

- (v) Thirty-sixth Report of the Committee on 'Pradhan Mantri Gram Sadak Yojana (PMGSY)' of the Ministry of Rural Development (Department of Rural Development).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Zero Hour submissions.

RE. DISCUSSION ON THE CONDUCT OF THE GOVERNOR OF GOA

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, as directed by you, I had moved a Substantive Motion against the Goa Governor under Rule 168. I would request you to tell me when this Motion will be taken up because I have not been informed as yet and it has not been listed in the Business for today. As you had mentioned that day that it will be considered, that we will discuss it on Monday.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; I will reply to it. Your notice is received and it is under consideration. And as and when the hon. Chairman decides on the admissibility. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, this is well taken; I understand. But at the same time, the urgency is lost. We would request you to kindly look into it. How the democracy has been murdered in Manipur and Goa. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No. Okay. *...(Interruptions)...* All that... *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, this is something which has to be discussed. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All that you can discuss... *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: The role of Governor has been totally unjustified, *...(Interruptions)...* has gone against the Constitution, has gone against the principles of democracy... *...(Interruptions)...* has gone against the guidelines of the Sarkaria Commission. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijayaji, I told you. *...(Interruptions)...* Digvijayaji, *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: In a fractured mandate, it has been the practice *...(Interruptions)...* to invite the single largest party for the first time *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijayaji, ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: And the single largest party has got the right of refusal. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijayaji, ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, this is the murder of democracy. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijayaji, ...(Interruptions)... Yes; I told you. ...(Interruptions)... Why do you say this? You are saying as if it is rejected. It is not rejected. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: It may not be rejected. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is under consideration. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: But I appeal to you. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: And I will come back to you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, urgency is lost. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will come back to you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Sir, urgency is lost. ...(Interruptions)... Kindly take it up as seriously as possible ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will come back to you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Yesterday only. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. You will be informed. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: The last working day ...(Interruptions)... we had the information that it will be taken up on Monday.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes; you will be informed and not only that, the House will also be informed about your motion, about your notice of a substantive motion. You will be informed.

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE AND THE MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): Sir, first of all, the expression, 'murder of democracy' by them should not go on record.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Why? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I have got the right to make my request to the Chair. Why not?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will go through that.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, the second thing is that the in-house problem of the Congress Party should not be shifted to the Governor. The matter is pending.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay; let us not go into the merit now. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us not go into the merit now. We are not going into the merit of the matter.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I have a request and I am not going into the subject. But the expression, "murder of democracy" is not unparliamentary language and it cannot be expunged.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will examine.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: The hon. Minister has made his point. I am also making my point.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I said that I will examine and go through that.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: Please don't go by that.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will examine and go by the practice and... ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Sir, will the Treasury Benches and the Ministers tell the leaders in the Opposition and Members here what to speak?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. He did not say that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: What has happened is. ...*(Interruptions)*... What has happened is ...*(Interruptions)*... assault ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I must clarify. ...*(Interruptions)*... I respect your right to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: They lost the election and they are ...*(Interruptions)*... sworn in as the Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I fully respect your right to speak.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: The theft has been committed... ...(Interruptions)... in the Constitution and now you expect that we will not even point it out, that we will not resist that. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: But, Anand Sharmaji, ...(Interruptions)... Anand Sharmaji, as you have a right, the hon. Minister also has a right.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I am not questioning his right.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You may disagree, but he is saying what he has to say. You may disagree.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: If democracy has been murdered, what is wrong in saying that?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No; if the discussion is permitted, you can say all this. No problem. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Because when you don't get a mandate and you commit theft of ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. We don't go into the merit of that now. ...(Interruptions)... We don't go into the merit of that. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. आप बैठिए, बैठिए! We don't go into the merit now. Sharad Yadavji, now, I have to take up the Zero Hour.

श्री शरद यादव (बिहार): सर, शुक्रवार को यह बात हुई थी कि दिग्विजय सिंह जी का resolution आज आएगा। मैं मानता हूँ कि बात को वक्त पर ही होती है। आप से मेरी विनती है कि आज के लिए इम्पेशन था कि आज इनका resolution लिया जायेगा। आज ये कैसा महसूस कर रहे हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sharad Yadavji, if a notice is given; there is a procedure to be followed. With regard to your substantive motion, the hon. Chairman has to examine its admissibility, and he has to permit the admissibility. Once it is permitted, you will know about it. I will convey your feeling to the hon. Chairman.

अल्पसंख्यक कार्य मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी): उपसभापति, शरद यादव जी जो बात कह रहे हैं, मुझे लगता है कि ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have already said ... (*Interruptions*)... Now, LoP.

श्री मुख्तार अब्बास नकवी: उपसभापति जी, जो शरद जी कह रहे हैं, उस पर आज चर्चा करने की कोई बात नहीं थी।... (व्यवधान)... उस वक्त माननीय दिग्विजय सिंह जी ने इस मुद्दे को उठाया था और हम लोगों ने कहा था कि आप इस पर नोटिस दीजिए। नोटिस देने के बाद चेयर तय करेगी, हम लोग उसको तय करेंगे कि इस पर substantive motion के तहत चर्चा होगी या किसी और नियम के तहत चर्चा होगी। इसलिए इस इश्यू को चेयर के ऊपर छोड़ना चाहिए क्योंकि मुझे यह लगता है कि जनादेश का सम्मान शांतिनता से होना चाहिए।

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnatak): Please permit me before the LoP.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not before the LoP. How can you say before the LoP? The Chair is obliged to call the LoP when he is standing.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. That is expunged ... (*Interruptions*)... That is expunged. Sit down. That is expunged. Don't say about that. That is expunged; so, you can't comment on that ... (*Interruptions*)... What is expunged can't be commented upon, sit down.

श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव (राजस्थान): उपसभापति जी, शरद जी ने जो कहा ... (व्यवधान)... उपसभापति जी, शरद जी की बात बहुत सही है कि वक्त गुजर गया है। सुप्रीम कोर्ट का वॉर्डिक्ट भी आ गया है, फ्लोर पर टेस्ट हो गया है, सब जगहों पर हार गए हैं, इसलिए वक्त गुजर गया है और विषय समाप्त हो गया है।

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद): उपसभापति जी, Thursday और Friday को हम लोगों ने और विपक्ष ने यहाँ पर, जीरो ऑवर में यह विषय उठाया था। आपको Friday को ऑनरेबल मेम्बर दिग्विजय सिंह जी को यह बताया था कि आपका जो मोशन है, इस मोशन पर गवर्नर का conduct discuss नहीं किया जा सकता। आपने यह भी बताया था कि उसके लिए Substantive Motion देना चाहिए। हमने और विपक्ष ने कहा था कि हम Monday को Substantive Motion देंगे। अब इन्होंने Substantive Motion दिया है और आज वह discuss होना चाहिए।... (व्यवधान)... आपने अभी तक इसको नहीं लिया है, इसलिए मेरा आपसे अनुरोध है कि इस पर 2 बजे से चर्चा होनी चाहिए। अभी सवा ग्यारह बजे हैं, यह इस बीच में डिसाइड हो सकता है और इस पर 2 बजे से चर्चा आरंभ की जा सकती है। मेरा आपसे यह अनुरोध है।

† قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد): آپ سبھا پٹی جی، Thursday اور Friday

کو ہم لوگوں نے اور ویکشن نے یہاں پر زیرو اوور میں یہ وشنے اٹھایا تھا۔ آپ نے Friday کو انریبل ممبر دگوجے سنگھ جی کو یہ بتایا تھا کہ آپ کا جو موشن ہے، اس موشن پر گورنر کا conduct discuss نہیں کیا جا سکتا۔ آپ نے یہ بھی بتایا

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

† Transliteration in Urdu script.

تھا کہ اس کے لئے Substantive Motion دینا چاہئے۔ ہم نے اور پورے ویکس نے کہا تھا کہ ہم منٹے کو Substantive Motion دیں گے۔ اب انہوں نے Substantive Motion دیا ہے اور آج وہ ٹسکس ہونا چاہئے۔۔۔ (مداخلت)۔۔۔ آپ نے ابھی تک اس کو نہیں لیا ہے، اس لئے میرا آپ سے انورودھ ہوگا کہ اس پر دو بجے سے چرچا ہونی چاہئے۔ ابھی سوا گیارہ بجے ہیں، یہ اس بیچ میں سوسائٹ ہو سکتا ہے اور اس پر دو بجے سے چرچا شروع کی جا سکتی ہے۔ میرا آپ سے یہ انورودھ ہے۔

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon. LoP, you are a seasoned and a senior Member with a lot of experience in the Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha. You know, if a motion is given to the hon. Chairman or to the Secretariat, for that matter there is a procedure to be followed, and that procedure will be followed and the decision will be communicated to you. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: But there should be a time limit. Otherwise, the urgency will be lost.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be done as early as possible.... (Interruptions).... Please sit down.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: The Governor of Goa has acted ... (Interruptions).... She has violated the guidelines.... (Interruptions)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijaya Singhji, you are a senior Member. What can I do? You are such a senior Member arguing with me!

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: She should have given an opportunity to the largest party.... (Interruptions).... She has not followed the guideline.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijaya Singhji, सुनिए, सुनिए। I have already said that it is under consideration of the hon. Chairman. Now, if you allege that it is going to be delayed, I want to tell you that it is casting aspersion against the Chair. Don't do that.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: I am requesting the Chair to kindly indicate the timeline.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your request is accepted. I will convey it to the hon. Chairman. Sit down.