

"That in pursuance of clause (d) of sub-section (4) of Section 4 of the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority Act, 1985 (No. 2 of 1986), read with Rule 3 of the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority Rules, 1986, this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct, one Member from amongst the Members of the House, to be a member of the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority.

*The question was put and the motion was adopted.*

#### RE. DEMAND FOR DISCUSSION ON PRIVILEGE MOTION

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY (Gujarat): Sir, it is Zero Hour. ...*Interruptions...* I should be given a chance. ...*Interruptions...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, no; not all of you. ...*Interruptions...* One of you, please. ...*Interruptions...* Your whip is standing. So, let others take their seats. ...*Interruptions...*

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, I have given the notice. ...*Interruptions...*

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी** (मध्य प्रदेश): सर, मैं आप से यह अनुरोध करना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे कई सदस्यों ने प्रिविलेज मोशन मूव किया है। उस मोशन पर अभी आप यहां चर्चा नहीं करा रहे हैं, लेकिन जीरो ऑवर में उन लोगों को अपनी बात कहने का मौका दिया जाए।

**श्री उपसभापति:** बैठिए। आप ने जीरो ऑवर में जो नोटिस दिया है, उसे चेयरमैन ने देखा है और चेयरमैन साहब ने जो एडमिट किया है, मैं उसे परमीशन दूंगा। I will read it out.

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** जो प्रिविलेज मोशन दिया गया है, उन लोगों को मौका तो दीजिए, कम से कम वे अपनी बात तो कह सकें।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. You have made your point. आप बैठिए। You tell me what you want. ...*Interruptions...* Please tell me what you want. ...*Interruptions...* What is the subject? ...*Interruptions...*

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, it is the question of privilege. ...*Interruptions...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That has already been raised. ...*Interruptions...*

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, please listen to us ...*Interruptions...* You just can't overrule it. ...*Interruptions...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will come to that. ...*Interruptions...* Please take your seat. ...*Interruptions...* Regarding the question of privilege, as I understand, hon. Chairman has said in this House during the Question Hour that it is under his consideration. Therefore, that question cannot be taken up here.

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: But you have to listen to us.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. That is something on which hon. Chairman has given a ruling. ...*Interruptions*... I cannot allow it.

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: Sir, the Rule says that if twenty-five Members stand up, you have to admit it. ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow it. ...*Interruptions*... If hon. Chairman has given a ruling on something, I cannot allow a discussion on that. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: But you have to admit it if twenty-five Mmembers stand up. ...*Interruptions*... You just can't go on and \* it. ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Chairman has said that he will give a ruling. ...*Interruptions*... Wait for the ruling. ...*Interruptions*... You have to wait for the ruling of hon. Chairman. ...*Interruptions*... You wait for the ruling. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: The Minister of Railways must resign. ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mistry, I have to go by the Rules. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: You can listen to it in the Zero Hour. ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am taking up Zero Hour. ...*Interruptions*... Please take you seat. Those who have given notices and the subjects which have been permitted by the Chairman will be allowed. But regarding the privilege motion, hon. Chairma has already given a ruling that it is under his consideration. So, I cannot allow it. ...*Interruptions*... Nothing will go on record. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He said that he is examining it. ... He said that he is examining it. I know that he said so. ...*Interruptions*... It is on record. ...*Interruptions*... Wait for the ruling of hon. Chairman. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mistry, you are a senior Member. ...*Interruptions*... Mr. Mistry, wait for the ruling of the hon. Chairman. ...*Interruptions*... You wait for the ruling of hon. Chairman. ...*Interruptions*... Please wait for the ruling of hon. Chairman. ...*Interruptions*... Mr. Mistry, you are a senior Member. May be you are here for the first time, but you were a Member of the Lok Sabha also. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY : \*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You will get an opportunity. ...*Interruptions*... No. ...*Interruptions*... आप बैठिए। Please take your seat. ...*Interruptions*... Please take your seat. Wait for the ruling of hon. Chairman. ...*Interruptions*...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, चेयरमैन साहब इसके ऊपर विचार कर रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हमारा कहना यह है कि चेयरमैन साहब विचार करें, उसके पहले इस सदन के सदस्यों की क्या राय है, वह भी तो सुन लीजिए और तभी उसके ऊपर विचार हो सकता है।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. ...*Interruptions*... That is not permitted under the Rules. ...*Interruptions*...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** सर, जीरो ऑवर में इनको एक अवसर दे दिया जाए।

**श्री उपसभापति:** नहीं, जीरो ऑवर के लिए सेपरेट नोटिस चाहिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जीरो ऑवर के लिए आप नोटिस दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: If the motion is under the consideration of hon. Chairman, then why should Members not be given a chance to express their views?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. ...*Interruptions*... That is not allowed. No discussion on that. ...*Interruptions*... Give a separate notice for Zero Hour. ...*Interruptions*... You give notice for Zero Hour. ...*Interruptions*... Now we shall take up matters to be raised with the permission ...*Interruptions*... Zero Hour. ...*Interruptions*... Shri Tapan Kumar Sen. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, please ensure order in the House. ...*Interruptions*... Please allow me to speak. ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You wait for hon. Chairman's ruling. ...*Interruptions*... Wait for hon. Chairman's ruling. ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: How can I speak? ...*Interruptions*... Sir, please ask them to sit down. ...*Interruptions*... Sir, what is going on? ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You all take your seats. ...*Interruptions*... What is this? ...*Interruptions*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, please bring the House in order. ...*Interruptions*... What is going on? ...*Interruptions*... There must be order in the House. ...*Interruptions*...

**श्री मधुसूदन मिश्री:** सर, यह पूंजीपतियों की सरकार है ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह पूंजीपतियों की सरकार है, जिसके अंदर यह किया जा रहा है। पूंजीपतियों की यह सरकार नहीं चलेगी। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mistry, I am on my legs. ...*Interruptions*... At least, listen to me. ...*Interruptions*... You should know the basic rule. ...*Interruptions*... Please sit down. ...*Interruptions*... बैठिए, मित्रा जी, बैठिए... आप बैठिए। Hon. Members, I did not deny any opportunity to you. In the morning, the issue was raised and the hon.

Chairman has given a ruling that he is looking into that issue of privilege. Because the Chairman has given such a ruling, it is not within my right, I have no authority, to allow a discussion on that. ...*Interruptions*... Please sit down, ...*Interruptions*... आप बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... This is indiscipline. Sit down, ...*Interruptions*... I am on my legs. You please sit down. ...*Interruptions*... You can very well go to the chamber and meet the hon. Chairman. But, after the Chairman has given a ruling on that, I am not going to allow it. ...*Interruptions*... Nothing will go on record on that, ...*Interruptions*... Now, Shri Tapan Kumar Sen. ...*Interruptions*... बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... Why are you preventing others? ...*Interruptions*... There are important mentions. ...*Interruptions*... Why are you preventing others? ...*Interruptions*... I can't allow this. ...*Interruptions*... Why do you do like this? ...*Interruptions*... This is indiscipline. ...*Interruptions*...

**प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** उनका बोलने तो दीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, चेयर की रूलिंग कुछ भी हो सकती है, लेकिन उनको मेंशन करने से थोड़े ही रोका जा सकता है।

**श्री उपसभापति :** उन्होंने मेंशन किया, उसी समय चेयरमैन साहब ने रूलिंग दी। ...*(व्यवधान)*... उसी समय चेयरमैन साहब ने रूलिंग दी। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** उपसभापति जी, सुबह जब इस मसले पर हमने नोटिस की बात कही, तो केवल यह कहा कि हमने अमुक विषय पर एक नोटिस दिया है, सस्पेंशन ऑफ क्वेश्चन ऑवर का और प्रिविलेज का। इतना हमने मेंशन किया, इसके बाद चेयरमैन साहब ने कहा कि ठीक है, मैं इस पर विचार करता हूँ। ठीक है? इस मसले के ऊपर हमारा क्या कथन है, हम हाउस में कुछ नहीं कह पाए। हम केवल इतना चाह रहे हैं कि जिन मेम्बर्स ने नोटिस दिया है, वे कम से कम इतना तो बता सकें कि जो प्रिविलेज का नोटिस दिया है, वह विषय है क्या? वह विषय तो सुन लीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... उसके बाद फिर आप जो फैसला करना चाहें, करें पर आप वह विषय सुन तो लीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... वह विषय क्या है, उसको सुन तो लीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, there are two privilege notices. ...*Interruptions*... We also gave one. ...*Interruptions*...

**श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी:** इसलिए मैंने कहा कि जीरो ऑवर में उनको विषय के बारे में अपनी बात कहने अवसर दे दीजिए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is the point. आप बैठिए...बैठिए। You made a very relevant point. I understood that, but that is exactly what I saying. ...*Interruptions*... Because this is a matter which you raised before the hon. Chairman and the Chairman said that he would consider that or examine that, whatever may be the wording, I cannot give a ruling on that. ...*Interruptions*... Please. ...*Interruptions*... आप सुनिए...सुनिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठ जाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश) :** डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, किस नियम में लिखा है कि चेयरमैन की रूलिंग ...*(व्यवधान)*... किस नियम में लिखा हुआ है कि रूलिंग के बाद ...*(व्यवधान)*... You can listen. ...*Interruptions*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will tell you. ...*Interruptions...* जो मेरा रीज़न है ...*(व्यवधान)*... सुनिए... मैं बताऊंगा। The reason is that I cannot give a ruling over the Chairman's ruling. I cannot give a different ruling. Then, why should I listen to that? Then, why should I waste the time? ...*Interruptions...* If I cannot say anything, why should I listen to that? .. Why do I waste the time? ...*Interruptions...*

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: किस नियम में लिखा हुआ है? ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह किस रूल में लिखा हुआ है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, you cannot give any other ruling. the Chairman has given a ruling. All that they are asking is that they be allowed to mention the issues. ...*Interruptions...* We do not know what the issue is. But we know the ruling of the Chairman.

DR. V. MAITREYAN (Tamil Nadu): I would like to know the precedent. In the UPA Government period, we gave a notice for breach of privilege. But we were never allowed to speak on that. I want a ruling on that also. ...*Interruptions...* I gave a notice for the breach of privilege when the same issue was raised. ...*Interruptions...*

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव: वह टाइम बार्ड होता है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, let us take up Zero Hour first. ...*Interruptions...* The Law Minister wants to speak ...*Interruptions...* Listen to the Law Minister. ...*Interruptions...* I have called the Law Minister.

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY; AND THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): Sir, my submission is very simple. I have been a Member of this House for the last 14 years; and had been a Member of the other House also. The well settled precedents which have been followed in this House say that whenever an issue of privilege is raised, the matter goes before the Chairman and subsequently to the Committee on Privileges. the content is not allowed to be raised. I have also moved many privilege issues. If in one case, exception is being sought to be made, then, it will become a rule. Therefor, kindly take a call. The well settled precedent of this House has been that a privilege issue is not allowed to be raised. Once it is approved by the hon. Chairman, it goes to the Committee on Privileges. Therefor, I think, it is an issue to be considered by you. ...*Interruptions...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In any case, it is a matter under the consideration of the hon. Chairman. Therefore, neither am I going to give a ruling nor am I going to allow it. I am going to allow Zero Hour submissions with permission. ...*Interruptions...*

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : What is your point of order?

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, इन्होंने दो नोटिस दिए। एक नोटिस रूल 267 के अंतर्गत दिया और दूसरा प्रिविलेज का दिया। प्रिविलेज पर चेयरमैन साहब रूलिंग दे गए कि वे एग्जामिन कर रहे हैं, लेकिन 267 तो स्टैंड कर रहा है। अगर दो नोटिस हैं तो 267 पर उन्हें सुना जाए। उनको 267 पर क्यों नहीं सुना जा रहा है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** 267 क्या है? वह तो सस्पेंशन का है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** तमाम बार 267 आया है और उसको सुना गया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** वह तो सस्पेंशन का है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... वह हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** फिर इनको 267 पर क्यों नहीं सुना जा रहा है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** वह तो सस्पेंशन का है, वह हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** कहां हो गया? उस पर कोई जवाब नहीं आया, उस पर कोई रूलिंग नहीं है। उस पर कोई रूलिंग कहाँ आयी है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** वह मेरा काम नहीं है, 11 बजे करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** उस पर कोई रूलिंग नहीं आयी। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** रूलिंग कैसे आएगी? वह तो खत्म हो गया।

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** उसको चेयर ने रिजेक्ट नहीं किया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** वह हो चुका है। अब रूलिंग कैसे दे सकते हैं?

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** आप प्रोसीडिंग निकाल लीजिए। चेयरमैन साहब ने रिजेक्ट ही नहीं किया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप पूरी प्रोसीडिंग निकाल लीजिए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please cooperate. Mr. Tapan Kumar Sen wants to raise a very important issue. ...*Interruptions*... Only what Mr. Tapan Kumar Sen says will go on record. ...*Interruptions*...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल:** आप उनको सुन तो लीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Nothing will go on record except what Mr. Tapan Kumar Sen says.

#### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

##### **Situation arising out of closure of tea gardens, jute mills and major industrial units affecting lakhs of workers**

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, with you permission, I would like to raise the precarious situation ...*Interruptions*... Sir, this is an issue which can't be raised in the din. ...*Interruptions*... How can I raise this issue in this