

RAJYA SABHA

Thursday, the 17th July, 2014/26th Ashadha, 1936 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

RULINGs BY THE CHAIR

(i) External Affairs Minister's request to withdraw Short Duration Discussion on unprecedented spurt in violence in Gaza and West Bank Area of Palestine from the List of Business

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, as you are aware, a Short Duration Discussion on the "Unprecedented spurt in violence in Gaza and West Bank area of Palestine causing death of scores of civilians" had been listed in yesterday's agenda. However, yesterday, I received a letter from the Minister of External Affairs inviting attention to Rules 169 (xiii) and 169 (xvi) of Chapter XII (Conditions of Admissibility of Motions on Matters of Public Interest) of Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States. She had contended that the said rules do not permit discussion on a matter which is not primarily the concern of the Government of India and which refers discourteously to a friendly foreign country respectively and as such the Short Duration Discussion may be withdrawn from the List of Business.

I have examined the matter in the light of the rules quoted by the Minister. It is seen that the rules quoted relate to Motions on matters of public importance and not to the Short Duration Discussion which was listed. The conditions which are prescribed in rule 176 for admissibility of a Short Duration Discussion are, firstly, that the notice of a Member should be accompanied by an explanatory note stating the reasons for raising the discussion on the matter in question and, secondly, that the notice should be supported by signatures of at least two other Members. In the instant case, I do not find any infirmity in the notices given by the hon. Leader of the Opposition and others.

In view of the position stated above, I am unable to accede to the request of the hon. Minister.

(ii) Non-listing of Short Duration Discussion on unprecedented spurt in violence in Gaza and West Bank Area of Palestine in today's agenda papers

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, Members have raised a question as to why the Short Duration Discussion on "Unprecedented spurt in violence in Gaza and West

2 *Rulings by*
[Mr. Chairman]

[RAJYA SABHA]

the Chair

Bank area of Palestine' which was listed on 16th July, 2014 in the agenda papers but could not be taken up, has not been listed for discussion in today's agenda papers.

Hon. Members are aware of the provisions of rule 177 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Council of States which clearly state that after the Chairman has admitted a Short Duration Discussion on a subject, date for its discussion has to be fixed in consultation with the Leader of the Council. The said Short Duration Discussion was accordingly listed on the 16th July, 2014 after consultation with the Government but could not be taken up on that day. As per the rules, the subject having been already admitted, now requires consultation with the Leader of the House to fix the next date and time for discussion.

In this connection, I received a communication last evening from the Leader of the House stating that the Short Duration Discussion on the Palestine issue may not be taken up on 17th July, 2014 and that the Government will communicate an appropriate date for the same soon.

Accordingly, in view of the provisions of rule 177 read with the communication received from the Leader of the House, the Short Duration Discussion on Palestine has not been listed in today's agenda papers.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY (West Bengal): Sir, I have a point of order, if you permit me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One by one. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Rajasthan): Sir, I myself, the LoP, leaders of other parties have given notice under Rule 267 for suspension of Question Hour so that the matter which was listed for discussion yesterday is taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री विजय गोयल (राजस्थान) : सर, क्या रूलिंग पर चर्चा हो सकती है?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. यह दूसरा सब्जेक्ट है, रूलिंग पर नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : सर, रूलिंग पर भी बोलना है।

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: With all respect to the Chair, I would have to point out that the Business of this House can only be transacted under the rules and this Rule Book has some sanctity. Whether it is Rule 23 or Rule 29 or Rule 177 it makes it very clear that once the admissibility is decided and a matter is listed on the Agenda, in the List of Busi-

ness, circulated as such, that becomes the property of the House. That is the privilege of the Members, the right of the Members of this House to discuss that matter. If there is any extraordinary situation, even then it cannot be taken out of the List of Business, except when a sense of the House is taken. If the Leader of the House, with all respect, is giving a communication, writing to the hon. Chair, still the sense of the House has to be taken. This is not a matter without precedent. Sir, we have been talking to the Government. But before that I would like to quote here from Kaul and Shakhder. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: This has been settled. ...*(Interruptions)*... Kaul and Shakhder has specifically commented on this. There are rulings on this matter. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us not go into a longer debate during Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I am not going into a debate. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will just conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will just quote Kaul and Shakhder. It is given in 461, if they are getting it, it makes it absolutely clear. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am aware of that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am aware of that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: It makes it absolutely clear that if a matter is not discussed for any extraordinary situation, even if there is death of a Member or an outstanding personality or for any other extraordinary reason, it must again be listed for the next day. That is the settled ruling. Either we are going to respect this or we are going to respect Kaul and Shakhder, Sir, there is one point which I must make. The framers of the Indian Constitution went for this...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us not go into a longer debate. ...*(Interruptions)*... You just make the point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The framers of the Constitution had made a clear separation between functions of legislature, the Judiciary and the Executive, in this Executive cannot remove a listed subject once something becomes the property and privilege of the House tell...

MR. CHAIRMAN: There is no suggestion to that effect. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The Executive cannot tell the Legislature not to discuss it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We work by a consultative process. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: India has a stated position. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is not the matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... We will not be going into that.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it is a very important point. Please allow me just half a minute more. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Government has been saying today to us in the meetings that the Prime Minister being away, this should not be taken up, but whereas the Prime Minister has gone to attend the BRICS Summit which is over. The BRICS Declaration to which India is a signatory has half a page on the Gaza developments and on the Palestine.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: That should be put on record by us. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs is saying something. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Is he answering? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT; THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION; AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU): Sir, I am not answering anything because you have also not asked me to answer. My point is, if we are talking about the rules, the rule says every day the first hour is Question Hour. It is there listed in the Business. First, let us take up the Business No.1. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी (मध्य प्रदेश) : यह रूल आपको तब याद था, जब आप यहां थे?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Secondly ...*(Interruptions)*... आप बैठिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... सुनिए तो सही।

श्री सभापति : आप बैठ जाइए! ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी : यह रूल आपको तब याद था, जब यहां थे आप? आज आप हमें सिखा रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : आप बैठ जाइए प्लीज...एक मिनट ...*(व्यवधान)*... प्लीज बैठ जाइए आप ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Because you are quoting the rules, I have reminded you about the rules. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. The Minister is speaking. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, my point is, first let us take up the Question Hour. Secondly, the hon. Leader of the House has already communicated to the Chair about the willingness of the Government to discuss the matter when the BAC meets and decides on it. The third point is, if we are going back to what has happened, I would like to request the Chair and also the hon. Members to go through the proceedings, wherein the hon. Deputy Chairman, the day before yesterday, has taken into. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have gone into that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The Railway Budget had been taken up by the Deputy Chairman and the debate had started yesterday. ...*(Interruptions)*... So, there is no...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... We cannot have a debate on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay, Mr. Yechury. But, very quickly. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have to take up the questions. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I beseech you to please understand that — when you want us to be brief, I will be — these are matters of very grave importance. The Minister has just now said that procedure and rules say that the first thing to be taken up is the Question Hour. You have Rule 267, whereby we can move for the suspension of the Question Hour. That's a rule and our right also. So, don't deny us that right. If you go by rules, then, we have given our notice. So, that is not the point. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is not the point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I would like to know whether the Chair has allowed suspension of the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Everyone knows the procedure for suspension of the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: As regards your ruling, Sir, as a Member of this House and respecting the procedure of this august House, all of us are bound to accept

your ruling. There is no question of not accepting it. But, acceptance does not mean that we cannot question. My reason for rising to question that ruling is ...*(Interruptions)*... I will tell you. Please bear with me for a minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have said very correctly, the concurrence of the Leader of the House is required. But there must be some reason for the Leader of the House to change the order, which has already been decided and circulated. That reasoning has not come. This was my point No. 1. Number two, even if the discussion on the Rail Budget had begun and, according to the Parliamentary Affairs Minister, the revised List of Business was circulated subsequent to that, from my knowledge of the functioning of this House and the procedures and the rules, no revised List of Business can be circulated unless there is prior agreement of the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Please, one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... If the Government agreed to that the day-before-yesterday, and it was circulated yesterday, why was a disagreement yesterday; why was it stopped from circulation, today? This House needs to know the reason. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: You please tell us why you are not wanting this discussion to take place. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: We want to know, Sir...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति : अब खत्म कीजिए प्लीज।

श्री सीताराम येचुरी : हमारे प्रधान मंत्री एक रेजोल्यूशन पर दस्तखत करते हैं। जिस सवाल पर हम यहां पर डिस्कस करना चाहते हैं, उसके ऊपर कंडेम करते हैं। गाजा में जो हो रहा है, उस पर प्रधान मंत्री कंडेम करते हैं तो क्या सदन का अधिकार नहीं है कि उस पर डिस्कशन करे? ...*(व्यवधान)*... हमारे संविधान का उल्लंघन हो रहा है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let me get on to...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we are all, together, violating the Constitution of India. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are violating the Constitution of India. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are denying the independence of the right to this Parliament. ...*(Interruptions)*... As a custodian, you have no right to ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot preside over denying

of this right to us, which the Constitution of India, 'We, the people', has given us. You cannot preside over denying this right to us. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No right ...*(Interruptions)*... Sharadji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sharadji.

श्री शरद यादव (बिहार): सभापति महोदय, मैं आपके फैसले पर सिर झुकाता हूँ, लेकिन आज का दिन हमारे 68 वर्ष की जो आपने कहा कि इसको आगे कर दीजिए, यह बिजनेस में नहीं आता, तो देश और दुनिया में जितने रूल्स वगैरह कोट किए हैं, वे तो अपनी जगह हैं, लेकिन इसको कल से लेकर आज तक टालने का जो काम हुआ, सदन के नेता के पत्र के जरिए हुआ। उनसे मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि वेस्ट एशिया हमारे हर तरह के हितों के साथ जुड़ा हुआ है, हमारे देश की भावनाओं के साथ जुड़ा हुआ है। अगर यह टलेगा, तो आप मेरी बात को मान लीजिए कि यह ठीक नहीं होगा। मैं समझता हूँ कि अगर यह मामला नहीं आता तो बहुत अच्छा था, लेकिन दो दिन से यह मामला खड़ा हुआ, देश और दुनिया भर में यह बात चली गयी। मेरे साथियों ने जो बात कही कि ब्रिक्स सम्मेलन में हमारे देश ने एक ऐसी बात और ऐसा मुद्दा वहाँ खड़ा किया....। आज जिस तरह की वहाँ स्थिति है, मैं आपसे एक ही बात कह रहा हूँ कि सदन के नेता ने जो यह काम किया है, उसके नतीजे अच्छे नहीं निकलेंगे क्योंकि इस देश के लाखों लोग वहाँ रोजगार से और व्यापार से जुड़े हुए हैं। देश के लोगों के मन में इस सवाल पर बहुत बेचैनी है। उस बेचैनी को यदि सदन में नहीं लाया जाता है, तो उचित नहीं होगा। इसलिए मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि इसको कल के लिए मत टालिए। रेल बजट पर तो कभी भी चर्चा हो सकती है। यह वेस्टर्न एशिया के हित में है, हमारे देश हित में है और यह इजरायल के खिलाफ नहीं है। सवाल यह है कि जिस तरह से वहाँ इंसानियत की अनदेखी हो रही है, जिस तरह से वहाँ एकतरफा कार्यवाही हो रही है, आज की दुनिया इतनी अन्यायी हो गई कि कोई भी इसके बारे में बोलने के लिए तैयार नहीं है।

श्री सभापति: थैंक्यू। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री शरद यादव: यह देश गांधी का है और यदि इस पर हम लोग नहीं बोलेंगे ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, I have a clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not giving a speech. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We can't have a debate on this. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is Question Hour.

श्री शरद यादव: इसलिए मेरी आपसे विनती है कि आज ही सदन में, चाहे रात को बैठना पड़े, इस सवाल को आप जरूर ले लीजिए। नहीं तो यह ठीक नहीं होगा, यह मेरी आपसे विनती है।

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: माननीय सभापति जी। ...*(व्यवधान)*... माननीय सभापति जी। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE (Kerala): Sir, I have given a notice under Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I only want a clarification; no speech. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the clarification? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, my clarification is that my party has along with, maybe, a few other parties, have given a notice under Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, what is your ruling on that? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. Now, we will proceed with the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question 141. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. This is not a debate. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not a debate. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Let the Government say something. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय सभापति जी, जब एक नोटिस हम लोगों ने दिया हुआ है...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: आपको प्रोसीजर मालूम है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आपको प्रोसीजर मालूम है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सभापति महोदय, हम आपकी रूलिंग को चैलेंज नहीं कर रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... लेकिन जो नोटिस लगा है, उसका जो प्रोसीजर है, वह प्रोसीजर एडॉप्ट करना चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति: आप उस प्रोसीजर को पढ़िए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: आप उस प्रोसीजर को एडॉप्ट कर लीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You know the procedure for Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. RAJEEVE: Sir, I have given a notice under Rule 267 to suspend the Question Hour and discuss the atrocities ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I can't allow a discussion, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... There are one, two, three, five, six Members. It is not possible. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question No. 141. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY; THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS; THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF ATOMIC

ENERGY AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SPACE
(DR. JITENDRA SINGH): A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, my party along with some other parties have given a notice under Rule 267 for suspension. ...*(Interruptions)*... So, we can take up this issue and then take up the Railway Budget after that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You know the procedure for 267. ...*(Interruptions)*... Rule 38 prevails. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: Sir, I have to say something. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: We can't have a debate, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question 141 has been called. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not a debate. This is Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी: सभापति महोदय, प्रश्नकाल में इस विषय पर चर्चा कराने के लिए हमने नोटिस दिया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: नहीं-नहीं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, the Opposition seeks protection of the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Opposition seeks your protection, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी: सर, हमने नोटिस दिया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... जब तक इस विषय पर बहस नहीं होगी, तब तक कोई बिज़नेस नहीं हो सकता। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please don't do this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We have to respect the dignity and the rights of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is Members' right. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are not giving up our rights.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please don't do this. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is adjourned for 15 minutes.

The House then adjourned at nineteen minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at thirty-four minutes past eleven of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 141. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : चेयरमैन सर, नहीं-नहीं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want the Question Hour. We want Question No. 142 to be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, we are taking up the questions. Question No. 141. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : चेयरमैन सर, नहीं-नहीं ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... The fishermen of Tamil Nadu are being attacked. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay; one minute. One minute, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us hear the LOP. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us hear the LOP. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: We want Question No. 142 to be taken up ...*(Interruptions)*... Already forty minutes have gone. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us hear the LOP. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Fishermen of Tamil Nadu are being attacked by Sri Lankan Navy. ...*(Interruptions)*... They are attacking our fishermen. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. Maitreyan, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: The House is not being allowed to discuss the question. ...*(Interruptions)*... We want the question to be taken up first. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just one minute, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us hear the LOP. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: We have heard enough now. ...*(Interruptions)*... We want the question to be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*... For forty minutes, we have been silent. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: If the LOP wishes to say something, the convention is that he is allowed to say. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Assure me that the question will be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: I will yield only for LOP. ...*(Interruptions)*...

सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी: आप नेता विपक्ष को सुनिए ...*(व्यवधान)*...

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद): माननीय सभापति जी, आपने अभी माननीय विदेश मंत्री साहिबा ने कल आपको जो लैटर लिखा था, उसको कोट किया और दूसरा सदन के नेता के बारे में फरमाया। हाउस की इस साइड के जितने भी मैम्बर्स हैं, हम सभी ने आपसे अपील की थी कि कल के बिजनेस में इजराइल, फिलिस्तीन - जिनके बारे में आपने अभी खुद फरमाया कि वहां पर प्रॉपर्टीज का अनप्रिंसिपेंटेड डिस्ट्रक्शन हो रहा है और जिस तरह से बच्चे, औरतें, बूढ़े और नौजवान मारे जा रहे हैं, हम उस बारे में चर्चा करें। यह विषय कल के बिजनेस में राइटली लगा हुआ था। आज सरकार की तरफ से मैसेज आता है कि हम इस पर किसी और दिन चर्चा करेंगे। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

डा. वी. मैत्रेयन: जब जिनोसाइड हुआ था ...*(व्यवधान)*... तब आपसे उसके लिए हाउस में एक कंडोलेंस भी नहीं हुआ था ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सभापति जी, जब हार्ट अटैक हो जाता है, तो आप उस वक्त उस मरीज के दिल की बीमारी का इलाज करेंगे या कहेंगे ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम उसका इलाज करेंगे। ...*(व्यवधान)*... जब एक पेशेंट का हार्ट अटैक हुआ है ...*(व्यवधान)*... तो क्या आप अगली दफ़ा किसी और डेट पर इसको अरेंज करेंगे? ...*(व्यवधान)*... लड़ाई आज चल रही है, बच्चे आज मर रहे हैं ...*(व्यवधान)*... चूंकि आज की लिस्ट में ...*(व्यवधान)*... मुझे बहुत अफसोस है। यदि गवर्नमेंट influence करेगी, लिस्टेड बिजनेस को चलने नहीं देगी और आने वाले वक्त में लगने नहीं देगी ...*(व्यवधान)*... तो हमारे पास और कोई ऑप्शन नहीं था कि क्वेश्चन ऑवर को सस्पेंड किया जाए ...*(व्यवधान)*... इस पर तुरंत डिस्कशन होना चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... जो डिस्कशन होना चाहिए थी ...*(व्यवधान)*... आज हो रहा है ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: One-and-a-half lakh citizens have been killed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let them take it up at 12 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We have given notice under Rule 267 for the suspension of Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Have you given the notice? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We are moving the motion. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are moving the motion. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have given notice for the suspension of Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have given notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question Hour be suspended. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sense of the House be taken. ...*(Interruptions)*... If required, we are ready for the voting. ...*(Interruptions)*... We have given notice under Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: We want the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute please. ...*(Interruptions)*... One minute please. ...*(Interruptions)*... आप बैठ जाइए! ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बैठ जाइए! ...*(व्यवधान)*... बैठ जाइए प्लीज़! ...*(व्यवधान)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, a notice has been given under appropriate rules by the hon. Leader of the Opposition.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल : हम लोगों ने भी नोटिस दिए हैं।

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: There are seven in all.

MR. CHAIRMAN: ...and others. Now, there is a well-established procedure which everybody knows as to how that is to be tackled. For that, the first requirement is peace in the House. So, I would request you to please listen to what he has to say and then it is your choice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, he has already said what he had to say. We want the Question Hour to be taken up. We have already listened to him. We want the Question Hour to be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has given a notice for the Motion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: We want the Question Hour to be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*... Fishermen of Tamil Nadu are being treated as second-class citizens. They are our own citizens. We have not bothered about them. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now also, you are not taking it up. We want the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let him do it at 12 o'clock. We have no problem. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is the second question listed today. Let them do it at 12 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please listen to what the hon. Leader of the Opposition has to say on his Motion. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is a Motion on the Table. ...*(Interruptions)*... I know that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the Question was in progress. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Question was in progress. If the Chair first takes the Question Hour, I have no problem ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: We want Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please don't do this. Please don't come here. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is adjourned till 1200 hours.

The House then adjourned at forty-three minutes past eleven of the clock.
