

[Shri A.W. Rabi Bernard]

We keep requesting you to support Madam Jayalalitha's efforts for an inclusive information technology growth through the distribution of free laptop computers to higher-secondary level students. The Finance Minister will surely acknowledge the dividends which the country is reaping as a result of educational revolution, particularly in the faculties of engineering and IT brought about by Dr. M.G R.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA): You have taken twice the time allotted to you.

SHRI A.W. RABI BERNARD: The Free Laptop Scheme of the State Government of Tamil Nadu should also be supported.

Sir, finally, let me quote the Bible. Jesus said, "Use your worldly resources to benefit others and make friends."

(Hon. Member may kindly fill in Tamil.)

Thank you, Sir.

MESSAGE FROM LOK SABHA

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report to the House the following message received from the Lok Sabha, signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:

"I am directed to inform you that Lok Sabha, at its sitting held on Tuesday, the 18th December, 2012, adopted the following motion:—

"That this House do extend upto the last day of the Budget Session, 2013, the time for presentation of the report of the Joint Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of telecom licences and spectrum".

GOVERNMENT BILL

The Appropriation (No. 4) Bill, 2012 (contd...)

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Andhra Pradesh): Hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the passing of Appropriation Bill is an occasion for mid-term review and from three months now, we are going to have the regular Budget. I am the ninth person

to focus on the national economic situation during this debate on the Appropriation Bill — fairly the view of the House reflected till now. My beloved friend from Opposition Benches, the main Opposition, Shri Piyush Goyal, tried to put forth his points of dichotomy, the *ardh-satya* to focus and over-focus on the sort of kind words 'mismanagement of the economy'. And the Left led by Shri Tapanji has fairly appreciated the efforts of UPA Government led by our hon. leader Shrimati Sonia Gandhi and hon. Prime Minister of India, Dr. Manmohan Singh. We were sincere and honest in our effort to present the reality. It was conveyed through our senior Member, Shri Rama Chandra Khuntia, by focusing on certain essential points. The Indian National Congress will not mince their words in admitting and meeting the expectations and aspirations. As it is, since the Lok Sabha has passed the Bill, the Rajya Sabha is going to pass this Bill. This occasion and the sort of debate went on till now will definitely be taken note of by the Union Government. The Union Finance Minister is not available and he is represented by his hon. Minister of State for Finance. I hope that the shrewd person, Shri Namo Narain Meena, will take all the points into consideration and in the essential deliberations which may commence from now onwards for the preparation of the ensuing Budget, he will certainly take the view of the House.

The UPA Government was continuously focusing on ensuring the rights so far awaited and the realization of all those rights. Any attentive Government will certainly try to understand the sensitivity and the appreciation of various fora about their comments and advice so as to plan its own approach. UPA Government is known to be very sensitive to understand the pulse of rural and urban India as well. That is how so far this UPA Government has tried to sustain, enlarge and enhance the living standards of rural and urban citizens. It is a fact and that is why almost all the speakers have appreciated the real change and its achievements on the front of agriculture, on the front of food processing. We all know that how many efforts have gone into and what is the net result in spite of global warming, other weather conditions and uncertain monsoon. How could Indian agriculture sector sustain all these conditions? What are the support mechanism, support policy and programme of the UPA Government that has ensured development? That could be understood. If you take the case of rural development, if you take the case of rural drinking water programme, if you take the case of irrigation sector, if you take the case of infrastructure sector, you can definitely understand how

[Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu]

5.00 P.M.

sincerely the UPA Government is focusing on the development. There has been appreciation of the programmes and achievements. The UPA Government has ensured to attain equilibrium of development and welfare. The welfare to the needy through various programmes, including the Rural Employment Guarantee Programme, Urban Poverty Alleviation Programme and the ensuing enlargement of the health care, the enhancement of the human civil aviation programme, the sort of concentration and importance being attached to certain sectors by the UPA Government can be understood. Regarding the seriousness of the UPA Government in sustaining and improving the capacity of the average Indian is visible. The Indian economy is very safe. Almost all the global organisations are trying to understand the strength and programme of the UPA Government. In a way, sincerely appreciating the genuine efforts of the Government. This is an occasion for a mid-term review; the House will give its sense to the Union Government. The concern expressed in this House on tax arrears shall be taken note of by the Government. The employment scenario for the rural artisans, rural agricultural labour, the urban labour has improved; and their standing of living has also improved. But the contract employment sector is day by day deteriorating. With this, the inclusiveness in the growth momentum and the intended inclusiveness of the *aam aadmi* into the totality of the Indian economy has to be seriously taken care of.

The effort of the hon. Prime Minister in constituting the Investment Board, the sort of importance it has been provided with, is automatically indicating the importance being attached to enlarge and enhance the scope for the industrial growth. The indicators are there about the Whole Price Index, about retail inflation, about other parameters. My friends from various shades of their political following tried to focus, appreciate and establish the exact fact. The confidence level of the average Indian citizen in the governance is high when we compare with other global nations.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA): Mr. Rapolu, just a minute. At 5 o'clock we have to take up Half-An-Hour Discussion. Since we have to conclude

this debate, if the House agrees, we can dispense with the Half-An-Hour Discussion and proceed with the debate. ...(*Interruptions*)... The House has agreed to continue with the debate. So we are dispensing with the Half-An-Hour Discussion.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: Respected Ashok Gangulyji has mentioned about avoiding the financial crisis. That is the effort of the UPA Government. That is within the capacity of the UPA Government. As it is, our UPA Government is not fond of making such a drastic disinvestment. If it is highly essential, then only they will be looking towards that. On the whole, building confidence among business and industrial sectors and also sustaining confidence and living standard of the average Indian living across the nation is of utmost importance to our UPA Government led by the Indian National Congress and its President, Shrimati Sonia Gandhi. While establishing the point that the UPA is committed to attain sustained growth, inclusive growth and equilibrium of development and welfare, I request the hon. Minister of State for Finance to take note of the points seriously which have been raised by me and by Shri Rama Chandra Khuntia for evolving the future course of programme for the ensuing budget. With these words, I appreciate and support the Appropriation Bill.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSAN BEHERA (Odisha): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I know there is time constraint and the Government is also hurrying up for completing this debate today. The economy of this country is going down and down. There is no specific project and programme to scale down the prices of consumer goods. The Government has no plan at all. There is a need to look into the common man's economic health. Inflation is in upper trend and it will touch double digit soon. It was 9.73 in last September and 9.75 in October. In November, it is 9.9. So the trend shows that inflation will certainly touch double digit. It seems the Government is not in a position to give the country a healthier economic situation. The Government is in a mess. This misgovernance will carry this country to a complete economic disaster. This is the apprehension. Our major population consists of middle-class and lower middle-class people. The problems of middle-class and lower middle-class are not being taken care of. The Government never thinks about the basic needs of the consumer and giving benefits to the consumer. The Government is also not serious about the minimum requirement of the common man. Now the Government has reduced the number of cooking gas cylinders per

[Shri Shashi Bhusan Behera]

family. The minimum requirement of a standard family is not less than 12. And this cap has been put by the Government. I feel that this Government is not thinking of the basic requirements of the people. These people are running their families with a lot of difficulties. They are facing shortage of pure drinking water. There is shortage of power. They are not able to get proper health care. There is no food safety. The Government is also not taking care of the needs and requirements of farmers. Today we were supposed to have a Short Duration Discussion on fertilizer shortages. Availability of urea and DAP is still in a crisis in the country, and farmers are having shortages of urea and DAP.

Then, as regards Minimum Support Price, Sir, ours is a paddy growing country. Paddy is grown in most parts of India; particularly, Eastern and Southern parts of India depend upon paddy cultivation. But the Minimum Support Price is not being enhanced by the Central Government. Even as regards jute, which is grown in West Bengal — in Orissa also we were having jute production, but now, the production is less because of this constraint — we are having this problem. As the Minimum Support Price is not being enhanced, the farmers are suffering. The State Governments are also constrained in giving bonus as they are in a financial crisis. In backward States like Orissa, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, etc., they are facing shortage of doctors in health care. I am talking about health care; I am talking about education. In all these sectors, the Government should take special care. Not only Orissa, but also the entire country is having shortage of doctors and medical colleges. Sir, health care is the basic need of the country. Only if you increase the number of seats in the existing medical colleges in Orissa, from 150 to, at least, 250, health care of the people can be properly addressed. And this is the state of financial affairs, in this country and the Government is only talking about reforms, looking after world markets, and not looking into country's own economic reforms, traditional economic reforms. This country is always having its base on traditional economic systems. So, I would say that this Appropriation Bill does not satisfy the House. Especially, when they talk of reforms, they must learn as to how to run the economic affairs of the country in a better way.

श्री राम कृपाल यादव (बिहार): उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आज हम लोग विनियोग विधेयक, 2012 पर चर्चा कर रहे हैं। देश की आर्थिक व्यवस्था ठीक नहीं है, या यूँ कहा जाए कि देश

के अलावा दुनिया की आर्थिक व्यवस्था ठीक नहीं है, तो गलत नहीं होगा, क्योंकि उसका कुप्रभाव हमारे देश पर पड़ रहा है। आम तौर पर, मूल रूप से यह कहा जाता है कि हमारा ग्रोथ रेट बढ़ रहा है, हम विकास कर रहे हैं, हमारा जी.डी.पी. बढ़ रहा है, लेकिन इस देश के जो आम लोग हैं, किसान हैं, मजदूर हैं, नौजवान हैं, जिनको दो वक्त की रोटी चाहिए, रहने के लिए मकान चाहिए, पहनने के लिए कपड़ा चाहिए, स्वास्थ्य और शिक्षा की उचित व्यवस्था चाहिए, पीने के लिए पानी चाहिए, उनको वह नहीं मिल पा रहा है। सर, सरकारें एक लम्बे अरसे से काम कर रही हैं, मगर मैं समझता हूँ कि आज भी बहुत से लोग ऐसे हैं जो बिना घर के हैं, जिनके लिए उचित आवास की व्यवस्था नहीं की गई है और वे खुले आकाश में रहने को मजबूर हैं। आज बड़े पैमाने पर बेरोजगारी की हालत है, जिससे लोगों को काफी कठिनाइयों का सामना करना पड़ रहा है। धीरे-धीरे रोजगार के अवसर खत्म हो रहे हैं। आज भी मूल रूप से इस देश की लगभग 70 से 75 प्रतिशत आबादी खेत-खलिहान पर निर्भर करती है, मगर किसानों की हालत कुछ ठीक नहीं है। आज भी पर्यावरण का प्रकोप पड़ रहा है असमय बारिश हो रही है। मैं समझता हूँ कि किसानों के लिए समुचित रूप से जल की जो व्यवस्था होनी चाहिए, वह नहीं हो पा रही है। अगर कोई किसान बहुत मेहनत से अपने खेत में उत्पादन भी करता हूँ, तो उसको उसकी सही कीमत नहीं मिल पा रही है। मैं तो समझता हूँ कि बहुत से ऐसे किसान हैं, जो आज भी आत्महत्या के लिए मजबूर हैं। जब उनको लागत की कीमत नहीं मिलेगी, तो निश्चित तौर पर वे जो कर्ज ले रहे हैं, और वह कर्ज वापस नहीं कर पा रहे हैं। तो उन्हें आत्महत्या के अलावा कोई दूसरा उपाय नहीं सूझ रहा है। सर, हमारी अर्थव्यवस्था खेत, खलिहान, गांवों पर निर्भर करती है। जब तक हम सम्पूर्ण रूप से उनके लिए उचित व्यवस्था नहीं करेंगे, तब तक हमारे देश की अर्थव्यवस्था ठीक नहीं होगी। जब तक गांवों में खुशहाली नहीं होगी, तब तक इस देश में खुशहाली नहीं होगी।

माननीय मंत्री जी, निश्चित तौर पर जो सब्सिडी का प्रावधान किया जा रहा था, धीरे-धीरे आप खाद से सब्सिडी हटा रहे हैं, गैस सिलेंडर से सब्सिडी हटा रहे हैं, मगर आम लोगों की जो समस्या है, उसकी तरफ आपका ध्यान नहीं जा रहा है। आज भी मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर किसानों के लिए उचित व्यवस्था कर दी जाए, तो देश की अर्थव्यवस्था को पूरे तौर पर मजबूत करने का काम किया जा सकता है, क्योंकि उनमें क्षमता है, कूवत है।

महोदय, आज शिक्षा की क्या व्यवस्था है? आज भी बड़े पैमाने पर गांवों में गरीब तबके के लोग हैं। इस देश में आधे से अधिक लोग गरीबी रेखा से नीचे गुजर-बसर कर रहे हैं। उनके बच्चे आज भी समुचित ढंग से पढ़ नहीं पा रहे हैं। स्कूल भवनों की कमी है, शिक्षकों की कमी है, जिससे उनको गुणवत्तापूर्ण शिक्षा नहीं मिल पा रही है। कई ऐसे अभाव दिख रहे हैं। मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर हम गांवों के बच्चों की शिक्षा के लिए समुचित व्यवस्था नहीं करेंगे, तो देश तरक्की नहीं कर सकता है।

[श्री राम कृपाल यादव]

महोदय, स्वास्थ्य की क्या व्यवस्था है? आज भी बड़े पैमाने पर हॉस्पिटल्स की कमी है, स्वास्थ्य केन्द्रों की कमी है, डाक्टर्स की कमी है, दवाई उपलब्ध नहीं है। मैं समझता हूँ कि आबादी के हिसाब से पर्याप्त संख्या में जो डाक्टर्स की उपलब्धता होनी चाहिए, हॉस्पिटल्स की बिल्डिंग होनी चाहिए, वे नहीं हैं, कम हैं। इसलिए इस पर सरकार को ध्यान देने की जरूरत है।

महोदय, मैं आपको बताऊँ कि किसानों को जो ऋण दिए जाते हैं, आम लोगों को जो ऋण दिए जाते हैं, ...सर, दो मिनट दे दीजिए, बैंकों की जो व्यवस्था है, किसानों और जो कमजोर तबके के लोग हैं, साधारण लोग हैं, गरीब लोग हैं, उनके लिए तो आपके पास निश्चित तौर पर बहुत सारे कानून हैं, जिनको इम्प्लीमेंट करके मसलमैन को भेजा जाता है, एजेंट को भेजा जाता है, जो ऋण को वसूल करने का काम करते हैं, मगर वहीं इस देश में जो बड़े-बड़े उद्योगपति हैं, बड़े-बड़े घराने हैं, उनको भारत सरकार के बैंकों से जो कर्ज दिया जाता है, उसकी वसूली नहीं की जाती है, उसे माफ कर दिया जाता है। आप एक तरफ गरीबों के लिए पिटाई की व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं और दूसरी तरफ बड़े-बड़े उद्योगपतियों के लिए मिठाई की व्यवस्था कर रहे हैं। यह दो तरह की नीति चलने वाली नहीं है। आप ऐसी व्यवस्था करें, ताकि किसानों को कम दर पर ऋण मिल सके, ताकि वे अपना जीविकोपार्जन कर सकें और देश की तरक्की में महत्वपूर्ण योगदान कर सकें।

महोदय, मैं समझता हूँ कि आज भी इस देश में बच्चे कुपोषण के शिकार हो रहे हैं, क्योंकि खाद्य की समुचित व्यवस्था नहीं हो पा रही है। प्रधानमंत्री जी ने स्वयं कहा है कि इस देश में कितने बड़े पैमाने पर बच्चे कुपोषण का शिकार होने की वजह से मर रहे हैं। ...**(समय की घंटी)**... सर, एक मिनट। आज भी कई ऐसी माताएं हैं, जो गर्भ होने के बाद भी अपने बच्चों को ठीक ढंग से दूध नहीं पिला सकतीं। उनके लिए दवा की उपलब्धता नहीं है। इन तमाम चीजों पर सरकार को ध्यान देने की जरूरत है। देश के आम लोग स्वस्थ रहेंगे, तभी देश स्वस्थ हो सकता है। इसलिए आप ऐसी नीतियों को, ऐसे विचारों को लाने का काम करें, जिनसे देश की बेरोजगारी, गरीबी, फटेहाली दूर हो सके।

महोदय, बिहार ऐसा प्रदेश है, जहां आज भी बड़े पैमाने पर अशिक्षा है, स्वास्थ्य की कमी है, आधारभूत संरचना की कमी है। मैं समझता हूँ कि बिहार जैसे जो पिछड़े प्रदेश हैं, उनके लिए विशेष पैकेज की जरूरत है। ...**(समय की घंटी)**... बिहार की सरकार को भी सहयोग की जरूरत है, क्योंकि वहां 10 करोड़ की आबादी है, जो परेशानी की हालत में है। इसलिए माननीय मंत्री जी, कुछ कृपा कीजिए और बिहार जैसे पिछड़े प्रदेशों के ऊपर ध्यान देकर उन्हें अगली पंक्ति में उठाने के लिए सहयोग देने का काम कीजिए। **It is my last point, Sir.** मंत्री जी यहां नहीं थे, आप एमपीलेड की व्यवस्था करते हैं, लेकिन आज हमारे

राज्य की सरकार ने एमपीलैड में एक नई व्यवस्था करने का काम किया है। यहां पर बिहार के कई माननीय सांसद बैठे हैं, मैं आपको बताना चाहूंगा कि वहां इस फंड से एक भी पैसा खर्च नहीं हो रहा है, क्योंकि इस नयी व्यवस्था में कई तरह का व्यवधान आ रहा है।

माननीय मंत्री जी, आप बिहार के एक-एक क्षेत्र के लिए पांच-पांच करोड़ रुपया प्रति वर्ष दे रहे हैं, लेकिन वहां उस पैसे का सदुपयोग नहीं हो रहा है, जिससे वहां का विकास अवरुद्ध हो रहा है, इस पर भी आप ध्यान देने का काम करें। राज्य की सरकार ने एमपीलैड पर जो नये तरह का व्यवधान इम्पोज़ करने का काम किया है, उसे आप हटाने का काम कीजिए।

इन्हीं चन्द शब्दों के साथ मैं पुनः आपसे अनुरोध करूंगा कि जब तक इस देश के खेतों और खलिहानों में खुशहाली नहीं आएगी, तब तक इस देश की जनता, देश की आवाज खुश नहीं रह सकती। आज भी 70% से 75% गरीब जनता, किसान और मज़दूर बेरोज़गारी और गरीबी की हालत में हैं। आप उनकी तरफ भी ध्यान दीजिए, तो मैं समझता हूं कि इससे निश्चित तौर पर देश आगे बढ़ेगा और हमारी अर्थव्यवस्था मजबूत होगी। बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT (Maharashtra): Sir, I think, I am the last speaker.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA): No. There is one more.

DR. BHARATKUMAR RAUT: Sir, I wish to speak point-wise and do not intend to make a general speech. I know that it is not an election speech.

Sir, I draw your attention to Point No. 9 of the Schedule which deals with the Ministry of Civil Aviation. In that, the capital voted Demand from Parliament is Rs. 2,000 crores. I am talking about only one Demand.

Sir, I am associated with Shiv Sena-led labour unions in Air India and the Airport Authority of India. Therefore, I am speaking on this point, though I am not an economist. Sir, when I went through the figures, I was really surprised that Air India needs this much of money — Rs. 2,000 crores -- in this Budget for its turnaround! I really do not know. The hon. Minister is here. I really do not know why Air India needs such huge amount. क्योंकि एअर इंडिया तो महाराजा है, फिर उसको भीख क्यों चाहिए? I really don't understand. But, then, when I went into the details, I realised that Maharaja is not dying; Maharaja is being killed by the Government and the Ministry. Therefore, I am concern about it. When I say this, I have specific reasons behind this. There are moves going on and already some

[Dr. Bharatkumar Raut]

moves took place to privatise certain wings of Air India and also the AAI. And, who are becoming private partners? Sir, mostly, they are foreign companies and MNCs. We are doing this business with them. We are giving our business to them in the name of shading the burden of overheads. What are these overheads? Now, we are thinking of "bringing in a joint-venture partner in the department of OMR—Operation, Maintenance and Repairs and also creating a separate company called AIATSL. These companies are, basically, handling the maintenance and ground support facilities. So far, it is only the Air India which has been providing ground support. Apart from giving - ground support to Air India flights, it was also providing ground support to other airlines which did not have their own department. So, Air India was providing them those facilities on rent or on payment. As we are taking money from other airlines by providing ground handling facilities, the Ground Support Department not only became self-sufficient but also was giving money to Air India kitty. We are privatising that department! Why? It is because we want to shed the overheads. I failed to understand the logic. There are some economists here who would, perhaps, give logic in doing this.

We have a milking cow which we send to the slaughter house; why? For shedding overheads! What are the overheads? By doing this, you are leaving the Air India staff, which has been there with you for many years, in the lurch, and at the mercy of foreign partners. So, there will be agitations; in any case, there will be agitations; there will be litigations. Who will face them? And after two years, you will again come up with another turn-around proposal and ask for another Rs. 2,000 crores. Why so? Why do we not strengthen these departments which are functioning, and which are providing money to the Air India kitty? We need to look into that. ...(*Time-bell rings*)...

Sir, I have taken only a few minutes. I would conclude soon. I would take one minute less than what was allotted.

Sir, this is the situation. Talking of joint venture partnerships, I would again like to draw the attention of the hon. Minister to the fact that we are selling off prime land in the vicinity of our airports. For example, in Mumbai we have huge prime land at Santa Cruz and Sahara Airport. That is being given away at a throw-away price to the joint venture partner. The partner would establish commercial

complexes there and run his business. Why can't we do that? It is a one-time affair. Once you sell it away, it is gone. Why don't we develop the property and add money to our own kitty? This is not on. I can smell a rat there.

Sir, so far only IAS officers have been heading Air India and the Airport Authority; or, sometimes these have been the technocrats. I have nothing against the Civil Service. But Air India is a commercial venture. It is not a Government department. So, if it is a commercial venture, it should be run and headed by a commercial person. So, why do we not bring a good commercial man, a management guy, from outside and make him run the Department, so that the Ministry's burden is lessened and we could run it in a proper manner?

SHRI N.K. SINGH (Bihar): Sir, it is the fag end of this discussion. In a certain holistic sense of the term, out of the amount which the Finance Minister is seeking, Rs.32,000 crores odd, Rs.28,000 crores is for payment of subsidies and so on, and Rs.2000 crores is for civil aviation which is also necessary. Nobody can really object to this. But the fact remains that you are asking for Rs.28,000 crores because you have not been able to take the corrective steps in the course of this year. Why? Also, why did you end up providing only Rs. 40,000 crores in the Budget when, in the previous year, 2010-11, the amount which you had provided, was Rs. 83,000 crores? So, when the actual was Rs. 83,000 crores, you provided for Rs. 40,000 crores. You didn't take the corrective action. Therefore, as a consequence of this, naturally, you are now seeking Rs. 28,000 crores, which is extra. This really calls for better budgetary planning.

But, Sir, leaving aside this issue, what is the configuration? I have every sympathy for the Finance Minister. The configuration doesn't look good at all. Now, yesterday's Mid-Term Economic Analysis suggests that the economic growth is likely to be around 5.7 per cent. You might take a congratulatory view that compared to the rest of the world we are doing damn good; 5.7 per cent is not bad. It is way below our potential and it is way below the fact that at some stage we grew at 9.8 per cent. So, coming down from 9.8 per cent to 5.7 per cent, at best, is hardly something which is congratulatory. Also, you had taken upon yourselves the challenge of keeping fiscal deficit at only 5.3 per cent; the Finance Minister mentioned that he might try for 5.2 per cent. But his new path of fiscal

[Shri N.K. Singh]

consolidation hasn't been filled 'up with details of how he intends to achieve 5.3 per cent and, what the Prime Minister has said the day before yesterday, 'take the bitter pill'. When will this bitter medicine be administered? Mr. Pranab Mukherjee had talked of biting the bullet; now, we are talking of the bitter medicine. When will this bitter medicine be taken?

Look at the basic facts, Sir. The facts remain that the savings rate, which is the investment bearing ratio, which is the critical factor to determine the rate of growth, has stumbled down from 36.8 per cent to just 32 per cent. How are you going to put up your savings rate by four percentage point of our GDP? The fact remains that the external debt has deteriorated because the debt service ratio has gone down, debt as a percentage of GDP has gone up, and the current account deficit yawns at an impossible 70 billion dollars as per the Finance Minister's own confession. What are really the trajectories in which he wishes to do so? The manufacturing sector has shown some incipient signs; there have been some improvements in investor sentiment. The new committee constituted by the Prime Minister, hopefully invests some new hope into real sectors like civil aviation, power, telecom and so on. Hopefully, there will be some actions which will be taken on the ground. But, I think, since this is the last opportunity this House will have before the Budget, I wish to make for the Finance Minister's consideration five suggestions which he could consider while formulating the Budget.

First and foremost, Sir, give us and give the world a credible action plan for managing the fiscal numbers. The new Fiscal Responsibility Bill really should be invested with more teeth. The Finance Commission has suggested the constitution of a Fiscal Council. This Fiscal Council ends up in reporting only to the Finance Ministry. Why does not this Fiscal Council—as happens in the rest of the world like in Europe, France, the U.K., the U.S., Australia and Canada—report also directly to the Parliament? It will help the Finance Ministry because then you will have real teeth in the new path of fiscal consolidation which you lay upon yourself.

Secondly, the Finance Minister had accepted in principle the constitution of an independent debt management office. When will that independent debt management office which will obviate the conflict of interests, with the Reserve Bank of India, begin to take real teeth in substance?

Thirdly, Sir, they talk greatly of expenditure reports. These expenditure reports give historic opportunity for you, Mr. Finance Minister. On the 27th of this month, the National Development Council meets—it is a special meeting, it meets once in five years—to approve the contours of new Five Year Plan. Please suggest to the National Development Council to constitute a special committee of the Chief Ministers to look at a further consolidation of Centrally-sponsored schemes which still number over 100 and to really give the contours of a better expenditure management plan. This will be a central fulcrum for you when you begin to crop your Budget.

Sir, I would suggest two more suggestions for the consideration. One is the National Commission on Regional Inequality. You have had a lot of amplitudes in economic growth. The economic growth has been volatile in this country. The GDP figures have varied very widely. One way you cannot have an insurance is to have really the lesser developed regions of this country growing at a faster rate. A regional commission on amelioration of regional inequalities would go a long way.

Sir, I wish to end by saying that the Finance Minister must be complimented. He has tried to reverse the dwindling investor sentiments. He took over the reigns of the Finance Ministry at a difficult time. Suddenly, the world had lost confidence. Suddenly, on every conceivable macro-economic parameter, we seem to be going downhill. This must be said to the credit that he has tried to arrest this downward sentiment.

Sir, I have two closing comments to make having paid him this compliment. First and foremost, we must realise that what the Finance Minister has done was not to take over from a new Government. He took over from this very Government. It is, therefore, ironic that the argument, 'I inherited an economy in a mess; but, look, what I have done to it in a short period of time!', cuts thin because you inherited an economy which you decided to bequeath for yourself.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair)

My last comment is, the time for pepping up sentiment is over. The time when you can talk of stock market is also past the time. The world will watch very carefully what you do between now and the next Budget to take some of the more

[Shri N.K. Singh]

difficult measures which you need to take, which is outlined on page 39 of the Planning Commission's Chapter-I of the Plan to be adopted on the 27th of this month, and how you intend to take those difficult measures and swallow the bitter pill. We will wait and watch very carefully the actions which we hope will unfold. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You spoke already, I think.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, just one minute. There was some comment made about my intervention, which I just need to rebut because unfortunately, the Treasury Benches seem to be ignorant about facts. Like Jesus said, "We should forgive them their ignorance," I do forgive them their ignorance. But I just wanted to say that our party is the one party. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam): Sir, he has accused the entire Treasury Benches. If he has any dispute with somebody, he can say so. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: "Somebody" is correct. Do not blame them as a group; you say individually.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, an hon. Member from the Treasury Benches seem to allude that the BJP opposes FDI, and on another hand, demands for FDI or demands policy intervention to increase FDI. I would like to inform them that it is the BJP-led NDA that brought in structural reforms to bring FDI in banking, insurance and pension. We disinvested sick units. Maximum reforms took place in that period. ...(Time-bell rings)... The gentleman is alluding to multi-brand retail only. We have, in fact, allowed them to do single brand. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; now the hon. Minister.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: We have always supported ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the hon. Minister.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Except that FDI in multi-brand retail ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is over. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: ...was a matter of conviction, and we stand by that conviction in national interest.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, take your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: So, all FDI is not necessarily good, and I would like to quote their own Finance Minister, who said on the floor ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, there is no time for quoting. Take your seat.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: I am just quoting his statement in Parliament. Therefore, that is a comment from that side, and not from the BJP side. We have always supported FDI in national interest.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, the hon. Minister may reply, please.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I would like to extend gratitude to all hon. Members who have participated and gave valuable input, suggestions and made observations in the debate on the first batch of Supplementary Demands for Grants, 2012-13. Approval of additional expenditure is being sought from the Parliament for absolutely essential items. Further, the Government will not be required to borrow additionally from the market for the items of cash additionality. The additionality will be met through savings within the budgeted expenditure level.

The Supplementary demands have to be seen in view of commitment of Government to move towards path of fiscal consolidation. It may be recalled that the Government had not presented any supplementary demands during the Monsoon Session of the Parliament to keep Government expenditure under strict control.

Sir, several issues during the debate were raised by the hon. Members regarding fiscal consolidation, current account deficit, inflation, expenditure on social sector schemes, etc. I would like to address them one by one. I will use this opportunity to inform this .House about the need for fiscal consolidation. After passage of FRBM Act, 2003, there was a significant improvement in fiscal deficit.

[Shri Namo Narain Meena]

The process of fiscal consolidation during the years 2002-03 to 2007-08 resulted in an improvement in fiscal deficit from 5.9% of the GDP in 2002-03 to 2.7% in 2007-08. The counter cyclical measures taken by the Government to overcome the effects of the global slowdown in 2008-09 and 2009-10 resulted in shortfall in revenue and substantial increases in government expenditure. This was however a part of Government's policy initiative based on the principle of insulating the vulnerable sections of the society and sectors of the economy from the adverse impact of the economic downturn and at the same time to ensure revival of the economy with higher growth.

Fiscal deficit, which stood at 6.5% of GDP in 2009-10, came down to 4.9% of GDP in 2010-11 because of higher receipts of Non-Tax Revenue from auction of 3G and Broadband Wireless Access (BWA) spectrum. The fiscal deficit in 2011-12 was 5.8% of GDP as per provisional accounts as against 4.6% of GDP estimated in BE 2011-12. It is estimated to be 5.1% of GDP in 2012-13. Government is taking all possible measures to contain the fiscal deficit very nearly to the budgeted level. Therefore, barring 2010-11, when the Government had the benefit of higher than estimated non-tax revenue of about 0.9 per cent of GDP from auction of 3G and BWA spectrum fiscal deficit has consistently remained high in last few fiscal years.

The reasons for increase in fiscal deficit are wide-ranging, like global economic Scenario including hardening of crude prices and sticky high inflation scenario in the domestic economy. With crude oil prices remaining at about US \$110 to 115 per barrel during the most part of the calendar year and consequent duty cuts on petroleum products during June, 2011, the fiscal balance deteriorated in 2011-12, reflecting slippages in tax revenues. Further, there was shortfall on disinvestment targets due to prevailing market situation in 2011-12. High crude oil prices coupled with high international prices of imported fertilizer resulted in huge jump in subsidy bill of the Government in 2011-12.

The increase-in fiscal deficit may also be seen in the context of Government policy, introduced during 2010-11, for making payment to oil and fertilizer companies in cash towards oil and fertilizer subsidies in lieu of issuing bonds to these companies.

A supplementary demand for which the assent of Parliament is being sought has to be seen in the backdrop of this fiscal stress, which the Government is facing. It is essential at this juncture that effort is made in the direction of fiscal consolidation. This is also required to aid economy in growth revival and, second, to bring down the deficit from 2011-12 level so as to leave space for private sector credit as the investment cycle picks up.

The Government has reverted to the path of fiscal consolidation with gradual exit from the expansionary measures in a calibrated manner. During current financial year, 2012-13, the Government intends to gradually return from the fiscal deficit of 5.8 per cent to at least 5.3 per cent, that is, a correction of nearly 0.5 per cent through a mix of reduction in total expenditure and improvement in gross tax revenue as percentage of the GDP. The Government has taken the following steps to contain the fiscal deficit: (a) In the current financial year, the Government has imposed economic measures, like, rationalization of expenditure and optimization of available resources with a view to improve macroeconomic environment. This includes 10 per cent mandatory cut on Non-Plan expenditure in the current financial year, ban on holding of meetings and conferences at five star hotels, ban on creation of Plan and Non Plan posts, restriction on foreign travels, restriction on re-appropriation of funds, observance of discipline in fiscal transfers to States, Public Sector Undertakings, Autonomous Bodies, such as, releases to any entity shall be based on furnishing of Utilization Certificates, no release of funds will be made in relaxation of conditionalities attached to such transfers (matching funding), etc.; (b) The Government has also introduced 'Medium-term Expenditure Framework Statement', setting forth a three-year rolling target for expenditure indicators with a view to undertaking a da novo exercise for allocating resources for prioritized schemes and weeding out others that have outlived their utility. It would also encourage efficiencies in expenditure management; (c) the Government will also endeavour to restrict the expenditure on Central subsidies. Partial increase in the price of diesel and a cap on subsidized LPG cylinder are a few steps in this direction; (d) A committee, constituted under Dr. Vijay Kelkar to assist the Government in formulating the path of fiscal consolidation, has recommended a number of reform measures in taxation, disinvestment and expenditure. While the Government has broadly accepted the recommendations of the Committee with certain reservations, details are under examination of relevant Ministries and

[Shri Namo Narain Meena]

Departments. The Government has also decided to adopt the following plan of fiscal consolidation during the period of the Twelfth Plan, that is, from 2012-13 to 2016-17: The fiscal road map is — during the year 2012-13, the fiscal deficit will be 5.3 per cent of the GDP; 2013-14, the fiscal deficit will be 4.2 per cent of the GDP; 2014-15, the fiscal deficit will be 4.2 per cent of the GDP; 2015-16, the fiscal deficit will be 3.6 per cent of the GDP; 2016-17, the fiscal deficit will be 3.0 per cent of the GDP.

My friend, Sri Piyush Goyal, stated that the NDA had left the country in sound fiscal health and there were deteriorations thereafter. I would like to state that the NDA left with a Fiscal Deficit of 4.5 per cent of the GDP in 2003-04. The UPA Government, with a focus on fiscal consolidation, brought the fiscal deficit down to 2.7 per cent in 2007-08. However, global factors and recession necessitated Government to take several counter cyclical measures, including tax concessions in order to protect the poor and vulnerable sections of the society.

As I have stated earlier, the Government is committed to path of fiscal consolidation and appointed the Kefkar Committee. We are committed to reigning in the fiscal deficit in the current year to 5.3 per cent, and progressively reduce it to 3 per cent. Sir, a point was raised by several Members of Parliament about lack of investment and high inflation. Sir, a tight Monetary policy has been pursued by the RBI, during 2011-12, to control inflation. The repo rate was raised by 375 points between May, 2010 and Oct, 2011, which has led to an increase in the cost of borrowings.

The economy, however, registered a growth of 8.4 per cent in 2009-10 and 2010-11 through policy interventions and stimulus measures including government expenditure in key infrastructure and social sectors.

Sir, the Government is now taking various measures which include: (1) Approval of a National Manufacturing Policy with the objective of enhancing share of manufacturing in GDP. (2) Creation of Cabinet Committee on Investment to fast-track the process of granting clearances to projects. Agriculture has been the priority of the Government. Besides increasing irrigation, storage and cold storage networks, efforts have been made to improve production of protein foods.

There are some positive signs of growth. RBI's Business Expectation Index is now showing an improvement.

The Government is committed to various social sectors and upliftment of the disadvantaged class. A comparison of allocation under various key Ministries that are involved in these activities has been made which is like this. For rural development, during 1999-2004, the allocation was Rs.54,368 crores, whereas the allocation during 2009-13 is Rs.2,68,970 crores. For drinking water supply, during 1999-2004, it was Rs.10,921 crores, whereas during 2009-13, it is Rs.43,761 crores. For education, for the same period, that is, during 1999-2004, it was Rs.28,488 crores, whereas during 2009-13, it is Rs.1,86,326 crores. For health, during 1999-2004, it was Rs.24,639 crores, whereas during 2009-13, it is Rs.93,165 crores. For social justice and empowerment, during 1999-2004, it was only Rs.5,787 crores, whereas during 2009-13, it is Rs.17,657 crores. For tribal affairs, during 1999-2003, it was Rs.4,240 crores, whereas during 2009-13, it is Rs. 12,946 crores. For women and child development, during 1999-2004, it was Rs.8,351 crores, whereas during 2009-13, it is Rs.53,700 crores. So, you can see, how much more allocations are being made by our Government.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: These are the figures for all the years taken together.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: This is a comparison of allocations made for five years.

Sir, some of my friends have also raised their concerns. With regard to the concerns raised by Shri Tapan Kumar Sen, I would like to say that the Government, while promoting efficiency and autonomy of PSUs, is also committed to judicious utilisation of disinvestment resources. Disinvestment proceeds are used for creation of capital assets. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me finish. Then, Dr. Bharatkumar Raut has asked about the provision of Rs. 2000 crore for Air India in Supplementary Demands for Grants. Sir, the provision of Rs. 2000 crore to Air India is as a part of equity infusion, as a part of turnaround plan. While we are also concerned about this, my colleague would appreciate that, this being a difficult time in civil aviation sector, we need to support the national carrier not only to control fares but also to infuse competition. The Air India has shown some improvement in the last few months and my colleague, the Civil Aviation Minister, is monitoring it on a regular basis.

[Shri Namo Narain Meena]

In the end, I would also like to thank Shri N.K. Singh for his valuable suggestions and his guiding words.

With these words, I request that the Appropriation (No. 4) Bill, as passed by the Lok Sabha, be returned.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The question is that the ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI N.K. SINGH: Sir, one very small question. I will take not more than thirty seconds. Sir, the hon. Minister has very rightly referred to the fact that the Government has appointed the Kelkar Committee to give the Government a roadmap. I am sure, the Minister is aware that Government not only appointed but since then Dr. Vijay Laxman Kelkar has submitted his report in three parts. His part 1 deals with a revised path, proposed path of fiscal consolidation in modification of his recommendations given as the Chairman of the Thirteenth Finance Commission. I just wish to seek a clarification from the Minister. Has the Government accepted Dr. Kelkar's recommendations?

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, as I have said in my reply, there are certain conditions which they have accepted. But there are certain reservations also. That is under consideration.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the question is, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: The hon. Minister has said that the ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no time for discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no; you are not supposed to reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not supposed to reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... Reply is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay. Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... It's is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not supposed to reply to him. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not a Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not expected to reply to him. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can use it later. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Now, the question is:

That the Bill to authorize payment and appropriation of certain further sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of India for the services of the financial year 2012-13, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.

The motion was adopted.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill.

Clauses 2, 3 and the Schedule were added to the Bill.

Clause 1, The Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI NAMO NARAIN MEENA: Sir, I move: That the Bill be returned.

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to inform the Members that the Business Advisory Committee, in its meeting held on the 18th of December, 2012, has allotted time for Government Legislative Business, as follows:—

Business	Time Allotted
Consideration and passing of the Enforcement of Security Interest and Recovery of Debts Laws (Amendment) Bill, 2012, as passed by Lok Sabha.	Three hours
Consideration and passing of the Banking Laws (Amendment) Bill, 2011, after it is passed by Lok Sabha.	Four hours

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11.00 A.M.

The House then adjourned at fifty-five minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Wednesday, the 19th December, 2012.