

responsibility for this. I would only quote that in the year 2011-12, the tax foregone was Rs. 5.33 lakh crore. ...*(Interruptions)*... In 2012-13, the tax foregone is Rs.5.73 lakh crore. Why don't you recover this tax and pay for the Food Security Bill? Thank you, Sir.

---

**MESSAGE FROM THE LOK SABHA - (Contd.)**

**The National Highways Authority of India (Amendment) Bill, 2012**

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, in accordance with the provisions of rule 101 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to inform you that the following amendments made by Rajya Sabha in the National Highways Authority of India (Amendment) Bill, 2012 at its sitting held on 13th August, 2013, were taken into consideration and agreed to by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 2nd September, 2013 : –

**Enacting Formula**

1. That at page 1, line 1, *for* the word “Sixty-third”, the word “Sixty-fourth” be *substituted*.

**Clause 1**

2. That at page 1, line 3, for the figure “2012”, the figure “2013” be *substituted*.

---

**STATUTORY RESOLUTION DISAPPROVING THE NATIONAL FOOD  
SECURITY ORDINANCE (NO. 7 OF 2013)**

**AND**

**THE NATIONAL FOOD SECURITY BILL, 2013 – (Contd)**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Amar Singh. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I want to make a submission and also an appeal to the ruling party. A good number of Members want to speak on this Bill. So, let the discussion be over today. Minister's reply and voting can take place tomorrow morning. ...*(Interruptions)*... That will be ideal. Otherwise you won't get Members. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (BIHAR) : Sir, I oppose. जब आप किसी चीज को नियमबद्ध करते हैं, तो सब लोग अपने लिए समय नियत करते हैं। मुझे आज पटना जाना था, लेकिन इसके कारण मैंने वहां जाना कैंसिल किया। यह लिस्टेड है। लोक सभा ने रात के 11 बजे तक बैठ कर यह बिल पास किया था। इसमें हम कितने लोग बोलने वाले हैं? मुश्किल से छः-सात लोग और बोलने वाले हैं। अभी एक-दो घंटे में यह खत्म हो जाएगा। You conclude today.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, Shri Amar Singh. Your time is five minutes only.

**श्री अमर सिंह** (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मैं इस महत्वपूर्ण ऐतिहासिक खाद्य सुरक्षा बिल का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ा हूं।

आज प्रातः काल से लगातार मैं सभी माननीय सदस्यों के वक्तव्य को इस सदन में सुन रहा हूं। सबका अपना-अपना फितूर है, सबके अपने-अपने दिमाग की फसल है, उपज है और सभी मुल्क के मुफलिसों के लिए फिक्रमंद हैं।

खाली नहीं दिमाग किसी का फितूर से,  
इंसान परेशां हाल है अपने कुसूर से।  
फसलों को नफरतों में उगाने लगे हैं लोग,  
पीकर लहू को प्यास बुझाने लगे हैं लोग।  
मुफलिस को देखकर जो परेशान नहीं होता,  
यह सच है, ऐसे शख्स का ईमान नहीं होता।

सर, मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि यह सवाल उठाना कि चुनाव घोषणापत्र में यह बहुत पहले था और अब क्यों हुआ है और अगर अब नहीं किया होता, तो कहा जाता है कि बिल्कुल किया ही नहीं। देर आए दुरुस्त आए। यह कहना कि आप जो देश में करने जा रहे हैं, हम किसी राज्य में बहुत पहले बहुत अच्छा कर चुके हैं,

(उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी) पीठासीन हुईं)

इसलिए बड़ा मन दिखाना चाहिए। भाई अरुण जेटली जी की इस बात से मैं पूर्ण रूप से सहमत हूं कि बड़ा मन दिखाना चाहिए।

अगर पक्ष का कोई व्यक्ति बड़ा मन नहीं दिखा रहा है, तो मैं तो आपसे अपील करूंगा कि आप बड़ा मन दिखा कर सराहना कीजिए कि आपने जो काम छत्तीसगढ़ राज्य में किया है, वह काम यह सरकार और यूपीए का नेतृत्व पूरे देश में करने जा रहा है। कोई तो बड़ा मन दिखाए। अगर इधर कंजूसी है, तो उधर के लोग दिखाएं और उधर कंजूसी है, तो इधर के लोग दिखाएं, क्योंकि गरीबों को रोटी देने और पेट की भूख के मामले में, सीमा



की सुरक्षा के मामले में, देश की आंतरिक सुरक्षा के मामले में, शिक्षा और स्वास्थ्य के मामले में मेरी समझ में कोई सियासत नहीं होनी चाहिए और सियासत हो भी नहीं रही है। बहुत कम लोग हैं, जो इस बिल का खुला विरोध कर रहे हैं। हर व्यक्ति चाहता है कि यह बिल पास हो जाए और पास करने के लिए लोग बैठे भी हैं, लेकिन मुझे दुख इस बात का है कि सब अपना-अपना caveat दे रहे हैं। सबको इस बात की फिक्र है कि इसका श्रेय उधर बैठे हुए लोग न ले लें और इसलिए बार-बार अनावश्यक रूप से टिप्पणियां हो रही हैं। मैं किसी का नाम नहीं लेना चाहता, नाम लेकर अनावश्यक विवाद नहीं पैदा करना चाहता, एक बड़ी आवाज आई कि श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी ने कहा है कि साधन हों या न हों, हमें यह करना है। कैसे करेंगे? इसका सवाल उठा। उसका जवाब सीताराम येचुरी ने दे दिया कि बजट में प्रावधान है कि 6 लाख करोड़ रुपए आय का एक एकत्रीकरण होना चाहिए। वह नहीं हो रहा है। देश के अमीर लोग सोना खरीदते हैं या रीयल एस्टेट में नियोजन करते हैं या फिर डॉलर खरीदते हैं। आज हमारे देश का रुपया किया गया है, लेकिन देश के सबसे बड़े औद्योगिक घराने को रुपए की इस मंदी से बहुत फायदा हो गया। ऐसे तमाम लोगों पर टैक्स लगना चाहिए। ऐसे तमाम लोगों से जो धनाढ्य हैं, जिनमें मैं भी हूं, टैक्स लीजिए। मैं नहीं कहता कि मैं मुफलिस और गरीब हूं। मैं भी करोड़ों में टैक्स देता हूं। ऐसे तमाम लोग, जिनके पास है, जो हैब्स संप्रदाय से संबंध रखते हैं, वे गुरबत के मारे गरीब लोगों को अगर अपनी जेब से कुछ निकाल कर दें और अगर वे देने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं, तो उनकी जेब में हाथ डालकर निकाल कर लेने का अधिकार आपको है, इसलिए यह कहना कि संसाधन नहीं हैं, उचित नहीं है। मैं तो यह कहना चाहूंगा कि लोगों को जीडीपी, सेंसेक्स और इंडस्ट्रियल ग्रोथ की बड़ी फिक्र है, लेकिन मैं पूछना चाहता हूं कि गरीब किसान आईटीसी का होटल नहीं बना पाएगा, लेकिन आईटीसी का होटल चलाने वाले लोग, पांच सितारा होटल चलाने वाला आईटीसी और कारगिल के लोग गरीब किसान की जमीन को लेकर आटा बनाने का काम कर सकते हैं। इसलिए, इंडस्ट्रियल ग्रोथ की विंता मत कीजिए। यहां पर राम जेटमलानी जी बोले और बोल करके चले गए, उन्होंने खाने की, भोजन की परिभाषा दी। माननीय कर्ण सिंह जी नहीं हैं, वे हमारे उपनिषदों के बड़े ज्ञानी हैं। हमारे उपनिषदों में लिखा है कि खाद्य जीवन की मूलभूत आवश्यकता है, सृष्टि में उत्पत्ति का मूल अन्न है, पृथ्वी पर जीव की यथार्थता का कारण अन्न है, पृथ्वी पर जीवन का मर्म भी अन्न है एवं पृथ्वी पर जीवंत अपने अंत पर विसर्जित एवं समाहित और समर्पित भी अन्न के अंदर ही होता है। अन्न कहां से आएगा? भारतीय किसान ब्राउन राइस, बासमती चावल, रेड राइस, ब्लैक राइस और गंगा की तटीय मिट्टी पर 18 फीट लंबे धान के पौधे और कोस्टल वाटर के पास saline resistant rice को बनाने की क्षमता रखता है। भारत का किसान इतना गुणी है, सिर्फ वह पेटेंट कराना नहीं जानता है। उसकी गुणवत्ता को चुनौती मत दीजिए। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि जेनेटिक इंजीनियरिंग MONSANTO का एक कार्यक्रम है, इसलिए यह फूड डेमोक्रेसी भी बहुत जरूरी है। फूड डिक्टेटरशिप, जो बहुराष्ट्रीय कंपनियां चला रही हैं, जीडीपी ग्रोथ और सेंसेक्स के नाम पर Seattle में जो बड़ी-बड़ी मीटिंगें हो रही हैं, उन मीटिंगों में

जनता खुला विरोध कर रही है और Seattle में जनता खड़ी होकर कहती, है No new around, turn around, इसलिए जीडीपी और सेंसेक्स के ग्रोथ की चिंता मत कीजिए।

जो आप यह कहते हैं कि यह फूड बिल नहीं है, वोट बिल है, तो अगर यह वोट बिल भी है, तो क्या हर्ज है? क्या वोटर भूखा नहीं है? क्या वोटर गरीब नहीं है? वह जो गरीब वोटर है, वही इधर के लोगों को भी उधर के लोगों को भी, हम सबको वोट देता है।

अगर वोटर्स के पेट की भूख को मिटाने के लिए भी यह बिल लाया जा रहा है, तो इस बिल का आप लोगों को समर्थन करना चाहिए।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Amar Singhji, please conclude.

**श्री अमर सिंह :** मैं आपकी बात मानते हुए इतना ही कहूंगा कि उद्योग जगत के लोगों को पिछले दिनों मैंने एक चैनल में देखा। भाई मणि शंकर अखर जी ने अच्छा जवाब दिया। कई बातें, तो ज्यादा लंबी नहीं कही जा सकती हैं, वे छोटे काव्य के माध्यम से कही जा सकती हैं। राष्ट्रकवि रामधारी सिंह दिनकर ने कहा था :

**श्वानों को मिलता दूध-भात, भूखे बच्चे अकुलाते हैं,  
मां की गोदी में टिटुर चिपक जाड़े की रात बिताते हैं।**

हम कुत्तों को दूध-भात दे सकते हैं, लेकिन मां की गोदी में टिटुरे-चिपके बच्चों को खाना देने के सवाल पर सेंसेक्स, जीडीपी और ग्रोथ की व्यर्थ चर्चा करते हैं। आइए, हम सब इन चीजों को भूलें और इस चक्कर में न रहें कि श्रेय कौन लूटकर ले जाएगा? हम श्रेय का चक्कर छोड़ें और इस ऐतिहासिक बिल को मिल-जुलकर पास करें, देश के गरीब-गुरबों की बदहाली के लिए, उनकी भूख को मिटाने के लिए।

**श्री भरतसिंह प्रभात सिंह परमार (गुजरात) :** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, आपने मुझे इस बिल के ऊपर बोलने का समय दिया, इसके लिए धन्यवाद। महोदया, मैं इस बिल के ऊपर बोलते समय न्यूट्रीशन मिशन ऑफ इंडिया के पैरामीटर्स का आधार लेकर कुछ बातें यहां रखना चाहता हूं। इस बिल में एक बीपीएल फैमिली को 25 किलो अनाज मुहैया कराने का प्रावधान किया गया है। यानी एक व्यक्ति को एक दिन 165 ग्राम अनाज मिलेगा। न्यूट्रीशन मिशन ऑफ इंडिया के पैरामीटर्स के आधार पर एक वयस्क व्यक्ति, जो मेहनत करता है, जो गरीब आदमी है, उसको हर दिन 2500 कैलोरीज चाहिए। इस 165 ग्राम में जो कैलोरी मिलेगी, वह सिर्फ 500 होगी। फिर उसको 200 कैलोरीज कहां से लानी होगी और उसकी जवानी का क्या होगा?

महोदया, मैं यहां इंदीवर की एक पंक्ति क्वोट करना चाहूंगा :

महंगाई बढ़ाने वालों से ये भूखे फरिश्ते पूछते हैं,  
और अनाज दवाने वालों से ये भूखे फरिश्ते पूछते हैं,  
अगर यह हाल रहा तो दुनिया में भारत की कहानी क्या होगी,  
जिस देश का बचपन भूखा है, उस देश की जवानी क्या होगी?

हमें इसके ऊपर विचार करना होगा। 66 सालों में इस देश में गरीबी बढ़ती चली जा रही है, अनाज की संग्रहखोरी भी बढ़ती जा रही है तथा गरीब और गरीब बनता जा रहा है। हमें लगता है कि इस बिल के ऊपर पुनर्विचार करना होगा।

महोदय, मैं थोड़ी-सी और बातें माननीय मंत्री जी को बताना चाहता हूँ। सर, इस बिल का प्रावधान करते समय पूरे देश के राज्यों की राय नहीं ली गई है। हमें पता है कि इसकी इम्प्लीमेंटेशन एजेंसी राज्य ही बनने जा रहे हैं। इसका इम्प्लीमेंटेशन कैसे होगा, इस बारे में हमें सोचने की जरूरत है। सर, इसमें एक दूसरा प्रावधान भी करने की जरूरत है। देश में जब कुदरती आपदा आती है, जैसे बाढ़ आती है, भूकम्प आता है, अनावृष्टि या अतिवृष्टि होती है, तो इस बिल में ऐसी कोई गारंटी नहीं है कि उस समय भी उन्हें अनाज मुहैया कराना ही है। इसलिए इसमें एक कम्पलेशन यह लाना चाहिए कि ऐसे समय में भी हम उनको अनाज मुहैया कराएंगे।

महोदय, फूड सिक्योरिटी के संदर्भ में छत्तीसगढ़ एक मॉडल स्टेट बन गया है। इस बिल में जो प्रावधान हैं, वे सब तो छत्तीसगढ़ देता ही है, इसके साथ-साथ वह दाल, चीनी, चना, नमक आदि सब देता है, जिससे लाभार्थी को प्रोटीन मिलता है और उसकी ताकत भी बढ़ती है। इस प्रकार का प्रावधान इस बिल में भी करना चाहिए।

दूसरा, इस बिल में केंद्र सरकार ने राज्य सरकारों को जो गाइडलाइंस दी हैं, उनके अनुसार ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में 75 प्रतिशत और शहरी क्षेत्रों में 50 प्रतिशत जो कुल पॉपुलेशन है, उसके पैरामीटर्स के आधार पर उनकी गिनती होगी। हमें लगता है कि इसके अंदर भी सुधार की आवश्यकता है, क्योंकि कई ऐसे राज्य हैं जहां गरीबों की बहुत बड़ी संख्या है। मैं गुजरात का भी उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ। इस बिल के आधार पर गुजरात में जो मुश्किल आने वाली है, उसका भी मैं उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, गुजरात में अभी फूड सिक्योरिटी का लाभ ले रही जो गरीब बी.पी.एल. फैमिली है, इस बिल के आने से करीब एक करोड़ रुपए पचास लाख लोग इस लाभ से वंचित हो जाने वाले हैं। सर, दूसरे, आज गुजरात में 35 किलो अनाज गरीब बी.पी.एल. फैमिली को मुहैया कराया जा रहा है। इस बिल के आने से सिर्फ 25 किलो अनाज मिलेगा। इससे गरीब फैमिली पर ज्यादा रुपए का बोझ पड़ने वाला है। वह आज 35 किलो अनाज 176 रुपए में खरीद रही है। आने वाले समय में जब इस बिल का इम्प्लीमेंटेशन होगा तो उसको 25 किलो अनाज के मूल्य के 261 रुपए चुकाने पड़ेंगे। आज इतनी महंगाई में बी.पी.एल. फैमिली किस तरह अपना जीवन व्यतीत कर रही है? उन्हें दो

वक्त की रोटी भी नसीब नहीं होती। तो हमें लगता है कि इसमें यह प्रावधान सुधारने की जरूरत है। थैंक्यू।

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Nominated): Madam, given the very short time available, I would, while rising to support this Bill in its entirety, like to bring to the attention of the hon. Minister that despite my meeting him, despite my pleading with him, despite my giving it to him in writing, Chapter X of the Bill, as it stands today, is word-to-word exactly what it was in Chapter XII in the previous version of this Bill. In other words, we have not at all taken into account what the Constitution says about the role of the Panchayats in the Public Distribution System. If the hon. Minister would kindly look at the Constitution, it says, in the Eleventh Schedule, that the Public Distribution System should be brought under the Panchayati Raj System. And, in article 243G as well as in article 243W, the Panchayats and the Municipalities are described “as institutions of local self-government”. Now, our Minister has used a completely colonial term ‘local authority’. So, it is not at all clear from this Bill that when this Bill talks of local authority, as it does at several different points, whether it means some kind of bureaucratic system or whether it means the people of India. Further, there is a provision, and that is what I would plead with the Minister to take advantage of now, that State Governments shall, by a notification, explain what the role of the local authority is. But as this is a Centrally Sponsored Scheme, it is not only State Governments which will be issuing notifications, but the Centrally Sponsored Scheme will also have Guidelines, and as per the Circular, which has been received by his Secretary and other Secretaries, the Prime Minister’s direction is that each one of the Centrally-sponsored Schemes must have an Activity Map detailing the jurisdiction of Panchayats and Municipalities in terms of the devolution of Functions, Finances and Functionaries. Mr. Minister, if you do not do this in your own Bill, then, I am afraid, we will go the way of all flesh and will end up with some kind of an enabling provision for the Panchayats, but we won’t get the Panchayats involved in the system. All over this country, wherever the PDS has functioned successfully, be it Tamil Nadu or Chhattisgarh, it is because the Panchayats have been given a role which means that the people who are the beneficiaries, as also the people, who must know whether a particular ration shop is or is not providing the civil supplies that it is supposed to, are involved. Also, Mr. Minister, you must know that the Civil Supplies Departments, all over this country, have become dens of corruption. And unless we are able to make the

Panchayats responsible, the people responsible, I don't see how this continued dependence on the bureaucracy is going to give you this answer. I say this as a former bureaucrat myself and I say this on behalf of several distinguished civil servants, who are in this House, who have all realized that this is not the way to go forward.

But you have done nothing about it in all that we have pleaded with you. Now, you have a golden opportunity. As soon as this Bill becomes an Act, you will have to produce the Guidelines and in the course of producing the Guidelines, I would plead with you, as I have done already by letter, that you must recognise that however gargantuan the task and the expense of producing food supplies, of procuring food supplies, of storing food supplies, of transporting food supplies, of delivering food supplies even unto the doorstep is, if at the last mile there is a babu standing there and not an elected representative of the people, there is no hope whatsoever that all your trouble and all your money will actually give results. And who was the one who saw it? None other, Sir, — I would understand if this Bill came from some other party — but it was Rajiv Gandhi who wrote with his own hand and in my presence that the Public Distribution System should be under the Panchayati Raj system and if 25 years ago, the leader, that both you and I acknowledge, is going to be ignored in a historic Bill produced by our own Party, then, whom are we kicking in the mouth? We are kicking ourselves. I plead with you that despite all my efforts and your giving me such a sympathetic hearing, receiving all my papers, saying that you will do it, even though not one comma has been changed between 2011 and today, there is still an opportunity because you have to produce the Guidelines; you have to produce the Activity Map. I have got a whole team. There is an Expert Committee which I have chaired, which has produced a 1500 page Report. It is in five volumes. I will take out four or five paragraphs that relate to you. You can follow them. We can still get this done but I think, I would like to demand not only on my behalf but on behalf of this entire House, whose representatives have asked for a discussion on the Expert Committee Report, that you must please answer us as to whether, when you bring this Act into operation, you will ensure through the Guidelines and the Activity Map attached to the guidelines that the Panchayats will have a really significant role in Tamil Nadu, whether it is the DMK or the AIADMK Government. If they have had such a huge success, it is because even though the DMK or the AIADMK fight each other all the way down to the villages precisely because

**7.00 P.M.**

political forces are fighting each other in the villages, delivery at the village level is simply outstanding. Dr. Kalaingar said that he would give rice at Rs. 2 a kilo. He ended by giving rice at Re. 1 a kilo and nobody complained that they didn't get the rice. The complaint is perhaps about the quality. But that is just as well because those who want basmati rice can go and pay for it in the market. So please understand, Sir, that everything that you have done is going to come to naught unless the Panchayats and the Municipalities are given that last mile delivery and that they are made responsible to the Gram Sabha because it is only in the Gram Sabha or the Ward Sabha that the beneficiaries of this scheme can sit. It was Rajiv Gandhi who said, "We need a responsive administration." Then he went on to say, "You cannot get a responsive administration unless it is a responsible administration, responsible to the beneficiaries." And he added that, "You cannot have a responsible administration which is not a representative administration." IAS officers may be brilliant at passing exams. I too have passed the exam and I hold the example in complete contempt because it has nothing to do with ordinary people and ordinary people cannot get into the IAS and everybody else in the bureaucracy simply imitates the IAS. For God's sake, understand that the people of this country have been given Constitutional Right by Rajiv Gandhi and today we cannot pass this historic Bill without recognising those Constitutional Rights. Please give us the opportunity of doing so. Thank you.

SHRI V. P. SINGH BADNORE (Rajasthan): They never heed to your advice.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA (Odisha): Madam, I will not go into the views of Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar.

Thank you, Madam, for the opportunity. First, I don't agree with Amar Singhji who is sitting here that it is good that at last this thing has been brought.

In 2004, you promised and came to power on the plank of providing employment. The UPA was voted to power. You could not live up to your promise. What did you do? Then, you promised this in your Manifesto and you did a waiver of farm loans. Again, people believed you and gave you a mandate. And, you have formed the UPA-II. Now, after the Election Manifesto of 2009, we

expected that in the first Monsoon Session — this is the fifth one — you would bring this Bill. But, you are bringing this Bill four years later and, before we discuss this Bill, you are giving Government advertisements on television and on every other part of media by saying that ‘you are getting 5 kgs for Rs. 3, Rs. 2 and Re.1.’ The advertisement showing some lady going to Ration Shop and all that; propaganda has started. Is it just an election gimmick or what? Therefore, had you really thought of this Bill, you would have taken my friend, Mani Shankar’s suggestion very seriously.

Madam, I had floated a party five months ago. The first and foremost programme of that party is to ensure that the village becomes the source of all power. In that, we have written down and now we have gone on propagating everywhere that village will be a Panchayat and in that Panchayat procurement, distribution, storage and processing of foodgrains will be the responsibility of Panchayat. Panchayat will be the source of power; residuary power would come to Government. This is the concept. This has to be the concept if India is to become strong.

Having made this point, I would say that a strong India means, a real federal India where we trust in the State Government and a powerful village Panchayat. You must trust powerful States; not arrogate all the powers to the Centre. Not to have arrogance of saying that we will give directives and you have to obey directives. Who are you, anyway? If you leave out the States, where is your existence? You always say that you are giving money from the Centre. It is propaganda. State leaders are also saying, ‘we are giving this free to you.’ This is all people’s money. Nobody should claim, neither the Centre nor the State, that they are giving money. If we are giving it free or if we are giving it at Rs. 3, Rs. 2, Re. 1, it is with their money. We are taking it through the representatives of the people in both the Houses of Parliament. People have given them mandate to give it and to make laws. So, let us trust each other. Let us also see and acknowledge that this is people’s money and, since people have voted us through the State Assemblies, we have a responsibility to see that their money is utilized in the best way possible. And, you have found the best way in 2004. You did not implement. The best way is not to distribute anything free or anything subsidized. The best way is to give employment, employment and employment, so that if I am a poor man, I earn and I have enough earning ability and I feed my family.

How can you play with statistics? The present figure of 67 per cent is more than double the number of, what you call, people living Below Poverty Line. How can you say that when, on the other hand, the Saxena Committee goes to Odisha and says, 84 per cent of the people are poor? Then, the Odisha Chief Minister has given statistics showing that they have brought down the number of people living Below Poverty Line from 57 per cent to 37 per cent, and now, to 32 per cent. So, there are the Saxena Committee figures and these. Why do you play with statistics? We must look at the facts on the ground. There is extreme poverty.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Mohapatra, I must request you to conclude. Please, conclude.

SHRI PYARIMOHAN MOHAPATRA: I would conclude, Madam.

There are extreme kinds of poverty. We must have conscience, we must have sensitivity and we must have compassion for our brethren who are poor. And only on that score, I support the Bill. I support the Bill only on one condition, the one which Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar has mentioned, which we support fully. We must endorse it and besides, take more people out of the 67 per cent.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Shri Jai Prakash Narayan Singh. He is not there. Shri M. Rama Jois.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS (Karnataka): Thank you, Madam, for giving me this opportunity. I give my qualified support to this Bill.

The preamble to the National Food Security Bill, 2013 states that this is a Bill 'to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, *by ensuring access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity and for matters connected therewith or incidental thereto.*' Thus, the objective of the Bill appears to be to provide relief against starvation and to wipe out the tears of those who are in distress. From time immemorial, that has been a part of our rajdharma and the rules which are prescribed for the state. In the Mahabharata, Raja Rantideva says:—

न त्वहं कामये राज्यं न स्वर्गं न पुनर्भवम्।  
कामये दुःख तप्तानां प्राणिनाम् आर्तनाशनम्॥

It means, I do not want kingship or political power, neither *swarga* nor *moksha*, but my desire is to wipe out tears from the eyes of those who are in



distress. This indicates that the desire to render such selfless service is the most important function of the state. The preamble to the Bill indicates this.

But, unfortunately, when you see the provisions of the Bill, the motive appears to be questionable. In fact, as early as on 15th December, 2012, the Times of India (*Delhi Edition*), had a news item wherein there is a statement of \* the number two in the Congress hierarchy, saying, "Get Cash Transfer Scheme right and we can win the next two polls." So, the entire noble object of the Bill has been totally destroyed by this. And I read only one para. It states, "Congress heir-apparent, \*

डा. विजयलक्ष्मी साधू (मध्य प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, दूसरे सदन के सदस्य का नाम यहां पर नहीं लिया जा सकता।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Well, actually, Mr. Jois, you can't take the name of a.....(*Interruptions*)...

Just a moment. Let me tell him. Mr. Jois, you are senior enough to understand that he is a Member of the other House. Kindly avoid taking names of Members of the other House. Anyway, we will examine it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: I am quoting from the *Times of India* newspaper.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): But the tradition is that we do not take names of Members of the other House, who are not here to defend themselves. We will examine the records and do the needful. Yes, Mr. Jois, please continue. Do not take names.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: In this statement, it is clearly stated that the Aadhar number as well as the cash transfer is meant only to influence voters in the 2014 general elections and also 2019 elections and satisfy the hunger for votes by the ruling party. This has been stated not by any Tom, Dick and Harry. This has been stated by number two in command in the ruling party. This is violative of Section 123 of Representation of peoples Act, 1951. Therefore, you cannot slightly brush it aside. ...(*Time-bell rings*)...

श्री हुसैन दलवाई (महाराष्ट्र) : ये क्या बातें बोल रहे हैं?...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, you have to speak within your time limit.

---

\*Not recorded.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: You can't prevent me from saying the truth. Mahatma Gandhi stands for truth. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, you are losing your time to say what you want to say on the Bill.

श्री हुसैन दलवाई : महात्मा गांधी का इससे क्या संबंध है?...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Am I producing a fake document? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): You can stick to the Bill. Your time is up, Mr. Jois. Please conclude.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: That is why I have given amendment to Clause 8 which provides for cash transfer and also Clause 12 regarding Aadhar. Shri Jawaharlal Nehru said, 'industrialize or perish' ... ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, while pressing for your amendment, at that time you can speak. Now, please conclude.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Now, the agricultural lands are excessively utilized for industries, and now it is, 'industrialize and perish'. That is the situation we are facing. That is why we are short of agricultural commodities. And, then,...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Thank you Mr. Jois. Please conclude.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Then, coming to Aadhar, it is a more serious matter. The National Identification Authority Bill was introduced before the Rajya Sabha on 3.12.2010...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, you are taking up the time of your colleagues. If they agree, then, you speak. If your other colleague is willing not to speak, then, you speak.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: On 3.12.2010, it was introduced before Rajya Sabha, and, then, referred to the Standing Committee. The Standing Committee rejected it on 11th December, 2011. Then, giving of Aadhar numbers was stopped only for some time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): I am afraid, your colleagues' time will be cut. Please conclude, Mr. Jois.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Subsequently, it is continued in utter disregard to the Parliament. The Aadhar numbers are being issued not merely to the citizens but also to the non-citizens. When you are giving Aadhar numbers to non-citizens, they are also entitled to same amount of foodgrains. Are you maintaining non-citizens or non-patriots or even infiltrators to...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Thank you very much. I am calling the next speaker. Shri Vijay Jawaharlal Darda.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: When the Standing Committee has rejected the Bill, if the ruling party has any iota of respect for Parliamentary democracy, they should have brought back the Bill before Rajya Sabha, and got its support. Why are they... ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा (महाराष्ट्र) :** मैडम, मैं राष्ट्रीय खाद्य सुरक्षा विधेयक, 2013 का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ।...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, I am afraid, nothing will go on record, if you continue as I have called the next speaker. You can speak at the time of your amendment.

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: \*

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** मेरी पार्टी ने मुझे बोलने के लिए 15 मिनट का समय दिया है, इसके लिए मैं अपनी पार्टी का आभारी हूँ...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Nothing is going on record. Please sit down.

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** सबसे पहले मैं अपनी उस भावना को व्यक्त कर रहा हूँ, जिसके तहत मैं आज दुनिया के सामने गर्व से कह सकता हूँ, ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: \*

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** मैं उस देश का प्रतिनिधित्व कर रहा हूँ, जहाँ अब कोई भूखा नहीं सोएगा।...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: \*

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा : मुझे बापू के वे शब्द याद आ रहे हैं, मैं उनको quote करना चाहता हूँ, “There are people in the world so hungry that God cannot appear to them except in the form of bread.” आज हमारी राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्ष आदरणीय सोनिया जी के भावनात्मक लगाव और अथक परिश्रम के बाद प्रधानमंत्री डा. मनमोहन सिंह जी ने वह सपना पूरा किया है, ...(व्यवधान)...जिसकी बुनियाद पार्टी के घोषणापत्र के एक वायदे के रूप में पार्टी के सामने रखी गई थी।...(व्यवधान)...मेरे विपक्ष के साथी इस विधेयक को लेकर काफी आक्रांत हैं।...(व्यवधान)...मैं उनको Albert Einstein के शब्द याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ, “An empty stomach is not a good political adviser.”

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) : आपने माननीय सदस्य को मना कर दिया है।...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी) : मैंने इन से कह दिया है कि आपका भाषण रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जा रहा है।...(व्यवधान)...मैंने रिक्वेस्ट भी की थी कि आप conclude करिए।...(व्यवधान)...मैंने यह भी कहा...(व्यवधान)... Please let me say what I have to say. I had said... ...(Interruptions)...

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा : मुझे दुख के साथ कहना पड़ रहा है...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी) : दर्डा जी, क्या आप yield कर रहे हैं?

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा : नो मैडम, मैंने अपनी बात शुरू कर दी है। आपने मुझे बोलने के लिए कहा था।...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Jois, I had said, if you colleague agrees that he will give up his time for you, you could continue. We had requested you. The matter is over now. I am sorry, Mr. Punj, I have already called the next speaker, and he is speaking. ...(Interruptions)...

You cannot show papers like that. ....(Interruptions)....

श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा : मैं यहां पर इस बात का उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ कि...(व्यवधान)...मुझे दुख के साथ यह कहना पड़ रहा है कि...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... The Member is not yielding. ...(Interruptions)... Then your colleagues would not get the time. ...(Interruptions)...

---

\*Not recorded.

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** कुछ लोगों ने दुनिया के सामने भारत की छवि को अभी तक भूख और गरीबी के साथ पेश करने का प्रयत्न किया है।...*(व्यवधान)*...वे चाहे अर्थशास्त्री हों...*(व्यवधान)*...ठीक है, उनको बोलने दीजिए।...*(व्यवधान)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Member is not yielding. ...*(Interruptions)*... Then your colleagues would not get the time. ....*(Interruptions)*....आप बताइए? आपके दूसरे मेम्बर भी हैं, यदि आप उनका वक्त इनको दे रहे हैं, तो आप बात कर लीजिए...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री वी. पी. सिंह बदनौर :** यह डबल सिक्योरिटी है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: The Chair has given extra time. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): I have not given extra time. ....*(Interruptions)*.... I am sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry, Mr. Punj. ...*(Interruptions)*... I don't think that is right. ....*(Interruptions)*.... You must not speak in this way. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am very sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*... No extra time has been given, which can be examined from the records. ....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Let him finish. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Mr. Murli Manohar told this. ....*(Interruptions)*.... We agree with the food security. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Mr. Punj, please sit down. ....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS: Just as Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar said, I fully support him, the Constitution was amended to bring in existence the Panchayati Raj. That was done by Shri Rajiv Gandhi. Why don't you entrust this responsibility to Panchayats? All the allegations against the Central Government will go. ...*(Interruptions)*... Entrust it to the Panchayats. Persons belonging to various political parties will be there. Let it be entrusted to them. A Constitutional status has been given to Panchayats by amending the Constitution. Therefore, my submission is that while I fully support the objective of the Bill, I am strongly opposing the ulterior motive. That is why I have given amendments to clause 8 and clause 12. Thank you.

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** मैडम, मैं पहले से शुरू करूँ या कंटीन्यू करूँ?

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी) :** आपका टाइम अब शुरू होता है।

**श्री विजय जवाहरलाल दर्डा :** आदरणीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं आपके समक्ष खाद्य सुरक्षा अधिनियम का समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। मैं सबसे पहले अपनी वह भावना व्यक्त कर रहा हूँ, जिसके तहत मैं आज दुनिया के सामने गर्व से कह सकता हूँ कि मैं उस देश का प्रतिनिधित्व कर रहा हूँ जहाँ पर कोई भूखा नहीं सोएगा। मुझे बापू के वे शब्द याद आ रहे हैं, जिनको मैं यहाँ पर वोट करना चाहता हूँ, “There are people in the world so hungry that God cannot appear to them except in the form of bread.” आज हमारी राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्षा, श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी जी के भावनात्मक लगाव और अथक परिश्रमों के बाद प्रधानमंत्री जी मनमोहन सिंह जी ने वह सपना पूरा किया है, जिसकी बुनियाद पार्टी के घोषणा-पत्र में एक वायदे के रूप में उनकी अध्यक्षता में रखी गई थी। मेरे विपक्ष के साथी इस विधेयक को लेकर काफी आक्रान्त हैं। मैं उन्हें अल्बर्ट आइंस्टीन के वे शब्द याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ, “An empty stomach is not a good political adviser.” हम यहाँ पर लोकतंत्र के मंदिर में बैठे हैं और लोकतंत्र में भूखे पेट से किसी प्रकार की सलाह नहीं दी जा सकती है। मैं यहाँ पर इस बात का विशेष रूप से उल्लेख करना चाहूँगा कि मुझे दुख के साथ कहना पड़ रहा है कि अभी तक भारत की छवि को दुनिया के सामने भूख और गरीबी के नाम से पेश किया जाता रहा है। वे चाहे अर्थशास्त्री रहे हों या जिन लोगों ने फिल्मों के माध्यम से दुनिया को यह दिखाया हो, मगर मैं आज उनसे यह जरूर कहना चाहूँगा कि इसके बाद से इस देश का कोई भी व्यक्ति भूखा नहीं सोएगा। उनको कानून के तहत अधिकार मिलेगा, जो उनका अपना अधिकार होगा और वे उस अधिकार के साथ रोजी-रोटी की बात कर सकेंगे।

हमारी यूपीए सरकार ने सर्वप्रथम शिक्षा का अधिकार दिया, फिर सूचना का अधिकार दिया, रोजगार का अधिकार दिया और अब भोजन का अधिकार दिया जा रहा है।

अक्सर यह कहा जाता है कि कोई भी सशक्त राष्ट्र जब तक अपने आदमियों की जरूरतें पूरी नहीं करता, तब तक वह सशक्त राष्ट्र नहीं हो सकता। आम आदमी की जरूरतों में रोटी, कपड़ा और मकान हैं, लेकिन आज मैं इसके आगे जाकर एक शब्द जोड़ना चाहूँगा कि प्रत्येक व्यक्ति के लिए स्वास्थ्य महत्वपूर्ण है। उस व्यक्ति का यह अधिकार है कि उसके स्वास्थ्य के लिए भी देश में कुछ किया जाना चाहिए। आम आदमी के स्वास्थ्य के लिए विशेष रूप से मैं चाहूँगा कि उसके साथ दवा शब्द भी जोड़ा जाना चाहिए।

मैं यह जानता हूँ कि यह बिल 2011 में आना था, लेकिन उसके आने में विलम्ब होता रहा। विपक्ष, विशेष रूप से बीजेपी इस बात से भयभीत थी कि अगर यह बिल आता है, तो निश्चित रूप से आने वाले चुनाव में शायद उसके पैरों के नीचे की जमीन खिसक सकती है। इसलिए आपने देखा होगा कि किसी-न-किसी तरीके से वे लोग हर वक्त इसको रोकते गए। यहाँ तक कि संसद, जो लोकतंत्र का सबसे महत्वपूर्ण अंग है, जहाँ पर डिबेट और

डिस्कशन होना चाहिए, उनको रोकते गए और उन्होंने उसे होने नहीं दिया। इसलिए इसके लिए ऑर्डिनेंस लाना पड़ा। इसे ऑर्डिनेंस के माध्यम से लाया गया। अब उनके सामने कोई चारा नहीं है कि वे इसका विरोध करें। आज उनको इस बिल को पारित करने के लिए सूचनाओं के साथ मदद करनी होगी।

इसी के साथ-साथ, मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि कई राज्यों के अंदर, चाहे वह गुजरात हो, चाहे वह छत्तीसगढ़ हो, चाहे वह मध्य प्रदेश हो, जो भी स्कीम्स आई हैं, चाहे गौ देने की बात हो, चाहे अनाज देने की बात हो, उनमें भारत सरकार का बहुत बड़ा रोल है। मैं चाहूंगा कि भारत सरकार जिस परसेंटेज के साथ उनकी मदद कर रही है, वे उसे बताएं। स्टेट्स कभी भी यह नहीं बताती हैं कि यह भारत सरकार की मदद से किया जा रहा है। इसलिए मैं चाहूंगा कि भारत सरकार की जितनी भी योजनाएं हैं, उन सारी योजनाओं में कानून के तहत यह प्रावधान होना चाहिए कि उनको वहां पर बताना चाहिए। इसके लिए कानून पारित होना चाहिए कि भारत सरकार की जो-जो योजनाएं हैं, राज्य उनको बताएं और अगर वे ऐसा नहीं करते हैं, तो यह\* के अंदर आएगा और\* के अंदर उसका प्रोसिक्यूशन होना चाहिए, ऐसी मेरी मांग है। साथ ही साथ, मैं यह भी बताना चाहूंगा कि इस विधेयक में हम खाद्य सुरक्षा की बात कर रहे हैं, लेकिन इसके साथ-ही-साथ इसमें किसानों का भी एक बहुत बड़ा मसला है। जब तक किसान अनाज पैदा नहीं करेगा, तब तक हम कहां से लोगों को अनाज दे पाएंगे? इसलिए मैं चाहूंगा कि किसानों पर भी विशेष रूप से ध्यान देना चाहिए। जिस प्रकार से उनके ऊपर कर्ज था, उस कर्ज के अंदर करीब-करीब 60 लाख करोड़ रुपए का इफेक्ट है, मैं चाहता हूं कि इसके पहले कि यह चीज और आगे बढ़े, इसको भी ध्यान में रखना चाहिए। किसान जो प्रोड्यूस करता है, उस अनाज का भी अच्छा रेट मिलना चाहिए। जब उसको अच्छा रेट मिलेगा, तो निश्चित रूप से वह हम लोगों के साथ सहयोग कर पाएगा। आज की इस इकोनॉमी के अंदर उसका बहुत बड़ा योगदान है। आपने देखा होगा कि 2003 में उनके ऊपर 87 करोड़ का लोन था, जो आज सिर्फ 7 करोड़ है। इसका मतलब है कि उन्होंने भी इस इकोनॉमी के अंदर अपना हाथ लगाया हुआ है।

आखिर में मेरी आपसे यही गुजारिश है कि यह जो बिल अया है, इस बिल के माध्यम से आज देश के अंदर एक बहुत बड़ी क्रांति आने जा रही है। इसका सारा श्रेय इस सरकार को है, हमारी नेता श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी को है और प्रधानमंत्री जी को है। इसी के साथ, मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करता हूं। धन्यवाद।

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I am grateful to you for having given me an opportunity to speak on this very important piece of legislation which, this Government says, changes the face of poor in the country and is a game changer. We have seen to what extent the game has changed since the Congress came out with a slogan '*garibi hatao*' in 1971 to remove *garibi* by Indira Gandhi. Now the Congress is giving the slogan, '*hunger hatao*'. After 40

---

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

years of '*garibi hatao*' slogan, *garibi* in the country has gone up. Who is responsible for this, Madam? And the present '*hunger hatao*' slogan would also meet the same fate as the earlier slogan, unless the Government is sincere in its implementation.

I have heard the other day in a debate on a TV Channel, one of the Congress Spokespersons saying that it is a "Vote Catcher." I agree with him that it is not a "Game Changer"; it is a "Vote Catcher" and an election gimmick. If it is not the intention to gain political mileage and hoodwink the poor people of this country, the Government would not have waited for more than four years to bring this legislation. It is precisely with this objective in mind, Congress has brought this Bill.

Madam, our party never opposed food security to poor; rather it is the TDP founder, *Swargiya* Shri NT Rama Rao, who had implemented Rs. 2 kg rice for the poor in Andhra Pradesh, perhaps, for the first time in the history of this country. So, it is not new to us. When the TDP implemented this in 1983, this very Congress Party opposed the decision saying, 'it is not good economics and is a cheap trick.' But, exactly after three decades, Congress opened the eyes, doing what we had done in 1983. It is not only with regard to food security, but the same is the case even with regard to Cash Transfer Scheme also. Cash Transfer was first proposed by Shri Nara Chandrababu Naidu in 2009 in the TDP Election Manifesto. Now, the UPA Government has copied it and it is being implemented in some districts of the country. So, this is not a new scheme. It is old wine in a new bottle. So, all that we want is its universal coverage, because food is the fundamental right of every citizen.

Madam, in a country where you do not have a fixed definition for 'Poverty', where you have no accurate data either at the Centre or at the States as to how many poor are there in the country and without giving any thought to important aspects like production of foodgrains, procurement, storage, transportation and with rupees free fall, Congress is blindly and adamantly trying to push this Bill. Government is pushing this without any guidelines to States or making any regulations and without taking views of Chief Ministers into consideration. Madam, there is also a need to revamp, modernize and strengthen the PDS in the country.

Madam, the Bill provides 5 kilogram rice to poor. I tried to find out whether it is sufficient. I had gone through the recommendation made by the ICMR and



NSSO. The ICMR recommends that 7 kilogram of foodgrains for children and 14 kilograms for adults are required. Even if you look at the NSSO Survey, it says that 9.5 kilogram foodgrains are required. But, you are providing just 5 kilograms. From where will the poor get the remaining foodgrains? He cannot afford to buy them from the market. (*Time-bell rings*)

Madam, I would need two minutes more. I am a lady Member. So, you have to be considerate.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): The Chair has got nothing to do with this. The Chair has no gender.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI: You are giving me the chance to speak at last. So, Madam, I request the hon. Minister to increase the foodgrains to, at least, 10 kgs if you really want to help the poor.

Farmers are the backbone of the Bill, Madam. I tried to find out whether the Bill has anything for the protection and welfare of farmers. But, alas, there is nothing. Sir, food security can only be given if the farmers produce foodgrains. They can produce only if they see some profit in agriculture. We can give him profit only by protecting the MSP. And, there is nothing in this Bill to protect the MSP. Here, I agree with the hon. Minister. Recently, in an interview, he said and I quote:

“My worry is not today or tomorrow, but when the Food Security Bill will be in full swing — by next year — the subsidy bill will go up to Rs.1.25 lakh crores. My worry is that any Finance Minister will not be happy with this burden and their advice to the Council of Ministers will be not to hike the MSP.”

He further said, “Because this will only increase the burden and that will directly affect the farmers and the farmers will get hurt. He will shift from crop A to crop B. Then, how are we going to implement the Food Security Bill?”

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Sudharaniji, please conclude.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI: Madam, other people also got some extra time. Madam, the Bill under clause 3 (2) covers 75 per cent of rural and 50 per cent of urban poor but the Ordinance reduced it and says that it covers 67 per

cent. I will give you the example of my own State of Andhra Pradesh. In Andhra Pradesh, out of total population of 8.46 crores, 8 crores are covered under Re. 1 per kg rice scheme. If Food Security Bill is implemented, only 4.61 crores would get the benefit. And, it puts an additional burden of Rs. 2500-3000 crores on Andhra Pradesh and the State requires 1.7 lakh additional foodgrains every month.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): Thank you Sudharaniji. Please conclude.

SHRIMATI GUNDU SUDHARANI: So, Madam, I would like to know from the hon. Minister how he is going to do this.

Lastly, I wish to say this to the Government. I suggest to the Government not to just see populism, but provide the poor with nutritious food, because it is the need of the hour. Many of the women and children in our country, about 51-74 per cent, are malnourished.

Madam, there is no doubt that foodgrains are required at normal times. But, in this Bill, it is said that the Government would not take care of the same during natural calamities. I would suggest that this Bill be sent to the Standing Committee as many amendments have been suggested to this Bill.

With these observations, and hoping that the hon. Minister would address the concerns expressed by me in the true sense, I conclude my speech.

**उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती रेणुका चौधरी) :** श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह जी, आपकी पार्टी का वक्त तो खत्म हो गया है, मगर मैं आपको मौका दे रही हूँ। आपको 4 मिनट का समय दिया जा रहा है, आप संक्षेप में अपनी बात कह दीजिए।

**श्री जय प्रकाश नारायण सिंह (झारखंड) :** महोदया, इसके लिए आपको धन्यवाद। मैं संक्षेप में अपनी बात कहूँगा।...**(व्यवधान)**...मैं माया जी को भी धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

महोदय, खाद्य सुरक्षा कानून केंद्र की संग्रह सरकार के लिए भले ही गेम चेंजर बनने जा रहा है, लेकिन देश के करोड़ों अन्नदाता किसान भाइयों का भविष्य इससे असुरक्षित हो सकता है। किसानों की चिंता पर एक-दो राजनीतिक दल ही गंभीर हैं, बाकी सभी दल इस खाद्य सुरक्षा विधेयक पर कोई गंभीर स्टैंड नहीं ले रहे हैं। कहीं ऐसा न हो कि किसानों का खेती से ही मोहभंग हो जाए। तब इस देश की अर्थव्यवस्था का क्या होगा, जब किसान खेती ही नहीं करेंगे? खाद्य सुरक्षा विधेयक की वजह से वित्तीय घाटा और ज्यादा बढ़ेगा।

अगर आप कृषि को बढ़ावा देने की कोशिश नहीं करेंगे, किसानों को कृषि उत्पाद का, उसकी उपज का लाभकारी मूल्य देने की कोशिश नहीं करेंगे, तो आप देश की अर्थव्यवस्था

को बनाए नहीं रख सकते। मनरेगा और खाद्य सुरक्षा विधेयक का असर आपको दो-तीन सालों के अंदर दिखने लगेगा। इससे कृषि उत्पादन में जबर्दस्त कमी आएगी। तब उसका खामियाजा देश को भुगतना पड़ेगा। किसानों की सौ प्रतिशत फसल खरीद का सिक्कुरिटी बिल भी सरकार को सदन में लाकर यह साबित करना चाहिए कि वह देश के अन्नदाता किसानों के लिए चिंतित है।

मनुष्य को जीने के लिए सिर्फ भोजन की ही आवश्यकता नहीं होती। सरकार को चाहिए कि प्रत्येक व्यक्ति को चिकित्सा सुविधा उपलब्ध कराने संबंधी बिल भी सदन में लाए। इस देश में किसानों की स्थिति पर चिंतन के लिए 15 दिन का एक स्पेशल डिबेट होनी चाहिए, सेशन होना चाहिए। किसानों को प्रोटीनयुक्त भोजन मिलना चाहिए।

सरकार इस “आगामी चुनाव जिताऊ” योजना रूमी बिल के द्वारा खजाने पर 1.25 लाख करोड़ रुपए का अनावश्यक बोझ डालने जा रही है, जिससे देश की अर्थव्यवस्था को बहुत बड़ा झटका लगेगा। अभी सरकारी एजेंसीज सीमित राज्यों में कुल खाद्य उत्पादन का अधिकतम 20 से 25 प्रतिशत तक अनाज ही खरीद सकती हैं, बाकी उत्पाद खुले बाजार में ही जाता है। योजना आयोग की रिपोर्ट के मुताबिक कमजोर राशन प्रणाली के चलते पचास प्रतिशत से अधिक अनाज चोरी होकर खुले बाजार में पहुंच जाता है। इससे बाजार नीचे चला जाता है, जिससे किसान की फसलों का उचित मूल्य उसे नहीं मिल पता।

अतः मेरा सरकार से आग्रह है कि इस बिल में किसानों की पूरी फसल को उचित निर्धारित मूल्य पर खरीदने की गारंटी का प्रावधान भी जोड़ा जाना चाहिए, ताकि किसान खेती में लगे रहें। सरकार इसके लिए किसानों की स्थिति पर चर्चा के लिए, डिबेट के लिए, 15 दिनों का एक विशेष सत्र बुलाए। धन्यवाद।

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Aandhra Pradesh): Madam, Vice-Chairman, this is a historic occasion. Ours is the rights era. सर्वे जनाः सुखिनो भवन्तु। This is our universal Vedic message, to strive for the wellness of all. The centrality of Swami Vivekananda's teachings is, feed first, only then preach. Our beloved bapu, Mahatma Gandhi, taught us to care for *daridra narayana* first. The need for food security comes from the prevalent food insecurity. Due to the scarcity of adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices, there are price fluctuations and financial crisis, which lead to food insecurity, resulting in suffering from hunger and growing malnutrition.

Ensuring food security is a wider and broader challenge. How much wider and bigger challenge is this? As per 2012 Global Food Security Index of 105 nations, India ranks at 66 whereas China ranks at 39. Even at nutrition front, our India is behind our neighbouring country Pakistan. This has the essence of

concern of my leader, hon. Congress President, UPA Chairperson, Sonia Gandhiji.  
...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): What is this?  
Across the floor shouting. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: All along our Indian National Congress and our UPA partners established the standard of performance on growth path. My friends are enjoying in making phrases. They are at liberty. But UPA, the United Progressive Alliance, with its established track record, is the upper-path achiever. The UPA initiated the process of development equalization.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair)

Growth, development, prosperity and mitigation of livelihood complication became rights under our UPA Government. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After he finishes, I will call you.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: Shall I take a few minutes or not, Ravi Shankar Prasadji? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have to make a request. Many more speakers are left. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam): Sir, I have a serious objection.  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: Sir, right to adequate food paves way to advance food and nutritional security to maintain intake standards and to raise the level of nutrition and standard of living. With this grand focus on vulnerable populace, we will achieve improvement in public health. With this Bill, we will not only achieve public health, but this will also reduce the burden on the Public Distribution System and the Food Corporation of India and its food storage requirements. To be in the statute that the price will not exceed Minimum Support Price for wheat and coarse grains, derived Minimum Support Price for rice, we can ensure livelihood security to farmers and this will also expand the agricultural

production and the agricultural infrastructure, geographical diversification of procurements and enhance the qualitative scientific decentralized food storage mechanism. This enactment will bring reform and much more transparency. The Union Government, with this Bill, with this enactment, is under obligation to ensure regular supply of foodgrains to the depots of State Governments all across the nation. On formation of State Food Commissions, these State Food Commissions will protect hunger-stricken, provide food security allowance and punish those who err in discharging their responsibility in delivery of right to food. This demands the involvement of rural and urban local bodies for which ready mechanism is available in the form of District/Block/Mandal/Village Committees besides ration-shop Committees. This has to be pruned and scope shall be evolved as enshrined by late Rajiv Gandhiji through his Constitutional Amendment.

A word of caution for the judicious functionality of these State Food Commissions is highly required. There is right to employment and the National Rural Employment Guarantee programme, but to check and to ensure the right to employment...*(Time bell rings)*... Shall I take two minutes, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, only two minutes more; not more than that.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: With this, the right to employment is yet to evolve through a proper mechanism at the State level, and with this precaution, there is every necessity to have the perfect State Food Commissions. The State Food Commissions will ensure the provision of Right to Food to the needy. Here, I want to make a small point. For the success of the Food Security Bill, we shall ensure proper functioning of markets and the trade system in the country. Developed nations' distortions are hampering the developed nations like India in food production. So, I request the hon. Minister at this occasion to have the proper mechanism to provide a ration card through AADHAR and other technological advancements as smoothly as getting enrolled as a voter. Here, I would remind that there are certain dreams from those benches...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, now, you conclude.

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU: *यद्भावं तद्भवति* - be in your dreams, but please do not forget; क्षमा धनं, क्षमा दानं, क्षमा जीवन विधानम्। - patience and perseverance of our fund, our delivery, our dedication, and in all, our livelihood, is the philosophy, on which basis, our achievements and our commitments are going

on, and within a few hours from now, the food security is going to become the right of the needy Indians to have food. Thank you very much, Sir.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, my request is that still, a good number of speakers is left.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Seven more speakers are there.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Therefore, I am only requesting that let all the speakers be completed today and the voting may take place at 11 o'clock tomorrow after the Minister's reply.

**श्री रामविलास पासवान :** सर, वेंकैया नायडु जी ने दो घंटे पहले यही सवाल उठाया था। उस समय हमने आपसे आग्रह किया था कि आज हम लोगों को पटना जाना था, लेकिन इसके कारण हम लोग बाहर नहीं जा सके और हम लोग शेड्यूल्ड लिस्ट के मुताबिक यहां हैं। इसलिए जब लोक सभा 10 बजे रात तक बैठ सकती है, तो क्या हम एक घंटा और नहीं बैठ सकते? यह इतना इम्पोर्टेंट बिल है और इस पर सारे मेम्बर्स का मन बन चुका है, इसलिए इसको पास कराकर खत्म कीजिए।

**श्री सतीश चन्द्र मिश्रा (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** सर, जो कांग्रेस के बचे हुए स्पीकर्स हैं, वे अपना समय फॉरगो कर दें और आप इस पर वोटिंग करा लें। क्योंकि उनका समय अभी 30 मिनट और बचा है, अगर उनके 10 स्पीकर्स और बोलेंगे, तो प्रॉब्लम हो जाएगी।...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति :** कांग्रेस के ज्यादातर स्पीकर्स बोल चुके हैं।...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री सतीश चन्द्र मिश्रा :** अगर वे बोल चुके हैं, तो फिर इस पर आज ही वोटिंग करा दीजिए।...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति :** कांग्रेस से अभी तक स्पीकर, डा. कर्ण सिंह हैं और अदर्स कैटगरी से अभी सात स्पीकर्स बाकी हैं। What is your reaction to this?

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा योजना मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री राजीव शुक्ल):** सर, कल का एजेंडा काफी हैवी है। कल दो बिल्स हैं और प्राइस राइज पर डिस्कशन भी है, इसलिए वोटिंग अगर आज ही रखें, तो अच्छा रहेगा।...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** अगर हम कल सुगह इस पर वोटिंग करेंगे, तो हम कल शाम को देर तक बैठ सकते हैं। अभी आपके सात-आठ स्पीकर्स बचे हैं, तो इसमें साढ़े आठ बजेगे और वोटिंग होने तक रात के 11 बजेगे। Many amendments are there.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is for the House to decide.

श्री वी. हनुमंत राव (आंध्र प्रदेश) : सर, आज ही वोटिंग कराइए।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no consensus.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we can have voting tomorrow.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House should agree. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is your view?

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Today.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Today. They are not agreeing. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav. Take only five minutes, strictly five minutes.

श्री राम कृपाल यादव (बिहार) : महोदय, मैं अपना भाषण एक काव्य पंक्ति से शुरू करना चाहता हूँ।

**“जब तक भूखा इंसान रहेगा, तब तक धरती पर तूफान रहेगा।”**

मैं आभार व्यक्त करना चाहता हूँ माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी का, जिन्होंने फूड सिक्योरिटी बिल, 2013 लाकर, जो धरती पर तूफान है, उसको मिटाने की कोशिश की है। मैं इसका स्वागत करता हूँ, समर्थन करता हूँ। महोदय, विडम्बना है कि 65-66 वर्ष की आजादी के बाद भी लोग भूखे मर रहे हैं। हम आजाद भारत के नागरिक हैं। हमारे पुरखों ने इसलिए आजादी नहीं ली थी कि 65-66 वर्ष के बाद भी हमारे लोग भूखे मरें। मैं समझता हूँ, यह भी अजीब विडम्बना है कि इस देश में दो तरह की ज़िंदगियां जीने वाले लोग हैं। कोई खाते-खाते मर रहा है और कोई भूखा मर रहा है। एक तरफ कोई दिन भर कमाने के बाद दो वक्त की रोटी नहीं खा पाता, अपने परिवार को कुछ नहीं दे पाता, उसके बच्चे भूखे रह जाते हैं और दूसरी तरफ इस देश में एक ऐसा भी तबका है, जिनके कुत्ते और बिल्ली भी दूध पीते हैं। यह स्थिति दर्दनाक और भयावह है। अगर इस असमानता को दूर नहीं किया गया तो निश्चित तौर पर देश में अस्थिरता पैदा होगी। समतामूलक समाज की स्थापना की सोच हमारे पुरखों की थी, लेकिन वह शायद नहीं हो सका। महोदय, एक तरफ होटलों में पांच-पांच, दस-दस हजार रुपये की प्लेट इस देश के रईस लोग खाते हैं और दूसरी तरफ गरीब लोग भूखे रह जाते हैं। मैं समझता हूँ कि यह बिल बड़ा ही उपयोगी साबित हुआ है, इससे लोग बहुत चैन की नींद सोएंगे। मैं समझता हूँ कि इस बिल के माध्यम से 75 परसेंट ग्रामीण लोग और 50 परसेंट शहरी आबादी फायदा उठा पाएगी। महोदय, खाद्यान्न के संबंध में हम यह निर्णय ले रहे हैं कि तीन रुपये किलो चावल, दो रुपये किलो गेहूँ और एक रुपये किलो मोटा अनाज हम 67 प्रतिशत लोगों को देने का काम करेंगे। मैं समझता हूँ कि यह भी एक चिंता का विषय है कि हम यह अनाज कहां से लाएंगे? जिस तरह से खेती के प्रति लोगों का रुझान घटा है, जिस तरह से आज किसान किसानों से भाग रहे

हैं, इस पर भी निश्चित तौर पर सरकार को ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। उन खेतों-खलिहानों में काम करने वाले लोग, जो अपना खून और पसीना बहाकर अनाज का उत्पादन करते हैं, जिनके बल पर हम 67 परसेंट लोगों को खाद्यान्न सुनिश्चित करने जा रहे हैं, हमने उनकी तरफ कभी झांकने का काम नहीं किया है। आज किसानों का रुझान क्यों घट रहा है, यह भी सोचने का विषय है। आज बेचारे किसान जो लागत पूंजी लगा रहे हैं, वह भी वापस नहीं आ रही है। पिछली यू.पी.ए. गवर्नमेंट ने एक निर्णय लिया था और किसानों पर बैंकों के कर्ज माफ करके कुछ राहत दी थी। आज स्थिति वहीं पहुंच गई है। यह भी चिंता का विषय है। खाद महंगी हो गई है, बिजली महंगी हो गई है, डीजल का दाम रोज बढ़ रहा है। मैं समझता हूं कि जो मेहनतकश किसान हैं, उनको फायदा नहीं मिल रहा है। तो जब खाद्यान्न का उत्पादन नहीं होगा, जब हम चावल, गेहूं और मोटे अनाज का उत्पादन नहीं करेंगे, तो किस आधार पर हम इस बिल के माध्यम से लोगों को खाद्यान्न मुहैया कराने का काम करेंगे? महोदय, यह चिंता का विषय है, सरकार को इस पर ध्यान देना चाहिए। माननीय प्रधानमंत्री जी यहां हैं, मैं समझता हूं कि निश्चित तौर पर वे इस पर विचार करेंगे। आज इस बिल के माध्यम से इस देश के जो गरीब तबके के लोग हैं, दबे-कुचले लोग हैं, पिछड़े माइनॉरिटी के लोग हैं, जिनके लिए इस बिल के माध्यम से खाद्यान्न सुरक्षित करने की आवश्यकता है, उनके प्रति सरकार ने बड़ा ही ऐतिहासिक कदम उठाया है और इस कदम का हम सब लोग समर्थन करना चाहते हैं। मैं समझता हूं कि पूरा सदन इस पक्ष में है।

महोदय, बिहार जैसा प्रदेश आम तौर पर बाढ़ और सुखाढ़ से ग्रसित रहता है। अभी बिहार के लगभग 28 जिले सुखाड़ से प्रभावित हैं और 10 जिले बाढ़ से प्रभावित हैं। ऐसे प्रदेशों पर विशेष ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। ये इतने बड़े जो प्रभावित इलाके हैं, मैं समझता हूं कि देश के कई ऐसे अन्य राज्य हैं, जहां सूखा और बाढ़ दोनों से परेशान लोग रहते हैं, उनके लिए विशेष उपाय करने की आवश्यकता है।

महोदय, इस में कई खामियां हैं। आप जन-वितरण प्रणाली के माध्यम से इस योजना के तहत अनाज वितरित करना चाहते हैं, लेकिन एक रिपोर्ट के आधार पर यह पाया गया है कि जन-वितरण प्रणाली...(व्यवधान)...की व्यवस्था को सुदृढ़ करना होगा।

**श्री उपसभापति :** अपना टाइम खत्म हो गया। आपके 5 मिनट हो गए हैं।

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव :** सर, मैं दो मिनट में अपनी बात खत्म कर दूंगा।

**श्री उपसभापति :** अच्छा, आप एक मिनट में खत्म कीजिए।

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव :** महोदय, मैं निवेदन कर रहा था कि ऐसे प्रदेशों की ओर विशेष ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। महोदय, गरीबी और बदहाली में गुजर रहा बिहार सब से गरीब प्रदेश, जहां बहुत ही बदहाली है और गरीबी रेखा से नीचे गुजर-बसर करने वालों की



संख्या अधिक है, उसकी ओर विशेष ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है। महोदय, एक विंता का विषय और है कि केंद्र सरकार की सूची में बिहार में गरीबी रेखा के नीचे गुजर-बसर करने वालों की संख्या कम है और राज्य सरकार की रिपोर्ट के अनुसार वह अधिक है। इस असमानता को भी दूर करने की आवश्यकता है।

**श्री उपसभापति :** अब आप बैठिए।

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव :** महोदय, मैं एक बात और कह कर अपनी बात समाप्त करूंगा। आज यह सरकार निश्चित तौर पर एक उपहार दे रही है। सरकार ने जिस तरह से रोजगार गारंटी योजना लागू कर देश को ऐतिहासिक उपहार दिया था, उसी तरह आज फूड गारंटी योजना लाकर बहुत ही ऐतिहासिक काम किया है।

**श्री उपसभापति :** राम कृपाल जी, आप कृपा करके बैठिए।

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव :** मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करते हुए अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूं। धन्यवाद।

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I want to raise only one point. Two MPs from the TDP party were suspended today morning. I appeal at least at the time of voting they should be allowed to come and vote. ....(Interruptions).... It will be a healthy precedent, Sir. ....(Interruptions).... They will be used only for voting. ....(Interruptions)....

**श्री उपसभापति :** श्री रामविलास पासवान। सिर्फ 5 मिनट में समाप्त करें।

**श्री रामविलास पासवान :** सर, मैं फूड सेक्योरिटी बिल का पुरजोर समर्थन करता हूं। यह बिल बहुत पहले आ जाना चाहिए था। महामहिम राष्ट्रपति प्रतिभा पाटिल जी ने 4 जून, 2009 को अपने अभिभाषण में कहा था कि यह बिल जल्द-से-जल्द लाया जाएगा, लेकिन किसी कारण यह बिल लटकता रहा। वर्ष 2011 में जब लोक सभा में यह बिल मूव हुआ, मैं समझता था कि यह बिल उसी समय पास हो जाएगा, लेकिन इसे स्टैंडिंग कमेटी को भेज दिया गया। फिर किसी-न-किसी कारण पार्लियामेंट की कार्यवाही नहीं चल पाती थी और अंत में लाचार होकर सरकार को ऑर्डिनेंस जारी करना पड़ा। अब यह बिल के रूप में लोक सभा सभे पास होकर हमारे सदन में आया है। मैं इस बिल का समर्थन करता हूं। जब इस गर्म पदार्थ को धीरे-धीरे बाहर निकलने का मौका मिलता है तो ज्वालामुखी नहीं फूटता है, लेकिन यदि उस पदार्थ को दबाकर रखने की कोशिश की गई तो ज्वालामुखी फूटता है और जब यह फूटता है तो अंग्रेजी में एक कहावत है 'He that is down need fear no fall'. जो सब से नीचे है, उसे गिरने का भय नहीं होता है, लेकिन जो सब से ऊपर है वह अपनी खेरियत मनाए। हम तो डूबे हैं सनम, तुमको भी ले डूबेंगे। नक्सलाइट्स के मामले में भी यही हो रहा है। महोदय, नक्सलिज्म का मुख्य कारण है कि उन लोगों का खाने का

अधिकार खत्म कर दिया गया। इसलिए हम चाहते हैं कि “राइट टू फूड” को फंडामेंटल राइट्स में जोड़ा जाए। मैं यूपीए सरकार को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। यूपीए सरकार ने बहुत अच्छे-अच्छे काम किए हैं, लेकिन वे जनता के बीच में नहीं जा रहे हैं, जनता के बीच में जाता है - करप्शन, हल्ला-गुल्ला। यूपीए की सरकार में बहुत काम हुए हैं - राइट टू वर्क, मनरेगा, सौ दिन का काम। आज गरीब लोग सौ दिन कमाते हैं। पहले उनका शोषण होता था, अब वह बंद हो गया है। उनको और ज्यादा दिन का काम मिलना चाहिए। सरकार ने उस दिशा में पहल की है। राष्ट्रीय स्वास्थ्य मिशन के तहत राइट टू हेल्थ के लिए यूपीए सरकार ने काम किया। सर्व-शिक्षा अभियान के तहत राइट टू एजुकेशन के लिए यूपीए की सरकार ने काम किया। इस सरकार ने लोगों को राइट टू इनफॉर्मेशन का अधिकार दिया। इस सरकार ने राइट टू लैंड और राइट टू फूड के लिए साथ-साथ काम किया है। आजादी के बाद कभी इतना बड़ा काम हुआ?

लेकिन सरकार का अच्छा काम जनता के बीच में नहीं जाता और जो जनता के बीच में नहीं जाना चाहिए, उसका प्रचार-प्रसार होता है। सरकार में बैठे हुए लोग किस तरीके से प्रोपेगंडा करते हैं, यह बात हमें समझ में नहीं आती है। इसलिए हम आपसे कहना चाहते हैं कि घबराने की कोई बात नहीं है। बुलन्दी के साथ आप जाइए, 2014 में आप फिर लौटकर आएंगे, आपकी सरकार 2014 में आएगी। इंदिरा गांधी जी ने नारा दिया था - गरीबी हटाओ और उस गरीबी हटाओ के खिलाफ सारे लोगों ने मोर्चाबंदी कर ली थी। इंडिकेटर सिंडिकेट बन गया था और अकेले उस गरीबी हटाओ के नारे के बल पर इंदिरा गांधी दोबारा पावर में आ गई थीं। यह “राइट टू फूड” कोई मामूली चीज नहीं है, यह “राइट टू फूड” बहुत बड़ी चीज है। आज किस तरीके से तर्क दिया जा रहा है कि पैसा कहां से आएगा? प्रधानमंत्री जी, पैसा निकालिए बड़े-बड़े पूंजीपतियों से, जो 5 लाख करोड़ से ज्यादा का बकाया टैक्स के रूप में रखे हुए हैं। पैसा निकालिए उनसे जो, 5 लाख करोड़ से ज्यादा को लोन लेकर वापस नहीं दे रहे हैं - यह सब पैसा निकालिए। इसमें कितना लगता है? 1 लाख 25 हजार करोड़ का है और पहले भी कुछ योजनाएं चल रही थीं, इसलिए पैसे की कमी नहीं है। कहा जाता है कि राज्य सरकार से मांगो। कौन राज्य सरकार विरोध करती है? जो सब्सिडी दी जाएगी, वह भारत सरकार देगी या नहीं देगी? राज्य सरकार को, हमारे यहां बिहार में तो फायदा ही होने वाला है। बिहार की सरकार गर्त में जा रही है, लेकिन इससे उसको फायदा हो जाएगा। यहां सारे के सारे साथी यह जानते हैं, इसलिए मैं यह कहने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ कि इसमें कोई इधर-उधर नहीं होना चाहिए। कहा जाता है कि यह चुनावी मुद्दा है। इस देश में चुनाव न हो तो क्या कोई गरीबों के लिए काम करेगा? सात जन्मों में भी गरीबों के लिए काम होने वाला नहीं है। वह वोट की राजनीति है। वोट के राज का मतलब छोटों का राज होता है। यह गरीब लोगों का राज है। यहां गरीब लोगों के हित की बात होती है और स्वाभाविक है कि जब चुनाव आता है...आपकी भी सरकार आई थी, तो आपने इसको अपने एजेंडे में क्यों नहीं रखा था? क्यों नहीं एनडीए की सरकार ने इसको रखा था? और भी सरकारें आई थीं, तो आप रखो। अभी स्टेट्स में चुनाव हो रहे

8.00 P.M.

हैं, कोई किसी को रोक रहा है क्या? जिस सरकार का मन होगा दो रुपए किलो में अनाज बेचेगी, एक रुपए किलो में बेचेगी या तीन रुपए किलो में बेचेगी। आप बेचिए, आपको कौन रोक रहा है? इसलिए हम तो चाहते हैं कि यह जो आपने पांच किलो का प्रावधान किया है, इसको बढ़ाइए। इसमें से 75 परसेंट अमीर लोगों को छंटिए। जो भी लोग गरीब हैं, चाहे वे किसी भी जाति के हों, उन सबको एक बार जोड़िए। नहीं तो क्या होगा? भ्रष्टाचार फैलेगा। एक तरफ दो रुपए में मिलेगा और दूसरी तरफ तीस रुपए में मिलेगा। एक तरफ एक रुपए में मिलेगा, दूसरी तरफ पच्चीस रुपए में मिलेगा। इससे क्या भ्रष्टाचार नहीं बढ़ेगा? उस भ्रष्टाचार को कैसे आप खत्म करेंगे?

सर, मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ। एक होता है ऐक्ट, एक होता है फैक्ट और एक होता है टैक्ट। तो ऐक्ट आप बना रहे हैं, कानून बना रहे हैं, लेकिन फैक्ट अलग है। उसके लिए आपको टैक्टफुली काम करना पड़ेगा। आपको उसके लिए पारदर्शिता लानी पड़ेगी। आपने कहा है, जो गर्भवती महिलाएं हैं, जो बच्चे हैं, सबके लिए आपने यह कानून बनाने का काम किया है, लेकिन इसको जमीन पर उतारने के लिए आपको सशक्त होना पड़ेगा। भारत सरकार को इसमें सख्त से सख्त हिदायत देनी पड़ेगी। इसमें पैसे की समस्या नहीं है। पैसा आएगा और उसके अलावा हम चाहते हैं कि जो भी राशन शॉप्स हों, जगह-जगह पर जो राशन की दुकानें हैं, डीलर्स हैं, वहां धांधली हो रही है, उसको कैसे रोकेगा? कैसे गरीब के पास अनाज पहुंचेगा? मैं समझता हूँ कि ये सारी की सारी चीजें हैं।...**(समय की घंटी)**...मैं चाहता था कि विस्तार से आपको बताऊँ। मैं बस खत्म ही कर रहा हूँ...इसलिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ, प्रधानमंत्री जी, आपने...**(समय की घंटी)**...और कांग्रेस की अध्यक्ष सोनिया गांधी जी ने यह जो काम किया है, यह काम बहुत पहले होना चाहिए था। आज आप यह बिल लाए हैं, और आज यह पास होगा। पूरे देश में लोगों के मन में एक विश्वास का वातावरण बनेगा...**(समय की घंटी)**...और जो ताकतें देश में गरीबी-अमीरी की दीवार को बनाना चाहती हैं, उनका हौसला पस्त होगा। इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

**श्री उपसभापति :** धन्यवाद। श्री आर. एस. प्रजापति जी, बोलिए।

**श्री रणवीर सिंह प्रजापति (हरियाणा) :** सर, आपने मुझे इस महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए धन्यवाद। सरकार खाद्य सुरक्षा बिल लेकर आई है तथा सरकार का यह कहना है कि इस बिल से देश के 50 परसेंट शहरी और 75 परसेंट ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों के लोगों को लाभ मिलेगा। सर, मुझे यह समझ में नहीं आता कि जब भारत सरकार यह मानती है कि गांव में रहने वाला, जो 24 से 28 रुपए कमाता है... जो शहर में रहने वाला 32 रुपए हर रोज कमाता है, वह गरीबी रेखा से ऊपर है, तो फिर उन्हें इसका लाभ कैसे मिलेगा, इसका क्राइटीरिया क्या है, यह मेरी समझ में नहीं आता है।

उपसभापति महोदय, मैं हरियाणा से आता हूँ। हरियाणा सरकार ने गांव में रहने वाले ज्यादातर लोगों के पीले कार्ड काट दिए हैं। वे लोग इस खाद्य सुरक्षा बिल का लाभ कैसे लेंगे? अगर सरकार यह मानती है कि आज भी गांव के 75 परसेंट लोगों को इस बिल के माध्यम से अनाज देने की जरूरत है, तो इस देश की ऐसी हालत के लिए जिम्मेदार कौन है? हमारे देश को आजाद हुए 67 साल हो गए हैं। अब तक अगर 75 परसेंट आबादी की हालत ऐसी है कि आज भी उनको इस तरह से अनाज देने की जरूरत है, तो फिर इसके जिम्मेदार, जो लगातार इस देश के ऊपर राज करते रहे हैं, जिन लोगों की ज्यादातर सरकार रही है, कांग्रेस के लोगों की सरकार रही है, वे ही इसके लिए जिम्मेदार हैं। आज हम जनता को क्या देने जा रहे हैं? जैसे हम बाढ़ में फंसे हुए लोगों की सहायता करते हैं, उसी तरह से हम इन गरीब लोगों को अनाज देने का काम करेंगे। यह तो ऐसी ही बात हो गई – जैसे सरकार उनको मछली पकड़-पकड़ कर देना चाहती है, उन्हें मछली पकड़कर देने की जरूरत नहीं है, बल्कि उन्हें मछली पकड़ना सिखाना चाहिए, तभी उनका कुछ भला हो सकता है। जनता को रोजगार देने की जरूरत है। जनता को सुरक्षा चाहिए, लोगों को सुरक्षा चाहिए। जब लोगों के पास रोजगार होगा, तो फूड की सिक्योरिटी अपने आप हो जाएगी। सरकार यह कहती है कि हमारे किसानों ने अन्न का रिकार्ड उत्पादन सरकार की अच्छी नीतियों के कारण किया है। सर, अन्न का रिकार्ड उत्पादन सरकार की अच्छी नीतियों के कारण नहीं हुआ है, बल्कि हमारे किसानों ने अपनी मेहनत से अन्न का रिकार्ड उत्पादन करने का काम किया है। हमारी सरकार की गलत नीतियों के कारण किसान को महंगा डीजल लेना पड़ता है, महंगा यूरिया लेना पड़ता है, उन्हें ब्लैक में डीएपी लेनी पड़ती है, लेकिन बिना साधनों के भी किसान ने रात-दिन मेहनत करके, धरती का सीना चीरकर अन्न के रिकार्ड उत्पादन करने का काम किया है। सरकार की गलत नीतियों के कारण रिकार्ड अन्न उत्पादन करने के बावजूद भी किसान को भूखे पेट सोना पड़ता है। आज किसान निरंतर कर्ज के नीचे दबता चला जा रहा है। वह सरकार की गलत नीतियों के कारण कर्ज के नीचे दबता चला जा रहा है।...**(समय की घंटी)**...सर, मैं किसानों की बात कर रहा हूँ।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

**श्री रणवीर सिंह प्रजापति :** सर, यह चर्चा फूड सिक्योरिटी बिल पर है। मैं हरियाणा से आता हूँ। हरियाणा और पंजाब सबसे ज्यादा अन्न पैदा करते हैं।

**श्री उपसभापति :** हो गया। आप बैठ जाइए।

**श्री रणवीर सिंह प्रजापति :** किसान जो अन्न पैदा करता है उसके लिए भंडारण की व्यवस्था यह सरकार नहीं कर पाई है। सर, मैं चाहता हूँ कि गरीब लोगों को सस्ता अनाज मिले।

**श्री उपसभापति :** प्रजापति जी, अब आप बैठ जाइए।

**श्री रणवीर सिंह प्रजापति :** सरकार गरीब लोगों के लिए सस्ता अनाज उपलब्ध करवाए।...**(समय की घंटी)**...किसान तो पहले से ही बर्बादी के कगार पर हैं। इस फैसले से कहीं उनका और ज्यादा नुकसान न हो जाए।...**(समय की घंटी)**...हमारा देश कृषि प्रधान देश है। अगर किसान बर्बाद हो गया तो यह देश बर्बाद हो जाएगा।

**श्री उपसभापति :** ठीक है। धन्यवाद।

**श्री रणवीर सिंह प्रजापति :** इसलिए आज किसान को भी बचाने की जरूरत है।...**(समय की घंटी)**...इस बारे में भी सरकार को सोचना चाहिए।...**(समय की घंटी)**...सर, मैं आज सुबह ही हरियाणा से आया हूँ। आज भी किसान वहाँ धरने पर बैठे हुए हैं। उनकी कपास की फसल खराब हो चुकी है। उनकी ज्वार की फसल भी खराब हो चुकी है। गरीब किसानों की हालत को भी हमें देखना चाहिए।...**(समय की घंटी)**...इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ, मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Now, Shri Mohammad Shafi; not here. Now, Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (Punjab): Thank you, Sir. A detailed analysis of this Bill clearly shows that this is nothing but a political gimmick, an attempt to hoodwink the poor people of this country, on whom a \* is being perpetuated. As the LOP stated this morning, it is nothing but re-branding and re-packaging of the existing PDS system.

Sir, the Bill says that it will cost the country Rs.1,25,000 crore. If you look at the budgetary figures, Rs.1,24,840 crores were provided for the PDS and other schemes relating to the women and children.

The hon. Minister in reply to my question last week stated in this House that if the PDS was updated to 2013, it will cost the exchequer another Rs.4,000 crores. This means the total cost of the schemes which exist today plus PDS, if updated would have been Rs.1,29,000 crores. Now, the Bill says it will cost Rs.1,25,000 crores. You tell me what is being given to the poor. Sir, my contention is supported by the Bill which states that 54.9 million tonnes would be required for this proposal. Sir, I have a PIB release of 20th August which states that 56.3 million tonnes would be required for the foodgrains under the PDS which means you are reducing it by 1.4 million tonnes and then you are saying that you are giving a lot to the poor in this country.

---

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, very, very poor of this country will be hit very hard because till now they were getting 35 Kg of foodgrains per family. But now an average family of five would only get 25 Kg foodgrains. According to the NSSO survey of 2009-10 the per capita cereal requirement of a human being is 10.7 Kg. Now, where will the balance 6 Kg will come from? The poor man can't afford to buy from the market given the way that this Government has messed up the economy; and the way food prices have gone up.

Sir, already in States like Andhra Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh and Punjab, we have our own schemes wherein we not only give cereals but also *daal*, *chana*, sugar, etc. Now, I wish the Government should have taken care of these things; and borrowed a leaf from our book.

Sir, there are two more points that I would like to dwell upon. A nation that cannot secure its existing foodgrains stocks can't promise food security. Today, we have 20 million tonnes of foodgrains rotting in the open. In Punjab alone 12 1/2 million tonnes of foodgrains are lying in the open; and in Haryana another 6 million tonnes of foodgrains are lying in the open and in Uttar Pradesh more than one lakh tonnes of foodgrains are lying in the open.

The other day the hon. Minister has said that CAP is a scientific storage. This is the most amazing thing I have ever heard that you keep foodgrains outside on the plinth. Monsoons are in full swing; and you say that this is a scientific storage. Please name one developed country wherein foodgrains are kept outside, then, they call it scientific storage. What does the Government do? It says that they have planned to add six million tonnes of foodgrains storage capacity in this year. It is totally illogical. You have 20 million tonnes of foodgrains lying outside. You plan for six million tonnes of foodgrains. Then, what do you build in the first three months? It is merely three lakh tonnes. It is a shame the way that they are storing our foodgrains.

Sir, today, we are lucky that we have some food available. But if monsoons fail two or three years in a row, where will these foodgrains come from? We have to look at the supply side economics also to ensure that our poor people would continue to get foodgrains because this nation can't afford to import foodgrains, given our precarious foreign exchange position. You have to ensure that the farmer gets a good price for his produce. This Government claims that it has doubled the

MSP since it came to power. Sir, I would like to challenge them that compounded every year the rise has been 9 per cent for wheat and 10 per cent for rice. So, don't fool the poor farmers of India because the input cost has more than quadrupled in this period.

Sir, I have given a notice to amend clause 2 of the Bill requesting for the Swaminathan formula to be adopted which means input cost plus 50 per cent would be the MSP that would be given to the farmer.

Sir, 65 per cent of our population is dependent on agriculture and we have to ensure that they get a fair deal. Unless we make agriculture a viable business, this country will not be able to guarantee food to its poor. Thank you.

DR. KARAN SINGH : Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, we have come to the end of a rather long and very interesting debate and the Minister will surely reply to the various questions raised. I would simply like to put, first of all, this whole historic legislation in the broader perspective. What the UPA has attempted to do in the last nine years is to put in place for the first time the elements of a social security net for one billion people — it has never even been attempted in human history before — more than the population of the whole of Europe and North America combined. We started with the Right to Information Act which opened out the doors of the Government to every person, which gave every person an empowerment. We went on to the Right to Education Act, which was a constitutional imperative and now has become a right. We went then on to the Nation Rural Employment Guarantee Act. Despite all the criticism, millions of people have benefited from MNREGA, and now we have come to the Food Security Act, which is another element in this network that we are trying to build for the security of the people of this country.

Sir, thanks to the green revolution and the patriotic farmers particularly of the last two speakers' States of Haryana and Punjab, and elsewhere, we have enough foodgrains today. I remember the days, the Prime Minister will remember, when we lived from ship-to-mouth, in a ship PL-480 food came. We used to go around the world literally with a begging bowl asking for food. Today we are growing enough food for our nation. What we are now trying to do is to ensure that this food really gets to every deserving person in the country at a reasonable price. Its important difference is that now this is becoming a legal right. It is not only a

give-away, it is a Right to Food, like the Right to Education. So there is a qualitative difference between the earlier programme and this programme. That is the first point I would like to mention.

Sir, it is a shame and a disgrace that millions of children still go to bed in India without a full meal. Once we are able to get this grain to them, hopefully, it will considerably improve their nutritional value. Certainly, grain by itself is not enough nutrition. That is an obvious thing. As a former Health Minister and my colleague sitting here, we all know that nutrition needs a lot of other inputs. But grain is essential. Without grain you cannot have any basic health. Therefore, the importance of grain always “अन्नदान महाकल्याण”, and even the Rigveda says “अहम् अन्नम्, अहम् अन्नम्, अहम् अन्नम्” I am anna; I am anna; I am anna because they realized that that was the basis of civilization. Therefore, it is very important to realize what it is that we are trying to do. We are not talking about the problems of the farmers, that is a separate matter. There is one point I must mention which seems to have disappeared from our public discourse, Sir, and that is population stabilization. Nobody ever mentioned it anywhere. I am not going into that now. We will have a separate debate one day on that. I am just pointing out that if the population continues to grow exponentially, then the pressure upon our foodgrains will naturally increase.

I know there are concerns about financial implications. But as the Leader of the Opposition pointed out, and as other Members have pointed out, this figure that is being bandied around that we are driving the country into bankruptcy by all the columnists, and some of the TV channels are saying that you are driving the country to bankruptcy, is simply not true because this Bill is encompassing a large number of existing organizations and strengthening them. Sir, three very quick points and I will be over. Although my Party has 24 minutes, we are giving up 20 minutes for you.

I would like to make three points. The first is storage. I agree that it is a crime that children go to bed hungry and our food rots. So, you will never see a thin rat in India, but you will see a lot of thin children. Rats are always fat because they are eating our grains. Therefore, the provision of storage facilities, building of storage facilities all over the country, has to be the first priority both in the public sector and in the private sector. We should not leave it to the Food Corporation of India which is not able to do it and has an unsavory reputation.



The second is transportation. We are often told that nobody is prepared to lift the grains. How do we take them from one place to another? We have to work out a proper system, a scientific system of transportation by truck and by train so that the grains can move as and when required, and they don't have to be stored. It has to be computerized and modernized, and again, both the public sector and the private sector have to co-operate. The final point, Sir, is distribution. That is the essence of the whole thing. The Central Government and State Governments must ensure that the highly subsidized foodgrains reach the people they are meant for and that they do not get sold in black markets. This is a very important thing. Panchayati Raj Institutions have also got to show this. There is the cancer of corruption that is eating into our economy, society and our politics and it must not be allowed to destroy this very great and historic programme that we have brought.

Finally, Sir, let us not be misguided by the prophets of doom and necromancers of negativity because there are some people who are, constantly, bemoaning what is happening thereby disempowering people's minds and hearts. We have got to renew the national purpose. We are celebrating the 150th Birth Anniversary of Swami Vivekananda. His favourite verse from the Kathopanishad was that we should awake, arise and move forward boldly across the razor-edge path. It is the razor-edge path which is before us. It is a difficult path, but there are no short-cuts, and we all have to do this together. The Opposition, the Government, all of us as a nation, have to ensure that we get enough food for our children. I will end, Sir, with the verse from the Kathopanishad which is an inspirational verse.

उत्तिष्ठ जाग्रत प्राप्य वरान्निबोधत।  
क्षुरस्य धारा निशिता दुरत्यया दुर्गं पथस्तत्कवयो वदन्ति।

MR. CHAIRMAN: This concludes the discussion. Now, the Mover of the Resolution.

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I had moved the Resolution opposing the use of the Ordinance path under article 123. And the reason for the opposition was that between the 5th of July when the Ordinance was promulgated and the 6th of August, there were 30 days, and there was no urgency. In any case to operationalise the Ordinance or the Bill, as and when it is passed, it is going to take a reasonably long time. The Bill itself says that it will take 365 days

for States to prepare the list of priority and eligible houses. In the entire discussion which has taken place and to which many hon. Members have contributed, I am still struggling for a response as to what the need was to have an Ordinance to cover up for this period. We could have easily waited for a Session of Parliament, and during the Session of Parliament, we could have discussed, amended and altered the Bill rather than confront Parliament with a *fait accompli*. Also, during the period, from 5th July till date, there are no effective steps which have been taken, no guidelines which have been framed and which have been sent to States in order to take further steps in the matter. All that has taken place is that a certain number of political programmes have been held in some selective States in order to demonstrate that we are putting in this Bill into motion and operationalising the Bill itself.

But, that is only a showcasing. That is not an effective implementation of the Bill and such political signals, as I said in the morning, can never be a lawful, valid ground for promulgation of an Ordinance. Sir, I had said that my party is in favour of the Right to Food. The Right to Food itself makes life more meaningful, it makes it more effective. It is essential for anyone to survive, to have an effective life which can't be the anti-thesis of an animal existence. It is life which is more meaningful and, therefore, empty stomachs will have to be fed. My party, therefore, supports the concept of the Right to Food. But are we substantially expanding the right over what existed prior to this Bill being brought in. Are we substantially increasing the outlay? The answer is 'no'. Are we increasing the number of persons who are going to benefit from it as were benefiting from pre-existing schemes? The answer is 'no'. Are we increasing the quantum quite to the contrary for BPL? We are reducing the quantum. Compared to several States, we are reducing the quantum. Are we making the food which is being promised, more nutritious? The answer is, we are not doing it. It is only foodgrains and nothing else. In the face of all this, is this an effective Right to Food or is it merely a re-packaging of all existing schemes? I regret to say that it is a re-packaging of all existing schemes and not an effective Right which is being given as far as this Government is concerned. I would, therefore, urge the hon. Minister, when he replies to this debate on merits, to take all these factors into consideration and try to improve upon the Bill. There are certain amendments which Members of the Opposition benches have moved, which will go a step further in strengthening this Bill. I am sure he will be magnanimous enough to consider some of them.

PROF. K. V. THOMAS: Sir, today this Bill was discussed in this House threadbare and the discussion started from the hon. Leader of the Opposition, Shri Arun Jaitley, and 37 Members participated in the discussion, ended by Dr. Karan Singh. Sir, a large number of suggestions have been made. I have noted down those suggestions. At the outset, I wish to bring to the notice of the House that all the constructive and positive suggestions will be carefully followed when we have the rules, guidelines and when we start implementing this important legislation. I also wish to assure the House that the federal system of this country will be totally protected because we know, especially in the case of the food security of the nation, both the Central Government and the State Governments have to go hand-in-hand. Unless we work together, not only in The Food Security Bill, but even in the targeted Public Distribution System which started in 1997, it cannot be implemented effectively. Sir, in this context, I wish to bring it to the attention of the hon. Members, many Members suggested that there are better food security measures and projects undertaken by many State Governments.

There are model projects like what is now being implemented in Chhattisgarh or in Tamil Nadu or, my CPI(M) friends from Kerala said that Kerala has got a model project. I agree with that. But, the model projects which all of us like to be implemented are not the projects which can be implemented throughout the country, because the character differs from State-to-State. When hon. Members suggest that States are doing better, I think, one important factor is forgotten. The commitment, both financial and availability of foodgrains to be given to the States, by the Centre is much more than what the States are spending now.

The present TPDS — let us forget about the proposed Bill — supply 1 kg. of rice to the BPL at Rs. 5. For example, Kerala is getting it at Rs. 5.30 — 30 paise is the addition of the State, because State does not want to bear the transportation charge. So, we are giving it at Rs. 5. What is our economic cost after paying the MSP, after paying Bonus and the State taxes? Sir, per kilogram of rice alone comes to Rs. 27. So, we have to bear Rs. 27 and States are getting it at Rs. 5. For example, to my State, Kerala, when I give it at Rs. 5, now, the State Government is giving at Re. 1. And, what is the subsidy given by the State? It is only Rs. 4. I am not pointing out the fact that it is small. But the burden of the Government of India is much more than the States that are bearing.

Similarly, I come to the quantum of foodgrains. Some hon. Members pointed out that the present Chhattisgarh model is good. I know it is good. I myself have gone two or three times. But, look at the present situation. Sir, the existing subsidy, as per the TPDS, to Chhattisgarh, is Rs. 2,027 crores from the Government of India and the subsidy now we have to incur — once we implement the National Food Security Order in Chhattisgarh — is Rs. 2,910 crores. It is more than Rs. 883 crores we are bearing.

Similarly, I come to foodgrains. Now, we are giving foodgrains to Chhattisgarh, through the TPDS *i.e.*, BPL, AAY and APL, to the tune of 11.33 lakh tones. In the Food Security Bill, it comes to 12.91 lakh tones. So, roughly, it is more than 1.5 lakh tones.

Sir, you look at other considerations. For example, hon. Members from Tamil Nadu said that they have got a better system. Okay, I agree with that, because I am just its neighbour. They also put a question whether the Government of India is supplying foodgrains to 18 States, including Tamil Nadu, Kerala, etc., which becomes lower than the present supply. What are we going to do?

Sir, in the case of Tamil Nadu, the average off-take in the last three years has been to the tune of 36.78 lakh tonnes, for BPL, AAY and APL. So, here, we must understand that from 1997 onwards, both the BJP and the Congress have been in power. In Tamil Nadu, the DMK and the AIADMK have been in power. But, during these periods, in the case of Tamil Nadu and Kerala, only AAY and BPL were mandatory; APL was not mandatory. For example, in 2009, when I became the MoS with Sharad Pawarji at the helm, CPI-M was in power in Kerala; Mr. Divakaran was the hon. Food Minister. In the beginning, for APL, we gave only 8.5 kg per family. After that, we had enhanced it to 10 kg. ...*(Interruptions)*... My point is about 1997 onwards. That is what I am talking about. Before that, so many things have happened. At the end of the last LDF Government in Kerala, from 8.5 kg it came up to 10 kg. We never looked into the politics of this. Now, we are giving 15 kg. My point is that, for APL, it is not mandatory; the price is linked to the MSP. When I give AAY under two rupees for rice and five rupees for BPL, my APL price is linked to the MSP. Now, we have taken a decision because some of our friends from these 18 States, including Tamil Nadu and Kerala, were getting less. If you take Tamil Nadu, their total AAY, BPL and APL was Rs. 36.78 lakhs. AAY and BPL together was round about Rs. 20 lakhs. Now, it

has been enhanced to Rs. 24 lakhs under 'priority'. The priority is much more liberal. So, now we are giving 24 lakhs. A State like Tamil Nadu, which is getting only Rs. 20 lakhs under the present PDS system, under AAY and BPL, is going to get Rs. 24 lakhs. Then, there is a balance of twelve lakhs. That is the APL. Under the APL, it is always so, that the quantity is not fixed. It depends on the off-take of the State for the last three years and the availability of foodgrains, and it is linked to the MSP. So, what is the decision that we have taken now. Because of the representation from 18 States which are getting less than what they are getting now, the hon. Prime Minister has taken a very bold decision to protect the quantity and the price for the next three years. And what is the additional burden? The additional burden is of Rs. 5,000 crores. Dr. Maitreyan had asked me one thing. I would reply to him. He had asked me if it was included in the Bill. Dr. Maitreyan, it is the quantity that is included in the Bill.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: What about the price?

PROF. K. V. THOMAS: I am coming to that point. I had told you that even the last time, APL was linked to the MSP, but because of the recommendations of many Chief Ministers, including the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu – as also Mr. Karunanidhi, Mr. Baalu and all our friends from Kerala — we decided in the Cabinet that when the Bill is taken up in the Lok Sabha, the price of Rs. 8.30 per kilo for rice and Rs. 6.10 for wheat would be protected. This is the present APL price. That has been approved by the Cabinet. I can give you the document. What else do you need?

It is a Cabinet decision. Do you want much more than that? I have got the document with me. We have not included it because APL is always linked to MSP. So, the Cabinet has taken a decision that till these three years are over, because this is a review. Somebody said that after three years, we are going to drop it. Sir, we are not going to drop it. It will be reviewed. Review does not mean we are going to cancel it. So, we have protected all the 18 States with more foodgrains and additional financial burden.

Then, somebody asked me, in a State like Kerala, where there is almost universal rationing, Tamil Nadu has universal rationing, what you are going to do. I have discussed it with my friends from Tamil Nadu, with the Chief Minister of Kerala. Somebody alleged that we have not made due consultation. Sir, what we

have done is this. Remember, it was in 2009, exactly on 4th of June, the Rashtrapatiiji made this decision. The next day, we sent the Draft Paper to every State. Sir, EGoM was constituted under the then Finance Minister, Pranabda. It met eight times. There was an NAC under the Chairmanship of Madam Gandhi. There was Dr. Rangarajan in the Economic Advisory Committee of the hon. Prime Minister, and I called the Food Ministers of the country four times. What else is needed? Wherever I went, except a few Chief Ministers, I met all of them personally and explained the position. Sir, in Bihar, I met Shri Nitish Kumar. About three months back, I met the Odisha Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik. In Punjab, I had discussions with both the Chief Minister and the Food Minister about one month back. I went to Chhattisgarh more than three times. I have good relations with Mr. Raman. So, we have discussed all these matters. I myself have written to the Chief Ministers.

DR. K.P. RAMALINGAM (Tamil Nadu): Have you met the Tamil Nadu Chief Minister, Sir?

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: I don't want to answer it. You know better than me. ...*(Interruptions)*... I sent the message. The Food Minister of Tamil Nadu, the Food Secretary, we used to meet. I go to Cochin *via* Chennai only. So, I used to meet all these people.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: None of the Union Ministers... ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF SHIPPING (SHRI G. K. VASAN): It is because of the Union Ministers... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, allow the Minister to continue.

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: I have all the respect for Jayalalithaa. But I was conveyed. Yes, except a few Chief Ministers, I met everybody personally and explained it. In this House also, I met almost all the Members of Parliament, explained the position. So, Sir, there has been adequate consultation.

Then, somebody may ask, why you have taken the Ordinance route. Sir, this Draft Bill was presented to the Lok Sabha in the end of December, 2011. It was sent to the Standing Committee. The Standing Committee took one year's time. The Standing Committee went to almost all the States, consultations were made. And,

finally, the Standing Committee unanimously gave the recommendation, except, as I said in the other House, that Seema, from my State, made only one amendment, *i.e.*, universal PDS. I am with her because that was the stand taken by the CPM and the CPI for quite a long time. Except that, the recommendations of the Standing Committee were unanimous.

Sir, let us take the first Draft Bill. In the first Draft Bill, 75 percentage was the coverage; out of that, 46 will be priority in the rural areas; and 50 percentage in the urban areas, out of that, 28 percentage will be priority. So, in the original Bill, we had three categories at that time, *i.e.*, priority, general and excluded.

The Standing Committee in its wisdom after having lengthy discussions has suggested that there can be only two categories, that is, 75 percentage of priority in the rural area and 50 percentage of priority in the urban areas. It is a drastic change because in the existing PDS what the Government of India is obliged is only 6.52 crores of BPL families, not more than that, that is, 32 crores of the people. There is AAY sector within this which is about two crores of families who are entitled to 35 kilos. It is family-wise. In the existing PDS it is 35 kilograms. But what is the position in the country? I am giving 35 kilograms to my State Kerala in the present system of PDS. But Kerala Government is not giving 35, they are giving only 20. Many States cutting across the country are not giving 35. I am not blaming them because they have enhanced the number. The BPL, APL and AAY is decided by the Planning Commission. So, on that basis it is only 6.52 crores of BPL families which is now 32 crores. Because of the unanimous recommendation of the Standing Committee which was headed by our good friend, Dr. Vilas Muttamwar and the Members representing the political parties both in Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha are Members of it. So, because of that we have enhanced it to 75 percentage in the rural areas and 50 percentage in the urban areas, that is, coverage is 82 crores of the people. From 32 crores it becomes 82 crores. We have not rejected any major recommendation. We have expanded it. For example, their suggestion was that in the case of AAY families, just like the other priorities, we give only five kilograms. But after I discussed this matter with hon. Prime Minister and Madam Gandhi, they suggested that AAY is the poorest among the poor. There may be only one member in that family or two members. But as they are getting now 35 kilograms at the rate of Rs.3 for rice and Rs.2 for wheat per kilogram, that has to be protected. And, Sir, we have protected that. That is our

commitment. So, we have done much more than what the Standing Committee has suggested. Similarly, Sir, we have also decided to merge together the various welfare schemes like the ICDS or Mid-day Meal Scheme to have nutritional component and that becomes a statute. That nutritional component is decided by kilocalories. I understand if the entire people of this country can be provided with nutritional component, it is well and good. But this is our first step. Everybody in this country of 120 crores of the people if it can provide with nutritional food, it is a good dream we have got but practically it is not possible. So, we decided that the pregnant women, the lactating women, the newborn child, the child up to the eighth standard should be provided as per kilocalories. This has become a right. It is true that these schemes are already functioning but not in the way we have formulated it. Some States have it, some States do not have it. So, we are making it an all-India obligation. Sir, another thing is that in the same nutritional component, there was a some kind of view that this is to help the biscuit barons, readymade nutrients because many of my friends raised this issue, we changed it. That was one of the amendment we made in the Lok Sabha that it ought to be cooked food. It is just to protect our young children from the big business houses and multinational companies. A basic change we have done. But I am suggesting that we have been trying to accommodate all the views.

Sir, another question that was raised was that whether our Public Distribution System is ready enough to handle this situation. Sir, we have got the PDS. The responsibility of the Central Government is to procure foodgrains, store it, transport it and make it available to the State Governments at designated places. This is what our responsibility is. Sir, when the new UPA-II Government was formed, our storage capacity in 2010, covered and CAP, was total 583.86 million tonnes, which, within last five years, we have built up to 751 million tonnes. So, it is a commendable achievement, Sir. We will build up another five million capacity before the end of next year. Somebody asked the question whether 'covered' is only scientific, whether CAP, is not scientific. Sir, CAP is the scientific CAP not the *katcha* which India has been using for a quite long, long time. When I visited many of the wheat producing countries, I found that many of them are using the CAP, but it should be scientific. There are some scientific norms fixed for that. It is not the *katcha* one. Sir, I would also add that we have got a huge damage. It is true there was a damage. Though the FCI is handling and procuring till the arrival of the foodgrains, there is no control by the FCI. During the season, when the



foodgrains come, we are bound to procure and protect the MSP price. Last year, our procurement was to the tune of 82 million tonnes whereas we needed only 60 or 62 million tonnes. This year, it has gone up to 73. So, Sir, huge procurement is taking place, because we have to protect the interest of the farmers. So, whatever said and done, I know the FCI is a white elephant. It has got its negative points. But the FCI is the only organisation under the public sector – it is not with private—which guarantees procurement of the foodgrains which come to *mandis* and nobody else. And it is the only Organisation which protects MSP for the farmers. Suppose they are left to the private traders, what would happen? We had a bad experience last season, because we were procuring everything under the MSP, giving the bonus and giving the State taxes. What happened? As we had a higher procurement, we found out that private traders did not come to the market. So, we had to supply the huge stock we had through the OMSS, but a heavy subsidy was there. So, this year, we took a conscious decision. The OMSS wheat is taken by the biscuit manufacturing companies. So, they will pay the MSP plus the bonus and plus the State taxes. So, as a result, this season, because in the last season we purchased about 39 millions of wheat in Punjab and Haryana, it has come down to 24 and 25. They knew that they would not get subsidised wheat from Government. So, this is the huge responsibility we are holding. So, Sir, we are fulfilling all these responsibilities.

Sir, another question was raised whether we will protect the farmers. Sir, if you look at the Bill, you will find that the Schedule III clearly gives an indication that revitalisation of agriculture will be given foremost importance.

There will be agrarian reforms through measures for securing interests of small and marginal farmers. There will be increase in investments in agriculture. Sir, there are about six or seven measures like these which we have added in this Schedule so that the farmers' interests are being protected.

Sir, similarly, take the MSP price. The MSP price will not be frozen. The MSP price is decided by the CACP. The CACP's recommendation is usually accepted by the Cabinet. So, this Bill, Sir, is a new step. I am not claiming that it is hundred per cent perfect. We have got a long dream. I appreciate the views of my friends of the Left from Kerala. They had said, if it is a universal measure, well and good. But can we have more than 62 million tonnes? Our procurement is 30 per cent of what we produce in the country. When we calculated in 2010-11, it

was 339-340 million tonnes, and we found that we could scientifically procure 30 per cent, which would be enough for the requirement under the proposed Food Security Bill. If you go beyond that, then there will be scarcity in the market. The prices will go up. So, we have taken all these things into consideration and then this Bill has been brought. I do not want to go into many more details. This Bill has been discussed in the other House also.

So, with these words, I request the hon. Members to pass this Bill unanimously.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall ...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, the hon. Minister has made several statements. I have just two specific questions to him. There are States which have a superior food scheme. Will this Act prevail or those Schemes prevail? That is to say, after the coming into force of this Bill when it becomes an Act, will those superior schemes lapse and a Bill for which they have to pay more and get less prevail over those non-statutory schemes? That is my first specific question.

My second question is, in Clause 3, you say, the coverage will extend up to 75 per cent of rural and 50 per cent of urban population. One of the concerns we raised was that these percentages are the upper cap. Will you make a change in your Bill so that they are the base and not the cap so that the numbers don't come down below that figure? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, we are not re-opening the discussion. It will be unending. Yes, Prof. Thomas, please go ahead.

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: Sir, article 32 of the Bill protects all the existing schemes that are there in the States. ...*(Interruptions)*... Then, Sir, the question was raised as to why we confined to 75 and 50. It was because it was decided by the NSSO. When this question of 75 and 50 came as the priority, many States like Uttar Pradesh and Bihar asked us, are you going to give the same to Kerala which has a much better lifestyle? Are you going to give the same to Tamil Nadu? So, we took a decision that that will be done on the basis of NSSO and when we get all the figures, this would be considered. So, it is on that basis, we took the second decision. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I also have to seek one clarification.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am afraid, not. ...*(Interruptions)*... The discussion is over. We shall now put the ... ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What is this? When we initiate a debate, don't we have the right to ask clarifications? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, what is this? I do not understand...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do we want to have a second round of debate? We have debated it the whole day. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No debate at all, Sir; simple clarifications. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your amendments are already there. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is a very important issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no end to it. ...*(Interruptions)*... There will be no end to it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Venkaiahji, there would be no end to it. There would be 10, 15 or 20 other Members asking for clarifications. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we are debating an issue which concerns a large number of farmers of this country. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have debated the whole day. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have also debated the Resolution moved by the hon. Leader of the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this is not the way to stifle the voice of the Opposition; I am sorry to say. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: After a whole day's debate, you can't say that your voice is being stifled. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, this has been happening in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... The farmers' issue which had been raised has not been

responded to. ...*(Interruptions)*... That has been the practice in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is not the practice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, that has been the practice in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have debated it. The reply has been given. Now, we move on to the next stage. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, do we have to take whatever the Minister says in his reply? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have already moved your amendments. ...*(Interruptions)*... I shall now put the Resolution moved by Shri Arun Jaitley to vote. ...*(Interruptions)*... The question is put. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, he said that the State Government ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am sorry; it can't be done. ...*(Interruptions)*... The question is put. ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. Seema, please sit down. There is no procedure for it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, I just wish to ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. T.N. SEEMA: Sir, let me say just one line. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, I am sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down. No, I am sorry. It cannot be done. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, the Minister has...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, as per rules, when the Minister names a Member ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; no. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have debated the matter the whole day. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, Mr. Rajeeve. Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not correct. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not correct. Please, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. The Chair must protect the right of the Member. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; there is no room for it here. Please, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would request the hon. Members not to ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. Please ask the Minister...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ....*(Interruptions)*.... I am sorry.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, the Minister has taken the name of the Member. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister has taken the name of the Member. ...*(Interruptions)*... As per the rule...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. You are not going to get up one by one and disrupt. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Yechury, I would request you to discipline your Members. This is not correct. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have had a debate. Everybody has spoken. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Resolution has already been moved. Now, we have to proceed further. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I understand....*(Interruptions)*... The problem arose only because the Minister took the name of an hon. Member. So, that hon. Member wanted to raise it. That was the only reason. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That does not matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yechuryji, the Resolution has been moved. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Now, I shall put the Resolution moved by Shri Arun Jaitley to vote. The question is:

“That this House disapproves the National Food Security Ordinance (No. 7 of 2013) promulgated by the President of India on 5th July, 2013.”

...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: “Ayes”. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**9.00 P.M.**

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, the Resolution has been put to vote. The “ayes” have it. There were no “noes”. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Those against would please say “no”.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think, the “noes” have it, the “noes” have it, the “noes” have it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sorry, Sir. This is not correct.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do you want a division? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the voting was not fair at all. ...*(Interruptions)*... They have said ‘ayes’ first and now you say ‘noes’. How can that be? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Can the same Members vote twice, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*... Can the same Members say ‘ayes’ as well as ‘no’? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Can the same Members say ‘yes’ as well as ‘no’? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Will you please ...*(Interruptions)*... There is only one way out of this: if there is a demand for division, then we will have a division. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Yes, Sir. We want it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your problem? ...*(Interruptions)*... Can one person speak, please? ...*(Interruptions)*... May others sit down, please? ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: My objection is, kindly listen, when you called for the voting, from here 'we' and from there 'they', both said, 'Ayes' ...*(Interruptions)*... Then how can they say 'Noes'? ...*(Interruptions)*... We have it. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have it. ...*(Interruptions)*... When you repeated it, they said 'Noes'. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, 'Ayes' are in the majority. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the whole world has seen it; it is going on live. When the 'Ayes' came, both sides said 'Ayes'. ...*(Interruptions)*... Therefore, Sir, the 'Ayes' have to be taken into consideration. ...*(Interruptions)*... The 'Ayes' have to be taken into consideration. They cannot say 'Noes'. ...*(Interruptions)*... It has gone live; the whole world has seen it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Put it again for voting. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAJEEV SHUKLA: Mr. Chairman, Sir, our people did not say 'Yes'. But if they are still insisting, we can ask for division. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, we request the Chairman that if they don't want to ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is asking for division. ...*(Interruptions)*... We will have division. ...*(Interruptions)*... A request has been made for division. ...*(Interruptions)*... A request has been made for division. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let the lobbies be cleared.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Let them accept their mistake. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let them accept their mistake. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: They have asked for division, Venkaiahji. ...*(Interruptions)*... They have asked for division. What is your problem with it? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That is secondary. First, let them accept their mistake gracefully. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री के. सी. त्यागी (बिहार) : सभापति जी, ऐसा लोक सभा में हो चुका है...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : बैठ जाइए। Please, sit down. Secretary-General will now explain the voting procedure.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, two resolutions are there.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we have moved resolutions. He has moved. I have moved. Put all these together.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: All the resolutions opposing the Ordinance may be put together.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down. The Resolution was moved on behalf of various Members. Let us proceed now. I shall now put the Resolution moved by Shri Arun Jaitley to vote. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Arun Jaitley and others...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Resolution was moved by Shri Arun Jaitley, that's all. The name is there on the record; nothing more will be said. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down. Don't interrupt. The question is:

“That this House disapproves the National Food Security Ordinance (No. 7 of 2013) promulgated by the President of India on 5th July, 2013”.

SECRETARY-GENERAL: I am starting the voting process. The voting time starts now. ....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: It is a big embarrassment. ....*(Interruptions)*... The entire country is watching and the voting system is not...*(Interruptions)*... It is a big embarrassment. The entire country is watching. ....*(Interruptions)*....

#### **The House divided**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.



Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the motion moved by Prof. K.V. Thomas to vote.



The question is:

That the Bill to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring access to adequate quantity of quality food at affordable prices to people to live a life with dignity and for matter connected therewith or incidental thereto, as passed by Lok Sabha, be taken into consideration.

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall now take up clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill. In Clause 2, there are 38 amendments. Amendments (Nos.1-5) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu.

#### **Clause 2 - Definitions**

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, I beg to move:

- (1) That at page 2, line 9, *after* the word and figure “section 3”, the words “and the households covered under Public Distribution System” be *inserted*.
- (2) That at page 2, line 15, *after* the words “time to time”, the words “in consultation with the State Governments” be *inserted*.
- (3) That at page 2, *for* lines 16 and 17, the following be substituted, namely:-

‘(6) “food security” means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences *for* an active and healthy life.’
- (4) That at page 2, lines 18 and 19, be *deleted*.
- (5) That at page 2, line 41, *after* the word and figure “section 10”, the words “and the households covered under Public Distribution System” be *inserted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.26-31) by Shri Prakash Javadekar.

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, हर clause पर amendments दिया गया है।

श्री सभापति : मुझे मालूम है।

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, मेरी आपसे गुजारिश होगी कि clause-by-clause amendment को move कराएं, यह उचित होगा और यही संसदीय प्रक्रिया है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: After all the amendments are moved, then we will take up the amendments one by one.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR : Sir, I beg to move:

(26) That at page 2, *after* line 6, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2a) “destitute person” means men, women or children who have no resources, means and support required for food and nutrition enabling their survival, to the extent that makes them vulnerable to live with or die of starvation;

(2b) “disaster” shall have the same meaning as assigned to it in clause (d) of section 2 of the Disaster Management Act, 2005;”. 53 of 2005.

(27) That at page 2, line 9, *after* the word and figure “section 3”, the words “and the households covered under Public Distribution System” be *inserted*.

(28) That at page 2, *for* lines 13 to 15, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“(5) “foodgrains” means rice, wheat, coarse cereals, pulses, cooking oil, iodized salt or any other combination thereof conforming to such quality norms as may be determined, including on nutrition and safety, by order, by the Central Government from time to time;”.

(29) That at page 2, *for* lines 16 and 17, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“(6) “food security” means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life in accordance with the four pillars of food security, *i.e.*, availability, stability of supply, access and utilisation”.

(30) That at page 2, lines 18 and 19, be *deleted*

(31) That at page 2, line 41, *after* the word and figure “section 10”, the words “and the households covered under Public Distribution System” be *inserted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 45) by Shri Naresh Gujral.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL : Sir, I beg to move:

- (45) That at page 2, lines 29 and 30, *after* the words “announced by the Central Government, the words “based on the Swaminathan Committee formula, that is, cost of production plus fifty per cent of cost of production” be *inserted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.57 and 58) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal.

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सर, हम move नहीं कर रहे हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.68-78) by Shri D. Raja.

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I beg to move:

- (68) That at page 2, line 4, *for* the word “Targeted”, the word “Universal” be *substituted*.

- (69) That at page 2, *after* line 6, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(2a) “destitute person” means men, women or children who have no resources, means and support required for food and nutrition enabling their survival, to the extent that makes them vulnerable to live with or die of starvation;

(2b) “disaster” shall have the same meaning as assigned to it in clause (d) of section 2 of the Disaster Management Act, 53 of 2005;’. 2005.

- (70) That at page 2, lines 7 and 8, *for* the words “priority households”, the words “Public Distribution System” be *substituted*.

- (71) That at page 2, *for* lines 13 to 15, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(5) “food commodities” means rice, wheat, coarse cereals, pulses, edible oil, or any other combination thereof conforming to such quality norms as may be determined, including on nutrition and safety, by order, by the Central Government from time to time;’.

- (72) That at page 2, *for* lines 16 and 17, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(6) “food security” means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life in accordance with the four pillars of food security, *i.e.*, availability, stability of supply, access and utilisation’.

(73) That at page 2, *for* lines 18 and 19, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(7) “homeless persons” means persons who do not have homes and live as such on the roadside, pavements, or in such other places, or in the open, including persons living in shelters for homeless or beggars or such other homes;’.

(74) That at page 2, *after* line 26, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(8a) “malnutrition” means the condition that develops when the body, over a prolonged period of time, does not receive or absorb adequate and appropriate calories, proteins and other nutrients required for good health, growth and maintenance of the human body and mind;’.

(75) That at page 2, *for* lines 29 to 31, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(10) “minimum support price” means the assured fair and remunerative price announced by the Central Government, which is fixed at least fifty per cent more than the weighted average cost of production, at which foodgrains are procured from farmers by the Central Government and the State Governments and their agencies, for the central pool;’.

(76) That at page 2, *after* line 31, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(10a) “National Commission” means the National Food Commission constituted under the relevant section of this Act;’.

(77) That at page 2, *after* line 42, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(15a) “private contractor” means any entrepreneur, commercial enterprise or company not owned or controlled or funded or aided by the appropriate Government;’.

(78) That at page 3, *after* line 5, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(20a) “starvation” means prolonged involuntary deprivation of food that threatens survival of the person;

(20b) “starvation death” means death of a person caused chronic low food intake deemed insufficient to sustain life;’.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.119-123) by Shri M.P. Achuthan.

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN (Kerala): Sir, I beg to move:

(119) That at page 2, line 4, *for* the word “Targeted” the word “Universal” be *substituted*.

(120) That at page 2, line 12, *for* the word “Targeted” the word “Universal” be *substituted*.

(121) That at page 2, *for* lines 13 to 15, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(5) “foodgrains” means rice, wheat, coarse cereals, pulses, cooking oil, iodized salt or any other combination thereof conforming to such quality norms as may be determined, including nutrition and safety, by order, by the Central Government from time to time’.

(122) That at page 2, *for* lines 16 and 17, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(6) “food security” means a situation when all people at all times, have physical and economic access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food to meet their dietary needs and food preferences for an active and healthy life in accordance with the four pillars of food security, *i.e.*, availability, stability of supply, access and utilisation.’

(123) That at page 2, *for* lines 29 to 31, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(10) “minimum support price” means assured fair and remunerative price announced by the Central Government, which is fixed at least fifty per cent more than the weighted average cost of production, at which foodgrains are procured from farmers by the Central Government and the State Government and their agencies, for the central pool.”

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.153 and 154) by Shri Baishnab Parida.

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA (Odisha): Sir, I beg to move:

(153) That at page 2, *after* line 42, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(15a) “private contractor” means any entrepreneur, commercial enterprise or company not owned or controlled or funded or aided by the appropriate Government’.

(154) That at page 3, *after* line 5, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(20a) “starvation” means prolonged involuntary deprivation of food that threatens survival of the person.

(20b) “starvation death” means death of a person caused by chronic low food intake deemed insufficient to sustain life’.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.164-167) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : Sir, I beg to move:

(164) That at page 2, *after* line 6, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

‘(3) “destitute persons” means men, women or children who have no resources, means and support required for food and nutrition enabling their survival;

(165) That at page 2, line 16, *after* the words “quantity of” the words “sugar, cooking oil, pulses” be *inserted*.

(166) That at page 2, *for* lines 29 to 31, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘(10) “minimum support price” means a guaranteed fair and remunerative price announced by the Central Government which will not be less than the weighted average cost of production plus 50 per cent more, at which foodgrains are procured from farmers by the Central and State Governments and their agencies for the central pool”

(167) That at page 3, line 10, *for* the words “Targeted Public Distribution System” the words “Public Distribution System” be *substituted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 197) by Shri N.K. Singh.

SHRI N.K. SINGH (Bihar): Sir, I am not pressing it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Amendment (No.212) by Shri Lalhming Liana; not here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : चेयरमैन सर, जिनके कुछ अमेंडमेंट्स हैं, आपने उनको कॉल नहीं किया...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: If they are in the list, I would call them. If they are not in the list, I cannot call them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have requested you earlier also. Many hon. Members have given amendments. It will be better to take it up clause by clause.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are doing that.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: That's all I am saying. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, if you agree, may I suggest a procedural matter?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, there are various amendments moved by various hon. Members. On Clause 2, you have asked the Members whether they are moving the amendments or not. Some have moved; some have not moved. Now, may I suggest you to take a combined vote for all those that have been moved and thereby, go clause by clause? It will save a lot of time. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is there any agreement on that? ...*(Interruptions)*... It can be for all amendments under Clause 2 that have been moved. ....*(Interruptions)*....देखिए, सब का नाम लिया है।...(व्यवधान)... You don't want to take them up clause by clause.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, they are entirely different. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is not how it is listed here. It is listed Clause-wise. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, while moving the amendment, I have a right to explain what the amendment is.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, Clause 2 is a very long one. It is the definition Clause. Sir, kindly appreciate that Section 2 is the definition clause. It contains as many as 25 sub-clauses. You can't have clause 2 straightaway. Many hon. Members have given amendments to different sub-clauses. May I request you to take up amendments on 2(1), 2(2) and 2(3) onwards, it will facilitate. ....*(Interruptions)*....

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is not our practice. We are taking up amendment by amendment, Member by Member. I have called the first amendment by Shri Venkaiahji. We have now gone past it. Shri Prakash Javadekar. ....*(Interruptions)*.... One minute. ....*(Interruptions)*.... Please listen to me. The amendments have been circulated. Those are in the knowledge of the Members. All we have to do is decide. That's all.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: When we are moving an amendment, we are given an opportunity to explain. ....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the need of duplicating the exercise? It is in the knowledge of Members.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: "From time to time in consultation with State Governments", that's the amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Whatever the amendment is, the amendment is in the knowledge of the Members of the House. All that is required now is to vote on it.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: That has been the practice. If you want to dispense with the practice, I will leave it to the House.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am not dispensing with it. It is logical. That is the purpose of circulating the amendment. ....*(Interruptions)*....

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : ऐसे तो सुबह तक नहीं होगा।...*(व्यवधान)*...ऐसे तो कल तक नहीं होगा।...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : यह बहुत सही है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. The whole purpose of giving amendments and circulating them to the Members of the House is that all the amendments moved or proposed to be moved are in the knowledge of all the Members. So, there is no need to duplicate that by explaining it, again and again. It is presumed that everybody has read the amendments. ....*(Interruptions)*....



DR. V. MAITREYAN: We want division. ....(Interruptions)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, you will not do this. ....(Interruptions)....

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : सर, मेम्बरवाइज लीजिए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : नहीं, नहीं।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : एक-दो मेम्बर्स के कहने से हाउस नहीं चलेगा।...(व्यवधान)....यह एक नई परंपरा बन रही है।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right.

डा. नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला : Sir, I said it मेरी तो वॉइस भी कहीं होगी।...(व्यवधान)

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु : सर, मैंने तुरंत कहा डिविजन। आप दूसरे क्लॉज पर चले गए।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति : देखिए, वेंकैया जी। When there is a doubt about the voice vote, division is taken. ....(Interruptions).... Okay, fine. ....(Interruptions)....

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Division has to be granted even if one Member asks for it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right, you have it.

श्री रामविलास पासवान : सर, आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए।

श्री सभापति : जी।

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: May I make a suggestion? On clause 2(1), all the amendments that have been moved, you take it up separately. On clause 2(2) if any Member wants to move the amendment and press for the division, you can take it up. Like that you dispose them of one by one. ....(Interruptions)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute.

श्री रामविलास पासवान : सर, हम 1977 से एम.पी. रहे हैं। क्लॉज बाई क्लॉज की एक-एक अमेंडमेंट पर वोटिंग नहीं होती है। जितने Yes में कहने वाले लोग हैं, वे एक तरफ में हैं, जितने No में कहने वाले लोग हैं, वे दूसरी तरफ हैं। आप चाहे एक अमेंडमेंट पर वोटिंग करवाइए और चाहे 100 पर वोटिंग करवाइए, उसका रिजल्ट वही होगा। यदि लीडर ऑफ द अपोजिशन चाहते हैं कि रात भर वोटिंग हो, तो होने दीजिए।...(व्यवधान)....आप सारे अमेंडमेंट्स को एक साथ रखकर वोटिंग करवाइए।...(व्यवधान)...

डा. वी. शैत्रेयन : हम जब भी डिविजन मांगेंगे, डिविजन होगा।...*(व्यवधान)*...

We can demand division. It is our right.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: It is the convention in the House. It is the right of the Members. ...*(Interruptions)*...

डा. वी. शैत्रेयन : हम अपने अमैडमेंट्स पर डिविजन तो मांगेंगे।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I want silence in the House. Please, sit down.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I have a point of order under rule 252(4). सर, चार में यह है कि यदि किसी के मन में कोई शंका है, तो डिविजन करना पड़ेगा।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right, I concede your point. That is not the issue.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I would again urge, Sir, kindly appreciate this. Clause 2 is an important clause. It is a definition clause. It has got 25 sub-clauses. As Mr. Sitaram Yechury rightly stated, if you go clause by clause, many amendments will not be pressed. Therefore, I would again appreciate if you go clause by clause, in many cases, amendments will not be pressed. We have discussed it also. But, Sir, this being an important legislation, we have to also insist upon certain issues which we have moved by way of amendments shared by a lot of Members. Therefore, you can go by that. That's all what we are saying.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute please.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I want to submit one small thing. My amendments are starting from 67 to 117. I have moved these amendments. I may demand division on one amendment. You can go like that. I have made a practical suggestion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is precisely what we are doing.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am only saying take clause 2, sub-clause (1); clause 2, sub-clause (2); clause 2, sub-clause (3)...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA: It is always clause by clause; no sub-clause...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute, we are going on clause 2. There are a number of amendments moved by different Members. The first ones, as listed here, are

Amendments (Nos.1-5) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu. Now, if he wishes for a division, it is his right. Now, do you wish division?

SHRI M. VENKALAH NAIDU: I said, 'division'. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. What is the difficulty? You were not satisfied with the voice vote. You have asked for a division. Let the division take place. That's all.

श्री थावर चंद गहलोत (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, इसमें एक और ऐड करा दीजिए। इसी क्लॉज के अंदर अगर किसी और मेम्बर का भी है तो उस पर भी बात कर लीजिए।  
...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have a suggestion. ....*(Interruptions)*.... Please don't open the lobbies till the entire voting is over. ....*(Interruptions)*....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Division. Let the lobbies be cleared. ....*(Interruptions)*.... Please. ....*(Interruptions)*.... Sit down. We are on Venkaiah ji's amendments. ....*(Interruptions)*.... The Secretary-General has already explained the voting procedure. It does not have to be explained again. I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 1 to 5) moved by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu to vote. Division. ....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, there may be some amendments here, which we agree to vote for and some which we do not wish to vote for. ....*(Interruptions)*.... But, in this way, you are making it mandatory for us to vote for all the amendments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is the practice that the House has followed, and, I am following it.

श्री राम विलास पासवान : सभापति जी, यह कोई कांस्टीट्यूशनल अमेंडमेंट नहीं है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, please. ....*(Interruptions)*.... Division.

### *The House Divided.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, there is a request, for pressing reasons, that we take an adjournment for ten minutes. Thank you.

The House then adjourned at forty six minutes past nine of the clock.

The House reassembled at fifty-six minutes past nine of the clock, MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair

MR. CHAIRMAN: Subject to correction:

Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.  
Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin  
Jaitley, Shri Arun  
Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal  
Javadekar, Shri Prakash  
Jha, Shri Prabhat  
Jois, Shri M. Rama  
Katiyar, Shri Vinay  
Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai  
Kore, Dr. Prabhakar  
Koshiyari, Shri Bhagat Singh  
Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh  
Lakshmanan, Dr. R.  
Maitreya, Dr. V.  
Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.  
Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur  
Mathur, Shri Om Prakash  
Mitra, Dr. Chandan  
Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan  
Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash  
Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah  
Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas  
Narayanan, Shri C.P.  
O' Brien, Shri Derek  
Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj  
Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai  
Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj  
Budania, Shri Narendra  
Chavan, Smt. Vandana  
Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.  
Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka  
Daimary, Shri Biswajit  
Dalwai, Shri Husain  
Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal  
Deora, Shri Murli  
Dua, Shri H.K.  
Dwivedi, Shri Janardan  
Fernandes, Shri Oscar  
Gill, Dr. M.S.  
Gupta, Shri Prem Chand  
Hariprasad, Shri B.K.  
Hashmi, Shri Parvez  
Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal  
Jinnah, Shri A.A.  
Jugul Kishore, Shri  
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar  
Kanimozhi, Smt.  
Kannan, Shri P.  
Karan Singh, Dr.  
Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh  
Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar  
Keishing, Shri Rishang  
Khabri, Shri Brijlal



Khan, Shri K. Rahman  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali  
Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra  
Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina  
Krishna, Shri S.M.  
Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram  
Kujur, Shri Santiuse  
Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
Lachungpa, Shri Hishey  
Mahendra Prasad, Dr.  
Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh  
Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed  
Masood, Shri Rasheed  
Mayawati, Km.  
Misra, Shri Satish Chandra  
Mukut Mithi, Shri  
Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra  
Naik, Shri Shantaram  
Nanda, Shri Kiranmay  
Nandi Yellaiah, Shri  
Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi  
Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana  
Pande, Shri Avinash  
Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas  
Patel, Shri Ahmed  
Pathak, Shri Brajesh  
Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender  
Singh, Shri Ishwar  
Singh, Shri N. K.  
Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad  
Singh, Shri Veer  
Soni, Smt. Ambika  
Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din  
Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi  
Syiem, Smt. Wansuk  
Tariq Anwar, Shri  
Thakur, Dr. Prabha  
Thangavelu, Shri S.  
Tiwari, Shri Alok  
Tiwari, Shri Shivanand  
Tripathi, Shri D.P.  
Tyagi, Shri K.C.  
Vasan, Shri G.K.  
Vora, Shri Motilal  
Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan  
Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal  
Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh  
Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendments (Nos. 26 to 31) moved by Shri Prakash Javadekar to vote.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment (No. 45) moved by Shri Naresh Gujral to vote.

**10.00 P.M.***The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendments (Nos. 68 to 78) moved by Shri D. Raja to vote.

SHRI D. RAJA: On one amendment (No. 68) I want division. That is on the Universal Public Distribution System, I want division.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment (No.68) moved by Shri D. Raja to vote.

*The House divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN:

Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah  
Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas  
Narayanan, Shri C.P.  
O'Brien, Shri Derek  
Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj  
Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai  
Parida, Shri Baishnab  
Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh  
Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh  
Patil, Shri Basawaraj  
Pillania, Dr. Gyan Prakash  
Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra  
Pradhan, Smt. Renubala  
Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar  
Punj, Shri Balbir  
Rai, Smt. Kusum  
Raja, Shri D.  
Rajeev, Shri P.  
Rangarajan, Shri T.K.  
Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri  
Rathinavel, Shri T.  
Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar  
Raut, Shri Sanjay  
Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar  
Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap  
Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai  
Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri  
Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi  
Bachchan, Smt. Jaya  
Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh  
Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar  
Batra, Shri Shadi Lal  
Bhattacharya, Shri P.  
Bora, Shri Pankaj  
Budania, Shri Narendra  
Chavan, Smt. Vandana  
Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.  
Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka  
Daimary, Shri Biswajit  
Dalwai, Shri Husain  
Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal  
Deora, Shri Murli  
Dua, Shri H.K.  
Dwivedi, Shri Janardan  
Fernandes, Shri Oscar  
Gill, Dr. M.S.  
Gupta, Shri Prem Chand  
Hariprasad, Shri B.K.  
Hashmi, Shri Parvez  
Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal  
Jinnah, Shri A.A.  
Jugul Kishore, Shri  
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar



Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi  
Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana  
Pande, Shri Avinash  
Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas  
Patel, Shri Ahmed  
Pathak, Shri Brajesh  
Patil, Smt. Rajani  
Rajan, Shri Ambeth  
Rajaram, Shri  
Ram Prakash, Dr.  
Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.  
Ramesh, Shri Jairam  
Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra  
Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha  
Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar  
Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen  
Ratna Bai, Smt. T.  
Ravi, Shri Vayalar  
Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami  
Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan  
Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi  
Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar  
Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad  
Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh  
Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver  
Sanjiv Kumar, Shri  
Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.  
Sharma, Shri Satish  
Shukla, Shri Rajeev  
Singh, Dr. Manmohan  
Singh, Shri Amar  
Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar  
Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain  
Singh, Shri Birender  
Singh, Shri Ishwar  
Singh, Shri N. K.  
Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad  
Singh, Shri Veer  
Soni, Smt. Ambika  
Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din  
Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi  
Syiem, Smt. Wansuk  
Tariq Anwar, Shri  
Thakur, Dr. Prabha  
Thangavelu, Shri S.  
Tiwari, Shri Alok  
Tiwari, Shri Shivanand  
Tripathi, Shri D.P.  
Tyagi, Shri K.C.  
Vasan, Shri G.K.  
Vora, Shri Motilal  
Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan  
Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 69 to 78) moved by Shri D. Raja to vote.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendments (Nos. 119 to 123) moved by Shri M.P. Achuthan to vote.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendment (Nos. 153 & 154) moved by Shri Baishnab Parida to vote.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 164-167) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal to vote.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal): Sir, I want a division.

MR. CHAIRMAN: On which one?

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE: On amendment No. 165.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Which clause?

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, Amendments (Nos. 165, 167, 168 and 169) are relating to Clause 2. I would suggest that all these four amendments can be taken together. One consists of an amendment to include other than foodgrains, sugar, cooking oil, etc.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Those amendments are already circulated. You don't need to read them again.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: I am making a proposal that would be easier for you and the whole House. Please understand. I am asking to take all these four amendments together for voting, instead of taking them separately. Listen to me, sometimes, at least, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Yechury, please keep quiet. No cross talking please.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sorry, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put amendment (No. 164) moved by Shri P. Rajeeve.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put amendment (No. 165) moved by Shri Prasanta Chatterjee to vote.

*The House divided.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes – 85

Noes – 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri



Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi  
Bachchan, Smt. Jaya  
Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh  
Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar  
Batra, Shri Shadi Lal  
Bhattacharya, Shri P.  
Bora, Shri Pankaj  
Budania, Shri Narendra  
Chavan, Smt. Vandana  
Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.  
Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka  
Daimary, Shri Biswajit  
Dalwai, Shri Hussain  
Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal  
Deora, Shri Murlu  
Dua, Shri H.K.  
Dwivedi, Shri Janardan  
Fernandes, Shri Oscar  
Gill, Dr. M.S.  
Gupta, Shri Prem Chand  
Hariprasad, Shri B.K.  
Hashmi, Shri Parvez  
Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal  
Jinnah, Shri A.A.  
Jugul Kishore, Shri  
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar  
Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.  
Karan Singh, Dr.  
Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh  
Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar  
Keishing, Shri Rishang  
Khabri, Shri Brijlal  
Khan, Shri K. Rahman  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali  
Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra  
Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina  
Krishna, Shri S.M.  
Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram  
Kujur, Shri Santiuse  
Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
Lachungpa, Shri Hishey  
Mahendra Prasad, Dr.  
Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh  
Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed  
Masood, Shri Rasheed  
Mayawati, Km.  
Misra, Shri Satish Chandra  
Mukut Mithi, Shri  
Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra  
Naik, Shri Shantaram  
Nanda, Shri Kiranmay  
Nandi Yellaiah, Shri  
Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish  
Shukla, Shri Rajeev  
Singh, Dr. Manmohan  
Singh, Shri Amar  
Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar  
Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain  
Singh, Shri Birender  
Singh, Shri Ishwar  
Singh, Shri N. K.  
Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad  
Singh, Shri Veer  
Soni, Smt. Ambika  
Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din  
Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi  
Syiem, Smt. Wansuk  
Tariq Anwar, Shri  
Thakur, Dr. Prabha  
Thangavelu, Shri S.  
Tiwari, Shri Alok  
Tiwari, Shri Shivanand  
Tripathi, Shri D.P.  
Tyagi, Shri K.C.  
Vasan, Shri G.K.  
Vora, Shri Motilal  
Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan  
Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal  
Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh  
Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the amendments (Nos. 166 to 168) moved by Shri P. Rajeeve to vote.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Clause 2 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 3, there are 38 amendments. Amendments (Nos. 6-8) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving the amendments?

**Clause 3 —Right to receive foodgrains at subsidized prices by persons belonging to eligible households under targeted public distribution system**

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments to only Clause 3(1). I move:

(6) That at page 3, *for* lines 19 to 22, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“3.(1) Every person belonging to priority households and households covered under Public Distribution System and Antyodaya Anna Yojana shall be entitled to receive seven kilograms of foodgrains per month per child, nine kilograms of foodgrains per month per adult, one and half kilograms of pulses, eight hundred grams of cooking oil and two hundred grams of iodized salt per person per month at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I.”

(7) That at page 3, lines 29 and 30, *for* the words “at prices as may be determined by the Central Government”, the words “at the prevailing prices at which the State charges from the eligible households” be *substituted*.

Sir, I want division. We want to improve the Bill. The Government is not willing accept that. What can we do? I seek division.

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, there are similar amendments.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, if there are other amendments similar to this, they can be taken up together...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, on the same Clause, there are amendments by other hon. Members.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We cannot reopen that exercise...*(Interruptions)*... We are following the procedure that has been followed in the House...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, on Clause 3(1), I have my amendments. Are you going to vote it twice?...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am asking you to dispose them all together...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, I cannot do it at this stage. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is a set procedure...*(Interruptions)*... I shall, now put the amendments (Nos. 6-8) moved by Shri Venkaiah Naidu to vote.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, there are some amendments by Dr. Maitreya, Shri Javadekar, D. Raja are same. So, instead of taking them up individually, why cannot we take them up for voting in one go?...*(Interruptions)*... I am asking the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Why is this confusion being created? There is a set practice of this House; we are following it.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Okay, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put the Amendments (Nos. 6 and 7) moved by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu to vote.

*The House Divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeev, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.



Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh  
Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar  
Ali, Shri Munquad  
Anand Sharma, Shri  
Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar  
Ansari, Shri Salim  
Antony, Shri A.K.  
Ashk Ali Tak, Shri  
Ashwani Kumar, Shri  
Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi  
Bachchan, Smt. Jaya  
Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh  
Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar  
Batra, Shri Shadi Lal  
Bhattacharya, Shri P.  
Bora, Shri Pankaj  
Budania, Shri Narendra  
Chavan, Smt. Vandana  
Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.  
Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka  
Daimary, Shri Biswajit  
Dalwai, Shri Husain  
Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal  
Deora, Shri Murli  
Dua, Shri H.K.  
Dwivedi, Shri Janardan  
Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we will now take up Amendments (Nos. 32 and 33) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you pressing?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR : Sir, I beg to move:

32. That at page 3, *for* lines 19 to 26, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“3.(1) Every person belonging to priority households and households covered under Public Distribution System and Antyodaya Anna Yojana shall be entitled to receive seven kilograms of foodgrains per month per child, nine kilograms of foodgrains per month per adult, one and half kilograms of pulses, eight hundred grams of cooking oil and two hundred grams of iodized salt per person per month at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I.”

33. That at page 3, *for* lines 35 and 36, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“sub-section (1) at subsidized prices shall extend to every citizen of India barring income tax payers and land owners having ten acres of irrigated land”.

Sir, Amendment No. 32 is okay. I am pressing for division on Amendment No. 33 because we are saying that the income tax payers and land-owners...(Interruptions)...I am pressing for division only on Amendment No. 33.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put Amendment (No. 32) moved by Shri Javadekar to vote.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put the Amendment (No. 33) moved by Shri Prakash Javadekar to vote.

*The House Divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes	:	85	
	Noes	:	119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh  
Gupta, Shri Vivek  
Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul  
Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.  
Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin  
Jaitley, Shri Arun  
Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal  
Javadekar, Shri Prakash  
Jha, Shri Prabhat  
Jois, Shri M. Rama  
Katiyar, Shri Vinay  
Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai  
Kore, Dr. Prabhakar  
Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh  
Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh  
Lakshmanan, Dr. R.  
Maitreya, Dr. V.  
Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.  
Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur  
Mathur, Shri Om Prakash  
Mitra, Dr. Chandan  
Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan  
Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash  
Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah  
Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas  
Narayanan, Shri C.P.  
O'Brien, Shri Derek



Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.  
Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep  
Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan  
Singh, Smt. Maya  
Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh  
Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap  
Sudharani, Smt. Gundu  
Tarun Vijay, Shri  
Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji  
Thakur, Dr. C.P.  
Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.  
Yadav, Shri Bhupender  
Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed  
Agrawal, Shri Naresh  
Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar  
Ali, Shri Munquad  
Anand Sharma, Shri  
Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar  
Ansari, Shri Salim  
Antony, Shri A.K.  
Ashk Ali Tak, Shri  
Ashwani Kumar, Shri  
Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi  
Bachchan, Smt. Jaya  
Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar  
Keishing, Shri Rishang  
Khabri, Shri Brijlal  
Khan, Shri K. Rahman  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali  
Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra  
Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina  
Krishna, Shri S.M.  
Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram  
Kujur, Shri Santiuse  
Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
Lachungpa, Shri Hishey  
Mahendra Prasad, Dr.  
Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh  
Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed  
Masood, Shri Rasheed  
Mayawati, Km.  
Misra, Shri Satish Chandra  
Mukut Mithi, Shri  
Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra  
Naik, Shri Shantaram  
Nanda, Shri Kiranmay  
Nandi Yellaiah, Shri  
Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi  
Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana  
Pande, Shri Avinash  
Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed  
Pathak, Shri Brajesh  
Patil, Smt. Rajani  
Rajan, Shri Ambeth  
Rajaram, Shri  
Ram Prakash, Dr.  
Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.  
Ramesh, Shri Jairam  
Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra  
Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha  
Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar  
Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen  
Ratna Bai, Smt. T.  
Ravi, Shri Vayalar  
Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami  
Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan  
Sachho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi  
Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar  
Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad  
Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh  
Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver  
Sanjiv Kumar, Shri  
Seelam, Shri Jesudasu  
Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.  
Sharma, Shri Satish  
Shukla, Shri Rajeev  
Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar  
Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar  
Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain  
Singh, Shri Birender  
Singh, Shri Ishwar  
Singh, Shri N. K.  
Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad  
Singh, Shri Veer  
Soni, Smt. Ambika  
Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din  
Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi  
Syiem, Smt. Wansuk  
Tariq Anwar, Shri  
Thakur, Dr. Prabha  
Thangavelu, Shri S.  
Tiwari, Shri Alok  
Tiwari, Shri Shivanand  
Tripathi, Shri D.P.  
Tyagi, Shri K.C.  
Vasan, Shri G.K.  
Vora, Shri Motilal  
Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan  
Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal  
Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh  
Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 47, 48 and 49) by Dr. V. Maitreyan. Are you moving these amendments?

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Yes, Sir. I move:-

47. That at page 3, lines 29 and 30, *for* the words “prices may be determined by the Central Government” the words “the existing prices for which the foodgrains are now being supplied” be *substituted*.

48. That at page 3, line 35, *for* the words “up to seventy-five per cent of the”, the words “to the entire” be *substituted*.

49. That at page 3, line 36, *for* the words “up to fifty per cent of the”, the words “to the entire” be *substituted*.

Sir, I press for division only on Amendment No. 47.

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. Dr. Maitreyan seeks division on Amendment No. 47.

I shall now put Amendment No. 47 moved by Dr. V. Maitreyan to vote.

*The House divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta  
Dave, Shri Anil Madhav  
Desai, Shri Anil  
Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand  
Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar  
Goud T., Shri Devender  
Goyal, Shri Piyush  
Gujral, Shri Naresh  
Gupta, Shri Vivek  
Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul  
Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.  
Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin  
Jaitley, Shri Arun  
Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal  
Javadekar, Shri Prakash  
Jha, Shri Prabhat  
Jois, Shri M. Rama  
Katiyar, Shri Vinay  
Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai  
Kore, Dr. Prabhakar  
Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh  
Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh  
Lakshmanan, Dr. R.  
Maitreya, Dr. V.  
Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.  
Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur  
Mathur, Shri Om Prakash



Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.  
Jugul Kishore, Shri  
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar  
Kanimozhi, Smt.  
Kannan, Shri P.  
Karan Singh, Dr.  
Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh  
Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar  
Keishing, Shri Rishang  
Khabri, Shri Brijlal  
Khan, Shri K. Rahman  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali  
Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra  
Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina  
Krishna, Shri S.M.  
Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram  
Kujur, Shri Santiuse  
Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
Lachungpa, Shri Hishey  
Mahendra Prasad, Dr.  
Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh  
Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed  
Masood, Shri Rasheed  
Mayawati, Km.  
Misra, Shri Satish Chandra  
Mukut Mithi, Shri  
Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put Amendments (Nos. 48 and 49) moved by Dr. Maitreyan to vote.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are four Amendments (Nos. 59 to 62) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal. Are you moving them?

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: No, Sir.

SHRI NARESH AGRAWAL: We are not moving them.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two amendments (No. 79 and 80) by Shri D. Raja.

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:-

79. That at page 3, *for* lines 19 to 22, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“3.(1) Every person who is a resident shall be entitled to receive ten kilograms of foodgrains per month per person, one and half kilograms of pulses per month per person and eight hundred grams of cooking oil per month person at subsidized prices specified in Schedule I from the State Government under the Public Distribution System, ensuring universal coverage and thereby making it universal.”

80. That at page 3, lines 35 and 36, *for* the words “up to seventy-five per cent. of the rural population and up to fifty per cent. of the urban population”, the words “to every resident of India” be *substituted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 124 to 127) by Shri M. P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN : Yes, Sir. I move:-

124. That at page 3, *for* lines 19 to 22, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

‘3. (1) “Every family shall be entitled to receive 35 kilograms of foodgrains to a family per month; 1.5 kilograms of pulses per month per person and 800 grams of cooking oil per month per person at subsidized prices specified in Schedule 1 from the State Government under the Universal Public Distribution System.”

125. That at page 3, lines 35 and 36, *for* the words “up to seventy-five per cent of the rural population and up to fifty per cent of the urban population” the words “to every resident of India” be *substituted*.

126. That at page 3, line 40, the words “Subject to such schemes as may be framed by the Central Government,” be *deleted*.

127. That at page 3, line 45, *for* the words “maternity benefit” the words “Universal and unconditional maternity benefit” be *substituted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment (No. 155) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Are you moving it?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA : Yes, Sir. I move:-

155. That at page 3, *for* lines 19 to 22, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“ 3.(1) Every person who is a resident shall be entitled to receive ten kilograms of foodgrains per person per month per adult, one and a half kilograms of pulses per month per person and eight hundred grams of cooking oil per person at subsidized prices specified in Scheduled I from the State Government under the Public Distribution System”.

Sir, I want division. It is a very serious issue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment (No. 155) moved by Shri Baishnab Parida to vote.



*The House divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85  
Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.  
Arjunan, Shri K. R.  
Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das  
Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad  
Balaganga, Shri N.  
Balagopal, Shri K.N  
Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.  
Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan  
Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi  
Bose, Shri Srinjoy  
Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal  
Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta  
Dave, Shri Anil Madhav  
Desai, Shri Anil  
Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand  
Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar  
Goud T., Shri Devender  
Goyal, Shri Piyush  
Gujral, Shri Naresh  
Gupta, Shri Vivek  
Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul  
Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.  
Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin  
Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.  
Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka  
Daimary, Shri Biswajit  
Dalwai, Shri Husain  
Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal  
Deora, Shri Murli  
Dua, Shri H.K.  
Dwivedi, Shri Janardan  
Fernandes, Shri Oscar  
Gill, Dr. MS.  
Gupta, Shri Prem Chand  
Hariprasad, Shri B.K.  
Hashmi, Shri Parvez  
Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal  
Jinnah, Shri A.A.  
Jugul Kishore, Shri  
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar  
Kanimozhi, Smt.  
Kannan, Shri P.  
Karan Singh, Dr.  
Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh  
Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar  
Keishing, Shri Rishang  
Khabri, Shri Brijlal  
Khan, Shri K. Rahman  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali  
Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two Amendments (Nos. 168 & 169) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : Sir, I move:

168. That at page 3, *for* lines 19 to 22, the following be *substituted* namely:-

3(1) Every person subject to sub-section (2) shall be entitled to seven kilograms of foodgrains, per person, per month or thirty five kilograms per household, whichever is higher and adequate quantity of sugar, pulses and cooking oil shall be supplied at controlled prices”.



169. That at page 3, for lines 35 and 36, for the words “upto seventy-five per cent of the rural population and upto fifty per cent of the urban population’ the words ‘the entire population of India with the exception of income tax payees”.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 202-204) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA (Odisha): Sir, I move:

202. That at page 3, line 20, *for* the words “five kilograms of foodgrains per person per month” the words “Seven kilograms of foodgrains per person per month or thirty five kilograms per household per month, whichever is higher and adequate quantities of pulses and cooking oil” be *substituted*.
203. That at page 3, *after* line 33 the following be *inserted* namely:-
- (1A) All destitute persons shall be entitled at least two meals every day, free of charge, in accordance with such scheme including cost sharing as may be prescribed by the Central Government.
  - (1B) All homeless persons shall be entitled to affordable meals at community kitchens, in accordance with such scheme including cost sharing as may be prescribed by the Central Government.
  - (1C) For households which consist of senior citizens as defined under the Maintenance of Parents and Senior Citizens Act 2007, the minimum entitlement shall be twenty five kilograms of foodgrain per household.
  - (1D) For individuals in any hostel or other institutions providing residential facilities to students belonging to Schedule Caste and Scheduled Tribes the entitlement shall not be less than twenty kilograms of foodgrains per person.
  - (1E) The State Government shall, if it is of the opinion that an emergency or disaster situation exists, provide to affected households, two meals, free of charge, for a period up to three

months from the date of disaster in accordance with such scheme including cost sharing as may be prescribed by the Central Government.

204 That at page 3, lines 35 and 36 *for* the words “up to seventy-five of the rural population and up to fifty percent of the urban population” the words “to all priority households” be *substituted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 221-223) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL : Sir, I move:

221. That at page 3, line 20, *for* the words “5 kilogram” the words “11 kilograms” be *substituted*.

222. That at page 3, *after* line 21, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“2 kilograms of Iodine Salt per household per month, 1.3 kilograms sugar per household per month, 2 kilograms gram per person per month and 2 kilograms dal per household per month”

223. That at page 3, line 25, *for* the words “thirty-five kilograms” the words “fifty-five kilograms” be *substituted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 232) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad. Mr. Prasad, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

*Clause 3 was added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 4 - Nutritional support to pregnant women and lactating mothers**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 4, there are eight amendments. Amendments (Nos. 9 & 10) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Mr. Naidu, are you pressing your amendments?

SHRI M. VENKALAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing my amendments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are three Amendments (Nos. 81-83) by Shri D. Raja. Mr. Raja, are you pressing your amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA: No, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two Amendments (Nos. 170 & 171) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Mr. Rajeeve, are you moving your amendments?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : Sir, I move:

170. That at page 3, line 40, the words “Subject to such schemes as may be framed by the Central Government”, be *deleted*.

171. That at page 3, line 45, *after* the words “Six-thousand” the words “provided by Central Government” be *inserted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Clause 4 was added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 5 – Nutritional support to children**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 5, there are nine amendments. Amendment (No. 34) is by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Mr. Javadekar, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (Nos. 84-85) by Shri D. Raja. Mr. Raja, are you pressing your amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am not pressing my amendments.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 128) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Mr. Achuthan, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 156) is by Shri Parida. Mr. Parida, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 172 to 174) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving your amendments?

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE : Sir, I move:

172. That at page 4, line 6, the word “exclusive” be *deleted*.

173. That at page 4, line 7, *after* the word “promoted”, the words “and the Government shall ensure crèche and other facilities for working mothers to make this possible” be *inserted*.

174. That at page 4, line 14, *after* the words “water and sanitation”, the words “for which the Central Government shall provide assistance” be *inserted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Clause 5 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 6, there are two amendments. Amendment (No.35) is by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving your amendment?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: I am not moving my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.129) is by Shri Achuthan. Are you moving your amendment?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not moving my amendment.

*Clause 6 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment for insertion of new Clause 6A. The Amendment (No.86) is by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA: I am not moving.

**Clause 7 - Implementation of schemes for realization of entitlements**

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are two amendments (Nos. 175 & 176) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE : Sir, I move:

175. That at page 4, line 21, the number “4” be *deleted*.

176. That at page 4, lines 21 and 22, *after* the words “cost sharing between the Central Government and the State Governments” the words “in consultation and agreement with State Governments” be *inserted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.199) by Shri N.K. Singh. He is not present.

*Clause 7 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment for insertion of new clause 7A, (No.177) by Shri Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: I am not moving.

**Clause 8 - Right to receive food security allowance in certain cases**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 8, there are 13 amendments. Amendment (No. 11) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving your Amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos.36 & 37) by Shri Javavedkar. Are you moving your amendments?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 87 & 88) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving your amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.130) by Shri Achuthan. Are you moving your amendment?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one amendment no. 162 by Shri M. Rama Jois. He is not present. Then, Amendment Nos. 200 and 201 by Shri N.K. Singh; not present. Amendment No. 216 by Shri Lalhming Liana; not present. Amendment No. 224 by Shri Piyush Goyal.

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL : Sir, I move:

224 That at page 4, Clause 8 be *deleted*.

Sir, I want division.

*The House divided.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85  
Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.  
Arjunan, Shri K. R.  
Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das  
Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad  
Balaganga, Shri N.  
Balagopal, Shri K.N  
Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.  
Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan  
Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi  
Bose, Shri Srinjoy  
Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal  
Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta  
Dave, Shri Anil Madhav  
Desai, Shri Anil  
Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand  
Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar  
Goud T., Shri Devender  
Goyal, Shri Piyush  
Gujral, Shri Naresh  
Gupta, Shri Vivek  
Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul  
Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.  
Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun  
Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal  
Javadekar, Shri Prakash  
Jha, Shri Prabhat  
Jois, Shri M. Rama  
Katiyar, Shri Vinay  
Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai  
Kore, Dr. Prabhakar  
Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh  
Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh  
Lakshmanan, Dr. R.  
Maitreya, Dr. V.  
Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.  
Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur  
Mathur, Shri Om Prakash  
Mitra, Dr. Chandan  
Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan  
Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash  
Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah  
Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas  
Narayanan, Shri C. P.  
O' Brien, Shri Derek  
Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj  
Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai  
Parida, Shri Baishnab  
Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh  
Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj  
Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash  
Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra  
Pradhan, Smt. Renubala  
Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar  
Punj, Shri Balbir  
Rai, Smt. Kusum  
Raja, Shri D.  
Rajeeve, Shri P.  
Rangarajan, Shri T.K.  
Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri  
Rathinavel, Shri T.  
Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar  
Raut, Shri Sanjay  
Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar  
Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap  
Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai  
Sai, Shri Nand Kumar  
Sancheti, Shri Ajay  
Seema, Dr. T.N.  
Shanta Kumar, Shri  
Sharma, Shri Raghunandan  
Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.  
Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep  
Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan  
Singh, Smt. Maya  
Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh



Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.  
Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.  
Ramesh, Shri Jairam  
Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra  
Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha  
Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar  
Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen  
Ratna Bai, Smt. T.  
Ravi, Shri Vayalar  
Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami  
Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan  
Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi  
Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar  
Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad  
Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh  
Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver  
Sanjiv Kumar, Shri  
Seelam, Shri Jesudasu  
Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.  
Sharma, Shri Satish  
Shukla, Shri Rajeev  
Singh, Dr. Manmohan  
Singh, Shri Amar  
Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar  
Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain  
Singh, Shri Birender  
Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (Nos. 233 and 234) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am not pressing, Sir.

*Clause 8 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up clause 9. There are 10 amendments. Amendment (Nos. 12 and 13) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendment (No. 38) by Shri Prakash Javadekar.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 63) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal.

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendment (Nos. 89 and 90) by Shri D. Raja.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 131) by Shri M.P. Achuthan.

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendment (No. 178) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal.

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 217) by Shri Lalhming Liana; not in the House. Then, there is one Amendment (No. 235) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am not moving.

*Clause 9 was added to the Bill.*

**Clause 10 – State Government to prepare Guidelines and to  
Identify Priority Households**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up clause 10. There are 12 Amendments. Amendment (No. 39) by Shri Prakash Javadekar.

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then, Amendments (Nos. 50 and 51) by Dr. V. Maitreyan.

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, I move:

50. That at page 4, lines 45 and 46, be *deleted*

51. That at page 5, lines 1 and 2, be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendments (Nos. 91 and 92) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving Mr. Raja?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I move:

91. That at page 4, *for* lines 37 to 46, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“10. (1) The State Government shall ensure the proactive identification of individuals, households, and groups living in starvation or in conditions akin to starvation and provide the relief as mentioned under this section.

(2) While making the said identification, the State Government shall enquire into the overall life situation of the persons, groups or communities living in starvation and the question whether the person group or community was continuously deprived of adequate food entitlements by the denial of entitlements under this act or otherwise for any reason whatsoever.

(3) Where the conditions of starvation are found to exist the State Government shall take corrective action to ensure that functioning of the food related schemes and the delivery of entitlements under this Act or any other Acts as may be necessary”.

92. That at page 5, lines 1 to 8, be *deleted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 132) by Shri Achuthan. Are you pressing Mr. Achuthan?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN: No, Sir. I am not pressing it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendments (Nos. 179 to 181) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving, Mr. Chatterjee?

SHRI PRASHANTA CHATERJEE : Yes, Sir. I move:

179. That at page 4, lines 45 and 46 be *deleted*.

180. That at page 5, lines 1 and 2 be *deleted*.

181. That at page 5, *for* lines 3 to 5, the following be *substituted*, namely:—

“Provided further that the State Government shall continue to receive the existing allocation of foodgrains from the Central Government under the present public distribution system and the Central Government shall supply the additional grain where the requirement under this Act exceeds the present allocation.”

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendments (Nos. 205 and 206) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving Mr. Mohapatra?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA : Yes, Sir. I move:

205. That at page 4, *for* lines 42 to 46 the following be *substituted* namely:—

“(b) The remaining households as priority households which shall include citizens with the exceptions of income tax payees to be covered under the Public Distribution System, wherein the cost of identification of households shall be borne by both the Central and the State Governments in such manner as may be prescribed.”

206. That at page 5, lines 1 to 5 be *deleted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 218) by Shri Liana. He is not present.

*Clause 10 was added to the Bill.*

**Clause 11 – Publication and display of list of eligible households**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 11 of the Bill. There is one Amendment (No. 93) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving, Mr. Raja?

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

93. That at page 5, *for* lines 9 and 10, the following be *substituted*, namely:—

“11.(1) If a person has died of starvation, the appropriate Government shall enquire whether such person was living in conditions of prolonged food deprivation for any reason whatsoever and shall not base its conclusion on the Post mortem report.



(2) If proved that the person has died of starvation, the household to which he or she belonged shall be provided with financial assistance under the National Family Benefit Scheme regardless of whether or not he or she was the primary breadwinner of the household.”

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 11 was added to the Bill.*

**New Clause 11A**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Insertion of new Clause 11A. There is one Amendment for insertion (No. 94) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving, Mr. Raja?

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

94. That at page 5, *after* line 11, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“11A.(1) The State Government shall within six months of the Act coming into force, establish, through a Code, the processes for investigating starvation and protocols for mandatory intervention by State authorities for relief, prevention and accountability that are in conformity with the provisions of this Act, to be known as the Starvation Protocol.

(2) The Protocol shall establish processes which shall be transparent, reliable and respectful of the dignity of all persons.

(3) The State Governments shall clearly designate authorities, at State, district and local levels, directly responsible for preventing starvation and starvation death.

(4) All persons, households, groups or communities living in conditions of starvation shall have the right to approach the District Grievance Redressal Officer for immediate relief under this section and the District Grievance Redressal Officer shall be bound to provide such relief”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

**Clause 12 – Reforms in targeted Public distribution system**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 12 of the Bill. There are 17 Amendments. Amendment (No. 14) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you pressing, Mr. Naidu?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 52) by Dr. Maitreyan. Are you moving, Dr. Maitreyan?

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, I move:

52. That at page 5, line 33, *after* the words “Central Government, the words “no such scheme shall be introduced without the concurrence of the State Government” be *inserted*.

Sir, I want division.

*The House divided.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes 119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.



Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negated.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are five Amendments (Nos. 95 to 99) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

95 That at page 5, lines 22 and 23 be *deleted*.

96 That at page 5, line 29, *for* the words “over a period of time”, the words “in a time bound manner” be *substituted*.

97 That at page 5, line 30, *after* the words “and grains banks”, the words “through special schemes implemented through bodies such as Panchayats, Self Help Groups, Cooperatives, NGOs, etc.” be *inserted*.

98 That at page 5, lines 31 to 33 be *deleted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negated.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There are six Amendments (Nos. 133 to 138) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN : Sir, I move the Amendments but I am not pressing for a division. Sir, I move:

(133) That at page 5, line 14, *after* the word “System” the words “converting it into Universal Public Distribution System” be *inserted*.

(134) That at page 5, line 17, *for* the word “Targeted” the word “Universal” be *substituted*.

(135) That at page 5, lines 22 and 23, be *deleted*.

(136) That at page 5, line 29, *for* the words “over a period of time” the words “in a time bound manner” be *substituted*.

(137) That at page 5, line 30, *after* the word “banks” the words “through special schemes implemented through bodies such as Panchayats, Self Help Groups, Co-operatives, Non-Government Organisations , etc.” be *inserted*.

(138) That at page 5, lines 31 to 33, be *deleted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.163) by Shri M. Rama Jois. Not present. Amendments (Nos. 182 and 183) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : This is on Aadhar and cash transfer, and I move the Amendments. Sir, I move:

182 That at page 5, lines 22 and 23 be *deleted*.

183 That at page 5, lines 31 to 33 be *deleted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.225) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving it?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: No, Sir.

*Clause 12 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, clause 13. There are two Amendments. Amendment (No. 100) by Shri D. Raja and Amendment (No.157) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Now, Amendment (No.100) by Shri D. Raja.

**Clause 13 – Women of eighteen years of age or above to be head of household for purpose of issue of ration cards**

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

(100) That at page 5, *after* line 42, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(3) All meals provided under this Act shall be prepared in a decentralized manner through local women or their collectives which include Self Help Groups, mothers’ committees and Mahila Mandals, to promote women’s livelihood and preference be given single women, disabled women, Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe women and women from minority communities”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.157) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Are you moving?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA : Sir, I move:

(157) That at page 5, *after* line 42, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“13A. All meals provided under this Act shall be prepared in a decentralized manner by local women or their collectives which include Self Help Groups (SHGs) mothers’ Committees and Mahila Mandals, to promote women’s livelihood and preference shall be given single women, disabled women, Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe women and women from minority communities”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 13 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Clause 14. There are three Amendments. Amendment (No.101) by Shri D. Raja, Amendment (No.139) by Shri M.P. Achuthan and Amendment (No.207) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra.

#### **Clause 14 – Internal Grievance Redressal Mechanism**

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

(101) That at page 5, *after* line 47, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) Each public authority responsible under this legislation shall publish:

- (i) a statement of obligations towards the citizens under this Act; and
- (ii) a statement that violation of any of the provisions of this statement, in any manner whatsoever, will constitute a grievance.

(3) The grievance redressal mechanism under this Act shall accept and support complaints being made and consequent procedures being carried out in accessible formats for the disabled like Braille, oral, e-text and sign language”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.139) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN : Sir, I move:

(139) That at page 5, *after* line 47 the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) Each public authority responsible under this Act shall publish a statement of obligations towards the citizens.

(3) Violation of any of the provisions of this Act, in any manner whatsoever, will constitute a grievance and

(4) The grievance redressal mechanism under this Act shall accept and support complaints being made and consequent procedures being carried out in accessible formats for the disabled like braile, oral, e-text and sign language.”

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (207) by Shri Rabi Narayan Mohapatra. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA: Sir, I move:

(207) That at page 5, *after* line 47 the following proviso be *inserted* namely:-

“Provided that the cost of setting up internal grievances redressal mechanism shall be borne by both the Central and the State Government in such manner as may be prescribed by the Central Government.”

The question was put and the motion was negatived.

Clause 14 was added to the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 15. There are two Amendments (Nos. 102 and 103) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving the amendments?

#### **Clause 15- District grievance redressal officer**

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

102. That at page 6, for lines 1 to 4, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“15.(1) The State Government shall appoint or designate, an officer to be the Grievance Redressal Officer, at panchayat/municipal level, block level and district level, for expeditious and effective redressal of

grievances of the aggrieved persons in matters relating to distribution of foodgrains or meals under Chapter II, and to enforce the entitlements under this Act.

(2) The Grievance Redressal Officers so appointed shall address the grievances within two weeks in an effective manner.

(3) The facilitation centres at the block and panchayat level register the grievances of aggrieved persons and forward them to the appropriate Grievance Redressal Officer”.

103. That at page 6, for lines 12 to 15, the following be *substituted*, namely:—

“(5) The officer referred to in sub-clause (1) shall have the following obligations and powers:

- (i) to hear complaints regarding non-distribution of entitled food grains or meals or matters related thereto;
- (ii) to conduct open court hearings, close to the location of the complainant; and
- (iii) to impose penalty and give compensation. The compensation shall be given in cash or kind as per the beneficiary’s choice and be five times the value of the entitlements the beneficiary was originally entitled to”.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 140-145) by Shri Achuthan. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

140. That at page 6, line 2, *after* the word “Officer” the words “and Grievance Redressal Officers at the Panchayat or Municipal level and the block level” be *inserted*.

141. That at page 6, line 5, *after* the word “Officer” the words “and Grievance Redressal Officers” be *inserted*.

142. That at page 6, line 8, *after* the word “Officer” the words “and Grievance Redressal Officers” be *inserted*.

143. That at page 6, line 10, *after* the word “Officer” the words “and Grievance Redressal Officers” be *inserted*.

144. That at page 6, *for* lines 14 and 15, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“action for the redressal within two weeks in an effective manner and in such manner as may be prescribed by the State Government.”

145. That at page 6, *after* line 20, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(8) Facilitation Centres at the block level shall be established to help aggrieved person to register their Grievances and forward them to the appropriate Grievance Redressal Officer.”

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No.(158) by Shri Baishnab Parida. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendment. I move:

158 That at page 6, for lines 1 to 4, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“15.(1) The State Government shall appoint or designate, an officer to be the Grievance Redressal Officer, at panchayat or municipal level, block level and district level for expeditious and effective redressal of grievances of the aggrieved persons in matters relating to distribution of foodgrains or meals under Chapter II of the Act, and to enforce the entitlements under this Act”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No.(219) by Shri Lalhming Liana. He is absent.

*Clause 15 was added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 16 – State Food Commission**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 16. Amendments (Nos. 64 and 65) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal. Are you moving the amendments?

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: We are not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 104 to 106) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

104. That at page 6, for lines 28 and 29, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

105. That at page 7, line 30, be *deleted*.

106. That at page 7, *after* line 39, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(11) The State Commission shall dispose of cases within two weeks and shall have the power to impose penalties and order for compensation as required under this Act.

(12) The members of the State Commission shall be subject to appraisal to ensure their eligibility to continue as members”.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 146 to 148) by Shri M. P. Achuthan. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

146. That at page 6, line 28, *after* the word “women” the words “and one person who is disabled,” be *inserted*.

147. That at page 7, line 30, the words “physically or” be *deleted*.

148. That at page 7, *after* line 39, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(11) The State Commission shall dispose of cases within two weeks and shall have the power to impose penalties and order for compensation as required.

(12) The members of the State commission shall be subject to appraisal to ensure their eligibility to continue as members.”

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Clause 16 was added to the Bill.*



**Clause 17-Salary and Allowances of Chairperson, Member, Member-Secretary  
and other Staff of State Commission**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Clause 17. Amendment No. (208) by Shri Rabi Narayan Mohapatra. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendment.  
I move:

208. That at page 7, line 40 *for* the words “The State Government” the words  
“Both the Central Government and the State Government” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 17 was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 18 to 21 were added to the Bill.*

**Clause 22 – Central Government to allocate required quantity of Foodgrains  
from Central pool to State Governments**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 22 there are eight amendments. Amendment (No. 15) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving it?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (40) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (66) by Prof. Ram Gopal Yadav and Shri Naresh Agrawal. Are you moving?

PROF. RAM GOPAL YADAV: Sir, we are not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment No. (107) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving it?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendment. I move:

107. That at page 9, line 3, *after* the word “provide”, the words “at least fifty  
per cent” be *inserted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 184-186) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chaterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : Yes, Sir. I am moving the amendments. I move:

(184) That at page 8, line 33, *after* the words and roman numeral “Schedule I” the words “Provided that the allocation is not less than being given at present” be *inserted*.

(185) That at page 8, lines 34 and 35 be *deleted*.

(186) That at page 9, line 3, for the words “provide assistance” the words “make financial allocations” be *substituted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 220) by Shri Liana. He is absent.

*Clause 22 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 23 there are three amendments. First, Amendment (No. 53) by Dr. V. Maitreyan. Are you moving?

**Clause 23 — Provision for Funds by Central Government to  
State Government in Certain Cases**

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, I move the following amendment and demand division:

(53) That at page 9, for lines 9 to 12, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“23. It shall be the responsibility of the Central Government to ensure the continuous supply of foodgrains from the Central pool to a State”.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall, now, put the amendment moved by Dr. Maitreyan to vote.

*The House Divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra



Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall, now, take up Amendment (No. 108) of Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

(108) That at page 9, *after* line 12, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) It shall be the primary responsibility of the Central Government to ensure the continuous supply of foodgrains to a State”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: We shall, now, take up Amendment (No. 187) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL (KERALA): Sir, I move:

(187) That at page 9, lines 9-10, *after* the words “Central

Government” the words “in consultation and agreement with State Governments in accordance with prevailing market prices” be *inserted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 23 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 24 there are four Amendments. Amendment (No. 16) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Not moving. Amendment (No. 41) by Shri Javadekar. Not moving. Amendment (No. 226) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Not moving. Amendment (No. 236) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad. Not moving.

*Clause 24 was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 25 and 26 were added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 27, there are two amendments. Amendment (No. 109) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

**Clause 27 – Disclosure of Records of Targeted Public Distribution System**

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:-

109. That at page 10, *after* line 16, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) The Short Messaging Service (SMS) alert systems shall be set up, by the State Government, or local authorities, through which complaints regarding the functioning of this legislation, including the non performance of duties by the concerned officials, might be submitted.

(3) The SMS services shall also be used to provide members of the public with information on funds and food grains allotted to particular ration shops, ICDS centres and schools, community kitchens etc.

(4) The telephone lines specifically for dealing with Public Distribution System -related enquiries or complaints shall be set up for the purpose of this Act.

(5) Every public authority shall, specifically in relation to information about the Public Distribution System, publish all such information”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 149) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving it?

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN : Yes, Sir. I move:-

149. That at page 10, *after* line 16, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) Short Messaging Service (SMS) alert systems shall be set up by the State Government, or local authorities, through which complaints

regarding the functioning of this legislation, including the non-performance of duties by the concerned official, shall be submitted.

(3) SMS services shall also be used to provide members of the public with information on funds and foodgrains allotted to particular ration shops, the Integrated Child Development Services centers and schools, community kitchens, etc.,

(4) Telephone lines especially for dealing with Public Distribution System- related enquiries or complaints shall be set up.”

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 27 was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 28 and 29 were added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 30, there are two Amendments (Nos.150 and 151) by Shri M. P. Achuthan. Are you moving these?

**Clause 30 – Food Security for People living in Remote,  
Hilly and Tribal Areas**

SHRI M. P. ACHUTHAN : Yes, Sir. I move:-

150. That at page 10, line 43, *after* the word “groups” the words “such as destitute and homeless persons” be *inserted*.

151. That at page 10, line 44, *after* the word “areas” the words “and for emergency feeding *after* some natural calamities” be *inserted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Clause 30 was added to the Bill.*

**Clause 31 – Steps to further Advance Food and Nutritional Security**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 31, there are eight amendments. Amendments (Nos. 17 and 18) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving them?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am not moving them, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 42) by Shri Javadekar. Are you moving it?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR : Yes, Sir. I move:-

42. That at page 11, *after* line 3, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) The Government shall buy all foodgrains that farmers offer to sell to it at statutory Minimum Support Price (MSP) through procurement centres open for every ten kilometers radius area and the MSP shall be calculated as per the recommendation of the National Farmers Commission (cost plus fifty per cent)”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 46) by Shri Naresh Gujral. Are you moving it?

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: I am not moving it, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 110 and 111) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving them?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I move:-

110. That at page 11, line 2, *for* the words “strives to progressively realise”, the words “ensure that all guidelines, policies, programmes and laws are in place towards and in accordance with the objectives specified in Schedule III” be *substituted*.

111. That at page 11, *after* line 3, the following proviso be *inserted*, namely:-

“Provided further that within one year from the date of commencement of this Act, all the relevant existing guidelines, policies in particular the industrial, agricultural and wage policies and laws shall be reviewed to ensure realization of the objectives specified in Schedule III of this Act.”

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 227 and 228) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: I am not moving, Sir.

*Clause 31 was added to the Bill.*

**11.00 P.M.**

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 112) for Insertion of New Clause 31A by Shri D. Raja.

**New Clause 31A**

SHRI D. RAJA : This is a very important issue, Sir. This is about MSP to farmers and about the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes.

Sir, I move:-

112. That at page 11, *after* line 3, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“31A. (1) The Government shall buy all the foodgrains that farmers offer to sell to it at statutory Minimum Support Prices (MSP) through procurement centres opened for every 10 kilometers radius area.

(2) All entitlements provided under this Act are universal, special efforts shall be made to ensure physical and social access to disabled persons, persons belonging to nomadic tribes, persons belonging to denotified tribes, persons belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, aged persons, and single women”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 32, there is one Amendment (No.188) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T. N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving it?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : Yes, Sir.

I move:-

188. That at page 11, line 10, the words “from its own resources” be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 32 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 33, there are three amendments. Amendment (No. 113) is by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

**Clause 33 – Penalties**

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

113. That at page 11, *after* line 14, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) Whoever on the ground of ‘untouchability’ or caste, gender, religion or race enforces against any person, any disability, restriction, exclusion or boycott with regard to,

(i) access to any Fair Price Shop, grain, meal, utensils or any place prescribed under this Act; and

(ii) access to or employment under any other provision or entitlement of the National Food Security Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment of a minimum of three months and a maximum of six months with a fine of a minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand, which shall be deductible from the person who has committed the offence.

*Explanation.* (1) For the purpose of this Act, place includes any shop, centre, facility or space where grain, meal or any entitlement;

(2) A person shall be deemed to boycott another person who refuses to let such other person or refuses to permit such other person to avail of entitlement or employment under this Act; and

(3) Enforcing disability includes the use of threat, intimidation, verbal abuse (referring to caste or general in nature), violence, humiliation and discrimination.

(3) Whoever, being a public servant willfully neglects his duties required to be performed by him under this Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than six months but which may extend to one year and a fine of minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand and the same shall be deductible from the person who has committed the offence and such offence shall be a cognizable and non-bailable as defined in the Indian Penal Code, 1860"

(4) Whoever, having already been convicted of an offence under this Chapter is convicted for the second offence or any offence subsequent to the second offence, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term



which shall not be less than one year but which may extend to the punishment provided for that offence and a fine of minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand and the same shall be deductible from the person who has committed the offence”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.152) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN : Sir, I move:

152. That at page 11, *after* line 14, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(2) Whoever on the ground of untouchability, caste, gender, religion or race enforces against any person, any disability, restriction, exclusion or boycott with regards to -

(i) access to any Fair Price Shops, grain, utensils or any place prescribed under the Act; and

(ii) access to or employment under any other provision or entitlement of the Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment of a minimum of three months and a maximum of six months with a fine of a minimum of Rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty thousand which will be deductible from the person who has committed the offence.

(3) Whoever, being a public servant wilfully neglects his duties required to be performed by him under this Act, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than six months but which may extend to one year and a fine of minimum of Rupees three thousand to a maximum of rupees twenty five thousand which will be deductible from the salary of the person who has committed the offence and such offence will be cognizable and non-bailable as defined in the Indian Penal code, 1860.

(4) Whoever, having already been convicted of any offence under this clause is convicted for the second offence or subsequent offence, shall be punishable with imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than one year and a fine of minimum of rupees three thousand to a maximum

of rupees twenty five thousand which will be deductible from the person who has committed the offence.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 209) is by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA : Sir, I move:

209. That at page 11, line 14 *for* the words “shall be liable to penalty not exceeding five thousand rupees” the words “and in case of destruction of any foodgrain meant for distribution under this Act, the Public Servant or authority found guilty shall be liable to pay a penalty of twenty five thousand of rupees or the market value of such foodgrains whichever is higher” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 33 was added to the Bill.*

*Clause 34 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 35, there is one Amendment (No. 210) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving?

**Clause 35 – Power to Delegate by Central Government and State Government**

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA : Sir, I move:

210. That at page 11, lines 29 to 36, be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 35 was added to the Bill.*

*Clause 36 was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 37, there is one Amendment (No. 189) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T.N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal. Are you moving?

**Clause 37 – Power to Amend schedules**

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL : Sir, I move:

189. That at page 11, line 41, *for* the words “by notification” the words “only with approval of Parliament” be *substituted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*Clause 37 was added to the Bill*

**Clause 38 – Power of Central Government to give Directions**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 38, there are five amendments. Amendment (No. 19) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu. Mr. Naidu, are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 54) by Dr. V. Maitreyan. Dr. Maitreyan, are you pressing your amendment?

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No. 56) by Shri Derek O’Brien.

SHRI DEREK O’BRIEN : Sir, I am pressing my amendment. This is a issue of federal structure, and I seek a division also. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the rights of the States should be protected, and we support his amendment.

SHRI DEREK O’BRIEN : Sir, I move:

56. That at page 11, clause 38, be *deleted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment moved by Shri Derek O’Brien to vote.

*The House divided.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N  
Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.  
Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan  
Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi  
Bose, Shri Srinjoy  
Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal  
Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta  
Dave, Shri Anil Madhav  
Desai, Shri Anil  
Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand  
Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar  
Goud T., Shri Devender  
Goyal, Shri Piyush  
Gujral, Shri Naresh  
Gupta, Shri Vivek  
Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul  
Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.  
Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin  
Jaitley, Shri Arun  
Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal  
Javadekar, Shri Prakash  
Jha, Shri Prabhat  
Jois, Shri M. Rama  
Katiyar, Shri Vinay  
Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai  
Kore, Dr. Prabhakar  
Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O'Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.  
Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri  
Rathinavel, Shri T.  
Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar  
Raut, Shri Sanjay  
Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar  
Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap  
Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai  
Sai, Shri Nand Kumar  
Sancheti, Shri Ajay  
Seema, Dr. T.N.  
Shanta Kumar, Shri  
Sharma, Shri Raghunandan  
Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.  
Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep  
Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan  
Singh, Smt. Maya  
Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh  
Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap  
Sudharani, Smt. Gundu  
Tarun Vijay, Shri  
Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji  
Thakur, Dr. C.P.  
Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.  
Yadav, Shri Bhupender  
Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P. Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.



Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh  
Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed  
Masood, Shri Rasheed  
Mayawati, Km.  
Misra, Shri Satish Chandra  
Mukut Mithi, Shri  
Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra  
Naik, Shri Shantaram  
Nanda, Shri Kiranmay  
Nandi Yellaiah, Shri  
Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi  
Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana  
Pande, Shri Avinash  
Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas  
Patel, Shri Ahmed  
Pathak, Shri Brajesh  
Patil, Smt. Rajani  
Rajan, Shri Ambeth  
Rajaram, Shri  
Ram Prakash, Dr.  
Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.  
Ramesh, Shri Jairam  
Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra  
Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha  
Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar  
Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen  
Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar  
Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami  
Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan  
Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi  
Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar  
Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad  
Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh  
Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver  
Sanjiv Kumar, Shri  
Seelam, Shri Jesudasu  
Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.  
Sharma, Shri Satish  
Shukla, Shri Rajeev  
Singh, Dr. Manmohan  
Singh, Shri Amar  
Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar  
Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain  
Singh, Shri Birender  
Singh, Shri Ishwar  
Singh, Shri N. K.  
Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad  
Singh, Shri Veer  
Soni, Smt. Ambika  
Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din  
Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi  
Syiem, Smt. Wansuk  
Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.114) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I move:

114. That at page 11, for lines 46 to 48, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

38. The Central Government, in consultation with State Governments, issue directions for the effective implementation of the provisions of the Act.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.159) by Shri Parida.

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Sir, my amendment is similar to Shri Derek O'Brien, so I am not pressing it.

*Clause 38 was added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 39 – Power of Central Government to make rules**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 39, there are five Amendments. Amendments (Nos. 115 & 116) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I move:

115. That at page 12, lines 9 to 13, be *deleted*.

116. That at page 12, *after* line 19, the following proviso be *inserted*, namely:-

Provided that none of the entitlements under this Act shall be reduced due to not contribution of the Central or State share.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.160) by Shri Parida. Are you moving the amendment?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendments (Nos. 190 & 191) by Shri Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee and Shri Balagopal. Are you moving the amendments?

SHRI K.N. BALAGOPAL : Sir, I move:

190. That at page 12, line 5, the words “cost sharing” be *deleted*.

191. That at page 12, lines 11 to 13, be *deleted*.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Clause 39 was added to the Bill.*

*Clauses 40 to 43 were added to the Bill.*

#### **Clause 44 - Force Majeure**

MR. CHAIRMAN: In Clause 44, there are seven amendments. Amendment (No.20) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu. Are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.43) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you pressing your amendment?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Sir, I am not pressing my amendment.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No.117) by Shri Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA : Yes, Sir. I move:

117. That at page 13, clause 44, be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.161) by Shri Parida. Are you moving?

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA : Yes, Sir. I move:

161. That at page 13, clause 44, be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.192) by Shri Rajeeve, Dr. Seema, Shri Chatterjee, Shri Balagopal. Are you moving?

SHRI P. RAJEEVE : Yes, Sir. I move:

192. That at page 13, lines 38-40, the words beginning with “flood” and ending with the words “under this act” be *deleted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 229) by Shri Piyush Goyal. Are you moving?

SHRI PIYUSH GOYAL: Sir, I am not moving.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 237) by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, I am moving because supply must be maintained during floods and drought also. I want division.

Sir, I move:

237. That at page 13, lines 38 and 39, the words “flood, drought” be *deleted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the amendment moved by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad to vote.

*The House divided.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85  
Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay



Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. M.S.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

*Clause 44 was added to the Bill.*

*Clause 45 was added to the Bill.*

#### **Schedule I – Subsidised prices under Targeted Public Distribution System**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Schedule-I of the Bill. There are eight amendments. There is one Amendment (No. 21) by Shri M. Venkaiah Naidu. Are you moving?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am not pressing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 44) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving?

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR : Sir, I move:

44. That at page 15, line 6, *after* the words “coarse grains”, the words “rupees five per kilograms for pulses, rupees ten per liter for edible oil and rupee one per kilogram for iodized salt” *inserted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 55) by Dr. V. Maitreyan.

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, I move:

55. That at page 15, for lines 4 to 11, the following be *substituted*, namely:-  
“Eligible households shall be entitled to foodgrains under section 3 at the subsidised price not exceeding rupees 3 per kg for rice, rupees 2 per kg for wheat and rupee 1 per kg for coarse grains”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, there are Amendments (Nos. 193 to 195) by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T. N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal.

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE : Sir, it should be Rs.2/- instead of Rs.3/-.

SHRI K. N. BALAGOPAL : Sir, it is very important. We want division.

Sir, I move:

193. That at page 15, line 5, for the figure and words “3 per kg. for rice” the words “2 per kg for rice” be *substituted*.  
194. That at page 15, line 6, for the words “three years” the words “at least ten years” be *substituted*.  
195. That page 15, line 6 to 11, the words beginning with “and there *after*” and ending with “as the case may be” be *deleted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the amendments moved by Shri P. Rajeeve, Dr. T. N. Seema, Shri Prasanta Chatterjee and Shri K.N. Balagopal to vote.

The House divided.

MR. CHAIRMAN Ayes : 85

Noes : 119

**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal



Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreyan, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya  
Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh  
Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar  
Batra, Shri Shadi Lal  
Bhattacharya, Shri P.  
Bora, Shri Pankaj  
Budania, Shri Narendra  
Chavan, Smt. Vandana  
Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.  
Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka  
Daimary, Shri Biswajit  
Dalwai, Shri Husain  
Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal  
Deora, Shri Murli  
Dua, Shri H.K.  
Dwivedi, Shri Janardan  
Fernandes, Shri Oscar  
Gill, Dr. M.S.  
Gupta, Shri Prem Chand  
Hariprasad, Shri B.K.  
Hashmi, Shri Parvez  
Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal  
Jinnah, Shri A.A.  
Jugul Kishore, Shri

Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar

Kanimozhi, Smt.

Kannan, Shri P.

Karan Singh, Dr.

Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh

Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar

Keishing, Shri Rishang

Khabri, Shri Brijlal

Khan, Shri K. Rahman

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali

Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra

Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina

Krishna, Shri S.M.

Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram

Kujur, Shri Santiuse

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Lachungpa, Shri Hishey

Mahendra Prasad, Dr.

Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh

Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed

Masood, Shri Rasheed

Mayawati, Km.

Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk

Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Amendment (No. 211) by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra. Are you moving the amendment, Mr. Mohapatra?

SHRI RABINARAYAN MOHAPATRA : Yes, Sir, and I want division. I move:

211. That at page 15, line 5 *for* the words and figure “rupees 3 per kg for rice, rupees 2 per kg for wheat” the words and figure “rupee 1 per kg for rice and rupee 1 per kg for wheat” be *substituted*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Amendment moved by Shri Rabinarayan Mohapatra to vote.

*The House divided*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ayes : 85

Noes : 119



**Ayes - 85**

Achuthan, Shri M.P.

Arjunan, Shri K. R.

Baidya, Smt. Jharna Das

Baishya, Shri Birendra Prasad

Balaganga, Shri N.

Balagopal, Shri K.N.

Bandyopadhyay, Shri D.

Behera, Shri Shashi Bhusan

Bernard, Shri A. W. Rabi

Bose, Shri Srinjoy

Chakraborty, Shri Shyamal

Chatterjee, Shri Prasanta

Dave, Shri Anil Madhav

Desai, Shri Anil

Gehlot, Shri Thaawar Chand

Ghosh, Shri Kunal Kumar

Goud T., Shri Devender

Goyal, Shri Piyush

Gujral, Shri Naresh

Gupta, Shri Vivek

Haque, Shri Md. Nadimul

Heptulla, Dr. Najma A.

Irani, Smt. Smriti Zubin

Jaitley, Shri Arun

Jangde, Dr. Bhushan Lal

Javadekar, Shri Prakash

Jha, Shri Prabhat

Jois, Shri M. Rama

Katiyar, Shri Vinay

Khanna, Shri Avinash Rai

Kore, Dr. Prabhakar

Koshyari, Shri Bhagat Singh

Kulaste, Shri Faggan Singh

Lakshmanan, Dr. R.

Maitreya, Dr. V.

Mandaviya, Shri Mansukh L.

Manjunatha, Shri Aayanur

Mathur, Shri Om Prakash

Mitra, Dr. Chandan

Mohapatra, Shri Rabinarayan

Nadda, Shri Jagat Prakash

Naidu, Shri M. Venkaiah

Naqvi, Shri Mukhtar Abbas

Narayanan, Shri C.P.

O' Brien, Shri Derek

Pandian, Shri Paul Manoj

Pandya, Shri Dilipbhai

Parida, Shri Baishnab

Parjapati, Shri Ranbir Singh

Parmar, Shri Bharatsinh Prabhatsinh

Patil, Shri Basawaraj

Pilania, Dr. Gyan Prakash

Pradhan, Shri Dharmendra

Pradhan, Smt. Renubala

Prasad, Shri Ravi Shankar

Punj, Shri Balbir

Rai, Smt. Kusum

Raja, Shri D.

Rajeeve, Shri P.

Rangarajan, Shri T.K.

Rangasayee Ramakrishna, Shri

Rathinavel, Shri T.

Raut, Dr. Bharatkumar

Raut, Shri Sanjay

Roy, Shri Sukhendu Sekhar

Rudy, Shri Rajiv Pratap

Rupala, Shri Parshottam Khodabhai

Sai, Shri Nand Kumar

Sancheti, Shri Ajay

Seema, Dr. T.N.

Shanta Kumar, Shri

Sharma, Shri Raghunandan

Singh Badnore, Shri V.P.

Singh, Dr. Kanwar Deep

Singh, Shri Jai Prakash Narayan

Singh, Smt. Maya

Solanki, Shri Kaptan Singh

Sood, Smt. Bimla Kashyap

Sudharani, Smt. Gundu

Tarun Vijay, Shri

Thakor, Shri Natuji Halaji

Thakur, Dr. C.P.

Vegad, Shri Shankarbhai N.

Yadav, Shri Bhupender

Yechury, Shri Sitaram

**Noes-119**

Adeeb, Shri Mohammed

Agrawal, Shri Naresh

Aiyar, Shri Mani Shankar

Ali, Shri Munquad

Anand Sharma, Shri

Ansari, Shri Ali Anwar

Ansari, Shri Salim

Antony, Shri A.K.

Ashk Ali Tak, Shri

Ashwani Kumar, Shri

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Bachchan, Smt. Jaya

Baghel, Prof. S.P.Singh

Balmuchu, Dr. Pradeep Kumar

Batra, Shri Shadi Lal

Bhattacharya, Shri P.

Bora, Shri Pankaj

Budania, Shri Narendra

Chavan, Smt. Vandana

Chiranjeevi, Dr. K.

Chowdhury, Smt. Renuka

Daimary, Shri Biswajit

Dalwai, Shri Husain

Darda, Shri Vijay Jawaharlal

Deora, Shri Murli

Dua, Shri H.K.

Dwivedi, Shri Janardan

Fernandes, Shri Oscar

Gill, Dr. MS.

Gupta, Shri Prem Chand

Hariprasad, Shri B.K.

Hashmi, Shri Parvez

Jain, Shri Ishwarlal Shankarlal

Jinnah, Shri A.A.

Jugul Kishore, Shri  
Kalita, Shri Bhubaneswar  
Kanimozhi, Smt.  
Kannan, Shri P.  
Karan Singh, Dr.  
Karimpuri, Shri Avtar Singh  
Kashyap, Shri Narendra Kumar  
Keishing, Shri Rishang  
Khabri, Shri Brijlal  
Khan, Shri K. Rahman  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ali  
Khuntia, Shri Rama Chandra  
Kidwai, Smt. Mohsina  
Krishna, Shri S.M.  
Kshatriya, Prof. Alka Balram  
Kujur, Shri Santiuse  
Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
Lachungpa, Shri Hishey  
Mahendra Prasad, Dr.  
Mahra, Shri Mahendra Singh  
Malihabadi, Shri Ahmad Saeed  
Masood, Shri Rasheed  
Mayawati, Km.  
Misra, Shri Satish Chandra

Mukut Mithi, Shri

Mungekar, Dr. Bhalchandra

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Nanda, Shri Kiranmay

Nandi Yellaiah, Shri

Natarajan, Smt. Jayanthi

Natchiappan, Dr. E.M. Sudarsana

Pande, Shri Avinash

Paswan, Shri Ram Vilas

Patel, Shri Ahmed

Pathak, Shri Brajesh

Patil, Smt. Rajani

Rajan, Shri Ambeth

Rajaram, Shri

Ram Prakash, Dr.

Ramalingam, Dr. K.P.

Ramesh, Shri Jairam

Rao, Dr. K.V.P. Ramachandra

Rao, Shri V. Hanumantha

Rapolu, Shri Ananda Bhaskar

Rashtrapal, Shri Praveen

Ratna Bai, Smt. T.

Ravi, Shri Vayalar

Reddy, Dr. T. Subbarami

Reddy, Shri Palvai Govardhan

Sadho, Dr. Vijaylaxmi

Sahani, Dr. Anil Kumar

Sahu, Shri Dhiraj Prasad

Saini, Shri Rajpal Singh

Saleem, Chaudhary Munavver

Sanjiv Kumar, Shri

Seelam, Shri Jesudasu

Selvaganapathi, Shri T.M.

Sharma, Shri Satish

Shukla, Shri Rajeev

Singh, Dr. Manmohan

Singh, Shri Amar

Singh, Shri Arvind Kumar

Singh, Shri Bashistha Narain

Singh, Shri Birender

Singh, Shri Ishwar

Singh, Shri N. K.

Singh, Shri Ramchandra Prasad

Singh, Shri Veer

Soni, Smt. Ambika

Soz, Prof. Saif-ud-Din

Stanley, Smt. Vasanthi

Syiem, Smt. Wansuk



Tariq Anwar, Shri

Thakur, Dr. Prabha

Thangavelu, Shri S.

Tiwari, Shri Alok

Tiwari, Shri Shivanand

Tripathi, Shri D.P.

Tyagi, Shri K.C.

Vasan, Shri G.K.

Vora, Shri Motilal

Waghmare, Dr. Janardhan

Yadav, Prof. Ram Gopal

Yadav, Shri Darshan Singh

Yadav, Shri Ram Kripal

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is one Amendment (No. 230) by Shri Piyush Goyal. He is not pressing.

*Schedule I was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Schedule II. There is one amendment (No. 231) by Shri Piyush Goyal. He is not pressing it.

*Schedule II was added to the Bill.*

### **Schedule III**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I shall now take up Schedule III. There are three Amendments; Amendments (Nos. 22 to 24) by Shri Venkaiah Naidu.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, these are the last Amendments about remunerative prices on the Swaminathan Commission's recommendation. I request the Government to accept these Amendment. The Minister has given a commitment,

but there is nothing specific here. That is why I have mentioned it. I appeal to them in the interest of the farmers, please accept these Amendments.  
... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naidu, are you moving the Amendments?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Sir, I move:-

22. That at page 17, line 10, *after* the words “remunerative prices”, the words “in accordance with the recommendations of the National Commission on Farmers and, in particular, with the method of fixation of Minimum Support Price at fifty per cent more than the weighted average cost of production” be *inserted*.

23. That at page 17, *after* line 12, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(e) linking rivers within ten years across the country in order to secure optimum utilisation of water for irrigation and drinking purposes in rural areas”.

24. That at page 17, *after* line 20, the following be *inserted*, namely:-

“(e) providing storage facilities through both public and private initiatives for the total requirement of foodgrains by the Centre from time to time and also providing godowns in every panchayat for storage of grains; and

(f) providing incentives for setting up of cold storage chains and also refrigeratory vans for farmers in every tehsil across the country”.

*The questions were put and the motions were negatived.*

*Schedule III was added to the Bill.*

*Schedule IV was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now clause 1. There is one Amendment (No.196) by Shri N.K. Singh. Not present.

*Clause 1 was added to the Bill.*

*The Enacting Formula was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now the Long Title. There are three Amendments, Amendment (No.25) by Shri Prakash Javadekar, Amendment (No.67) by Shri D. Raja

and Amendment (No.118) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Amendment (No.25) by Shri Prakash Javadekar. Are you moving?

**Long Title**

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR : Sir, I move:

(25) That at page 1, *for* the long title, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“A Bill to ensure public provisioning of food and related measures and to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring social, physical and economic access to adequate quantity of food at affordable prices to all eligible persons in the country, at all times to live a life with dignity in pursuance of article 21 of the Constitution of India”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.67) by Shri D. Raja. Are you moving?

SHRI D. RAJA : Sir, I move:

(67) That at page 1, *for* the long title, the following be *substituted*, namely:-

“A Bill to ensure public provisioning of food and related measures and to provide for food and nutritional security in human life cycle approach, by ensuring social, physical and economic access to adequate quantity of food at affordable prices to all persons in the country, at all times to live a life with dignity in pursuance of article 21 of the Constitution of India”.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Amendment (No.118) by Shri M.P. Achuthan. Are you moving?

SHRI M.P. ACHUTHAN : Sir, I move:

118 That at page 1, in the long title, *after* the words “by ensuring” the words “social, physical and economic” be *inserted*.

*The question was put and the motion was negatived.*

*The Long Title was added to the Bill.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now the Minister to move that the Bill be passed.

PROF. K.V. THOMAS: Sir, I move:

*That the Bill be passed.*

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will continue with the Special Mentions.  
Hon. Members may please lay their Special Mentions on the Table.

---

**SPECIAL MENTIONS – (Contd.)**

**Demand for proper implementation of the Integrated Action Plan for  
development of naxal affected districts in Bihar**

**श्री राम कृपाल यादव** (बिहार) : महोदय, बिहार राज्य के 11 जिले – मुंगेर, जमुई, अरवल, औरंगाबाद, गया, जहानाबाद, कैमूर, नवादा, पश्चिम चंपारण, रोहतास, सीतामढ़ी विशेष नक्सल प्रभावित जिले हैं जहां केंद्रीय सरकार द्वारा वर्ष 2013-14 के लिए एकीकृत कार्य योजना के तहत प्रत्येक जिले को 30 करोड़ रुपये जारी किए गए हैं। बिहार राज्य सरकार बिहार के इन उपरोक्त नक्सल प्रभावित जिलों के समन्वित विकास हेतु योजनाओं का चयन ठीक ढंग से नहीं करती जिसके कारण नक्सल क्षेत्र की जनजातीय व पिछड़ा बहुल क्षेत्र की बहुत बड़ी आबादी को जो लाभ मिलना चाहिए, वह लाभ नहीं मिल पा रहा है। जबकि एकीकृत कार्य योजना का मूल उद्देश्य जनजातीय व पिछड़ा बहुल आबादी का विकास कर के उसे राष्ट्र की मुख्य धारा में जोड़ना है।

महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से भारत सरकार से मांग करता हूँ कि उपरोक्त योजनाओं का लाभ वास्तविक लाभार्थियों तक पहुंचे, इसके लिए वह ठोस कार्यवाही करें। सरकार स्थानीय संसद सदस्यों के साथ विचार-विमर्श करके योजना का चयन करे। मैं ऐसी ठोस नीति-निर्देश बनाने की प्रक्रिया का पालन करने हेतु भी ठोस व कठोर कार्यवाही की अपेक्षा रखता हूँ ताकि बिहार राज्य के 11 अति नक्सल प्रभावित जिलों का समुचित विकास हो सके।

**Demand for mandatory attestation of documents by Gazetted officer or Notary  
Public for obtaining connections by mobile subscribers in the country**

**श्री मनसुख एल. मांडविया** (गुजरात) : महोदय, मोबाइल सिम कार्ड धारक व्यक्तियों के वेरिफिकेशन के बारे में सरकार नए प्रावधान लागू करने जा रही है, लेकिन अभी भी फर्जी