

*The House then adjourned for lunch at one of the clock.*

---

*The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-four minutes two of the clock,*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair*

### **SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (GENERAL) 2016-17**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRI ARJUN RAM MEGHWAL): Sir, I lay on the Table, a statement (in English and Hindi) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants (General) 2016-17.

---

### **PRIVATE MEMBERS' RESOLUTIONS**

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now it is Shri Tiruchi Siva's Resolution. How are you getting it again and again? Earlier you had a Bill. It is a good thing. Congratulations. Now you can move the Resolution.

#### **Amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960**

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I move the following Resolution:—

"Having regard to the fact that:—

- (i) from time immemorial, India has been an agrarian economy as the agricultural sector employs 263.1 million Indians, which accounts for 54.6% of the total Indian workforce;
- (ii) agriculture contributed 15.4% of the Gross Value Added in 2015-16;
- (iii) over the years, indigenous breeds of cattle have been the backbone of the agricultural economy as prior to the introduction of modern farm equipments, agriculture would not have been possible without cattle and even today, cattle play an important role in agricultural activities, particularly for the small and medium farmers;
- (iv) bull power is used for ploughing and transportation, which saves electricity and consumption of large volumes of fossil fuel that are harmful to the environment;

[Shri Tiruchi Siva]

- (v) India imported 2.28 lakhs TMT of crude oil and other petroleum products in the year 2015-16, worth Rs. 5.24 lakh crores, 60 lakh tonnes of diesel worth Rs. 4000 crores which can be potentially saved by replacing tractors by cattle for the purposes of ploughing and transportation;
- (vi) cattle manure has been traditionally used in India as fertiliser which helps reduce reliance on chemical fertilisers and pesticides, that have a negative effect on soil quality and harm quality of food crops produced as India consumed 256 lakh tonnes of fertilizers in 2014-15;
- (vii) indiscriminate use of fertilisers and pesticides in agriculture has been linked to spread of diseases through food products but use of dung and urine from cattle has a positive impact on the environment and soil quality, with no negative effects on health;
- (viii) a higher dependence on fossil fuels and chemical based farm inputs significantly raises the cost of farming resulting in higher food prices;
- (ix) by increasing reliance on cattle in agriculture, one can reduce cost of food products and avoid negative effects on environment and health;
- (x) cattle used in agriculture are reared with great care, and are fed a high-quality diet, including grass fodder grown exclusively for the cattle and their health is monitored and taken care of on a periodic basis by qualified veterinary doctors;
- (xi) native breeds of cattle are gradually being phased out due to the onslaught of modern farm equipments and the import of exotic breeds;
- (xii) as per the Livestock Census conducted by the Department of Animal Husbandry, Dairying and Fisheries of the Government of India, the total indigenous cattle population in India has reduced by 8.94% from 1660.15 lakhs in 2007 to 1511.72 lakhs in 2012, which is a small fraction of the total actual requirement for cattle for agricultural practises;
- (xiii) the population of exotic breeds of cattle has increased by 20.18% in the same period, from 330.6 lakhs in 2007 to 397.32 lakhs in 2012;
- (xiv) owing to the decline in the population of the indigenous bulls, artificial insemination is increasingly being relied upon for breeding of cows;

(xv) article 48 of the Constitution of India directs that the State shall endeavour to take steps for preserving and improving breeds of animals; and

(xvi) all possible steps are needed to be taken to preserve, improve and protect the stock of indigenous cattle of the country,

this House urges upon the Government to: —

(a) suitably amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 to exempt bulls from the application of provisions that restrict their utility and training for various purposes by using of various techniques to train them to perform agricultural tasks such as ploughing and transportation;

(b) include the amended Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, in the Ninth Schedule to the Constitution of India; and

(c) take steps to encourage and incentivise the use of indigenous cattle for agricultural purposes and improve their health and stock."

Sir, it is a very important Resolution which may appear to be very simple, but involves our rich tradition, culture and the native people of this country. From time immemorial India has primarily been an agrarian country. Of course, our nation contributes 15.4 per cent of the GVA, Gross Value Added, in the years 2015-16. It employs 263.1 million Indians which accounts for 54.6 per cent of the total work force. Sir, today India like many other developing countries with a rich agricultural tradition and heritage of their own, the worse improved agriculture forms as a substitute or synonymous with the increasing use of high yielding variety seeds and usage of chemical fertilizers, pesticides and tractors among other modern inputs.

Sir, the spread of modern technology or the modern methods uprooted several traditional agricultural methods like that of crop rotations, use of cattle and inter-cropping patterns which have been an integral part of heritage. However, in the goal of increasing the short-term yield, the long-term impacts of these modern methods have been severely neglected. Sir, we should not ignore certain facts. Over the years, indigenous cattle have been the backbone of the agriculture of our country rather our economy. Prior to introduction of modern farm equipments, carrying on agricultural activities would not have been possible without the use of cattle. From ploughing to transportation, use of dung and urine as manure and fertilizers, use of cattle for agriculture are many. Even today cattle are an integral and important part of agriculture particularly for the landless, the marginal and the small farmers. Sir, the bulls are used for ploughing and transportation.

[Shri Tiruchi Siva]

This not only helps to save consumption of power but also in using volumes of fossil fuels that are harmful to the environment. Fossil fuels are a primary source of energy, no one can deny, but at the cost of what? Sir, the fossil fuels release carbon dioxide, sulphur dioxide, nitrogen oxides and carbon monoxides among other Green House gases that will severely harm the environment as such. The consequences, in the long run, will be felt. Burning of fossil fuels is one of the primary causes of global warming. It results in the rise of temperature, flooding of low-lying areas in sea levels and submerging of islands. Sir, sulphur dioxide is one of the pollutants released by the fossil fuels, which causes acid rain. Acid rain not only leads to destruction of monuments but also severely affects crops due to acidification. We cannot ignore this very, very important thing. As of today, fossil fuels are being extracted and mined at an exorbitant cost to meet the current demand and supply. However, it is estimated that fossil fuels would become extinct in the long run since this is a non-renewable energy. It is highly likely that fuel prices will also increase steeply in the future. Sir, in the year 2014-15, the sale of tractors in India was 5.51 lakh. In 2015-16, India imported 2.2 lakh TMT of crude oil and other petroleum products worth Rs. 5.24 lakh crores. It is estimated that 60 lakh tonnes of diesel worth Rs. 4000 crores can be potentially saved by replacing tractors with cattle for the purposes of ploughing and transportation. This would have a huge saving not only economically, but also environmentally. Sir, cattle dung has been traditionally used in India as manure and fertilizers. This tremendously helps to reduce the reliance on chemical fertilizers and pesticides that have a negative effect on the quality of the soil as well as harms the quality of food crops that are produced. Sir, given the serious issue of depleting ground water sources, over utilization of chemical based fertilizers and pesticides is further adding to the problem of non-usability of existing ground water resources. Sir, India consumes 256 lakh tonnes of fertilizers in 2014-15. Indiscriminate use of pesticides and fertilizers in agriculture has also led to the rampant spread of diseases through food products. Use of such inputs leading to ground water contamination has been linked to gastric cancer and hypertension and stomach cancer among a number of other diseases. Sir, however, on the other hand, dung and urine from cattle contain various natural minerals which are extremely beneficial for the soil and have other environmental friendly uses as well. Dung is also collected and used as biogas to generate electricity and heat. The gas is rich in methane and is renewable, stable and an inexpensive source of electricity. Further, the use of dung as manure has no negative impact on our health. Sir, a high dependence on fossil fuels and chemical-based input for agriculture not only harms the environment, but is also extremely expensive. The usage of such inputs significantly raises the cost of farming which is not feasible for the small and marginal farmers who are living a



hand-to-mouth existence. Such farmers find it more economical to rear bulls rather than to purchase or rent tractors. Sir, in order to maintain their agricultural inputs they get loans from the banks which they are not able to repay and we hear so many number of farmers committing suicides in recent days across India. Not only in any particular region, but across India, farmers commit suicide only for the reason that they don't get rain, they don't get water, and for incurring costs on inputs for agriculture like pesticides and fertilizers which they believe would fetch them more yield, which rather put them to disastrous end. So, the use of chemical fertilizers and pesticides rather than helping the farmers brings their life to an end. So, it is very imminent. Sir, we have to consider that. It has to be replaced with a traditional and heritage form of cultivation. Use of cattle will not only help the farmers, but also preserve the soil as well as the food products that are cultivated. Sir, as per the Livestock Census conducted by the Department of Animal Husbandry, Dairying and Fisheries of the Government of India, the total indigenous cattle population in India has reduced by 8.94 per cent from 1660.15 lakhs in 2007 to 1511.72 lakhs in 2012 lakhs, which is a small fraction of the total actual requirement for cattle for agricultural practices. On the other hand, the population of exotic breeds of cattle has increased by 10.18 per cent in the same period, from 330.6 lakhs to 397.32 lakhs in 2012. So, native breed of our cattle are diminishing and are being extinct whereas the exotic breeds of cattle are increasing in number. What is the result of that? Sir, I have got a very good example. There is a saying in Tamil about the cows which yield milk. I think, the milk which the cows yield has a protein which is called Beta-Casein, A-1 and U-1, A-2 and U-2. The milk which native cows are giving has A-2 and U-2. It helps the people to live in good health and, of course, blood circulation is increased. Whereas milk, which breed cows are giving, has A1 and U1 and they are the source of cancer. Sir, this is not something which is imaginary; it is proved by way of research. So, milk that we get from our native cows keeps our children healthy; whereas, milk given by exotic breed cows brings new diseases. Just to get more milk, we cannot keep the health of our people at stake.

Owing to this decline in cattle population, artificial insemination is increasingly been relied upon for breeding cows. This is a very sad thing. Not only is the process of artificial insemination expensive, but it also led to a reduction in the demand for bulls. Sir, bulls are used for plowing, transportation, breed cows and also for other sports like *Jallikattu*.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): That is the real purpose.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Yes, maybe. Why not?

[Shri Tiruchi Siva]

So, when native bulls actually become extinct, the focus on certain specific breeds through the process of artificial insemination also results in loss of genetic variation. In fact, according to a recent news report, 59 live bulls of Jersey breed imported from Denmark! Studies have shown that due to artificial insemination and the way animals are treated, the life span of animals is drastically impacted. In an ideal situation, cattle live for around 25 years. However, animals that are intensively milked live up to only around 10 years. So, Sir, our cows also will become extinct in the coming years. Other breeds will be imported. These also live for a short period. And, even for insemination and growing cattle, we have to depend on other nations. So, my point is, when we have a rich tradition and heritage, we are just giving it up for more income. But, in reality, we would not get more income, rather we are only keeping the lives of our children and the country at stake. So, the native cattle in India have evolved in perfect harmony with their local region and adapting to the local environment conditions. The State of Tamil Nadu has six indigenous cattle breeds — Kangayam, Pulikulam, Umbalachery, Barugur, Alambadi and Malai Maadu. However, today, owing to increase in artificial insemination and lesser people rearing cattle, most of these breeds have dwindled to a few thousands and are on the verge of extinction. This is majorly due to lack of incentives to farmers, introduction of tractors and popularization of exotic breeds.

Sir, I think, hon. Deputy Chairman is well aware, now-a-days, the people are reverting back to original form of cultivation. They are totally giving up chemical fertilizers as organic products are being welcomed by consumers as well as farmers. It is more remunerative to farmer as well as it is healthier for consumer. Now, I am converting my farm into organic. Earlier, we were using chemical fertilizers. Now, agriculture experts instructed me to totally stop that. Only two native cows and two native bulls are enough for 15 acres of land whose cow dung and urine can be used as manure as well as pesticides. People are waiting for produce that come out from such farm. So, awareness has come. But, we are resorting to other means.

Article 29 of the Constitution says that it is the fundamental right of every citizen, residing in any part of India and having a distinct culture of its own, to conserve the same. Article 51A of the Constitution directs that it is the fundamental duty of every citizen to value and preserve the rich heritage of our composite culture.

Artificial insemination is the worst thing which we have to stop immediately. When

we have got our own bulls used for plowing, transportation and sports, these can otherwise be used for breeding our own cows.

I should confess here and I tender my apology for telling this. Through artificial insemination, cow may breed and give milk. But, its natural pleasure is deprived. It is not just saving an animal from cruelty meted out by human or anyone else. Just because it does not have voice, we should not underestimate its feelings. It has to give birth to a cow and for that it has to be with a bull. But you are totally depriving it of a bull. No bull is there, whereas it is impregnated, it gives birth and it also gives milk. Sir, I am very sorry to say this, but I have to share this. They are all animals. How can we deprive them, just for the sake of milk or money? Only artificial insemination can fetch you more money does not mean that we should use this technique. I think, Sir, we have to apply our mind. We should have some humanitarian consideration, not only with fellow human beings, but also with animals, who come along with us and who are always with us. So, there are many such things which I would like to say; I think it is not out of place. Cows and bulls are being domesticated. They are brought up like children. Not only in Tamil Nadu, but also in many other areas, these animals are being used for other activities. In Tamil Nadu, there is an ancient tradition that has been observed for over 2,000 years, the *Jallikattu*, a bull taming sport, conducted as a part of the annual Pongal festivities to celebrate the harvest season. A glimpse of the *Jallikattu* sport can also be seen in the ancient relics from the Indus Valley Civilization, which are on display at the National Museum, New Delhi. So, it is not something which is happening today. It is there since the Indus Valley Civilization and is still in the National Museum, New Delhi. So, it requires the use of indigenous breed of bulls. The bulls are identified, nourished and trained for the event. They are not tortured. They are fed well as that of a child. Without activities like the *Jallikattu*, a lot of native breeds will be sent to slaughter houses. With reduced availability of bulls, farmers will be forced to adopt artificial insemination techniques, which is cost prohibitive, and is in direct contravention of *in situ* conservation. So, Sir, in a bid to extract more commercial value and more milk from the cows, artificial insemination methods are used rather than breeding of the indigenous breeds of a cattle. Thus, a ban of traditional and cultural practices such as *Jallikattu*, Kambala in Karnataka, etc. further aggravates the problem of extinction of indigenous cattle. Sir, societal peace and harmony comes about by taking proactive action and not just by talking about it. Despite religious, class and caste diversities prevalent in India, many principles, functions, events are sustainably shared for a peaceful co-living. *Jallikattu* is one such festival that is celebrated with full

[Shri Tiruchi Siva]

enthusiasm across the State of Tamil Nadu, by the people, breaking through numerous class, caste and religious barriers. So, Sir, the native bulls or the native cattle are essential for agricultural purpose, to preserve our ancient and heritage method of agricultural farming. Moreover, it is in the interest of small and marginal farmers who consider it better to rear a bull to maintain their livelihood than to resort to chemical fertilizers to get some more yield in the farms. Sports like Jallikattu will also encourage the people to develop that. Here, I would like to quote Article 51A. It says, "It shall be the duty of every citizen of India to promote harmony and the spirit of common brotherhood among all the people of India transcending religious, linguistic, regional or sectional diversities." Sir, just for an example, I say, it does not create any controversy, rather, it brings in more harmony among the people of various culture, diversities, castes, classes and religions. In Madurai, the Muslim Imams offer holy ash to the bulls before the sport is started. In fact, in Madurai, the first bull that enters the arena belongs to a Scheduled Caste family. Further, in Dindigul, the Christian priest hoists the flag to start the event and in Alanganallur, priest belonging to the Scheduled Caste perform a puja before the vadaivasal is opened. So, there is no caste barrier. No religion is there. People are together. For example, if people have to come together, some festivals have to be there. When Ramzan comes, we go there. When Christmas comes, we come to a place. When Deepavali comes, they go to other places. Like that, such events also bring people together. Some sports, by showing some reason, if curtailed, may spoil the ancient heritage, culture and tradition of the country. So, Sir, in the interests of several things, I am moving this Resolution; namely, first, to preserve the traditional form of agriculture and also to save the interests of small and marginal farmers who cannot afford to pay for the chemical fertilisers. And it contaminates the soil. It depletes the ground water. It spoils even the food products. The crops which are produced in that soil by way of these inputs cause harm and it is hazardous to the health of human also. So, we have to replace it. It is high time we concentrated on it. The Ministers are here. The Government is here. All the learned Members are also here, Sir. Should we give it up for other expectations which don't fetch anything?

So, Sir, I would like to conclude with my emphasis on social harmony. In light of the importance of social harmony, it is a goal that must be pursued at all costs. In light of the directives mandated by our Constitution and importance of the events like *Jallikattu*, the bulls, the native cattle, have to be protected. Sir, events like *Jallikattu* play an important role in maintaining such harmony, which I just mentioned as an example.

Given the added benefits in achieving this goal by events such as *Jallikattu* and

the Constitutional importance granted to the same, the Government must also take steps to preserve this unique culture and heritage of our country. I also urge the Government to take all positive steps to promote the use of indigenous cattle, and actively engage in preserving and protecting the native breeds.

For that, the House urges upon the Government to take the following measures:—

(i) Suitably amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, to exempt bulls from the application of provisions that restrict their use and training for various purposes. This includes the use of various techniques to train them to effectively perform their agricultural tasks such as ploughing and transportation.

(ii) Include this amended Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, to the 9th Schedule of the Constitution of India; and

(iii) Take steps to educate, encourage and incentivize people about the numerous uses of indigenous cattle for agricultural purposes and improve their health and stock.

Thank you very much, Sir.

*The question was proposed.*

SHRI ANANDA BHASKAR RAPOLU (Telangana): Respected Deputy Chairman, before starting my observations on the submission of my esteemed colleague, Shri Tiruchi Siva, for suitable amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, I salute the recent Marina March which has replicated the Dravidian Renaissance, the inherent, indigenous, native, traditional emotions and their importance. By reflecting their commitment to the Tamil heritage which is part of the Dravidian heritage and which is part of the larger Indian heritage, the Marina March has attracted the attention of all the sensitive citizens of the globe.

Sir, we have our own cock fights in Andhra Pradesh, we have our own type of bull fights in Rayalaseema, we have our own bullock cart races in Telangana and the variety of races, variety of seasonal and festive-related celebrations involving the animals are there almost all across the nations.

With the focus on the *Jallikattu*, the World Council of Indigenous Peoples and their indigenous traditional habits, is again focusing to enlarge the demand to encourage, sustain and preserve the traditional knowledge and traditional festivity.

[Shri Ananda Bhaskar Rapolu]

**3.00 P.M.**

We have forgotten to protect the earthworm. The protection of earthworm is directly related to organic farming. Organic farming is directly related to the health of the ecology, the environment and human beings. What is happening to soil health all over in the absence of earthworms is well known not only to the illiterate farmers of our country, but also to our extraordinary agricultural scientists. Yet, we are not able to protect the earthworms. Not just the earthworms, we are not able to protect the frogs and tortoises either. Where is this leading to? We advocate and champion the cause of protection of our biodiversity, but until and unless we protect the original natural resources such as earthworms, frogs and tortoises, we won't be able to protect organic farming. How are we going to protect agriculture in the real sense?

Sir, recently, I travelled to Maharashtra. I visited the Kaneri Math at Siddhagiri, the place of Kolhapur Maharaja. Sambhaji Maharaj is here in this House. In the Siddhagiri gowshala, I saw the rarest of the rare breeds of cattle and cow. Sahiwal, khillari, dangi, ongole and other breeds are not seen in their original form in our agricultural fields, but I could see the rarest of the rare breeds of cow of not just India, but of the world there. I visited *Narasimha Wadi* on the banks of the Krishna River, just 70 kilometres away from Kolhapur. Even there I could see the commitment, care and concern to protect the original breed of cattle so as to protect organic farming and to preserve the traditional knowledge, the real treasure of our natural breeds, and the relevance of our indigenous breeds. In this context, I would like to again talk about my own State, particularly Andhra Pradesh's, *kodi pandalu*. It looks odd in these modern times, but it is shastra, respected, Sir, it is *kukkuta shastra*. It has got astronomical and astrological relevance. The colours of the fighting cocks, especially the winning cocks, were used to adjudge the relevance of planets and their effects in a particular year. They are centuries and millennia old. There was a necessity to depend on them because they did not have ready calculations or calendars. They used to depend on this *kukkuta shastra*, these cock fights, during the time of *Sankranti*, *Maha Sankranti* or *Makara Sankramana*. Likewise, *jallikattu* and all other traditional fights have their significance. It is not just for encouragement and enthusiasm, but also to protect the nativity of breeds. Can anybody imagine a hybrid variety of the bull taking part in *jallikattu*, bull fights in Rayalaseema or bullock cart races in Telangana? Only the native, original and well-bred bulls can take part in such races. These are having the relevance directly to the traditional knowledge and their preservation. Hence, I appreciate the initiative of Tiruchi Sivaji to focus on this vital aspect and to lead

towards preservation of traditional festivities involving animals. At this juncture and in this context, I plead to the modern and the newer generation, while you take part in those traditional heritage-oriented festivities and competition between animals, ensure to have humanitarian ground and ensure not to give them any sort of anaesthesia-type of medication just to win your race. This is the reflection of the traditional heritage of Indian sub-continent to protect that. We need to have the traditional capacities to continue our activities with the modern understanding of the age-old traditions. For that, the initiative by Tiruchi Sivaji is appreciable and I welcome it. Thank you, very much.

**श्री बसावाराज पाटिल (कर्नाटक) :** माननीय उपसभापति जी, आदरणीय श्री तिरुची शिवा इस हाउस में आज जो खास Resolution लाए हैं, उसके लिए मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि वे एक बहुत महत्वपूर्ण विषय लेकर आए हैं। सरकार को इस पर बहुत गंभीरता से सोचते हुए इसके सभी पहलुओं पर विचार करना चाहिए। उन्होंने अपने अध्ययन के द्वारा यह जितना बड़ा काम किया है, उसके लिए मैं श्री तिरुची शिवा का अभिनंदन करता हूँ।

आधुनिकता के नाम पर हम अपनी वास्तविकता और कुछ परंपरागत सच्चाइयों को कितनी दूर तक नजरअंदाज कर सकते हैं और इसके क्या दुष्परिणाम होते हैं, इसके बारे में हमें गंभीरता से सोचना होगा। एक जमाने में भारत में केमिकल्स और फर्टिलाइजर्स के कारण पंजाब दुनिया का सबसे आकर्षक स्थान बना, लेकिन आज पंजाब सबसे ज्यादा कैंसर रोग पाया जाने वाला राज्य बन गया है। इस प्रकार तात्कालिक सुख के लिए, थोड़े समय के आनंद के लिए अनंतकाल के दुख को भोगना देश के हित में ठीक नहीं होगा। भारत की जो संस्कृति है, जीवन शैली है, वह उत्तम है।

उपसभापति जी, एक होती है घर की माँ, दूसरी धरती माँ और तीसरी गौ माता होती है। इन तीनों माताओं के बीच में एक अन्यान्य संबंध है, जिसके आधार पर यह सृष्टि चलती है। भारत की गाय के गोबर, भारत की गाय के गौमूत्र के द्वारा जमीन की फर्टिलिटी बढ़ती है। घर की माँ उसके उत्पाद को यूज करती है, घर के बाल-बच्चों को और सबको दूध पिलाती है। इसके कारण जो एक सुंदर वातावरण बनता है, वह घर के लिए बहुत आनंददायक होता है। इस महत्वपूर्ण गाय की रक्षा आवश्यक है।

उपसभापति जी, हमारे देश में इसको कामधेनु कहा गया है। इसको केवल नाम के लिए कामधेनु नहीं कहा गया है, बल्कि इसलिए कहा गया है कि यह बहुत उपयोगी जंतु है। जब गाय के दूध से घी बनता है, तब उसमें ऑक्सीजन की मात्रा 47 परसेंट तक पहुंच जाती है। इतना ही नहीं, सृष्टि के अंदर गाय एकमात्र ऐसा प्राणी है, जो ऑक्सीजन लेती है और दुनिया को वापस ऑक्सीजन देती है। ऐसी कई चीजों के कारण उनके इस Resolution को रखने का समर्थन करते हुए मैं सरकार से विनती करता हूँ कि अपने देश की जो भी परंपरागत ब्रीड है, उसका जो गोबर है, जिसके अन्यान्य उपयोग के कारण अच्छा अन्न बनता है, अच्छे फल बनते हैं, अच्छी तरकारी बनती है, इस सब चीजों को छोड़कर, हमारी जेनरेशन केमिकल्स के नाम पर जो एक बरबादी की ओर चली जा रही है, उसको रोकना होगा। इसके कारण आज का अन्न खाकर हमारी सारी कमाई एक प्रकार से हॉस्पिटल को जा रही है। नेपाल हमारा पड़ोसी देश है, उस देश के अंदर आज भी गाय को एक राष्ट्रीय प्राणी के नाते स्वीकार किया जाता है।



[श्री बसावाराज पाटिल]

वहां जिस प्रकार एक मनुष्य के ऊपर आहत करने पर जितना बड़ा अपराध माना जाता है, उतना ही बड़ा अपराध गाय के ऊपर आहत करने पर माना जाता है। हमारे देश में परंपरागत गौ की आने वाली कितनी ही रेस हैं, जैसे कि हमारे कर्णाटक में देवणी है, मलेनाडुगिड्डा है, खिलारी है, कृष्णवेड़ी है। आज इस प्रकार की अलग-अलग जाति की गौ-संपत्ति अपने देश के अंदर है, जिनका विकास होना चाहिए और जिनके आधार पर हमारा विकास होना चाहिए। इससे ने केवल पैसे बचेंगे, बल्कि इसान स्वस्थ रहेगा, आरोग्य रहेगा और आरोग्य रहने के कारण आदमी स्वस्थ रहेगा और जो पैसा रोज दवाखाने को जाता है, वह भी बचेगा। आज कैंसर, इत्यादि नाम के भयानक रोग जो अपने देश को खा रहे हैं, उससे भी हम बच सकते हैं। अपने देश की एक-एक ब्रीड की महत्ता इतनी है कि अगर आज भी वर्ल्ड में दूध का कॉम्पिटिशन होता है, तो the top two highest milk-yielding breeds in the world are Indian breeds. इसमें वर्ल्ड कॉम्पिटिशन में आंध्र प्रदेश की होंगल 49 लीटर तक दूध देती है। इस प्रकार इतिहास के पन्नों में आधुनिकता के नाम पर हम अपनी कुछ मौलिक चीजों को खो बैठे हैं। हमने अभी तक जो गलती की है, वह की है, लेकिन इसे आगे ले जाना आत्मघातक होगा। मुझे एक प्रकार से डर लगता है कि अगर इसी प्रकार का नेग्लिजेंस रहेगा, तो शायद हमें अपनी सभी ब्रीड्स को एक एग्जिबिशन की वस्तु के रूप में देखना पड़ेगा। बाद में इसके अभाव में हम जिंदगी में कितने भी तड़पेंगे, हमारी गई हुई वह मौलिक संपत्ति हम वापस नहीं ला सकेंगे। इस प्रकार यह हाई-ब्रीड, जिसमें न आनंद है, जिसमें न आरोग्य है, जो स्वास्थ्य के लिए उपयोग नहीं है, विश्व में यह साबित हो गया है कि भारत का ए-वन और यू-वन दूध और उसके सभी प्रोडक्ट्स मनुष्य के स्वास्थ्य के लिए और नाना प्रकार के रोगों से मुक्ति के लिए सर्वश्रेष्ठ हैं। इन सब चीजों को जानते हुए मैं आदरणीय तिरुची शिवा जी के इस महत्वपूर्ण संकल्प का समर्थन करता हूँ।

उपसभापति जी, मैं अभी गुजरात गया था। अहमदाबाद में इसकी 12 जातियां हैं, जैसे नक्षत्र होते हैं, ऐसे 12 प्रकार हैं। एक विदेशी कंपनी वालों ने एक नंदी, he asked for ₹ 8 crore to purchase that bull. वे क्या करते हैं कि उसे ले जाते हैं और सीमेन क्रॉस ब्रीड कराते हैं, उससे 80 करोड़ रुपए कमाते हैं। जैसा तिरुची शिवा जी ने कहा, जैसे मनुष्य की फीलिंग्स होती हैं, वैसे ही प्राणियों की भी फीलिंग्स होती हैं, नेचुरल ब्रीडिंग होनी चाहिए। नेचुरल ब्रीडिंग के आधार पर जो उत्पत्ति होती है, वह अनंत काल के लिए, स्वास्थ्य के लिए, अपने जीवन के सुखी जीवनयापन के लिए महत्वपूर्ण होती है। इन चीजों को ध्यान में रखते हुए हमारे देश में इन फर्टिलाइजर्स से छुट्टी लेना जरूरी है। आज जनता की तरफ से तेजी से यह आवाज आ रही है और लोग ऑर्गेनिक फूड की तरफ जा रहे हैं, ऑर्गेनिक आहार के पीछे आज लाइन लगा कर खड़े हो रहे हैं। वे कहते हैं कि हमें यह तरकारी चाहिए, हम यह चीज चाहिए। इस प्रकार भारत की अपनी जो अनमोल संपत्ति है, जो गौ-वंश है, इसके पीछे केवल धार्मिक भावनाएं नहीं हैं। यह एक सहज बात है कि अगर मेरे कष्ट में किसी आदमी ने कोई सहायता दी, तो हम उसे याद करते हैं, उसे स्मरण करते हैं, वैसे ही एक गाय के इस देश में जन्म लेने के बाद, उसकी मृत्यु के बाद भी अगर उसे गाड़ा जाता है, तो दो साल के अंदर जमीन में से जो उसका कैमिकल एक्शन होकर निकलता है, वह लगभग आठ हजार रुपए का एक प्रकार का फर्टिलाइजर बन कर निकलता है।



MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Time is over. Please conclude.

**श्री बसावाराज पाटिल:** इन चीजों को ध्यान में रखते हुए, माननीय उपसभापति जी, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार से विनती करता हूँ कि तिरुची शिवा जी के इस संकल्प को सरकार बहुत गंभीरता से ले और देश की अनमोल संपत्ति को बचाकर एक स्वस्थ भारत का निर्माण करने की दृष्टि से महत्वपूर्ण काम करे। मैं यही प्रार्थना करता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: As Mr. La. Ganesan has to catch a flight, let me call him first. Of course, Mr. Jairam Ramesh has agreed.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: But, Sir, he should listen to me also.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes, yes. He will be happy to listen to you. At least, the Chair will listen to you. Don't worry.

SHRI LA. GANESAN (Madhya Pradesh): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you for the opportunity given to me. Sir, I whole-heartedly support the Resolution moved by my friend, and, hon. Member of this House, Shri Tiruchi Siva. I went to him and appreciated the way the Resolution was drafted and the way he spoke while presenting the Resolution. Sir, I am here to support this Resolution. वास्तव में यह Resolution बीजेपी के मेम्बर द्वारा present किया जाना चाहिए, लेकिन अगर इसको डीएमके के मेम्बर present करते हैं, तो मुझे बहुत खुशी होती है।

Sir, I will make one or two brief points as all the points have been mentioned by Siva ji and are mentioned in the Resolution also. Sir, now-a-days, the dogs, our local, Indian dogs, swadeshi dogs, are not seen. In Tamil Nadu, we call rajapalayam dog or kombai dog, which is very watchful, and which is a traditional one. Now-a-days in houses also, the pet dogs are there. They never bark, they never bite but they are called dogs. This is the position everywhere.

Let us take the example of a variety of rice seed, Japonica Indica. It is a cross-breed between the *videsh* Seed and Indian seed. We eat that rice, and, so, in our blood also, already the *videshi* and *swadeshi* are mixed. In the same way, as he rightly mentioned, there are cows and the bulls. Our Ongole bull, Kangayam bull, or, even Sindhi also, are not prevalent now-a-days. Gradually, they are decreasing now. Only to get more milk artificially, we are bringing more and more jersey cows and other cows. Already Mr. Siva has mentioned about the capacity of the milk, the strength of the milk, and the protein content of the milk. Sir, we all are consuming that. Gradually, a day will come when you won't be able to call yourself an Indian. When everything is mixed, our blood will also be mixed blood. Only *swadeshi* will not be there in our blood. So, I think, a very important point has been mentioned by Mr. Siva, and, I agree with him.

[Shri La. Ganesan]

Sir, as far as *Jallikattu* is concerned, it is a blessing in disguise. The main thing was to give permission to conduct *Jallikattu*. Of course, with the efforts of the State Governments and with the cooperation of the hon. Prime Minister and the Central Government, we were successful in conducting *Jallikattu*. Sir, what has happened is that, saath-saath, an awareness has come in the people of Tamil Nadu, particularly, kisans, students and youngsters, that they have to protect our *swadeshi* cows, *swadeshi* bulls. That is an important thing. Now, immediately after all this, Mr. Siva has moved this Resolution. So, Sir, once again, I say that I whole-heartedly support this Resolution. Sir, *Jallikattu* is observed for only one day in a year. For all the other 364 days, the bull is maintained only for breeding, for production just as the indigenous cows. This is the most important aspect. We don't simply want to protect the celebration of *Jallikattu* but the maintaining of the cows for that purpose is very important. This has created awareness in Tamil Nadu. That is why, I whole-heartedly support this move. There are some things which people are not aware of. They should be properly educated. The kisans or other people grow their cows or bulls in their houses but after some time, after a particular age, when that animal is not useful for ploughing, or, if some cows are there, which are not able to give milk, then, they sell it. As he himself rightly mentioned, now-a-days, it has been found that if only the urine and the dung of these animals are properly maintained, it can give more income to the kisan than what he can get from the cows that give milk. This has been proved beyond doubt. Awareness should be created among the kisan also. One more thing is that transportation of cows also is very cruel. I also demand, it is not mentioned in it, that transportation of the cows should be stopped. Most of the cows and bulls are transported to Kerala for butchering. That should also be stopped. Also, the cows are transported in a very inhuman way.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There are more incidents of cancer in Kerala because of that, I am telling you.

SHRI LA. GANESAN: That is why in one short sentence, I would say in Tamil, '*nattaipadukakka vendum, aanal mattaiyum padukakka vendum.*'

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH (Tamil Nadu): Thank you, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. We all really stand with the farmers and also the traditional way of ploughing by farmers in our place, especially in our State of Tamil Nadu, which is actually a State of agriculture. People, mainly our forefathers, they all depended only on agriculture as their main source of income. So, as I come from an agrarian State, I do want to put forth my

views. First of all, I have to thank the Central Government on behalf of people of Tamil Nadu for early clearance of the *Jallikattu* Bill, which paved the way for the conduct of *Jallikattu* this year in the State. As rightly pointed out here by my colleague, the organic farming has to be promoted in the nation as general. Cattle manure has been traditionally used in India as a fertilizer, which has been clearly brought out here.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA) *in the Chair*]

I also want to state here that Tamil Nadu being the first in agriculture industry, our then hon. Chief Minister, a mass leader and our revered, Dr. Puratchi Thalaivi Amma, set up five model villages to promote organic farming. Tamil Nadu will boast of its eco-friendly organic villages. As part of its efforts to promote organic farming, the Tamil Government, under the dynamic leadership of our late leader, hon. Puratchi Thalaivi Amma, announced five model organic villages in Vellore, Erode, Dharmapuri, Tiruvannamalai and Krishnagiri districts. The eco-friendly initiative was taken to strengthen the integrated pest management, that is, 150 eco-friendly villages were set up in the State. She made this announcement in the wake of concerns over the deterioration of organic content in the soil. A programme under the Centre's National Mission for Sustainable Agriculture would ensure the villages to adopt no-pesticide, no-insecticide concept to promote organic farming. Based on these pilot projects, a number of villages were raised. She also announced seven new liquid bio fertilizer production units and two organic fertilizer testing units besides a laboratory complex in the Department of Organic Agriculture at the Tamil Nadu Agriculture University. Incidentally, out of 17,500 fertilizer samples tested by the fertilizer control laboratories in the State, 635 samples were found to be non-standard and legal action was initiated against the defaulters. Another major announcement which the Government made under the leadership of hon. Puratchi Thalaivi Amma was selling of Amma seeds. Amma seed was proposed and Amma outlets were formed across the State. In a bid to encourage farmers to use high quality certified seeds, the Government set up Amma Seed Agency by coordinating with the Government Seed Farms, Seed Production Units and farmers. The agency was set up with adequate staff at Rs. 156.74 crore. The quality seeds produced here will be supplied as Amma seeds through Amma outlets at reasonable rates. This is one part of the Tamil Nadu Government's efforts to intensify grain production for the fiscal year. Despite poor monsoon, grain production stood at 110,00,000 tonne per year. Despite the monsoon failure, the grain production shot up thanks to the farmers who switched to millet cultivation instead of water-intensive paddy crop.

I also wanted to put forth here one thing which is about the traditional ploughing

[Shrimati Vijila Sathyananth]

methods used by farmers. Why have they gradually reduced using them? Why have they started using tractors which run on diesel? Because that was time-consuming and the farmers wanted to speed up the process. Earlier when they used to start ploughing the field in the morning, it used to go on up to two o'clock or three o'clock. Now everything is about time management. This is the ground reality.

Coming from farming background, I know this. Earlier, many people from rural areas used to come to do all kinds of jobs like ploughing the field and weeding. Nowadays we don't get people for these jobs. Why? Because it is time-consuming. The traditional way of ploughing the field used to take a lot of time. Gradually, people started using tractors. That also should be looked into.

Bulls are part and parcel of our life. We rear them as our children and we take care of them. Then they are used for bull-taming sport. It is our tradition. It is a heritage of Tamil tradition. These bulls were fed like a child. They were fed all good things. They were happily kept at home.

In Spanish bull fighting, bulls are killed. But here bulls are pampered. We only rear them for keeping up with our tradition and culture. Jallikattu has become a part and parcel of our life. After the Government passed the legislation, it is going to be a regular event in our State.

Use of cow dung is a natural way of improving soil health. It enhances soil fertility. This way we can reduce the use of fertilizers and pesticides.

The use of cow dung, which is popularly known as gobar gas, gives healthier and more fertile soil. We have to take a turn from here to there. But the main thing is that people have gradually stopped using traditional ploughing methods. Now the people have become aware of time management and they want more things to be done in a short duration. The ground reality is that we don't get farmers. Why? Improve farming methods and encourage farming among people. Minimum support price is not there. There is frequent monsoon failure. So, there was no harvest and many people lost their paddy. They lost their crops. It was burnt. So, we are looking forward in this regard. We want the farming community to be lifted up. We have to encourage farming. We have to give them proper education. Give them proper techniques and give them more. Most of the farming community leave farming because they don't get what they have invested in it. So, they move out. They sell their lands. If it is in city, they sell their land for exorbitant rates and real estate owners benefit. Then, what happens to farming? In a few years, or in another 10-20 years, we will have money but where will be food?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude now.

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: So, we have to make improvement in the whole thing. Improve farming methods and give them latest techniques and methods. We have to encourage farming. We have to give them Minimum Support Price and give them whatever they have spent. It has to be profitable for the farmers. Farming should become more profitable. That is the main thing. I support it and I also congratulate him. A battle has begun. The view of the Central Government should be as to how to improve agriculture in India and how to improve the living standards of farmers in India and how to make farming community more blessed in this country. Thank you so much.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Thank you. Next speaker is Mr. B.K. Hariprasad.

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD (Karnataka): Thank you, Vice-Chairman, Sir. I rise to support the Resolution moved by Mr. Siva on agrarian issues. Sir, as you know, in this country, almost 65 per cent of the population is involved in agricultural activity. In terms of contribution to the GDP, agriculture may not contribute more than 20 per cent, but in terms of the employment generation, it contributes almost 54 per cent. When compared to the service sector, agriculture contributes almost 54 per cent and employment generation of service sector, I think, is around 18 per cent. Mr. Siva has moved this Resolution and it is regarding the agricultural activities. We all know this. It is an age-old practice. Animals and human beings co-exist in this world and in this country. Especially India being a vast country with diversity, we have seen different types of culture all over. Right from Kashmir to Kanyakumari and from Narmada to Brahmaputra, we have seen how animals and human beings co-exist. If you talk about animals, especially Mr. Siva was talking about *Jallikattu*, of course, farmers are also human beings. They also need some recreation and entertainment. As I said, animals and human beings co-exist. They love their animals. When I see here, they talk of cow and bull. I come from the coastal part of Karnataka where the agricultural activities are mainly dependent upon buffaloes. We groom buffaloes, we love buffaloes. During the non-agricultural season, they have a buffalo race called *Kambala*, where in a muddy slushy field, there will be buffalo races with pairs of buffalo tied to ploughs. Really, it is one of the oldest traditions of Karnataka, especially in the coastal belt. It is a 900-year old tradition which has been practised. When it comes to buffaloes, I can see, in this country, discrimination is a part of life. Whereas the cow is protected very well, buffaloes are totally neglected. Sir, I was shocked about PETA. I believe in non-violence on any kind of animals whether it is cow, buffalo or

[Shri B.K. Hariprasad]

chicken or whatever it is. I believe in that but when it comes to horses, horse is also a part of the agricultural activities but in most of the places, especially, in Delhi and Bangalore, there are huge horse races. The jockey sits on the horse, whips the horse but no PETA goes there because it is the sport of the elite. When it comes to the sports of the farmers, definitely, these PETA or whatever the organisations, they raise objections whether it is *Jallikattu* or *Kambala*. Sir, for *Jallikattu*, as Shrimati Vijila and Mr. Siva said, they groom the bulls with love and affection as we groom the buffaloes with love and affection. We do not treat them as enemies or treat them cruelly. All the 365 days, we groom them, we feed them and only once in a year, after the completion of agricultural activities, as a kind of sport, we encourage these farmers. Unfortunately, it was banned almost ten years back. Mr. Oscar is the patron of this *Kambala* sport in Udupi and Mangalore. He knows pretty well better than me. These animals contribute to the development of the region. As we all know, today, India is the largest producer of milk in the world. That is because we protect and groom these animals whether it is buffaloes, cows or bulls. It is not *Jallikattu* alone or buffalo race or the horse races, even as Bhaskarji said, the cock fights. In some places we have goat fights. All these animals also need some sports, I think there should not be any objection to this. I thank Mr. Jairam Ramesh for giving me permission to speak before him because I have to catch a flight. So my support is to Mr. Siva regarding this. There should not be discrimination against buffaloes because it does not mean that we should only protect cows. Buffaloes are also a part of our life and the milk of buffaloes has got more protein than the cow. It should also be protected. ... (*Interruptions*)... I do not go into the religious aspect. Sir, as you know, even in Assam the goat fights are there. We have been seeing. So, I think, what Mr. Siva has moved is a commendable Resolution. I think the Government should come out and support this. Thank you very much, Sir.

**श्री मेघराज जैन** (मध्य प्रदेश): आदरणीय उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो संकल्प प्रस्तुत किया है, वह वास्तव में स्वागत योग्य है। उन्होंने अपने उद्बोधन में संपूर्ण बात यानी सभी विषयों को लिया है। मैं आपके माध्यम से माननीय कृषि मंत्री जी का ध्यान इस ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ कि किसान के लिए गाय और बैल इसलिए आवश्यक है, क्योंकि खेत का wastage बैल खाए, गाय खाए और गाय का wastage खेत खाए ताकि इससे किसान की लागत कम हो जाए। यह आवश्यक है और हमने यह प्रयोग करके देखा है। जैविक कृषि के लिए गोबर आवश्यक है, जब कि आज हमारी स्थिति यह हो रही है कि हमारी भूमि खराब हो रही है, जैव विविधता नष्ट हो रही है, प्रदूषण बढ़ रहा है, हमारा जल प्रदूषित हो रहा है, रासायनिक कीटनाशक और रासायनिक खाद के कारण अनाज प्रदूषित हो रहा है और उसके कारण अनेक बीमारियां हो रही हैं। अगर जैविक खाद का प्रयोग किए जाए, तो हम इन सब बीमारियों से बच सकते हैं, स्वस्थ रह सकते हैं और अपने पशुओं को बचा सकते हैं। इसके साथ ही हम इस तरह से किसान की लागत कम कर सकते हैं। ये सब इसके

वैज्ञानिक कारण हैं और केन्द्र सरकार के जो अनुसंधान केंद्र हैं, वहां के वैज्ञानिकों ने इसके बारे में अनुसंधान किया है। जिस समय मैं करनाल में अनुसंधान केंद्र में था, उस समय जब वहां पर एक युवा वैज्ञानिक बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ, तो जिन्होंने यहां पर Jersey और Holstein लाने का विचार किया था, जो रिटायर हो गए थे, उनके पैर छू कर उन्होंने कहा कि सर, मैं आपका बहुत सम्मान करता हूँ, आप हमारे गुरु हैं, पर अगर मेरा वश चलता, तो मैं आपको फांसी पर लटका देता। मैं वहां उस कार्यक्रम में मौजूद था। उन्होंने कहा कि जो जरसी का दूध और Holstein का दूध है, वह देश के लिए घातक है और बीमारी का कारण है। गेहूँ के बारे में अनुसंधान करने वाले वैज्ञानिकों ने कहा कि अगर गाय का मूत्र, बैल का मूत्र, पानी के साथ खेतों में दिया जाए तो हमारी गेहूँ की फसल अच्छी होगी। गन्ने पर रिसच करने वाले वैज्ञानिकों का कहना है कि गन्ने के खेत में अगर गौमूत्र का पानी दिया जाए तो गन्ना लम्बा होगा, मोटा होगा और मीठा होगा। उसमें शक्कर ज्यादा होगी। ऐसा वैज्ञानिकों ने कहा है। मेरा कहना है कि वैज्ञानिकों की एक कमेटी गठित करके कृषि मंत्री जी इस बारे में देखें।

आज हिन्दुस्तान के अंदर लगभग 200 गौशालाएं ऐसी हैं, जहां गौमूत्र पर आधारित औषधियां बन रही हैं। मनुष्य उनका लाभ ले रहे हैं। मैं स्वयं, जब मेरी तबियत खराब होती है या जरूरत पड़ती है तो गौमूत्र का सेवन करता हूँ। अनेक लोग गौमूत्र का सेवन करते हैं। गौमूत्र पर आधारित हमारे यहां अनेक गौशालाएं चल रही हैं, जो किसी अनुदान पर आश्रित नहीं हैं। इसलिए मेरा निवेदन है कि समग्र रूप से गाय के बारे में, बैलों के बारे में हम ध्यान केन्द्रित करें। आज देश में हम जितना कीटनाशक प्रयोग करते हैं, उससे हमारा पानी खराब हो रहा है। गौमूत्र के प्रयोग में कुछ लगता नहीं है। यदि गाय का मूत्र एकत्रित किया जाए और इसके साथ हमारे किसान नीम, करंज के पत्ते, सीताफल के पत्ते, बेशर्म के पत्ते, धतूरे के पत्ते और थोड़ा आकरा डालकर, उबालकर, उसका कीटनाशक बना लें, फिर कोई दूसरा कीटनाशक डालने की जरूरत नहीं है। इसे हमारा किसान अपने घर में तैयार करके पैसा बचा सकता है और हमें प्रदूषण से भी मुक्ति मिल सकती है। इसलिए मेरा निवेदन है कि तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो संकल्प सदन में प्रस्तुत किया है, उनके संकल्प पर गम्भीरता से विचार करने की आवश्यकता है। अभी हमारे यहां वलसाड के पास वागलधारा नामक एक स्थान है, जहां कैसर का निःशुल्क उपचार पंच-गव्यों से होता है। वहां लोगों की भारी भीड़ लगी रहती है। वैसे ही बीकानेर में पंच-गव्यों का प्रयोग करके एक अस्पताल खोलने की तैयारी चल रही है। इसके अलावा टाटा मैमोरियल कैसर अस्पताल में भी इस पर प्रयोग हुआ और पाया गया कि जो लोग गौमूत्र का सेवन करते थे, उनका हीमोग्लोबिन कीमोथेरेपी के बाद भी गिरता नहीं है। इसलिए इन सब चीजों पर वैज्ञानिक आधार पर अनुसंधान सरकार द्वारा कराया जाना चाहिए। जहां प्राइवेट लोग यह काम करते हैं, उस पर कई लोग विश्वास करते हैं, कुछ नहीं करते हैं। इसलिए मेरा माननीय कृषि मंत्री जी से निवेदन है कि इन सभी लोगों की एक कमेटी बनाई जाए। कानपुर गौशाला में, हमारे तोशनीवाल जी ने ऐसा यंत्र बनाया है, जो काम एक tractor करता है, वे सारे काम बैलों को चलाकर उस यंत्र से किए जा सकते हैं। बैल से बिजली पैदा की जा सकती है, बैल से चक्की चलाई जा सकती है, बैल से श्रेशर चलाए जा सकते हैं। हमारी जो केन्द्र सरकार की कृषियंत्र निर्माण से संबंधित कार्यशालाएं हैं, वहां उसी प्रकार के यंत्र बनने चाहिए और किसानों को वे यंत्र दिए जाने चाहिए ताकि हमारे बैल भी सुरक्षित रहें, किसान की लागत भी कम आए और जैविक कृषि भी हम गोबर से कर सकें। इन सारे कामों को करने के लिए मैं कृषि मंत्री जी से निवेदन करता हूँ और तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो संकल्प सदन में रखा है, मैं



[श्री मेघराज जैन]

उसका अनुमोदन करते हुए निवेदन करता हूँ कि उन्होंने कृषि मंत्री जी से जो सिफारिश की है, उस सिफारिश से मैं उनका साथ देता हूँ। मुझे ईर्ष्या हो रही है कि ऐसा संकल्प मुझे यहां रखना चाहिए था, लेकिन उन्होंने इसे सदन में रखा। काश मुझे इसे यहां रखने का मौका मिलता। इन शब्दों के साथ मैं उनका अभिनन्दन करता हूँ और संकल्प का समर्थन करता हूँ।

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, I rise to oppose Mr. Tiruchi Siva's Bill. Mr. Tiruchi Siva is an old friend of mine. He has also gained Parliamentary fame for his Private Member's' Bill. His earlier Private Member's Bill created history. But before I speak on his Bill, let me say straightway....

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: It is a Resolution and not a Bill. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mine is a Resolution and not a Bill.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, before I speak on his Bill....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): No; you have to speak on the Resolution.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Let me say straightway that all my life I have been inspired by Silappadikaram, Manimekalai and Thirukkural. My wife is a Tamilian and I am as much a Tamilian as *Amma* was. If *Amma* was a Tamilian, I am also a Tamilian. So, I am a great admirer and a student of Tamil history and Tamil culture. I myself have written a number of articles on the Tamil Nadu model of development which is far superior to the Gujarat model of development. So, I want to say this. What I am now going to say, I am sure, will not appeal to many of my friends here in the House because the objective of Mr. Siva is not animal welfare. The objective of Mr. Siva is not organic farming. यहाँ गलती से कृषि मंत्री को बिठाया गया है, असली निशाना तो पर्यावरण मंत्री हैं। पर्यावरण मंत्री को यहाँ ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: You cannot decide about my intention.... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री जयराम रमेश: निगाहें और कहीं, निशाना और कहीं! His real objective is not organic farming. His real objective is not improving agricultural practice. His real objective is not animal welfare. His real objective is to bring back Jallikattu. That is his real objective. Mr. Tiruchi Siva has given 16 reasons for improvement in Indian agriculture and Radha Mohan Singhji will agree with all of them. I also agree with all of them. Organic farming must be promoted. केमिकल फर्टिलाइजर्स के इस्तेमाल पर कुछ नियंत्रण होना चाहिए। Traditional agricultural practices should be encouraged. इसमें कोई दो रायें नहीं हो



सकती हैं। Farm mechanization should not destroy the animal economy. I agree with it 100 per cent. My friend Basawaraj Patilji said that cow is a *Kamadhenu*. Yes, cow is a *Kamadhenu*. We should protect, preserve and worship this *Kamadhenu* along with the other dark *Kamadhenu*, the buffalo, which is, unfortunately, neglected in our society. So I agree with all that has been said, but, to do all this, जैन साहब, सुनिए। आपका मकसद सही है, पर आपके मकसद को पाने के लिए शिवा जी क्या करना चाहते हैं? ये Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. में संशोधन लाना चाहते हैं। यह अजीज-सी बात है! ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री मेघराज जैन:** मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो पशु क्रूरता निवारण अधिनियम है, उसमें केवल 200 और 250 रुपए तक का जुर्माना है। मैं सात साल तक गोसंवर्धन बोर्ड का अध्यक्ष रहा हूँ और मैं जानता हूँ कि लोग इस अधिनियम का किस प्रकार से दुरुपयोग करते हैं। उसके अंतर्गत लोग इतने बैल और गाय हत्या करने के लिए ले जाते हैं, लेकिन उनके ऊपर कोई कार्रवाई नहीं होती है, इसलिए उसमें संशोधन होना चाहिए।

**SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH:** Sir, may I continue? The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, यह कैसे बना? मुझे अफसोस है कि शिवा जी ने इस ऐक्ट का गौर से विश्लेषण या अध्ययन नहीं किया। राज्य सभा की एक नॉमिनेटेड मेम्बर हुआ करती थीं, जो एक मशहूर महिला थीं और उनका नाम रुक्मिणी देवी अरुंडेल था। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्री (श्री राधा मोहन सिंह):** सर, हमारी एक मीटिंग है, इसलिए मैं अभी जा रहा हूँ। हमारे राज्य मंत्री यहाँ बैठे हैं, मैं फिर आ जाऊँगा।

**श्री जयराम रमेश:** सर, सन् 1952 से लेकर सन् 1962 तक रुक्मिणी देवी जी नॉमिनेटेड मेम्बर रहीं। Rukmini Devi Arundale, a pure blooded Tamilian, was a Nominated Member of this House from 1952 to 1962. She moved a Private Members' Bill that India must have an Act of prevention of cruelty to animals. उन्होंने उस प्राइवेट मेम्बर्स बिल को पेश किया। उस समय के प्रधान मंत्री, पंडित नेहरू उससे बहुत प्रभावित हुए और उन्होंने रुक्मिणी देवी जी से यह निवेदन किया कि आप यह बिल withdraw कीजिए, सरकार एक कानून बनाएगी। तब सन् 1960 में Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960 बना। संविधान के कुछ प्रावधान थे और उन प्रावधानों के तहत वह ऐक्ट बनाया गया। अब तिरुची शिवा जी क्या करना चाहते हैं? तिरुची शिवा जी इस ऐक्ट में संशोधन लाना चाहते हैं और वे क्या संशोधन लाना चाहते हैं? इन्होंने कहा कि: Bull must be removed from the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Why? Because bull must be trained; and bull must be equipped for agriculture. I want to inform my friend, he can do all these things without amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Now, all that you have said in the Resolution about bulls, I agree with. But my difference with you is this. The State Government is fully empowered. All States are fully empowered to pass their own laws for improving the quality of livestock. You don't need to amend

[श्री जयराम रमेश]

the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act is to prevent cruelty. It is not meant to train bulls. It is not meant to improve the milk yield. It is not meant to improve organic agriculture. It is meant to prevent cruelty to animals. That's it. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will take two minutes and conclude. The Tamil Nadu Assembly had passed the Tamil Nadu Animal Preservation Act, 1958; and most States have passed Animal Preservation Acts because according to Entry 15, List-11 of the Indian Constitution, it says, "State is responsible for preservation, protection and improvement of animal stock and prevention of animal disease." यानी की राज्य सरकार का पूरा अधिकार है कानून बनाने के लिए, उत्पादकता बढ़ाने के लिए। Why doesn't the State Government amend the Tamil Nadu Animal Preservation Act, 1958 to fulfill the 16 objectives that you want to fulfill through your amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act? सर, मैं जल्लीकट्टू में नहीं पड़ना चाहता हूँ। यह बहुत भावुक मुद्दा बन गया है। मैं साफ कर देना चाहता हूँ, जो मैं यहां कह रहा हूँ, वह मैं यहां व्यक्तिगत रूप से कर रहा हूँ, क्योंकि मेरी पार्टी ने भी यह स्टैंड लिया है कि जल्लीकट्टू होना चाहिए पर मैं जल्लीकट्टू के विरोध में रहा हूँ। मैं जब पर्यारण मंत्री था, तभी मैंने यह निर्णय लिया था कि जल्लीकट्टू पर प्रतिबंध लगाना चाहिए। सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने मेरे निर्णय को सही बताया। पर बाद में बहुत कुछ चला और वह जल्लीकट्टू का चैंप्टर अब बंद हो चुका है, उसको मैं नहीं खोलना चाहता हूँ। अभी तमिलनाडु को पूरा अधिकार है कि साल के एक दिन में जल्लीकट्टू बनाने का और कोई नहीं रोक सकता, कानून नहीं रोक सकता। पर उसके बाद अब यह बिल लाना मुझे नहीं पता चलता कि इसका मकसद क्या है? जल्लीकट्टू आज भी हो सकता है, आज के कानून के आधार पर! Let me translate it for you. According to the laws of the land passed by this Government with the cooperation of all parties *Jallikattu* is permitted. Now, what do you hope by amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act? I fail to understand. There is nothing. Let me say once again very clearly, please read the Act. There is nothing in the Act that prohibits the State Government from doing any of the 16 things that you wanted. There is nothing in the Act. The Act only prevents cruelty. How can you remove a bull? Tomorrow, you would start removing animal after animal and you would not have any Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act! So, why do you want to remove only the bull? The reason why you want to remove the bull is that it is because of *jallikattu*. But on *jallikattu* you have already got the Government pass an Ordinance. That Ordinance became a law; the Assembly approved it. *Jallikattu* can now be performed. Fourteen people have died because of *jallikattu* this year. उसके बारे में कोई शोक व्यक्त नहीं करता है। 14 व्यक्ति मारे गए हैं, जल्लीकट्टू की वजह से, लेकिन उसका कोई ज़िक्र नहीं होता है। वह सब छोड़िए, ये छोटी-छोटी बातें हैं। आप जल्लीकट्टू कर सकते हैं, धूम-धाम से मना सकते हैं, लेकिन इस कानून में संशोधन क्यों लाना चाहते हैं? Sir, Mr. Tiruchi Siva is a very, very close friend of mine. Our friendship goes back many years. I agree with the 16

reasons that he has given for his Resolution. But I disagree with the conclusion of this Resolution. The 16 reasons -- Sudarshan Bhagatji is here -- आपके लिए हैं, लेकिन ये जो दो तीर अंत में इन्होंने मारे हैं, वे आपके लिए नहीं हैं क्योंकि उसका और इन्होंने यह जो विश्लेषण किया है, इन दोनों के बीच में कोई संबंध नहीं है। So, I request Mr. Siva not to persist with this Resolution; Rather, he should persist with putting pressure on the Government to promote organic farming, to promote animal welfare, to improve animal productivity, to improve dairying, to protect indigenous breeds, to protect indigenous varieties and so on. He should not persist with this folly of amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, which has stood this country well.

Sir, when passing this Bill in 1960, Rukmani Devi had said, "The test of a civilized society is how it treats its animals." If Mr. Tiruchi Siva's amendments are approved, I am afraid, we would have opened the doors for becoming an uncivilized society.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Thank you. Shri D. Raja. You have only two minutes.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, at the outset, I congratulate our colleague, Mr. Tiruchi Siva, for this Resolution.

What is the essence of this Resolution? The essence is to urge upon the Government to:—

"(a) suitably amend the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, which has been referred to by my colleague, Shri Jairam Ramesh, to exempt bulls from the application of provisions that restrict their utility and training for various purposes by use of various techniques to train them to perform agricultural tasks such as ploughing and transportation;

(b) include the amended Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, 1960, in the Ninth Schedule to the Constitution of India; and

(c) take steps to encourage and incentivise the use of indigenous cattle for agricultural purposes and improve their health and stock."

This is the essence of the Resolution, Sir.

Before making my observations, I must salute the youth of Tamil Nadu, the students who came together and gave a collective expression to the aspirations of the Tamil people on the issue of *jallikattu*. Yes, this Resolution does have a context. It has reference to the recent events in Tamil Nadu where people wanted *jallikattu*; all political parties

[Shri D. Raja]

wanted *jallikattu*. The youth came together and stood by what they believed in. It is a part of the Tamil culture. It is a part of the Tamil tradition. India is a country with tremendous diversities, India is a country of composite culture, and this Tamil culture must be understood in a proper historic perspective, and appreciated. That is how the young people stood together and fought for *jallikattu*. Sir, let us understand that *jallikattu* became a turning point in the polity of Tamil Nadu, in the polity of the whole country, and it has made tremendous impact on the thinking of political parties and politicians in this country, and the young people of Tamil Nadu. They did not stop with *jallikattu* only. They said, "Let us say no to Pepsicola. Let us promote indigenous drinks." This is what the young people of Tamil Nadu declared. They said, "Come on, let us say no to Pepsicola. Why should we promote such drinks? We can promote indigenous drinks." That is a campaign going on. Now, she spoke. She is from that district. Thamirabarni river is there, and even I have my own understanding of law. The court, somehow, allowed the Cola company and other companies to take huge amount of water. So, what is going to happen to our water resources? So, we are talking about cattle. Yes, we should increase the population of our cattle. Our cattle population should increase, and we should also protect and preserve our water bodies and water sources.

Having said that, Sir, now, I take the point what our friend, Mr. Jairam Ramesh, has touched upon. Yes, it is 1960 law, and yes, we should be worried about cruelty to animals, cruelty to human beings, and we should be worried on both counts. But, what do you mean by cruelty to animals? That is the point. I can be more objective than Mr. Jairam Ramesh. I do not own land. I do not own cattle. So, I can be more objective. What do you mean by cruelty to animals? Because, I see in Tamil Nadu in the houses of farmers, agriculture workers, cattle are there around. Cows, bulls, buffalos, they are all living as family members. They live within house premises, and they take care of these animals. This *jallikattu* is a sport; it is a game only at the time of Pongal festival which is the main festival of Tamil people. During that period also, people decorate these cattle, cows, bulls and buffalos. They give them good bath; they paint their horns; they garland them, they take them around, and they treat them as human beings that way. They are all family members. They are all family animals. So, let us not get into that argument as though it is cruelty to animals. What do we mean by cruelty? That is the point, and that is where the case went to the Supreme Court, that is where the case went to the court, the Judiciary, and that is where the State Government had to intervene in the situation, and the State Government had to take the opinion of all political parties. That is where the elected State Legislative Assembly had to take up this issue, and had to pass its own law

in the State Legislative Assembly. So, we are a country who believe in the rule of law; we are a country having our own Constitution, we should respect our Constitution. That is why, there is an Act called the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. This is an Act of the Parliament, and if there is a need to amend this Act of Parliament, this Parliament is supreme; this Parliament is competent to do that. That is why, my friend, Mr. Tiruchi Siva, has brought this issue for the consideration of this Parliament. We will have to stand by the rule of law. I go by Mr. Jairam Ramesh. Why should we have an Act of Parliament? Why should we have Constitution? Why should we have Judiciary? We are bound by Parliament Acts. This Parliament Act needs certain Amendments in a changed situation, at a time when we need to acknowledge and appreciate the great diversities of our country. This law needs certain appropriate Amendments. That is why he has brought this up. It is for the Government to take this in a proper perspective. This Parliament has to consider this. I am saying that it is not only for Tamil Nadu. Tomorrow, it can be for some other State also; maybe, for Karnataka or for some other States. After all, we are a civilized country and we can't have a kind of authoritarian rule. We have to go by certain laws. The civilized society, the civilized nation needs civilized laws. That is where this Act needs certain Amendments at this point of time.

Once again, I salute the young people of Tamil Nadu who have given a proper expression to the aspirations and to the cultural values of Tamil Nadu. It applies to all parts of our country, to all the young people. We will have to come forward taking up such issues in the interest of the country and its progress. I appreciate this Resolution. I urge upon the Government to give due consideration to this Resolution. Thank you.

**महंत शम्भुप्रसादजी तुंदिया** (गुजरात): उपसभापति जी, आदरणीय तिरुची शिवा जी जो संकल्प लेकर आए हैं, उसके संदर्भ में इस सदन में सभी ने अपनी बात रखने का प्रयत्न किया है। मैं भी इस संदर्भ में अपने मन के विचार से जुड़ी कुछ बातें यहां रखना चाहूंगा।

महोदय, शिवा जी द्वारा यह संकल्प पेश किए जाने के संबंध में उनका ध्येय क्या है, इस बारे में श्री जयराम रमेश जी ने बताया कि उनका ध्येय कुछ और है और यहां बिल में संशोधन लाने के लिए ध्येय, पशु पर क्रूरता के संदर्भ में कुछ और बताया जा रहा है। महोदय, भारतीय परम्परा में कृषि और ऋषि की संस्कृति को बहुत महत्व दिया गया है और हमारे यहां कृषि और ऋषि आधारित संस्कृति पर देश और गांव जी रहे हैं। महोदय, कृषि के आधार पर जीने वाले लोग गाय को मानते हैं, पूजते हैं और हमारे शास्त्रों में तो गाय के लिए "गावो विश्वस्य मातरः" कहा गया है, मतलब गाय पूरे विश्व की माता है। महोदय, गाय का दूध संपूर्ण आहार की श्रृंखला में आता है। उसके गोखल के सेवन से मानव जीवन को बहुत आरोग्य मिलता है। इस से लगभग 75 प्रकार के रोग नष्ट हो जाते हैं। आज के जमाने में ऑर्गेनिक फूड और जहां हम chemical fertilizers का उपयोग करते हैं, उससे हमें शुद्ध, सात्विक खाद्य पदार्थ नहीं मिलते जब कि गाय के गोबर के प्रयोग से अच्छे खाद्य और सब्जी मिलती है। मगर

[महंत शम्भुप्रसादजी तुंदिया]

जैसा कि आदरणीय जयराम रमेश जी ने बताया, उसके संदर्भ में मैं इस सदन के माध्यम से कुछ और बात रखना चाहता हूँ। मैं गुजरात से आता हूँ। हमारे यहां एक मंदिर में कुछ महीने पहले एक हाथी को permission लेकर पाला गया, लेकिन उसे केवल पालने के लिए नहीं पाला गया था, हाथी का गणपति का अवतार मानने वाले लोगों ने गणपति को भगवान मानते हुए उसकी पूजा करने के लिए वहां रखा था। अब उसके ऊपर वहां पशु क्रूरता अधिनियम के अंतर्गत एक केस हो गया। उस समय मेरे ध्यान में एक किस्सा और आया। महोदय, हम घोड़े का प्रयोग बग़्घी के लिए करते हैं और यहां जो पशुओं की बात करते हैं, उन पर क्रूरता के संदर्भ में बात रखते हैं, तो मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि हमारी भारतीय परंपरा में, भारतीय जीवन पद्धति और ज्ञान में धर्म शास्त्रों में लिखा गया है कि 84 लाख प्रकार की योनियों के जीव इस धरती पर पनपते हैं। मनुष्य के अलावा उनमें जितने भी जीव हैं, उनकी चार कोटि में अलग-अलग प्रकार से गणना की गई है। हम लोग जब पशुओं की बात करते हैं, तो पशुओं के संदर्भ में वन्य जीवन के आधार पर रहने वाले पशुओं की अलग बात है और मानव द्वारा परिपालित होने वाले पशुओं का उपयोग होता है। यहां गाय का उपयोग होता है, बैलों का उपयोग होता है, भैसों का उपयोग होता है, भेड़-बकरियों का उपयोग होता है। भेड़ों का ऊन के लिए उपयोग होता है, इसलिए हम उसका परिपालन करते हैं। हम बकरियों को भी पालते हैं और हम यहां यातायात के प्रयोग हेतु घोड़ों को भी पालते हैं। हम यहां इस तरह के विचार के लिए इकट्ठा होकर यह सोच रहे हैं कि आदरणीय शिवा जी ने जो यह संकल्प लिया है, यह अच्छा संकल्प है।

जहां तक गौ-संवर्धन की बात है, जहां तक भारतीय परम्परा की बात है, आपके क्षेत्र में, आपके राज्य में अलग से उत्सव होते होंगे, हमारे यहां गुजरात में अलग से उत्सव होते हैं। हमारे यहां भी पशुओं के लिए उत्सव मनाये जाते हैं। हमारे यहां त्योहार मनाए जाते हैं तथा पशुओं को पूजा जाता है और उनको सम्मान दिया जाता है। जहां तक पशु क्रूरता अधिनियम की बात है और उसमें सुधार लाने की बात है, तो इस बारे में मेरा स्पष्ट रूप से यह मत है कि वन्य जीवन के आधार पर जीने वाले जो पशु हैं, उनके लिए अलग से संशोधन होना चाहिए और जो मानव द्वारा पालित पशु हैं, जो मानव जीवन के लिए उपयोगी हैं तथा जिनका हम कृषि क्षेत्र में अच्छे तरीके से उपयोग करते हैं, ऐसे पशुओं के लिए अलग से संशोधन होना चाहिए।

महोदय, आदरणीय शिवा जी जल्लीकट्टू के संदर्भ में जिस ध्येय से यह संकल्प लाए हैं, मैं यह कहना चाहूंगा कि भारतीय परम्परा में जितने भी उत्सव हैं, जितने भी त्योहार हैं, वे मूल रूप से मानव जीवन में अपने धर्म की स्थापना के लिए और अपनी संस्कृति के संवर्धन के लिए रखे हुए हैं, यदि आप उस संदर्भ में भी यह संकल्प लाए हैं, तो बहुत अच्छी बात है। मैं आपकी सराहना करते हुए, अपनी बात को समाप्त करता हूँ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Elangovan. You have only two minutes. ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (Tamil Nadu): Thank you, hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir. While I rise to support Mr. Tiruchi Siva, I have to make certain clarifications in this House

as a reply to my hon. colleague, Shri Jairam Ramesh. Rukmani Devi Arundale was a resident of Chennai. She might have insisted for an Act, Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act, but did not talk about Jallikattu at that time. It means she knows what is Jallikattu. Sir, he also said he knows Thirukkural, Silappadikaram and other things. There is one Thirukkural which I want to quote which means *maadu* is cattle in Tamil. Education is the most invaluable among all wealth, rest are not wealth. Cattle are called as wealth. That was the only wealth of the people of Tamil Nadu in the rural areas. Even today there are temple bulls in every village which will not be touched upon. Those bulls can do any atrocity. They can go to any field to eat. Nobody will touch it, nobody will question it. If somebody tries to throw stone on a bull, that fellow will be sent out of the village. That is how bulls are treated in Tamil Nadu. Sir, this Jallikattu is part of a celebration with the bulls. It is not cruelty to bulls. The question which I want to raise is this. He raised the point that there should be an amendment. Hon. Jairam Ramesh did one thing successfully by stating that it is not the subject for the Minister of Agriculture, so he can go. He wanted Environment Minister to come back. The Minister also left. Sir, we need an amendment.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You have to conclude now.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN: In one minute, I will conclude. There is a need for an amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. One point about which we have doubt is that this amendment was made by the Government of India on the advice of PETA, an organization where an American citizen is the Chief Executive Officer. This American citizen is challenging every Tamilian. Sir, a festival, a cultural festival can support commercialism, but a cultural festival should not be stopped for the sake of commercialism. *Jallikattu* should not be stopped for the sake of killing Indian animal bulls and bringing Jersey Bulls. That is not the way. We want an amendment to the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. Shri Siva talked much about agriculture, farming and everything, but the ultimate idea is to see that *Jallikattu* is performed because the most petted animal in Tamil Nadu are the bulls. The most pampered animal in Tamil Nadu are the bulls. So, this amendment should be made. With these words, Sir, I conclude. Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI VIJILA SATHYANANTH: If PETA enforces this, the bulls can be included in the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act. At that time, the UPA-II brought it. At that time DMK was also a part of that. So, we wanted to...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: This is totally unwarranted.



SHRI T. K. S. ELANGOVAN: Don't challenge us. When we were in power, *Jaliikattu* was there. When they came to power, it was stopped.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): We will not go into that. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**कृषि एवं किसान कल्याण मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सुदर्शन भगत):** माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, माननीय सदस्य श्री तिरुची शिवा द्वारा निजी सदस्य संकल्प में आग्रह किया गया है कि पशुओं के प्रति क्रूरता का निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 के उन उपबंधों के अनुप्रयोग से बैलों को छूट देने के लिए, जो उन्हें खेती एवं परिवहन जैसे कृषि कार्यों के निष्पादन में विभिन्न तकनीकों द्वारा प्रशिक्षण देकर उनकी उपयोगिता एवं प्रशिक्षण से रोकते हैं, में उपयुक्त संशोधन करें; संशोधित पशुओं के प्रति क्रूरता का निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 को भारत के संविधान की नौवीं अनुसूची में शामिल करें और कृषि प्रयोजनों हेतु स्वदेशी मवेशियों के उपयोग को प्रोत्साहित करने तथा उनके स्वास्थ्य में सुधार एवं उनकी संख्या बढ़ाने के लिए कदम उठाएं।

इस संबंध में मैं सदन को बताना चाहूंगा कि पर्यावरण, वन एवं जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्रालय पशु क्रूरता निवारण अधिनियम, 1960 को अधिनियमित एवं क्रियान्वित कर रहा है, इसलिए भाग (क) और (ख) मेरे मंत्रालय से संबंधित नहीं हैं। हालांकि पशुपालन डेयरी और मत्स्यपालन विभाग कृषि प्रयोजनों हेतु देशी गोपशुओं के प्रयोग को बढ़ावा देने, प्रोत्साहित करने तथा उनकी उत्पादकता, स्वास्थ्य और संख्या में सुधार हेतु पहले से ही योजनाएँ कार्यान्वित कर रहा है।

राष्ट्रीय गोकुल मिशन को दिसम्बर, 2014 में देश में पहली बार विशिष्ट रूप से देशी बोवाई नस्लों के विकास के लिए और संरक्षण के लिए प्रारंभ किया गया है। इस योजना में गोकुल ग्रामों की स्थापना की जा रही है। अब तक कुल 14 गोकुल ग्राम स्वीकृत किए जा चुके हैं। राष्ट्रीय गोकुल मिशन के अंतर्गत 27 राज्यों से आए 35 प्रस्तावों को 582.09 करोड़ की राशि के साथ स्वीकृत किया गया है। जिसमें से 216.6 करोड़ रुपए की राशि जारी की गई। मैं यह भी बताना चाहूंगा कि इससे तमिलनाडु को 16 करोड़ रुपए जारी किए गए हैं। राष्ट्रीय बोवाई प्रजनन कार्यक्रम (एनपीबीबी) को फरवरी, 2014 में प्रारंभ किया गया। इस कार्यक्रम का उद्देश्य किसानों के द्वार पर प्रजनन आदानों की सुपुर्दगी के माध्यम से बोवाई आबादी का आनुवांशिक उन्नयन करना है। साथ ही जैविक खेती के विकास के लिए देश में एक नई योजना "परंपरागत कृषि विकास योजना" प्रारंभ की गई।

महोदय, राष्ट्रीय डेयरी योजना-1, विश्व बैंक सहायता प्राप्त राष्ट्रीय डेयरी योजना को फरवरी, 2012 में प्रारंभ किया गया। यह योजना गौ-पशुओं तथा भैंसों की 12 देशी नस्लों के विकास और संरक्षण पर भी ध्यान केन्द्रित करती है। देश में दुग्ध का उत्पादन तथा उत्पादकता बढ़ाने के लिए और दुग्ध उत्पादन को किसानों के लिए लाभकारी बनाने के लिए नई योजना "राष्ट्रीय बोवाई उत्पादकता मिशन" की शुरुआत की गई है। योजना में चार घटक शामिल हैं। पहला, पशु संजीवनी, इसके तहत पशु स्वास्थ्य पत्र (नकुल स्वास्थ्य पत्र), साथ ही साथ यूआईडी (पशु आधार) द्वारा पशुओं की पहचान शामिल है। इस योजना के तहत 8.8 करोड़ दुधारु पशुओं की पहचान की जा रही है और उनका डाटा INAPH डाटा बेस में अपलोड किया जा रहा है। दूसरा, उन्नत प्रजनन तकनीक, तीसरा, देशी नस्लों के



लिए राष्ट्रीय बोवाईन जेनोमिक केन्द्र की स्थापना और चौथा, ई-पशुधन हाट पोर्टल, देश में पहली बार राष्ट्रीय इस तरह का पोर्टल स्थापित किया गया है।

मंत्रालय द्वारा डेयरी उद्यमशीलता विकास योजना चलाई जा रही है। योजना के अंतर्गत सब्सिडी प्रदान की जा रही है। पशुधन स्वास्थ्य एवं रोग नियंत्रण देशी बोवाईन नस्लों समेत पशुधन संख्या के बीच रोगों के नियंत्रण और रोकथाम हेतु कार्यान्वित की जा रही है।

महोदय, मंत्रालय द्वारा कार्यान्वित की जा रही उपरोक्त योजनाओं में तेजी से की जा रही कार्यवाही एवं प्रगति के आलोक में मैं माननीय सदस्य से अपने इस संकल्प को वापस लेने की अपील करता हूँ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Shri Tiruchi Siva, are you withdrawing your Resolution, or, should I put it to vote?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, before that, I wish to say a few words.

First of all, I thank all the hon. Members. Sir, around ten hon. Members have deliberated on this Resolution for which I am very, very thankful.

The intention behind moving this Resolution was interpreted in another manner by my esteemed colleague and former Minister, Shri Jairam Ramesh. I don't deny it. Yes; my intention is for *Jallikattu*. But, at the same time, you cannot undermine my advocacy for organic farming and to protect and preserve indigenous cattle. It is no less than that. For example, as I said, while moving my Resolution, we have to preserve the traditional and ancient form of agricultural methods in our country. And, Sir, due to introduction of modern farm equipment, so many people have been displaced, lost jobs and, moreover, cattle are becoming extinct. Secondly, chemical fertilizers and pesticides which we are using are contaminating groundwater, spoiling soil, depleting water table and whatever it produces is very, very harmful to the health of people.

So, considering all these aspects, I am saying this. I agree with what my senior colleague, Mr. Oscar Fernandes, told me. When we revert back to the traditional form of agricultural methods, we will fall short of the requirement, the mismatch between demand and supply. But we have to find some other ways. We cannot totally give-up that. See, I don't want to leave moveable and immovable property to my children in the future. I want to live them in a world where they can have good water, good food and in a very hygienic atmosphere. Everyone of us has got that responsibility. We all think that we are leaving some estate to our people. No, that won't make them to live happily. After some ten or twenty years, in the present situation, they will be having oxygen cylinders to breathe. War will break out for the sake of water. So also, food will be in a very

[Shri Tiruchi Siva]

big demand. When the population in our country is increasing, the agricultural lands or cultivable lands are coming down. The production has to be increased. So, whatever we produce should be healthy in nature. That is the main reason for my bringing or moving this Resolution. I think, when the Minister replied, he was very much concerned about the cattle. I am concerned about the indigenous cattle. The imported or the other breeds like Jersey, Persian and all these breeds or even insemination bulls which are being brought will totally spoil our country, the health of our people as well as the cattle. So, my foremost reason is that.

The second is, one of my points in this Resolution was to amend the Prevention of Cruelty-to Animals Act. Why have I brought that? The Tamil Nadu Government has enacted a law unanimously and it has been, of course, supported by the Central Government also that *Jallikattu* can be performed and that Cruelty to Animals Act will not be a hindrance to that. But why then I move it again here? As my colleague, Mr. Raja, pointed out, it is an Act of Parliament and the Parliament can any time by way of another amendment supersede the Act which was passed by the Assembly. Moreover, the Act which was passed by the Assembly can be challenged in a court of law, and why I am concerned, I want to be very explicit. Only one Member spoke against this Resolution and that too only on one point. On the surface of it, he appeared to be very low but, at the end, he said, just by way of taking out bulls, don't open the gate or don't take us back to the barbarian society. I don't understand how. Sir, he said that I have not gone through the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act fully well. Of course, I may not like you because you were a Minister. You were concerned with that. But, as a Member of Parliament, I have gone to the extent I need to. Section 22 empowers the Central Government and Section 24 of the PC Act talks about, 'Power of Court to prohibit or restrict exhibition and training of performing animals.' Training of Performing Animals is one category and when you are using a bull for ploughing, when you are using it for transportation, the man on the cart will be whipping. Will you say that it is a cruelty to the animal? Yes, they will. Only in 2011, when he was the Minister for Environment -- there is nothing wrong in that; it is a history -- the Notification was made. Section 22 says, 'No person shall exhibit or train (i) any performing animal unless he is registered in accordance with the provisions of this Chapter; (ii) as a performing animal, any animal which the Central Government may, by notification in the official gazette, specify as an animal which shall not be exhibited or trained as a performing animal.' Sir, the Gazette Notification by the Central Government in the year 2011 -- when he was the hon. Minister -- included it. See which are the animals in that? They are 'Bears, Monkeys, Tigers, Panthers, Lions and last of all 'Bulls'.

Sir, all the other animals are forest animals, whereas, bull is being domesticated. It is used for agricultural purposes. Why should it be brought into that? That is what my colleague, Mr. Elangovan, said. Some organization which has its headquarters in USA is deciding what should happen in India. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: No, no. That is not true. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I don't mean 'you'. I don't mean 'you'. Who is challenging it again and again in the court of law? It is that organization which is interested in this. I don't blame you. You have done something when you were in the office. That's all. But who is challenging it again and again? It is the PETA, an organization which has its headquarters in the USA. Now, what interest do they have in India? They want to kill our traditional forms of agriculture.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, a Cabinet Minister of this Government is also in agreement on this.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: I shall come to that point later.

So, they want to kill traditional methods of agriculture in our country. Now, we are cutting down some karuvelam trees in Tamil Nadu. These trees had been planted by the US. There are many other things, like Pepsi, that the hon. Member here mentioned. They are bringing all these things here to spoil the health of the people of our country. They are only commercializing things. It is in an attempt to do so that they want to take away our bulls. This would mean that people would not nurture them and they won't need them for agricultural purposes when trends change. When tractors were being brought in, I said that it consumed more of fossil fuel and that it was hazardous. We experience global warming only because of the excessive use of fossil fuels. We have many conventions taking place all over the world to ponder over bringing down global warming, which country needs to cut down what emissions, and so on. But no country is prepared to do that, whereas the farmers are being forced to do away with traditional methods of farming. Tractors came in and fossil fuels came in, which emit so many Greenhouse gases. So, that needs to be restored. They are attempting at this. When bulls are not used for agriculture, farmers won't rear them. When jallikattu is banned, they would not tame bulls for sport. When they are not available for breeding cows, artificial insemination would come in. So, there would be no need for rearing bulls after some time. We could then tell our children in some exhibition, 'this is a bull; this is what was found in our country once!' Do you want that to happen? So, bulls need not be brought in the category of 'performing animals'. We don't perform anything anywhere. For that matter, what is happening with elephants?

[Shri Tiruchi Siva]

They are tied with iron chains in the temples. They are used for begging on the streets. Why have they not paid attention to them? It is a forest animal. When they did not pay attention to the elephants, why are they paying attention to the bulls?

Sir, through a Notification in the Gazette in 2011, bulls were brought in. After that, our Party, when we were in power in Tamil Nadu, bypassed this Notification and conducted *jallikattu* with permission from the Court, though with some restrictions. Of course, we have been partners with them, but we were able to perform the *jallikattu* sport with the permission of the Court, with the restrictions that they had imposed. We abided by those rules and conducted the sport. After the next Government took over, they were not able to continue the sport. That is a different matter. In the year 2016, when Shri Prakash Javadekar was the Environment Minister, another Gazette Notification came, which said very clearly, "Provided that bulls may be continued to be exhibited or trained as a performing animal at events such as '*Jallikattu*' in Tamil Nadu and 'bullock cart races' in Maharashtra, Karnataka, Punjab, Haryana, Kerala and Gujarat in the manner by the customs of any community or practised traditionally under the customs or as a part of culture in any part of the country subject to the following conditions..."

Sir, I thank Mr. Prakash Javadekar for having brought out this Notification. Now, I think, Mr. Jairam Ramesh would agree that I have gone through the Bill. I have gone through the Gazette Notification and also the Supreme Court judgement which followed that. It says that after Mr. Prakash Javadekar brought out this Notification in the Gazette, it was challenged in the court of law by PETA. Now, let me quickly quote what the hon. Supreme Court said, "As an interim measure, we direct that there shall be stay on Notification dated 7th January, 2016, issued by the Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change, until further orders." So, it was stayed. A big agitation came up in Tamil Nadu, on a scale that no one had ever witnessed in the past. It was a silent protest. Students, youngsters, women and even small children participated in the agitation, because they were concerned about the culture. Some people may say that they didn't need it, for one or the other reason. But people are concerned. India is basically a nation of varied cultures. It has got a tradition of its own. We have never been a capitalist country. We have never been a country with commercial basics. We live on the lines of tradition. So, Tamil Nadu witnessed a very big agitation and the Tamil Nadu Government passed an Act unanimously. I am afraid, Sir, that it may again be challenged in a court of law. Or, in future, I don't hesitate to say, if Shri Jairam Ramesh becomes the Minister of Environment and Forests may again impose something to ban Jallikatu. So, I have to be very cautious.

...(Interruptions)... In a democratic country, it may happen. If he or any like-minded person becomes the Minister -- unlike Shri Prakash Javadekar, who is very cordial with us -- then there may be ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I think, you should conclude now.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, it is a very serious issue. Either he or anyone like him may again come here. Or, it can also be challenged in the court of law. In that situation, I move this Resolution in this House that necessary amendments should be made and bulls must be exempted from the performing animals and it should be incorporated in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution. That is my main emphasis in this Resolution. If it is included in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution, it cannot be challenged in the court of law. We have got an experience. The Reservation Policy in Tamil Nadu was incorporated in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution after great efforts. We don't want to witness agitations in Tamil Nadu every year. Of course, we agitate in a peaceful manner. But, it does not mean that we should agitate again and again. When the Parliament is here to enact laws, when the Government is here to do certain things, the Members also have some responsibility. In that respect, I would like to move this Resolution that necessary amendments should be made in the PCA to exempt bulls as performing animals and also incorporate it in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution to enable Jallikatu to be performed as well as to encourage organic farming and to protect and preserve the indigenous cattle in our country. The bulls are becoming an extinct species. I am very much worried about that. Everyone is worried about that. I am very, very thankful to all the Members who expressed their concern and supported my Resolution. So, I am compelled to move my Resolution for adoption.

**अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री; तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी):** सर, ऑनरेबल तिरुची शिवा जी ने जो प्राइवेट मैम्बर रिजॉल्यूशन रखा है, उसमें बहुत अच्छे सजैशन्स हैं। Some suggestions are very good and fruitful for us also. गवर्नमेंट द्वारा जो भी कानून बनाए जाते हैं, उनमें रिफॉर्म्स और अच्छी चीजें जोड़ने का एक अनवरत प्रोसेस होता है और उसमें कहीं कोई बाधा नहीं होती। श्री तिरुची शिवा ने बहुत अच्छे सुझाव दिए हैं, जिन्हें हम डेफिनिटली ध्यान में रखेंगे। इसमें बहुत अच्छे सुझाव हैं, जिन्हें ऑनरेबल मिनिस्टर ने भी एक्सेप्ट किया है। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि जब हम इस दिशा में आगे बढ़ेंगे, तो डेफिनिटली आपके जो सजैशन्स हैं, जो सुझाव हैं, जो आपने इस बिल में रखे हैं, उन्हें हम बहुत पॉजिटिव और कस्ट्रक्टिव तरीके से लेंगे। इसलिए सर, हमारी आपके माध्यम से श्री तिरुची शिवा अपील है कि वे इस रिजॉल्यूशन को विद्वानों करें।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): So, Mr. Siva, with the assurance given by the Government, are you withdrawing your Resolution or should I put it to vote?

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I am very much appreciative and thankful to the hon. Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. He is always very much compassionate. Since the assurance has been given on behalf of other Minister, I am afraid what we will be able to do if something happens in future. In that situation, agitations cannot be made again and again. I think, it can unanimously be adopted. There is nothing wrong in it.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF MICRO, SMALL AND MEDIUM ENTERPRISES (SHRI GIRIRAJ SINGH): Mr. Siva, everybody is supporting you; the whole House is supporting you. सारे लोग आपके साथ हैं। इससे बढ़कर और कोई चीज़ नहीं होती है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री नारायण लाल पंचारिया** (राजस्थान): हम सब लोग आपके साथ हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I take the words of the Minister. And, since many hon. Members are supporting me, I should also consider it. I think, the ' message should be strong enough from the Government that my Resolution will be taken into consideration and necessary amendments will be made in the PC Act and it will be incorporated in the Ninth Schedule of the Constitution. If that assurance is given, I am prepared to withdraw this.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Also, there is no possibility of my becoming the Minister of Environment once more.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Has he the leave of the House to withdraw the Resolution?

**श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी**: सर, मैंने पहले भी कहा है कि ऑनरेबल तिरुची शिवा जी के बहुत अच्छे सजेसंस हैं। जब भी एप्रोप्रिएट टाइम होगा, उस समय हम लोग उस पर भी कंसिडर करेंगे। यह बहुत क्लियर कट बात है।

**श्री गिरिराज सिंह**: इसलिए पूरा हाउस आपके साथ है।

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, I withdraw this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Has he the leave of the House to withdraw the Resolution?

*The Resolution was, by leave, withdrawn.*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Now, we have another Resolution of Shri Vishambhar Prasad Nishad regarding need to take welfare measures for farmers in Bundelkhand region and steps for overall development of the region.

**Need for taking welfare measures for farmers in Bundelkhand region and steps for overall development of the region**

**श्री विशम्भर प्रसाद निषाद** (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे अवसर देने के लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ और मैं अपना निम्नलिखित संकल्प उपस्थित करता हूँ:-

"इस तथ्य को ध्यान में रखते हुए कि—

- (क) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र में सूखे, बाढ़, पाला पड़ने व ओलावृष्टि से किसानों की फसलें नष्ट हो जाने से उनमें निराशा उत्पन्न हो रही है;
- (ख) इस क्षेत्र में उ.प्र. के सात जिले अर्थात् झांसी, ललितपुर, जालौन, बांदा, चित्रकूट, महोबा एवं हमीरपुर तथा मध्य प्रदेश के सात जिले अर्थात् छतरपुर, पन्ना, सागर, दमोह, टीकमगढ़, दतिया और ग्वालियर शामिल हैं;
- (ग) पिछले कई दशकों से बुन्देलखण्ड के किसान लगातार रोजगार की तलाश में बाहर पलायन कर रहे हैं;
- (घ) बुन्देलखण्ड में जंगली जानवरों व 'नीलगायों' से किसानों की फसलों का भारी नुकसान होने से उनमें हताशा उत्पन्न हो रही है;
- (ङ) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र मुख्य रूप से वर्षा पर निर्भर रहने वाला कृषि क्षेत्र है और फसलें मुख्यतः मानसून पर निर्भर होती हैं जिससे उपज एवं आय में अनियमितता के कारण किसानों का जीवन अनिश्चित हो जाता है और जीना दूभर हो जाता है;
- (च) बुन्देलखण्ड क्षेत्र में लगातार पड़ रहे भयंकर सूखे के कारण फसलों की उपज निरंतर कम होती जा रही है जिसके फलस्वरूप किसान खेती से लागत मूल्य भी नहीं निकाल पा रहे हैं;
- (छ) इस क्षेत्र में कृषि आधारित उद्योगों और कुटीर उद्योगों की कमी के कारण रोजगार और वित्तीय आय की बहुत कमी है;
- (ज) नकदी फसलों के प्रतिकूल मूल्य निर्धारण तथा कारोबार के खुलेआम शोषण के कारण कृषि एक घाटे का कार्य बन गया है और यह उ.प्र. के किसानों में व्याप्त ऋण भार तथा हताशा का प्रमुख कारण है;