

**The motion was carried by a majority of the total membership of the house and by a majoring of not less than two-thirds of the Members present and voting.**

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I shall now put the Motion of Thanks, as amended, to vote. The question is:

That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:

"That the Members of Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament, assembled together on February 23rd, 2016, but regret that the Address does not mention that the Government is committed to securing the fundamental right of all the citizens to contest elections at all levels, including to Panchayats to further strengthen the foundations of democracy, which also forms part of the basic structure of the Constitution and is consistent with the spirit of the 73rd Amendment to the constitution, intended to expand and encourage democratic participation of the poor and marginalized without imposing educational or any other limitations on the right to contest elections."

*The motion was adopted.*

---

#### **RE. DEMAND TO TAKE UP DISCUSSION ON BILL**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Naqviji, what are we taking up now? ...*(Interruptions)*... Shall we take up the Bill? ...*(Interruptions)*... How much time is there for this Bill? ...*(Interruptions)*... What are we taking up now? Shall we take up the Short Duration Discussion? ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT; THE MINISTER OF HOUSING AND URBAN POVERTY ALLEVIATION; AND THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU): Sir, what about the Real Estate Bill? I have given notice after notice.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naqvi, which Bill have we agreed for today?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Sir, I am of the understanding that the Government Business is decided by the Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs, and I have been asking for this Bill for days together. I don't know what is happening. I feel sorry for it. The public has been agitating...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We can decide it here.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The time has been allotted. There were instances where the House had taken up the Supplementary List of Business. Sir, the announcement was made on 4th....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All of you take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please maintain order in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Is there a Supplementary List? Mr. Minister, I understand that there is no Supplementary List of Business. ...*(Interruptions)*... For that, a Supplementary List of Business has to come, which has not come. For the Real Estate Bill, no Supplementary List has come.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I have been sending reminders continuously since the day before yesterday. I don't know whether...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naqvi will explain. Mr. Naqvi, you explain the position because now the Cabinet Minister says, he wanted to take up this Real Estate Bill. But no Supplementary List is issued. That is what I am saying. ...*(Interruptions)*... We can decide to pass one Bill today. But we take up Short Duration Discussion. That is our decision; that stands. ...*(Interruptions)*... Which Bill ?

अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): सर, आज सुबह भी मीटिंग में यह discuss हुआ था कि Real Estate Bill लिया जाए और इसको Supplementary Business में डाला जाए।

श्री उपसभापति: Supplementary List आई है या नहीं? Venkaiahji, I will explain the position to you. There was a morning meeting when all the parties, including the Government representatives, were there, and, it was unanimously decided there that today we would take up the Short Duration Discussion and one Bill. But that is another Bill. And, tomorrow, your Bill will be taken up. That was the decision taken in the morning. So, accordingly, the Supplementary List of Business was not issued. That decision was taken by the Chairman in consultation with all the party leaders and with your own representatives there.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I am not questioning anything and I don't want to enter into an argument. What I am trying to submit is, saying that we have not received the Supplementary Agenda is not correct.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You had given the proposal, is it?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Yes, Sir. I myself, as Parliamentary Affairs Minister and as Minister of Urban Development, have given it.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, this is as per the decision in the morning.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: I brought it in December and then, I brought it on 15th February.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anyway, it is for tomorrow. You may please include it in the List of Business for tomorrow. We will take it up tomorrow. Now, let us begin the Short Duration Discussion. It is only for two-and-a-half hours, and everybody has to adhere to the time allotted. After that, we will take up one Bill, as agreed in the morning. That is the position. Now, Shri Pramod Tiwari. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI K. N. BALAGOPAL (Kerala): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is that?

SHRI K. N. BALAGOPAL: I want a ruling from you. In the morning, there was an issue raised. We all came here and we were shouting slogans against the use of military for a private purpose...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That was over. Don't raise it again.

SHRI K. N. BALAGOPAL: Sir, I want a ruling from you as to whether a case, under the consideration of a Tribunal, can be considered a *sub judice* affair. Is it similar to a Court case? I want a ruling from the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. I will examine it. I am not a legal expert. So, I will look into the papers and come back to you. Now, Shri Pramod Tiwari.

---

## SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION

### Prevailing agrarian crisis in the country

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी (उत्तर प्रदेश): डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, मैं आपका आभारी हूँ कि देश की जो सबसे बड़ी समस्या है, उस पर आपने मुझे बोलने का मौका दिया है। सर, मैं शुरू तो कर रहा हूँ, लेकिन मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर यह है कि इस समय कृषि मंत्री जी यहां मौजूद नहीं हैं और आपने चर्चा शुरू करा दी। ...(*व्यवधान*)...

अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): प्रमोद तिवारी जी, कृषि राज्य मंत्री जी यहां हैं और कृषि मंत्री जी भी आ रहे हैं, वे on the way हैं। आप अपनी बात कहिए, उसको हम भी नोट कर रहे हैं, आप चिंता मत कीजिए। आपकी हर बात को नोट किया जा रहा है। लीजिए, कृषि मंत्री जी भी आ गए।

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: सर, वैसे तो जब से यह सरकार वादा करके आई है कि अच्छे दिन आने वाले हैं, हर क्षेत्र में बुरे दिन की शुरुआत हो गई है। हर मोर्चे पर यह सरकार असफल हो गई है, लेकिन अगर मोदी सरकार के पिछले दो साल पर नजर डालें, तो इनसे सबसे ज्यादा पीड़ित अगर कोई है, तो वे दो हैं — एक, जो इस देश का अन्नदाता है — किसान और दूसरा