

**SHORT NOTICE QUESTION****Negotiation with Maoists involved in abductions**

05. SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR : Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

- (a) whether Government has any plan to negotiate with the Naxals/Maoists who have been involved in various abductions in the recent past;
- (b) if so, the details thereof; and
- (c) if not, the reasons therefor?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI JITENDRA SINGH) : (a) to (c) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

***Statement***

(a) to (c) It is a fact that the CPI (Maoist) are resorting to large scale abductions in their areas of influence. However, only high profile abductions are widely reported. In the recent past, the CPI (Maoist) abducted two Italian nationals, Mr. Paolo Bosusco and Mr. Claudio Colangelo on 14.3.2012 from Daringibadi P.S. of Kandhamal District of Odisha. Subsequently, Shri Jhina Hikaka, MLA, Laxmipur, District Koraput, Odisha was abducted on the night intervening March 23-24, 2012. The District Magistrate of Sukma District in Chhattisgarh, Shri Alex Paul Menon was abducted by the CPI (Maoist) on 21.4.2012. In the year 2011, the Collector of Malkangiri District in Odisha, Shri Vineel Krishna, was also kidnapped by the CPI (Maoist) on 16.2.2011.

The abduction of young and pro-active Collectors, elected representatives and foreign tourists, etc. is a clear indication of the changing nature of Maoist insurgency. The kidnapping of civilian non-combatants and even foreigners is indicative of the facts the Maoists are using terrorist tactics to get their demands fulfilled by the State Governments. Usually, the main demand of the CPI (Maoist) includes release of their jailed cadres, especially relatives of important leaders. The abduction of civil administration officials indicates a determined effort on the part of the CPI (Maoist) to stall development process in affected districts. They seek to prevent poor and marginalized sections of the society in their areas of dominance from joining the mainstream development process. Such action by the CPI (Maoist) will not deter the Government from its determination to continue with its efforts to combat Left Wing Extremism in a holistic manner.

It has been noticed that the primary demands of Maoist always pertains to release of their jailed cadres. Hence, negotiations in such situations can only be conducted by the State Governments concerned. There is no direct role for Central Government in

such situations other than providing necessary assistance required by the State Governments. At the strategic level, Government of India has time and again appealed to the CPI (Maoist) to abjure violence and come for talks. However, there has been no response to this offer by the CPI (Maoist).

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर :** सभापति महोदय, अभी जो नक्सलियों द्वारा जिलाधिकारी का अपहरण हुआ और बहुत सारे अपहरण हुए, उसके बाद छत्तीसगढ़ के मुख्य मंत्री श्री रमन सिंह मीडिया से मुखातिब हुए और उन्होंने अपनी वेदना को प्रकट किया कि अगर अगली बार मेरा अपहरण होता है, तो **swap deal** नहीं होनी चाहिए, यानी उसके बदले में कुछ नहीं करना चाहिए, निगोसिएशन नहीं करना चाहिए। यह जो उन्होंने कहा इसके लिए निश्चित रूप से उनकी सराहना करनी पड़ेगी। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** यह बोल्ड स्टेटमेंट है। इसकी सराहना होनी चाहिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री सभापति :** प्लीज, प्लीज। आप बैठ जाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप सवाल पूछिए।

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर :** लेकिन उसके साथ उन्होंने यह कहा कि इसका कारण यह है कि बार-बार ऐसा सभी राज्यों में हो रहा है, क्योंकि एक **hostage** पॉलिसी नहीं है। मेरा प्रश्न है कि क्या मंत्री महोदय यह बता सकेंगे कि ऐसे **hostage** रखने की जो रणनीति है, उसके जवाब में हम क्या पॉलिसी तय कर रहे हैं या क्या कर रहे हैं?

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM :** Sir, I have also taken note of the statement of the Chief Minister of Chhattisgarh. I did speak to him when he was here two days ago. Nevertheless, we must take note of the fact that the Chhattisgarh Government did appoint mediators. Therefore, it would be impractical to take the view that under no circumstances should mediators or negotiators or whatever name you may call them can be appointed in a hostage situation. That, in my respectful submission, would be impractical.

The Chhattisgarh Government, in fact, appointed mediators who held talks with the two mediators or interlocutors appointed by the Maoists and they signed an agreement. And, now, it is for the Government of Chhattisgarh to take action according to what they agreed.

As far as hostage policy is concerned, yes, a suggestion was made that we should evolve a uniform hostage policy in this country. The suggestion has been made since the Kandahar case. But, there is no uniform hostage policy. And, I have told to my officers that once the current hostage situations are resolved, they may begin consultations with the State Governments on whether it is possible to evolve a uniform hostage policy and, if it is possible to evolve a uniform hostage policy, what should that policy contain. So, I have told them to take it up with the State Governments once the current hostage situations are resolved.

**श्री सभापति :** आप दूसरा प्रश्न पूछिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर :** सर, यह सही है, कि 10 साल के बाद भी कोई पॉलिसी नहीं बनी है इसलिए इसमें जल्दी करने की जरूरत है। मेरा दूसरा सवाल **unified strategy** के बारे में है। अनेक बार गृह मंत्री जी बयान देते हैं कि यह राज्य का मुद्दा है या लॉ एंड ऑर्डर की सिचुएशन है, ऐसा नहीं है। यह 8 राज्यों का मुद्दा है। यह भारत पर, भारत के संविधान पर प्रहार है। ये **sovereignty** को चेलेंज है। ये आम स्ट्रगल में विश्वास रखते हैं। केवल डेवलेपमेंट के अभाव में ही नक्सलिज्म बढ़ रहा है, यह भी सही नहीं है। **We have to take a holistic policy. But, that is not the reasons.** इनसरजेंसी एक पॉलिटिकल चेलेंज है। जैसे दूसरे इनसरजेंसी केस में त्रिपुरा ने एक सक्सेस हासिल करके दिखाया, पंजाब में दूसरी तरह की इनसरजेंसी हुई, तो वहां भी सफलता मिली। नक्सलवाद के बारे में आंध्र प्रदेश ने भी एक ऐसी पॉलिसी बनाई कि वहां भी सफलता मिली। **But, it depends upon the clarity of purpose and clear action plan.** So, I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the Government has any clear policy to deal with this menace or will formulate a uniform strategy.

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM :** Sir, Government has a clear policy. My view has been, my view is, and my view will be that dealing with terrorism, militancy and insurgency is a shared responsibility. The very Constitution that gives police and law and order to the States under List-II, has also imposed upon the Central Government a duty under article 355. This is what I said at the Chief Ministers' Conference, not for the first time but at every Conference of Chief Ministers. Some others have thrown doubt upon the way I have formulated the policy. But I have no doubt in my mind that dealing with terrorism, militancy and insurgency is a shared responsibility.

Sir, this policy can only be implemented if the Centre and States work together. My appeal to all the State Governments, even in the last Chief Ministers' Conference, has been that we have to work together and, by working together, we can overcome the challenges of terrorism, militancy and insurgency.

**श्री शिवानन्द तिवारी :** सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से कहना चाहता हूं कि इस देश में एक गृह मंत्री जी की बेटी का अपहरण हुआ था और अपहरण करने वालों की शर्तें मान कर, हमने गृह मंत्री जी की बेटी को बचाया था। इसी तरह से एक दूसरा बड़ा अपहरण हवाई जहाज का हुआ था। उसमें भी अपहरण करने वालों की बात मान कर, हमने जेलों में बंद आतंकवादियों को छोड़ा था। मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूं कि यहां लगातार अपहरण की जो घटनाएं हो रही हैं, क्या वे दोनों घटनाएं इन घटनाओं को ताकत देने का काम कर रही हैं अथवा उन दोनों घटनाओं में हमने जो सरेन्डर किया, क्या इन अपहरण की घटनाओं को बढ़ावा देने का तो कारण नहीं है?

**SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM :** Sir, I didn't get the nuance in the last part of the question. Hon. Member referred to two incidents, one that happened many years ago and the other that happened at Kandahar. I am trying to understand the question.

Yes, hostages are taken by Maoists repeatedly. In fact, the cases that get highlighted are cases where a District Collector is taken hostage. But there are any number of cases where militants and Maoists have taken hostage Government Servants at lower levels, contractors, businessmen, etc. Therefore, Maoists continue to indulge in kidnapping. Some militant groups in the North-east also indulge in kidnapping. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please do not interrupt. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please do not interrupt, Mr. Tarun Vijay.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Therefore, kidnapping is not, regrettably, an uncommon event. A lot of kidnappings take place. Many of them get resolved at the local level. We play a critical, crucial role in advising and helping State Governments in resolving those crises. For example, only about a couple of months ago, five supervisory level workers of a construction company were kidnapped on the Mizoram Bangladesh border, and it took us almost three-four weeks to get them back. But it was done quietly. There was not much publicity in the Delhi newspapers but there was some reporting there in the local newspapers.

Now, certainly, all this weighs on our mind and, that is why, I have advised officers of the Ministry to take it up with the State Governments and begin consultations with them, on whether we can have a uniform hostage policy. Now, how this hostage policy will eventually evolve, I cannot say at the moment. But mediation and negotiations are a part of every country's hostage policy. Israel, for example, released 1,000 prisoners to get back one Israeli soldier. Therefore, we cannot take an impractical view. At the same time, we must also, in agreeing on a policy—if all the States agree—know where and how to draw the line.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Devender Goud.

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडभाई रूपाळा : सभापति जी ...(*व्यवधान*)...

श्री सभापति : आप पहले इनको सुन लीजिए।

SHRI DEVENDER GOUD T. : Mr. Chairman, Sir, with a little experience of being the Home Minister for five years in Andhra Pradesh, I can say that without the support or cooperation of the civilians in that area, the police force cannot solve this kind of a problem. With the same experience, I can say to the hon. Home Minister—he is well aware of the problem—that States cannot handle this kind of a problem by themselves. Their forces are not properly trained. Even the civil administration is also not prepared for this kind of a situation in that area. Kindly create a nodal agency; of course, you have it but it must be activated by not only giving more funds and also by issuing directions on how they should implement. A lot of modalities and a lot of conditions are put by the Central Government as well as the State Government. The field officers suffer a lot because they are not having the clarity on how to spend and how to implement this sort of programmes of the Government of India. Kindly take a special interest. I would like to reiterate that without the civilian support, you are not going to succeed in handling this kind of a situation.

I would like to know what kind of actions are taken from your side to coordinate between the State and the implementing agencies. Every time we handle the problem,

[SHRI DEVENDER GOUD T.]

a lot of experience we gain. I would like to know if there is any specific nodal agency you have formed to resolve this kind of problem. Thank you.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Sir, there is no nodal agency as such to deal with each of these problems. There are commonalities among the challenges; there are differences among the challenges. Terrorism poses one kind of challenge. Naxalism or CPI (Maoists) activities pose another kind of challenge. Insurgency or separatism in the North-East poses another kind of challenge. There are commonalities. But, there are also differences. There is no nodal agency. The nodal intelligence agency is the IB. There is no other nodal agency. A very grave aspect of the problem, namely, terrorism, sometimes, what the CPI (Maoists) does also qualifies under the definition of terrorism. What the insurgents in the North-East do also qualifies under the definition of terrorism. To deal with terrorism, we have proposed a nodal agency. But that, as the hon. Members are aware, is still under debate.

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाळा : सभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय गृह मंत्री जी से यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि ऐसे नाजुक विषयों पर, सत्ता में बैठे लोगों के बयान बहुत असर करते हैं। अभी दो दिन पहले आपके मंत्रिमंडल के एक साथी ने ऐसा बयान दिया है कि आदिवासियों को दोनों लोग, सरकार और माओइस्ट निशाना बना रहे हैं। केंद्रीय मंत्री जी ने ऐसा कैटेगोरिकली बयान मंच पर से दिया है। क्या यह बात आपकी जनकारी में है और ऐसे निवेदनों की क्या प्रतिक्रिया होती है? वहाँ समाज के अंदर जो लोग प्रशासन में लड़ रहे हैं, उन पर इसका क्या असर होता है? जो लोग इस नक्सलाइट मूवमेंट के साथ जुड़ रहे हैं, उनके साथ क्या हो रहा है? क्या माननीय मंत्री जी को इस बयान के बारे में पता है, यदि पता है तो आपकी क्या प्रतिक्रिया है और आप सरकार की साझा जिम्मेदारी को मानते हुए क्या कदम उठाने जा रहे हैं?

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Sir, I am not aware of any statement ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाळा : जयराम रमेश ने पब्लिकली कहा है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : बैठ जाइए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : I said I am not aware of any such statement. But, a statement is brought to my notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाळा : सभापति जी, अगर देश के गृह मंत्री के ध्यान में ऐसी बातें नहीं हैं तो ...*(व्यवधान)*... कहाँ से आएगा ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : आपने सवाल पूछ लिया है, अब आप जवाब सुन लीजिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM : Sir, I am not aware of any statement as said by the hon. Member. I think, I saw a statement which said that tribals in conflict zone are caught between the Maoists on the one hand and the security forces on the other.

Now, the implication and nuance of that statement is very different from what the hon. Member says. But if what the hon. Member said is correct, and I am sure, he is right, certainly, it is for the Minister to explain what he said and what he meant.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Now, Statement by Minister correcting answer to Question. Shri A.K. Antony. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, I have a question. यह व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

MR. CHAIRMAN : No, you can't. The Question Hour is over. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, every day in the House, one Minister or the other comes to correct the answer. What is the solution of it? Why don't they give the correct answers when the questions are put?

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : That is according to the rules. You know it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, the rule does not say that every day you should do it. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, it is becoming a practice ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, it is being done every day. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, it is becoming ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : You know the rules. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, don't take it lightly.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, they can't do it. ...(*Interruptions*)... You have to give a ruling on this. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : It is as per the rules.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Rules permit it only under extraordinary situations. But, yesterday, day-before-yesterday, the other day also, every day, the Ministers are correcting their statements. ...(*Interruptions*)... That means they are irresponsible while giving answers. Are they careless while giving answers? ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : Anyhow, we have to go by rules. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, why don't you give a direction to the Government that they should come and tell the truth?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : What is the rule? Please enlighten us, Sir. ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : This is as per the rule. The Ministers can correct it.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : No, Sir; this is the complaint. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, you give your ruling on this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : They are doing their duty to the House by correcting the answers. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, you cannot object to that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Let them be responsible.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : Madam, you were in the Chair; you know everything. You cannot object to that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : What is the rule?

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, you give a direction to the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : No, no; take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not to quote you the rules. Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, please allow him. See, they are doing their duty by correcting their mistakes, if any. It is permitted as per the rules. Rules permit such corrections. ...*(Interruptions)*... Madam, you know everything. Madam, you know much more than me. Then, why do you object to it?

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Sir, I know the rules. That is why I am objecting to it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Every day, it is becoming a practice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : Every day, one Minister is not correcting. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, yesterday, day-before-yesterday, the Ministers corrected the answers. Check the record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : No, no; if every day one Minister is correcting, you have a point. It is not like that.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, yesterday, day-before-yesterday, they corrected answers. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : Venkaiahji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... No; that is some other Minister. That is their duty to the House. They are performing their duty by correcting the answers.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Giving wrong answers is their duty?

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA : Their duty to the House is to give correct answers. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : No, no; you know the rules. Madam, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Madam, you are my good friend. Please sit down. Venkaiahji, my good friend, please sit down.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : They have to explain as to why it happened.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : Yes, that is what they are doing by correcting the answers. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is what we are doing. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no; whatever is under the rules, I can allow. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no rule ...*(Interruptions)*... Vinay Katiyarji, you have no point. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have no point. Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री विनय कटियार : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, हमें आपका संरक्षण मिलना चाहिए। अगर कोई मंत्री गड़बड़ी करता है, तो आपकी ओर से हम लोगों को संरक्षण मिलना चाहिए।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : Now, Statement by Minister correcting Answer to Question. Shri A.K. Antony. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

#### STATEMENT BY MINISTER CORRECTING ANSWER TO THE QUESTION

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI A.K. ANTONY) : Sir, I lay on the Table, a Statement (in English and Hindi) correcting the answer to Unstarred Question 2825 given in the Rajya Sabha on the 2nd May, 2012 regarding Purchase of MIG aircrafts.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka) : Under what rule? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : No, no; you take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... You know there is a rule in the Rule Book to correct the answers. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, there is a rule. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not to quote you the rule now. Take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Papers to be laid on the Table. Kumari Selja. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

- I. Report and Accounts (2010-11) of various Institute, Council, Fund and Centre and related papers.
- II. MOU (2012-13) between Govt. of India and HUDCO.

THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND THE MINISTER OF CULTURE (KUMARI SELJA) : Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers:—