

OBSERVATION BY THE CHAIR

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, Report of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of telecom ...(Interruptions)... Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. NAJMA A. HEPTULLA (Madhya Pradesh) : Sir, I have a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Former Deputy Chairman is raising a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (Bihar) : Sir, I have a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me listen to the point of order. ...(Interruptions)... I am ready to listen to that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : I have a point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am allowing the point of order. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, यह बचाने की कोशिश की गई है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह बहुत ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am allowing it. Let me listen to it. No, no. ...(Interruptions)... आप लोग बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... All of you take your seats. ...(Interruptions)... I will handle it. ...(Interruptions)...

डॉ. नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला : सर, इन्हें बैठाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, इन्हें बैठाइए। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु (कर्नाटक) : सर, उनको बैठाइए। ...(व्यवधान)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu) : Sir, first of all, whatever Shri Ananda Bhaskar has said should not go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I only mentioned the subject. Now listen to me. ...(Interruptions)... After mentioning the subject, I called Hon. Member for point of order because he raised it. ...(Interruptions)... Let me anyhow listen to the point of order. ...(Interruptions)... Let me listen to the point of order. ...(Interruptions)... Please take your seat. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Shantaram Naik, please take your seat. ...(Interruptions)... You leave it to me. ...(Interruptions)... Please take your seat. ...(Interruptions)... Hon. Members, it is the right of a Member to raise a point of order. That is what I am allowing. ...(Interruptions)... Leave it to me. ...(Interruptions)... I am allowing the point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, my point of order is under article 105 of the Constitution read with Rule 258 of the Rules. Under article 105, I have got the right to raise any matter of importance including my freedom to administer a note of dissent. I was a Member of JPC. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have given a strong dissent note. ...*(Interruptions)*... Those really responsible for corruption of Rs . 1,76,000 crore have been left out. ...*(Interruptions)*... Evidence has been ignored. ...*(Interruptions)*... It's a *Report. It is a * Report. ...*(Interruptions)*... This Report should not be allowed to be presented on the floor of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... We strongly object to it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Those who, were guilty have been saved. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Okay. You have made your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Therefore, I request you not to allow this Report to be tabled. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You made your point. Now, Hon. LoP. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY) : Sir, on what my learned colleague, Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad, has said, we invite a ruling from the Chair. Under the powers to correct a note of dissent which is submitted by Members of this House, can the Chairman of any Committee just delete unparliamentary words, correct language or can he alter the substance of that dissent note? If he alters the substance, the Chairman is guilty of breach of privilege. ...*(Interruptions)*... Therefore, I invite a ruling from the Chair. The substance of the dissent note given by Members of this House has been altered by the Chairman. Please give us a ruling whether this is permissible or not. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, it is a matter of privilege. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is only a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, allow me. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on the point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, I want to react on the issues raised by Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad and the Hon. LoP. ...*(Interruptions)*... I want to give my ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am requesting you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. LoP has certainly raised a valid point regarding the contents of the Report but the Chair is unable to make any comment on that ...*(Interruptions)*... because the Chair has not seen the Report and the Chair does not know what is the contents of the Report. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, my dissent note has been ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Hon. Members, before I call Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu/Shri Satish Chandra Misra to lay the Report and Minutes of the ...*(Interruptions)*... Please ...*(Interruptions)*... You have not raised a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... I only allowed a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, I cannot. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... Ruling is final. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... Before I call Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu/Shri Satish Chandra Misra to lay the Report and Minutes of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of Telecom Licences and Spectrum, as mentioned in today's Revised List of Business. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would like to inform the House that I have received a communication from Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad wherein he has sought my permission to raise certain objections in regard to violation of certain rules during the deliberations in the Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*... In this connection, I would like to refer to the terms of reference contained in the Motion to constitute the Joint Committee, which was adopted by this House on the 1st of March, 2011. ...*(Interruptions)*... One of the terms of reference was that the Joint Committee shall lay a Report to the House ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no provision in the Rules, which permits discussion or raising of objections before laying of a Report which has been duly adopted by a Joint Parliamentary Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*...

I am, therefore, not inclined to allow any debate at this stage of laying of the Report of the Joint Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu to lay the Report.

...*(Interruptions)*...

**REPORT OF THE JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE TO EXAMINE
MATTERS RELATING TO ALLOCATION AND PRICING OF TELECOM
LICENSES AND SPECTRUM**

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Andhra Pradesh) : Sir, I beg to lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the *Report and *Minutes of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of Telecom Licences and Spectrum.

...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House is adjourned to meet at 2.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at twelve minutes past twelve of the clock.

*The Report and Minutes were presented to the Speaker, Lok Sabha on 29th October, 2013 and to the Chairman, Rajya Sabha on the same date.