

## RAJYA SABHA

*Thursday, the 7th August, 2014/16th Sravana, 1936 (Saka)*

*The House met at eleven of the clock,*

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

### RE. DEMAND FOR DISCUSSION ON FDI IN RAILWAYS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 421 ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, we have given a notice. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, FDI is being introduced in Railways. ....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please allow the Question Hour. ....(*Interruptions*)... This is not the time for it. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, FDI cannot be allowed in Railways. It is a serious issue, and it should be discussed. It is not in the national interest. ....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is not the time for it. ....(*Interruptions*)... Please allow the Question Hour to proceed. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, last night, there was a Cabinet meeting. ....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please allow the Question Hour. ....(*Interruptions*)... Please allow the Question Hour. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, the hon. Prime Minister is also sitting here. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, this is a serious matter. You just give a ruling that you will permit it in the Zero Hour. ....(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You raise a discussion on it. But you can't do it during the Question Hour ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, there is already a notice on it. ....(*Interruptions*)... Sir, a notice is there. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, there is a notice. ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, a notice is there. So, we want you to, at least, say that you will allow this to be discussed at 12 o'clock.

MR. CHAIRMAN: If there is a notice for a discussion or a Calling Attention, it will be examined ....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, it is a notice for suspension of the Question Hour and discussion ....(*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, will it be taken up in the Zero Hour? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, there is a notice ....(*Interruptions*)... No, Sir; there is a notice. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am afraid, suspension of Question Hour is not the way out, if you wish a discussion. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you can take it up in the Zero Hour as the first item ....(*Interruptions*).... Sir, you take up it in the Zero hour.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the Parliament is in session. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: If it is a Zero Hour notice, then, it will be taken up. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, the Parliament is in session and the Government is making. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You can decide, Sir. ...(*Interruptions*)...

Sir, you have the right to decide. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. O'Brien, please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you have the right to decide. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अली अनवर अंसारी (बिहार): सर, यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister, do you want to say something? ...(*Interruptions*)... Let us hear the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. ...(*Interruptions*)... The Minister for Parliamentary Affairs, please. One minute; one minute. ...(*Interruptions*)... Let us hear the Minister.

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT; THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION; AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU): Hon. Chairman, Sir, the entire House, and particularly the senior Members are all well aware of the rules. If somebody is agitated on some issue, there is a way for it. They can give a notice to the hon. Chairman, and if the hon. Chairman permits it, we can discuss it at an appropriate time. This is number one.

The second thing is, nothing new is done. These things were there in the Budget Speech of the Finance Minister. It was discussed in the House, and the House has passed the Budget. And, if they still feel that there is something more to be discussed, let the hon. Members give the notice, and let the Chair...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the notice has been given.

श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु: भाई प्लीज ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: सुन लीजिए... सुन लीजिए! ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The notice has to be given; the notice has to be studied by the Chairman, and the Chairman has to even ask the Government also whether they are ready or not, and then the Chairman decides and we are ready to cooperate with the Opposition. Sir, my suggestion is. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sitaramji, one minute, please.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, may I suggest one thing?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the Minister finish.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: One minute, please. I have to work in both the Houses, that is why sometimes I am not here. My appeal is, let the Members, whoever is agitated on any issue, give an appropriate notice and take up the matter after the Question Hour, so that we can have the Question Hour. We should not deprive the other Members also of their right to ask questions, and the Ministers are making preparations. ...*(Interruptions)*... If you don't want, don't waste the time of the Government. ...*(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE (Maharashtra): Sir, we want the Question Hour.

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, they should let the Question Hour to run. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, may I make one point?

MR. CHAIRMAN: One at a time ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I have to make a point. What I am suggesting is, we heard the hon. Minister, and a notice has been given by my colleague for suspension of the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: Every day they are disrupting the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Now, it is under your jurisdiction and your domain and you take a decision on that notice. If you are not going to permit suspension of the Question Hour, then, what I would suggest is, you please give a ruling that this will be the first issue in the Zero Hour, and we can discuss this. ...*(Interruptions)*... We will discuss it after the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, we value the Minister's appeal. The question Hour should not be disturbed. So, please let the Question Hour go on, and immediately after the Question Hour, take this up as the first issue ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: One more thing only. There is a notice given for suspension of Question Hour. Even for the UPSC issue it was said. Now it is said that there will be an all- party meeting. So, this cannot be a pause, Parliament cannot be used as a pause

button only. They have to be serious: Number two, we may differ on other issues with Mr. Yechury, but we have also given a notice for Zero Hour. If you want Question Hour to be run, then bring this up. Parliament ran up to 6.45. At 7 O'clock when Parliament is running, media agencies are carrying reports and the parliamentarians are getting breaking news. Why come to Parliament, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let it be replied. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, it is not your time. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down please.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, the FDI in railways was distinctively mentioned in the Rail Budget, FDI in Defence was mentioned in the Union Budget. Both during the discussions on the Rail Budget and the Union Budget and the Finance Bill, this House has discussed it. So, there is no occasion for anybody to say that we heard it for the first time from the media. What this House has already approved in the Budget, the formal decision had to be formalised by the Cabinet, which has been done. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have given a Zero Hour notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... It will be considered there ....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: Sir, when the House is running, the Bill is in the Lok Sabha, ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute ....*(Interruptions)*... We have given a notice for suspension of Question Hour. On UPSC it was the same thing done. All we are saying is that at 12 o'clock during the Zero Hour ...*(Interruptions)*... This is a matter which concerns many Members. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute. There is an FDI in Insurance Bill hanging fire here. That is the reality. ...*(Interruptions)*... So, why this backdoor? ...*(Interruptions)*... So, let us discuss at 12 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have given a Zero Hour notice and you will get a chance. That is settled. ...*(Interruptions)*... You will get your chance during Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: After Zero Hour, it should be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: We had a four days discussion on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री सभापति:** शरद जी, आप क्या कह रहे हैं, बताइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... बैठ जाइए, बैठ जाइए। शरद जी, आप बताइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री शरद यादव (बिहार):** चेयरमैन सर, मैं एक बात कहना चाहता हूँ। जो मामला उठाया गया है, जैसा आप कह रहे हैं, 12 बजे के बाद इस पर बहस करा दीजिए, लेकिन एक और बहुत महत्वपूर्ण मामला है। यूपीएससी के बच्चों की जो मांग थी, उसके संबंध में मैंने आपके सामने नोटिस भी दिया है।

**श्री सभापति:** वह तो कल डिस्कस हो चुका है।

**श्री शरद यादव:** नहीं, डिस्कस नहीं हुआ। रूलिंग पार्टी की तरफ से आया है कि हम ऑल पार्टी मीटिंग बुलाएंगे। उन्होंने categorically कहा है कि 24 तारीख का एग्जाम जरूर होगा। सर, CSAT में अकेले एक language का मामला नहीं था। जो Civil Services Aptitude Test है...

**श्री सभापति:** वह आप कह चुके हैं।

**श्री शरद यादव:** उसे हटाने का मामला है। सरकार इसमें डिले करना चाहती है। आज लाखों-करोड़ों बच्चे इस एग्जाम से बाहर हो रहे हैं, इसलिए इसको आप बहस से अलग मत करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री सभापति:** ठीक है। धन्यवाद।

**श्री शरद यादव:** सरकार को आज ही मीटिंग बुलानी चाहिए ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज ही मीटिंग बुलाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... तभी उसमें कोई ताकत आएगी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज ही इस पर मीटिंग बुलाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, what I suggest is that you give a ruling that after the Question Hour both these issues will be taken up.

MR. CHAIRMAN: How will both be taken up at the same time?

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: One after the other.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Then what happens to the rest of the agreed agenda? ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the agenda will follow. We sat till 7 o'clock yesterday. ...**(Interruptions)**... We sat till 7 o'clock yesterday.

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी:** लाखों बच्चों का सवाल है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उन पर मुकदमे हो रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN : One minute. ...**(Interruptions)**... Sit down.

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी:** पूरे देश में आंदोलन हो रहे हैं, उन पर मुकदमे हो रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Please sit down.

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी:** उन पर लाठीचार्ज हो रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह पूरे देश का मामला है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हमारे जो स्टूडेंट्स हैं, वे रोज लाठी खा रहे हैं। ये बच्चे कल आईएएस बनेंगे, आईपीएस बनेंगे ...**(व्यवधान)**... पूरे देश में उन पर मुकदमे हो रहे हैं, उन पर लाठीचार्ज हो रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह लाखों बच्चों की जिंदगी का सवाल है।

**श्री सभापति:** बैठ जाइए। आप मंत्री जी को सुन लीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... बैठ जाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अंसारी जी, बैठ जाइए।

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sitaramji and Sharadji both are very senior and seasoned Members. My plea to them is that this issue was discussed in the House, a statement was made, clarifications were sought and then again for the second time, it

was raised and then it was discussed in the Chamber of the hon. Chairman also. The Government has made a fervent appeal saying the examination is very close. It is coming on 24th. Let us not disturb the minds of the students. Let us focus on the examination. ...*(Interruptions)*... प्लीज़, आप सुनिए। आप बाद में बोलिएगा। मेरी बात का खंडन करना है, तो बाद में चेयरमैन साहब की अनुमति लेकर बोलिए। इसमें मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। Please try to cooperate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please continue.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, our view is there are both sides of arguments we have seen in this House and I have seen in the other House also -- about the so-called CSAT examination. The Government, in its corrective wisdom, after hearing the Members, have taken some stand. That is to be approved by the Union Public Service Commission. I also understand its implications. Some people have come with some new ideas saying this exam should be held in the regional languages also like Tamil, Telugu, Kannada. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM (Andhra Pradesh): These are not regional languages. These are Indian languages. ...*(Interruptions)*... These are not regional languages. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : You have been a Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

You have been a Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: What is the point of order in the Question Hour, Mr. Seelam?

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: No, no. The point of order is ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no point of order ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: These are not regional languages; these are Indian languages. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU : Please, please, you have been a Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... I understand 'Indian languages' 'भारतीय भाषा' ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not understanding the consequences. ...*(Interruptions)*... My point is भारतीय भाषा चाहिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... अंग्रेजी चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी:** अंग्रेजी कहां हटाई जा रही है? ...(व्यवधान)... सीसैट से सेकेंड पेपर को हटाने की मांग की जा रही है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** आप बैठ जाइए! ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी:** अंग्रेजी कहां हटाई जा रही है? ...(व्यवधान)... सीसैट से सेकेंड पेपर को हटाने की मांग की जा रही है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु:** सर, इसलिए मैं कोई viewpoint नहीं दे रहा हूं। मेरी विनती यह है कि ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: The Government can't do that. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let the Minister speak. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI (Madhya Pradesh): Heaven will not fall, I assure you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Okay. As the hon. Members are saying, even if English is removed, Heaven is not going to fall. That is one argument. ...(Interruptions)...

AN HON. MEMBERS: No, no; we are not saying. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: He said it. ...(Interruptions)... He said it. ...(Interruptions)... मेरी विनती यह है कि ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री अली अनवर अंसारी:** यह लड़ाई भाषाओं के बीच की नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: ... this requires a deep study, a proper discussion among political parties, and also the people connected with that. ...(Interruptions)... That is why the Government has come out with a suggestion. ...(Interruptions)... Please, please. ...(Interruptions)... They don't want a solution. ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री सभापति:** आप बैठ जाइए! ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, after the Session, the Government is willing to discuss with all the Members concerned, who are interested, and try to evolve a consensus ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री सभापति:** आप बैठ जाइए! ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: .....and try to evolve a common approach for the future examinations. ...(Interruptions)... As far as this year is concerned, there is no scope for postponing or cancellation of the examination at this stage. ...(Interruptions)... Let the hon. Members understand this. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: May I please request everybody to allow the Question Hour to proceed? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (West Bengal): Sir, I have only two short points to submit. As the hon. Leader of the House has stated, it is true that both, the FDIs in Railways and Defence, were discussed along with the Railway Budget and the General Budget. But there was no structured discussion on FDI in Railways and FDI in Defence. So, we would like to have an assurance from the Government that this would be discussed immediately after the Question Hour, so that the Members can express their views.

MR. CHAIRMAN: How can it be discussed immediately after the Question Hour?

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, there is also a notice for that. Because this happened last time. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just give us an assurance because this FDI. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is a difference between ...*(Interruptions)*... सतीश जी, आप बोलिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सतीश चन्द्र मिश्रा (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, hon. minister ने अभी कहा और कल स्टेटमेंट भी दिया कि इस मामले में ऑल पार्टी मीटिंग बुलाएंगे। इसके लिए हम उन्हें बधाई देते हैं कि आपने यह डिसिजन लिया, लेकिन हमारी पार्टी की आपसे यह भी रिक्वेस्ट है कि इस संवेदनशील मुद्दे को देखते हुए, जिस तरह से लड़के सड़कों पर बैठे हुए हैं, लाठियां खा रहे हैं, जेल में बंद हैं, आप इसमें ऑल पार्टी मीटिंग को डिले क्यों कर रहे हैं? आप इसके बारे में मीटिंग कल बुला लीजिए, परसों बुला लीजिए। इसके पहले भी बैठकें हुई हैं जब भी कोई ऐसा मुद्दा हुआ, तो ऑल पार्टी मीटिंग 24 घंटे में बुलाई गई है और निर्णय हुआ है। मेरा सरकार से सिर्फ इतना अनुरोध है कि इसको खत्म करने के लिए आप ऑल पार्टी मीटिंग तुरंत बुला लीजिए। आप इसमें डिले मत करिए।

श्री सभापति: आप यह बात ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Mr. Chairman, Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no; I am not having a debate on this.

श्री के.सी. त्यागी (बिहार): सभापति महोदय ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: त्यागी जी, आप बैठ जाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Tyagiji, please sit down. I want to proceed with the Question Hour; Question 421.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, please give an assurance that after the Question Hour, you will take up the matters that have been raised. One is the question of the FDI and the other is the question of ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are taking up Zero Hour. His notice for Zero Hour on this subject is there. So, what is the difficulty? ...*(Interruptions)*...



SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, there is also a notice for suspension of Question Hour ...(Interruptions)... You have to rule on that, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am afraid, I cannot take a positive view on that. Question Hour will not be suspended because that is our practice. ...(Interruptions)... Questions are important ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Okay. Then you rule that you will allow this as the first item in the Zero Hour.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I cannot change the order arbitrarily. ...(Interruptions)... There is an agreed order of business. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you have the authority as the Chairman, and to make the House run in an amicable manner you can cut corners ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do I do with the agreed business as late as this morning at 10.30? ...(Interruptions)... There was an agreement on it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: That will continue. ...(Interruptions)... That will continue. ...(Interruptions)... We sat till 7 o'clock yesterday, Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव** (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, मैं एक मिनट में यह कहना चाहता हूँ ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री विजय गोयल** (राजस्थान): बहुत महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न हैं...(व्यवधान)... ये लोग हर रोज हाउस को डिस्टर्ब करते रहते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव**: आज माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी यहां संयोग से बैठे हुए हैं और लाखों लड़के आज सड़कों पर हैं। जैसा कि शरद जी ने कहा है कि सीसैट का केवल दूसरा पेपर खत्म कर दिया जाए, तो इसका सॉल्यूशन हो जाएगा। यहां कहीं अंग्रेजी और इंडियन लैंग्वेज के conflict का मामला नहीं है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति**: राम गोपाल जी, कल इस विषय पर काफी बहस हो चुकी है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव**: 24 तारीख से इम्तिहान हो रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)... मीटिंग का क्या मतलब है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति**: देखिए. ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री विजय गोयल**: हमें लोगों की समस्याएं उठानी हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The house is adjourned for 15 minutes.

*The House then adjourned at seventeen minutes past eleven of the clock.*