

fifth, Two Hundred and Seventieth and Two Hundred and Seventy-third Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Industry on Demands for Grants (2015-16) and (2016-17) respectively pertaining to the Department of Heavy Industry, Ministry of Heavy Industries and Public Enterprises.

---

**RE. DEMANDING ACTION FOR MAKING UNWARRANTED REMARKS  
AGAINST CHIEF MINISTER OF WEST BENGAL AND OTHER ISSUES**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Sukhendu Sekhar Roy.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY (West Bengal): Sir, one activist of the Ruling Party at the Centre in West Bengal has publicly described the hon. Chief Minister of West Bengal as 'demon' and also announced a reward for those who will bring the head of the hon. Chief Minister. *...(Interruptions)...* An award of Rupees eleven lakhs has been announced by the activist of the Ruling Party at the Centre saying that if anyone brings the head of the hon. C.M. of Bengal, he will be rewarded with eleven lakhs of rupees. *...(Interruptions)...* I urge upon all the hon. Members of this House ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The West Bengal Government can take action. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: ... including the Government to condemn this incident because from this fact it appears that the Ruling Party at the Centre is trying to unleash a reign of terror in West Bengal in the name of religion and in the name of other things. *...(Interruptions)...* But this should be stopped. Otherwise, the entire country will be engulfed with such tendency which is dangerous for our parliamentary democracy. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The State Government can take action. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: I urge upon the Government to condemn this incident. *...(Interruptions)...* A constitutionally-elected Chief Minister has been described as 'demon' and an award has been rewarded on her head. *...(Interruptions)...* How can this be done by a Ruling Party activist? This should be condemned, and I urge upon ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, it is not the ruling... *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: I urge upon the Parliamentary Affairs Minister to speak on behalf of the Government condemning the incident. *...(Interruptions)...*

अल्पसंख्यक मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री, तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): सर, ...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Would you like to react?

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: सर, ऑनरेबल सुखेन्दु शेखर राय जी ने जो बात कही है, हम उसकी कड़े शब्दों में निन्दा करते हैं। I strongly condemn such type of a statement, and the State Government is free to take appropriate legal action on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): The Party should expel him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, sit down. Sit down. I am telling you that the Minister has already condemned that incident. If anybody has said like that, he has condemned it, and the Minister has also said that the State Government can take proper action. You can take proper action. ...*(Interruptions)*... You know a case can be registered and action can be taken. Do that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Do that. An FIR can be registered and action can be taken. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, law and order is with the State. You can do that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, has a new enterprise born, to have the business of heads? ...*(Interruptions)*... Not only in West Bengal, but in many places, for beheading, a rate is called. ...*(Interruptions)*... Has a new industry born, and for that, a separate Ministry is to be made by this Government? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is going on in our country? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On such people, who make irresponsible statements, action is to be taken under the law. An FIR should be registered, and the law should take its own course. The State Government should do the needful. ...*(Interruptions)*... The State Government can take action. Do that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: There is no condemnation from the ruling party. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; he said it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Sukhendu Sekhar Roy, you raised it, and the Minister has condemned it. That is enough. But the person who made this remark is an ordinary citizen of the country, whatever it may be. ...*(Interruptions)*... So, it has been condemned. That is enough. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is no need of discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: It has become the game-plan. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**सुश्री मायावती** (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति जी, ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mayawatiji, there is no need of discussion on that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Why do you want a discussion on that? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**सुश्री मायावती**: माननीय उपसभापति जी, तृणमूल पार्टी की ओर से माननीय सदस्य ने पश्चिम बंगाल की मुख्य मंत्री के बारे में गम्भीर मामला सदन में उठाया है और उन्होंने यह कहा है कि बीजेपी के एक जिम्मेदार पदाधिकारी ने, मंत्री ने ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति**: कुमारी मायावती जी, इस बारे में मंत्री जी ने स्पष्ट कर दिया है। इस मामले को खत्म कर दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)... और क्या चाहिए? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE (West Bengal): Yes, we associate. Action should be taken. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But the State Government should also take the action. You have to take action. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**सुश्री मायावती**: माननीय उपसभापति जी, केवल condemn करने या खेद प्रकट करने से काम नहीं चलेगा। यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। इसलिए बीजेपी को चाहिए कि उनके खिलाफ action लेना चाहिए, केवल निन्दा करने से काम नहीं चलेगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति**: मैंने कहा है कि action लेना है। ...(व्यवधान)...

**सुश्री मायावती**: महोदय, भारतीय जनता पार्टी को action लेना चाहिए। यह अच्छी बात नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... इस प्रकार से तो कोई भी किसी के बारे में बोलता रहेगा। ...*(व्यवधान)*... भारतीय जनता पार्टी केवल निन्दा कर देगी या condemn कर देगी, इससे काम नहीं चलेगा। भारतीय जनता पार्टी को action लेना चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sukhenduji, I am also asking you to convey to the State Government to take action. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: But, Sir, what about the political patronage? This is a case of political patronage. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; that is enough. You have raised it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, it is not only that. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is a serious issue where a BJP leader has made such a statement. At least, the Prime Minister should say on his official Twitter handle that he condemns it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You were the Chief Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: This has been happening at the behest of the BJP leadership. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijaya Singhji, please don't. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI HUSAIN DALWAI (Maharashtra): Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Husain Dalwai, what is your point of order? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री हुसैन दलवाई: सर, देश में जर्नलिस्ट्स के ऊपर बड़े पैमाने पर हमले हो रहे हैं। उन्हें कोई security नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... उनके लिए कोई health scheme नहीं है। Times of India के बहुत से पत्रकारों को निकाल दिया गया है। आनंद बाजार पत्रिका के कुछ लोगों को निकाल दिया गया है। इंडिया टीवी के चार लोगों को कल ही निकाला गया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री हुसैन दलवाई: सर, CNN और IBN के 300 लोग निकाले गए हैं।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Husain Dalwai, that is not a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री हुसैन दलवाई: श्री अरनब गोस्वामी ने कल ही चार लोगों को निकाल दिया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री हुसैन दलवाई: उनको गवर्नमेंट को protection देना चाहिए। उन्हें पेंशन देनी चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Let the Government say something on this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is not a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... You give notice. This is not a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: सर, आज हमारे इस सत्र का आखिरी दिन है और आखिरी दिन होने के नाते, मेरी आपसे प्रार्थना है कि आपने मेरे substantive motion को, जो गोवा के राज्यपाल के संबंध में दिया गया था, मैंने उस पर discussion के लिए समय देने को कहा था, लेकिन उस पर discussion के लिए अभी तक आपने कोई समय निर्धारित नहीं किया है। हमारे संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री, श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नक़वी जी के कहने के बावजूद भी आपने उसे admit नहीं किया है। यह हम लोगों के लिए दुख की बात है। यह सदन आपके नियमों और निर्देशों से चलता है, न कि सदन के नेता के आदेशों से। आपके आदेशों का उल्लंघन हुआ है। हमारे रूल्स में यह प्रावधान है कि आपको यह विशेषाधिकार है। कंसल्टेशन की जरूरत नहीं है। It is 'may' and not 'shall'. उसके बावजूद भी आप मेरे हितों का संरक्षण नहीं कर पा रहे हैं। माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मुझे इस बात का दुख है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री तपन कुमार सेन:** सर, इसको अभी लीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Sir, this may be taken up right not. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I have already said about it. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, please allow Shrimati Jaya Bachchan to speak. She has been standing for the last 15 minutes. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is okay. ...**(Interruptions)**... What is it, Shrimati Jaya Bachchan? Please tell me. ...**(Interruptions)**... Shrimati Jaya Bachchan. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRIMATI ROOPA GANGULY (Nominated): Sir, please allow me to speak. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: After Shrimati Jaya Bachchan, I would call you. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**श्रीमती जया बच्चन** (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, इस देश में महिलाओं के प्रोटेक्शन के लिए बहुत aggressively स्टेप लेने की जरूरत है। गायों को आप बचा सकते हैं, महिलाओं के ऊपर अत्याचार हो रहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इस तरह से ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपका एक मेम्बर इस तरह से ...**(व्यवधान)**... Sir, how can somebody talk like this, especially against a woman? When today the women are really feeling so insecure, is this what they should be promoting? ...**(Interruptions)**... आप लोग तो सारे अखबारों को कंट्रोल करते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप लोग तो सारे अखबारों को कंट्रोल करते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. That is okay. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**श्रीमती जया बच्चन:** सर, इस तरह की news कैसे छप जाती है? एक महिला मुख्य मंत्री के बारे में ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** एक दूसरी महिला भी बोलना चाहती हैं।

**श्रीमती जया बच्चन:** वे बोलती रहें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उनको क्या है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** हो गया, हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... ठीक है, हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: Sir, she has not yet completed. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRIMATI JAYA BACHCHAN: Sir, is this the way they are going to protect the women of this country? ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. You have made your point. Now, sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shrimati Ganguly, what is your point? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI ROOPA GANGULY: Sir, I am also a woman. I have been beaten up in front of all the policemen, beaten up by people, insulted... ...*(Interruptions)*... For months I had to be in the bed. I am also a woman and I was beaten up by a mob in West Bengal. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let them answer this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR ROY: No, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: Sir, is she endorsing. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; you go back. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would listen to him; please go back. ...*(Interruptions)*... All right; sit down. That is all. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay; everything is on record. Now, Zero Hour; Shri Partap Singh Bajwa. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI D.P. TRIPATHI (Maharashtra): Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE: Sir, he has a point of order. Please allow him. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shri Partap Singh Bajwa. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. I can't allow it. I have started the Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री प्रताप सिंह बाजवा (पंजाब): सर, सबसे important ...*(व्यवधान)*... Excuse me, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नीरज शेखर (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री प्रताप सिंह बाजवा: सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*... ये क्या कर रहे हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, टाइम reset कीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, टाइम reset कीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, what is your problem? ...*(Interruptions)*... One of you may speak. Others may sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... One of you may speak. आप लोग बैठिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Dr. Tazeen Fatma, what is your problem?

डा. तजीन फातमा (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, ...*(व्यवधान)*... कल मेरा Zero Hour mention incomplete था। ...*(व्यवधान)*... आपने कहा था कि ...*(व्यवधान)*...

† ڈاکٹر تزنین فاطمہ (انٹرپریڈر): سر، کل میرا Zero Hour mention incomplete رہ گیا تھا  
 --- (مداخلت) --- آپ نے کہا تھا کہ --- (مداخلت) ---

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. I accept that. ... (Interruptions)...

ڈا. تاجیون فاطما: سر، کل میرا Zero Hour mention incomplete تھا। ... (ব্যবধান) ... مئے  
 دو sentence ہئ پڑے تھے کہ آپنے کہا کہ آج ... (ব্যবধান) ...

† ڈاکٹر تزنین فاطمہ : سر، کل میرا Zero Hour mention incomplete رہ گیا تھا  
 --- (مداخلت) --- میں نے دو sentences ہی پڑھے تھے کہ آپ نے کہا کہ آج  
 --- (مداخلت) ---

شری ساتیش چندر میشر: سر، آپنے کل इनको अलाउ किया था। ... (ব্যবধান) ... آپ इनको  
 बोलने दीजिए। ... (ব্যবধান) ...

ڈا. تاجیون فاطما: سر، آپنے کل کہا تھا کہ continue کیجیے گا۔ مئے سیرف دو ہی  
 sentence بولے تھے کہ time over ہو گیا تھا۔ ... (ব্যবধান) ...

† ڈاکٹر تزنین فاطمہ : سر، آپ نے کل کہا تھا کہ continue کیجئے گا۔ میں نے صرف دو  
 sentences ہی بولے تھے کہ ٹائم اوور ہو گیا تھا۔ ... (مداخلت) ---

شری उपसभापति: ठीक है। आपने नोटिस renew कर दिया है?

ڈا. तजीन फातमा: जी, सर। मैंने नोटिस दिया है। ... (ব্যবধান) ... आज का भी नोटिस दिया है।  
 † डॉक्टर तज़न फ़ात्म: जी, सर- मेंने नोटिस दिया है --- (मداخلत) --- आज का भी नोटिस दिया

شری उपसभापति: अच्छा। आपने नोटिस दिया है, लिस्ट में आपका नाम है। मैं आपको बुलाऊंगा।  
 अभी आप बैठिए। ... (ব্যবধান) ... लिस्ट में आपका नाम है। ... (ব্যবধান) ...

ڈا. तजीन फातमा: सर, अब तक 12.00 बजे का समय हो जाएगा। ... (ব্যবধান) ...

† डॉक्टर तज़न फ़ात्म: सर, तब तक बारह बजे का وقت हो جائे گا --- (मداخلत) ---

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your point is that you were speaking at that time and  
 so, you have the right to be called first. I agree; I would do that. ... (Interruptions) ... Mr.  
 Bajwa, I would call you after her. The hon. lady Member is raising a very pertinent point.  
 We should listen to that. I accept that point.

SHRI NEERAJ SHEKHAR: Sir, the time may be. ... (Interruptions) ...