

**Comment by a U.S. Congressman on  
Indo-U.S. Nuclear deal**

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Jharkhand): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir. The issue that I am going to raise is an issue which should have been actually debated in this House. If we had a debate on Foreign Policy, then, we would have all spoken on this issue in some detail. But I am compelled to raise it during the Zero Hour and I know that my time is limited because we are not going to have a debate on foreign policy. Sir, we have had a nuclear deal with the U.S. on July 18th, and, increasingly all the signals which are coming from the U.S., the U.S. congress, from the U.S. officials suggest that the goal post is being shifted. Our Foreign Secretary, Sir, currently is in the U.S. to further negotiate the nuclear deal. But I would like to draw your attention, Sir, only to one or two points. Our former Foreign Minister is sitting here.

Sir, Tom Lantos, who is a U.S. Congressman, a member of the U.S. Congress, he described him as 'dense'; and before the vote on Iran in the IAEA-Sir, I have the verbatim record of this-this is what Tom Lantos said. He said, "They" means Indians, "need to be told in plain English, not in diplomatic English either with us or against us." This is what happened in the U.S. Congress.

We, Sir, in the Parliament, are we going to be mute spectators to this enormity of the kind of objection which is being raised? Sir, the other point which I would like to make is the U.S. officials have made it clear.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA:...(Interruptions)...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया (झारखंड): उन्हें वहां भी समझ में नहीं आया और यहां भी नहीं आ रहा है।....(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete. ...(Interruptions)... Let him finish.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, when the negotiations are on and the Government takes a position, why is this issue being raised?  
...(Interruptions)...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, यह क्या हो रहा है? ....(व्यवधान)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it has never happened that the Parliament will start discussing these matters when these matter are raise and when the Foreign Secretary is there. An effort is being made to misinterpret

...(Interruptions)... The Prime Minister has made it clear in this House that... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have allowed him, please sit down, Mr. Sharma. He is also a responsible Member. He knows that the Foreign Secretary has gone to America. Please, let him speak. ...(Interruptions)... Let him finish. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, there is no change in the Government policy ...(Interruptions)... The Prime Minister has made it clear ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the harm if he attracts your attention towards this issue? ...(Interruptions)... Please do not disturb. Please finish as early as possible, Mr. Yashwant Sinha.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I know that we have defenders of the U.S. Congress in this House ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please do not make it an issue ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He said whether India is with us or against us, then we go and vote against Iran in the IAEA—after this effect! ...(Interruptions)... This I am quoting from the verbatim record. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सभापति: बैठिए बैठिए....(व्यवधान)... आप जो कह रहे हैं, इसमें आपको क्या आपत्ति है....(व्यवधान)... आपको क्या आपत्ति है....(व्यवधान)... आपत्ति है, तो आप जवाब दे देना....(व्यवधान)... आप जवाब दे दीजिए न....(व्यवधान)... Please finish, Mr. Yashwant Sinha.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I must be allowed to speak. Please look at what they are doing! Is this the behaviour?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, I have here a statement from a very well-known expert on international affairs, Selig Harrison, who is a U.S. citizen. He himself has objected to many elements of this game. The point that we are now being told is, "we must place our civilian nuclear safeguards in perpetuity with the IAEA, which is an international multilateral body in return for bilateral concessions, which may or may not be made available by the US and other NSG members. Sir, this deal has already become totally unequal and unreciprocal. This is the point that I want to make in this House that should the Parliament of India remain a mute spectator when all this is going on ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT (West Bengal): Excuse me, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... While appreciating the points made by the hon. Member who is also the former Foreign Minister, there are some very crucial issues which do require to be taken up and do require to be discussed in the House because we also perceive a shift from the independent Foreign Policy which India is committed to and which is part of the National Common Minimum Programme. That is why, Sir, we had actually raised this issue and we had appealed even in the BAC that there should be a full debate. For example, our understanding is that, in fact, this Government is only following the policies of surrendering to the United States, which was ...*(Interruptions)*... Excuse me, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me finish what I want to say. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIPANKAR MUKHERJEE (West Bengal): Let her speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the Minister react. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, as Indian citizens we have a point of view about the Foreign Policy directions of the Government of India that is following the policies set by the NDA Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... We want a discussion in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are yet to ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will not allow it during Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is enough. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Member, please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, it is very important point about surrendering India's interests. ...*(Interruptions)*... He has something to say, something about his Government which started this surrendering to the USA. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no question of this Government or that Government. ...*(Interruptions)*... Your cannot say like this. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: We want a proper discussion on that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing you. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will not allow. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will not permit. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please do not disturb....*(Interruptions)*...

[22 December, 2005]

RAJYA SABHA

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Please allow us a discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (Uttar Pradesh): We also want a discussion on foreign affairs. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only the hon. Minister has been allowed to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him speak. I have allowed him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, in this House we had a discussion on the Foreign Policy when we discussed the Indo-US Agreement. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: We want a discussion on it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI ARJUN SINGH): Sir, with your kind permission. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Is the Minister responding on behalf of the Government?

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Yes, of course I am. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Okay.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has already cleared. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. ARJUN SINGH: Sir, without any prejudice to your decision that you may take ultimately, I would only like to place before you certain facts which all of us know. Number one, this deal that was concluded was presented to the House by the hon. Prime Minister, and in very clear terms he stated the basic parameters under which this Agreement was made. A crucial part of that was the reciprocity, if I recollect correctly. And reciprocity has a very definite meaning. Now, if what the Prime Minister has said in this House is being deviated from by anyone—there are only two parties, one is the Indian part, have we deviated anywhere—that is a cause for immediate attention and definitely, we have a right to object to it. But as it appears from the statement of the hon. former Foreign Minister, there is a statement by a Member of the US Congress. A Member of the US Congress is entitled to make a statement as he deems fit. Neither I, nor you, nor anybody can object. But that does not become a policy.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Sir, they have a right to approve the deal. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister must know this.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. Please don't disturb. Let him finish. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him finish.

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: And, I am sure, all these things can be addressed holistically if the House does decide in its wisdom to have a discussion. That, nobody can object to. If there is time we can certainly have a discussion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Unfortunately, there is no time.

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Well, that is something which the House has to address. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: आप बोलने दीजिए।....*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: And therefore Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह (झारखंड): यह सेशन आगे बढ़ा दिया जाए।....*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री अर्जुन सिंह: अब यह तो मेरे हाथ में नहीं है।....*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, कल दीजिए।....*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: नहीं, आप इन्हें खत्म करने दीजिए न। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: सर, कल शुक्रवार है।....*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: कल सुबह कर दीजिए या नहीं कर दीजिए Leave it to me and the Government. हाऊस कितने दिन चलेगा ....*(व्यवधान)*... नहीं, कल नहीं आएगा....*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: The US Government will approve this deal and this House will not even discuss this. ...*(Interruptions)*... This House will not even discuss this. This is the whole point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Sir, I want to make the record straight. We also had given a notice for an independent foreign policy. Sir, it is unfair.

श्री सभापति: आपने दिया है, वह मुझे मालूम है।....*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Now, we consider collectively and whatever decision BAC takes is a unanimous decision. Now, unfortunately, time could not be provided for that discussion. But that cannot become a provocation for discussing this issue as a special submission with a special permission from the Chair. We would like to discuss. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: यह होता रहा है।....*(व्यवधान)*...यह होता रहा है।....*(व्यवधान)*...Let him finish. Let him finish. ...*(Interruptions)*...

[22 December, 2005]

RAJYA SABHA

SHRIYASHWANT SINHA: In future, I will seek their permission, instead of the Chair's permission. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Sir, that is all I had to say. That does not become something on which we have to take notice of.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I have given a notice for a discussion on public health. It is more important than foreign policy.. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Everything is important. Everything is important. Certainly, you give a notice. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, why are you avoiding a discussion on public health?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Who is avoiding?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Why are we getting into foreign policy now, Sir?

श्री सभापति: आपने यह क्या चार्ज लगा दिया कि मैं avoid कर रहा हूँ....*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, we are asking you for a debate on public health.

श्री सभापति: अगर गवर्नमेंट चाहे तो मैं आज भी करवा सकता हूँ।....*(व्यवधान)*...Ask your Government whether they are ready for a discussion on foreign affairs or not. I will just allow.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I have been requesting you. Public health system has collapsed in this country and we are worried about some representative of the US Congress. All over India people are suffering from Sinus and we are not worried about public health. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. That is enough. ...*(Interruptions)*...

### **Deaths of Lacs of Sheeps/Goats In Andhra Pradesh**

SHRIMATI N.P. DURGA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, in a span of three months. 11 lakh sheep/goats have died in A.P., about 4 lakh sheep/goats have been sold for less than half of its price and the net loss to the 10 lakh cattle-growing families in the State, is to the tune of Rs. 260 crores. In two districts alone 5.2 lakh sheep died. In Mahaboobnagar, 3.5 lakh sheep died and in Nalgonda 1.7 lakh sheep died. The argument of A.P. Government is that it cannot give any compensation since never in the past any