

**CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT  
PUBLIC IMPORTANCE — Contd.**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is against the rule. No clarifications can be allowed over clarifications. It cannot be allowed ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री दिलीप कुमार तिरकी:** सर, माननीय मंत्री जी ने एक बात गलत बतायी है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What the hon. Minister replied was to your clarifications. There cannot be clarifications over clarifications. I cannot allow this. ...*(Interruptions)*... You please cooperate with me. I was liberal in allowing clarifications. I had allowed not only those Members who gave their names in time, but also those Members who gave their names afterwards. There is no procedure in this House for seeking clarifications over clarifications. For Calling Attention, you sought clarifications and the Minister has already replied. She has finally assured that all the issues will be taken care of. So, there is no need of further clarifications ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, there are certain statements made in the House which are not factual ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then you give notice...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: I am ready to point out the factual error ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Tapanji, you sought your clarifications after reading the statement of the Minister. If there was anything in the statement which was factually incorrect, you could have raised the issue at that time. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, there were factual errors in the statement made by the Minister in reply to the clarifications sought ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then give notice ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री दिलीप कुमार तिरकी:** सर, चूंकि हम माननीय मंत्री जी के उत्तर से संतुष्ट नहीं हैं, इसलिए हम सदन से वॉकआउट करते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI ANUBHAV MOHANTY: Sir, we are not satisfied with the reply of the Minister. So, we are walking out.

*(At this stage some Hon. Members left the Chamber.)*

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Sir, the Government of Odisha has sent all the papers. They are standing and telling here that they have not received them. Is it not a factual deficiency?. Sir, within the two States' MoUs, if this is not implemented, has the Central Government no role to play? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to go by the rule.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Are the States of Odisha and Chhattisgarh sovereign States? They are part of the Indian Union ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot allow discussion on this. ...*(Interruptions)*... You give notice saying that the Minister's statement is wrong. I will examine it. I cannot allow a discussion now ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Raja, how can I allow a discussion like this? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam Ramesh, what is this? You know the rules.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I am on another topic.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Then you give notice ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Yesterday, the House could not function because of continued uncertainty on the Private Members' Bill ...*(Interruptions)*... I want to know as to what the position of the Government is ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Kanimozhiji, I know you are on another subject. You give notice. I know your subject is not Mahanadi ...*(Interruptions)*... You sit down ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: While the voting took place, ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will sort it out ...*(Interruptions)*... The Deputy Leader of the Congress Party, Shri Anand Sharma, you rein in your Member. This is absolutely wrong. Don't do this. No; don't do this. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will sort out the problem. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Ramachandra Rao, please don't do this. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Ramachandra Rao, please don't do this. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am requesting the Deputy Leader of the Congress Party to rein in him and ask him to behave. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, the private member is very agitated. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know, I know. ...*(Interruptions)*... You sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will deal with that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, that is of great concern. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will deal with that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH : Sir, voting must take place. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Jairamji, you sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... You please go back. ...*(Interruptions)*... See, if you can go back to your seats. One of you raised the issue, we will sort it out. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please do that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us solve the problem. ...*(Interruptions)*... See, I know.....*(Interruptions)*... I will finish. ...*(Interruptions)*... I know, this side, the Congress Party wants a discussion on that particular....

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: No discussion; voting. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, voting. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will come to that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Voting, if that is your request, we will discuss and decide it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, no discussion; voting. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD) : No, Sir. Let us have a vote. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. LoP. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay, I will answer that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me reply to that. Yes, Mr. Jairam Ramesh and hon. LoP have asked for voting on the Private Members' Bill on which the discussion was over. That I know. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, the Minister's reply is over. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have agreed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Discussion over means it is everything. ...*(Interruptions)*... No; let me. ...*(Interruptions)*... I can listen to you only when you speak from your seat and not from here. ...*(Interruptions)*... I can listen to you from your seat only. You go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Go to your seat. Please go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will allow you; you go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, please listen to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Ramachandra Rao, you sit and listen to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't do this, Shri Ramachandra Rao. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Ramachandra Rao, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't show it. It is an insult to me. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are actually insulting me. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am telling you it is an insult to the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... Totally disobeying. Totally ignoring the direction of the Chair. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is an insult. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay, please. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) Please listen to me, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the point is... *(Interruptions)*... Now, listen, listen. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, please. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I told you that I will listen to you. *(Interruptions)*... Sit down. *(Interruptions)*... I told you that I will allow you, sit down. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, please. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I told you that I will allow you; sit down. *(Interruptions)*... I told you. *(Interruptions)*... You should know the basic rule that when the Chair is standing, you should not stand up. *(Interruptions)*... That is the basic fundamental rule every Member should know. *(Interruptions)*... At least, know that rule and go by that. *(Interruptions)*... Now, listen, I know the problem, but hon. LoP, I want to tell you, the discussion was over; correct. The reply was over; correct. But that is a Private Members' Bill. It can only be taken.

SHRI C.M. RAMESH (Telangana): Sir, quorum was not there. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It can only be taken up on the day allotted for Private Members' Business. *(Interruptions)*... Otherwise, it can also be taken on any other day, provided the BAC decides accordingly. *(Interruptions)*... Let me say. It is correct that the Chairman, in consultation with the Leader of the House, has to decide and the BAC has to finally allot the time also. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, voting was deliberately prevented on Friday. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me complete. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: The time allotted for voting... *(Interruptions)*... The Government ran away from the vote, deliberately prevented the vote. *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Therefore, at this point of time, I am unable to take up that Private Members' Bill, nor am I able to allow voting. *(Interruptions)*... I am unable as I am bound by the rules of the House, so I cannot do that. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: What happened to the Rule on Friday when voting was sabotaged? *(Interruptions)*...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, *(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am saying that. *(Interruptions)*... That is what I

am saying. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me complete. But I am also saying that I will convey the feeling to the hon. Chairman, and the hon. Chairman may consult the Leader of the House. If the decision is taken, we can have it tomorrow or the day after tomorrow or Friday. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. T. SUBBARAMI REDDY: We do not agree, Sir. We want it to be taken up today itself. ...*(Interruptions)*... We won't allow the House... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot do it. I cannot do it. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry; I cannot do it. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am sorry; I cannot do. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am bound by the rules of the House. रूल्स के अनुसार काम करना मेरी जाब है। रूल्स के खिलाफ मैं कुछ नहीं कर सकता। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: सर, अभी "कैम्पा" लगा हुआ है, उसके बाद जो भी ...*(व्यवधान)*... उस पर हमें किसी तरह की कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen to the Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Listen to the Minister.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Let the House decide it.

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: उस पर चेयर जो भी एलाउ करती है, उसी पर आप चर्चा कीजिए। लेकिन सर, अभी जब यह "कैम्पा" पास हो जाएगा तो इसी आन्ध्र प्रदेश को 2,023 करोड़ रुपए चले जाएंगे। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री मोहम्मद अली खान (आन्ध्र प्रदेश): आप इसकी बात कीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

† جناب محمد علی خان: آپ اس کا بات کیجئے (مداخلت)

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: न केवल आन्ध्र प्रदेश को बल्कि उत्तर प्रदेश, उत्तराखंड, हिमाचल प्रदेश, राजस्थान और तमाम राज्यों को 33,000 करोड़ रुपये दिए जा रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री मधुसूदन मिश्री (गुजरात): फॉरेस्ट ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: हम उन राज्यों को वनीकरण के लिए, उन राज्यों के गरीबों, आदिवासियों, कमजोर तबकों के रोजगार के लिए पैसा देना चाहते हैं, लेकिन आप हमको रोकना चाहते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह हमारा आप पर आरोप है कि आप उन राज्यों के विकास को रोकना चाहते हैं। उन राज्यों को जो पैसा केन्द्र सरकार देना चाहती है, उसको आप रोक रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: यह बिल्कुल गलत आरोप है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Let the Government agree. ...*(Interruptions)*... CAMPA can come up later. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: सर, यह उन राज्यों के साथ अन्याय है, गरीबों के साथ अन्याय है, आदिवासियों के साथ अन्याय है, कमजोर तबकों के साथ अन्याय है और यह अन्याय देश बरदाश्त नहीं करेगा। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What can I do? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Anand Sharma, please tell me what I can do. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, please hear me, ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, this situation is entirely the creation of the Government. The Government created this on Friday by disrupting the House; by preventing the Bill to be taken up for voting after the discussion was over.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is all over. Now, what can I do?

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Now, the rules provide with clarity that if the Leader of the Council agrees, then, the House can take it up. It is a Private Member's Bill. We request you to protect the right of the Member. The Government cannot object today, after one year, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MADHUSUDAN MISTRY: The House agrees.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The House has discussed thrice, and the Minister has replied. Therefore, let the Government be fair. You make amends. It is penance for you. आप पश्चाताप करो जो आपने किया है और अब मान जाओ। जो आपने शुक्रवार को किया, उसका प्रायश्चित्त करो। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी:** आनन्द जी, पश्चाताप तो आपको करना पड़ेगा, जो आप कर रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will call you. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will allow you. Go to your seat. आप वहाँ से मत बोलिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Do not speak from here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी:** पश्चाताप आपको करना पड़ेगा, जो आप राज्यों और गरीबों के विकास में बाधा डाल रहे हैं। यह पश्चाताप आपको करना पड़ेगा और निश्चित तौर ...*(व्यवधान)*... जहाँ तक आन्ध्र प्रदेश का सवाल है, हम उनके पक्ष में हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम चाहते हैं कि आंध्र प्रदेश का विकास होना चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हम चाहते हैं कि आन्ध्र प्रदेश के स्टेटस के बारे में चर्चा होनी चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हमने कभी नहीं रोका, लेकिन ऐसे थोड़े ही होता है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... अगर प्राइवेट मेम्बर्स बिल ...*(व्यवधान)*... फ्राइडे है ...*(व्यवधान)*... तो हम तैयार हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... उसके अलावा ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: From the Chair, I can give an assurance. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी:** उसके अलावा, जिस दिन चाहिए ...*(व्यवधान)*... एक घंटा, दो घंटा, तीन घंटा चर्चा कर लीजिए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Naqviji, from the Chair, I will give an assurance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Let the Government agree to take it up on Friday. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let the Government agree to take it up on this Friday. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: From the Chair, I can give an assurance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, it can be taken up this Friday. Let the Leader of the Council be called. Why is the Minister getting agitated?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is what I am saying.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Let the Leader of the Council agree and we may take it up on Friday. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anand Sharmaji, I will give an assurance from the Chair, if it is acceptable to both sides. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Reddy, you go to your seat, and then only you can speak. I will allow you if you go to your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... If you go to your seat and stand there, I will allow you. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot speak from here. ...*(Interruptions)*... You go back. Listen, from the Chair, I have a formula of compromise, if you agree. It is like this. This Friday is for Resolutions, according to our pattern of working. But, as you said, the Chairman can, according to the rules, take a decision to have the Bill, certainly, in consultation with the Leader of the House. Therefore, I will convey the feelings of the House because the Government has also agreed that they are ready for a discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will convey, which is, more or less, the consensus of the House, that on this Friday, instead of Resolutions, the Bills may be taken up. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please let me complete. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, there is a flaw in your argument.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me complete and then I will allow you. सुनिए, सुनिए! ...*(व्यवधान)*... Even if I have to correct myself, I will correct, but listen to me. So, I would request hon. Chairman and inform about the consensus of the House that this Friday we will take up the Bill. And since the discussion on the Bill is over, and if the reply is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... I said 'if the discussion is over'. Then, whatever step is to be taken next, either voting or reply, whatever it is, will be taken up. Therefore, this Friday, we decide with the consent of the hon. Chairman to take up that Bill, if it is acceptable to both sides. The second point is, why I said this is because, I remember,

[Mr. Deputy Chairman]

last Thursday, there was a decision of the House. The decision was that the Compensatory Afforestation Fund Bill will be taken up on Monday. That was yesterday, and it will be disposed of. That was the decision of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... ठीक है! You allow me to speak, please. From the Chair, I also said that it is a ruling also. So, now I feel guilty that that decision could not be implemented. I feel humiliated that my ruling is not taken seriously, and therefore, this is a solution to satisfy all. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is my suggestion, if you agree. If you give your opinion from this side and from that side, then, we will take it up on Friday. Do you agree? ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Jairam Ramesh, can you say something about my opinion?

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: We agree.

श्री मेघराज जैन (मध्य प्रदेश): तीन-तीन बार कोरम के अभाव में ...*(व्यवधान)*... क्या बात कर रहे हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: With due respect to you, Sir, you are trying to find a way forward, and we will support you to find a way forward. We are as much interested in having the CAMPA Bill discussed as Mr. Naqvi, as Mr. Dave and everybody else. We are as much concerned with the rights of State Governments. We are more concerned about the rights of *Adivasis*. That is a separate issue. The issue is this: on Friday afternoon, deliberately a voting on the Private Members' Bill was prevented. That is the reality. Sir, now you are saying that it will be taken up on Friday. What is the guarantee? We take you on your word. What is the guarantee that the Leader of the House will not get up on Friday and say that it is a Money Bill and the Rajya Sabha is not competent to discuss this? Are you going to give us the guarantee that voting will take place? It is because all of today and all of yesterday the Finance Minister has been saying that this is a Money Bill. On 7th of August, 2015 the President gave his assent to the introduction of this Bill. From 7th of August this Bill has been in this House. Nobody has raised the Money Bill issue. Yesterday suddenly, the Finance Minister has raised this.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, he did not say it in the House. He said nothing about it in the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: On Friday, this is what the Finance Minister will say. That is why we want the voting now, and not on Friday.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How do you read the Finance Minister's mind? Do you have any communication? ...*(Interruptions)*... Is there a direct communication between Finance Minister's mind and your mind?

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: He has been saying this. Sir, the Finance Minister's mind is known to everybody in the Central Hall. His mind is on display in the Central Hall. The Central Hall is abuzz that this is a Money Bill. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री शरद यादव** (बिहार): उपसभापति महोदय, आपने एक अच्छा समाधान दिया है। मैं मानता हूँ कि यह सदन जैसा आज चल रहा है, वैसा... जिस दिन फाइनेंस मिनिस्टर इस पर बोलेंगे, लीडर ऑफ द हाउस बोलेंगे, उनकी सहमति, असहमति के बारे में यह शंका कर रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सदन में आपने जो बात रखी है, उसके माध्यम से एक रास्ता निकाला है। मैं मानता हूँ कि सभी लोगों को इस पर सहमत होना चाहिए। फ्राइडे को इसको पक्का लेकर, यह तो सदन की इच्छा है कि अगर हम वोटिंग चाहेंगे, तो होगी, इसको कौन रोक सकता है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री मेघराज जैन**: उपसभापति महोदय ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह क्या बात है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Redely, what is that you want to say?

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, I have a point to make. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not merely about voting, even the discussion has to take place. Though a discussion took place at that time, my party, the YSR Congress Party did not have any representation in this House. It is a very important issue concerning the people of Andhra Pradesh. It is the Congress Party which is squarely responsible for the division of the State and the apathy of the people of Andhra Pradesh. I want to make my submission. Please allow me some time and I will make my observation on that issue; that can be considered as my maiden speech.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If there be any discussion like that, I will allow you.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: I would like to make my maiden speech on this issue at that time.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Ramesh.

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: In the last Session, this Bill came up and everybody discussed it. The Minister also gave the reply. Finally, it came up for voting and, at that time, there was no quorum and it got postponed. Now, if you allow, within ten minutes, the voting will be over. Then, CAMPA Bill can be taken up. All the Bills can be taken up as everybody is ready. All the Members are here today. Within ten minutes, it can be over.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The rule does not permit that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: Sir, we have changed it so many times. It is an important issue relating to Andhra Pradesh. ...*(Interruptions)*... Everybody is here; it could be done. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY): Sir, either this side or that side, both have been delaying the matter. One side says that it is a Money Bill and it can't be taken up...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody has said it in the House. From the Government, nobody said it in the House.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EARTH SCIENCES (SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY): Sir, it is decided that in the interest of the State of Andhra Pradesh, let there be voting or a discussion to understand the status of the assurances given on the floor of the House as well as the Act. What is the status as on today? Two-and-a-half years have been completed and we should understand what the Government is likely to do on the commitments under the Act as well as on the assurances given. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are a part of the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI Y.S. CHOWDARY: Of course, collectively. I am a part of the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी:** डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि हम पूरी तरह से तैयार हैं कि ये आन्ध्र प्रदेश के मुद्दे पर शॉर्ट ड्यूरेशन डिस्कशन कर लें, कॉलिंग अटेंशन कर लें, हम किसी भी मुद्दे से भाग नहीं रहे हैं। हम चाहते हैं कि ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति:** मेरे सुझाव के बारे में...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी:** जहां तक फ्राइडे का इश्यू है, वह होता रहेगा। अगर सदन चाहता है कि आन्ध्र प्रदेश के मुद्दे पर चर्चा करनी है, तो ये कभी भी चर्चा का नोटिस दे दें। ...*(व्यवधान)*... लेकिन मुद्दा आन्ध्र प्रदेश नहीं है। आन्ध्र प्रदेश तो बहाना है, प्रोग्रेस को पलीता लगाना है। इश्यू यह है कि डेवलपमेंट इश्यू को कैसे रोका जा सके? This is the whole game. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We want voting. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already given my ruling that the Private Members' Bill can't be taken up now. According to the rules, it is not possible. Therefore, I am taking up the Compensatory Afforestation Fund Bill, 2016. The Bill has already been moved in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have already ruled out. ...*(Interruptions)*...

It is not possible. ...*(Interruptions)*... It cannot be taken up now ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: It is possible ...*(Interruptions)*... You can make it possible...

*(Interruptions)*... You take up the Bill for voting ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Rule does not permit ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: You can permit it ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know the rule ...*(Interruptions)*... It does not permit me to take up the Private Member's Bill now ...*(Interruptions)*... So, I am taking up the CAMPA Bill ...*(Interruptions)*... The first speaker is Shri Jairam Ramesh ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI C.M. RAMESH: Sir, we want voting ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी:** उपसभापति जी, आपके कहने के बावजूद भी, आपकी रूलिंग के बावजूद भी यदि यह हो रहा है ...*(व्यवधान)*... चूंकि कांग्रेस पार्टी जो कर रही है, वह आइसोलेट होती जा रही है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... पूरा सदन चाहता है कि हाउस चले। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सदन के लोग चाहते हैं कि देश से जुड़े मुद्दे पर बहस हो, डिबेट हो। ...*(व्यवधान)*... इस तरह का व्यवहार कांग्रेस को आइसोलेट कर रहा है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आपको सदन की रक्षा करनी होगी। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सदन के लोग चाहते हैं कि discussion हो, डिबेट हो, ...*(व्यवधान)*... ठोस डिजीजन हो। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 4.00 p.m.

*The House then adjourned at thirty-two minutes past three of the clock*

---

*The House re-assembled at four of the clock,*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

### **RE. AN ISSUE ABOUT TAKING UP THE PRIVATE MEMBERS' BILL**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, let us take up the Compensatory Afforestation Fund Bill, 2016, for further consideration. The Bill had already been moved by the hon. Minister on 19th July, 2016. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would request the hon. Members to cooperate so that we can take up the Bill. ...*(Interruptions)*... The first speaker is Shri Jairam Ramesh. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam Ramesh, you can speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam Ramesh, you can speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... I can hear you, if you speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, the House is not in order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have already given the ruling that there cannot be voting because we cannot take up the Private Members' Bill today. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have already assured that it can be taken up on Friday, after a decision in the Business Advisory Committee. ...*(Interruptions)*... Therefore, I would