I beg to disagree. It is not his worth which is being ridiculed by the country. He has assumed to himself the right to ridicule our late lamented Prime Minister, Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, who was loved by the entire country. He has tried to malign our Deputy Prime Minister, Shri Morarji Desai, and he has tried to malign the ex-Defence Minister Shri Krishna Menon. And he is that person who enjoyed the favours of these people for a great length of time, and there could be no further act of ingratitude than the reference made to these people distinguished people, in his book. Then he goes on to say.

"Though I have no pretensions to greatness, I have also been through a similar experience."

Here again I have to differ. He has assumed to himself the greatness and has acted in a role as if he is the supreme man and he has been appointed to judge the acts of all and sundry, whether they were national leaders, or they were his seniors in the army, or his juniors in the army. That is the role he has given unto himself in this book which is named "The Untold Story", and here I would say that what he has said is only a portion of the story, and I am sure, one day, the real version of the untold story will also come before this country. Then another of his sentences is: