

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COURT OF THE ALIGARH
MUSLIM UNIVERSITY**

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That in pursuance of item (xxiv) of clause (1) read with clause (2) of Statute 14 of the Statutes of the Aligarh Muslim University appended to the Aligarh Muslim University (Amendment) Act, 1981, in terms of Section 28 thereof, this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct, one Member from amongst the Members of the House to be a member of the Court of the Aligarh Muslim University in the vacancy caused due to the expiry of term of Shri K.N. Balagopal therein on the 3rd May, 2015."

The question was put and the Motion was adopted.

RE. NOTICE UNDER RULE 267

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Notice under Rule 267, Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad.

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE (West Bengal) : Sir, I have also given a Notice.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After this. His is the first Notice and yours is second.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद): माननीय डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब, अरुणाचल प्रदेश में जो राजनीतिक गतिविधियां चल रही हैं, मैंने उसके लिए नोटिस दिया है। 31 अक्टूबर, 2015 को विधान सभा का सेशन खत्म हुआ था और 3 नवम्बर, 2015 को माननीय गवर्नर साहब ने उसे prorogue किया। 14 जनवरी, 2016 को सेशन दोबारा से बुलाया जाना था, लेकिन इसी बीच में, prorogue होने के बाद वहां पर कुछ डेवलपमेंट्स हुईं। वहां कांग्रेस के 47 MLAs हैं, भारतीय जनता पार्टी के 11 MLAs हैं और दो MLAs Independent हैं, इस तरह 60 MLAs का हाउस है। कांग्रेस के कुछ rebels हैं और उन rebels में एक कांग्रेस का डिप्टी स्पीकर भी है। हर पार्टी में rebel activities चलती रहती हैं। 6 नवम्बर, 2015 को कांग्रेस के एमएलएज ने डिप्टी स्पीकर को हटाने का नोटिस दिया कि वे * और वे रूलिंग पार्टी की तरफ से नियुक्त किये गये या इलेक्ट किये गये डिप्टी स्पीकर हैं। वे * डिप्टी स्पीकर को हटाने के लिए नोटिस की जो प्रक्रिया अंडर कांस्टीट्यूशन होती है, वह कांग्रेस के एमएलएज ने दी। उसके तीन दिन बाद, 9 नवम्बर को भारतीय जनता पार्टी के एमएलएज ने स्पीकर को हटाने का नोटिस दिया। यह 'तीन दिन बाद' बहुत जरूरी है।

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

† قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد): مائے ڈپٹی چیئرمین صاحب، اروناچل پردیش میں جو راجنیتی گتیودھی چل رہی ہیں، میں نے اس کا نوٹس دیا ہے۔ 31 اکتوبر 2015 کو ودھان سبھا کا سیشن ختم ہوا تھا اور 3 نومبر 2015 کو مائے گورنر صاحب نے اسے 'پروروگ' کیا۔ 14 جنوری 2016 کو سیشن دوبارہ سے بلایا جانا تھا، لیکن اسی بیچ میں 'پروروگ' ہونے کے بعد وہاں پر کچھ ڈیولپمنٹس ہوئیں۔ وہاں کانگریس کے 47 ایم۔ایل۔ایز۔ ہیں، بھارتیہ جنتا پارٹی کے 11 ایم۔ایل۔ایز۔ ہیں اور 2 ایم۔ایل۔ایز۔ انڈیپنڈنٹ ہیں، اس طرح 60 ایم۔ایل۔ایز۔ کا

ہاؤس ہے۔ کانگریس کے کچھ 'ریپلس' ہیں اور ان ریپلس میں ایک کانگریس کا ڈپٹی اسپیکر بھی ہے۔ ہر پارٹی میں ریپل ایکٹیویٹی چلتی رہتی ہیں۔ 6 نومبر، 2015 کو کانگریس کے ایم۔ایل۔ایز نے ڈپٹی اسپیکر کو ہٹانے کا نوٹس دیا کہ وہ * اور وہ رولنگ پارٹی کی طرف سے مقرر کئے گئے، یا الیکٹ کئے گئے ڈپٹی اسپیکر ہیں۔ وہ * ڈپٹی اسپیکر کو ہٹانے کے لئے ایک نوٹس کی جو پرکریا انڈر کانسٹی ٹیوشن ہوتی ہے، وہ کانگریس کے ایم۔ایل۔ایز نے ڈپٹی اسپیکر کے لئے دی۔ اس کے تین دن بعد، 9 نومبر کو بھارتیہ جنتا پارٹی کے ایم۔ایل۔ایز نے اسپیکر کو ہٹانے کا نوٹس دیا۔ یہ تین دن بعد بہت ضروری ہے۔

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, may I say something, if the Leader of the Opposition yields? ...*(Interruptions)*... I am on a question of propriety and rules. Can the proceedings of an Assembly be discussed in this House? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is happening ...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry, I would like to have a ruling...*(Interruptions)*... What is happening in a State Assembly, if we start discussing in the House ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, what is happening in a State Assembly has never been discussed in this House and should never be discussed in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, if you allow this discussion, tomorrow State Assemblies will start discussing what happens in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*... کل विधान सभाओं में चर्चा शुरू हो जायेगी कि देश की संसद में क्या हो रहा है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, difficult or normal conditions में you can say 'yes' or 'no', लेकिन अभी मैं आगे जो पढ़ूंगा ...*(व्यवधान)*... मैं आगे जो पढ़ूंगा, वह इस हिन्दुस्तान के किसी कोर्ट, किसी अदालत में ...*(व्यवधान)*... उसकी चर्चा नहीं हो सकती ...*(व्यवधान)*... सिर्फ पार्लियामेंट में ही चर्चा हो सकती है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد: سر، difficult or normal conditions میں you can say

'yes' or 'no' لیکن ابھی میں آگے جو پڑھوں گا ...*(مداخلت)*... میں آگے جو پڑھوں گا، وہ اس ہندوستان کے کوئی کورٹ، کسی عدالت میں ...*(مداخلت)*... اس کی چرچہ نہیں ہو سکتی ...*(مداخلت)*... صرف پارلیمنٹ میں ہی چرچہ ہو سکتی ہے ...*(مداخلت)*...

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, please do not discuss the proceedings of the Assembly. Please do not discuss the proceedings of the Assembly. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I am not talking about the proceedings. No proceedings have started as yet. I am just saying when the Assembly is not... *(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*...

मैं माननीय लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस को करेक्ट करना चाहता हूँ। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

اُمیں مائٹے لیڈر آف دی ہاؤس کو کریکٹ کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔۔۔*(مداخلت)*۔۔۔

श्री अरुण जेटली: सर, स्पीकर को हटाने या डिप्टी स्पीकर को हटाने का नोटिस, यह विधान सभा का विषय है, यह संसद का विषय नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, अगर आप इसकी अनुमति देंगे, तो संसद में क्या होता है, उसकी चर्चा विधान सभाओं में होगी। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, यह अभी प्रोसीडिंग्स में से नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

اُسر، یہ ابھی پروسیڈنگ میں سے نہیں ہے۔۔۔*(مداخلت)*۔۔۔

I am not quoting any proceedings of the Assembly. ...*(Interruptions)*... This has happened when the Assembly was not in session. ...*(Interruptions)*...

संचार और सूचना प्रौद्योगिकी मंत्री (श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद): सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम रोज प्रिविलेज का नोटिस देते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम रोज प्रिविलेज का नोटिस देते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम रोज disqualification का नोटिस देते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह भी हाउस की प्रोसीडिंग्स का पार्ट है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, अगर यूपी विधान सभा की चर्चा करेंगे, ...*(व्यवधान)*... अगर बिहार की या पश्चिमी बंगाल की विधान सभाओं की चर्चा करेंगे, ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I am not discussing the proceedings of the Assembly. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: क्या इसकी चर्चा यहां करेंगे? ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह बहुत गलत बात है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: What has happened, what has transpired and what has been discussed on the floor of the House, I am not discussing that. ...*(Interruptions)*... When the Assembly is not in session, where is the question of discussing the proceedings in the House? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. P. SINGH BADNORE (Rajasthan): Sir, this is an internal problem ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... We represent, the Rajya Sabha represents the States. ...*(Interruptions)*... Rajya Sabha represents the States. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is our duty to protect the interests of the States. ...*(Interruptions)*...

† Transliterated in Urdu script.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Azad ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: It is our duty to protect the interests of the States. We, as Rajya Sabha Members, are custodian of the States ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: We have to protect the interests of the States. ...(Interruptions)... This is the Council of States. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Rajya Sabha is the Council of States. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: It is our responsibility to protect the interests of the States. ...(Interruptions)... We are not going to budge.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, do not discuss about the Deputy Speaker or the Speaker here. Do not discuss about the Deputy Speaker or the Speaker of the Assembly here. That is for the Assembly. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I cannot discuss the proceedings of the Assembly. ...(Interruptions)... I am not discussing the proceedings of the Assembly. ...(Interruptions)... The Assembly is going to be convened from tomorrow. ... (Interruptions)... The Assembly is going to be convened from tomorrow. Then, how can I discuss ...(Interruptions)... how can I discuss ...(Interruptions)... the proceedings of the Assembly? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your complaint? ...(Interruptions)... What is your issue then? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, let me tell you. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, let me tell you. ...(Interruptions)... The most undemocratic thing, which has never happened in the history of independent India ...(Interruptions)... and which did not happen even during the British time, is happening now ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, it is not clear to me what you are speaking. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: In the British Raj, we used to have Governments but we did not have this type of Governor. ...(Interruptions)... The Governor of Arunachal Pradesh, *suo motu*, without consulting the State Government ... (Interruptions)... without consulting the Chief Minister ...(Interruptions)... without

[Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad]

the advice of the Chief Minister and the Council of Ministers ...(Interruptions)... summons the Assembly Session for 16th of December! ...(Interruptions)... Sir, the most important thing is, what does the summon say ...(Interruptions)... and what does the Executive Order of the Government say. ...(Interruptions)... The Executive Order says, ...(Interruptions)... the Executive Order of the Governor of Arunachal Pradesh ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, listen please. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: It is for the removal of the Speaker ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, please ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: This is the first item on the Agenda. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, please. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: The first item on the Agenda of the House at the first sitting of the Sixth Session of the Assembly....(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: And it also says ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, please ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: The Resolution for removal of the Speaker ...(Interruptions)... shall be the first item of the business at the first sitting of the sixth Session of the ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, Rule 238 says, ...(Interruptions)... He is on a point of order. ...(Interruptions)... Now, Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad. I have to allow the point of order ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, no point of order. ...(Interruptions)... No, no, no. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed the point of order. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: what is happening in the State of Arunachal Pradesh is ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: No House can sit over a judgment on the proceedings of either House or of a State Legislature ...(Interruptions)...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: कोई भी कांस्टीट्यूशन में आप नहीं ...(व्यवधान)...

آجناب غلام نبی آزاد: جو سنسد کا ایمان کیا جا رہا ہے --- (مداخلت)---

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Rule 238 is clear. Neither can the conduct of a Governor be discussed here nor can the proceedings ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: The Governor of Arunachal Pradesh is playing like a * ...(Interruptions)... Let me tell you ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, please listen. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad ...(Interruptions)... Please listen to me. ...(Interruptions) Please, I want to make a few points clear. ...(Interruptions)... Now everybody, please ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad ...(Interruptions)... Please, I will allow. ...(Interruptions)... Please, now, let me say. ...(Interruptions)... See, I have to make a few points clear. ...(Interruptions)... Now, please, आप लोग बैठिए। बैठिए-बैठिए।... (व्यवधान) ...(Interruptions)... I have to make a few points clear. ...(Interruptions)... Wait ...(Interruptions)... Now, please ...(Interruptions)... Sit down, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Go to your seats. I have to make a few points clear. ...(Interruptions)... Now, please. ...(Interruptions)... Two points I have to make clear. Number one is that, according to Rule 238, a person in position, in authority like a Governor, can be discussed only through a substantive motion ...(Interruptions)... Let me say ...(Interruptions)... No, no; let me say. ...(Interruptions)... Second, proceedings of the Legislative Assembly will not be discussed ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I am not discussing the proceedings. ...(Interruptions)... The House is not convened as of now. So, how can I discuss proceedings? ...(Interruptions)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: गुलाम नबी आज़ाद साहब ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, मैं सिर्फ़ तीन चीज़ें बता रहा हूँ कि गवर्नर ने सरकार की रिक्वेस्ट के बगैर असेम्बली सेशन बुलाया है। ...(व्यवधान)... गवर्नर ने विधान सभा का एजेंडा भी खुद ही फिक्स किया है। ...(व्यवधान)... कोर्ट कोई अथॉरिटी नहीं है कि वह यह कह दे कि स्पीकर प्रिज़ाइड नहीं करेगा, डिप्टी स्पीकर प्रिज़ाइड करेगा। ...(व्यवधान)... गवर्नर को यह अथॉरिटी नहीं है कि वह यह कहे कि डिप्टी स्पीकर को हटाने के लिए resolution move किया जाएगा। ...(व्यवधान)... यह संविधान में कहीं भी नहीं लिखा हुआ है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह किस संविधान में लिखा हुआ है? ...(व्यवधान)... यह बीजेपी के constitution में हो सकता है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह बिल्कुल गलत बात है। ...(व्यवधान)... यह * की जा रही है। ...(व्यवधान)...

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

† قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد) : سر، میں صرف تین چیزیں بتا رہا ہوں کہ گورنر نے سرکار کی ریکویسٹ کے بغیر اسمبلی سیشن بلایا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ گورنر نے ودھان سبھا کا ایجنڈا بھی خود ہی فکس کیا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ کورٹ کوئی اتھارٹی نہیں ہے کہ وہ یہ کہہ دے کہ اسپیکر پریزائڈ نہیں کرے گا، ڈپٹی اسپیکر پریزائڈ کرے گا۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ گورنر کو یہ اتھارٹی نہیں ہے کہ وہ یہ کہے کہ ڈپٹی اسپیکر کو ہٹانے کے لئے ریزولوشن موو کیا جائے گا۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ یہ سنودھان میں کہیں بھی نہیں لکھا ہوا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ یہ کس سنودھان میں لکھا ہوا ہے؟۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ یہ بی۔جے۔پی۔ کے کانسٹی ٹیوشن میں ہو سکتا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ یہ بالکل غلط بات ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ یہ * کی جا رہی ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, I am quoting a ruling. ... (Interruptions)... I will allow you. ... (Interruptions)... I am quoting a ruling. ... (Interruptions)...

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद : अभी भारत के संविधान पर चर्चा की। ... (व्यवधान)... अभी 15 दिन भी नहीं हुए और उसी * उड़ाई जा रही हैं। ... (व्यवधान)... संविधान को * किया जा रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)... हम यह नहीं होने देंगे। ... (व्यवधान)... हमारी पार्टी यह कभी नहीं होने देगी। ... (व्यवधान)... विपक्ष यह कभी नहीं होने देगा। ... (व्यवधान)...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : ابھی بھارت کے سنودھان پر چرچہ کی۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ ابھی 15 دن بھی نہیں ہوئے اور اسی * اڑائی جا رہی ہیں۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ سنودھان کو * کیا جا رہا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ ہم یہ نہیں ہونے دیں گے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ ہماری پارٹی یہ کبھی نہیں ہونے دے گی۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ وپکش یہ کبھی نہیں ہونے دے گا۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now there is a ruling by the then Deputy Chairman on 27.3.1992. To a question by Shri Ahluwalia, the ruling was, and I read: "Mr. Ahluwalia, you cannot raise the issue of the State Assembly here. We may be a Council of States. But we cannot raise the issue." ... (Interruptions)... And Governor should be discussed through a substantive Motion. ... (Interruptions)...

सुश्री मायावती (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति जी, उत्तर प्रदेश के गवर्नर के बारे में बोलने का हमें भी मौका दिया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): It is Governor's behaviour and not a State issue that... (Interruptions)...

सुश्री मायावती: माननीय उपसभापति जी, उत्तर प्रदेश के गवर्नर के बारे में बोलने का हमें भी मौका दिया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)... इस तरह से सदन के अंदर नहीं चलेगा। ... (व्यवधान)... हमें भी बोलने का मौका दिया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)... माननीय उपसभापति जी, हाउस के जो नियम-कानून

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... यदि आप यहां असेम्बली के मामले को उठाने की परमिशन देते हैं, तो हमें भी फिर उत्तर प्रदेश के बारे में, वहां के गवर्नर के बारे में बोलने का मौका दिया जाए, ...**(व्यवधान)**... हमारी पार्टी को बोलने का मौका दिया जाए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... माननीय उपसभापति जी, मेरी आपसे यह रिक्वेस्ट है कि हमारी पार्टी को भी बोलने का मौका दिया जाए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: It is not a State issue. It is in relation to the Governor's behaviour. ...**(Interruptions)**... Your ruling is all right. But it is not a State issue. ...**(Interruptions)**...

अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री और संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी): सर, यह जो उनको ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; Governor can be discussed only through a substantive Motion. ...**(Interruptions)**... What is your Motion? ...**(Interruptions)**... Is it a substantive Motion? What is LOP's Motion? ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: सर ...**(व्यवधान)**... ये रूलिंग पर यकीन नहीं करते ...**(व्यवधान)**... किसानों के साथ भी करते हैं ...**(व्यवधान)**... ये किसी रूलिंग पर यकीन नहीं करते ...**(व्यवधान)**... ये unruly behaviour पर यकीन करते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, देश का जो संघीय ढांचा है ...**(व्यवधान)**... ये एक नया बहाना लेकर आए हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your Motion? ...**(Interruptions)**... Is it a substantive Motion? What is LOP's Motion? ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर ...**(व्यवधान)**... पैरा मिलिट्री फोर्सों को बुलाया गया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

آجناب غلام نبی آزاد : سر، --- (مداخلت) --- پیرا ملٹری فورسز کو بلایا گیا ہے --- (مداخلت) ---

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी: सर ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज ये एक नया बहाना लेकर आए हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप यह बताएं ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, वहां लॉ एण्ड ऑर्डर ...**(व्यवधान)**...

آجناب غلام نبی آزاد : سر، وہاں لاء اینڈ آرڈر --- (مداخلت) ---

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad, I am saying that it is unimportant. ...**(Interruptions)**... Are you on a point of order? ...**(Interruptions)**... I have given the ruling. ...**(Interruptions)**... I have to go by the ruling. Please sit down. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, before you give the ruling, shall I read one thing? ...**(Interruptions)**...

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have understood your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, before you give your ruling, I would also read Article 174 (1). Then, you give the ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have understood your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Kindly look into Article 174(1) read with Article 163 of the Constitution of India and Rule 3 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business of Arunachal Pradesh. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I understood your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: That the Governor has to consult the Chief Minister and the Council of Ministers. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I understood your point. I understood what Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad was saying. But the point is, I have to go by the rules. That is the only problem. Rule 238 is very clear, that "the conduct of a person, authority...". I don't want to read it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Whether it is the Governor, Rashtrapati or whoever it is, that can be discussed only through a substantive motion. Now, I have with me the notice given by hon. LoP, Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad. ...*(Interruptions)* ... Every Member is honourable and LoP is equally honourable . This motion — I don't want to read it, if the House wants I can share it with you — that in pursuance of Rule 267 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business of Rajya Sabha, this House does suspend the normal business to enable it to take up the discussion on the recent interference by Governor, Arunachal Pradesh, in the functioning of Government in the State of Arunachal Pradesh with the evil intention to topple a democratically elected Government in the State by way of promoting factualism and inciting dissention. It is only a motion for suspension of the Question Hour. It is not a substantive motion. Therefore, I could disallow the discussion on this. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is no more a substantive motion. What can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not a substantive motion. What can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*.... It is not a substantive motion. You could have given a substantive motion. Shri Md. Nadimul Haque.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, the motion is for discussion under Rule 267 and that is permissible. ...*(Interruptions)*....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not a substantive motion. ...*(Interruptions)*.... What can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*.... Shri Md. Nadimul Haque. ...*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: Sir, I want to raise the issue of CBI raid on Delhi Chief Minister, Shri Arvind Kejriwal's office. ...*(Interruptions)*... They are

killing federalism. ...(Interruptions)... It is totally objectionable.(Interruptions)... It is dangerous for democracy.(Interruptions)... Sir, where is cooperative federalism now? ...(Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned for fifteen minutes.

The House then adjourned at twenty-five minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at forty minutes past eleven of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN (West Bengal): Sir, a notice under Rule 267 has been given by my party...(Interruptions)...We have given a notice under Rule 267...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; yes ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, we have given a notice under Rule 267.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; a notice has been given. It is not by you, Mr. Derek ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: I want to know a point ...(Interruptions)...That is our notice. There is an undeclared emergency in the country. The Office of the Chief Minister of Delhi has been raided! ...(Interruptions)...What is going on in this country? ...(Interruptions)...Sir, I want the hon. Leader of the House to clarify this ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I will just clarify this ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But, the notice is given by Shri Nadimul Haque, not by you ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Yes, Sir. You give him a chance to speak. ...(Interruptions)...He is from my party ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no ...(Interruptions)... Please, listen. ...(Interruptions)... Now, listen ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the Office of the Chief Minister of Delhi has been raided ...(Interruptions)... We are hearing different stories. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek, you listen ...(Interruptions)... It is not a party issue ...(Interruptions)... Only the Member who gave notice can raise it, not by you ...(Interruptions)... Zero Hour. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I have no objection to Mr. Derek O'Brien raising it ...*(Interruptions)*... I will just clarify it and give the facts which speak for themselves ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, this is not a party issue; this is about the country and the federal structure of this country ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not a party issue ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not a party issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, Mr. Nadimul Haque gave a notice in the morning at 10 o' clock ...*(Interruptions)*... This is beyond a party issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is the issue pertaining to federal structure. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, may I say something? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, he is democratically elected Chief Minister... *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, what do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT; THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU): Sir, may I say something? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What can we do? We cannot do anything. ...*(Interruptions)*...What can we do? It is the CBI which has raided. ...*(Interruptions)*... What do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, I have no difficulty...*(Interruptions)*...I will just clarify it...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the hon. Leader of the House wants to clarify it...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*...Mr. Derek O'Brien, what do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, the hon. Leader of the House is clarifying it...*(Interruptions)*...Sir, they should listen to him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek O'Brien, what do you want? ...*(Interruptions)*... Do you want a discussion? ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the House is ready to answer you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, may I just clarify it? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek, the Leader of the House is ready to

answer you ...(Interruptions)... What do you want? Mr. Derek, the Leader of the House is ready to answer you ...(Interruptions)... See, Mr. Derek, he is ready to reply to you. He is ready to reply to your point Mr. Derek. The Leader of the House is ready to answer you ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, may I just clarify it? ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Derek O'Brien has raised an issue ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek, the Leader of the House is responding to your point ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, Mr. Derek O'Brien has raised an issue. ...(Interruptions)... Actually, let me clarify this ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You listen to this ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Derek, he is replying to you. Listen to him ...(Interruptions)... The Leader of the House and Finance Minister is replying to your point. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, factually, let me clarify it. Mr. Derek O'Brien has not correctly been informed. The Office of the Chief Minister of Delhi has not been raided. The raid has nothing to do with Mr. Arvind Kejriwal. The raid has nothing to do with the tenure of Mr. Arvind Kejriwal as the Chief Minister of Delhi ...(Interruptions)... There is a corruption case ...(Interruptions)... There is a complaint with the CBI against one officer in the Delhi Government. The office of that officer is attached to the Office of the Chief Minister. Sir, 14 different cases have been filed by the CBI ...(Interruptions)... It is the office of that officer searched and the search is in relation to a case for an alleged offence committed in his capacity before his joining the Office of Mr. Kejriwal ...(Interruptions)... The raid has nothing to do with Mr. Kejriwal's Office or his tenure ...(Interruptions)... And, therefore, Mr. Derek O'Brien, before he raises this issue, should factually clarify and factually confirm the correctness of his facts ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not a raid on the Chief Minister's Office... (Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: It is relating to a corruption case of an officer. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The hon. Finance Minister has replied to your allegation...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the CBI is under the hon. Prime Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Derek, he says that the CBI has not raided the Office of the Chief Minister ...(Interruptions)...The raid was only on the office of an officer ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, the office of that officer is in the Chief Minister's Office ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, everyday the House is disrupted. ...(Interruptions)... Why are they standing like this? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What do you want? Tell me. ...(Interruptions)... What is your problem? What do you want? ...(Interruptions)... Why do you shout here? ...(Interruptions)... What is your demand? I am asking the shouting Members: What is your demand? ...(Interruptions)... It is very unfortunate. What is your demand? ...(Interruptions)... Please tell me. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Khan, tell me what your demand is. ...(Interruptions)... I am ready to listen to you. Tell me what your demand is. This shouting system is very bad, very unfortunate. This is an anti-democratic action. I don't approve of this. ...(Interruptions)... It is an anti-democratic action. Why do you shout slogans without any rationale? Tell me what you want. ...(Interruptions)...

The House is adjourned till 12.00 noon.

The House then adjourned at forty-six minutes past eleven of the clock.

The House reassembled at twelve of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: I request the hon. Members to refrain from coming into the Well. ...(Interruptions)... Question Hour. ...(Interruptions)... What do you wish to say? Is it relating to question? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, we have a notice under rule 267 given by my colleague. The issue here is, Sir, the Chief Minister, I am saying this again ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have already spoken on this subject. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, Sir. ...(Interruptions)... No, Sir. There has been a raid this morning, within the precincts of the CMO. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I believe ...(Interruptions)... I believe the Leader of ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: In the morning you have said, Chief Minister's Office. Now you are saying in the precincts. Merely because an alleged corrupt officer ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I believe that question has been clarified. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: This kind of ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I will sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, I will sit down... ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, let the Leader of the House speak, I will speak after that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am saying this on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... The files in the Chief Minister's office ...*(Interruptions)*... The files in the Chief Minister's office are being brought through the CBI. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I believe the Leader of the House has clarified this situation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: It does not even relate to the tenure of the Chief Minister. It relates to an officer for acts done in his earlier capacity. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right. ...*(Interruptions)*... You had your say, now let the Question Hour proceed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, Sir. I need your protection. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: But you have had your say ...*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please understand two things. No one is here to defend a corrupt official.. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is what ...*(Interruptions)*... We are standing...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have said ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is enough, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Go back to your places. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, one minute please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, this has become a federal issue for the Trinamool Congress. Is corruption an issue of federalism for the Trinamool Congress? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Derek, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down ...*(Interruptions)*... आप क्या कह रहे हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप क्या कह रहे हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*... आप बताइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सभापति महोदय, अरुणाचल प्रदेश में * की जा रही है।
...(व्यवधान)...

† قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد) : سبھا پتی مہودے، ارونا پردیش میں * کی جا رہی ہے۔
---(مداخلت)---

MR. CHAIRMAN: Everybody cannot speak at the same time. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सभापति महोदय, नॉन बीजेपी सरकारों को इस बीजेपी की सरकार से बचाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... बीजेपी गवर्नमेंट द्वारा सब नॉन-बीजेपी सरकारों को * ...(व्यवधान)...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد: سبھا پتی مہودے، نان بی-جے-پی-سرکاروں کو اس بی-جے-پی-سرکار سے بچائیے --- (مداخلت) --- بی-جے-پی-گورنمنٹ کے ذریعے سب نان-بی-جے-پی-سرکاروں کو * --- (مداخلت) ---

MR. CHAIRMAN: All right ...(Interruptions)... आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... क्वेश्चन नम्बर 166 ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... Thank you ...(Interruptions)... आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... What is this? ...(Interruptions)... The LOP has spoken, that is enough. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, Article 174 ...(Interruptions)... Sir, Article 174 of the Constitution ...(Interruptions)... No Governor can take any decision ...(Interruptions)...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: सर, ऑनरेबल लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस ने बिल्कुल clear कर दिया, उसके बावजूद भी अगर ...(व्यवधान)... इससे एक बात बिल्कुल clear है कि Congress and * are made for each other और इसलिए ये * को बचाने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... ये * को बचाने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please...(Interruptions)... One minute, please. ...(Interruptions)... Will you give a minute to the Chair? ...(Interruptions)... Please, ...(Interruptions)... Please give a minute to the Chair. ...(Interruptions)... Please...(Interruptions)... आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप एक मिनट मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Please, ...(Interruptions)... Give me a minute, please. Will you please sit down? Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Will the collective wisdom of this House kindly explain to me ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down, I am speaking. ...(Interruptions)... Will the collective wisdom of this House kindly explain to this Chair, what purpose is served by Members violating the privilege of fellow Members by refusing them to ask questions and give answers? Why can you not allow the Question Hour to proceed? You have your chance; you have your say. ...(Interruptions)...

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, during morning hour, certain issues had been raised and those have not been addressed properly. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You know the procedure how to deal with these issues. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Some of the issues were raised in the morning hour and that has not been given proper address. ...(Interruptions).... It has not been replied to. ...(Interruptions).... It is a continuing thing. ...(Interruptions).... Sir, we raised collectively certain issues which are tampering federal democracy of the country ...(Interruptions).... Arunachal is governed by Delhi. ...(Interruptions).... That needs to be addressed on priority, and that is why it is continuing. ...(Interruptions).... Nobody is encroaching anybody's privilege, Sir. ...(Interruptions)....

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, गवर्नमेंट अपने आप में इस हाउस में बाधा डाल रही है। ...(व्यवधान).. क्या कभी सुना है ?..(व्यवधान)..

† قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد) : سر، گورنمنٹ اپنے آپ میں اس ہاؤس میں رخنہ ڈال رہی ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ کیا کبھی سنا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔

MR. CHAIRMAN: That is an allegation. ...(Interruptions).... That is an allegation. No. ...(Interruptions)....

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: क्या कभी सुना है कि सेशन के अंदर ..(व्यवधान).. गैर बी.जे.पी. सरकार के चीफ मिनिस्टर के यहां छापे मारे ...(व्यवधान)...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : کیا کبھی سنا ہے کہ سیشن کے اندر۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ غیر بی۔جے۔پی۔ سرکار کے چیف منسٹر کے یہاں چھاپے مارے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔

श्री सभापति: यह आप लोग क्या कर रहे हैं? इस से क्या फायदा है?

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सरकार गिराने की कोशिश की जाए। ...(व्यवधान).... फिर सेशन कैसे चल सकता है? यह सरकार खुद नहीं चाहती है कि पार्लियामेंट चले। ...(व्यवधान)....

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : سبھا پتی مپودے، نان۔بی۔جے۔پی۔ سرکاروں کو اس بی۔جے۔پی۔ کی سرکار سے بچائیے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ بی۔جے۔پی۔ گورنمنٹ کے ذریعے سب نان۔بی۔جے۔پی۔ سرکاروں کو گرایا جا رہا ہے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, यह सरासर गलत है ...(व्यवधान)....

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 12.30 p.m.

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

The House then adjourned at six minutes past twelve of the clock.

The House reassembled at thirty minutes past twelve of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 166, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Question No. 166. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY (Gujarat): Sir, the Leader of the House has spoken untruth. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Leader of the House was*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ask your question. ...*(Interruptions)*... बैठ जाइए, बैठ जाइए।*(व्यवधान)*.... Please. Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री और संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): सर, one minute. हमारी आपके माध्यम से रिक्वेस्ट है कि आज हाउस को रात के 12.00 बजे तक चलने दीजिए।*(व्यवधान)*... क्योंकि बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी का भी यही निर्णय है कि हम देर रात तक बैठकर काम करेंगे।*(व्यवधान)*... इनको अगर नारा भी लगाना है, तो देर रात तक लगाने दीजिए।*(व्यवधान)*... आज हाउस एडजॉर्न नहीं होना चाहिए।*(व्यवधान)*... हम आज रात के 12.00 बजे तक बैठेंगे....*(व्यवधान)*... कल भी बैठेंगे*(व्यवधान)*... ताकि ये जितने नारे लगाना चाहते हैं, लगाएं।*(व्यवधान)*... चूंकि यह बिजनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी का डिजीज़न भी है*(व्यवधान)*... कि हमें इस सप्ताह से देर रात तक बैठना है।*(व्यवधान)*... इसलिए हमारी सरकार की तरफ से रिक्वेस्ट है*(व्यवधान)*... सदन के जो सदस्य काम करना चाहते हैं,*(व्यवधान)*... उनकी तरफ से रिक्वेस्ट है कि हाउस को आज देर तक रात 12.00 बजे तक चलाया जाए।*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री के. सी. त्यागी (बिहार): सर*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Are you on this question? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री के. सी. त्यागी: केजरीवाल के*(व्यवधान)*... पर छापा पड़ा है*(व्यवधान)*... वह*(व्यवधान)*... के खिलाफ नहीं, वह केजरीवाल के खिलाफ*(व्यवधान)*... इसकी जांच होनी चाहिए।*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री सभापति : बैठ जाइए।*(व्यवधान)*... बैठ जाइए।*(व्यवधान)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Go back to your places. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please go back to your places. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please allow the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... The House is adjourned till 2.00 p.m.

—————