

[Secretary.]

dure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose herewith a copy of the Dowry Prohibition Bill, 1959 as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 9th December, 1959."

Sir, I lay the Bill on the Table of the House.

RESOLUTION RE GIVING COLOUR TO HYDROGENATED EDIBLE OILS—continued

श्रीमती सावित्री निगम : उप समापति महोदय, यद्यपि सदन के लगभग अधिकांश सदस्यों ने इस प्रस्ताव का पूरी तौर से समर्थन किया है फिर भी कुछ सदस्यों ने इस के विरुद्ध बड़ी ही विचित्र सी धारणाएँ उपस्थित की हैं। इसमें, श्रीमन्, उनका दोष नहीं है। वनस्पति धी ने एक नई सम्यता—वनस्पति सम्यता—उत्पन्न कर दी है और श्रीमन्, इस सम्यता के प्रभाव से हमारी मनोवृत्ति भी बड़ी कृत्रिम, बनावटी सी बन गई है, इसीलिये इसे वनस्पति मनोवृत्ति हम कह सकते हैं। यह कृत्रिमता पिछले वर्षों में इतनी तेज रफ्तार से बढ़ी है कि आज के दिन हम ऐसी स्थिति में पहुँच गये हैं कि हमारे लिये यह पहिचानना ही कठिन नहीं हो गया है कि यह असली धी है या वनस्पति धी है, यह पीतल या सोना है बल्कि यह पहिचानना भी मुश्किल हो गया है कि कौन शत्रु है, कौन मित्र है। श्रीमन्, यह दिखावटीपन इतनी गहराई से व्याप्त हो गया है कि बड़े बड़े सम्प्रांत परिवारों में भी धी के मामले में इतना एडल्टरेशन होने लगा है कि परिवार की रसोई में दो दो प्रकार के भोजन बनने लगे हैं। और यह सारी देन केवल वनस्पति धी की है। इस प्रकार के डबल स्टैण्डर्ड जो समाज में प्रचलित हो रहे हैं उसका कारण यह है कि जैसा खाये अन्न वैसा होये मन।

श्रीमन्, इसी दिल्ली में डालडा से मक्खन बनाने की तीन, चार फैक्ट्रियाँ पकड़ी गई

हैं। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी का ध्यान तेल धानी कमेटी की ओर दिलाना चाहता हूँ। श्रीमन्, इसके वैज्ञानिक सर्वेक्षण के आधार पर हम सब इस निश्चय पर पहुँचते हैं कि स्वस्थ रहने के लिए जितने तेल या चिकनाहट की पर कैपिटल देश में आवश्यकता है उसके हिसाब से आज एडिबल आइल याने खाने वाले तेल की तादाद बहुत कम है, यानी रिक्वायरमेंट पूरा करने के लिये भी पर्याप्त नहीं है। इसके अतिरिक्त उसमें यह भी कहा गया है कि किसी तरह के भी एडिबल आइल का एक्सपोर्ट न किया जाय। इसे भी सरकार ने माना है क्योंकि इसी आधार पर एक्सपोर्ट इम्पोर्ट में कुछ अंतर किया गया है। इसके अलावा उन्होंने यह भी सिफारिश की है कि चूँकि एडिबल आइल खाने के लिये इतना कम है कि वह लोगों को पर्याप्त मात्रा में खाने को नहीं मिलता इसलिये साबुन भी उस तेल से न बनाया जाय। एक्सपोर्ट पालिसी के सम्बन्ध में उन्होंने यह मांग की है और सख्त हिदायत की है कि तेल यहां से एक्सपोर्ट न हों। उनकी सिफारिशों का आम तौर से उद्देश्य यह है कि जो एडिबल आइलस हमारे देश में उपलब्ध हैं, जिनमें कि काफी पोषक तत्व विद्यमान हैं, वे पोषक तत्व और तेल हमारे देश की चालीस करोड़ जनता को अधिक से अधिक संख्या में, अधिक से अधिक मात्रा में मिल सकें।

श्रीमन्, अब हमें यह देखना है कि इस तेल के उत्पादन द्वारा हमारे व्यवसायी जो हजारपति थे वे लखपति और लखपति करोड़पति बन रहे हैं वे किस तरह बन रहे हैं। उसी तेल में उलटफेर करके उसी को जमा कर, उसी में मिलावट करके और एक दूसरा लेबिल लगा कर, जो गरीब जनता का भोजन है, उस भोजन के साथ इतना जबर्दस्त खिलवाड़ हो रहा है कि लाखों करोड़ों की सम्पत्ति वाले लोग डालडा को, एडिबल आइल को कनबर्ट करके, मिला

जला करके करोड़पति बन रहे हैं। श्रीमन्, इस डालडा से बने घी से किसका ज्यादा फायदा हुआ है? एक तरफ इंडस्ट्रियलिस्ट का फायदा हो रहा है, तो दूसरी तरफ नुक्सान किसका हो रहा है? पूरे देश के स्वास्थ्य का। यहाँ पर कई एक माननीय सदस्यों ने भन्नी प्रकार से समझाया है, कि किस प्रकार डालडा का सेवन करने से चूहे अंधे हो जाते हैं, इसान भी अंधे हो जाते हैं। हमें किसी वैज्ञानिक खोज की आवश्यकता नहीं है। हमें स्वयं मालूम है कि विटमिन ए जिस तेल में नहीं होगा या जिस तेलयुक्त पदार्थ में नहीं होगा और जिसके अपने भी पोषक तत्व मार डाले जायेंगे, क्योंकि उसको जब हाइड्रोजनेटेड किया जायगा और प्रोसेस किया जायगा, तो उसके जो पोषक तत्व होंगे, वे भी उस क्रिया में मर जायेंगे; और आप समझ सकते हैं कि यह मानी हुई बात है कि उस हालत में उससे तरह तरह का नुक्सान होगा, थ्रोम्बोसिस होगा, और बीमारियाँ होंगी। हार्ट के डिजीज जो शहरों में ज्यादा बढ़ रहे हैं, वे इस बात का प्रमाण हैं; क्योंकि देहातों में डालडा कम जाता है। तो इस बात को जानने के लिये हमें किसी वैज्ञानिक खोज और किसी अनुसंधान की जरूरत नहीं है। जो सन् १९५१ में उसके विषय में बात कही जा चुकी है, वह काफी है। श्रीमन्, हमारे उम समय के खाद्य मंत्री महोदय ने भी इस बात को स्वाकार किया था। वनस्पति घी का जो व्यवसाय है, उस पर रोक थाम लगनी चाहिये; क्योंकि यह एक और पूरे राष्ट्र के स्वास्थ्य का प्रश्न है और एक और पूजापतियों के और अधिक सम्पन्न बनने का प्रश्न है। एक और प्रश्न है, लोगों की बेराइटी का। एक सज्जन ने कहा : हमको तेल में महक आती है। उनको महक आती होगी, अगर उनका नषाबी मिजाज है। लेकिन उस जनता को जो दोनों जून भोजन जुटा नहीं पाती, उसकी हमें परवाह करनी है। हमें इस प्रकार नाक भों सिकोड़ने वाले न तो राजनीतिज्ञों की

अनुमति से काम है और न हमें उनकी पसंदगी से ताल्लुक है। हमें ताल्लुक है, चालीस करोड़ जनता से जिसको आज दोनों जून भोजन उपलब्ध नहीं है।

श्री शीलभद्र याजी : आप प्रस्ताव के खिलाफ बोल रही हैं, प्रस्ताव पर बोलिये, कलरिंग पर बोलिये।

श्रीमती सावित्री निगम : श्रीमन्, इसीलिये मैं अनुरोध करना चाहती हूँ कि जो कलरिंग करने का प्रस्ताव है, डालडा और वनस्पति घी को कलरिंग करने का प्रस्ताव है, उसके ऊपर सरकार शीघ्र विचार करे। लेकिन यह प्रस्ताव तभी स्वीकृत होगा, जब हमारे खाद्य मंत्री महोदय इस बात को मान जायेंगे और उनको इस तरह की गलतफहमी दिलाने वाली दलीलें न दी जायेंगी कि डालडा स्वास्थ्य के लिये हानिकारक है या नहीं।

श्रीमन्, दूसरी दलील जो वनस्पति घी के विरुद्ध दी जा रही है, वह यह है—कई भाइयों ने कहा है—कि विदेशों में तमाम वनस्पति घी खाया जाता है। लेकिन मैं कहना चाहती हूँ कि जिस तरह के पोषक तत्व विदेशों में, अमेरिका में या इंग्लैंड में या यूरोप में जनता को उपलब्ध है जिस दिन वे पोषक तत्व हमारे देश में हर एक आदमी को उपलब्ध होने लगेंगे, उस दिन—वह दिन जब आ जाये तो, चाहे दस वर्ष बाद आए या पन्द्रह वर्ष बाद—तो फिर से फैक्टरी बनाने की इजाजत दे दी जाये। अभी मेरे दो अनुरोध हैं : एक तो जल्दी से जल्दी, बिना विलम्ब के, वनस्पति घी को कलर करने के लिये कोई न कोई फार्मूला, कोई न कोई प्रोसेस, ऐसी निकालनी चाहिये जिससे उसकी पहचान हो सके। मेरा विश्वास है कि खाद्य-मंत्रालय और खाद्य मंत्री महोदय, अगर वे पूरे सदन की राय नहीं बल्कि तमाम जनता की, अथवा की, राय और डेमोक्रेटिक व्यवस्था में

[श्रीमती सावित्री निगम]

विश्वास करते होंगे और इसका मानते होंगे, तो मेरी इस बात को अपनी हृदय में धारण कर लेंगे और शीघ्रातिशीघ्र हमें सदन में आश्वासन देंगे कि सरकार अविलम्ब वनस्पति घी कलर करने की व्यवस्था करेगी। दूसरा आश्वासन हम उनसे यह चाहते हैं कि अब कम से कम वनस्पति घी की नयी फैक्ट्रियां न खुलने दी जायें। "हाथी", "घोड़ा", "रथ", "ऊँट" "नं० १" "नं० २" इत्यादि नाम से हजारों वनस्पति घी की फैक्ट्रियां नित्य नयी खुल रही हैं। आखिर उनको लाइसेंस कहाँ से दिये जाते हैं? वे जो थोड़े से एडिबल आइल्स राष्ट्र की सम्पत्ति हैं, जो कि आज भी पूरी मात्रा में उपलब्ध नहीं हैं, जो कि एक चौथाई मिलनी चाहिये, किन्तु आज आठवें भाग की मात्रा में भी उपलब्ध नहीं हैं उनके पोषक तत्वों को नष्ट करने की जिम्मेदारी आज उन लोगों के ऊपर है जो वनस्पति घी की फैक्टरी खोलने के लिये और कारखाने के लिये बराबर लाइसेंस देते जा रहे हैं। तो मैं दो आश्वासन, श्रीमन्, चाहती हूँ और इसी उद्देश्य को लेकर मैं इसका समर्थन करने खड़ी हुई हूँ।

खाद्य मंत्री महोदय इस बात के लिये बहुत उत्सुक है कि हम लोग जल्दी से जल्दी समाप्त कर लें। इसलिए, श्रीमन्, इस प्रस्ताव का एक बार फिर समर्थन करके मैं समाप्त करती हूँ। धन्यवाद।

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: Mr. Deputy Chairman, I do not want to take up much time of the House because the hon. Deputy Minister has to go to a function.

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: That can be no consideration.

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: I am neither a doctor nor a scientist; I am a layman but I am guided by the views in the report given by the scientists and chemical analysis on this hydrogenated oil. The question is not whether to

ban or not to ban, but the question raised here is:

"This House is of opinion that Government should take early steps for giving colour to Hydrogenated edible oils commonly known as Vanaspati Ghee."

There was unnecessary excitement in the House; but one thing what I have to say is that this is not a question between ghee and vanaspati. It is a question as to whether colouring should be given to vanaspati or not. As far as I am concerned, I think, if it is possible for the Government to find out a colour which is not injurious, which will be permanent, which will be rather pleasing, which will have some flavour, then the Government has to see that colouring is given but I understand from the report that they performed 55 experiments with 55 different colours and they have not been able to find one colour which will be suitable for the purpose . . .

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: Is that the end of research?

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: . . . up to this day. But as my friend, Dr. Dube, said, in this Sputnik age it should be possible to find out a colour which will be permanent and which will not be injurious. The Government has to make some more research and find out if it is not possible to get a permanent colour. Granting that a colour which is permanent is given, do you mean to say, in a nation whose character is adulterated, whose merchants adulterate when everything in India is adulterated today, do you mean to say that they will not be able to find out some stuff which may be injurious to the health of the public to remove that permanent colouring? Now, with this hydrogenated oil ghee is adulterated. Even granting that ghee is adulterated with this hydrogenated oil, let me say that it is much better than being adulterated with the fat of dead animals. The issue before us is that we must

choose the lesser evil. Now, poor men cannot afford to go in for *ghee* paying Rs. 10 or Rs. 12 a *viss*. The other day I spent for a *viss* of *ghee* from Bengali market paying Rs. 12 and the proprietor gave me to understand that it was pure *ghee*. I am used only to *ghee* and when this *ghee* came, I found that it was nothing but fat. Sir, there is no use passing this Resolution or saying that if *vanaspati* is not coloured, it should be banned. The Food Adulteration Act is there and action can be taken to deal with this. Now, milk is adulterated but are you going to have water coloured for that? As far as Delhi is concerned, the milk that I get everyday is nothing but adulterated milk.

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: You are not complimenting the Food Ministry because they are supplying the milk.

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: I am getting milk from a private vendor. Simply because milk is adulterated with water, do you mean to say that the waters of Jamuna have to be coloured? The arm of the law is long enough to deal with these culprits who resort to adulteration. Now, there is already a little colour in *vanaspati*. It contains 5 per cent. til oil and it can be easily identified. When you have 5 per cent til oil, it is easy for us to find out whether the *ghee* is adulterated or not. And here are reports to show that hydrogenated oil in India is the next best to pure *ghee*. Even in England and other places this is used. My hon. friend, Diwan Chaman Lall, gave statistics to show that in America and other places people take hydrogenated oil. In Holland also, which produces large quantities of butter, I understand from him that 41 per cent. of the people are using hydrogenated oil and there is no such clamour there but here in India everyone . . .

SHRI ABDUL RAHIM (Madras): How is it prohibited in the house of the Prime Minister?

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: The Prime Minister is a rich person; he can well

afford to pay for pure *ghee*. I am speaking for those poor people, commoners, poor people like me.

SHRI ABDUL RAHIM: So far as I understand, there is not much difference between the price of *ghee* and that of this *vanaspati*.

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: Granting that I accept the argument that there is not much difference between the price of pure *ghee* and that of *vanaspati*, even the *ghee* which is supposed to be pure and for which you have to pay Rs. 12 a *viss*, is found to be adulterated.

SHRI P. D. HIMATSINGKA (West Bengal): If it is pure, it cannot be adulterated.

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: There is no such thing as purity in India and how could you expect purity in *ghee*?

AN HON. MEMBER: Question.

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: What we want is morality. We want national character, national morality, national conscience. Unless we rise to the occasion, there is no use passing a Resolution and having a law on paper. If you want to bring to book any person, there is the Food Adulteration Act which can be used and the arm of the law, as I said, is long enough to book anyone. No doubt, if it is possible for the Government to find—mark my word 'if it is possible'—a colour which is non-injurious, pleasing, permanent, the Government has to see that *vanaspati* is coloured—I do not want this colouring to be done with some injurious stuff which is harmful to the people—otherwise I want the *status quo* to continue so far as this *vanaspati* is concerned.

SHRI P. D. HIMATSINGKA: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, this question about colourisation of *vanaspati* was debated some years ago and a committee, as has been mentioned, was also appointed which went into the matter. There is no doubt that *ghee* is very much adulterated and because it is easy to get hydrogenated oil,

[Shri P. D. Himatsingka.]

that is also used as one of the adulterants along with the various other adulterants that were being used and that might be used even now. So far as colourisation is concerned, the report at that time was that no suitable colour was available which could conveniently be used, which would not be injurious or which would not be costly. So far as the industry is concerned, I do not think they can have the slightest objection to any steps being taken which will prevent *vanas-pati* being used as an adulterant. The question, I think, is being looked at from a wrong point of view. If it is injurious for life, certainly steps should be taken to stop that. Members who have spoken have said that so long as it is in the oil stage, it is not injurious. Therefore the question that has to be looked into is whether hydrogenating the oil makes it injurious. If it is injurious, stop it by all means. If it is not, nothing should be done to colour it. As a matter of fact, there is an interesting story. A milk vendor was prosecuted for adulterating milk. He said, "I have not adulterated milk; I have adulterated water; I have added some milk to the water, and adulterated the water". That is the position at the present moment. As a matter of fact, *ghee* is being put into Dalda and the whole thing is being sold as *ghee*. Therefore if something is done to stop this adulteration, no one can possibly take any objection but the question is whether it is practicable. You are going to add to the difficulties of the common man who needs fat and who is using this hydrogenated oil. I think most of the people—most of us—if they go to the market do not get pure *ghee*. As a matter of fact, a seer of cow's milk gives you three tolas of fat and therefore you will require at least 26 seers of milk to get one seer of *ghee*. So you can imagine the price that you will have to pay for pure *ghee*. If it is buffalo's milk, then it will be about 16 seers. Even then the price will be prohibitive. Therefore, it has become more and more difficult to get pure *ghee*, unless you keep a cow

and unless you have it in your own house. Not that the production of *ghee* has gone down. It has, I think, gone up a little, but not to the extent of the requirements of the country. Therefore, people are making up the deficiency in *ghee* by using oil and hydrogenated oil. The enquiries should be directed to see if hydrogenated oil is in any way injurious. Some of the hon. Members have said that hydrogenated oil is injurious, that it causes loss of eyesight and other kinds of disease. So far as I know, recent scientific reports in foreign countries have gone to the extent of saying that oil is better than *ghee* and hydrogenated oil. They say that it causes less of coronary thrombosis and other diseases which are due to coagulation of blood and so on. Therefore, the enquiry, if any, should be directed to that effect. Otherwise, it will be merely adding to the price and cost of hydrogenated oil which is now being taken in very large quantities by the people. And this thing is also being used in foreign countries without any objection. I think they have also examined the question scientifically. They have allowed the thing to be used, even though it might be found to be injurious.

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: But there the hon. Member will probably agree that this hydrogenated oil is not adulterated with pure *ghee* because they do not use *ghee*.

SHRI P. D. HIMATSINGKA: True. Therefore—I began with that—if the objection to hydrogenated oil is on the ground that it is being used for adulteration, there is no difficulty. No one will question that. That is a fact. That is being done. It is being used as an adulterant. But is it the fault of the industry or is it the fault of those who want to buy cheap *ghee*. If you want to have *ghee* at Rs. 4 per seer, you cannot get pure *ghee*. You will have to take something which is not *ghee*.

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: That is the reason why the hon. mover has

said that you should mix some colour in it.

SHRI P. D. HIMATSINGKA: Do it by all means. But that will not solve the question of your getting pure *ghee*. You can get pure *ghee* only if you take steps to produce more, if you improve the breed of your cattle, if you have more milch cattle. As a matter of fact, you will find motor cars and horses in every rich man's house but not a cow. Go to any town, go to any village, you will not find cows. Therefore, the production of *ghee* has not increased to the extent that we require. So, steps should be taken to see that the *ghee* that we require is produced. This colourisation is not a remedy. This will not solve the difficulty of pure *ghee* being supplied simply because you colour hydrogenated oil. Of course, it may be that hydrogenated oil cannot be used. Even today if hydrogenated oil is mixed with *ghee*, it can be detected because it is compulsory under the provisions of the present law that five per cent. of sesame oil is used and by a very simple test, as mentioned by the previous speakers and as has been mentioned in this Report, that can be detected if hydrogenated oil with sesame is mixed in *ghee*. Therefore, the fault lies in proper steps not being taken to detect adulteration and proper steps not being taken to prevent adulteration of *ghee* with vegetable oil. Therefore, I think that the proper remedy is to take certain steps to prevent adulteration and the remedy that is being suggested will not be a proper remedy.

SHRI A. M. THOMAS: Mr. Deputy Chairman, I am glad that this subject has been discussed thoroughly and from all aspects. This subject is of considerable importance, important from the point of view of the economy of the country, from the point of view of the national health of this country. This matter has been agitating the minds of hon. Members of Parliament as well as the public—the public more because they do not really know the exact position due to the prevalence of conflicting reports

on the subject. There is not a single session of Parliament when notices have not been received of motions either for colourisation of *vanaspati* or for the total banning of the manufacture of *vanaspati*. Such motions have been discussed previously also on the floor of Parliament and it is not a case of first impression at all.

May I at the outset make the Government's position clear with regard to the Resolution in hand? Although we have travelled much beyond the scope of the Resolution, I am not going to leave out the points that have been raised. They have got, although not a direct bearing, an indirect bearing on the subject matter of this Resolution. So, I will certainly be dealing with those aspects also. It may not be fair to the House also if I leave those questions that have been raised, unanswered. Regarding the Resolution that we are discussing, I will be requesting this House to negative this Resolution, not because I am opposed to the principle of the Resolution. I am not opposed to the principle of colourisation of *vanaspati* and I make the position very clear that Government itself will take necessary steps to make such colourisation compulsory as soon as a suitable colour has been found. In fact, this Resolution has, therefore, assumed importance because of the fact that *vanaspati* has been used as a common medium for adulteration of *ghee*. This Resolution has, therefore, assumed importance from that point of view. It is really a menace, the menace of adulteration. I do not want to minimise the problem at all. I have myself had recently an experience. An hon. Member of the other House sent me a sample of *ghee* that was being distributed among Members of Parliament both in South Avenue as well as North Avenue. And that person who distributed it was swearing in the name of God that it was the purest *ghee* that was available. All the same, one Member of Parliament thought that he should get it analysed. He sent it to me for analysis and I sent it to my Directorate for analysis. The result

[Shri A. M. Thomas.]

that the *ghee* which was sworn to be purest in the name of God contained 75 per cent. *vanaspati*. So, no argument is necessary to convince me or bring home to the Government the prevalence of this evil of adulteration of *ghee* with *vanaspati*.

SHRI D. A. MIRZA: May I know from the hon Minister what steps they have taken?

SHRI A. M. THOMAS: I will come to that. So, I can very well understand the righteous indignation that has been voiced on the floor of this House by Members of Parliament who have spoken on the subject.

Before I revert to the subject of colourisation, I may answer some points which should serve as a corrective to some of the opinions that have been expressed on the floor of this House. Some hon. Members—Rajkumari Amrit Kaur who spoke the other day, and Dr. Gour, Diwan Chaman Lall and some others also who spoke today—while speaking, according to me, made a very constructive approach to this problem, and they have made my task easier also. All the same, I would touch on some of the points which have been referred to on the floor of this House. Sir, the hon. Member who moved this resolution, Shri Panigrahi, mentioned these points in the course of his speech. He said:

"*Vanaspati* adversely affects the *ghee* industry and the growth of cattle in the country; and it is an enemy of the cottage industry, of oil pressing. It is prohibitive in price and it also deprives the poor man of a sufficient quantity of fresh oil."

These were some of the points that were made by the hon. Member who moved this resolution. With regard to how far this will affect the cottage industry, it is well that we just have some figures. Sir, the availability of edible fats and oils in the country at

present was—I am giving the figures:

Ghee and butter: About 5.05 lakh tons.

Vanaspati: About 3.00 lakh tons.

Edible vegetable oils: About 12.60 lakh tons.

So, altogether the availability of edible fats and oils is about 20.65 lakh tons. That means that it would provide a per capita consumption of half an ounce per day of fat as against the minimum normal requirements of two ounces according to experts. There is, therefore, plenty of scope for both the *vanaspati* and the *ghee* industries to flourish side by side and to expand and develop without impinging on each other's interests. *Vanaspati* fills the demand, as has been pointed out by one hon. Member, for a hard fat particularly among the middle classes who are unable to afford the high price of *ghee*. *Vanaspati* usually costs between half and one-third as much as *ghee*, the current rates being about Rs. 3 and Rs. 7 per seer respectively. The oils used in *vanaspati* form less than 20 per cent of the available supply of edible oils in the country, and hence it is hardly correct to say that *vanaspati* deprives the poor man of a sufficient quantity of fresh oil. So, that is the position.

Then, Sir, Shri Panigrahi observed that we are spending crores of rupees on the import of Vitamin A as an additive to *vanaspati*. It is not a correct proposition. The implication here perhaps is that Rs. 12 crores worth of Vitamins are being imported for mixing in *vanaspati*. That is not the case. In the first place, Vitamin A is now being manufactured indigenously, and secondly, even when it was being imported, the cost of the import was only around Rs. 0.40 crores per year. That was the case.

One hon. Member, Shri Amolakh Chand, just referred to the question that fish oil is being used for the

purpose of Vitamin A in *vanaspati*. That is not correct. Only synthetic Vitamin A from Lemon grass oil is used. So, that impression of his is not correct.

I will next examine the question from the point of view of health. If it has been conclusively established that the use of *vanaspati* is detrimental to the health of the nation, one should not stand on any other considerations in order to ban the manufacture of *vanaspati*. But I should say that it has not been so proved, and the available evidence and opinion on the subject only indicate that *vanaspati* is not injurious, as has been made out to be.

Then, Sir, one hon. Member observed that the use of *vanaspati* gives rise to eye defects. The reference here is presumably to the controversy associating consumption of *vanaspati* with night blindness which had arisen in 1947, following the premature publication of the results of certain researches conducted at the Indian Veterinary Research Institute, Izzatnagar. Detailed confirmatory researches since carried out at different national laboratories as well as at the Izzatnagar laboratory itself, including feeding experiments on human subjects, have shown that these fears are incorrect, and that *vanaspati* of melting point of 37° C—that is very important—had no deleterious effect as compared with raw or refined groundnut oil, and that its nutritive value was at least as good as that of raw and refined groundnut oil. In order to further improve its nutritive value *vis-a-vis* that of *ghee*, the incorporation of 700 international units of Vitamin A per ounce of *vanaspati* has been made compulsory for the past several years. That is the position.

With regard to the other matter, namely, its effect on the heart and other things, of course, it is certainly a matter of concern, but I may inform the hon. House that the position that has been indicated in the answer

given by the hon. Health Minister does not lead to the conclusion that has been drawn by the hon. Member, Shri Panigrahi. The position is this. This matter was considered, and even when that answer was given, the Health Minister said that the present evidence showed that taking too much of hydrogenated oil or even *ghee* was injurious to health and that the evidence was that too much consumption of hydrogenated vegetable oils was associated with coronary heart diseases. This statement was apparently based on a somewhat liberal interpretation of the conclusions arrived at by the joint meeting and the Nutrition Advisory Committee and the Cardio-Vascular Diseases and Hypertension Sub-Committee of the Indian Council of Medical Research held on 9th July 1959 after a detailed survey of the knowledge so far available on the subject. The position is now the following:

There is no definite evidence that the consumption of hydrogenated vegetable fats leads to the development of coronary heart disease. In fact, *vanaspati* is put on a par with *ghee*. Over-consumption of fat, for that matter even of coconut oil, should, perhaps, lead to that. In fact it gave me a shock when it was said that coconut oil also stood on a par with them, as it is a cooking medium in the South, because excessive use of coconut oil will have a similar tendency as consumption of any other fat. There is, however, considerable evidence pointing to the fact—and hon. Members who were of the view that this is injurious to cottage industry may bear in mind this aspect—that excessive consumption of fats, rich in saturated fatty acids like hydrogenated vegetable oil, butter, *ghee* and coconut oil, as opposed to fats rich in polyunsaturated fatty acids like gingelly oil, groundnut oil and safflower oil and mustard oil leads to increase in serum cholesterol levels—which, in turn, have been found to be associated with increased incidence of coronary heart disease. There were still many gaps in our present knowledge in regard

[Shri A. M. Thomas.]

to the pathogenesis of coronary heart disease, and a definite conclusion in this regard can only be arrived at after these gaps are filled by continued work in the laboratories in India and abroad. Then there is the conclusion that has been quoted by the hon. Member, Shri Avinashilingam Chettiar, who spoke. On this matter, in fact, I have got also with me the latest brief that has been received in this connection from the Ministry of Health, but it is more or less on the same lines that I have just now stated, and I do not want to tire the House by quoting those opinions also.

The hon. Member, Shri Jugal Kishore, who spoke on the last day, said that researches on the effect of feeding *ghee* and *vanaspati* to rats carried out at the Izzatnagar laboratory have shown that within six months the former gave birth to their offspring, while the latter died, that the continued consumption of *vanaspati* permitted by the Government would, therefore, appear to be nothing else but a birth control device for reducing the population. This has been his argument in this connection. While it is a fact that certain researches carried out at the Indian Veterinary Research Institute, Izzatnagar in 1946 did seem to indicate that feeding *vanaspati* to rats might result in loss of fertility in the third generation, subsequent confirmatory researches initiated by Government at various national laboratories, including the Izzatnagar laboratory itself, failed to confirm these results, and in fact proved that *vanaspati* was as harmless and nutritive as the raw or refined groundnut oil. Sir, when Shri Panigrahi and some other hon. Members spoke on the last occasion, they said that *vanaspati* was being manufactured only in this country and that it was not being manufactured in other countries and utilised. I am glad that Diwan Chaman Lall has given a direct answer to that argument. I have got some figures about it. He has also given some figures with regard to its

consumption. It may not have been known by the name of *vanaspati* itself, but it is known there by the name of margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening. My hon. friend has quoted the United States of America. In fact, according to the figures that I have got, based on some reports obtained in 1955, the United States of America produce margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening to the extent of 13,24,700 tons and it produces only 7,35,000 tons of *ghee* and butter. About the *per capita* consumption, my friend gave a different figure. Anyhow, the figures in my possession indicate the *per capita* consumption in America of margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening to be 18.4 lbs. per head per annum, whereas butter and *ghee* consumption comes to only 8.7 lbs. But that has roughly been indicated by Diwan Chaman Lallji as 9 lbs. Against this figure, according to the figure in 1955, India manufactured 2,60,000 tons of margarine, etc., and the consumption comes to 2,65,000 tons, and the *per capita* consumption of margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening comes only to 1.6 lbs., whereas the consumption of butter and *ghee* comes to 2.4 lbs. Take for example Canada where the *per capita* consumption of margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening comes to 16.5 lbs., whereas in the case of butter and *ghee* it comes to 20 lbs. Then take Denmark and the Netherlands where the dairy industry has been developed. In the Netherlands, they produce margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening to the extent of 1,98,000 tons, whereas the production of butter and *ghee* comes to 81,800 tons. The *per capita* consumption of margarine, etc., there comes to 40.8 lbs., whereas the consumption of butter and *ghee* comes only to 6.2 lbs. so that it is a misapprehension that . . .

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: What about the 1959 figures? You are quoting figures for 1955.

SHRI A. M. THOMAS: It will only be a little more. Diwan Chaman Lallji quoted more recent figures in his speech in respect of the United States of America. That indicates an

increased consumption of margarine, *vanaspati* and shortening there. That necessarily indicates that the consumption has not gone down, so that, Sir, we need not be afraid on that score at all.

Sir, now, I shall come to the question of colourisation which is the subject matter of this Resolution.

SHRI AKBAR ALI KHAN. What steps are the Government taking to increase the production?

SHRI A. M. THOMAS: I am coming to that.

Coming to the subject matter of the Resolution, my friend, Shri Amolakh Chand, quoted the opinion of the late Dr. Bhatnagar, the great scientist, to whom we are all indebted. I have now got with me the opinion that he gave in 1949. After a tour of the Western countries, he wrote a letter to Mr. Moni, I.C.S. who was then in the Food and Agriculture Ministry. My hon. friends will just hear what he says:

"I studied the subject during my tour in England, U.S.A. and France and visited the best experts and consulted them. The considered opinion of all the world authorities is against colourisation for technical and health reasons. Adulteration with real ghee should be punished severely. But the sesame oil which is compulsorily added to *vanaspati* is quite capable of being detected and no better material has so far been discovered"

He continues—

"of all adulterants which the ghee merchants and sellers use for adulteration of ghee, *vanaspati* is still the safest. The remedy lies in a vigil by government authorities and inspectors, and I do not recommend colourisation. It would be against my professional etiquette if I suggest a dye which may prove harmful to the people . . .

Underline the words "which may prove harmful to the people"

" . . . and may not help the Government. My advice is to let *vanaspati* be used as it is a good wholesome food".

That is his recommendation.

SHRI AMOLAKH CHAND: May I know from the hon. Deputy Minister whether the Government of India accepted this advice and has ceased to do anything, to take any steps regarding colourisation?

SHRI A. M. THOMAS: Sir, a Committee was appointed in this regard. I am coming to the point. The Government is not going to accept the view of Dr. Bhatnagar with regard to this colourisation. The Government itself appointed the Ghee Adulteration Committee, in 1951, the report of which was frequently quoted by hon. Members, for suggesting measures to eliminate or minimise the adulteration of ghee with *vanaspati*. Sir, they made two main recommendations to which I think it would be only proper that I should refer. One recommendation was that under the Vegetable Oil Products Control Order, 1947, incorporation of sesame oil in *vanaspati* is compulsory so that the product gives the Baudouin Test which is a distinctive test for the presence of sesame oil. In order to facilitate the detection of *vanaspati* in ghee, the Government should ensure by law that every batch of *vanaspati* produced in a factory should be certified that it gives the Baudouin Test. This test has been found to be of universal application and efforts should be made to make extensive use of this test by municipalities and other public bodies. This is recommendation No. 1 and we have accepted it in full and have implemented it. I come to the second recommendation which has been referred to by Dr. Shrimati Seeta Parmanand. She referred to this and said that the Government had not taken any steps in this direction. Sir, the second recommendation is as follows:

"As the Baudouin Test cannot be used for detection of adulterated

[Shri A. K. Das.]

ghee by the ordinary consumer, who has no laboratory facilities, all *vanaspati* produced in the country should be coloured orange by using carotene oil concentrate."

the second recommendation which was made by them. Of these recommendations, as I have already said, the first one has been implemented. All *vanaspati* factories have been directed to maintain with effect from 1st April 1953 a record of the Baudouin Test of each batch of *vanaspati* produced and each batch has to be certified by the factory chemist that the same conforms to the required Baudouin Test.

There are other recommendations on which steps have been taken. A laboratory has been set up under the Directorate of Sugar and *Vanaspatti* for the analysis of samples. Specifications have been prescribed for *vanaspati* under the Prevention of Food Adulteration Act as well. The addition of any colour or flavour to *vanaspati* resembling that of *ghee* has been prohibited. The use of oils like coconut oil, whose presence in *vanaspati* is likely to render its detection in *ghee* difficult has also been prohibited. The other recommendation was not accepted because the colour imparted by carotene oil concentrate to *vanaspati* is of an unstable nature and disappears when *vanaspati* is heated or is kept even without heating for some months. It has, therefore, been considered necessary to wait for the results of the various experiments which are being carried on for finding out a more suitable colouring medium for *vanaspati*. So, that recommendation even if implemented, would have been practically of no use and it would have also given rise to certain toxic effects. That is what the experiment has revealed.

The Ghee Adulteration Committee of which much was said in this hon. House, also prescribed certain qualifications for the colour. That point also the hon. House has to bear in mind. They said that the colour should

be easily soluble in *vanaspati*. The *vanaspati* thus coloured should be pleasing to the eye. The quantity of the colour required should be small. The addition of the colour should not cause a change in the taste or flavour of *vanaspati*. The colour should be cheap and easily available. The colour should be fast and should not be capable of easy removal by chemical or physical methods.

The colour should be heat-stable and should not decompose at the frying temperature (about 220 °C).

The colour should be non-toxic when consumed over a period of time and should exert no cumulative effect.

Sir, it is not fair to make a charge against the Food and Agriculture Ministry that it has not taken the necessary steps. In 1955, even after the submission of the report, the Minister for Food and Agriculture convened a conference of scientific experts from all parts of the country and urged on them the necessity of finding a suitable colour for colouring *vanaspati* but the considered opinion of that conference was to the effect that so far there was no suitable colour available which could be used for colouring *vanaspati*. But experiments are going on. Recently, during question hour, it was suggested that some foreign countries might have found out a suitable colour and it was asked: Why not borrow it, and in this Sputnik age, is it very difficult to find a colour? In fact, no country has been able to find a suitable colour so far.

In this connection one of my friends who spoke said that there is colourisation of butter in foreign countries. That is to make it yellow and that is only for aesthetic purpose that colour has been given as it is given for sweets here, for example, and that does not ensure that the colour cannot be removed or when heated the colour would be stable.

Sir, so far the experiments carried out at the various scientific institu-

tions in India in this respect have not yielded satisfactory results. Coal-tar dyes, as a class, are considered neither safe nor suitable colouring agents for foodstuffs, particularly for a cooking medium like *vanaspati* because these substances have a tendency to decompose on heating into toxic amines and may even be carcinogenic. Colours of vegetable origin obtained from *Ratanjot*, *Chlorophyll*, *curcuma*, etc., are either unstable and can be easily removed by simple treatment and will, therefore, not serve the desired purpose because unscrupulous persons will still be able to cheat the public by removing such a colour and then using the product for adulteration. So, for the present there appears to be nothing better than the latent colourisation by sesame oil, which is already being done compulsorily. Of course, further researches are continuing in our laboratories, for example, the Central Drug Research Institute, Lucknow, the Central Food Technological Research Institute, Mysore, the National Chemical Laboratory, Poona, etc. All these laboratories are conducting researches in this direction. Any result that is obtained in these researches will be put to test again and verified whether it is a suitable colour for colourisation of *vanaspati ghee*. I may inform the House that the Central Food Technological Research Institute, Mysore, has developed a handy test-kit for enabling the Baudouin Test to be applied on *vanaspati* by the housewife; this kit which is now being produced and marketed by Messrs. Gardeners Corporation, New Delhi, is priced at Rs. 1.70 nP. per kit, which can be used for 25 tests. The Central Drug Research Institute, Lucknow, is pursuing its work on the determination of the chronic toxicity of *Ratanjot* but as the CSIR report itself points out, this dye "is unstable and can be removed by simple treatment as all vegetable colours are".

So, Sir, this is the position. The Government has done everything in its power. The principle of the Resolution is accepted. If had been accept-

ed long ago—and steps are being taken. It would not be justified to charge the Government for not taking any steps. Steps are being taken. I hope that the hon. the Mover of the Resolution would be persuaded not to press this Resolution because the principle of the Resolution is accepted. That is all that I have to say.

SHRI S PANIGRAHI (Orissa) Mr Deputy Chairman, I have heard the speeches delivered by a large number of hon Members in this House on my Resolution and I am very happy that almost all the Members who have spoken on this subject have supported the contention of giving a colour to the *vanaspati ghee*. A few hon. Members have levelled criticisms with regard to adulteration and with regard to the point whether it is injurious to health or not but even they have not objected to the spirit of this Resolution. Therefore, I am grateful for the contributions made by all the learned friends of this House.

Sir, I may be allowed to say something with regard to the remarks offered by the hon. lady Member, Rajkumari Amrit Kaur. She has also not objected to the objective of the Resolution, i.e. giving a colour to *vanaspati ghee*. But she has tried to convince the House that it is not injurious to our health. Similarly, our learned friend, Diwan Chaman Lal also commended the acceptance of the Resolution by the House, although he has offered some criticisms. While offering their criticisms friends like these Members have pointed out that in foreign countries, *vanaspati ghee* is being manufactured and used on an extensive scale. But with regard to this I must submit that the diet habit of Western countries and the diet habit of the people of this country are different. The people in the Western countries are not accustomed to fried articles, I mean fried food. Therefore, their habit is different from our habit.

Then, there is another point. Our hon. Minister has also stated that the

[Shri S. Panigrahi.]

consumption of pure *ghee* and the supply of pure *ghee* can be made much more. In that context, I may say that if the demand for *ghee* is not increased, the supply of *ghee* also will not increase. So, if the demand for *ghee* is increased the supply also will increase and people in the villages will find employment and if the *ghee* is manufactured on a larger scale, then its price also will come down, and the problem of getting *ghee* at a cheaper price will also be solved. The price of hydrogenated edible oil is more than the price of pure oil. Therefore, with regard to price it cannot be said that middle-class people are benefited by the existence of hydrogenated edible oil.

Sir, another point I want to answer. Another friend has stated that adulteration is there in our national character, in our habit and customs, and so it is in existence on a large scale, and, therefore, there is no need either to give a colour to *vanaspati ghee* or to do anything so that its use can be minimised or the evils can be minimised. I am not agreeable to this contention. Because there is one evil, we should not encourage another evil and move about feeling happy about it. The poor man should be allowed to have pure oil at a cheaper price. We cannot be justified in saying that hydrogenated oil is cheaper than pure *ghee*. If hydrogenated oil is cheaper than pure *ghee*, then why should the people be not left with still cheaper pure oil?

Then, another point is with regard to the Baudouin Test and with regard to the addition of sesame oil with hydrogenated edible oil. With regard to these points, my submission is this. This test is not easy. It cannot be done in villages where there is no laboratory and it cannot be done by the illiterate ignorant people. Therefore some easy test, a test which will be easier for any ignorant and illiterate man even in the villages to apply and find out the existence of hydrogenated oil in pure

ghee, should be devised so that the colour given to hydrogenated oil will be revealed in the test applied to find out whether the *ghee* was pure or adulterated.

Then the other points I have already mentioned, Sir. There is no controversy about giving a colour to hydrogenated oil. The other controversial matters have been discussed in this House in all aspects and I am not going to deal with those matters. As I have stated at the very beginning, I am less concerned with the technical aspects of it. Whether *vanaspati ghee* and other varieties of it are beneficial to health or injurious to health are all technical matters about which I am not competent to give an opinion, but so far as this Resolution is concerned, even in this Resolution it has not been mentioned that immediate steps be taken. I have only mentioned that early steps be taken. So the Resolution is not only non-controversial but also harmless and innocent. Even if the Government cannot take immediate steps—I do not deny that they are taking some steps already—I do not mind, but I wish that sincere efforts must be made and early steps must be taken so that they could discover a suitable and stable colour to colour hydrogenated oil, and I am confident that they can find out such a colour.

Sir, then I may refer to one of the answers given by our Minister for Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs on the 26th November, 1959, which is the latest position with regard to giving a colour to *vanaspati*. He has stated:

'We have found out this compound which is very promising because it is colourless, and by a very simple test it brings out some colour if *ghee* is adulterated, and that is why it will be a more effective test than trying to colour *vanaspati*. If *vanaspati* is coloured that might be washed away, but since this is colourless the ordinary housewife, by a very simple test can find out

whether *vanaspati* has been added to ghee or not."

The hon. Deputy Minister for Food and Agriculture has now explained the latest position, but I do not know whether that position is in keeping with the statement made by the Minister for Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs. The Minister for Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs, Shri Humayun Kabir, has said that they have found out a chemical compound but the only difficulty is that it is colourless and it will also not be visible. Again the hon. Minister, Shri Kabir, says on the 26th November, 1959:

"We have found one material which is very promising, which appears to be without any toxicity and without any harmful effects. But in order to be sure, the test must be for at least 18 months or so. We have already completed the test for about one year."

According to this hon. Minister also they are expected to experiment with it at least for 18 months to come to a final solution with regard to finding a colour, and they have already spent a year.

SHRI A. M. THOMAS: Our only anxiety is that the remedy should not be worse than the disease.

SHRI S. PANIGRAHI: So by the end of six months from now at least I hope they will be able to find out a colour which could be given to hydrogenated oil. I only request the hon. Minister that they should make sincere efforts and I wish that they succeed.

There is another point, Sir. When this problem is dealt with, we find that the Food and Agriculture Ministry shifts the responsibility to the Health Ministry, and the Health Ministry shifts the responsibility to the Food and Agriculture Ministry, and at times, it is also brought within the scope of the Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs Ministry. I think that may be one of the reasons for which the experiment is not becoming successful or

they are not achieving success in this regard. I therefore earnestly request the hon. Minister to have co-ordination in their attempts to find out a colour, and I wish them success in that direction.

Another point that I want to refer to in this behalf is this: Some of my friends who have spoken earlier,—I think they are Shri Amolakh Chand and Dr. Barlingay—have mentioned that powerful forces are there in existence even in Government offices, and I won't be surprised if somebody were to say that there are powerful cells in Government offices on behalf of the *vanaspati* industry. Therefore, Sir, we must exercise caution and we must work in such a fashion that Government officials and scientists would not be the subject of pressure or persuasion by the *vanaspati* industry. Having made these submissions, Sir, I say that when the Minister for Scientific Research and Cultural Affairs has already declared that by the end of the next few months they would be in a position to find out a colour for *vanaspati* oil, either the Government should take the responsibility, find out a suitable colour and give it to *vanaspati* or hydrogenated edible oil, or, if they are unable to do so, then they should ask the *vanaspati* industry, compel the *vanaspati* industry to find out the colour. And if the *vanaspati* industry also should not be able to come out with a colour within a period of, say, six months, then that industry should be asked to stop further production so that necessary enthusiasm and energy would be created at all levels and Government would direct their scientific research organisations or their laboratories to go in pursuit of such a colour—it may be directed to be done by the industry itself and if that position is created, then there will be satisfaction in the minds of the public and in the minds of the Members.

I am very grateful to the hon. Members who participated in this debate. As the Minister has given an assurance, indirectly though, that they are

[Shri S. Panigrahi.]

taking steps and will be taking steps, I am prepared to withdraw this Resolution and I again request the Minister to take steps with a view to finding out a colour for nanaspati.

Sir, I beg leave to withdraw my Resolution.

The Resolution was, by leave, withdrawn.

RESOLUTION RE CONTROL OF FLOODS

SHRI BHUPESH GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I move the following Resolution:—

"This House is of opinion that in the light of the experience gained during the recent floods in West Bengal and other parts of India, Government should take early steps to appoint a Committee of experts having knowledge of the subject, to probe into the causes of the floods, review the existing flood control arrangements in the country and suggest effective measures for controlling the floods."

Sir, at the very outset I wish to make one point clear. As you know, Sir, before the Session started, in the months of September and October, devastating floods took place in many parts of the country, especially in West Bengal, Surat, Andhra Pradesh, Orissa, Assam, and various other places were also affected by floods, and I thought, Sir, that the hon. Minister himself would have been enthusiastic in initiating a discussion on the subject at the earliest opportunity in this Session when the matter had already agitated the public mind, because that is the way of functioning of a parliamentary system.

Anybody who reads newspapers knows very well that the floods in West Bengal and at other places have been the subject matter of very powerful, strong and unrelenting discussion

in the Press and otherwise. Accordingly I gave notice of the usual motion. Then, I thought that they might not take kindly to a suggestion of this kind; so I fell back upon this business of Private Members' Resolution, a second line of defence. Naturally, the ballot favoured and we are discussing the flood situation; otherwise this House would not have had an opportunity of discussing the matter in this Session at all. I ask the hon. Members opposite, specially the Members in the Treasury Benches: Is it the way to handle the affairs of the State? I do not wish to say anything more on the subject. Sir, I am very sorry about the attitude of the Government in regard to this matter.

Now, Sir, I would like to explain as to why I am suggesting the appointment of an Expert Committee. When I suggest the appointment of an Expert Committee, I do not mean that only official experts should be there; there should also be non-official experts. It should be a combined body of officials and non-officials to go into this question and submit a report to the Government or to Parliament for consideration.

Now, Sir, let me deal with the flood situation. In September-October, catastrophic floods occurred in West Bengal and also in other parts like Assam, Bihar, Surat and even in Andhra. But I shall mainly deal with the floods in West Bengal to point out as to why such a Committee is needed, to underline the importance of such a Committee today.

Sir, floods in West Bengal have been unprecedented, the like of which we have never known in the last fifty years or so. This is not disputed at all. The magnitude of the devastation and damage caused by these floods would stand out in the official figures themselves. Eleven out of the 16 districts of West Bengal were affected. I have got before me the statement by the West Bengal Government—Statistical Report on Floods, Cyclone, etc.—recently placed before the Assem-