

States and UTs during September-October 2015 which was attended by Education Ministers and officials of the respective States/UTs. The HRD Minister also held zone-wise interactions with district level officials and public representatives across the country *via* video conference.

(c) and (d) Suggestions on NEP have been received from nearly 30 Minority Institutions. Meanwhile, the Government of India has constituted a 'Committee for Evolution of the New Education Policy'. The Committee consists of Shri T.S.R. Subramanian, Former Cabinet Secretary as the Chairman and Smt. Shailaja Chandra, former Chief Secretary, NCT of Delhi, Shri Sevaram Sharma, former Home Secretary, NCT of Delhi, Shri Sudhir Mankad, former Chief Secretary, Gujarat and Prof. J.S. Rajput, former Director, NCERT as members. The Committee has to examine the outcome documents, recommendations and suggestions received and formulate a draft National Education Policy as well as a Framework for Action (FFA) by the end of this month. All suggestions, including those received from Minority Institutions, have been forwarded to the Committee for Evolution of New Education Policy.

Comments received regarding no-detention policy

217. SHRI DEREK O' BRIEN: Will the Minister of HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT be pleased to state:

- (a) the number and details of comments Government has received regarding the no-detention policy;
- (b) the responses received from each State regarding the no-detention policy;
- (c) the details of meetings/consultations held with education experts and stakeholders regarding this policy; and
- (d) whether Government intends to amend the Right to Education Act to allow removal of this policy?

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI SMRITI ZUBIN IRANI): (a) to (c) In pursuance of a resolution adopted in the 59th meeting of the Central Advisory Board of Education (CABE) held on 6th June, 2012, a Sub-Committee was constituted for assessment of implementation of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) in the context of No-Detention provision in the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education (RTE) Act, 2009. The Sub Committee during the course of its work held 5 (five) regional meetings and consulted various stakeholders over the issue of No Detention. The Sub-Committee has submitted its

report in August, 2014. The recommendations of Sub-Committee include, *inter-alia*, measuring Learning Level Outcomes of all children on regular basis, to catalyse a performance-driven culture and review of 'No-Detention' policy and its implementation in a phased manner.

The report of the Sub-Committee was placed before CABE in its meeting held on 19.8.2015, wherein it was decided to request all States/UTs to share their views on the No-Detention policy in writing with Ministry of Human Resource Development. 22 States shared their views on the No. Detention policy out of which 18 States have suggested to modify the No. Detention policy. The summary of the responses received from States is given in the Statement (*See below*).

Additionally, during the consultations held with State Governments for formulation of New Education Policy (NEP), the issues related to No-Detention policy were also covered. Presently, all such suggestions have been forwarded to the Committee for evolution of New Education Policy.

Another Sub-Committee under the Chairpersonship of Minister of Education, Government of Rajasthan has been constituted on 26.10.2015 *inter-alia*, to review the feedback received from States/UTs on the No-Detention policy.

(d) There is no decision at present to amend the RTE Act.

Statement

Comments received from the States regarding No. Detention Policy

Sl. No.	Name of the State/UT	Date of receipt of letter of State Government/UT	Gist of Comments/Remarks of State Government/UTs
1	2	3	4
1.	Bihar	15.09.2015	No-Detention Policy to be withdrawn and Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) Policy should be implemented. Performance of students should be assessed from time to time.
2.	Himachal Pradesh	28.09.2015	1. Introduction of internal examination at class 3rd and third party examination at the level of 5th and 8th classes.

1	2	3	4
			2. Detention of students at 3rd, 5th and 8th classes who fail to acquire class appropriate competences as identified at the respective level.
3.	Madhya Pradesh	21.09.2015	Board examinations at classes 5th & 8th to be held because No. Detention Policy has adverse impact on the academic performance of students..
4.	Mizoram	15.09.2015	All teachers to be trained in various aspect of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) to enable them to practice it effectively. Till the system of CCE stabilizes, the No Detention Policy may be kept in abeyance for 5-7 yrs.
5.	Odisha	07.10.2015	Provisions of 'No Detention' may be revisited and the State may be allowed to follow their own evaluation system at the end of every grade with class appropriate assessment.
6.	Punjab	06.08.2015	Provisions of 'No Detention' may be amended to reintroduce exam system from 1st-8th classes and start Board examination in classes 5th and 8th. A Resolution to this effect has been passed in the Punjab Vidhan Sabha.
7.	Rajasthan	09.09.2015	'No Detention Policy' and 'Age appropriate Admission Policy' to be withdrawn due to the adverse impact in the quality of education on account of decline in the commitment levels of students as well as teachers towards education. Tests/examination and detention provide students a fair stage to perform, besides being a remedy for correcting the deficiency in the knowledge of students.
8.	Sikkim	23.09.2015	Roll out plan of "No detention" in phased manner and assessment at classes 5th and 8th as regular attendance is not ensured by the family and thus 'No Detention' has further aggravated the motivation of students and teachers.

1	2	3	4
9.	Tripura	09.09.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be reviewed as this has led to a state of inattention to the teaching-learning process on the part of the children and has adverse impact on the regular attendance of students and teachers in schools.
10.	Uttar Pradesh	30.9.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be revoked as it has resulted in lack of competition and has reduced the learning outcome of students.
11.	Uttarakhand	27.09.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be withdrawn as this has brought down the standard of education. Half-yearly and annual examinations should be conducted in order to improve the quality of education of students and also their competitive spirits. This would also increase the responsibility of teachers.
12.	Puducherry	23.10.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be reviewed as it has led to deterioration in quality of elementary education and created negative impact on the students' as well as parents' attitude and mentality. Therefore, 'No Detention Policy' needs to be restricted up to class V.
13.	Karnataka	30.10.2015	'No Detention Policy' should continue in its present form as it is important to sustain students' interest in education and provide minimum 8 years of school education. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) should be improved and monitored, year-end evaluation for a few classes should be conducted and students with low scores should be helped in improving their learning through special teaching.
14.	Delhi	28.10.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be amended as this has led to students being promoted to next class without achieving the desired learning level of a class and being able to comprehend and follow the

1	2	3	4
			subject taught. It further results in unreasonable and indisciplined behavior of students or their dropping out of school. 'No Detention Policy' may be restricted up to Junior Primary class, <i>i.e.</i> class 3.
15.	Kerala	26.11.2015	'No Detention Policy' to be withdrawn as there is no harm in allowing a student one more year to recoup rather than allowing the student to pass to the next higher stage in an unbaked condition. The teachers will also be able to assess and correct themselves. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) process to be strengthened. Periodical, terminal and year-end examination will be necessary for an objective analysis of the learning level of the student.
16.	Andhra Pradesh	30.11.2015	'No Detention Policy' should continue as otherwise the dropout rate would increase and it would be difficult to fulfil the objective of universalization of elementary education. Detention of students would demotivate them and lead to rote learning and undue fear of exams on the students and encourage malpractice and suppresses creative thinking, analytical ability, exploration and experimentation skills of the students. Annual examinations should be conducted to assess learning levels for class III, V and VIII. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) should be strengthened. Quality of teaching should be improved.
17.	Gujarat	4.12.2015	'No Detention Policy' to be reviewed and suitably modified.
18.	Nagaland	3.12.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be reviewed as it has adversely affected both the students and teachers. The policy has made the students lazy and non-serious in their studies and the teachers too casual in their approach to teaching. The pass percentage

1	2	3	4
			and the grades/marks obtained by students in class IX and HSLC Examination have declined due to 'No Detention Policy'.
19.	West Bengal	2.12.2015	'No Detention Policy' to be withdrawn as the learning outcomes and school environment has suffered due to the policy. Adequate safeguards may be put in place so that drop outs do not increase.
20.	Haryana	28.10.2015	'No Detention Policy' needs to be withdrawn as it has resulted in deterioration in the quality of education due to decreased commitment levels of stakeholders. The policy has resulted in lackadaisical attitude on part of both students and teachers. For the policy to succeed, optimum teacher-pupil ratio should be optimum, along with compulsory attendance and effective implementation of Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE). Tests/examinations provide students with competitive spirit besides motivating them to study.
21.	Telangana	30.11.2015	'No Detention Policy' should continue to enable a child to learn better without fear of failure, detention and stigma. Continuous and Comprehensive Evaluation (CCE) should be strengthened to evaluate the learning standards of the child regularly and which focuses not on rote learning but encourages creative and critical thinking.
22.	Maharashtra	10.12.2015	'No Detention Policy' should continue with some changes as the policy has reduced school dropout rates and helps in building self esteem. Schools to test children at least thrice every year. States should be given freedom to decide whichever policy to follow.

Note : Responses have not been received from balance 14 States and UTs.