

दिल्ली में ठंड लगने से हुई मौतें

*१६२. श्री ए० बी० वाजपेयी : क्या निर्माण, आवास और पुनर्वास मंत्री यह बताने का कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) दिल्ली में इन सदियों में ठंड लगने से कितने व्यक्ति मरे; और

(ख) क्या यह सच है कि दिल्ली में बारह हजार से अधिक नागरिक फुटपाथों पर रातें गुज़ारते हैं ?

‡[DEBATES IN DELHI DUE TO EXPOSURE TO COLD

*192. SHRI A. B. VAJPAYEE: Will the Minister of WORKS, HOUSING AND REHABILITATION be pleased to state:

(a) the number of persons who died in Delhi during this winter on account of exposure to cold; and

(b) whether it is a fact that more than twelve thousand citizens in Delhi pass the nights on footpaths?]

निर्माण, आवास और पुनर्वास मंत्रालय से उपसंत्री (श्री पी० एस० नस्कर) : (क) संख्या मालूम नहीं है ।

(ख) दिल्ली नगर निगम ने २६ और २७ दिसम्बर के बीच की रात में ३१ इलाकों में एक पड़ताल की थी; उसके अनुसार खुली जगह में रात बिताने वाले लोगों की संख्या ३४८४ थी ।

‡[THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF WORKS, HOUSING AND REHABILITATION (SHRI P. S. NASKAR): (a) The number is not known.

(b) According to a survey conducted by the Delhi Municipal Corporation in 31 areas on the night between 26th and 27th of December,

†Transferred from the 20th February, 1964.

‡[] English translation.

1963, the number of persons passing the night in the open was 3484.

SHRI A. B. VAJPAYEE: May I know why the number of persons who died due to exposure is not known? Reports have been appearing in newspapers that so many persons died because of exposure. May I know whether the Delhi Municipal Corporation or the Delhi Administration is or is not keeping any records of such deaths?

SHRI P. S. NASKAR: I said, Sir, that the exact number is not known to us but according to the records of the burial and the burning grounds, so far as December, 1963, is concerned, thirty five dead bodies of unidentified and unclaimed persons were brought by the Bharat Sevak Samaj, by the Corporation or by the police. Though the cause in respect of these cases was given as exposure no definite proof has been taken of that. As I said earlier, we have no definite information about the number of people who died due to exposure.

SHRI A. D. MANI: Sir, I am shocked at the reply of the Minister. News of the deaths on account of exposure to cold was published in all papers. Such a thing is discreditable to any Government. Did not Government make any routine enquiry to find out whether such deaths did take place instead of referring to burial ground records?

SHRI P. S. NASKAR: Just as I said from the burial ground and burning ground records, whatever information was available I have given that.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I do not know which is better, the burial ground or this Ministry but what I would like to know from the hon. Minister is this. The Delhi papers were reporting day after day about these deaths due to exposure and the exposure to which the people had been subjected to. What steps did

the Ministry take to tackle the problem and may I also know, in this connection, whether they did not receive any representations from some organisations in Delhi for taking some concrete steps? We should like to know from the Minister what concrete steps they took, apart from going to the burial ground and getting something after they got notice of the question.

DR. SUSHILA NAYAR: Sir, I may add in this connection that all cases that are reported to be due to exposure need not necessarily be due to exposure unless a systematic post-mortem investigation and study is made to decide the cause of death. The Government has

(Interruption.)

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Sir, it is not a medical question and we do not want a medical answer.

DR. SUSHILA NAYAR: Sir, if you permit me to explain the situation, I will add . . .

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, I am sorry for the interruption.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I am sorry for the reply.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry for the interruption.

DR. SUSHILA NAYAR: Sir, Government is as unhappy as anybody else that anybody should die of exposure and for that reason a night shelter scheme has been provided. In spite of that, some people have died and it is not possible for the Housing Minister or for an member of the Government to say with certainty that these cases were not suffering from some other disease or that deaths were due to some other causes but it is true that these bodies were unclaimed. That is all that can be said

SHRI A. B. VAJPAYEE: Sir, in reply to part (b) of the question, the hon. Minister had stated that according to the survey conducted by the Delhi Municipal Corporation, the number of those who spent the nights on the footpath was only three thousand. Certain political parties have also conducted surveys and the number of people comes to more than twelve thousand. Is the hon. Minister in a position to explain the difference?

SHRI P. S. NASKAR: Sir, I have only given the information that I collected from the local bodies.

SHRI FARIDUL HAQ ANSARI: First of all, Sir, notice of this question must have been given some time in January. May I know why Government or the Ministry did not think it fit to make all the enquiries about this question? Secondly, about the shelter, may I know what difficulty there is in erecting a sufficient number of shelters to protect these people from extreme cold?

SHRI P. S. NASKAR: The Health Minister has already replied to the first part of the question. About shelters, I wish to say that there is provision made in the Delhi Municipal Corporation and by the Bharat Sevak Samaj to give shelter to about 2,400 or 3,000 persons but, Sir, it has also been reported to us by the local bodies that there are some people who prefer to stay outside than take shelter in the nights.

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: Sir, with your permission, I would like to repeat the question put by hon. Shri Mani. I want to know whether a democratic Government did not think it proper to react to the press reports that were published in the winter season in Delhi? Secondly, I want to know whether Government took it only as a medical or administrative question or whether humane considerations were also there guiding

the democratic Government. What is the attitude of Government, I want to know.

SHRI P. S. NASKAR: Attitude of the Government towards what?

SHRI CHANDRA SHEKHAR: I want to know whether this is treated as an administrative question, medical or scientific question or as a human question. I want to know whether the democratic Government of India is guided by newspaper reports and also by human considerations.

DR. SUSHILA NAYAR: Sir, the medical and scientific grounds are also human grounds. The medical and scientific professions are moved on account of the human needs and human considerations.

(Interruption)

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think the gentlemen who are putting questions would be satisfied if you could tell them what measures have been taken in anticipation of the future cold? Are you doing something to protect people who are exposed to cold?

SHRI P. S. NASKAR: Sir, the Delhi Municipal Corporation has one permanent night shelter and during the winter days, in December, they put up twelve more temporary shelters. In addition to that, the Bharat Sevak Samaj is also running five night shelters and the capacity of all these night shelters, during the winter months is about three thousand and I can assure the hon. House that no person was refused admission to any night shelter in those winter days. Anyone who went there got the shelter and a nominal charge of six nP. per night was made by the Corporation and the Bharat Sevak Samaj.

SHRI A. B. VAJPAYEE: Is it the contention of the hon. Minister that people preferred to die in the open than to enter a night shelter? Sir, the figures given by the hon. Minister are totally wrong. If the night shelters

can accommodate three thousand persons, why should they pass their nights on pavements and in the open?

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister said that no one has been refused admission to these shelters.

SHRI A. B. VAJPAYEE: Do they keep any record? How can he say no one has been refused admission? I have visited these night shelters. They are not spacious at all. They cannot accommodate more than three thousand persons and the number wanting shelter is about twelve thousand.

(No reply.)

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: The hon. Minister said that they need not necessarily be taken as deaths due to exposure; may be the other way round. May I know why there should not have been a presumption on the part of the Government, in view of the fact that they died under such circumstances, that death must have been due to exposure, especially when the newspapers also carried this news, I presume after enquiry. Currently, I want to know whether the Government instituted any investigation in order to find out whether on the whole these stories were correct and if so—or even without that—what steps did they take in the various areas to provide shelter? One cannot be expected to go from Palam to the other end of the city seeking shelter. I would like to know what the Housing Minister was doing at that time, just at that time? Now it is no use discussing this thing. They should tell us what they were doing just when the reports appeared. They should give us an account of the day-to-day action. In the whole of Delhi, Sir, people were dying due to exposure and here the great Minister comes and tells us that they were getting records from some other place. Let them tell us exactly what they were doing then.

SHRI T. T. KRISHNAMACHARI: Sir, the question now raised covers a very wide field. One hon. Member

says that twelve thousand persons were without shelter while the Government says that nobody had been refused admission. This is a matter which has to be verified. We will certainly undertake to verify it. If really more people need shelters, shelters will have to be provided and Government will take steps. In regard to the basic question which has been raised times without number over this particular matter, whether the deaths that have occurred are deaths which could have been avoided, that I think Sir, as my colleague, the Health Minister, has mentioned, is a matter which is not verifiable.

*282. [The questioner (Shri J. H. Joshi) was absent. For answer, vide col. 2124 infra.]

SMALLPOX ERADICATION WEEK

*283. SHRI KRISHAN DUTT: Will the Minister of HEALTH be pleased to state the number of vaccinations performed in each State during the Smallpox Eradication Week which was observed all over the country from 25th September to 2nd October, 1963?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH (DR. D. S. RAJU): A statement giving the required information is laid on the Table of the Sabha.

STATEMENT

Sl. No.	Name of the State/ Territory	Vaccinations			Remarks
		P.V.	R.V.	Total	
1	Andhra Pradesh	1,74,000	3,66,000	5,40,000	Eradication Staff Normal staff
2	Assam	5,366	28,222	33,588	
				38,652	
				72,240	
3	Bihar	37,639	5,95,177	6,32,816	
4	Gujarat	Figures not available			
5	Jammu and Kashmir	Figures not available			
6	Kerala				
7	Madhya Pradesh	1,685	18,795	20,480	
8	Madras	91,873	4,57,480	5,49,353	
9	Maharashtra	Figures not available.			
10	Mysore	18,337	2,51,431	2,69,768	
11	Orissa	12,583	1,40,051	1,52,634	
12	Punjab	32,663	1,80,146	2,12,000	
13	Rajasthan	22,301	1,89,785	2,12,086	
14	Uttar Pradesh	36,598	2,30,154	2,66,752	
15	West Bengal	99,079	9,23,023	10,22,102	Figures for fortnight ending 30-9-63.
16	Nagaland	3,54,175	27,18,696	30,72,871	For 1963.
17	Pondicherry	139	2,909	3,048	
18	Goa	938	6,834	7,772	
19	Delhi	21,444	
20	Manipur	4,675	1,02,677	1,07,352	
21	Himachal Pradesh	9,314	
22	Tripura	1,603	13,042	14,645	Figures for fortnight ending 30-9-63.
23	NEFA	813	6,700	7,513	
		390	1,111	1,501	
		8,89,882	61,29,556	70,88,848	