

**THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI M. SHAFI QURESHI) :** (a) Yes, Sir. Inter-ministerial committees have been appointed for this purpose.

(b) The reports are expected shortly.

#### REDUCTION IN PRICES OF INDIAN-MADE CARS

22. { **SHRI P. ABRAHAM :**  
**SHRI JAGAT NARAIN :**

Will the Minister of INDUSTRY be pleased to state :

(a) the steps taken to reduce the price of cars manufactured in India;

(b) whether any agreement has been reached with the manufacturing firms in this connection; and

(c) if so, what are the details thereof ?

**THE MINISTER OF INDUSTRY (SHRI D. SANJIVAYYA) :** (a) to (c) The prices of cars have been subject to an informal system of control by Government. Under this system, price increases are allowed to the extent of increases in fiscal levies imposed by Government on finished components and/or on component parts and materials. Similar increases are allowed consequent upon increases in ocean freight, prices of imported components as also on the high cost of indigenous production to the extent of 25% of the reduction in the value of the imported cost. Other increases are allowed after a careful cost examination of the manufacturing units.

Having regard to the present foreign exchange position, Government have laid emphasis upon the reduction of imported components and the need for import substitution. The low output of the manufacturing units, the relatively high cost of finished components and raw materials and the increases in Government levies are factors which leave little scope for reduction in the price of cars manufactured in the country in the immediate future. A careful watch is being kept by the Government on the prices of cars sold in the country and, as stated earlier, increases are allowed only after a careful examination of the claims asked for by the manufacturers.

12 NOON

#### CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

**REPORTED STARVATION DEATHS AND ABANDONMENT OF CHILDREN IN CERTAIN DISTRICTS OF ORISSA AND REPORTED SCARCITY CONDITIONS IN CERTAIN PARTS OF MADHYA PRADESH, JAMMU AND KASHMIR, UTTAR PRADESH AND BIHAR**

**SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY (Mysore) :** Sir, with your permission, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Food, Agriculture, Community Development and Co-operation,

(i) to the reported deaths and abandonment of children due to starvation conditions in the districts of Kalahandi, Sundargarh, Bolangir and Dhenkanal of Orissa; and

(ii) to the reported scarcity conditions in certain parts of Madhya Pradesh (Adivasi areas), Jammu and Kashmir, Uttar Pradesh (Eastern districts) and Bihar and other parts of India.

**THE MINISTER OF FOOD, AGRICULTURE, COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND CO-OPERATION (SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM) :** I find that 'and other parts of India' is added now. Any how, Sir, I will read the statement.

**MR. CHAIRMAN :** It gives you a bigger canvas.

**SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM :** It is a fact that scarcity conditions prevailed in certain districts in Orissa. A Central Team under the leadership of an Adviser to the Planning Commission, which visited the State in February, 1966, reported among other things that the real problem was to provide sufficient employment to the people in order to increase the purchasing power of the villagers, so that they could buy foodgrains which were available at reasonable prices in the fair price shops. The State Government have already started nearly 7,000 relief works out of which 250 are in Kalahandi District. According to the latest figures available about 3,80,000 persons are working on these works, out

[Shri C. Subramanian.]

of which 30,000 are from Kalahandi district.

Even though the production in Orissa this year has been lower than that of last year, still the availability of food-grains within the State is such as to provide food to the people at a reasonable level. The State Government have (started procurement of rice within the State in order to see that sufficient rice is made available to the affected areas. The stock of rice available with the State Government out of internal procurement was more than one lakh tonnes by the middle of April. Out of this, 15,000 tonnes have been sent by special trains to the affected districts. There is no necessity for any allocation of rice from the Centre nor has there been a demand from Orissa for the supply of rice. The Central Government has been allotting wheat to Orissa and the allotments have been increased substantially this year. Against a total of 67,300 tonnes supplied for the whole of 1965, allotments up to the end of April have been 53,700 tonnes. The allotment of May has been further increased to 25,200 tonnes.

In addition to the normal allotment of wheat, 5,000 tonnes of wheat have been allotted to the State Government for free distribution among the old infirm and others who are unable to work. In addition, the State Government have provided 10 quintals of rice at each block headquarters for free distribution to the vulnerable population. 3,600 tonnes of milk powder have also been allotted out of which 1 000 tonnes have already been moved and the balance will be despatched as and when the milk powder is received. A further quantity of milk powder will also be allotted as soon as the position regarding further availability becomes clear. 175 tonnes of biscuits and about a million multi-vitamin tablets have also been allotted to Orissa.

Rs. 45 lakhs were sanctioned as loan for the year 1965-66 to the Orissa Government. For the year 1966-67, a ways and means advance of one crore rupees for scarcity relief and another advance of one crore rupees for procurement

have also been made available to the State Government. It can thus be seen that the Government of India have been taking whatever action is possible, in order to provide foodgrains and financial assistance to the State Government.

Specific allegations of deaths due to starvation were received by Orissa Government in respect of 19 cases. These cases were investigated into by the Orissa government and according to them the reports of starvation deaths are incorrect. Regarding the statement attributed to the Governor of Orissa that he had seen people abandoning their children and had received reports about parents selling their children, enquiries made from the Orissa Government revealed that no such statement was made by the Governor. What actually happened was that the Governor in the course of his tour visited the orphanage at village Bhela in Kalahandi district where the inmates consisted of two orphans and 68 other children left there by their parents temporarily who had gone to work either on relief works or to obtain gratuitous relief.

Since, however, reports are continuously appearing in the Press and elsewhere regarding difficult conditions in certain districts of Orissa, Government of India have sent a team led by an Adviser to the Planning Commission to visit the affected areas to reassess the present position and to determine what further measures have to be taken to provide relief and what additional assistance would be needed from Government of India. The report of the Team is expected to be available by the beginning of the second week of May. I am also visiting Orissa shortly—I am going tomorrow morning; the Prime Minister also proposes to visit the State—and further action will be taken based on the recommendations made by this Team and on my personal observations.

SHRI G. MURAHARI (Uttar Pradesh) : Why did you not go earlier ?

SHRI C SUBRAMANIAM : Being badly affected by drought conditions, scarcity was expected to develop over large areas in Madhya Pradesh also. In

the case of Jammu and Kashmir, Uttar Pradesh and Bihar, though some small pockets here and there may have been affected by drought, it was not expected that conditions would be such as to require any large-scale relief operations.

When conditions of scarcity develop, the action that has to be taken by Government is to make sure that sufficient foodgrains are made available in the affected areas and distribution is so arranged that the foodgrains reach the vulnerable sections of the population. The actual distribution of available supplies within a State is the responsibility of the State Government. Only the State Government is in close touch with the conditions in the various parts of the State. They also have the necessary administrative organisation which can reach down to the villages. It is thus that the State Governments are the only authorities who are in a position to take up the task and discharge it satisfactorily. The main responsibility of the Government of India is that of providing foodgrains to the State taking into account the overall supplies available to them and the relative needs of the different States. The Government of India can also provide funds wherever necessary in order to enable the State Government to take up as many relief works as are found necessary.

Although Madhya Pradesh is one of the affected States, the situation there is under control. To provide necessary purchasing power to the low income groups, the State has taken timely action and they are running 2,753 relief works employing about 7 lakh people. Financial assistance to the extent of Rs. 3 crore has already been sanctioned by the Government of India up to the end of the March, 1966. In addition, the Central Government have already allotted 2,000 tonnes of wheat for free distribution as gratuitous relief to the old and the infirm. Another 2,000 tonnes of wheat are also being released almost immediately. These are in addition to the normal allotment of wheat to the State. Madhya Pradesh is being allotted about 30,000 tonnes of wheat per month for normal consumption at present.

For relief to the vulnerable population, i.e., expectant and nursing mothers and

children 1,035 tonnes of gift milk powder, 14,84,500 multi-vitamin tablets and 119 tonnes of gift biscuits have also been allotted to Madhya Pradesh.

Government have not received any report of any serious scarcity either in Uttar Pradesh or in Bihar though these States being deficit in foodgrains in an average year, some shortage of supplies may be experienced in some parts or the other of these two States. There had been some reports of starvation deaths in Uttar Pradesh, which were fully investigated and found incorrect. In Jammu and Kashmir also the State Government have not so far reported any case of starvation death.

Allocation of foodgrains to Bihar have been at a reasonably high level of about 60,000 tonnes per month which has been raised to 80,000 tonnes for the month of May. Similarly, Jammu and Kashmir is also being supplied with all the wheat required by them. In Uttar Pradesh, the allocation of imported wheat has been @ 50,000 tonnes per month. The State Government do want this quota to be increased, but with the extension of the Northern Wheat Zone to Uttar Pradesh, the position of supply of wheat in Uttar Pradesh is expected to improve materially.

The Central Government will take care to see that sufficient foodgrains are made available to the affected States. Financial help is also being made available to the States concerned as and when requests are received from them for such help. A close watch is being kept over the situation and I can assure the House that whatever action is necessary and possible to prevent distress will be taken.

**SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY:** May I know whether the Government of India have advised the State Governments that wherever there are famine conditions, remission of land revenue should be the first consideration to be tackled by the State Governments? Secondly, I would like to know whether the representatives of the Planning Commission who went round the States which are affected by drought conditions

[Shri Mulka Govinda Reddy.]

met the representatives of the political parties to assess the proper position in those States. Thirdly, I would like to know whether the foodgrains that have been supplied to the Government of India by Australia and other countries have been allotted to the different States. I would also like to know whether it has come to the notice of the Government that the prices of coarse grains, particularly in Mysore and other parts, have gone up, that one quintal of ragi or Jowar costs more than Rs. 100 and whether the Government of India is considering subsidising the foodgrains so that they may be available to the poorer sections of the population.

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : Sir, as far as the remission of land revenue is concerned, it is the responsibility of the State Governments. When scarcity conditions prevail, the rules provide for the remission of this land revenue. I am sure the State Governments would take care of it.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY : They are only suspending, not remitting.

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : We seem to think that there are some irresponsible people sitting in the States. They are also elected persons responsible to the people and they have to function under the Constitution. To think that I should dictate from here and impose such things over them is to be assuming too much of responsibility on myself. I have to assume that they are functioning in a responsible manner. Naturally, when difficulties arise, we consult them, we go to their help. But to think that we are here some superior human beings, imposing our suggestions and decisions on them, I do not agree with it.

SHRI MULKA GOVINDA REDDY : We cannot allow them to behave as they did in Bastar.

(Interruptions by some hon. Members)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please. He is giving a reply to the question.

SHRI G. MURAHARI : This is not the way to reply, Sir. I take strong objection to this manner of replying because he is casting aspersion on the Members. He has been saying that we are not superior beings. What I want to know is whether the Minister is seized of the fact. The question that has been posed in the calling attention notice is regarding the Minister of Food in the Central Government. And he goes on saying that the State Governments are elected people and, therefore, we should not say anything. This is not the way to reply. Either he is responsible or he is not responsible. If he is not responsible let him resign . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Murahari, please.

SHRI CHITTA BASU (West Bengal) : We are not to learn from him whether the State Governments are responsible or not responsible.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I find nothing wrong about the Minister.

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : I was stating about land revenue which is the source of revenue to the State Governments. To say from here that they should completely write off everything is not within the jurisdiction of the Central Government. I was particularly referring to the land revenue.

As far as officials meeting the political parties is concerned, I do not think, Sir, that we should ask our officials to contact the political parties as such. No doubt they would be meeting the prominent persons there in each area and find out the position. But I do not think our officials should be asked to meet political parties . . .

(Interruption)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him answer.

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : . . . and my own view is that the officials should be kept away from this. They should make such enquiry as it is possible for them to make.

As for the free gifts received from various sources, they are being distributed particularly to the scarcity affected areas on an equitable basis taking into account the deficit there and the intensity of the scarcity. We are trying to distribute the wheat, the gift milk, the vitamin tablets and the biscuits in an equitable manner.

As far as subsidising the foodgrain prices is concerned, there is no such proposal at the moment.

**SHRI G. MURAHARI :** The Minister in his statement has said that he has made enquiries and he has found that all these reports about starvation deaths are incorrect.

**SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM :** I want to correct the hon'ble Member. I said the State Governments have made enquiries and the reports received from them show that they are incorrect. We have not made any enquiry.

**SHRI G. MURAHARI :** That is much better. You rely on what the State Governments say. Specific allegations have been made that there have been starvation deaths. One of the Ministers of the Orissa Government accompanied the Leader of the Opposition. He toured the district of Kalahandi, came back and accepted that there have been deaths due to starvation. Of course, the ruling party will come and say that they died of under-nourishment. That way many people in this country who die of starvation die actually due to under-nourishment. So the Government cannot take shelter behind the argument that they died of under-nourishment. In the first instance, I would like to have an answer whether the Government is seized of the fact that in Orissa 19 people are reported to have died of starvation. Many more are dying, I know. But 19 people have been traced. Their names are there and they have been brought to the notice of the Government. In view of this situation, I would like to know there and they have been brought to subsidising the prices of foodgrains because to come here and say that we have allocated so much foodgrains to Orissa,

we have despatched so much of wheat and chocolates and we have despatched so much of tablets is not going to solve the food problem in Orissa because what matters is the price. The people in Orissa are not able to buy these foodgrains which are being sold at exorbitant prices. It is the responsibility of the Government to feed the people, to see that foodgrains are available at reasonable prices. So I would like to know from the hon'ble Minister whether the Government is taking steps to see that subsidised foodgrains are made available at cheap prices. I would also like to know what governs the Government's procedure in this respect. There is famine all round in the country, not only in Orissa. This morning we saw a report from Rajasthan that 600 villages are affected by famine. Not only in Rajasthan I know in Uttar Pradesh, in Madhya Pradesh and several other parts of the country there is famine. And the Government comes round and says that there is famine. At least in the other House the Minister said that there was no famine code. There was a famine code. Even an elementary knowledge of history will tell the Minister that the Famine Code was promulgated by the Central Government in 1883. It is still on the Statute Book and it has never been withdrawn. If so, the Government cannot say today that there is no Famine Code and if there is a Famine Code which is redundant, why should the Government not think of this problem and come forward with a new Famine Code which should govern such situations in future? If not, I would like to know why the Government is so complacent about this. If the Government is not aware of the Famine Code, I would respectfully ask the Minister to resign because it is elementary knowledge that in India there is a Famine Code existing and I am sorry that the Ministry is not aware of it. So I would like to know whether the Government has seen to this aspect of the problem. I would also like to know from the Government whether in viewing the famine situation prevailing in the country the Government gives foodgrains at subsidised prices but also sees to it that there are some relief camps opened in various parts where famine is raging,

[Shri G. Murahari.]

because apart from those who are able to afford and buy foodgrains, it is necessary that many of those people who are not able to afford anything at all should be given free relief. I would like to know from the Minister why he has taken such a long time to go to Orissa. This Orissa problem has been there for more than a month, I think. Over the last one month this has been brought to their notice. This is a very serious matter and in spite of it the Food Minister says that he is going tomorrow. Perhaps he is going there because the Prime Minister is going or, may be, both are going, I do not know. But what prevented the Food Minister from going earlier?

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : As far as these things are concerned, we had called for a report with regard to the alleged deaths and I had received a categorical report from the Orissa Government that there were no starvation deaths now . . .

SHRI G. MURAHARI : How do you come to this conclusion?

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : How does the hon'ble Member come to the conclusion that there are starvation deaths?

(Interruptions)

SHRI G. MURAHARI : I do not want to listen to a pack of people shouting there.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Murahari, please withdraw that. You cannot call Members a "pack". You cannot call your colleagues a "pack".

SHRI G. MURAHARI : They are shouting in a pack.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please withdraw that.

SHRI G. MURAHARI : If you insist, I shall withdraw.

(Interruptions)

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : I have tried to find out from the Chief Minister what the position is, because these allegations are being repeated. I have received a telegram from him wherein he has said that this has been gone into more than once and there is no justification for these allegations; they are incorrect. That is the only information available to me now. In addition to that I have already stated that a team has already gone there and they may also look into the position and perhaps some light may be thrown in their report. Therefore I would request the House to wait for that report. When I shall go there, I shall find out the facts for myself, but in all these cases it is the State Government which has got the organisation and the facilities to make enquiries. This team also which has gone there will have to take the help of the State Government officials. They cannot make an independent enquiry. Even the latest telegram which I have received says that there has been no starvation death and it has been said that those allegations are incorrect.

Then, Sir, with regard to the Famine Code, the point for consideration is this. During famine the giving of relief is the responsibility of the State Government. There had been a Famine Code for each State and each Province as it existed before and all those codes have now been revised because they were out of date and they had been formulated in different conditions altogether. Now almost all the State Governments have revised the Code or they have issued fresh orders with regard to the principles which should govern the situation in relation to famine relief and scarcity relief. As far as the Central Famine Code is concerned, I have tried to make a research. There has been no Central Famine Code at any time. In 1883 what the Central Government did was that they formulated a Model Famine Code and circulated it to all the State Governments so that they should adopt that Code or make suitable modifications with reference to each State. That is how 1883 is being mentioned. It was not any Central Famine Code as such. It was a Model Code prepared by the

Central Government and distributed to the State Governments for the purpose of formulating their own Codes and from time to time it had been modified by the Provincial Governments and now the State Governments have completely revised them to suit the modern conditions.

Then, Sir, as far as I am concerned, when I should resign and all that, the House knows that I do not hesitate to resign when it becomes a question of resigning. I have never attached any importance to the job as such. I am doing my duty and I know when to resign and when not to resign. I need not be taught by the Opposition Members as to when I should resign.

With regard to subsidy, whatever we are distributing through the fair price shops—and that is a very significant point—it is distributed at control price. The other Member put the question with regard to sale in the open market at Rs. 100 and Rs. 120 per quintal and he made a suggestion that the entire foodgrains should be subsidised. I said it is not possible now. But as far as distribution is concerned, whether it be rice or wheat, it is controlled and these things are distributed at very reasonable prices and I am sure the hon. Member would agree with me.

With regard to free distribution, to the extent it is necessary we are making available more and more wheat and other grains for free distribution and we can increase the quantities provided the State Governments want it.

**SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE** (Uttar Pradesh): Whenever there are starvation deaths, attempts are made to deny them and some sort of cold war is going on between the Government and the Opposition Parties, cold war on the question of starvation deaths. So far as the Government is concerned, it gives fantastic and funny reasons to justify that there has been no starvation death. There has been a report from Kashmir that a fellow died of starvation. Now the Kashmir Government has come forward with an explanation that he did not die of starvation; he died

of colitis; also the diseased man was getting two meals from the temple. Some of the Members belonging to the ruling party also are claiming that the gentleman died of starvation. Now the hon. Minister has stated that in the case of Adivasi areas in Madhya Pradesh the problem is difficult but not so acute. But Shrimati Jamuna Devi, an Adivasi Member of the Lok Sabha from Jhabua district, has stated that the situation is very grave and that people are forced to eat roots and leaves. I submit that it is time the Government and the parties, including the ruling party, realise that we are facing a grave situation and if all the resources, both official and non-official, are not pooled together, certain areas are going to face a calamity. I do not understand why the Government cannot adopt an all-India approach. The situation now has deteriorated in Orissa and the Prime Minister has called Members from Orissa. The Food Minister is going to visit that State. But it is an all-India problem and it is a psychological problem. Let us not mix politics with food. And this controversy about starvation deaths must stop. If there are any starvation deaths, the Government should come forward and say that the situation is grave, the people are dying of starvation and more are likely to die. There is nothing to hide. I would like to know why the Food Minister and the Prime Minister cannot call a conference of all Parties and of all the State Governments in order to adopt some common policy with regard to the situation now being faced by the country. This effort to hide facts is not going to help the country in the long run and it is not going to help the people at large.

**SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM**: Of course, there is no question as such but there are very many suggestions which have been made and I share with the hon. Member the concern he has expressed with regard to the situation in the country. I am not hiding any facts. As a matter of fact I have been telling that we are facing one of the worst situations and as a matter of fact I was criticised for taking action on the basis of this, but that apart. The question now before us is this: How are we try-

[Shri C. Subramaniam.]

ing to meet the situation? It is not as if we are sitting quiet, it is not as if we are not consulting the State Governments. As a matter of fact I have been touring—leave alone Orissa—the various States where there has been scarcity and I have tried to be as helpful as possible. As far as starvation deaths are concerned, after all some enquiry has got to be made. Allegations are made with regard to starvation deaths but on enquiry it is reported that a person aged 50 died of pneumonia about 3 months back. Another man of 65 was suffering from T.B. for the last 4 or 5 years and he died 5 months ago of T.B. Another person of 60 was a landlord and was reported to be well off and he died two months ago of T.B. Then another lady is said to belong to a land-owning family in the village and she had too grown up sense. She is reported to have died 6 months back of fever. So this is what is revealed on enquiry. I do agree that we are passing through a very difficult situation and it has got to be tackled but by saying that there have been starvation deaths and millions are dying like this we are not going to solve the problem. On the other hand we will create more scarcity. Therefore my respectful submission is that we are quite well aware of the difficult situation. We are doing everything possible to meet the situation and we are confident that we would be able to avoid starvation deaths but in that process I am not prepared to say that there will not be difficulties or distress but our attempt will be to minimise this distress and avoid as far as possible the mishaps happening anywhere. Therefore I can give this assurance that we are trying our best and we shall continue to do our best to see that the situation is met.

श्री राजनारायण (उत्तर प्रदेश) : श्रीमान्, मुझे बहुत अफसोस के साथ माननीय खाद्य मंत्री को सुनना पड़ा है। आगा खां के पैलेस में जब गांधी जी थे तो उन्होंने अंग्रेजी राज्य के बारे में लिखा था कि चार "एफ" से यह अंग्रेजी राज्य चल रहा है। चार "एफ" का मतलब उन्होंने बताया था : फोर्स, फ्राड, फ्लैटरी और फाल्सहुड।

श्री महाबारी प्रसाद भार्गव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
आपका क्या फार्मूला है ?

श्री राजनारायण : मेरा फार्मूला ? जो गांधी जी का फार्मूला था अंग्रेजी राज्य में, मैं समझता हूँ कि आज इस कांग्रेस के राज्य में वह ज्यादा उपयुक्त है। मैं बिहार हो आया हूँ। शायद कोई ऐसा हिस्सा बाकी नहीं है बिहार में जहाँ मैं न गया हूँ। मैं उत्तर प्रदेश हो आया हूँ। शायद ही ऐसा कोई एरिया हो जहाँ पर भुखमरी की स्थिति हो और मैं वहाँ न हो आया हूँ। मैं दावे के साथ कहता हूँ और आप से निहायत अदब के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ..

श्री अर्जुन अरोड़ा (उत्तर प्रदेश) :  
राजनारायण जी, सवाल उड़ीसा का है।

श्री राजनारायण : नहीं, नहीं। आप पढ़िये। इसमें उत्तर प्रदेश। ईस्टर्न डिस्ट्रिक्ट्स और बिहार है। मुझे अफसोस है कि माननीय सदस्य यहाँ आ जाते हैं बिना पढ़े हुये और वे हमारे उत्तर प्रदेश से आते हैं।

तो, श्रीमान्, मेरा कहना यह है कि बबूल के बीज, पशुओं के गोबर से निकाला हुआ दाना यह खाते हुये और बीनते हुये लोगों को हमने देखा है। और लखनऊ उत्तर प्रदेश की राजधानी है। वहाँ पर एक राजेन्द्र होटल है। आप जरा स्थिति का अवलोकन करें। राजेन्द्र होटल के पास हमारी स्टेट पार्टी का कार्यालय है। वहाँ पर मैंने देखा कि एक इंसान का पाखाना पड़ा हुआ है और उस पर चावल गिरा हुआ है और एक हट्टाकट्टा इंसान उस पाखाने पर पड़ा हुआ चावल उठा कर खा रहा है। मेज़ा तहसील में मैं हो आया हूँ। जब यहाँ पर माननीय लाल बहादुर शास्त्री प्रधान मंत्री थे। मुझे अफसोस है कि आज वे नहीं हैं। नंदा जी यहाँ पर बैठे हुये हैं और मुझे खुशी है कि आज उनके सामने मुझे कहने का मौका मिल रहा है। कुछ कहने पर मुराहरि जी से आपने कहा कि आप अपने शब्द वापस करिये और उन्होंने वापस किये। मगर मैं आपसे अदब के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ कि यह राज्य सभा है।



या तो इसका नाम बदल दीजिये या सत्य पर प्रकाश डालने का अवसर दीजिये। सभा वही जगह हो सकती है जहां सत्य का प्रकाश हो और जहां असत्य हो व सभा नहीं है। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि राज्य सभा के सम्बन्ध में सत्य का जहां प्रकाश होगा उसको हम राज्य सभा कहेंगे और हम इसको राज्य सभा के रूप में रखना चाहते हैं। मगर क्या कारण है कि कोई बात कही जाय और कुछ लोग एक साथ चिल्लाने लगते हैं। इसको क्या संज्ञा दी जाय।

**श्री सभापति**। दोनों तरफ से चिल्लाते हैं।

**श्री राजनारायण** : उस समय मुराहरि जी बोल रहे थे। आपके सम्मान के लिए उन्होंने वापस ले लिया लेकिन हमारी समझ में वह कोई अनपार्लियामेन्टरी चीज नहीं थी। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि मेजा तहसील में मैं गया हूं, वहां मौतें हुई हैं। क्या यह राज्य सभा इनफार्मेशन ब्यूरो है? हमारे खाद्य मंत्री जी कह दें कि राज्य सरकार ने सूचना दे दी। उसने जांच करा दी तो हम किस लिये बैठे हैं, फिर आप काहे को उत्तर देते हैं? राज्य विधान सभा है, विधान मंडल है, वहां भी लोग सवाल पूछते हैं, यही जवाब वही दिया जाता है। यहा भी उसी की पुनरावृत्ति हो रही है। इस तरह से सदन के समय का अपव्यय करने का फायदा क्या? जब हम सवाल पूछते हैं तो अपने कर्तव्य से प्रेरित होकर करते हैं। मंत्री महोदय को उसकी गुरुता, गम्भीरता को समझना चाहिये। मैं आज इस मंत्री के ऊपर चार्ज लगाता हूं कि मेजा तहसील में जानें गई है, लोग बिना अन्न खाए मरे हैं . . .

**श्री महाबीर प्रसाद शुक्ल (उत्तर प्रदेश)** : यह बात गलत है, झूठ है। मैं मेजा तहसील का निवासी हूं। अगर इसी सत्य की कसौटी पर आपकी बात आधारित है तो चलिए वहां देखिए क्या सत्य है।

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी** : आन ए पाइन्ट आफ आर्डर। 'झूठ' शब्द का प्रयोग किया गया है, यह शब्द संसदीय नहीं है।

**SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR (Uttar Pradesh)** : Shri Vajpayee should have objected when the other hon. Member said it in the beginning.

**SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE** : It was for Mr. Chandra Shekhar to object at that time.

**श्री सभापति** : आपने 'झूठ' का लपज कहा है, उसे वापस लीजिये।

**श्री महाबीर प्रसाद शुक्ल** : यदि मैंने 'झूठ' शब्द कहा है तो मैं उसे वापस लेता हूं। मेरा तात्पर्य 'असत्य' से है।

**श्री राजनारायण** : माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं श्री चन्द्रशेखर को बताना चाहता हूं कि मैंने 'झूठ' नहीं कहा, मैंने असत्य कहा। 'झूठ' शब्द अनपार्लियामेन्टरी है, असत्य नहीं है। अभी नए हैं पार्लियामेन्टरी प्रेक्टिस में लेकिन हम जानते हैं हमने असत्य कहा है और फिर असत्य कहते हैं। यह सरकार स्वतः असत्य है...

**श्री सभापति** : देखिए राजनारायण जी, अपने पाइन्ट पर आइए।

**श्री राजनारायण** : ये लोग हमको पाइन्ट से अलग करना चाहते हैं, हम अपने पाइन्ट पर बोलना चाहते हैं। कीचड़ से, एक ही जगह से जोंक भी पैदा होता है और कमल भी पैदा होता है। मेजा तहसील से महाबीर प्रसाद शुक्ल पैदा हो सकते हैं, राजनारायण भी पैदा हो सकते हैं और शालिग्राम भी पैदा हो सकते हैं। एक ही जगह से सत्य भी पैदा होता है, असत्य भी पैदा होता है।

**श्री सभापति** : राजनारायण जी, आपको बहुत जरूरी बातें कहनी हैं, फिर पीछे लौट रहे हैं। मैं चाहूंगा कि आप मिनिस्टर से सवाल पूछें।

**श्री राजनारायण** : सवाल यह है कि हमने निश्चित रूप से लिखा है भूतपूर्व प्रधान मंत्री और जहां तक मुझे याद है श्रीमान नन्दा जी को और सुचेता जी को भी कि एक गरीब हरिजन

[श्री राजनारायण]

परिवार का पिता नौकरी से हटा दिया गया, कई दिनों तक अपने बच्चों को खाना नहीं दे पाया, गंगा का किनारा और इलाहाबाद मिर्जापुर का बार्डर, तीन बच्चे, तीन साल, पांच साल और आठ साल के। श्रीमन, बच्चे जब रोने लगते हैं तो नहीं रहा जाता। बाप कहता है कि हम शाम को रोटी देंगे। वह दिन भर सस्ते गल्ले की दूकान पर खड़ा रहा। शाम को घर लौटता है, उसको गल्ला नहीं मिला, आटा नहीं मिला, कहीं से जो पैसा ले गया था उसी से उसने शक्कर ले ली और उसी से जहर ले लिया। शाम को घर आता है, बच्चे चिल्लाते हैं तो कहता है कि अभी रोटी नहीं मिलेगी, शर्बत पियो। शक्कर घोल देता है और उसमें जहर मिला देता है और तीनों बच्चों को पिला देता है और खुद पी लेता है और सारा परिवार इस कांग्रेस राज्य में हमेशा के लिये सो जाता है। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी के सामने उदाहरण रखता हूँ। आज भी देवरिया जेल में चले जाइए। एक महिला कई दिन तक जब अपने बच्चों को अन्न न दे पाई, उसकी व्यवस्था न कर पाई तो दोनों बच्चों को उसने कत्ल कर दिया और वह देवरिया जेल में बारह महीने की सजा भुगत रही है। जब मैं मेजा तहसील में गया—हमारे साथ श्री शालिग्राम जायसवाल और दूसरे लोग थे—उस समय संयुक्त सोशलिस्ट पार्टी के बहुत प्रचार और आग्रह पर तीन ट्रक उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार ने पानी के लिए भिजवाये थे क्योंकि वहाँ के गांवों में पीने के लिए पानी ही नहीं रह गया, सारे के सारे कुएं सूख गए हैं। यह स्थिति आज की नहीं है, बहुत समय से चल रही है। तीन ट्रकों पर पानी लाद कर गांवों में भेजा जाता है। तो सरकार की तरफ से जो यह सूचना दी जाती है कि भूख से मौतें नहीं हुई हैं वह असत्य है।

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, on a point of order. According to the Rules of Procedure in this House...

श्री राजनारायण : आपने इनका पाइन्ट आफ आर्डर मान लिया ?

श्री सभापती : अभी सुन रहे हैं, आप बैठ जाइए।

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : Sir, the point of order is this. The Rules of Procedure of this House say that a question should not be longer than 150 words. If I remember correctly, the hon. Member who is putting his question has used more than 1,500 words.

श्री राजनारायण : क्या करें बेचारे . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : I understand. Normally I would like the question to be brief. But the hon. Member has something to say and I allow him to do so. I hope he will be brief.

श्री राजनारायण : मैं यह कह रहा हूँ कि बिहार, उत्तर प्रदेश के बारे में निश्चित रूप से दावे के साथ कह सकता हूँ। उड़ीसा के लिए मेरे मित्र किशन पटनायक ने लोक सभा में कहा है—उससे सुबह बात हुई थी, किशन पटनायक निश्चित रूप से कहते हैं, बल्कि वहाँ के कांग्रेस के सदर का भी वयान है—कि उड़ीसा में भूख से मौतें हुई हैं। तो जब ऐसी स्थिति है तो मैं आपसे अदब के साथ कहूँगा कि यदि सरकार स्थिति पर नियंत्रण पाने में असमर्थ है तो केन्द्रीय सरकार इस्तीफा दे दें, माननीय मंत्री जी इस्तीफा दे दें और कहें कि सारा मामला राज्य सरकारों का है, वह डील करेंगी। अगर केन्द्रीय सरकार को कुछ करना है तो इस सदन की कमेटी बना दी जाय। मैं उस जांच में असत्य पाया जाऊँ, तो मुझे दंड दिया जाय और माननीय मंत्री जी अगर असत्य पाए जायें तो वे इस्तीफा दे दें। मैं जिम्मेदारी के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ कि अगर मेजा तहसील में मौतें नहीं हुई हैं तो हमको इस्तीफा देना चाहिये, वरना इस सरकार को इस्तीफा देना चाहिये, सुब्रह्मण्यम को इस्तीफा देना चाहिये। अगर देवरिया जेल में एक महिला अपने बच्चों को कत्ल करके सजा भुगत रही है तो सुचेता को इस्तीफा देना चाहिए, सुब्रह्मण्यम को इस्तीफा देना चाहिए। केवल यहाँ पर आकर

चन्द शब्दों का समूह जोड़कर कह देना ही मंत्री का कर्तव्य नहीं है,। आज इनसान भूख से मर रहे हैं, गोबर खा रहे हैं, बीज खा रहे हैं, घास खा रहे हैं, पत्ते खा रहे हैं,। जब सारे देश की ऐसी स्थिति है, हमसे कहा जाता है कि लाइक गुड बायज मंत्री महोदय का लेक्चर सुनें। हम मंत्री महोदय का लेक्चर सुनने नहीं आए, हम अपने कर्तव्य के पालन के लिये आए हैं और उस कर्तव्य के पालन में जो जोखिम उठानी होगी उसके लिये हम तैयार हैं।

श्री समाधि : बग कीजिये।

श्री राजनारायण : इतना ही कहना है। यह कैटेगोरिकल सजेशन स्पष्ट सुझाव है कि क्या इस स्थिति को देखते हुये और हमारे बयान को देखते हुये इस व्यवस्था को करने के लिये तैयार हैं कि जहा हम बता रहे हैं, वहां इस सदन के मेम्बरों की कमेटी जाय और चलकर स्थिति की जांच करे ? यह सरकार केवल राज्य सरकारों द्वारा दी गई सूचनाओं को इकट्ठा करके राज्य सभा के सदस्यों को उत्तर न दे दे।

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA (Orissa) : Sir, I had the privilege of going round the worst drought-affected areas of Kalahandi and I do not know...

SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM : Kindly repeat.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : There is nothing to repeat. I had the privilege of going round the worst drought-affected areas...

AN HON. MEMBER : Melancholy privilege.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : ... and I do not know if the hon. Minister has information that the question whether it was starvation death or death due to malnutrition was raised in the Orissa Assembly and the Health Minister had to admit it because there was a Ruling from the Chair there that it was starvation death.

Then, Sir, I will say what I have seen personally myself because the hon. Minister asks what the source of information of the Members of the Opposition is. My source is the physical presence of myself there but I do not know what the hon. Minister's sources of information are.

MR. CHAIRMAN : He has said it is the Government.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : That is all indirect, Sir.

I am sorry to indicate that the hon. Minister of Food here has acted as the Public Relations Officer of the Governor of Orissa. The Governor of Orissa himself has said in The Statesman of 22nd April that he picked up two orphans and placed them in the orphanage. If he had to say something contradicting it, he was the proper person to issue the contradiction. He has the necessary staff. It is none of the business of hon. Minister here in the Centre who has to deal with matters regarding food which he cannot suitably deal with to contradict on behalf of the Governor of Orissa and I was really constrained ...

MR. CHAIRMAN : But he received the contradiction from there.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : It is the Governor or who must have sent it here because I found it in the newspaper and I cannot take it from Mr. Subramaniam here.

MR. CHAIRMAN : You seem to trust the papers more.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : I trust the papers because I have not seen the contradiction from the Governor himself and he is the only person who could have contradicted it.

Thereafter I would urge this upon the Minister. He is taking the correspondence from Orissa in parts. He referred to some statement here and some statement there. In the Drought Committee the State Chief Minister says that they are keeping the Central Government posted with the latest

[Shri Lokanath Misra.]

information regarding the drought situation in Orissa. I would therefore urge that both the Report of the Officer of the Planning Commission and the correspondence between the Government of Orissa and the Central Government should be placed on the Table of the House so that Members of the House know who is really responsible for concealing these facts, facts regarding deaths due to starvation. When we ask the Orissa Government they say that it is the Centre that is making statements regarding this because they do not want themselves to be held responsible. Here when we raise the question the Central Government says that what it says is based on the information supplied to it by the Orissa Government. The Government of Orissa washes its hands off the matter when it says that it has sent the minutest details about these conditions to the Central Government.

MR. CHAIRMAN : It is those details he is giving out.

SHRI LOKANATH MISRA : Sir, I would request you to kindly ask the hon. Minister to place all the correspondence regarding the drought situation between the Government of India and the Government of Orissa on the Table of the House so that we know what the actual facts are, whether the Centre is trying to evade the issue or whether it is the State Government because in the Drought Committee the State Government spokesman says that they have kept the Centre informed about the minutest details relating to drought conditions. If that is so, there could not have been any other report than of starvation deaths because in the Orissa Assembly itself it has been finally decided by the Ruling of the Presiding Officer that it was starvation death. So what else could it be?

Now, I was there in the drought-affected areas and I have found people eating kusum leaves which are not eatable, and barks of trees. These deaths may be due to anything. Nobody dies of starvation as such because we have

seen people starving for 21 days; Mahatma Gandhi himself starved for 21 days. There are other people who starve for 60 days and they do not die. Therefore people who cannot withstand hunger start eating uneatables and when they start eating all uneatable things they get into trouble and die. Because of that should we say that it is not due to starvation? We have seen people starve and die. It is my personal impression that people have died of starvation in Orissa. Even if Mr. Subramaniam or the entire Government were to maintain that it is not death due to starvation. I would still insist that it is so. I am fully convinced that it is death due to starvation.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR : Mr. Chairman, Sir, it is a very tragic situation that we are facing now. It is a difficult time for us. It is true that there have been some deaths. There is no purpose in discussing this point whether it is death due to starvation or death due to undernourishment or under-eating. To my mind both are the same and it is surprising that eighteen years after freedom we must be discussing this thing in Parliament as to whether it is starvation death or death due to undernourishment. The Government should have taken more care in proper time to avoid this situation at least in Orissa. The official reports of the Orissa Assembly and the officers of the Orissa State say that though they are not starvation deaths they are deaths due to undernourishment and under-eating. I do not know what difference there will be if we stick to the word 'starvation' or if we stick to the word 'undernourishment'. It is a very difficult situation and I wholly agree with the sentiments expressed by my hon. friend, Mr. Atal Bihari Vajpayee, that unfortunately this question is being made a political question which should not be. For the last one or two years whenever we have been discussing this question we have been saying that this question should be treated at an all-party level and that there should be meeting of the leaders of all political parties. Why should the Government

be shy of convening such a meeting and putting before the parties the difficulties which are before the nation and inviting their suggestions? There are some friends, as the hon. Food Minister said, who say that food should not be imported. They say, 'let the people die'. If they are also faced with this situation they will have to give some opinion on the question. So it is high time that the Government should say that they are ready to consult every political party in the country, invite their suggestions and act accordingly. One thing I would like to say, Mr. Chairman. Today parliamentary democracy and the Government of the country is not run only by the Treasury Benches; the Opposition has an equal share. My hon. friend, Shri Rajnarain said there were four principles on which this Government is run. He said, force, flattery, falsehood and fraud. I agree that force is there and that is the force of the people, not the force of the Administration. There is a little bit of flattery too—that of bureaucracy—from which the Government is suffering. And the balance of the four principles, that is, 50 per cent of it, I will give to the party of Mr. Rajnarain, that is, falsehood and fraud. So fifty per cent is that of the Treasury Benches and the other fifty per cent is the share of the Opposition, especially of the party of Mr. Rajnarain to which this glorious Member belongs. So let us share it; fifty per cent is ours and the other fifty per cent I have given to him and I hope the hon. Minister will accept responsibility for the first 50 per cent and the other fifty per cent will be theirs.

श्री राजनारायण : आप दो साल से कोशिश कर रहे हैं, माननीय सदस्य श्री चन्द्र शेखर दो साल तक कोशिश करने के बाद भी नहीं जा पाये बेचारे ।

SHRI M. P. BHARGAVA : May I know from the hon. Minister whether he is aware that while on the one hand there are scarcity conditions in the country, particularly in some of the States, on the other hand as much wheat

and as much rice as one wants is available in black market in many of the cities and if he is aware of this, what steps are being taken by the Government to see that these persons who deal in rice and wheat are properly dealt with?

MR. CHAIRMAN : The Minister shall deal with all the questions together.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS (Orissa) : Sir, I am very sorry for the complacent and callous attitude of the Food Minister. I had been to that area only ten days back and I went to all the places which Mr. Subramaniam is going to visit and the Prime Minister of India is going to visit. They may not go to the interior areas, but I have here an album containing all the photos. I can prove here and I also give a challenge to the Food Minister. They can go to these villages and verify whether I am correct or he is correct. Here is an album where there are photos of starvation deaths . . .

SHRI ARJUN ARORA : You present them to the Food Minister.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : . . . where you can see abandoned children. Here is an album where you can see children being bought for one rupee. The photo of the child is here. The person who has sold it is here and the person who has received that one rupee is here. Here is an album where you can see people carrying peepul leaves to eat. Here is an album where you can see hundreds of people going with their wreaths to lay on bodies of persons who are just going to die. Here you can see all the pictures. So, I again submit to you, instead of going through this controversy, to request the hon. Minister to visit that particular village, over which there is so much controversy. That village is in Komuna panchayat samiti in Kalhandi district, where nine deaths have taken place, which the Deputy Minister for Revenue, Orissa, has visited, where I have personally gone and visited every house, verified them and taken statements, including names of

[Shri Banka Behary Das.]  
the persons, the age of the persons and the parents of the persons. The staff correspondent of the "Statesman" has gone to that particular village and has given a despatch from Calcutta saying that those nine persons had died of starvation. Here is a cutting, where the staff correspondent of the "Hindustan Standard" had visited that particular village where nine persons had been left to die of starvation. They have also written in the paper that starvation deaths of those nine persons have taken place. They have gone to those three panchayat samiti areas where the Prime Minister is visiting and they have gone to nineteen houses where starvation deaths have taken place. I have verified them and I have got their names also. I also appeal to the hon. Food Minister. He cannot shirk his responsibility. He cannot shift his responsibility to the State Government of Orissa and mock at us. This State had every year sent three lakh tonnes of foodgrains to Kerala, to West Bengal and other parts of India. Even in this year of misery, when we have been passing through these conditions, we have parted with about 75,000 tonnes of foodgrains to Kerala and West Bengal. In spite of these things, here mockery is taking place. In spite of the fact that we are dying of starvation, they say we are not dying of starvation but we are dying of something else. I want to submit here that the situation is very grave, whatever might be the statement of the Governor. I know that the Governor has not given any statement, but the Governor has given a press interview. They may take advantage of this difference between a press statement and a press interview. He gave it at Raipur and he has admitted that fact. I know that. I was there in those areas when the Governor of Orissa visited there, the day the Khariar panchayat samiti chairman interviewed the Governor. After one hour he told me that he had told the Governor that in his panchayat samiti seven to eight persons had died. He has told that to the Governor. He had told me, but the Governor had not the courage to go into the matter, to go to the villages, to enquire into the

facts. The same evening I was in Bhanipatna, the headquarters of the Kalahandi district. The Governor of Orissa issued a press statement. All the pressmen came and told me. The Governor said there were allegations of starvation deaths. There might be one or two starvation deaths, but "I have not verified them". So, in this way they want to shirk their responsibility. In this way they want to show their callous attitude to the people. They have starved them of foodgrains. If this is the case, I do not know—God knows—what will happen to the State. After my visit I had talked to the Chief Minister of Orissa. We may differ about the starvation deaths, though we ought not to differ. They will not lay much emphasis on starvation death. They are not giving much importance to the problems of those areas. I can say that from September last the food situation has become acute. The Orissa Assembly discussed the food situation in September. There was the drought situation in those areas. Up to March no awareness was shown by the Government. On March 15th the first instalment of money for test relief work was given to those areas, when all the people, excepting five per cent of the people in those villages, had sold away all their ornaments, all their utensils. Even the doors and shutters and the 'Nariel' tiles, with which their huts were built, had been sold away. By that time all their assets had been sold away. Maximum five per cent of the people had any asset left with them to purchase foodgrains in the black market. That was the situation, when this controversy of nine deaths arose. When the Government practically admitted that starvation deaths had taken place, then there was some awareness and they were prepared to rush to that place. But what happened? I have gone to most of the villages. Maximum five per cent of the people are engaged in test relief work. Maximum five per cent of the people will be there in every village, who may have some assets left. Eighty per cent of the people are going without any food and are living on peepul leaves, living on all types of uneatable things. I would here submit to

Mr. Subramaniam to leave aside the political aspects. He should go to his particular village where nine deaths had taken place, which has been established by us, including the "Statesman" and the "Hindusthan Standard". I would say he should come to the House . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : I think, you have amply made yourself clear.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : I have some suggestions to make, because he is going there. Up to June the starvation deaths will continue and I say from June to November the position will be serious. If you do not tackle the situation from now on, the position might be just like what happened in Bengal, in Calcutta, in 1943. The problem is there. There was not a single blade of grass grown during the last kharif season. Government also admits it. There are no seeds. Agricultural operations cannot be done without seeds. If they can provide seeds, if they can provide liberal loans, by giving grants to the State Government from here, then only agricultural operations can be undertaken, and you can expect that fifty per cent of the agriculturists and landless labour can be employed. That is the only solution. Orissa Government has not done much. There is no denying the fact. I know that for the whole of the Kalahandi district they are offering only 80,000 maunds of seed, whereas each block of that district requires this quantity . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please wind up. We have reached one o'clock. We have spent already one hour.

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : So, these are the questions. What is to be done till June, so that people will be employed, so that they will get some food and they will have some purchasing power? And what is to be done from June to October and November, so that everybody can be engaged and everybody who cannot be engaged should be given gratuitous relief, so that at least they are not allowed to die?

They might say in the Orissa Assembly or here that they will not allow a single person to die, but it is a fact which you cannot hide. I have no doubt that many persons have died and I have got here reports from the "Statesman" . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : You have said that several times. Will you please finish?

SHRI BANKA BEHARY DAS : Respectable Hindu agriculturists are stealing away cows and are taking beef. It is not my statement only. I have known . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : This has been said several times. I would now request you to sit down. Mr. Khandekar.

SHRI R. S. KHANDEKAR (Madhya Pradesh) : The hon. Minister is very much alive to the report of the State Government. May I assure him that in Madhya Pradesh one of the reasons for the Bastar tragedy is the bungling in regard to food on the part of the State Government as well as on the part of the Central Government? In Kaked tehsil of Bastar district there was a death by starvation. The sarpanch reported it. There was an entry in the books. Ultimately an adjournment motion was moved in the Madhya Pradesh Legislative Assembly, but on account of the pressure of the Government on the tehsildar the entry was scored out and the adjournment motion was disallowed. This is how . . .

DIWAN CHAMAN LALL (Punjab) : What about the very valuable suggestion made by Mr. Vajpayee?

SHRI R. S. KHANDEKAR : Yes, I agree cent per cent, but I know what sort of co-operation the Government wants. Whenever they are in difficulties they want to take advantage of the Opposition and try to save their skin, but the real issue is evaded.

My submission is . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN : Your suggestion is that even on this question they should not co-operate.

**SHRI R. S. KHANDEKAR :** I am for co-operation. That is what we are demanding. When the question is raised before the State Governments and the State Assemblies, they shift the responsibility on to the Central Government, and the Central Government relies entirely on the reports of the State Governments. The State Governments are behaving like this and they are sending false reports here. The hon. Minister says that everything is quiet in Madhya Pradesh and the situation is under control. Everybody knows how that control is brought about. It is control at the point of the bayonet. People ask for food and the Government says that everything is all right. May I submit that if the Central Government wants to shirk its responsibility, it should quit and leave the entire question of food to the State Governments? When there is this joint responsibility between the Centre and the States, people are suffering. Therefore, the Centre should be serious about this matter. There are starvation deaths in Madhya Pradesh apart from other areas, and there is no use saying that there are no starvation deaths. I will only ask what is the definition of malnutrition and starvation death. The Central Government should be more serious about this and should not treat this question lightly.

**SHRI D. L. SEN GUPTA** (West Bengal) : I am very sorry that reference to conditions in West Bengal has been omitted. Still with your permission, Sir, I would like to ask certain questions in the context of what has fallen from the Food Minister.

So far as the State Governments' reports are concerned, they are based on two tests. I have the experience of hearing our Chief Minister, Mr. P. C. Sen, saying in respect of the famine conditions of Purulia in West Bengal : "I passed through that village. I passed through the cremation ground. I have not seen any dead body being burnt. So I conclude that there is no famine". The Relief Minister, Miss Abha Maiti, bases her conclusion on this: "I had been to that district and an agriculturist supplied me food in a metal utensil. When an

agriculturist should give me food in a metal utensil, there could not be famine." These are the tests usually applied by the State Governments. Such presumptions and conclusions set to the Central Government should not be accepted. What I suggest is that the Central Government should have its own machinery for being sent to the different States from where there might be a cry of starvation deaths.

Secondly, we have got to fight on the home front against starvation. It is as important as fighting the enemy on the border. We are trying to have fertilizer plants in collaboration with America. What about drought? No amount of fertilizers can be a substitute for this situation. For that certain machinery has to be thought out. Unless we do that, we shall be putting the cart before the horse.

The third suggestion I would make is this. In respect of the famine deaths, so far as I am concerned I would expect the hon. Food Minister—whom I know to be a very very efficient man and he is a man with a broad heart—to read thoroughly the Famine Code and see to it that, if there is no question of supplying food, at least people dying of starvation are allowed to be burnt or cremated without production of a certificate. When there is a famine death, when his relations take him to the cremation ground or to the burning ghat, be he a Hindu or Muslim or Christian, no authority there at the cremation ground or the burning ghat will allow the body to be buried or burnt unless a particular disease is mentioned. They say that famine is no disease, that he must have died of a certain disease. That particular disease gets entered in the register, that there is a man who died of that disease. They say that nobody can die of famine. Let Government do one thing. At least a man must have the privilege of being cremated after his death on the ground that he died of starvation. Let that be done.

**MR CHAIRMAN :** I will not allow any more questions. I have allowed this for one hour. I will ask the Minister to say something.



**SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM :** Sir, there were not many questions but there were many good suggestions, if I may say so to deal with the situation and some valuable information also has been given by the Members. I shall certainly try to be benefited by those informations. I am going to Orissa tomorrow and I can tell the hon. Members that I am going there with an open mind to find out what is happening there and to the best of my ability if there is any help needed to bring about a better situation in Orissa, that will be given.

Only one thing I would like to say with regard to the Governor's press interview or statement. I have received information from Orissa saying that he never gave any interview, that he did not make any statement of this sort or any sort with regard to the situation. That is the information I have received. I do not think we should say that the Governor is trying to go back on the statement having once stated that, it is very unfair to take such an attitude.

As far as the various informations with regard to deaths are concerned, I also rely upon reports. I am sure the hon. Members also rely upon certain reports made to them. Therefore, it is a question of trying to find out what was the actual cause. But on all accounts it is agreed in the House that the situation is a very difficult situation and the difficult situation will have to be met firmly and as efficiently and as effectively as possible. I can only give this assurance to this House to the extent it is possible for me and for this Government that we shall see that the situation is contained and we shall see that all measures possible within the capacity of this Government and the State Government will be taken for the purpose of alleviating the distress and to see that starvation deaths are avoided. I can only give that assurance to this House and I do know that in a difficult situation of this sort naturally everyone is concerned about it, and there is nothing unnatural about it, and it is natural to expect particularly from res-

possible Members that they get concerned with a difficult situation, but the difficult situation has to be met by a positive enquiry as to where the difficulty exists, what sort of difficulty exists, what should be the solution for this, what steps and measures should be taken for the purpose of meeting this, and so on, and it is not as if we should distrust the State Governments. I am thinking in terms of appointing a high level officer who will be going round periodically to every State to find out the actual situation and report to the Central Government—not to act as a spy but to be of help to the State Governments, to discuss with them and to bring to our notice what is the actual situation and if there is any drawback there. Therefore, I am also contemplating to appoint a high level officer for this purpose. I am sure the hon. Members also would be interested in it. So far I have not received any report from any hon. Member. If they had sent any report certainly I would have taken notice of it and I would have tried my best to see that these difficulties are removed to the maximum extent possible.

But, apart from that, I seek the co-operation of all the hon. Members here, not only from the Opposition side, but from this side and from every side, because as is seen from the discussion here we are passing through a very difficult situation and the situation will have to be managed somehow or the other.

Then, some point was made by Shri Das with regard to the coming June-October period. We are very well aware of it. The Chief Minister made the point that the seeds might not be available. We have immediately contacted Madras and Madras has promised to give sufficient quantity of seeds for this purpose.

It was mentioned that bullock power may not be available for ploughing because some bullocks have been sold away or they might have become famished also in this condition. Therefore, we are trying to mobilise tractors for this purpose so that we may offer ploughing facilities to the farmers on a

[Shri C. Subramaniam.]

free basis so that wherever it is not possible to have bullocks, they may have this power.

All these are in our minds and we are taking measures to meet the situation from June to October, particularly for the agricultural operations. I am glad the hon. Member mentioned it. I am sure there might be other areas also to which attention may not have been drawn. But if our attention is drawn, certainly we will look into the matter and try to do as much as possible. I can only say that while the Members are greatly concerned, my concern is a little more than that and to the best of my ability, I shall try to do my duty.

श्री राजनारायण : आप मेज़ा तहसील में चलेगे ।

श्री सभापति : राजनारायण जी, अब नहीं ।

श्री राजनारायण : मैं न्योता देता हूँ आपके द्वारा . . . ।

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please, please.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

APPROPRIATION ACCOUNTS (1964-65) AND FINANCE ACCOUNTS (1964-65) OF THE GOVERNMENT OF KERALA AND RELATED PAPERS

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI L. N. MISHRA) : Sir, I beg to lay on the Table under clause (2) of article 151 of the Constitution, read with the Proclamation (G.S.R. No. 490) issued on the 24th March, 1965, under article 356 of the Constitution, in relation to the State of Kerala, a copy each of the following papers :—

- (i) Appropriation Accounts of the Government of Kerala for the year 1964-65. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-6220/66.]
- (ii) Finance Accounts of the Government of Kerala for the year

1964-65. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-6221/66.]

- (iii) Audit Report, 1966. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-6219/66.]

ANNUAL REPORT AND ACCOUNTS (1964-65) OF THE NATIONAL INSTRUMENTS LTD., CALCUTTA AND RELATED PAPERS

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI M. SHAFI QURESHI) : Sir, I beg to lay on the Table, under sub-section (1) of section 619-A of the Companies Act, 1956, a copy each of the following papers :—

- (i) Eighth Annual Report and Accounts of the National Instruments Limited, Calcutta, for the year 1964-65, together with the Auditors' Report on the Accounts.
  - (ii) Review by Government on the working of the Company.
- [Placed in Library, See No. LT-6045/66 for (i) and (ii).]

#### NOTIFICATIONS OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE

SHRI M. SHAFI QURESHI : Sir, I also beg to lay on the Table a copy each of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Commerce :—

- (i) Notification S.O. No. 1027, dated the 26th March, 1966, publishing the Essential Commodities (Regulation of Production and Distribution for Purposes of Export) Order, 1966, under sub-section (6) of section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1963.
  - (ii) Notification S.O. No. 1028, dated the 28th March, 1966.
  - (iii) Notification S.O. No. 1029, dated the 28th March, 1966.
- [Placed in Library. See No. LT-6117/66 for (i) to (iii).]