Probe into botched-up tubectomy operations in Chhattisgarh

†2184. DR. BHUSHAN LAL JANGDE: Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) the action taken on deaths of women due to botched-up tubectomy in Chhattisgarh;

(b) the real facts leading to such deaths and whether Government could get to the bottom of the matter;

(c) whether there was pressure for selection of generic medicines leading to huge losses to pharma companies; and

(d) whether Government should seriously probe the role of pharma companies with regard to these deaths?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA): (a) Action taken report as received from State is given in Statement (*See below*).

(b) and (c) The State Government has instituted a judicial commission of inquiry under a retired lady judge of the Chhattisgarh High Court to enquire into all aspects of the case including fixing accountability, criminal culpability and gender equity.

(d) FIR against the pharmaceutical company has been filed and the proprietors have been arrested.

Statement

Action taken report:

The Government of India has been in constant touch with the State Government and has extended full support. The status as received from the State is as under:

1. 137 sterilisation cases were performed in four fixed day female sterilization camps in district Bilaspur from 8.11.14 to 10.11.14 out of which 13 women have died. All had consumed the alleged adulterated drug 'Ciprocin 500' after surgery.

2. 34 non-sterilization cases were also admitted who too consumed the alleged adulterated drug 'Ciprocin 500' and 4 patients out of these too have died.

† Original notice of the question was received in Hindi.

3. State has released compensation of ₹ 4 lakhs each to families of those who have died and ₹ 50,000 each to those who have survived and been discharged.

4. Preliminary inquiry has revealed that–

   a. Standard operating procedures laid down by the Government of India restricting number of cases in a camp to 30 operations per day only were not followed in the first camp held on 8.11.14.

   b. The operation theater where the surgery was performed was not functional.

   c. Deaths may have also been caused by consumption of the alleged adulterated medicine 'Ciprocin 500' manufactured by one 'Mahawar Pharma' based in Chhattisgarh.

5. The batches of the all 12 drugs used in the surgery including 'Ciprocin 500' were sent for testing to various labs across the country and the test reports confirmed that it was not of standard quality and had zinc phosphate in it which is a poisonous material having no antidote.

6. Under departmental action–

   a. Dr. R. K. Gupta, the surgeon was arrested and dismissed from service.

   b. Dr. R. K. Bhange, the CMHO was also been dismissed from service.

   c. Dr. Pramod Tiwari, the BMO and Dr. K. C. Oraon, the State nodal officer for Family Planning have been suspended.

   d. Hemant Srivastava, the licensing authority has also been suspended.

   e. Dr. Amar Singh, Joint Director, Bilaspur has been transferred.

7. FIR against Mahawar Pharma, manufacturer of the drug 'Ciprocin 500' has been filed and the proprietor Shri Ramesh Mahawar and his son Shri Sumit Mahawar have been arrested.

8. Notice has also been sent to the Government of Uttarakhand to take action against M/s Technica Pharma based in Hardwar for supplying 'Ibuprofen' which too was found to be substandard by Shriram laboratories, Delhi.

9. The Chhattisgarh High court has taken *suo moto* action on a PIL No. 49/2014 and the State Government has filed a detailed reply. The high court has given an interim direction to the state to–

   a. Withdraw all consignment of 'Ciprocin 500' manaufactured by 'Mahawar Pharma' from the State. The same has been complied with.

   b. To enforce the SOPs laid down by the Government of India. (action in this regards has already been initiated).

10. A judicial commission of inquiry under a retired lady judge Smt. Anita Jha has been instituted and requested to submit the report within 3 months with clear terms of reference specially from the angle of–

   a. Fixing accountability and criminal culpability and

   b. Gender equity.

Reduction in cost of packages and implants procedures

2185. SHRI PARVEZ HASHMI: Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government has reduced the entitlement cost of certain packages and implants procedures and the CGHS beneficiaries have to pay the difference to the hospitals; and

(b) if so, the details thereof and the reasons therefor along with the corrective measures taken or being taken by Government in this regard?

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI JAGAT PRAKASH NADDA): (a) and (b) CGHS fixes rates for various treatment procedures and investigations through tender process and rates were last notified on 01.10.2014 for Delhi/NCR and on 17.11.2014 for CGHS cities outside Delhi/NCR. As per the MOA signed by empanelled hospitals with CGHS at the time of their empanelment, they are expected to charge as per CGHS packages rates only.

CGHS has fixed ceiling rates for certain implants without specifying any brand name. If there is no CGHS rate for a particular implant, then it is reimbursed as per