

SHRI NARESH AGRAWAL: I want your commitment and everything.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am always for helping the Members. You can give notice and we will select according to the priority and according to the time available. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

#### REGARDING ISSUES NOT TO BE RAISED UNDER RULE 267

श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव (राजस्थान): सर, नियम 267 में issue तभी raise किया जा सकता है, जब चेयरमैन की consent हो। ...*(व्यवधान)*... सर, हाउस में नियम 267 के अन्तर्गत तभी issue raise किया जा सकता है, जब hon. Chairman की consent हो। इस हाउस में नियम 267 के अन्तर्गत मुद्दा तभी raise करना चाहिए, जब चेयरमैन की consent हो, otherwise Rule 267 को लेकर कई बार हम हाउस को disturb कर देते हैं। इससे अच्छा है कि ऐसे विषयों को आपको पहले Zero Hour में allow करना चाहिए और without consent, रूल 267 में मुद्दा raise नहीं होना चाहिए, इस पर मेरा पाइंट ऑफ आर्डर है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा (हिमाचल प्रदेश): सर, यह कैसे हो सकता है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE (Maharashtra): Sir, please give me one minute.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay.

DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE: Sir, with folded hands, we are requesting you that there are many new Members here and we have been repeatedly giving some notices for Zero Hour mentions, and they are being denied; whatever maybe the reasons; they may not be finding them meritorious. ...*(Interruptions)*... But, कुछ लोगों के गले में माइक लगा है। इसलिए आवाज को दबाना उचित नहीं है। हमें बोलने दीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... हमें बोलने दीजिए। मेरा आपसे करबद्ध निवेदन है कि केवल पाइंट ऑफ आर्डर के नाम से इस सदन का बहुमूल्य समय अगर बेकार जा रहा है, तो उस पर हमें आपको संरक्षण देना चाहिए। It is your duty to protect our right to raise the issues in the Zero Hour.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Sahasrabuddheji...

DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE: We are being disadvantaged for no fault of ours. कुछ माननीय सदस्य सामने बैठते हैं और issue raise करते हैं और सदन की पूरी कार्यवाही को यहां-वहां कर देते हैं। क्या यह कोई तरीका है? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: आप बैठिए।

डा. विनय पी. सहस्रबुद्धे: महोदय, हमारे अधिकारों की रक्षा आपके हाथ में है। आपको हमें संरक्षण देना चाहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री उपसभापति: आप लोग बैठिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*...

डा. विनय पी. सहस्रबुद्धे: सर, इस प्रकार से हमेशा वेल में आना अच्छा नहीं है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI LA. GANESAN (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, what I observe. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, please, sit down. I want the hon. Members to know that any Member can raise a point of order, and if any Member raises a point of order, the Chair is duty-bound to listen to that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: ये भी दे सकते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Naresh Agrawal, please don't interrupt. ...*(Interruptions)*... Listen to me. I am speaking. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please listen, Mr. Sahasrabuddhe. You should understand the procedure. Any Member can raise a point of order. It is not that only Mr. Naresh Agrawal, or 'X' or 'Y' can raise it. Today, Mr. Naresh Agrawal and Dr. Subramanian Swamy raised the points of order. I heard both. You understand this. Any Member can raise it. If a point of order is raised, the Chair is duty bound to listen to that. But, after listening to that, the Chair may rule it out depending upon the merit of the case which has been raised. That is a different matter. Therefore, I cannot pre-judge, I cannot prevent anybody from...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. VINAY P. SAHASRABUDDHE: I do not want to enter into ...*(Interruptions)*... But if somebody habitually does it ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Sahasrabuddheji, you know the rules. I am talking. Please sit down. Such a senior Member should not do this. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sahasrabuddheji, you are a senior Member, a well-behaved Member. I allowed you. You should know that the moment you stood up, I allowed you. Even then you are saying that it is not allowed. It is not proper. Let me say. Please understand the procedure. As far as the Chair is concerned, it is an indirect insinuation on the Chair. So, I have to explain it.

As far as the Chair is concerned, every Member is equal to the Chair. That is number one. Secondly, any Member can raise a point of order. Simply because someone raised a point of order on the other day, I cannot say that today, he cannot be allowed. That is the

position. But, I have to listen to the point of order. Then only I can rule it out or accept it. Today, I listened to Mr. Naresh Agrawal and Dr. Subramanian Swamy. I ruled out both the points of order. In spite of your case not being a point of order, I allowed you also. Therefore, don't think that the Chair is partial. That is the position.

Now, with regard to the suggestion made by Mr. Bhupender Yadav regarding Rule 267, I would like to clarify that if there is notice under Rule 267, it has precedence over Zero Hour. It has precedence and it has to be disposed of first because it comes under Rule 267 which is specifically mentioned in the Rules Book. Zero Hour is not like that. For Zero Hour, there is no rule. It is only hon. Chairman's discretion to allow Zero Hour. Now, once a notice under Rule 267 is received, it is for the Chair to consider and dispose it. So, to consider it, sometimes, the Chair may need the assistance of the person who gave the notice. So, the Chair will allow him to speak. After listening to that, the Chair may reject it. Here, we have a number of notices under Rule 267, and usually, the Treasury Benches should know that...*(Interruptions)*... Listen to me. The Treasury Benches should know that the Treasury Benches cannot, will not and should not move notice under Rule 267 because notice under Rule 267 is for the suspension of particular day's Business, which is mostly Business agreed to between the Government and the Chairman.

So, it is the duty of the Treasury Benches to ensure that the House runs smoothly as per the List of Business. Therefore, the Treasury Benches cannot give notice for motion under Rule 267 as they cannot give Adjournment Motion in the other House, and, to say that motion under Rule 267 should be stopped means that the Member of the Treasury Benches is saying, 'block the Opposition from raising their view.' It is not possible. Rule 267 has precedence. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will listen to you. Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I ruled that out. ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Mr. Anand Sharma, what is your point under Rule 267? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I am not allowing you. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. What is your notice under Rule 267? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा (हिमाचल प्रदेश): सर ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव: सर ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I have given my ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... No discussion. Please sit down.

SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV: Sir, I need a clarification. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you want further clarification, please come to me later. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** मेरा नोटिस है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... मुझे बुला लिया गया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have given the ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*... On Rule 267, I have given the ruling. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** मैं अपनी बात आरम्भ करने जा रहा हूँ। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One second. ...*(Interruptions)*... If you want to move it under Rule 267, I have no objection. ...*(Interruptions)*... I only said that the Treasury Benches do not do that.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, you have already called me. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have called me more than once, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. If you give notice for motion under Rule 267, I have no problem. Let it come; I will examine it. But I only said that as a matter of practice and procedure, the Treasury Benches never do that. On that ground, I cannot block the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please understand this. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, what is your point, Mr. Anand Sharma?

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** सर, आप उनको बिठा दीजिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप जल्दी बोलिए। What is your point? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री विनय कटियार (उत्तर प्रदेश):** सर ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** सर, आप ही देखिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... इस तरह से अगर होगा तो ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point, Mr. Anand Sharma?

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** सर, हर देश और हर समाज अपने राष्ट्र के नेताओं, राष्ट्र के निर्माताओं और राष्ट्र पर कुर्बानी देने वालों का सम्मान से स्मरण करता है। भारतवर्ष में भी यही परम्परा रही है। स्वतंत्रता संग्राम के महानायक, राष्ट्रपिता महात्मा गांधी को सम्मान से स्मरण किया जाता है। भारत में सबसे ऊपर दर्जा महात्मा गांधी का है। उन्होंने उस समय हिन्दुस्तान के लोगों को हिम्मत दी...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the problem? Nobody is questioning that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** सर, मैं बता रहा हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप मुझे पूरा तो करने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... पूरा तो करने दीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह विषय बीच में आपने रोका। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please listen. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** सर, उसके साथ-साथ आज़ादी के संग्राम के एक महान नायक पंडित जवाहरलाल नेहरू थे, जो हिन्दुस्तान के प्रथम प्रधानमंत्री थे, अंग्रेजों की जेल में 14 साल रहे थे। तीसरे, स्वर्गीय इंदिरा गांधी जी 17 साल प्रधान मंत्री रहीं, हिन्दुस्तान के लिए शहीद हुईं। आज सरकार की तरफ से एक सुनियोजित तरीके से महात्मा गांधी के कद को छोटा दिखाना, उनके योगदान को छोटा करना, पंडित नेहरू का नाम नहीं लेना, इंदिरा गांधी के 100 साल...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the issue? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** इंदिरा जी की centenary ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं बता रहा हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कल महात्मा गांधी जी की तुलना पंडित दीनदयाल उपाध्याय जी से की गई। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't raise that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** पंडित दीनदयाल उपाध्याय का स्मरण ...**(व्यवधान)**... आप उनकी centenary मनाएंगे?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not allowed, not allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** इंदिरा जी की centenary नहीं मनाएंगे? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not allowed; ...*(Interruptions)*... not allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** आप अपमानित करते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not allowed. I am not allowing that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not allowing that.

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** यह इस देश का अपमान है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** कोई इस तरह का अपमान नहीं करता। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा:** आपके नेता हो सकते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... Zero Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. I am not allowing that under Rule 267. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, what do you wish to say?

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Mr. Deputy Chairman; Sir, normally, the Chair uses its own discretion and allows the points of order, which in most cases, are not points of order to be raised in the Zero Hour. The Chair is also using its discretion for allowing Members to raise motions and propose motions under Rule 267 but in every case, we have found that these are not motions under Rule 267, and, therefore, it is a practice which is being grossly abused. The Chair must also be guided by the principle that you cannot have a Zero Hour run only for the benefit of television cameras. That is something which is happening here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री नरेश अग्रवाल: सर ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह गलत बात है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, they want to muzzle the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is our right to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

क्या आप यह तय करेंगे कि हमें क्या बोलना है और क्या नहीं बोलना है? ...*(व्यवधान)*... क्या आप चेयर को बताएंगे कि क्या कहा जाएगा और क्या नहीं कहा जाएगा? ...*(व्यवधान)*... हमने यह अधिकार आपको नहीं दिया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Can we take what Mr. Anand Sharma has said today? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is why. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: The whole speech has to be expunged ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not allowed that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: The whole speech has to be expunged for even the Chair is bound by a rule which says that you do not refer to high constitutional authorities and what they have said in a debate in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Did he do that? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: That is the purpose behind what he said.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He cannot do that. ...*(Interruptions)*... I agree with you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: What is the point in dragging. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I have not referred to. ... (Interruptions)... The Leader of the House has not even heard me. ... (Interruptions)... I have not referred to any high constitutional authority. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: We know the spirit of what you are saying. ... (Interruptions)... We know the spirit of what you are saying. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: It is what your Government is doing. ... (Interruptions)... It is not mentioning Nehru. ... (Interruptions)... You cannot tell me what to raise. ... (Interruptions)... Sir, I am sorry, I have a right to raise this. ... (Interruptions)... Hon. Members have a right. ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Anand Sharmaji, please sit down. ... (Interruptions)... You agree. ... (Interruptions)... I am not allowing that. ... (Interruptions)... Anand Sharmaji, I have not allowed you. ... (Interruptions)... I am not allowing Anand Sharmaji. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: What wrong have I said? ... (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. ... (Interruptions)... I tell you this. I agree with the hon. Leader of the House that many of the issues referred. ... (Interruptions)... Let me complete it. ... (Interruptions)... Many of the issues referred here under Rule 267 are not relevant. That is why I am not allowing them. I have not allowed Rule 267 discussion till now. I have heard it all and discussion under Rule 267 has been rejected because the subjects are not relevant according to me also. But for the Chair to decide whether to accept or not, the Chair has to listen to them. That is the point. ... (Interruptions)... That is the point. ... (Interruptions)... This is number one. Number two, I have to go through the record and if Mr. Anand Sharma has referred to any high constitutional authority, the whole thing will be expunged. You cannot do that. ... (Interruptions)... You cannot do that.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद): ऑन रेबल डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहब, आनन्द शर्मा जी ने किसी भी highest या high constitutional authority का नाम सदन में नहीं लिया है।

† قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد): آنریبل ڈپٹی چیئرمین صاحب، آنند شرما جی نے کسی بھی

highest یا high constitutional authority کا نام سदन میں نہیں لیا ہے۔

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Directly or indirectly... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद: लेकिन गांधी जी का अपमान बराबर यह सरकार करती रही है।  
...*(व्यवधान)*...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : لیکن گاندھی جی کا ایمان برابر یہ سرکار کرتی رہی ہے۔—*(مداخلت)*—

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not allowing it. ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद: नेहरू जी का अपमान यह सरकार बराबर करती रही है।  
...*(व्यवधान)*...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : نہرو جی کا ایمان برابر کرتی رہی ہے۔—*(مداخلت)*—

श्री उपसभापति: आप ऐसा कैसे बोल सकते हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद: सर, ऐसे लोगों की centenary मनाई जा रही है, जिनका भारत के स्वतंत्रता संग्राम से कोई लेना-देना नहीं था। ...*(व्यवधान)*... जो देश की स्वतंत्रता के लिए स्वतंत्रता संग्राम के दौरान जेलों में सड़े, उनको इस सरकार में भुला दिया गया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... इस पर हमें घोर आपत्ति है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : سر، ایسے لوگوں کی centenary منائی جا رہی ہے، جن کا بھارت کی جنگ آزادی سے کوئی لینا دینا نہیں تھا۔—*(مداخلت)*— جو دیش کی آزادی کے لئے جنگ آزادی کے دوران جیلوں میں سڑے، ان کو اس سرکار میں بھلا دیا گیا ہے۔—*(مداخلت)*— اس پر ہمیں گہور اپنی ہے۔—*(مداخلت)*—

श्री उपसभापति: आप क्या बोल रहे हैं? कहां अपमान हो गया? ...*(व्यवधान)*... गुलाम नबी जी, कहां अपमान हो गया? ...*(व्यवधान)*... जीरो ऑवर लेना है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... जीरो ऑवर, श्री श्वेत मलिक। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद: महात्मा गांधी, जवाहरलाल नेहरू, इंदिरा गांधी ...*(व्यवधान)*... ये पिक एण्ड चूज करके राजनीति कर रहे हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

† جناب غلام نبی آزاد : مہتما گاندھی، جواہر لال نہرو، اندرا گاندھی۔—*(مداخلت)*— یہ 'پک اینڈ چوز' کر کے سیاست کر رہے ہیں۔—*(مداخلت)*—

श्री उपसभापति: कोई अपमान नहीं हो रहा है, आप यह क्या बोल रहे हैं? ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Sir, they don't want Members to take up Zero Hour.  
...*(Interruptions)*...



SHRI ANAND SHARMA: It is not true. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: This is all being enacted because they don't want a particular reference being made in Zero Hour by some Members who have given the notice. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I strongly object to this. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are questioning the integrity of my statement. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is most unfair. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ARUN JAITLEY: Therefore, the Chair must protect the rights of other Members. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री उपसभापति :** श्वेत मलिक जी, कृपया आप बोलिए।...*(व्यवधान)*...

#### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

##### Need for a National Policy for old parents neglected by children

**श्री श्वेत मलिक (पंजाब):** सर, मैं एक भावनात्मक विषय के ऊपर सदन का ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूँ और वह विषय यह है कि हमारी संस्कृति में माता-पिता को भगवान का दर्जा दिया गया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*... माता-पिता को भगवान का दर्जा दिया गया है, पर अफसोस है कि आज के समय में माता-पिता को तिरस्करित किया जाता है। उनकी संतान वृद्धावस्था में उनका त्याग कर देती है। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि भगवान राम ने अपने पिता की आज्ञा मानते हुए, 14 साल का बनवास स्वीकार किया था। इस देश में श्रवण कुमार अपने माता-पिता को 40 तीर्थों की यात्रा कराने के लिए ले गया था और इसी दौरान उसने अपने प्राण न्यौछावर कर दिए। परन्तु अफसोस है कि आज माता-पिता का तिरस्कार उनकी संतानों द्वारा किया जा रहा है, माता-पिता का त्याग किया जा रहा है। जो माता-पिता पहले उन्हें उँगली पकड़कर चलना सिखाते हैं, उसके बाद शिक्षा देते हैं, उसके बाद उन्हें आत्म-निर्भर बनाते हैं। ...*(व्यवधान)*... बाद में वही संतान वृद्ध माता-पिता का त्याग कर देती है, तिरस्कार करती है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

**श्री नरेश अग्रवाल (उत्तर प्रदेश):** महोदय, सदन में क्या विषय चल रहा है? What is the issue? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री आनन्द शर्मा (हिमाचल प्रदेश):** महोदय, इस तरह हमारी आवाज को दबाया नहीं जा सकता। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is Zero Hour mention. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री श्वेत मलिक:** जब माता-पिता वृद्ध हो जाते हैं, उनका बुढ़ापा आता है, old-age आती है, तो उनका त्याग कर दिया जाता है। मैं चाहता हूँ कि जब सरकार ने इस संबंध में कानून बनाया है, परन्तु