

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yechuryji, I am not allowing this discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing this discussion. See, Mr. Naresh Agrawal, if you feel that the Government has violated any norm or direction or any propriety, you can give a notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can give a notice. I do not want to comment on the basis on newspaper report. That is all. Let us take up further discussion on the working of Ministry of Home Affairs. Shri H.K. Dua to start discussion. Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Rajasthan): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, just one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have called his name. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

#### RE. CLARIFICATIONS ON INDIA'S STAND IN THE W.T.O.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Rajasthan): Sir, earlier in the morning, we raised an issue during the Question Hour and we gave the notices. The Leader of the House had said that they stood by the statement made by the hon. Minister of Commerce and Industry. There has been a confusion created because of what the Prime Minister has said when both the Houses of the Parliament are in Session. We do appreciate Mr. Arun Jaitley saying that the Government is willing to discuss it. We would also like to place the truth on record because we cannot allow a situation that both the Houses being in Session, the Prime Minister of the country trying to belittle and misinform...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This issue was raised in the morning. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, this has to be discussed. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, Sir. You have to fix time and discuss it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING; THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT, FORESTS AND CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR): Sir, an item which has already been discussed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: A ruling is there. ...*(Interruptions)*...

जिस पर चेयरमैन साहब ने रूलिंग दी है, उस पर आप कैसे बोल रहे हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*... जिस पर चेयरमैन साहब ने रूलिंग दी है, उस पर फिर कैसे चर्चा होगी? ...*(व्यवधान)*... चेयरमैन साहब ने इस पर रूलिंग दी है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Anand Sharma, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, the Government has agreed to discuss this. We want to know...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not now.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I am not saying 'now'. I did not say 'now'.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What discussion? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Because the Prime Minister alone can clarify ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has given the ruling.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, the Prime Minister alone can clarify. This is my submission. Nobody should take offence. When we discuss, let the Prime Minister come. We will ask him the questions.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. You have made your point.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Not just 'okay', Sir. We want ...*(Interruptions)*... a clear ruling on that since the Leader of the House has said that they are willing to discuss this.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen ...*(Interruptions)*... I believe ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I believe this matter was raised during the Question Hour and the hon. Chairman has given a ruling. Whatever is that ruling, we will go by that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That's all ...*(Interruptions)*.. No, no ...*(Interruptions)*... Why do you interrupt? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, only one minute.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What do you want to say?

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, my request to the Chair is that the Leader of the House has agreed to have a discussion on an issue where the Prime Minister has made disparaging remarks against the earlier Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: No. ...*(Interruptions)*... Absolutely not. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: This has to be explained ...*(Interruptions)*... by no one else but the Prime Minister himself. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA (Himachal Pradesh): Sir, the Leader of the House has ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: Mr. Deputy Chairman, I request you not to allow this ...*(Interruptions)*... They are discussing the ruling again. They should not do this. Already, the matter has been settled. Now, there should be no discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can't cast aspersions on the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, my request ...*(Interruptions)*... The date should be decided as soon as possible. We would like the hon. Prime Minister to come in the House ...*(Interruptions)*... and explain why he has said what he said, contradicting his own Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through the ruling of the hon. Chairman and we will go accordingly. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Shri H.K. Dua. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: There is no ruling. We want a ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no ruling on the Prime Minister to come and explain about his statement and the contradictions because you cannot expect ...*(Interruptions)*... We have the transcripts. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: We have the transcripts of hon. Prime Minister's speech where he has levelled charges against the earlier Government and the hon. Minister had categorically said in her statement that the Government of India has not deviated from the earlier Government's stand. So, now this is a very serious issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: It has to come from the Prime Minister himself.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But Mr. Digvijayaji, I think, the Leader of the House has given a statement in the House on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... That ends the matter. Isn't it? ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the House has given a statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... The concerned Minister is here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: We are grateful to the Leader of the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The Minister has said that she has not retracted. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: We are extremely grateful to the Leader of the House ...*(Interruptions)*... for having gracefully accepted to have a debate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the concerned Minister is here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTRY OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN): Sir, can I just clarify? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, our only request is ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us hear the concerned Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Our only request is that it should be done in the presence of the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The concerned Minister is standing. Let us hear her.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, all of us have heard the clarifications given for the questions that were raised. As much as the admission by my predecessor that day that it was not one of the perfect Agreements signed, was my comment that by continuing with the Agreement which was signed by the Government of India, we are only doing course correction. There is nothing else. We have not reneged the commitments made in Bali. So, let us understand the nuances of all the arguments placed as much as the arguments which were placed by my hon. predecessor and not, therefore, read between the lines and give distorted information, I am not suggesting somebody gave it, but then I am only saying let us not give room for any distortion in any kind of ...*(Interruptions)*... I am giving you the explanation. I wish all of the Members would hear it that there need not be room given for any kind of distortions for the statements that we have made, for the comments that my predecessor has also made. The discussion was elaborated that day in all details. Now, I am afraid, that I have to raise this question through you, Sir, that this discussion has been held with great detail and all answers and clarifications have been issued. The hon. Prime Minister's comments are very much in this background that we have discussed and ...*(Interruptions)*... And, just as, let us be very clear, there was a need for talking about the peace clause in Bali, a peace clause which was not for perpetuity, but a peace clause which was just there hanging for four years only... and with 2017 not giving us a guarantee that it will be held for perpetuity, I think it is important to read the Prime Minister's statement in that context and not give room for any distortions whatsoever.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, a reference has been made to what I had said. I think it would only be proper that I have my say.

First of all, I had corrected the Minister that day itself and the record should be called for 'it is not a perfect agreement, was in the context of the LDC package. So, it is a distortion. The entire Bali Agreement was said to be imperfect. I would like that to be corrected. The record would establish it. I had to get up that day also, as the House would recall. Sir, you were in the Chair and I had said it was only with respect to the LDC package. And I stand by that statement. We would have said that the LDC package should have been more robust.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What you said is also on record.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, please allow me to complete.

Second thing which has been said is this. First of all, there is no peace clause. It is just being said in common parlance. There is an interim agreement. Interim agreement is not hanging. I reject this because the wording of the Agreement is very clear. First this issue was not being allowed to be put on the agenda. This was put on the agenda and this was forced by us. So, the charge against us which has been levelled by none other than the Prime Minister has to be clarified because it misleads the country.

Secondly, Sir, it does not hang in air. *...(Interruptions)...* The four-year thing *...(Interruptions)...* The wording of the Bali Agreement is *...(Interruptions)...* Let the Minister contradict it. *...(Interruptions)...* Please *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री अनिल माधव दवे (मध्य प्रदेश) : *...(व्यवधान)...* आप रोटी बेच आए, हम उसे वापस ले आए। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Athawaleji, sit down.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: What the Agreement reached was because India had rejected the dated rules of the Uruguay Round and the external reference prices of 1986-88. We had said that these are unacceptable; we have to move to the 21st Century and we have to renegotiate under the Agreement on Agriculture. *...(Interruptions)...* Please, have some respect. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please complete.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Now what was agreed to was that Ministers agreed to negotiate a permanent solution. That was part one. The Leader of the House was here on 18th and 19th. We had a detailed discussion and I explained everything.

The second para reads, "In the interim, until a negotiated permanent solution is reached..." The first is a negotiated agreement on negotiated solution by MC 11. So, it is not hanging in air. It is definitive. Anybody having different understanding of English language ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Okay. Now you conclude.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I am surprised that the Minister had said here in this House answering to the clarifications that there was no retraction.

My "question is this. She answered to the queries and we accepted that. But I reject today's statement that it is hanging in air. All the records of the last year's discussion should be called when the Leader of the House was here. It is not a question of a Minister. I have nothing personal ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is all right.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We have respect for her. It is the Prime Minister of India who has contradicted.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now please sit down.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The Prime Minister therefore has to come to the House and we would like to discuss it with the Prime Minister now.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : सर, यह बड़ा गम्भीर विषय है। पूरे देश के सामने माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा है कि ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is over. I have to now take up the discussion. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Dua, please start.

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : किसानों का हित बेच दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to take up the discussion. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Dua, please start. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : इस बारे में हम जानना चाहेंगे ...(व्यवधान)... कि उनके माननीय राज्य मंत्री के स्टेटमेंट और माननीय प्रधान मंत्री के स्टेटमेंट में जो अन्तर है, ...(व्यवधान)... पूरे देश के सामने जो ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, can I please? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think it is okay. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, I should be allowed to ...(Interruptions)...

**श्री दिग्विजय सिंह :** कि पूर्व की सरकार ने देश के किसानों का हित बेच दिया, गरीबों का हित बेच दिया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us not have a discussion on this. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is the point? Mr. Anand Sharma. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will allow you ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, let us have a discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... If the Government is agreeing to discuss this, it should be in the presence of the Prime Minister because the issue that we have raised is not about the Minister's statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have raised an issue about the Prime Minister's statement. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Anand Sharma. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me explain the position. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, would you allow me one minute? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, there are a few things which I want to lay very clearly here on record. To pick on every word which I have said now or earlier is very welcome. I will stand up and explain things here. But the fact is, whatever word my predecessor used that day, if necessary...*(Interruptions)*... 'retraction' and also something more. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please be brief. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Yes, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... Considering that two eminent Members of the Opposition have stood up to speak elaborately on it, my brief can be only as much brief as theirs. Considering that my predecessor had mentioned that day that a peace clause was used, that was his mention also. That is a popular parlance. We can't today reject it saying that it is colloquial and don't bring it here. But, that's the expression about which all of us are talking about; WTO not being approached to take us to court. We looked to defuse arguments. That it was not one of the perfect agreements signed was something which my predecessor admitted gracefully that day. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not the way. ...*(Interruptions)*... I allowed you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, no more discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can't do that.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, We are sitting and watching. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not a discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree with you. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are right. ...*(Interruptions)*... It cannot be like this. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, every time, I get up; to speak, even before my sentence is completed, if there is a paraphrasing of it or adding a rider to it, I think, it is not fair. Very clearly, there was something said by my predecessor; if necessary, you can always pick it up to say that it was not one of the perfect agreements signed. So, when that is being said in the context of LDC or in the context of anything else, the fact remained that on Dec. 7, 2013, we had committed ourselves for a stand-alone signing on trade facilitation, leaving everything open till 2017. Was that in the interest of our country? I would rather have nothing at all, agreed on a standalone basis, even trade facilitation left till 2017. Why did we agree? To that extent itself, it is perfect. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let us not have a discussion on that. You explain only your position.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: I don't think that there should be further clarifications and further nuancing of arguments here.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No need of any *post mortem*. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing. ...*(Interruptions)*... It cannot be. ...*(Interruptions)*... Regarding the Prime Minister, I will answer. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will reply to that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The Prime Minister has made a statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister cannot contradict or confirm what the Prime Minister has said. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Sharma. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: It is not for the Leader of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is only for the Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will tell you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, let me have my say ...*(Interruptions)*...



SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Either we have a situation that the Minister is contradicted by the Prime Minister ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Anand Sharma, please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... All of you please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... I request all of you to take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Anand Sharma, it cannot be like this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it is my right and the right of this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... This House had discussed this matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot. ...*(Interruptions)*... I seek the protection of the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All of you sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please listen. ...*(Interruptions)*... Opposition has made a demand. ...*(Interruptions)*... My point is, I am guided by the ruling of the Chairman. I am also seeing what the Minister has said. In the morning, hon. Leader of the House has also made a statement. The Chair can only go by that. The Chair cannot give a direction on the basis of some newspaper report. If you have any such demand, give a separate notice. Not this way, you can give a separate notice. I am not allowing any discussion on that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. H.K. Dua. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing any discussion on that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing any discussion on that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why are you doing this? I called Mr. H.K. Dua. You prepare for the Home Ministry speech, I will allow you. If your name is there on the discussion of the Home Ministry, I will allow you. I will give you one extra minute for that. Now, Duaji.

---

#### **DISCUSSION ON THE WORKING OF THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS**

SHRI H.K. DUA (Nominated): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you for restoring order in the House and we can resume the debate.

Last week the Home Ministry was being discussed in the House. The Department of Disaster Management is a part of the functions of the Home Ministry. But the House was also discussing natural calamities. I think, there was a general consensus that most of the natural calamities are man-made. Indeed, we have to be careful about environment ...*(Interruptions)*... But today I would like to focus attention equally, possibly on a more serious situation which is on the agenda of the Home Ministry, of the Home Ministry, that is, about the internal situation, and issues like our preparedness to fight threat from terrorism, They are equally daunting challenges. The internal security situation and