

<i>Re. Taking up discussion ministry of</i>	[21 MAY 2012]		<i>on the working of</i>	295
			<i>civil aviation</i>	
1	2	3	4	
Delhi				
2009-10	53	34	63.5	
Lakshadweep				
2009-10	3	1	29.1	
Puducherry				
2009-10	30	27	88.0	
All India				
2009-10	182466	86423	47.4	

Source: Directorate of Economics and Statistics, Ministry of Agriculture.

RE. TAKING UP DISCUSSION ON THE WORKING OF MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION

MR. CHAIRMAN: We now take up a Short Notice Question.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY (Bihar): Sir, I have a point of order.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the point of order?

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, you will have to give me a minute because it has happened in your presence.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Hour is over.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, the Question Hour may be over, but I am raising a point of order in your kind presence.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have to take up a Short Notice Question. Please take it up after the Short Notice Question.

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, I will raise it but you must hear me out, because the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs is here and so are the others. This is something very important.

Sir, I would like to draw your attention to articles 105, 106, 107 and 108 which deal with Parliament. This Chapter of the Constitution relates to Parliament. I would also like to refer to articles 312 and 356. Sir, there are rulings from the Chair regarding taking up of the listed business. Sir, on the 30th of last month, the Business Advisory Committee, which comprises of all the Members of the House, met in your Chamber and agreed to some business. That business has been listed for discussion in this House for the last 15 days, starting from the 12th of May. This

[Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy]

item of business relating to the discussion on the working of the Ministry of Civil Aviation has been there since the 12th of May. The Session would be ending tomorrow and the discussion has been listed against the name of Shri Brajesh Pathak, and we have been told that since...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक (उत्तर प्रदेश): सभापति जी, हमने भी आपसे रिक्वेस्ट की थी...(व्यवधान)...

श्री राजीव प्रताप रूडी: क्योंकि इस विषय पर लोक सभा में विस्तार से चर्चा हो चुकी है, इसलिए इस सभा में इसकी चर्चा की आवश्यकता नहीं महसूस होती...(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Who has said that?

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, just a minute. It is proved by the point that the business has been listed for discussion in this House for the last 14 days; it has been positioned in such a manner by the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs that that business is not being taken up and, till today, when the business has been listed, it has been listed at the end. Now, the question that arises is: is this House a smaller or a lesser House in importance? This is the right of the Member against whose name that business has been listed, *to it that the discussion on Civil Aviation does not take place. These are the last two days, Sir,...(Interruptions)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Sir...

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Who is he, Sir? I am talking to you, Sir. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute, please. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, I am talking to you. Who is he to interrupt me? How can you entertain him when I am raising the issue? (Interruptions) I want your ruling on this. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. Then you may take it up. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, my point here is this. For the last 15 days this business has been listed. The Government had the option to list it at a point where the discussion could have been taken up. I have been coming to this House and other Members like Shri Brajesh Pathak have "been coming to this House, in the civil aviation sector. There is a situation prevailing in the House. The other House has discussed this Motion three times in the last 20 days, and this House does not have the privilege to discuss the Motion! I would like to have your ruling on this subject.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Re. Taking up discussion [21 MAY 2012] *on the working of* 297
ministry of *civil aviation*

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Mr. Chairman, Sir, in the last financial year.
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, I want a ruling from you. Who is he?
(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. He is another Member.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: This was exactly the case with regard to this House discussing the working of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. Repeatedly, for a period of three weeks, it was listed again and again, and because of the unbelievably* of the Opposition, it could never be taken up. I don't see what right they have to rake up this question now. (*Interruptions*) Tribals are the most deprived people of India...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, Mr. Aiyar. (*Interruptions*) Just a minute, please. Pawanji, would you like to respond? As far as the Chair can see, the matter is listed. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, before the Minister replies, Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, without any authority,* That expression should be removed from the record? (*Interruptions*) This expression should be removed from the record.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes, this should be removed from the record.
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is the Congress Party and its allies who were responsible for going into the Well of the House. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can we allow the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to reply? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Your allies and your party went into the Well of the House. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, Mr. Aiyar. May I request all concerned to resume their places? (*Interruptions*) Please. Venkaiahji. (*Interruptions*) Please, (*interruptions*)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: This is the*...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, adjectives do not add to any substance. Please refrain from them. (*Interruptions*)

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

298 *Re. Taking up discussion* [RAJYA SABHA]
ministry of

*on the working of
civil aviation*

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar): But, he should not vent his frustration for not making him a Minister. (*Interruptions*)

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला (गुजरात): सर, इनको बताइए कि वे मंत्री नहीं हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES (SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL): Sir, the hon. Member, Shri Rudy, has chosen to refer to the proceedings of the Business Advisory Committee. As far as I know, Sir, there is no reference made of the proceedings of the Committee in the House here. Since he has chosen to do, Sir, I would only wish to remind him—I do not know whether he was always there present in the meetings or not—that in the very beginning, the Government had agreed to the discussion on the working of four Ministries. As my friend, Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, has pointed out, this is not the first time that we have not been able to discuss all the four. On many occasions we have not been able to do it. But, I would only like to remind him that the only reason why this could not be taken up so far is that many, many Members, from the Opposition, have been pressing for various other discussions and we have been agreeing to that. We never said that we do not want a discussion. The hon. Minister was present on many occasions. Rather, my little disappointment is that we have not been able to take up all the Bills, all the legislative agenda, which we had listed because we were always trying to accommodate them on many other matters. Sir, you may go through the records. On every occasion, we have said that we were prepared to discuss. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can the decibel levels be lowered a bit?

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: That is for all the Members in the Business Advisory Committee to give priority to other items of the business.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can we take up the Short Notice Question? Mr. Tarun Vijay, do you wish to raise the Question? (*Interruptions*)

श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर (महाराष्ट्र): सर, इसका जवाब क्या हुआ?...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Are you holding the discussion or not? (*Interruptions*)

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, मेरा एक point-of-order है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: एक मिनट, आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए।...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Sir, please give a ruling on that. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: As far as the Chair is aware, this is a discussion on the working of the Ministry of Civil Aviation, it is listed in today's business. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: In the last 20 days, it is being listed, Sir. Why do not you give a ruling on it? This is going to be a history here. Why cannot you give a ruling that such a discussion should be allowed or not? It will save so much of time. (Interruptions)

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is listed. It is for you to take it up. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAJIV PRATAP RUDY: Then, please decide that it should be taken up, Sir. (Interruptions)

Why are you scared of having a discussion on the working of the Ministry of Civil Aviation? (Interruptions)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: Rudyji, why are you using the phrase, 'Why are you afraid?' Who says that we are afraid of it? What is this, Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can we complete the Short Notice Question and then take up others? (Interruptions)

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर, मेरा एक point of order है।

श्री सभापति: आप बताइए।... (व्यवधान)... चंदन जी, प्लीज आप बैठ जाइए।

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: माननीय सभापति जी, मैं आपके सामने एक कंस्टीट्यूशनल क्राइसिस लाना चाहता हूँ और चाहता हूँ कि इस पीठ से इस पर रूलिंग भी मिले। मैंने अभी तक संविधान और नियमावली में पढ़ा कि इस सदन को महामहिम राष्ट्रपति के अलावा कोई दूसरा व्यक्ति या किसी दल का नेता संदेश नहीं दे सकता है। श्रीमन् आप देख लीजिए, आर्टिकल 86(1) और 86(2), दोनों में यह स्पष्ट है। आर्टिकल 86(1) में महामहिम राष्ट्रपति अपना अभिभाषण देंगे और आर्टिकल 86(2), जो नियमावली का 20 और 21 बना, अगर महामहिम कोई संदेश देना चाहेंगे, तो वे संदेश दे सकते हैं। उसके अलावा किसी और दल का नेता अपना संदेश अपने दल के सदस्य के माध्यम से भी इस सदन को नहीं दे सकता है। श्रीमन्, परसों बहुजन समाज पार्टी की राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्षा, मायावती जी, ने बयान दिया... (व्यवधान)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक: सर, यह गलत है। ये इस तरह से आक्षेप नहीं लगा सकते।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: देखिए, आप लोग अपना टाइम जाया कर रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: मैं जो बात बता रहा हूँ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: पाठक जी, आप आपनी जगह पर जाइए, कुछ नहीं होगा। ... (व्यवधान)... आप अपनी जगह पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान)...

300 *Re. Taking up discussion* [RAJYA SABHA]
ministry of

*on the working of
civil aviation*

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: श्रीमान्, उनका बयान आया है कि मेरा लिखा ही पढ़ते हैं संसद में सतीश...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The house is adjourned for fifteen minutes.

**The House then adjourned at
ten minutes past twelve of the clock.**

The House reassembled at twenty-five minutes past twelve of the clock,

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): The Short Notice Question.
...(Interruptions)...Shri Tarun Vijay.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... I will allow you..
...(व्यवधान)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: मेरा जो point of order है...(व्यवधान)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक: सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... मेरी बात सुनिए।
...(व्यवधान)... I will tell you after the short Notice Question.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: अभी तो मैंने आधी बात ही कही है। मेरी तो बात ही पूरी नहीं हुई। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक: सर, ...(व्यवधान)...इस तरीके से...(व्यवधान)...जो रूल है...(व्यवधान)...जो आर्टिकल 86 की बात ये कर रहे हैं। इनसे कहिए कि ये संविधान की पूरी जानकारी लें।...(व्यवधान)...आर्टिकल 86 में, राष्ट्रपति महोदय यदि संसद को कोई संदेश भेजती हैं, तो...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): Please. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक: अगर कोई भी बात इस देश में चलती है, ...(व्यवधान)... तो सारी पार्टिज के अध्यक्ष अपनी पार्टी के सांसदों को बताते हैं कि पार्टी लाइन क्या होगी।...(व्यवधान)...इन्होंने जो प्रश्न उठाया है, ...(व्यवधान)... दुख इस बात का है कि इनको बहुजन समाज...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): ब्रजेश जी, सुनिए। ...(व्यवधान)...मैं डील करूंगा, आप बैठिए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक: दुख इस बात का है कि...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): ब्रजेश जी, आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)..... will deal with it. ... (व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए। ... (व्यवधान)... आप लोग बैठिए। ... (व्यवधान)... आप मेरी बात सुनिए।... (व्यवधान)... I will allow you. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री तरुण विजय (उत्तराखंड): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, ... (व्यवधान)... यह छः करोड़ बच्चों से रिलेटेड सवाल है।... (व्यवधान)... यह पोलिटिक्स नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)... मैं सदन से प्रार्थना करूंगा कि... (व्यवधान)... मुझे यह सवाल उठाने दीजिए।... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Tarun Vijay, I will allow you. ... (Interruptions)... Please take your seat. ... (Interruptions)... ब्रजेश जी, आप मेरी बात सुनिए।... (व्यवधान)... I will deal with it. ... (Interruptions)... ब्रजेश जी, आप मेरी बात सुनिए। ... (व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... अब आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... I will deal it. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर, मैंने अपनी बात ही नहीं कही।... (व्यवधान)... ये मेरी बात भी नहीं सुनेंगे और... (व्यवधान)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक: सर, ... (व्यवधान)... इनको सदन की कार्यवाही की जानकारी नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)... और कोई point of order नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन): Don't do this. ... (Interruptions)... Don't do this. आप लोग क्यों डरते हैं?... (व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... आप जाकर अपनी सीट पर बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... ब्रजेश जी, आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान)... व्यवस्था के अनुसार जाएगा।... (व्यवधान)... रूल के अनुसार जाएगा।... (व्यवधान)... आप अपनी सीट पर बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... ब्रजेश जी, आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान)... Don't worry at all. ब्रजेश जी, I will go by rules only.. आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... आप लोग बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... I will go by rules only.. आप प्लीज़ बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... आप लोग बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... Unless you allow me, what can I say? You allow me. Let me deal with it. वेंकैया जी, one second. Mr. Naresh Agrawal, your point of order cannot be a point of order on an issue which you are raising. But if you want to raise it, after the Zero Hour, I will allow you and give the ruling and not now. मैंने कह दिया कि ... (व्यवधान)... मैंने कह दिया कि वह point of order नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)... आप जाकर अपनी सीट पर बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... ब्रजेश जी, आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान)... आप बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... मैं रूल के अनुसार चलूंगा।... (व्यवधान)... यह point of order नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)... आप जाकर बैठिए।... (व्यवधान)... leave it to me.. मैंने बोला कि यह point of order नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)... I know it. ... (Interruptions)... Leave it to me. ... (Interruptions)... You cannot question like this. Leave it to me, Karimpuriji. ... (Interruptions)... You leave it to me. (Interruptions) You leave it to me. (Interruptions) You leave it to me. आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान)... You don't know what I am going to.... (Interruptions) आपको नहीं मालूम है कि क्या बोलना है।... (व्यवधान)... कैसे पता है?... (व्यवधान)... सुनने के बाद मैं ruling दूंगा।... (व्यवधान)... there is no rule, I will tell him. (Interruptions) Don't question the

[प्रो. पी.जे. कुरियन]

Chair. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Brijesh, if there is no rule, I will tell him. (*Interirruptions*). Don't question the Chair. (*Interruptions*) This is unfair. (*Interruptions*) You cannot question the Chair. (*Interruptions*). Hon. Members... (*Interruptions*) सुनिए, Mr. Naresh Agrawal raised a point of order. I said that there is no point of order. (*Interruptions*) If he wants to say anything, I will allow him later on. (*Interruptions*) If there is no rule, I will tell him there is no rule. (*Interruptions*) I will tell him there is no rule. (*Interruptions*) Why do you worry? (*Interruptions*) I will decide that. (*Interruptions*) Without hearing, I cannot say that there is no rule. (*Interruptions*) How can I say anything without hearing him? Why do you worry? (*Interruptions*) Don't do this. (*Interruptions*) I cannot allow this. (*Interruptions*)

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर, अभी तो मैंने कुछ बोला ही नहीं है।... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, there are so many vital issues to be raised during the Zero Hour. (*Interruptions*) You please give your ruling. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I cannot act according to your direction. (*Interruptions*) raise नहीं किया है, मैंने नहीं सुना है।... (व्यवधान) ...मैंने नहीं सुना है।... (व्यवधान) ... I did not hear. (*Interruptions*) You allow him, then, I will give the ruling... (*Interruptions*)

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी (बिहार): सर, जीरो आवर, जीरो आवर।... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I did not hear. You allow him, them, I will give the ruling. (*Interruptions*) You allow him, then, I will give the ruling. (*Interruptions*) You allow him, then, I will give the ruling. (*Interruptions*) अभी मैं रिकॉर्ड कैसे देखूँ?... (व्यवधान) ...क्या बोले?... (व्यवधान) ...अगर हो चुका है, तो I will verify (*Interruptions*) आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान) ...I will see to it. (*Interruptions*) क्या बोलते हैं?... (व्यवधान) ...आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए।... (व्यवधान) ...You go to your seat, I will see to it. (*Interruptions*) You cannot dictate the Chair. (*Interruptions*) It cannot be done. (*Interruptions*)

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी: सर, आज बहुत सारे महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दे हैं।... (व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Unless I listen to the Member, I cannot say anything; (*Interruptions*) No; no. (*Interruptions*) I will see that. (*Interruptions*) Go and sit there. (*Interruptions*) You allow him to do that. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Brijesh, I will have to name you. (*Interruptions*) We cannot function this way. (*Interruptions*) I am sorry. (*Interruptions*) I am sorry. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, all other Members are being deprived of their rights. *(Interruptions)* There are so many vital issues to be raised during the Zero Hour. *(Interruptions)* We seek your protection, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Why do you think that I am going to give that ruling? *(Interruptions)* Why do you think that? *(Interruptions)* आप समझते नहीं हैं...*(व्यवधान)*...आप अपनी सीट पर जाइए...*(व्यवधान)*... Let me listen to him only then I will be able to give a correct ruling. *(Interruptions)* I will have to name you. *(Interruptions)* I cannot allow like this. *(Interruptions)* You cannot dictate the Chair. *(Interruptions)* You cannot dictate to the Chair...*(Interruptions)*...Then, I am requesting you to go to your seat...*(Interruptions)*...Yes, I will listen to your request. Go to your seat. *..(Interruptions)..* No; nothing can be done like this. Nothing can be done like this. *...(Interruptions)..* You cannot dictate to the Chair like this...*(Interruptions)..* How can you think what ruling I am going to give?...*(Interruptions)*...No, no. He is not dictating...*(Interruptions)*.. I asked him to take seat; he took his seat. *..(Interruptions)...*No, no. Don't talk from here. I don't want to listen to you. *..(Interruptions)...*I may have to take action...*(Interruptions)...*I am telling you....*(Interruptions)...*This is most unfair and indisciplined, not allowing the Chair to run the House...*(Interruptions)...*What do you want?...*(Interruptions)...*Go to your seats....*(Interruptions)...*The House is adjourned for 15 minutes.

The House then adjourned at thirty-six minutes
past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at fifty-one minutes past twelve of the clock,

The VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

I. Statement on quarterly Review in relation to the Budget.

II. White paper on black money

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI SS. PALANIMANICKAM): Sir, I lay on the Table—

I. A copy (in English and Hindi) of the Statement on Quarterly Review of the trends in receipts and expenditure in relation to the Budget, at the end of the third quarter of financial year 2011-12, under sub-section (1) of Section 7 of the Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management Act, 2003. [Placed in Library. See No. L.T. 6960/15/12]