

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Hon. Members, before I call Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu/Shri Satish Chandra Misra to lay the Report and Minutes of the ...*(Interruptions)*... Please ...*(Interruptions)*... You have not raised a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... I only allowed a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, I cannot. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... Ruling is final. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion on ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... Before I call Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu/Shri Satish Chandra Misra to lay the Report and Minutes of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of Telecom Licences and Spectrum, as mentioned in today's Revised List of Business. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would like to inform the House that I have received a communication from Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad wherein he has sought my permission to raise certain objections in regard to violation of certain rules during the deliberations in the Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*... In this connection, I would like to refer to the terms of reference contained in the Motion to constitute the Joint Committee, which was adopted by this House on the 1st of March, 2011. ...*(Interruptions)*... One of the terms of reference was that the Joint Committee shall lay a Report to the House ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no provision in the Rules, which permits discussion or raising of objections before laying of a Report which has been duly adopted by a Joint Parliamentary Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*...

I am, therefore, not inclined to allow any debate at this stage of laying of the Report of the Joint Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu to lay the Report.

...*(Interruptions)*...

**REPORT OF THE JOINT PARLIAMENTARY COMMITTEE TO EXAMINE
MATTERS RELATING TO ALLOCATION AND PRICING OF TELECOM
LICENSES AND SPECTRUM**

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Andhra Pradesh) : Sir, I beg to lay on the Table, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the *Report and *Minutes of the Joint Parliamentary Committee to examine matters relating to allocation and pricing of Telecom Licences and Spectrum.

...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House is adjourned to meet at 2.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at twelve minutes past twelve of the clock.

*The Report and Minutes were presented to the Speaker, Lok Sabha on 29th October, 2013 and to the Chairman, Rajya Sabha on the same date.

The House reassembled at two of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu) : Sir, what happened in the morning
...(Interruptions)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद (बिहार) : सर, मैंने रूलिंग मांगी थी। Sir, how can my dissent note be edited? ...(Interruptions)... We have never asked for discussion. मैंने और अरुण जेटली जी ने कहा था कि हमारे डिसेंट नोट को जेपीसी में कैसे एडिट कर दिया गया। हमने उस पर रूलिंग मांगी, लेकिन आपने कह दिया, I will not allow discussion. We did not ask for discussion. ...(Interruptions)... That is not fair. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have heard you. Now let me say
...(Interruptions)...

श्री थावर चन्द गहलोत (मध्य प्रदेश) : सर, प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर पर पहले से रूलिंग तैयार हो, क्या ऐसा पहले कभी हुआ है? ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have heard you. Now let me say
...(Interruptions)... See, there are two things. Number one is there was a point of order. Hon. LoP and you said why ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. Let me react to him. I have heard him. The first thing is that you raised a point that in the Report your dissent has been amended or edited. ...(Interruptions)... Just a minute. You said that. Hon. LoP also raised the same point and wanted a ruling from me. What I said is, if I am correct—you can go through the record—what has been raised by Hon. LoP is a valid point. But, however, I am not able to give a ruling because I have not seen the contents; the contents as to whether edited or not edited. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, it is my right as a Member of the JPC
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not completed. ...(Interruptions)... I have not completed. Let me complete. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, give the ruling now. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not completed. Let me complete.
...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, give the ruling now. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me finish. ...(Interruptions)... Let me finish.
...(Interruptions)... Let me finish. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, are you giving the ruling now? ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let me finish. ...(*Interruptions*)... Let me finish. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, are you giving the ruling now? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRASANTA CHATTERJEE (West Bengal) : Sir, you could have postponed it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The second point is, when I read out the ruling, that was in response to a written letter given by the Hon. Deputy Leader, Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad. He has given a written letter to the Chairman and what I read out was in response to that letter. That is the procedure. That is over. ...(*Interruptions*)... Whatever I said is the ruling. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, you give the ruling now. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is over. ...(*Interruptions*)... Whatever I said is the ruling.

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, आपने मेरे प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर पर रूलिंग नहीं दी।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Whatever I said is the ruling there. You see that ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, you said that ...(*Interruptions*)... it will not be allowed to be discussed, but you allowed the Report to be tabled. It is a great violation of my right. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no rule for discussion. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : My dissent note has been deleted. ...(*Interruptions*)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, now you give your ruling. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no rule for discussion before presenting a Report. ...(*Interruptions*)... There is no rule. What can I do? I am bound by the rules.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : I was agitated about my right, Sir. My right as a Member to allow ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I had allowed your point of order.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : But, Sir, you did not give a ruling at all. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : My ruling was that I am not able to comment on your comments because I have not seen the Report.

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Sir, you give your ruling now. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is over. I gave the ruling. That is over. I cannot ...(*Interruptions*)... That is over. He can raise new points.

DR. V. MAITREYAN : Then this House ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Hon. Members, the Report is before you. If you want a discussion, send a notice. You can send a notice. There is no problem. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Sir, as the Hon. Deputy Chairman presiding, you are the custodian of the House and also of the dignity of the Members.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I tried to honour that.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : Apart from being a Deputy Leader, I was a Member of the JPC. For the first time, the dissent note in a JPC Report has been amended in material particular, not simple English or anything.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You can give notice. There is no problem.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : I am only saying my dissent note ought to have been allowed to be a part of that Report. That is what I am saying. Therefore, my right has been violated. I seek the protection of ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : In the Rule Book, there is a procedure for that. You raise it as per that procedure. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD : No, Sir.

DR. V. MAITREYAN : We want justice. ...(*Interruptions*)...

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE NATIONAL BOARD FOR MICRO,
SMALL AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES**

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF MICRO, SMALL AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES (SHRI K.H. MUNIYAPPA) : Sir, I move the following Motion:—

“That in pursuance of clause (d) of sub-section (3) of Section 3 of the Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises Development Act, 2006 (No. 27 of 2006),