

- (ii) Notification G.S.R. No. 1843, dated the 24th December, 1964.
- (iii) Notification G.S.R. No. 22, dated the 26th December, 1964.
- (iv) Notification G.S.R. No. 1846, dated the 26th December, 1964.
- (v) Notification G.S.R. No. 1860, dated the 31st December, 1964.
- (vi) Notification G.S.R. No. 39, dated the 2nd January, 1965.
- (vii) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 76 and 77, dated the 5th January, 1965.
- (viii) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 87 to 89, dated the 5th January, 1965.
- (ix) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 90 and 91, dated the 6th January, 1965.
- (x) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 92 and 93, dated the 11th January, 1965.
- (xi) Notification G.S.R. No. 180, dated the 20th January, 1965.
- (xii) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 158 and 159, dated the 21st January, 1965.
- (xiii) Notification G.S.R. No. 182, dated the 23rd January, 1965.
- (xiv) Notification G.S.R. No. 184, dated the 27th January, 1965.
- (xv) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 214 and 214-A, dated 3rd February, 1965.
- (xvi) Notifications G.S.R. Nos. 217 and 218, dated the 8th February, 1965.
- (xvii) Notification G.S.R. No. 244 dated the 10th February, 1965.

[Placed in Library : See No. LT-3879/65 for (i) to (xviii).]

- (b) A copy of the Ministry of Food and Agriculture (Department of Food) Notification G.S.R. No. 1842, dated the 24th December, 1964, under sub-section (1) of sec-

tion 12-A of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-3880/65.]

#### MINISTRY OF DEFENCE NOTIFICATION

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (DR. D. S. RAJU) : Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Ministry of Defence Notification S.R.O. No. 68, dated the 11th February, 1965, publishing a corrigendum to Government Notification S.R.O. No. 22 E, dated the 19th February, 1964. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-3897/65.]

#### CHAIRS RULING RE LAYING ON THE TABLE CERTAIN PAPERS RELATING TO ORISSA AFFAIRS

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal) : Sir, before you pass on to the next item, I would seek your guidance on one matter. We are in a little difficulty. You, Sir, gave a ruling on the CBI Report. On the same day the Speaker of the other House gave a ruling also. Now, Sir, it appears on the face of it and some people have taken them to be different types of rulings. We are in the same Parliament I am not saying which is right or which is good or bad. But personally I would like to have the position clarified. I presume that there is no fundamental difference between your ruling and the other ruling.

MR. CHAIRMAN : You hold.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : I presume it and I think I am right, Sir.

SHRI AWADHESHWAR PRASAD SINHA (Bihar) : Are we discussing the ruling given in the other House ? On a point of order, Sir, can this House discuss a ruling given in the other House ? And was this question put before you, Sir, before the gentleman came into the House ? Did he intimate to the Chairman that he would be raising this question ?

MR. CHAIRMAN : He has asked for my permission and I have allowed him.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Why should the Member get excited these days ? What have I done to him ?

MR. CHAIRMAN : No dialogue. Mr. Gupta. Will you please address me ?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : All that I am saying, Sir, is that you will understand our difficulty. And it is not good also. I know we are bound by your ruling.

MR. CHAIRMAN : You know that?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : It is quite clear and we have said that we submit to it. And now we had another elaborate ruling and it came from an august House. This House is also an august House and it is part of the Parliament and naturally Sir, a situation arises which you will have to settle. I hope, therefore, there is no contradiction between the two rulings at all. fundamentally, and I think, Sir, your ruling is a brief one and it covers the elaboration which is given in the other.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am really not concerned with the other ruling. I have given my ruling and that ruling will operate in this House. The Speaker's ruling will operate in the Lok Sabha. It is for you to find out whether there is difference or not.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : Then Sir, the question arises and you will consider it. One may take a formalistic view of the matter under the rule. Under the rules we have got our rules and they have got their rules, and in matters such as these the rules are identical. The other thing we have got is the House of Commons practice which has been taken into account in that House, and I believe you had these also in mind. We have the same Parliament together. We may suppose, Sir, this arose in a joint session. Will you and the Speaker quarrel ? We want

a synthesis. I understand now we did not have a joint session. But suppose in a joint session somebody raises it.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I do not suppose anything.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : You need not suppose, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I do not want to be drawn into any hypothetical discussion.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA : A synthesis has to be found. A synthesis, Sir, has to be found. Please do not have, Sir, any impression that we are reflecting upon your ruling at all. Not at all. The thing is, as Members of this House and above all as Members of India's Parliament, we are faced with some difficulty. That is why I have raised this before you, seeking as I said in the beginning, light and guidance from you.

MR. CHAIRMAN : May I repeat again ? I have given my ruling and that ruling will be operative in this House. I do not think there is any necessity for synthesis-ing. I do not think there is any antithesis. But that is not my business. I have given the ruling and it will be observed in this House. The Speaker's ruling will be observed in the other House and that is the end of it.

PANDIT S. S. N. TANKHA (Uttar Pradesh) : May I make a submission ?

MR. CHAIRMAN : Yes.

PANDIT S. S. N. TANKHA : Perhaps when you gave your ruling, Sir, certain precedents or rulings of the House of Commons were not brought to your notice.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am not at all inclined to revise my ruling. I have had all the material that I needed to come to a decision and I have given the decision, and I have nothing more to say. I am very grateful to you for trying to be helpful, but it is too late.

PANDIT S. S. N. TANKHA : If you had all the material before you, Sir, including the precedents in the House of Commons then, of course, I have nothing to say and your ruling is a ruling, which has certainly to be respected.

MR. CHAIRMAN : I am afraid I will not continue this discussion. There should be a limit. I cannot go on repeating myself as some of us are inclined to.

شری عبدالغنی (پنجاب) :

آن اے پوئنٹ آف آرڈر—اگر کوئی ایسی نئی بات آئے جو جناب کے نوٹس میں لانا ضروری ہو جس سے ڈیموکریسی کو زندہ رکھا جاسکے تو کیا آپ معمانعت کر دیں گے اس کو ہمیشہ کے لئے ختم کر دینگے۔

†[شری عبدالغنی (پنجاب) : آن اے پوائنٹ آف آرڈر—اگر کوئی ایسی نئی بات آئے جو جناب کے نوٹس میں لانا ضروری ہو جس سے ڈیموکریسی کو زندہ رکھا جاسکے، تو کیا آپ معمانعت کر دیں گے اس کو ہمیشہ کے لئے ختم کر دینگے؟]

شری سبھاپتی : میں ہمیشہ کے لئے کوئی چیز نہیں کہہ رہا ہوں۔ آپ ہمیشہ کے لئے کہہ سکتے ہیں۔ جب کوئی بات پیدا ہوگی تو اس پر رائے دی جائے گی۔ جب ڈیموکریسی ختم ہوتی ہوگی اس وقت میں رائے دوں گا، جب ڈیموکریسی بچتی ہوگی، اس کی رائے دوں گا۔

شری عبدالغنی : میری عرض

یہ تھی کہ اس وقت انگلینڈ کی جو پارلیمنٹ ہے اس کی روایات کو ابھی تک ساری دنیا نے

مانا ہے کافی شاندار روایات ہیں اور وہ مناسب ہے ڈیموکریسی کے لئے۔ اگر ہاؤس آف کامنز کی مثال جناب کے نوٹس میں لانا چاہیں تو کیا جناب اس کو پسند نہیں فرمائیں گے؟

†[شری عبدالغنی : میری رائے یہ ہے کہ اس وقت انگلینڈ کی جو پارلیمنٹ ہے اس کی روایات کو ابھی تک ساری دنیا نے مانا ہے۔ کافی شاندار روایات ہیں اور وہ مناسب ہے ڈیموکریسی کے لئے۔ اگر ہاؤس آف کامنز کی مثال جناب کے نوٹس میں لانا چاہیں تو کیا جناب اس کو پسند نہیں فرمائیں گے؟]

شری سبھاپتی : عبدالغنی صاحب، میں سب کچھ کر لوں گا۔ لیکن آپ اگر رولنگ کو گور سے پڑھیں اور اس پر عمل کریں۔

شری عبدالغنی : وہ تو کر رہے ہیں۔

†[شری عبدالغنی : وہ تو کر رہے ہیں۔]

شری سبھاپتی : . . . تو آپ کو کوئی نقصان نہیں ہوگا۔ آپ کی ڈیموکریسی کو کوئی نقصان نہیں ہوگا، لوک سبھا کو کوئی نقصان نہیں ہوگا۔ اس کو گور سے پڑھیں۔

شری عبدالغنی : اگر گورنمنٹ

وائے سمجھ جائیں تو پھر واقعی ایسا ہی ہو۔

†[شری عبدالغنی : اگر گورنمنٹ والے سمجھ جائیں تو پھر واقعی ایسا ہی ہو۔]