2871 Oral Answers

[RAJYA SABHA]

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: I have already stated that this map appears in the English edition of the book and in many other editions the same map has appeared.

DR. A. N. BOSE: When a book appears in another edition in another country, permission is obtained from the author or from the publisher for that production. My question is whether that permission was obtained or not from the author of the book?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: The hon. Member has slightly confused the issue. This has appeared in the English edition, not in the Chinese edition. Where the slight error was found, it was in the English edition of the book.

DR. A. N. BOSE: Was that erroneous edition published here in India?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: I do not know, I want notice.

DR. A. N. BOSE: But permission should have been obtained whether it be in the English language or in the Chinese language. Whatever language it be, does not matter.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: May I now, Sir, whether this map was included in this book by the author himself or by the printers on their own?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: All these are details which I am unable to answer on the spot.

SHRI V. K. DHAGE: May I know, Sir, whether any royalty is received for the publication of this book "Discovery of India" in China?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Many countries are not governed by the Copyright Act and they do not give royalties.

DR. A. N. BOSE: Sir, the hon. Deputy Minister said here that anyhow the question has been taken up. May I know in what manner the question has been taken up? SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: About the map. The hon. Member wanted information about the map which appeared on the cover of this book "Discovery of India" and we are trying to obtain a copy of the Chinese edition to find out how far it is different from the other maps.

SHRI V. K. DHAGE: The question is

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no question here. They are trying to get a Chinese edition of it and after getting it they will know the exact details. Now it is irrelevant to discuss this matter.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: No, Sir, it will not be....

MR. CHAIRMAN: At this stage it is irrelevant.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: But the Deputy Minister said that it has appeared in the English edition....

MR. CHAIRMAN: That will do, you may put the next question.

*544. [The questioner (Moulana M. Faruqi) was absent. For answer, vide cols. 2891-92 infra.]

U.S. EMBASSY'S PROTEST AGAINST THF DETENTION OF AN AMERICAN BY THE CHINESE CONSULATE AT BOMBAY

∫ SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE:‡ *545. { SHRI NIRANJAN SINGH: | SHRI V. K. DHAGE:

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have received any note from the United States Embassy in India protesting against the action of the officials of the Chinese Consulate at Bombay who forcibly detained an employee of the American Consulate on the 27th November, 1959; and

[‡]The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri B. D. Khobaragade. (b) if so, what action Government have taken in the matter?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF EX-TERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI LAKSH-MI MENON): (a) and (b). Both the U.S. and the Chinese Embassy complained to the Ministry of External Affairs regarding this incident. Subsequently, on 30th November, the American concerned lodged a formal complaint with the Bombay Police alleging wrongful detention and manhandling in the building of the Chinese Consulate General. The Police have registered a case and are making investigations. Government are awaiting the result of the investigations.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: May I know when this investigation will be completed?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: We have really completed the investigation as far as the American side is concerned; but we have not been able to get the same co-operation from the Chinese Consulate General.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: May I know, Sir, whether it is a fact that high-ranking police officials on the date of this incident approached the Chinese authorities and demanded the release of Mr. Armstrong and whether this demand of the police officials was rejected by the Chinese authorities?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: I could not follow the question, Sir. If the hon. Member would kindly repeat his question, I should be grateful.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: Sir, I asked whether high-ranking Indian police officials approached the Chinese authorities demanding the release of the American citizen—Mr. Armstrong—and whether this request or demand of the Indian police officials was rejected by the Chinese authorities? SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: The police authorities did demand the release of the American, the person who was detained. They raised some objection at the beginning, but he was ultimately released.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: The hon. Deputy Minister has said that the Indian police officers' demand was rejected by the Chinese authorities at first. So there is a prima facie case against the Chinese authorities. Moreover, from the reports that appeared in the press we learn that there were marks of rope burns on the arms and neck of Mr. Armstrong, and so, since there is a prima facie case against the Chinese authorities, may I know whether the Government of India propose to take any action against those officials and to withdraw all those privileges which are enjoyed by diplomatic personnel and request the respective governments to recall those offenders?

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is a suggestion for action.

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: Yes, Sir, it is a suggestion for action.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: My question is whether this action will be taken or not?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: What action will be taken will depend on the investigation when it is completed.

SHRI V. K. DHAGE: In the newspapers it was stated that the American Embassy or their Consulate General stated that Mr. Armstrong was manhandled and he informed the police. But the Chinese statement says that they informed the police. May I know which of these two statements is correct?

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is under investigation.

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: How can the Chinese inform the police, Sir? The Taxi driver says that he informed the police; the neighbours say that they informed the police. Whoever it

to Questions 2875

is, who informed the police, the police was informed and the police came to the rescue of the person.

MR. CHAIRMAN: His point is simply this: In the report of the American Consulate it is said that the neighbours reported to the police while the Chinese say that they reported to the police. Which is correct?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: Some people, including the taxi driver, who were present on the occasion, reported the matter to the police.

SHRI V. K. DHAGE: In the report it was also stated that Mr. Armstrong was mis-handled . . .

DR. W. S. BARLINGAY: Manhandled.

SHRI V. K. DHAGE: I am sorry, badly handled, and that he was forcibly taken away from the taxi. Is that correct?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: Yes, Sir. Whatever answers I give are based on the investigations.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The investigations are not complete.

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: They are not complete, Sir, as far as I know.

SHRI V. K. DHAGE: I think the Prime Minister must have been here to answer.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no use worrying about the point. The matter is still under investigation, and on the result of the investigation, definite action will be taken.

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: Yes, Sir, and we have not heard the Chinese side of the story.

SHRI P. S. RAJAGOPAL NAIDU: The investigation is proceeding on a private complaint made by the officials of the American Embassy but I would like to know whether Government is making an independent enquiry, apart from the police enquiry? SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: Yes, Sir, the Bombay Government is making an enquiry. The offences complained against are cognizable offences and the Bombay Government are competent to start investigations under the provisions of section 156 of the Criminal Procedure Code which they are doing.

SHRI B. D. KHOBARAGADE: The hon. Deputy Minister said that the Chinese authorities are not co-operating in the investigation of the offence. I think the diplomatic personnel enjoy certain privileges and are not subject to the local laws. In that case, may I know from the hon. Deputy Minister as to what action Government propose to take in this matter so that the investigation can be fully and impartially completed?

SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON: The Consul-General does not enjoy the privileges of a diplomatic envoy.

Position of Jammu and Kashmir shown in Michael Brecher's book "Nehru—A Political Biography"

*546. SHRI S. PANIGRAHI: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government are aware that the State of Jammu and Kashmir has been shown as disputed territory under International considerations in the book "Nehru—A Political Biography"—by Michael Brecher published by the Oxford University Press, London; and

(b) if so, what action Government have taken in the matter?

THE DEPUTY MINISTER OF EXTER-NAL AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI LAKSHMI MENON): (a) There are three maps of Indian States at pages 338, 404 and 484 in Michael Brecher's book "Nehru —A Political Biography". The maps show the evolution of Indian States in 1947 at the time of partition, in 1950 when the Constitution of India was inaugurated and in 1959 following the reorganisation of the States.