

if he had kindly given us the transcript of that statement which he made in the other House and then had added something rather than repeat the statement just at the moment? He can do it in the afternoon. Time would also be saved that way. It is a serious matter. He has made a statement. We can be given copies of that statement so that we may have time to study it and ask questions.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know what new thing he can say in the afternoon.

THE MINISTER OF SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH AND CULTURAL AFFAIRS (SHRI HUMAYUN KABIR): There is a question on this tomorrow and I had suggested to the Chairman that the best thing would be to take it up along with that but if the Chair wishes, I am ready to make the statement.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I would like to have that statement.

SHRI HUMAYUN KABIR: In that case, I will make the statement.

#### STATEMENT RE. PROF. HALDANE

THE MINISTER OF SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH AND CULTURAL AFFAIRS (SHRI HUMAYUN KABIR): Madam Deputy Chairman, in reply to a Short Notice Question on 12th June 1962, I said in the Lok Sabha:

1. Prof. Haldane was appointed Head of the Genetics and Biometry Unit with a small supporting staff as from 1st November 1961 and he and his staff had drawn their salary in the first week of December 1961.

2. The house selected by Prof. Haldane has been secured and is being repaired according to the wishes of Prof. Haldane, and

3. Office accommodation for the Unit has been provided at the Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental Medicine.

To my regret and surprise, Prof. Haldane contradicted this in the Press and alleged that officers of the C.S.I.R. had given me false information and as such my statement in Parliament was false. An analysis of Prof. Haldane's own statement will show that his allegations are completely unjustified.

Prof. Haldane has said nothing about my first observation that he knew that he was appointed Head of the Genetics and Biometry Unit as from 1st November 1961. He has therefore virtually admitted that his earlier remarks to the Press that he did not know of the existence of the Unit nor when he was appointed were not based on facts.

Regarding my second observation, Prof. Haldane has complained that the architects have not carried out his wishes in details. The work carried out so far has by and large been in accordance with his wishes, and where there have been differences between him and the architects, we have instructed them to conform to his wishes.

Prof. Haldane has also complained that only five rooms are being repaired and he has not obtained a plan for the repairs of the remaining part of the house. He has apparently forgotten that on January 10, 1962, he wrote to the architects that he wanted six rooms in the south wing with electric lighting and water and added,

"I am quite aware that the repair of the north wing will take some time, and that until this is done, I cannot have laboratory accommodation. I wish, however, to emphasise that we can start work as soon as we have rooms available for offices and stores and a wall or

[Shri Humayun Kabir.]

fence round the garden. Laboratory facilities are not needed in the early stages of genetical research."

The architects have reported that half the building should be ready within three weeks and plans for re-conditioning the remaining rooms have been prepared.

As I told the Lok Sabha on the 12th June, 1962, possession of this house was handed to C.S.I.R. only on 16th March, 1962, and to renovate half of this dilapidated 150 year old house within three months cannot surely be regarded as a sign of lethargy or indifference on the part of the officers of C.S.I.R.

Prof. Haldane has objected to my third observation that office accommodation has been provided in the Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental Medicine and complained that only half a table has been provided there for his Administrative Officer and none for himself or his scientific colleagues. My statement was in reply to Prof. Haldane's remark in the Press asking C.S.I.R. to tell him the address of his Unit. I may add that the Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental Medicine has not only provided accommodation to his Administrative Officer but is also offering the facilities of secretarial and accounts staff to the Unit.

I do not say that this is a completely satisfactory state of affairs but I would like to point out that this is Prof. Haldane's own choice. He declined our offer to set up his laboratory in a rented flat in Calcutta and preferred to work in his own house pending the renovation of the house of the late Surendranath Banerjee. The Indian Institute of Bio-Chemistry and Experimental Medicine is itself short of accommodation and Prof. Haldane has himself in a letter of the 24th March, 1961 expressed his admiration for the work of this Institute and said,

"I was very favourably impressed by the work of Dr. Ray and his colleagues. . . . The success in coping with overcrowding reminded me of F.G. Hopkin's Laboratory about 1920. This is a very high compliment."

It is surprising that Prof. Haldane should pay the Institute a compliment for improvising but at the same time be so impatient with the transitional arrangements which have been made at his own desire pending renovation of the house intended for his laboratory.

Prof. Haldane has complained that officers of the C.S.I.R. have given me false information and have been thwarting and frustrating him. The facts are quite the contrary. Many rules and procedures have been dispensed with or modified to accommodate him. He has been allowed to draw salaries without signing a pre-receipted salary bill. He and his colleagues have been exempted from signing forms which all officers have to fill on appointment. The C.S.I.R. also offered to place a block grant at his disposal, so that he would have complete freedom to operate and administer the funds of his Unit. He was told that he could appoint his staff on contract and thus obviate the necessity of following the various procedures of a departmental set-up.

It will thus be seen that Prof. Haldane chose the name and designation of the Unit which he was to direct, chose his staff to man the Unit, chose the building in which the Unit was to be housed, chose to work in his own house instead of moving into rented accommodation till the permanent building of the Unit was ready, and announced its existence to the outside world even before the house which it was to inhabit was ready for occupation. Only one instance has been reported to me in which the C.S.I.R. stood in the way

of Prof. Haldane's inclinations and this has nothing to do with scientific research. During the last general elections he wanted to campaign for certain candidates and was advised against it.

On the basis of these facts I leave it to the House to judge whose statements are correct and whose otherwise.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): Now, I would like the hon. Minister to clarify, to throw some light on this statement of Prof. Haldane which has been published in the Hindusthan Standard of the 17th June. Full text is there. He says: "No doubt I have annoyed them by refusing to sign a document to the effect that my appointment was temporary...." That is to say, the Government wanted him to sign a document to the effect that his appointment was temporary and Prof. Haldane did not agree to it. That is how the signing of the document question came up and reference has been made to that. Then the hon. Minister referred to the block grant. This is what he has to say: "I am told to ask for a block grant to cover the salaries of my colleagues without any statement of what accommodation will be available for them, or what security of position will be offered to them." Therefore he did not accept the suggestion in the manner in which it was made, this suggestion about block grants. What has he got to say about this?

With regard to repairs he has said here: "Some repairs are being carried out according to my desire, other according to the desire of Messrs. Ballardie, Thompson and Matthews contrary to my expressed wishes. More serious, no repairs are being carried out to the other rooms in the north wing though I received a verbal promise...." Here, is it not a fact that this company was asked to carry out the repairs and later on they

pointed out that they needed 40 tons of cement? This was the excuse given. Madam Deputy Chairman, here is a transcript of a certain newspaper correspondent from Delhi sponsored by the Government which was sent to the paper but was not published in which the Government wanted it to be said that the repair work could not be carried out because 40 tons of cement were not available although everybody knows that this company is a big company and it should not be difficult for it to get 40 tons of cement. Why is there no mention about this 40 tons of cement business? Now, Madam Deputy Chairman, here the Professor makes a categorical statement . . .

SHRI M. R. SHERVANI (Uttar Pradesh): He is making a speech.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You asked only for a clarification. Please be brief.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Last point. Here he says: "It is the intolerable conditions imposed by bureaucrats and not the low salaries or the lack of equipment which cause so many Indians to take up posts abroad. I hope that my resignation . . .

SHRI M. R. SHERVANI: What is the clarification which he seeks?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is making his last point.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Last but one point.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please be brief.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: I would demand a discussion on this. So this is what the Professor has said. His complaint is not merely that you have not given him this thing or that thing but about the manner in which you have been behaving with him and he has said that insult has been added to injury. These are very serious

[Shri Bhupesh Gupta.]  
allegations as you will agree. I am not asking, Madam Deputy Chairman, to give any judgment. All I say is, here is a world-famous scientist who feels that he has been treated in this manner. We know other scientists had to complain in the past. These are statements and counter-statements made from this side and from the Professor's side. I would only request, Madam Deputy Chairman, to give us an opportunity to have a discussion on the hon. Minister's statement. I think the other Opposition parties will join with us in making this demand and we can jointly give a motion for the discussion because we cannot allow our scientific institutions and scientific research to be treated in the manner in which you treat certain Government employees. Prof. Haldane is a man of such great renown; he knows it, I know it and everybody knows it. Am I to understand . . .

(Interruptions)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you want a discussion or do you want a clarification?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Why did the hon. Minister make the statement in the other House that it is his concern whether he has half of a table as the research centre or some such thing? Don't you think the scientist will be hurt by it? Scientists also have susceptibilities . . .

(Interruptions)

SHRI M. R. SHERVANI: What is all this? He is really wasting the time of the House. There is the question of time.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have already taken five minutes.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: Madam Deputy Chairman, we demand that this matter should be discussed on a

motion by us. (Interruptions) Why is he standing up every time? Is he a Deputy Minister?

(Interruptions)

SHRI T. S. PATTABIRAMAN (Madras): Who are you?

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: What about our demand for a discussion?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is another point. First you rose asking for a clarification. Has the hon. Minister anything to say about it?

SHRI HUMAYUN KABIR: So far as my statement is concerned, I have nothing to add. And most of the things which my hon. friend, Mr. Bhupesh Gupta, said just now are either irrelevant or have no bearing on the question. But one thing I would like to say. I did say in the other House that it was Prof. Haldane's concern whether he carries on his research in a bathroom or in his bedroom. That was based on what he himself had written to us that he wanted to use his bedroom for research. I have no hesitation in saying that that statement I should not have made. Whatever his attitude, whatever the provocation he may have given, a person occupying a responsible position, Madam, as I do with the blessing of this House should not have lost his temper.

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA: It is only confusion worse confounded. Madam, we are entitled to have a discussion on this matter. This is a matter to be considered by us.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned till 2.00 P.M.

The House then adjourned for lunch at six minutes past one of the clock.