

- (iii) Twentieth Report on action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Tenth Report on 'Demands for Grants (2015-16)' of the Ministry of Agriculture and Farmers Welfare (Department of Agricultural Research and Education).

STATEMENTS BY MINISTERS

Status of Implementation of Recommendations contained in the Two Hundred and Sixty-fourth Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry

सूक्ष्म, लघु और मध्यम उद्यम मंत्री (श्री कलराज मिश्र): महोदय, मैं सूक्ष्म, लघु तथा मध्यम उद्यम मंत्रालय की अनुदान मांगों (2015-16) के संबंध में विभाग-संबंधित उद्योग संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के दो सौ चौंसठवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में एक वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

Status of Implementation of Recommendations contained in the Eleventh Report of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री कृष्ण पाल): महोदय, मैं सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय की अनुदान मांगों (2015-16) के संबंध में विभाग संबंधित सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता संबंधी संसदीय स्थायी समिति के ग्यारहवें प्रतिवेदन में अंतर्विष्ट सिफारिशों/समुक्तियों के कार्यान्वयन की स्थिति के संबंध में एक वक्तव्य सभा पटल पर रखता हूँ।

RE. POINT OF ORDER RAISED BY SOME HON. MEMBERS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, admitted Zero Hour submissions.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I have a Point of Order.
...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, मेरा एक प्वाइंट ऑफ आर्डर है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After him. ...(Interruptions)... What is the Point of Order? ... (Interruptions)... Now, what is the Point of Order and under what rule?
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, I am telling you. *...(Interruptions)...* सर, इस सदन की कार्यवाही नियमों से चलती है, परम्पराओं से चलती है। कल से आज सुबह तक एक महत्वपूर्ण चैनल, विश्वसनीय चैनल एक न्यूज़ दिखा रहा है कि एक क्रिश्चियन मिशन ने वहां की अदालत को एक पत्र लिखा है। मैं उस पत्र की कॉपी भी दे सकता हूं। उसने साफ-साफ कहा है कि भारत सरकार की कुछ एजेंसियां दबाव बना रही हैं और उनसे लगातार सम्पर्क कर रही हैं। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now listen. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: कुछ बिचौलियों के माध्यम से वे प्रयास कर रही हैं कि किसी तरह इस देश के सबसे बलिदानी और प्रतिष्ठित गांधी परिवार को झूठा फंसाया जाए। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, how is it a Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*
No, how is it a Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: मान्यवर, यह देश इस बात का साक्षी है कि इस परिवार ने बलिदान दिया है। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Tiwariji, tell me, how is it a Point of Order?
...(Interruptions)...

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: प्रधान मंत्री के रूप में इन्दिरा गांधी ने बलिदान दिया, राजीव गांधी ने बलिदान दिया।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How it is a Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: सर, कुछ गद्दार ऐसे हैं *...(व्यवधान)...* कुछ गद्दार ऐसे भी हैं, जो दूसरे देशों से पैसा लेकर इस देश में अस्थिरता पैदा करना चाहते हैं। *...(व्यवधान)...* इस देश में अगर लोकतंत्र रहेगा। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Tiwari, how it is a Point of Order?
...(Interruptions)... It is not the question for a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री प्रमोद तिवारी: सर, I am raising it under Rule 267 *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, no, I am not allowing. It is not the question for a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...* It is not a question for Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, kindly read Rule 267. *...(Interruptions)...* सर, इस देश में अगर लोकतंत्र रहेगा, तो संविधान रहेगा। *...(व्यवधान)...* परन्तु इस देश में कुछ ऐसे गद्दार हैं, जो दूसरों से पैसा लेकर पलते हैं, *...(व्यवधान)...* और ये गद्दार उस परिवार पर आंख उठाना चाहते हैं। *...(व्यवधान)...* कि उन पर किसी तरह का मुकदमा बनाया जाए *...(व्यवधान)...* इस देश में अस्थिरता *...(व्यवधान)...* मैं आपसे सिर्फ यह कहना चाहता हूं *...(व्यवधान)...* मैं आपसे

यह विनम्रतापूर्वक अनुरोध करना चाहता हूँ कि गांधी परिवार ...(व्यवधान)... उस पैसे से पलने वाले ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Tiwariji, listen to me now. Mr. Tiwari has not given a notice under Rule 267. What he said is not a Point of Order. So, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Naresh Agrawal's Point of Order, please. ...(Interruptions)... He is on a Point of Order, but you didn't say the Point of Order. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: उपसभापति जी, कल सदन में एथिक्स कमेटी की रिपोर्ट पेश हुई थी। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There is no Point in that Point of Order.

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर, कल सदन में ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट, एक मिनट। ...(व्यवधान)...

सर, कल सदन में एथिक्स कमेटी की रिपोर्ट पेश हुई। उस रिपोर्ट में एक सदस्य की सदस्यता समाप्त करने के लिए रिकमंडेशन दी गई। श्रीमन्, शाम को चेयरमैन साहब ने उन्हीं के त्यागपत्र को स्वीकार कर लिया। अब इससे दो प्रश्न उठे। जब एथिक्स कमेटी की रिपोर्ट सदन के सामने आ गई, तो क्या चेयरमैन साहब को पावर थी कि वे इस्तीफा स्वीकार कर लें? अगर उनको इस्तीफा स्वीकार करने की पावर है, तो फिर एथिक्स कमेटी की रिपोर्ट की स्थिति क्या है? क्या वह रिपोर्ट मानी जाएगी? चूंकि वह इस सदन का एक हिस्सा बन गई है, वह रिपोर्ट सदन के पटल पर पेश हो गई है, तो अब एथिक्स कमेटी की उस रिपोर्ट की क्या वैल्यू होगी? उस पर क्या निर्णय होगा, इस बारे में हम आपसे जानना चाहते हैं। ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If it is a Point of Order, I will allow you. Naresh Agrawal.

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Nominated): Please look at this side also. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If it is a Point of Order, I will allow you. Now, Naresh Agrawalji, that Report is placed in the House. That is a property of the House. With regard to that, the House can take any decision. But, Mr. Chairman got the resignation letter and he acted according to the rules and the Constitution. That you can't question here because that is the action taken by him in his capacity as Mr. Chairman. That is one thing. But, now, the House has the Report. The House is free to discuss that Report. The House is free to take a decision on that. No problem. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर, अब इस पर क्या डिस्कशन होगा? ...(व्यवधान)... इस पर हाउस के सामने एक प्रस्ताव आता, लेकिन उसके पहले चेयरमैन साहब ने इस्तीफा स्वीकार कर लिया। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then the question is. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: तो अब उस रिपोर्ट की validity क्या रह गई? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Point for the House to consider is that if that gentleman has resigned, then see whether the House should discuss or not. It is for the House to consider, not for me. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: अब उसकी validity क्या रह गई? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Jairam Ramesh, are you on a Point of Order?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, a week has passed since I gave a notice on the GSPC KG Basin Scam. The hon. Minister got up and said that whatever decision is taken by Mr. Chairman, the Government would abide by it. One week has gone by since my notice was given. We have had a debate yesterday on the AgustaWestland issue. When is the House going to take up the ₹ 20,000 crore GSPC KG Basin Scam? I want to know. I have given a notice one week ago! It is on a CAG Report. The same CAG Report was quoted yesterday. You allowed a debate on the AgustaWestland issue in which mythical documents, unauthenticated documents were quoted. Those documents are still not authenticated. They are still not laid on the Table of the House. When is the GSPC KG Basin Scam involving ₹ 20,000 crores is going to be taken up in this House? I want an answer now, Sir. I want an answer now. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV (Rajasthan): No, no.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): Sir, the Government has said that they have no objection to have a discussion on this. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, yes. The Government has said. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Government has said on the floor of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes; the Government is ...*(Interruptions)*...to have a discussion. So I would urge upon the Chair, I would request the Chair that at the earliest it should be discussed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, we are hearing in the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Jairamji ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, listen to Shri Jairam Ramesh. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I want a categorical assurance that the House will not be adjourned till we have a discussion on the scam with authenticated documents ...*(Interruptions)*... unlike the bogus documents that were quoted yesterday by Dr. Subramanian Swamy ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please. *...(Interruptions)...* No, no. That is *...(Interruptions)...* You don't refer to that. *...(Interruptions)...* No. *...(Interruptions)...* No, I will tell you. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, it was discussed and ultimately the matter was given to hon. Chairman to decide. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. *...(Interruptions)...* I will tell you. *...(Interruptions)...* No, no. *...(Interruptions)...* I will come back to that. *...(Interruptions)...* I am coming back to the subject that it was *...(Interruptions)...* Sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, let me react to that. *...(Interruptions)...* No *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Sir, there was a consensus *...(Interruptions)...* and the Government accepted *...(Interruptions)...* Now, they cannot run away. It was a clear understanding. *...(Interruptions)...* They are running away. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; they are not running away. Who told you that they are running away? *...(Interruptions)...* The position is different. *...(Interruptions)...* No, no. The position is not that. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: It is not a question of anybody running away. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, it is put up to the hon. Chairman. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Minister. *...(Interruptions)...* Let me listen to the Minister. *...(Interruptions)...* Let me listen to the Minister. *...(Interruptions)...*

अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): सर, ऑनरेबल लीडर ऑफ दि अपोजिशन ने जो कहा है कि हम चर्चा के लिए तैयार हैं, पहली बात तो यह है कि वह factually गलत है। इस मामले में, इस मुद्दे पर कांग्रेस के मित्रों ने एक नोटिस दिया है और उस नोटिस पर सरकार का रुख, ऑनरेबल लीडर ऑफ दि हाउस ने बहुत स्पष्ट तरीके से कहा था कि जिस इश्यू का राज्यों की विधान सभाओं की पीएसी परीक्षण करती है, उसे examine करती है, उसके बारे में हम लोक सभा या राज्य सभा में चर्चा न करें। *...(व्यवधान)...* दूसरी बात यह है कि संविधान में बहुत स्पष्ट है *...(व्यवधान)...* संविधान के अनुच्छेद 151 में कहा गया है। "the reports of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India relating to the accounts of the Union shall be submitted to the President, who shall cause them to be laid before each House of Parliament." Then it says, "the reports of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India relating to the accounts of a State shall be submitted to the Governor of the State, who shall cause them to be laid before the Legislature of the State." *...(Interruptions)...* This is very clear cut. हम संविधान के दायरे में बात करना चाहते हैं। *...(व्यवधान)...* उसके बाद भी हमने कहा कि इसको हमने ऑनरेबल चेयरमैन पर छोड़ दिया है। *...(व्यवधान)...* इस पर ऑनरेबल चेयरमैन जो निर्णय करेंगे, वह हम सबको मान्य होगा। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; that is the position. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, it is very clear. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Deputy Chairman, Sir, *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is very clear. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it was discussed *...(Interruptions)...* What the Minister has said today *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. *...(Interruptions)...* Your leader and Shri Jairam Ramesh, both have spoken, why do you speak again? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I will tell you why. What the Minister has just said, this was discussed earlier. As you would recall and the House will recall, we had Pointed it out. First of all, it is not the State issue. *...(Interruptions)...* Off shore oil exploration *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; don't go to the merit at all. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: *...is not a State issue. ... (Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No need of going to the merit. *...(Interruptions)...* I tell you...*...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Banks and financial institutions are involved and it is an inter-State subject. *...(Interruptions)...* That is why it was agreed *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I tell you. *...(Interruptions)...* What the Minister said *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Now, they are running away from it. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, they have not. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Now, they are again quoting. *...(Interruptions)...* They can't face the truth. *...(Interruptions)...* सच्चाई नहीं कह सकते, सच्चाई नहीं सुन सकते। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Why are you *...(Interruptions)...* What is the need of...*...(Interruptions)...* What is the need of this shadow fight? *...(Interruptions)...* The Minister, of course, *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, this is not a shadow fight. *...(Interruptions)...* This is a real fight. *...(Interruptions)...* This is not a shadow fight. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, let me see *...(Interruptions)...* I will tell you.

...(Interruptions)... Okay; I agree. ...(Interruptions)... Now, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Yes; I agree. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Yes; it is a real fight, I agree. ...(Interruptions)... Now, you sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Listen, the Point is ...(Interruptions)... The reason why I have said it a shadow fight is, there need not be any fight. Yes, the Government has placed on record their views first saying that the discussion is not needed and they have quoted certain constitutional rules. But in the end the Parliamentary Affairs Minister said, in spite of all this, if the hon. Chairman decides to have a discussion, the Government is agreeable to that. ...(Interruptions)... Let me say. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Are you not seeing I am on my legs? ...(Interruptions)... Jairam Rameshji is a senior Member ...(Interruptions)... See, I can't understand Shri Jairam Ramesh jumping up like this when I am on my legs. ...(Interruptions)... You sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Let me complete. ...(Interruptions)... Okay; all right. ...(Interruptions)... Then I don't want to say anything. ...(Interruptions)... Then I don't want to say anything. ...(Interruptions)... Then, Shri Hanumantha Rao will come to the Chair and decide it. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Hanumantha Rao, come to the Chair and decide it, if you don't want me to say. ...(Interruptions)... I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)... Your notice is with me. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down, I will allow you. ...(Interruptions)... The first Point is, the problem with some of my very learned friends, very important and very senior friends is, when an issue is raised, the Chair has to respond and by that it may settle. But, then, again and again and again, they are standing up, that should not be. What I am saying is this. It is said in the House by the Government that if the hon. Chairman takes a decision, they will agree to that. You have raised it. I will convey your feeling to the hon. Chairman. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): When?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, what we... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will convey it today itself.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: But we are left with only one week. Within this week, this should be discussed. ...(Interruptions)... That is our request. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: For a discussion, only one day is needed; one week is not needed. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री के. सी. त्यागी (बिहार): सर, मैं आपसे निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि मीटिंग में आप भी थे, पार्लियामेंटरी अफेयर्स मिनिस्टर भी थे, नेता प्रतिपक्ष भी थे, राम गोपाल जी भी थे, मैं भी था और नरेश अग्रवाल जी भी थे।

श्री उपसभापति: आप क्या कहना चाहते हैं?

श्री के. सी. त्यागी: सर, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि उस मीटिंग में यह डिसाइड हो गया था कि दो शॉर्ट ड्यूरेशन नोटिसेज accept किए जाएंगे — एक अगस्ता पर और दूसरा उस पर, इसलिए अब तो इससे पीछे भागने वाली बात हो जाएगी, अगर आप कहेंगे कि इस पर कोई डिबेट नहीं हो सकती है। सर, BAC की मीटिंग के फैसले को बदलने का अधिकार किसी individual को है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI VIJAY GOEL (Rajasthan): Sir,...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; he is on a Point of Order. ...**(Interruptions)**... I replied to it also. I said that I will convey your feeling to the hon. Chairman. ...**(Interruptions)**... Yes, I will convey this.

श्री के. सी. त्यागी: सर, BAC की मीटिंग में very categorically यह तय किया गया कि दो शॉर्ट ड्यूरेशन नोटिसेज लिए जाएंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI V. P. SINGH BADNORE (Rajasthan): Sir, the BAC meeting cannot decide...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The BAC meeting has to be decided by the hon. Chairman. I will convey to him. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI V. P. SINGH BADNORE: It decides on time of the House. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Badnore, sit down. He is on a Point of Order. What is your Point of Order?

श्री विजय गोयल: सर, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर वही है, जो नरेश अग्रवाल जी ने उठाया है। आपने कहा कि चेयरमैन का prerogative था और उन्होंने रूल के हिसाब से उसको तय किया। एथिक्स कमिटी बैठी उसने देखा कि विजय माल्या ने एक अपराध किया है, उसके ऊपर उन्होंने एक डिस्मिशन लिया और उस डिस्मिशन से पहले accept कर लिया गया। अगर कोई व्यक्ति जो गवर्नमेंट सर्विस में होगा, वह करप्शन करेगा और फिर वह गवर्नमेंट सर्विस से रिजाइन करके चला जाएगा, तो उसके ऊपर केस चलेगा या नहीं चलेगा? मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि उसके ऊपर एथिक्स कमिटी कार्रवाई कर सकती है या नहीं कर सकती है?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen. I don't want to give a ruling on that. That is a legal Point. But, however, I want to tell you that the hon. Chairman, as the Chairman of the House, is to act as the Chairman. That all he has done. That does not mean the House should not discuss a report. That is a different matter. This is not a ruling. This is only my view. But, if you want a ruling, I will come to that later. ...**(Interruptions)**... Now, Dr. Subramanian Swamy. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: No. ...**(Interruptions)**...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: No, Sir. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, I have been raising my hand for a long time. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has given... *...(Interruptions)...* It is a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...* He is on a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...* He is on a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, I have been raising my hand. *...(Interruptions)...* You have called the Members from both the sides. What about me? *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has given a notice for Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...* Hon. Members, he has given a notice for a Point of Order. That is why I am calling him. We should listen to it. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, there is something more... *...(Interruptions)...* Sir, you should listen to it. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is on a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, please. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are raising it... *...(Interruptions)...* No, no. *...(Interruptions)...* You have already raised it. You have already said it. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have to say something more. *...(Interruptions)...* Please let me say this. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: See, you people cannot monopolize. The left side cannot monopolize. The LOP spoke, Shri Jairam spoke; Shri Tiwari spoke; now you are speaking; no. *...(Interruptions)...* Dr. Subramanian Swamy. *...(Interruptions)...* Dr. Subramanian Swamy. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, first allow me. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I have not allowed. *...(Interruptions)...*

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, my Point of Order arises from...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir,... *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are monopolizing. *...(Interruptions)...* You already spoke. Shri Jairam Ramesh spoke. All of you spoke. Let me listen to him. *...(Interruptions)...*

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, may I raise my Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The floor is given to Dr. Subramanian Swamy. ...*(Interruptions)*... The floor is given to Dr. Subramanian Swamy because he has given in writing that he wants to raise a Point of Order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please allow that. That has precedence. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Anand Sharma, you already raised your Point. Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I have not.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. You cannot monopolize. He has given in writing that he wants to raise a Point of Order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: You have not given me the chance. You have not heard me what I have to raise. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to allow him. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have called him. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, Mr. Anand Sharma, I am not allowing you. ...*(Interruptions)*... You please wait until he completes. ...*(Interruptions)*... That is a different matter. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have called him. If you are very particular, wait until he completes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, you will have to hear me. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is very important. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't try to force upon me. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Do not try to monopolize. ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. Subramanian Swami, as a Member, has every right to raise a Point of Order. ...*(Interruptions)*... You can raise everything, why can't he do that. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is your Point of Order, Dr. Subramanian Swamy? ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, my Point of Order is that the Government should make a statement on a matter of great importance. The Prime Minister and the Chief Justice of India have spoken about the backlog in the Supreme Court. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Is it a Point of Order? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will decide that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I listen to everybody's Point of Order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I want to say that there is a consensus now. Both sides have agreed that if the Supreme Court decides the matter – which I am going to mention, that is, the Ram Temple matter – it is an acceptable solution to both. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, that is not a Point of Order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI (Madhya Pradesh): Is that a Point of Order?
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not a Point of Order. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, the Point of Order is that the Government of Narsimha Rao ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Dr. Subramanian Swamy, it is not a Point of Order. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Sir, the Point of Order is that the Government must make a statement because contrary to that the Solicitor General and
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can approach the Government. There is no problem in it. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: All are agreeing to a day-to-day hearing
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In any case, it is not a Point of Order. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: The House should be known ...(Interruptions)..
This matter should be decided on a day-to-day ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: Sir, I also have a Point of Order.
...(Interruptions)... If you can allow him, why can't me? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already said that it is not a Point of Order.
...(Interruptions)... Then, why do you want to question it? ...(Interruptions)...

DR. SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: The Ram Temple matter should be decided on basis of day-to-day hearing. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not a Point of Order. Please sit down.
...(Interruptions)... I can only decide after hearing ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: If he can raise his Point of Order
...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You sit down. ...(Interruptions)... How are you questioning me? ...(Interruptions)... I have allowed him. What is the harm in it?
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: If he has a right to speak on a Point, why cannot I speak? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no. You are questioning me. *...(Interruptions)...*
You cannot question the Chair. *...(Interruptions)...* You cannot question me.
...(Interruptions)... No; no. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: This is not fair. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Sit down.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: * *...(Interruptions)...* * *...(Interruptions)...* हम
यहाँ कोई बच्चे नहीं हैं। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; no. *...(Interruptions)...* I will have to invoke
Rule 255. *...(Interruptions)...* What is he doing? *...(Interruptions)...* No; no. Sit down.
...(Interruptions)... Don't think that some people have special privilege. I allow
everybody's Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...* Let me complete. *...(Interruptions)...* I
allow everybody's Point of Order and listen to them. The subject may be irrelevant.
But in Order to decide whether it is relevant or irrelevant, I will have to listen to
that. I heard him. And, after hearing him, I said, "It is not a Point of Order." How
can a Member question that? That is the procedure. *...(Interruptions)...* You cannot
question that. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: I did not question that. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then, what did you do? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: I have a Point of Order. Why should I not
be allowed, if he can be allowed? *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have given a ruling that it is not a Point of
Order. *...(Interruptions)...* Then, why did you question that? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: I have no objection to *...(Interruptions)...*
But the question is *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Anand Sharma. What do you want to
say? *...(Interruptions)...* Are you on a Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Yes, Sir. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: I also have a Point of Order. *...(Interruptions)...*

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Anand Sharma. *...(Interruptions)...* What is your Point of Order? *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have an important Point of Order. My Point of Order is about the proceedings, yesterday, in this august House. There were certain documents, sensitive documents from the Ministry of Defence, the CBI and the ED, which were read by one hon. Member, * *...(Interruptions)...* And, he had promised to authenticate *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I had given a ruling *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, my Point of Order is that the House must know how a Member was given access to sensitive Government files, which he has refused to authenticate until now. *...(Interruptions)...* This is my *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I had given a ruling at that time itself that the papers which he read should be authenticated and placed. If that is not complied with *...(Interruptions)...* If that is not complied with, the rule will take its own course. *...(Interruptions)...* Okay, sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* That is enough. *...(Interruptions)...* That is enough. *...(Interruptions)...* No, I will not explain it now. *...(Interruptions)...* Zero Hour. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, Zero Hour. *...(Interruptions)...* Dr. Chandrapal Singh Yadav. *...(Interruptions)...* I told you. *...(Interruptions)...* I have given the ruling. *...(Interruptions)...* That it has to be complied with. *...(Interruptions)...* I gave the ruling. It has to be complied with. Sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* I am not allowing you. *...(Interruptions)...* No; I am not allowing you. *...(Interruptions)...* I am not allowing you. *...(Interruptions)...* I am not allowing you. *...(Interruptions)...* Not allowed. *...(Interruptions)...* Not allowed. *...(Interruptions)...* Not allowed. *...(Interruptions)...* Go back to your seat. *...(Interruptions)...* Not allowed. *...(Interruptions)...* No. I am not permitting you to place it on the Table of the House. I am not permitting. See, with regard to the matter raised by Shri Anand Sharma, yesterday itself, I had given the ruling that whatever was quoted should be authenticated and placed on the Table of the House. That has to be complied with. *...(Interruptions)...* Sit down.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: How long?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That has to be complied with. Sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, Dr. Chandrapal Singh Yadav. *...(Interruptions)...* Dr. Chandrapal Singh Yadav. *...(Interruptions)...*

डा. चंद्रपाल सिंह यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं आपका ध्यान *...(व्यवधान)...*

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: सर, इन्होंने पेपर्स authenticate करके सबमिट किये हैं। हम इनको जानकारी देना चाहते हैं कि जितने चिंतित आप हैं ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are not permitted to distribute.

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: आप से ज्यादा चिंता स्वामी जी पहले ही कर लेते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Zero Hour submissions.

MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

Demand to conferring Bharat Ratna Award on legendary hockey player Major Dhyan Chand

डा. चंद्रपाल सिंह यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं आज इस सदन का ध्यान बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is that being distributed without permission? You cannot distribute anything without my permission. Yes, please.

डा. चंद्रपाल सिंह यादव: माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं आज सदन का ध्यान एक विशेष महत्व के सवाल के ऊपर दिलाना चाहता हूँ। हॉकी के जादूगर मेजर ध्यानचन्द को इस दुनिया में कौन नहीं जानता? मेजर ध्यानचन्द झांसी में जन्मे और उन्होंने हॉकी के माध्यम से, जहां हॉकी का, वहीं पूरे देश का नाम दुनिया में रोशन करने का काम किया।

उपसभापति जी, उन्होंने 1928 में, 1932 में और 1936 में तीन ओलम्पिक खेलों में भारत को जिताने का काम किया। उन्होंने तीनों ओलम्पिक खेलों में 48 मैच खेले और उन्होंने 109 गोल करके पूरी दुनिया में रिकॉर्ड कायम करने का काम किया।

उपसभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से सदन में कहना चाहता हूँ कि उन्होंने जो विश्व रिकॉर्ड बनाया, आज तक के इतिहास में कोई उस रिकॉर्ड को तोड़ नहीं पाया और उनके प्रदर्शन को देखकर हिटलर ने पेशकश की थी कि वे जर्मनी की तरफ से खेलें, लेकिन मेजर ध्यानचन्द ने उसके लिए साफ मना कर दिया और उन्होंने हिन्दुस्तान की मर्यादा के लिए, हिन्दुस्तान के लिए खेलने का काम किया।

उपसभापति जी, क्रिकेट के बहुत बड़े खिलाड़ी सर डॉन ब्रैडमैन ने कहा कि मैं मेजर ध्यानचन्द का बहुत बड़ा प्रशंसक हूँ और उन्होंने गोल इतनी आसानी से किए कि मैं इतनी आसानी से रन नहीं बना सकता। उनको हॉकी कोच बनाने के लिए अमेरिका, जर्मनी और आस्ट्रेलिया ने पेशकश की, लेकिन उन्होंने इस बात के लिए मना कर दिया। उन्होंने कहा कि मैं जो भी करूंगा, वह हिन्दुस्तान के लिए करूंगा, भारत माता के लिए करूंगा।

उपसभापति जी, 25 जुलाई, 2015 को "भारत गौरव पुरस्कार" से ब्रिटिश पार्लियामेंट ने उन्हें सम्मानित किया, भले ही अंग्रेजों ने हमारे ऊपर सैकड़ों वर्षों तक शासन किया। माननीय मोदी