## RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 8th August, 2013/17 Sravana, 1935 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock, MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

## RE: PARLIAMENTARY BULLETIN PART-II, No. 51116, DATED WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 7, 2013 (VIOLATION OF RULES BY SOME MEMBERS)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU (Karnataka): Sir, I have an important issue to bring to your notice. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Questions. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, it is a matter about the House. ... (*Interruptions*)... Politely, I would like to know from the Chairman, what this practice is of naming Members and putting their names in the Bulletin?

Sir, I have been in the House for the last 13 years. I have seen Members entering the Well of the House, tearing away papers and snatching them away from the Minister on the Women's Reservation Bill. No such thing has been done earlier, but it has been done now because over the last two days, some Members have protested, that too, belonging to the main Opposition Party, the BJP. Why do we have this discrimination? Where is this procedure decided? Was it referred to the Rules Committee? I am unable to understand this.

Members are aggrieved by the actions of the Government, they are lodging protests, and we must all find some way of conducting the proceedings of the House. I do agree with you on that, Sir, but naming one party and showing discrimination is not acceptable at all. We denounce this totally. I have with me here the former Deputy Chairman who had been presiding over this House for a long period. You could know about it from her too. ...(Interruptions)...

On the Women's Reservation Bill, one Member from the Ruling Party had entered the Well and torn away the Bill. What did you do? We became helpless on such an important issue concerning 50 per cent of our population, the women, of this country. ...(Interruptions)... What is this practice? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, may I suggest something? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What is this practice? ...(Interruptions)... Who has suggested this? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Venkaiahji, may I suggest something? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Who has decided upon this? ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute...(Interruptions)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, it has never happened before. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I have all the respect for you. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute, please. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, it has never happened before. ... (Interruptions)... For more than 30 years, I have been a Member of this House. ... (Interruptions)... This has never happened. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just listen to me for a minute. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: With all respect to the Chair. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you, please, listen to me? ... (Interruptions)...

श्री थावर चन्द गहलोत (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, जब आसन्दी ने किसी का नाम नहीं लिया था, फिर ये बुलेटिन में कैसे आए? ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you, please, listen to me? ... (Interruptions)...

श्री पुरुषोत्तम खोडाभाई रूपाला (गुजरात): सर, यह कांग्रेस पार्टी का दफ्तर नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: There are no rules. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Will you, please, listen to me? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: No, Sir. We do not agree. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, listen to me. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, if you want to set a precedent, discuss it with leaders of all political parties...(Interruptions)... And let there be a common rule. ...(Interruptions)... Let there be a common rule for all the Members, particularly, the Ruling Party Members, who have disturbed the House a number of times. No such action was taken then, and all that was not mentioned by the Chair. If the Chair had named them or mentioned it in the House, I could understand.

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: There was no motion moved. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: No motion was moved. ...(Interruptions)... It is an insult, Sir. Also, it is discrimination against the main Opposition Party. It is an infringement on our rights. ...(Interruptions)... I feel sorry, Sir. I don't know whether it has happened with the knowledge of the Chairman or not. ...(Interruptions)... I don't know whether it has happened with the knowledge of the Chairman or not. ...(Interruptions)... We are for the peaceful conduct ...(Interruptions)... We want a peaceful conduct of the House. ...(Interruptions)... We have been saying that we would cooperate in the transaction of the Business. ...(Interruptions)... And we have been watching that it is the Congress Members who are obstructing the House and getting it adjourned on the issue of Telangana and Andhra Pradesh. ...(Interruptions)... It was the Congress Members on the issue of Andhra and Telangana. ...(Interruptions)... Their names were not taken. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI BHAGAT SINGH KOSHYARI (Uttarakhand): There are no common rules. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute.  $\dots$  (Interruptions)... Hon. Leader of the Opposition.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Bulletin which has been issued today carries the names of a large number of Members of the Opposition Benches, particularly, the TDP and the BJP.

Now, there have been incidents of expression of protest by several sections of the House. In fact, in the last three days, we have witnessed a Ruling Party Member menacingly marching towards another Member of the supporting party. We have seen a Member of the Ruling Party telling a Minister of the Ruling Party that once Telangana is formed, he will have to get out. Now, the object has been that the House can function peacefully and, therefore, these incidents are played down

rather than played up. But, if this is going to be mentioned in this manner, I would urge you to reconsider this and...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. May I request the hon. Leader of Opposition that, perhaps, we can discuss it in my Chamber? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PARSHOTTAM KHODABHAI RUPALA: No discussion ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI V. HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh): Two Members of this House. ...(Interruptions)...

श्रीमती माया सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश): मैं तो गई नहीं वैल में, फिर मेरा नाम क्यों है? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, you please tell the Secretariat to withdraw this. We will discuss it. We will come to your Chamber. We will discuss it and then we can move forward. Let there be a uniform policy for all.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will discuss it. ...(Interruptions)... Go back to your place so that we can go ahead. ...(Interruptions)... Question No. 61 ...(Interruptions)...

## ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

## Increase in budgetary support to Kerala

- \*61. DR.T. N SEEMA: Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:
- (a) whether the gross budgetary support by the Centre for Kerala has increased substantially compared to the previous Five Year Plan, if so the details thereof:
- (b) whether Government has reviewed the implementation of various social welfare schemes in Kerala during the last three years and the current year, if so the details thereof;
- (c) whether many social welfare schemes in Kerala aimed for the welfare of poor have failed in achieving the present targets;
  - (d) if so, the details thereof; and