

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Number 441...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir,...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Number 441, please ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Mr. Chairman, Sir, Odisha is facing with severe floods ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It cannot be taken up at this time. ...(*Interruptions*)... Question No. 441 ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI A. U. SINGH DEO: Sir, Odisha is facing with floods and hundreds of people died ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BAISHNAB PARIDA: Sir, kindly permit us to raise this. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question Number 441.

#### **ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS**

##### **Allowing use of BSNL Infrastructure by private players**

\*441. SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN: Will the Minister of COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY be pleased to state:

(a) whether Bharat Sanchar Nigam Limited (BSNL), which was flagship vehicle of communication in the country, has been overtaken by private companies competing in the field;

(b) whether it happened due to a conscious policy of Government;

(c) whether Government, instead of modernising technology and equipments of BSNL, is allowing its infrastructure to be used by private players; and

(d) whether Government considers it important to have an efficient official communication system for it and people to have a secure channel to exchange and store information and knowledge?

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): (a) to (d) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

##### ***Statement***

(a) BSNL has informed that its overall market share was 15.66% as on 31.03.2010 which has declined to 11.70% as on 31.05.2014.

(b) The decline in market share of BSNL can be attributed to various reasons, namely:-

- Inadequate investment in infrastructure expansion in recent years leading to delay in expansion of mobile network.
- Legacy issues of excessive manpower having inadequate skill set for customer centric services in sales and marketing, distribution channels and customer service management.
- High employee cost as compared to industry standards.
- Decline in traditional wireline business due to fixed to mobile substitution.
- Payment of market rates for both 3G and Broadband Wireless Access (BWA) spectrum in all License Service Areas (LSA) in its jurisdiction of ₹18,500.38 crores in 2010.
- Poor perception of quality of service provided by BSNL.

(c) BSNL has taken several steps for modernisation of its network, namely:-

- Migration from Public Switched Telephone Network (PSTN) to Next Generation Network (NGN) to provide Enhanced Value Added Services (VAS) like Personalized Ring Back Tone, Broadband Value Added services, Multi Media Video Conferencing, Wide Area Centrex, Voice Over Internet Protocol (VOIP) services and fixed- mobile services convergence etc.
- BSNL is expanding its mobile network across the country through installation of 15 Million lines at a cost of ₹ 4804 crores under Phase-VII expansion plan.
- Augmentation of network elements/expansion of Broadband network has been planned by BSNL keeping in view the traffic growth.

BSNL has informed that it has signed Master Sharing Agreements (MSAs) on Pan-India basis with private operators with the objective of generating additional revenue through unlocking its business potential. The total number of mobile towers being shared with private service providers is 2973 as on 31-03-2014 and the total revenue earned in financial year 2013-14 was ₹ 98.88 crores.

(d) Government is committed to the revival of BSNL, so that it can play an effective role in providing affordable public communication services.

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN: Sir, Question Number 441. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let it be answered ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Sir, it is an important issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... Kindly permit us to raise it after the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanan, please ask your supplementaries ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Sir, my entire State is suffering. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Government has to come forward to enhance and revise the relief rate ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... This is the Question Hour. Please do not disrupt ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Sir, now, the Government is giving ₹ 8,000 per hectare for loss of paddy ...*(Interruptions)*... I want the Government to enhance this ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. I am afraid ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Narayanan, you ask your supplementary ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN: Sir, my first supplementary is this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yesterday, you have already spoken on the subject. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot claim a right to speak again and again ...*(Interruptions)*... Please, sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... Allow your colleague to ask his questions ...*(Interruptions)*... You are infringing on his right ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Sir, the farmers are also not getting proper insurance ...*(Interruptions)*...

**संसदीय कार्य मंत्री (श्री एम. वेंकैया नायडु)** : क्वेश्चन ऑवर के बाद आप चेयरमैन से मिलिए, हम इसका कुछ समाधान निकालने की कोशिश करेंगे।

SHRI BHUPINDER SINGH: Okay; thank you, Sir ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This kind of agitational approach cannot work. Please, ask your supplementary, Mr. Narayanan.

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN: Sir, I have read the reply given by the hon. Minister. I have some doubts.

My first doubt is this. The BSNL was formed in 2000. By 2002, it was given permission to start mobile connections. By 2006, it became the second largest mobile company in the country in terms of providing the number of mobile connections. But, after that, we find a decline. This decline is due to 3-4 reasons and I want clarification on these.

Sir, ₹ 40,000 crores balance was there when the BSNL was formed. But, BSNL cancelled tenders three times to purchase mobile equipment. Due to this reason, by 2008-09, it could not give mobile connections even for 2-3 lakh customers while other companies were giving 20-30 lakh connections in a month.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is the question?

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN: So, I want the hon. Minister to explain why this decline has happened when BSNL had surplus funds.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, hon. Member is right. The BSNL was in a very good health. But, certain decisions were taken in the past which created a problem. One of the decisions on infrastructure procurement for equipment, etc., was delayed due to reasons into which I do not wish to go. At the expense of BSNL, the private players did very well.

The second issue was that more than ₹ 6,000 crores of broadband wireless access spectrum was given to BSNL which was not viable. So, ultimately, they had to pay, because the auction price was determined. So, they had to withdraw from that. That became a very heavy burden, both in terms of non-availability of infrastructure and almost giving more than ₹ 6,000 crores on BWA spectrum. But, yes, this Government is committed to improve the health of the BSNL by giving logistic support, by giving monetary support and also I wish to ensure that a large framework of growth for the hilly areas, for North-East region and Left-wing areas has been met. And, I am sure, the Government is committed to improving the health of the BSNL.

SHRI C.P. NARAYANAN: Sir, my second supplementary is this.

Sir, the hon. Minister in reply said that it is overstaffed. During the last ten years 1,30,000 people retired and, in their place, only 30,000 were appointed. So, there are over 1 lakh vacancies. Sir, there is a Report of Deloitte which recommended that out of 1,70,000 middle cadre employees, 85,000 should be laid out. Now, if you are doing such things, it is not good. One reason given for that is they are not equipped for new things. Usually, we train them. If we follow this company's recommendation, I think, BSNL will crumble down like anything. And, it will be like killing a golden goose for the private players.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I wish to assure the hon. Member and this hon. House that BSNL will not be allowed to die. We will ensure that it improves its health. I am personally monitoring it. And, I am happy to inform this House that in my own chamber in Sanchar Bhawan I have instituted NOC feed where I particularly notice the working of all the BTS transmission towers all over the country of the BSNL and the MTNL.

But, as far as manpower planning is concerned, it is very important that there is no question of removing anyone. They need to be trained. But, consistent with the needs of the competition, some kind of manpower planning has to be done. I think, all the hon. Members need to help and understand the situation which we are trying to follow.

**श्री चुनीभाई कांजीभाई गोहेल :** सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री जी से यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे हिन्दुस्तान में भारत संचार निगम लिमिटेड का बहुत बड़ा विस्तार है। यह ऐसा नेटवर्क है जो हिन्दुस्तान में नम्बर एक पर है, फिर भी हमें इसके मोबाइल नेटवर्क से कोई संतुष्टि प्राप्त नहीं होती है। इस प्रश्न के लिखित जवाब में यह बताया गया है कि इसके 3,177 टॉवर्स हैं, लेकिन जब हम दिल्ली से अहमदाबाद जाते हैं तो रास्ते में हमें इसका नेटवर्क नहीं मिलता है, जबकि दूसरी कम्पनियों का नेटवर्क मिल जाता है। मैं मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि हमारी इस क्षतिपूर्ति के लिए आप क्या करेंगे?

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैंने पहले ही यह स्वीकार किया है कि बी.एस.एन.एल. के स्वास्थ्य के बारे में बातें कही जा सकती हैं और यह स्थिति पिछले पांच, छह, सात वर्षों में बहुत उत्साहवर्धक नहीं रही है, लेकिन जब मैंने कहा कि हमारी सरकार की यह प्रतिबद्धता है कि हम बी.एस.एन.एल. को सुधारेंगे तो प्रामाणिक है। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि हम बड़ी संख्या में लगभग 27,465 बी.टी.एस. को इम्पूव करने जा रहे हैं। जो पूरे पब्लिक स्विचर्ड टेलिफोन नेटवर्क हैं, उनको हम नेक्स्ट जनरेशन नेटवर्क में प्रोवाइड कर रहे हैं, बाकी हम चाहते हैं कि वह अधिक प्रतिस्पर्धा में आए, कॉम्पिटीटिव बने और उसमें पूंजी का निवेश हो। मैंने पदाधिकारियों से स्वयं बात की है और मैं मानता हूँ कि बी.एस.एन.एल., जो कि टेलिफोन और मोबाइल के क्षेत्र में भारत का एक ऐसा बड़ा उपक्रम है जो देश में काम करता है, उसकी सेवा में सुधार हो।

आपने विशेष रूप से अहमदाबाद के रास्ते में इसके नेटवर्क का जिक्र किया है, मैं इस बारे में पदाधिकारियों को निर्देश दूंगा कि जो भी उचित कार्रवाई करने की आवश्यकता है, वह की जाए।

SHRI JESUDASU SEELAM: Sir, hon. Minister has mentioned, among other things, adequate investment in infrastructure expansion. So, I would like to know from the hon. Minister what are the special measures to improve infrastructure that the Government is taking, because infrastructure is the basic thing, especially in the North-East and hilly regions. The Standing Committee visited there and made several recommendations to improve the infrastructure. So, I would like to draw the attention of the House to this

and request the Minister to state as to what is the initiative they have taken in this regard. How far would it take them, and what is the timeframe within which they would get the infrastructure improved and make this competitive with the private sector?

**SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD:** Sir, support is being extended at two levels. One is the Governmental support. And as I told you, Sir, the Cabinet has decided to waive off return of ₹ 6,724.51 crores to BSNL which they have to dole out while paying the auction charge of BSNL spectrum. The waiver of loan to BSNL involves ₹1,411 crores. But the other steps are being taken by the BSNL. As I said earlier, the entire technology in the whole exchange system, namely, this PSTN Technology to NGN Technology, the modern technology, is being done. As I said, 24,765 base transmissions are sought to be set up in Phase-VII Plan. As far as the North East is concerned, as the hon. Member very rightly pointed out, a proposal for investing ₹5,363 crores for the development of infrastructure in North East of BSNL is already approved. It will go to the Cabinet. Improving the North East first; thereafter, the hilly areas, the border areas, the Left-Wing areas are the priority areas, apart from the entire system in the country.

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** माननीय मंत्री जी, पहले आपको बधाई कि कम से कम आपने गलतियाँ स्वीकारीं, कमियाँ स्वीकारीं। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि मुझे पार्लियामेंट से as an MP टेलीफोन मिला, उस नम्बर को मैंने एयरटेल में इस कारण कन्वर्ट कराया, श्रीमन्, जो नम्बर हम लोगों को मिले हैं, वे काम नहीं करते हैं खराब क्षमता के कारण। सत्यता यह है कि आपके कर्मचारी प्राइवेट सैक्टर के लोगों से मिलकर बी.एस.एन.एल. को डेमेज कर रहे हैं, टॉवर बंद कर देते हैं, सिग्नल बंद कर देते हैं, रात में क्षमता घटा देते हैं। तो मैं आपसे सिर्फ इतना पूछना चाहता हूँ, चूंकि मैंने as an MP टेलीफोन लौटाया है, मेरे पास अब एम.पी. वाला कोई फोन नहीं है, मैंने उसको हटाकर एयरटेल का वही नम्बर कर लिया है। प्रोफेसर साहब भी उस दिन आपसे शिकायत कर रहे थे।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति :** क्वेश्चन प्लीज।

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** मैं आपसे पूछना चाहता हूँ कि अब तक जांच में कितने कर्मचारी आपने दोषी पाए, जो बी.एस.एन.एल. का नुकसान कर रहे हैं निजी कम्पनियों से मिलकर और कितनों के खिलाफ आपने कार्यवाही की?

**एक सम्मानित सदस्य :** डीजल भी बेचते हैं।

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** हाँ, डीजल वगैरह सब बेच लेते हैं।

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** माननीय सभापति महोदय, जो माननीय सदस्य ने सवाल पूछा है, मैं बहुत ही ईमानदारी से स्वीकार करूंगा कि वे ही नहीं, कई सांसदों ने मुझे शिकायत की है कि एम.टी.एन.एल. की सुविधा को सुधारने की जरूरत है। मैं दो बार इस बारे में एम.टी.एन.एल. के लोगों से बैठक ले चुका हूँ। उन्होंने इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर की कमी की बात बताई है इस इलाके में और

बाकी में टॉवर की कमी है। मैं उसको मॉनिटर कर रहा हूँ। मेरे ख्याल में नरेश जी आप वरिष्ठ सांसद हैं, इतना स्वीपिंग आरोप लगाना कि प्राइवेट सैक्टर से मिलकर लोग काम करते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** बिल्कुल सही आरोप हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री सभापति :** नरेश जी, no disturbance, please. ...**(Interruptions)**... Let the Minister finish the reply. ...**(Interruptions)**... आप बैठ जाइए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल :** मैं ऑन ओथ कह सकता हूँ। मैं आपको नाम बता सकता हूँ कि कौन-कौन उनसे मिले हुए हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let the ...**(Interruptions)**... There is no practice of taking oath in the House. ...**(Interruptions)**... नहीं-नहीं, आप खत्म करिए।

**श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद :** मैं नरेश जी का बड़ा सम्मान करता हूँ, मैं उनकी बात का जवाब दे रहा हूँ। लेकिन अगर इस बारे में कोई स्पेसिफिक आरोप मुझे बताएंगे तो मैं आपको आश्चर्य नहीं करता हूँ कि मैं कार्यवाही करूँगा। जहाँ तक ऐसे पदाधिकारी हैं, कर्मचारी हैं उनके बारे में समय-समय पर कार्यवाही होती रहती है। मैं स्वयं उसको मॉनिटर कर रहा हूँ। मेरे ख्याल में हमारे पदाधिकारी सदन की इस भावना को समझ रहे हैं और प्रामाणिकता से काम करने की जरूरत है। यह आपने सही कहा कि कल माननीय राम गोपाल जी ने मुझे बताया था, कई एम.पी.जे. के फोन मेरे पास आए थे। मैंने पदाधिकारियों को उनके पास भेजा था, मैं नाम बताने की जरूरत नहीं समझता। लेकिन आपने चूँकि कहा था, मैंने पदाधिकारियों से कहा है कि वे आपसे सम्पर्क करें। ऐसी स्थिति क्यों हुई है, मैं अध्ययन कर रहा हूँ और यह जो पूरा Lutyens दिल्ली है, जहाँ बी.एस.एन.एल. नहीं है, एम.टी.एन.एल. है वहाँ की व्यवस्था सुधरे, इसकी हम पूरी कोशिश कर रहे हैं।

#### **Sale of camel milk**

\*442. SHRI BALWINDER SINGH BHUNDER: Will the Minister of AGRICULTURE be pleased to state:

- (a) whether there is a ban on sale of camel milk in the country;
- (b) if so, the details thereof and the reasons therefor; and
- (c) whether there is a demand to review this ban in view of its nutrition value?

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI RADHA MOHAN SINGH): (a) to (c) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

#### **Statement**

- (a) No, Sir.
- (b) and (c) Do not arise.