

The House reassembled after lunch at two of the clock,

MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*

CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Calling Attention to Matter of Urgent Public Importance, Shri V. Muraleedharan.

The misuse of social media platforms to spread rumours and fake news leading to rising incidents of violence and lynching in the country

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN (Maharashtra): Sir, I rise to call the attention of the Minister of Electronics and Information and Technology to the misuse of social media platforms to spread rumours and fake news leading to rising incidents of violence.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Minister of Electronics and Information Technology will now make a statement.

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE; AND THE MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD): Sir, at the very outset, I express my apology to my distinguished friends, that the photocopies are just being readied, but I am reading it slowly and the Hindi version will follow. I seek your indulgence.

Hon. Chairman, Sir, I rise to make a statement on the misuse of social media platforms and propagation of fake news causing unrest and violence. Hon. Members of Parliament Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita, Shri V. Muraleedharan, Shri Mahesh Poddar, Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar, Prof. Manoj Kumar Jha and Ms. Saroj Pandey have given notice for Calling Attention Motion that *inter alia* seeks to draw attention to the problem of "Misuse of Social Media Platforms to spread rumours and fake news leading to rising incidents of violence and lynching in the country".

Regarding nature of cyberspace, the issue raised by my colleagues is extremely relevant. It is important to appreciate the nature of cyberspace and its present status in the country for a comprehensive view in this matter. Cyberspace has distinct and unique characteristics as compared to physical space. It is virtual, borderless and offers anonymity to an extent. As a result, cyber-attacks can be launched from anywhere in the world with limited possibility of trace-back and positive attribution. Once anybody is on internet, he can access any system on internet spread across the globe from anywhere. The cyber space offers virtual environment where anyone can hide his identity on the network and

[Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad]

create a pseudo name or even acquire some other identity. The security of the computer infrastructure acquires greater importance under these conditions.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, with widespread proliferation of new technologies like social media and mobile apps, etc. there are some miscreants who are misusing these technologies for committing cybercrimes. Such behaviour is facilitated by virtual and borderless nature of cyber space, where anyone can open account in any name including fake name from any part of the world. Most social networking sites do not conduct background information check and their servers are located abroad.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, social media platforms have become the most prominent media to facilitate interactions. They have led to growth of digital medium. Popular social media platforms are Facebook, Twitter, Linked In, Instagram, Youtube, WhatsApp etc. Any user can post any content (text, image, video, speech, etc.) from anywhere on social media platform. Typically, users of these platforms are identified by the profiles they create. Users are required to provide certain amount of personal information to facilitate connections. These sites facilitate communication between users by means such as fora, chat rooms, blogs, tweets, email, instant messenger etc. In addition, several customized features and applications are provided on these websites to share information, photos, audio and video files.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, India today is emerging as a big digital power with a proactive people-centric program of creating digital infrastructure focusing on digital delivery of services and thereby digital empowerment leading to digital inclusion where every common man is enjoying benefits of digital governance. With a strong base of 118 crore mobile phones, about 122 crore *Aadhaar* numbers and 32 crore *Jan Dhan* accounts being opened, new milestones in digital delivery of various benefits to the citizens have been created. Riding on this *Jan-dhan, Aadhaar, Mobile (JAM)* Trinity, the implementation of various welfare schemes have been streamlined whereby fictitious duplicate claimants have been identified and weeded out resulting in savings of over ₹ 90, 000 crores as a result of such direct benefit transfer to the citizens. Initiatives like e-hospital, *Jeevan Pramanan*, e-scholarships, e-soil health cards, digital payments, digital locker, cloud services and *Umang* app wherein the citizen can avail the services of over 1,200 schemes of Central or State Governments in the palms of ordinary Indians, empowering the citizens in pursuit of digital inclusion.

India is also a globally recognised IT power where Indian IT companies have displayed their potential on the Global stage and have brought great respect to India. Of

late, India is becoming a big centre of the startup movement. The digital literacy scheme namely PMG DISHA that seeks to empower over 6 crore Indians is showing great results. Today innovation, entrepreneurship and inclination of ordinary Indians to improve the fruits of technology are being appreciated globally. The Government is taking initiatives so that in a few years India could become a 1 trillion dollar digital economy. Of late, India has also become an important country....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Minister.(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I take your point.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Go steadily. You are proceeding with a much more speed than me.

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka): Sir, take it as read.

श्री सभापति: नहीं-नहीं, ऐसा नहीं होता है।

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I will complete in a few minutes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Don't worry. You continue.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Of late, India has also become an important country where social media platforms have spread their wings. The spread of social media has also in its own way contributed to awareness, connectivity, education, community self-help, information and updates, and business promotion. All this could happen because the big digital economy operates beyond geographical borders.

Now, I come to userbase of Social Networking Sites by March, 2018. Facebook has 219 crores user base world-wide and it has 19.4 crores in India, the highest; Twitter has 33 crores user base world-wide and 2.6 crores in India; YouTube has user base of 100 crores world-wide and 4.2 % crores in India, and WhatsApp has 150 crores user base world-wide and 20 crores in India up to February, 2017, the highest, in the world, in India footprint. The Source is © Statista 2018.

Hon. Chairman, Sir, now, I come to the Challenges. While acknowledging the benefits of digital empowerment, it has also brought in challenges and some of its reckless abuse has posed a serious dilemma of striking the balance between freedom of speech and expression, awareness, empowerment and the obligation to be responsible, accountable so that mobile platforms do not become vehicles to commit crime, incite hatred, provoke terrorism, extremism, promote money-laundering, etc. The Government

[Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad]

because of its commitment to respect freedom of speech and expression, freedom of choice and responsibility towards the right to privacy of the citizen is equally cognizant of the mandate of Article 19(2) of the Constitution of India where the freedom of speech and expression is subject to reasonable restrictions relating to sovereignty and integrity of India, the security of the State, friendly relations with foreign States, public order, decency or morality or in relation to contempt of court, defamation or incitement to an offence.

Hon. Chairman, Sir, now, I come to fake news. Fake news is a type of propaganda that consists of deliberate misinformation or hoaxes spread via traditional print and broadcast news media or online social media. It can include text, visual, audio, data report, etc. Fake news is written and published with the intent to mislead in order to damage an agency, entity, or person, and/or gain financially or politically, create disturbance and unrest, often using sensational, dishonest, or outright fabricated headlines to increase readership, online sharing, and Internet click revenue. The typical attributes of fake news are that it spreads fast, is doctored, is incorrect, is *mala fide*, is intentional, is sensational/glamorous, is unverified, and goes viral.

The Government is cognizant that social media platforms are being abused as vehicles for weaponisation of information against India's strategic interest and economic stability and is committed to taking suitable action to deter such action. Sir, now I come to the actions taken on misuse of social media and fake news. Recently, it has come to the attention of the Government of India that a number of disturbing instances causing loss of innocent lives have taken place in various parts of the country. These are deeply painful, regrettable, as well as a matter of deep concern for the Government. The Government has taken prompt action. The first incident was reports of breach of data at Facebook, wherein it was reported that data of a number of their users had been compromised by Cambridge Analytica. Immediately, notices were issued to the two companies and their response sought. Facebook responded that they will streamline their internal processes regarding handling of personal data. They stated that the case of Cambridge Analytica was a case of breach of trust. They promised to take various other steps to ensure that such breaches do not recur. Cambridge Analytica on the other hand gave an initial response that data of Indians was not breached but this was not in conformity with what was reported by Facebook. Cambridge Analytica also did not respond to a subsequent notice. Sir, therefore, it is suspected that Cambridge Analytica may have been involved in illegally

obtaining data of Indians which could be misused. The Government has entrusted this issue to be investigated by the CBI for possible violation of Information Technology Act, 2000 and Indian Penal Code. There were also subsequent reports that data of users was illegally accessed by hardware manufacturers who had tie-ups with Facebook. In regard to this issue, Facebook has reported that they are not aware of any misuse of Facebook information, including Indian users' information.

Mr. Chairman Sir, there have been other series of incidents relating to abuse of social media where mob lynchings were reported in various parts of the country consequent to circulation of wild rumours on WhatsApp as a result of which innocent people have lost their lives. The Government swiftly issued notice to WhatsApp since in most incidents such horrible events were preceded by viral circulation of rumours on this platform. In response, WhatsApp have taken steps to increase the friction in propagation of content on the platform by reducing the number of forwards to five and also indicating whether an incoming message is either forwarded or originally composed by the sender. They have also planned to remove the forward button that appears adjacent to the video or audio message. They have also informed that they will be bringing in fact checking and fake news verification mechanisms to help people check the veracity of content on the platform. While taking note of such response, Mr. Chairman Sir, it was felt that it was not adequate to meet the challenges of the situation. Therefore, WhatsApp has been asked to come out with better technological solutions so that misuse of the platform is avoided. Also, the Government has issued second notice to WhatsApp and it was conveyed to them at the highest level that being a technological major company, it is equally their responsibility to promptly come up with technical solutions when a harmful message is in wide circulation on the same day in a particular area on a particular issue. It is their obligation to inform the law enforcement agencies when they notice such virtual messages.

Sir, now I come to the actions taken by the Ministry of Home Affairs. The Ministry of Home Affairs has issued a number of advisories including one advisory on untoward incidents in the name of protection of cows dated 9th August, 2016, another advisory on cyber crime prevention and control, dated 13th January, 2018 and also an advisory on incidents of lynching by mobs in some States fuelled by rumours of lifting/kidnapping of children, dated 4th July, 2018. Pursuant to the directions of the Supreme Court's order dated 17th July, 2018, MHA has issued a directive to the States for implementation of directions of the apex court on 23rd July, 2018 and has constituted a Group of Ministers and a High level Committee to make recommendations in this matter.

[Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad]

Sir, now I come to the legal provisions very briefly. First is the IT Act, 2000; provisions for blocking and removal of content. (A) Blocking of websites/information. Section 69A of the Information Technology Act, 2000 provides for blocking of websites/webpages in specific conditions of (i) Defence of India (ii) Sovereignty and integrity of India (iii) Security of State (iv) Foreign relations with foreign States (v) Public Order (vi) or for preventing incitement to the commission of any cognizable offense relating to above. (B) Disabling or removal of information by intermediaries. Social media site (Intermediaries) are required to disable or remove any unlawful information as and when brought to their knowledge through a court order or through appropriate Government or its agency. Various law enforcement agencies notify the social media sites for removal of contents/disabling of contents under provisions of Section 79(3)(b) of IT Act, 2000.

The Information Technology (Intermediary Guidelines) Rules, 2011 notified under Section 79 of the IT Act requires that the Intermediaries shall observe due diligence while discharging their duties and shall inform the users of computer resources not to host, display, upload, modify, publish, transmit, update or share any information that is harmful, objectionable, affect minors and unlawful in any way.

Now, Sir, I will share with this House how many blockings we have done under Section 69A of the IT Act, 2000.

For Facebook, we have blocked 457; for YouTube, 95; for Twitter, 321; for Instagram, 41; and others, 51.

(ii) The compliance of the intermediaries in the year 2018 (till June, 2018) is as follows:-

Facebook—499; YouTube—57; Twitter—88; Instagram—25; Tumbir—28.
URL means, Uniform Resource Locator.

The legal provisions that are currently available with regard to the conduct of intermediaries, which includes various social media platforms, in order to respond to such developments are in the IT Act, 2000. Some of such provisions need to be revised and reinforced so that they can respond to the emerging challenges. This is proposed to be done by strengthening the implementation aspects of Section 79 of IT Act, 2000.

Hon. Chairman, Sir, now, I come to new measures which the Government is proposing to take.

It is critical for social media service providers regulated as 'online intermediaries' under Indian law, to ensure that the lawful provision of their services and platforms in

India in order to continue to receive access to Indian users, should ensure and demonstrate their strict compliance with the Information Technology Act as well as all other applicable laws, as well as submit themselves and their services, platforms and other applications to the jurisdiction of Indian courts and authorities by having a physical presence In India.

To continue to target Indian users, such intermediaries must implement appropriate remedial measures and assist in curtailing any use of such services and platforms that perpetuate harm in Indian society, including loss of life or disruption of public order. This, at the very minimum, necessarily requires them to ensure that all such malicious messages circulated through their services or platforms in India can be traced, and their source of origin be effectively identified by law enforcement agencies or relevant public authority.

The Government is, therefore, seriously considering that through appropriate rules, all social media platforms should be required to locate their grievance officer in India who could act as the point of contact for all communication with regard to such grievances. The duty of such grievance officer should cover not only to receive grievances on real time basis, but also to inform law enforcement agencies. It is planned to issue directives in public interest to such intermediaries that would require all such social media platforms to ensure that their platforms do not become vehicles for promoting hatred, terrorism, money laundering, mob violence and rumour mongering. They should provide for technological solutions so that verified fake news and provocative messages can be filtered by technical solutions. They should bring in a more effective mechanism for receiving grievances and they should report to the law enforcement agencies. They should also seek to provide the facility of verifying fake news on the platform itself.

Further, this Government will strengthen the appropriate legal framework to ensure that significant social media and instant messaging service providers targeting Indian users do not deprive Indian users of the right to bring proceedings in India, and of the protections of Indian law.

The Government wishes to make it very clear that social media platforms run by any company or entity is an important stakeholder and therefore it cannot evade its responsibility, accountability and larger commitment to ensure that its platform is not misused on a large scale to spread incorrect facts projected as news and designed to instigate people to commit crime. If they do not take adequate and prompt action, then the law of abetment also applies to them. It is expected that while honouring freedom of speech and expression and right to inform and educate; the mandate of Article 19 (2) of

[Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad]

the Constitution has to be kept in mind and there has to be a healthy balance in overriding public interest.

In addition to taking the above reinforcement of legal provisions to make the platforms more accountable, the Government will also promote initiatives to increase awareness among the citizens to become adept in noticing fake news and to avoid becoming a party to viral circulation of fake news. A campaign to educate school children about the misuse of social media for propagation of false news will be taken up. The Common Service Centres will also be engaged in the task of promoting this message among people especially in rural areas. Various stakeholders such as educational institutions, professional and industrial associations, Chambers of Commerce, etc., would also be involved in this campaign. The State Governments will also be requested to join in this effort to make the citizens more aware to prevent the use and abuse of social media. In this regard, I will be writing to all Chief Ministers.

Conclusion: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the Government is committed to freedom of speech and expression and privacy of its citizens as enshrined in the Constitution of India. Government does not regulate content appearing on social network platform. These social network platforms, though, are required to follow due diligence as provided in Section 79 of the Information Technology Act, 2000 and the Rules notified therein. They have also to follow Article 19(2) of the Constitution and ensure that their platforms are not used to commit and provoke terrorism, extremism, violence and crime.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have deliberately made the statement a little bigger as a comprehensive view can be conveyed by this. I will await the feedback from hon. Members. Sir, let me assure this House that our Government is committed to freedom. But freedom also comes with responsibility. Therefore, the social media platform, being a stakeholder, has also to understand the import, integrity and dignity of the larger message of India's Constitution so as not to promote crime.

Sir, with these words, I conclude awaiting the feedback from hon. Members.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, it is really comprehensive. Shri V. Muraleedharan, you get seven minutes.

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the notice that I had given is regarding misuse of social media in spreading fake news which leads to violence and unrest in various parts of the country. The hon. Minister has made a statement. But I

would like to put forward some of the views that are very important in the present context. Of course, the Government led by Narendra Modiji has given utmost importance to the IT sector. Digital India is one of the prime mottos of the Government of India. E-Governance, through which the citizens get services on demand, and digital empowerment of the citizen are the main mottos of the Government. But, at the same time, I would like to put on record that the social media, on the one hand, as utilised for the betterment of the citizens of the country whether it is the Railway use or for the safety of those who are in a precarious condition in foreign lands. All these are done by the Government. But, on the other hand, there are forces in the country which are bent upon creating unrest and violence in the country. Rumours are being spread; unauthenticated news is being spread. Even such information which are far from truth are being spread. There was an incident, I can quote, of recent days. On 16th April, Kerala witnessed a *hartal* or *bandh*. Perhaps, the misuse of social media, the violence that erupted in the whole of Kerala would be the largest that has been reported in the whole country. On a single day, there were around 400 incidents of violence. Thousands of youths sprang to the streets of Kerala armed with weapons and they were obstructing the peace loving common people of the society. This was not done by any organisation, this was not done on the basis of any verified information, there was no reason for such an incident to happen, and, of course, the Government was caught unaware, and ultimately those who suffered, they were the common people of the society. There are incidents reported from various parts of the country wherein some information, some news, some rumour is spread by some irresponsible people on the one hand, and on the other hand, the sinister designs of some people have led to large scale violence. These incidents, on the one hand, which lead to violence, are there and, on the other hand, there are also instances of social media being utilised or used deliberately to defame the political opponents. Recently the Karnataka elections were held. I would like to quote that the principal opposition party utilised or rather in a way doctored the advertisement given by Bharatiya Janata Party in a very prominent newspaper, *The Hindu*. That advertisement was doctored and used by the head of the IT Wing of the principal opposition party to spread facts which are far away from truth. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): That is not correct. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: I have the material ...*(Interruptions)*... The banner headline in the top corner of *The Hindu* which gave the advertisement of BJP as 'for a corruption-free State', that was the slogan of the BJP, but the principal opposition party

[Shri V. Muraleedharan]

made a poster which said 'for a corruption State'. The word 'free' was omitted or in a way erased. It was tweeted by the IT head of the principal opposition party. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have records of so many leaders, so-called respectable leaders. The Chief Minister of Delhi tweets or re-tweets one or the other fake news and later on he withdraws that. ...*(Interruptions)*... My colleague *

MR. CHAIRMAN: 'Other House', you cannot quote. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot quote the other House, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is a Member of the other House. ...*(Interruptions)*... That should be expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, I have said it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Go ahead. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: The so-called respectable leaders of every political party in the opposition use this opportunity or use such fake news.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your time is coming to an end. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN: They use such fake news to spread rumours. Even there was an incident and I have the pictures wherein a photo of Rawalpindi was used to show that the photo is of Bhopal. A respectable Member of this House, he used this, he did this. So, this is not an issue of political one-upmanship, every political party needs to adhere to the rules of the country. I would request that political parties and respectable leaders cutting-across party lines, will have to show restraint so that people of the country also follow the rules of the country. With these words, I conclude.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री गुलाम नबी आजाद): माननीय चेयरमैन सर, यह एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय है, जो पांच-सात मिनट में या दो मिनट में खत्म नहीं हो सकता है। हमने इसके साथ ही Short Duration Discussion के लिए एक दूसरा नोटिस भी दिया है। उसमें हम बहुत सारी चीजें डिस्कस कर सकते हैं, जैसे security of citizens, छोटी-छोटी बच्चियों के साथ, बहनों के साथ जो बलात्कार हो रहा है, वॉयलेंस हो रही है, जिसकी वजह से डर है, खौफ है। मैं आपसे निवेदन करूँगा कि उसको आप नेक्स्ट वीक में लगाएं, ताकि पूरी तरह से उस पर चर्चा हो सके। आज की चर्चा का विषय सीमित है। माननीय मंत्री जी ने social media and fake news पर बहुत बड़ा वक्तव्य दे दिया है। यह बात ठीक है कि

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

इसमें बहुत अच्छे सुझाव भी हैं, लेकिन भारत जैसे सिविलाइज्ड देश में इसे तरह की घटनाएं हो जाएं, यह बहुत शर्म की बात है। इसमें धर्म या पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है, यह देश का सवाल है। इससे देश के अंदर भी और देश के बाहर भी, हमारा जो चेहरा है, वह काला हो जाता है कि आखिर हम किस तरह के लोग हैं। पिछले साल भी इसी महीने इस विषय पर चर्चा हुई थी और आज पूरे एक साल के बाद, फिर से इसी विषय पर चर्चा हो रही है, लेकिन इस साल मरने वालों की संख्या कम होने की बजाय बढ़ गई है। इस साल 13 राज्यों में, अफवाहों की वजह से या जानबूझ कर, 40 lynchings हो गई हैं। कभी-कभी हम अफवाह का एक बहाना भी बनाते हैं, अफवाह भी खुद बनाते हैं और खुद ही मौके पर पहुंच भी जाते हैं। आप यह समझ लीजिए कि सब कुछ fake news से चल रहा है या आईटी से चल रहा है। हमारे यहां ऐसे लोग भी हैं, जो एक आदमी को भेजते हैं कि तुम अफवाह फैलाओ और हम मारने के लिए वहां पहले ही मौजूद होंगे। यह सब जानकारी हरमें है। चूंकि समय बहुत कम है, इसलिए मैं इस सकरार से यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि fake news वाला आपके हाथ नहीं आ रहा है, social media पर इसका misuse करने वाला आपके हाथ नहीं आ रहा है, लेकिन अभी तक जो आपके हाथ आए हैं, उनको आपने क्या किया? माननीय मंत्री जी ने अभी abetment की बात की, Abetment का कानून है कि अगर किसी का क्रत्त्व किया जाए, तो उसमें मारने वाला, साजिश करने वाला, मौजूद होने वाला और encourage करने वाला, सब बराबर के क्रिमिनल हैं।

महोदय, इस सदन के माध्यम से मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से एक बात पूछना चाहता हूं, यहां मैं नाम नहीं लेना चाहता, क्योंकि शायद उनको शर्म नहीं आती, लेकिन मुझे शर्म आती है कि मेरे ही सदन के या दूसरे किसी सदन के एक बड़े नेता, जिनका हम सब आदर करते हैं, इज्जत करते हैं, वे लिंच करने वाले लोगों या जो लोग साम्रादायिकता फैलाते हैं, उन लोगों के साथ, उनके समारोह में जाते हैं, उनकी सहायता करते हैं, उनका सम्मान करते हैं। यह देखकर मुझे शर्म आ जाती है।

माननीय चेयरमैन साहब, कुछ अरसा पहले साम्रादायिकता हिंसा फैलाने के जुर्म में नवादा जेल, झारखंड में कुछ लोग बंदी थे।

[†] قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد) : مائنسے چینرمن سر، یہ ایک بہت ابم وشنے ہے، جو پانچ سات منٹ میں ختم نہیں بو سکتا ہے۔ یہ نے اس کے ساتھی ہی Short Duration Discussion کے لئے ایک دوسرا نوٹش بھی دیا ہے۔ اس میں یہ بہت ساری چیزیں ڈسکس کر سکتے ہیں، جیسے سیکورٹی آف سٹرینز، جہوٹی جہوٹی بچیوں کے ساتھ، بہنوں کے ساتھ جو بلا تکار ہو رہا ہے، والننس ہو رہا ہے، جس کی وجہ سے ڈر ہے، خوف ہے۔ میں آپ سے نویدن کروں گا کہ اس کو آپ اگلے بفتے میں لگائیں، تاکہ پوری طرح سے اس پر چرچا بو سکے۔ آج کی چرچا کا موضوع محدود ہے۔

[†]Transliteration in Urdu script.

[شیعہ گولام نبی آزاد]

مائٹے منتری جی نے سوشن میڈیا اور فیکسٹیوز پر بہت بڑا وکتوں دے دیا ہے۔ یہ بات تھیک ہے کہ اس میں کچھ بہت اچھے سمجھاو بھی ہیں، لیکن بھارت جیسے سولانزڈ دیش میں اس طرح کی گھشتائیں بو جائیں، یہ بہت شرم کی بات ہے۔ اس میں دھرم یا پارٹی کا سوال نہیں ہے، یہ دیش کا سوال ہے۔ اس سے دیش کے اندر بھی اور دیش کے باہر بھی، بمارا جو چہرہ ہے، وہ کالا بو جاتا ہے۔ کہ آخر ہم کس طرح کے لوگ ہیں۔ پچھلے سال بھی اسی مبنی، اسی موضوع پر چرچا ہو رہی ہوئی تھا اور آج پورے ایک سال کے بعد، پھر سے اسی موضوع پر چرچا ہو رہی ہے، لیکن اس سال مرنے والوں کی تعداد کم ہونے کی بجائے بڑھ گئی ہے۔ اس سال تیرہ راجیوں میں، افواہوں کی وجہ سے یا جان بوجہ کر، چالیس لنچنگ کلنگس ہو گئی ہیں۔ کبھی کبھی ہم افواہ کا ایک بہانہ بھی بناتے ہیں، افواہ بھی خود بناتے ہیں اور خود ہی موقع پر پہنچ بھی جاتے ہیں۔ آپ یہ مت سمجھہ لیجنے کے سب کچھ فیکسٹیوز سے چل رہا ہے یا آئی ٹھی۔ سے چل رہا ہے۔ بمارے یہاں ایسے لوگ بھی ہیں، جو ایک آدمی کو بھیجتے ہیں کہ تم افواہ پھیلانا اور ہم مارنے کے لئے وباں پہلے سے موجود ہوں گے۔ یہ سب جانکاری ہمیں ہے۔ چونکہ وقت بہت کم ہے، اس لئے میں اس سرکار سے یہ پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ فیکسٹیوز والا آپ کے پاتھہ نہیں آ رہا ہے، سوشن میڈیا پر اس کا misuse کرنے والا آپ کے پاتھہ نہیں آ رہا ہے، لیکن ابھی تک جو آپ کے پاتھہ آئے ہیں، ان کا آپ نے کیا کیا؟ مائٹے منتری جی نے ابھی abetment کی بات کی، Abetment کا قانون ہے کہ اگر کسی کا قتل کیا جائے، تو اس میں مارنے والا، سازش کرنے والا، موجود ہونے والا اور encourage کرنے والا، سب برابر کی کریمٹ ہے۔

مہودے، اس سدن کے مادھیم سے میں مائٹے منتری جی سے ایک بات پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں، یہاں میں نام نہیں لینا چاہتا، کیوں کہ شاید ان کو شرم نہیں آئی، لیکن مجھے شرم آتی ہے کہ میرے بی سدن کے یا دوسرا کسی سدن کے ایک بڑے نیتا، جن کا ہم سب آذر کرتے ہیں، عزت کرتے ہیں، وہ لنچنگ کرنے والے لوگوں یا جو لوگ فرقہ پرستی پھیلاتے ہیں، ان لوگوں کے ساتھ، ان کے سمازوں میں جاتے ہیں، ان کی مدد کرتے ہیں، ان کا مقام کرتے ہیں۔ یہ دیکھ کر مجھے شرم آ جاتی ہے۔

مائٹے چینرمن صاحب، کچھ عرصہ پہلے فرقہ پرستی نشدد پھیلانے کے جرم میں نوادا جیل، جہار کھنڈ میں کچھ لوگ بندی تھے۔

एक माननीय सदस्यः नवादा बिहार में है।

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ादः ठीक है। जो रूलिंग पार्टी * के बहुत सारे associated wings हैं।

جناب غلام نبی آزاد : ثہیک ہے۔ جو رولنگ پارٹی ④ کے بہت سارے associated wings بیس۔

श्री सभापति: गुलाम नबी जी, ऐसे तो बाकी लोग भी दूसरी पार्टीज़ का नाम लेंगे।

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ादः वे पार्टी का नाम ले चुके हैं, लेकिन यहां मैं किसी का नाम नहीं ले रहा हूँ।

جناب غلام نبی آزاد : وہ پارٹی کا نام لے چکے ہیں، لیکن یہاں میں کسی کا نام نہیں لے رہا ہوں۔

श्री सभापति: उन्होंने किसी पार्टी का नाम नहीं लिया है, अगर लिया है तो मैं काट दूँगा।

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: He said that 'Principal Opposition Party'.

श्री सभापति: आप भी ऐसे ही बोलिए।

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ादः मैंने किसी का नाम नहीं लिया, लेकिन मेरे पास नाम है। मेरे पास मंत्री का नाम भी है, वीडियो भी है। ... (व्यवधान) ...

جناب غلام نبی آزاد : میں نے کسی کा نام نہیں لیا, لیکن میرے پاس نام ہیں۔ میرے پاس منتری کा नाम भी है, विडियो भी है ... (مددخلت)۔

MR. CHAIRMAN: My only appeal is, if one party takes the name of the other party, they will take another name and then the entire purpose is lost. He did not take the name. If it is there, it will be removed.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, I am taking all the precautions. I have the name of the Ministers. I have the name of the organisation that has been telecast widely across the country and printed across the country, but yet I am not taking the name. लेकिन वे लोग, जो जेल में थे, वे साम्प्रदायिकता फेलाने के जुर्म में वहां थे, ऐसा नहीं कि वे बॉर्डर पर लड़ कर आए थे। एक माननीय मंत्री उनसे मिलने जेल में जाते हैं कि बहुत अच्छा काम किया!

सर, दूसरे Union Minister, जिनका मैं बहुत आदर करता हूँ, वे विदेश में पढ़े हुए हैं। मैं नहीं समझता कि विदेश में किसी यूनिवर्सिटी में लिंचिंग की ट्रेनिंग दी जाती है। झारखंड के अन्दर, मैं स्टेट का नाम बता रहा हूँ, झारखंड में लिंचिंग के लिए जो 8 आदमी पकड़े गए हैं, वे जेल में हैं, कई महीनों से जेल में हैं। जब उनको बेल मिल जाती है, तो वे सीधे केन्द्रीय मंत्री के घर पर जाते हैं और माननीय केन्द्रीय मंत्री उन पर फूल डाल कर उनको मिठाई खिलाते हैं।

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

†Transliteration in Urdu script.

[Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad]

[†]جناب غلام نبی آزاد: لیکن وہ لوگ، جو جیل میں تھے، وہ سامنہ دائیکٹا پیبلانس کے جرم میں وباں تھے، ایسا نہیں کہ وہ بارڈر پر لڑکر آئے تھے۔ ایک مانیس منتری ان سے ملنے جیل میں جاتے ہیں کہ بہت اچھا کام کیا۔ سر، دوسرے یونین منسٹر، جن کا میں بہت اور کرتا ہوں، وہ ودیش میں پڑھے ہوئے ہیں۔ میں نہیں سمجھتا کہ ودیش میں کسی یونیورسٹی میں لنجنگ کی ٹریننگ دی جاتی ہے۔ جہار کہنڈ کے اندر، میں استیث کا نام بتارہا ہوں، جہار کہنڈ میں لنجنگ کے لئے جو آئھہ ادمی پکڑے گئے ہیں، وہ جیل میں ہیں، کئی مہینوں سے جیل میں ہیں۔ جب ان کو بیل ملتی ہے، تو وہ سیدھے کیندریہ منتری کے گھر پر جاتے ہیں اور مانیس کیندریہ منتری ان پر پھول ڈال کر ان کو مٹھانی کھلاتے ہیں۔

شروع سبھاپतی: *ٹائم کا�یان رخیए।*

شروع گولام نبی آزاد: سر، اس سامنے بیج میں ٹسٹریپسنس ہو گئی تھی۔ ... (مدالٹ) —[†]جناب غلام نبی آزاد: سر، اس سامنے بیج میں ٹسٹریپسنس ہو گئی تھی۔ ... (مدالٹ) —

شروع سبھاپتی: *ہم دونوں کے بولتے سامنے disturbance ہوئی تھی۔ ... (کیا) ...*

شروع گولام نبی آزاد: سر، اسی تاریخ، جب 2015 میں پہلی لنجنگ اخلاق کی بونی تھی، تب اس سامنے * کے ایم اول اے کہتے تھے کہ میں تمہیں بیل دلاونگا۔ کٹھو ع گینگ ریپ کے وقت تو آپ کو معلوم ہی ہے کہ اس وقت کی روونگ پارٹی کے پورے منتری سڑکوں پر اترے تھے۔ اسی طرح سے ابھی جہار کہنڈ میں ایک اور لنجنگ بونی، تو مانیس ممبر آف پارلیمنٹ ان کو کہتے ہیں کہ اس کا جو وکیل کا خرچ ہے، وہ سب میں ہوں گا۔

شروع سبھاپتی: *جسیکہ ایم اول اے کہتے تھے کہ میں تمہیں بیل دلاونگا۔ کٹھو ع گینگ ریپ کے وقت تو آپ کو معلوم ہی ہے کہ اس وقت کی روونگ پارٹی کے پورے منتری سڑکوں پر اترے تھے۔ اسی طرح سے ابھی جہار کہنڈ میں ایک اور لنجنگ بونی، تو مانیس ممبر آف پارلیمنٹ ان کو کہتے ہیں کہ اس کا جو وکیل کا خرچ ہے، وہ سب میں ہوں گا۔*

شروع سبھاپتی: *گولام نبی جی، پلیزا!*

شروع گولام نبی آزاد: ماننی� مंत्रی جی، جब آप اپنے مینیسٹری پر اور اپنے امپیڈ پر ایکشناں نہیں لے سکتے ہیں، تو آپ کہاں چان مارے گے؟ یہ سب تو فیجوں کی بات ہے۔ کیا آپ اسے

[†]Transliteration in Urdu script.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

مینیسٹر س، ام پی ج اور ام اے ل اے ج پر اے کشان لے گے؟ عنا کو دھونپ کیجیے، عنا کے اوپر کا نوئی کارروائی کیجیے، چار دن میں یہ لینچنگ بند ہو جائے گی، بہت بہت دھنیوالا!

جناب غلام نبی آزاد: مانیسٹر منتری جی جب آپ اپنے منسٹر س پر اور اپنے ایم پیز پر ایکشن نہیں لے سکتے ہیں، تو کہاں چہاں ماریں گے آپ؟ یہ سب تو فضول کی باتیں ہیں۔ کیا آپ ان منسٹر س، ایم پیز اور ایم اے ل اے پر ایکشن لیں گے؟ ان کو تراپ کیجیے، ان کے اوپر قانونی کارروائی کیجیے، چار دن میں یہ لینچنگ بند بو جائے گی۔ بہت بہت دھنیوالا۔

شی سभاپतی: پرو. مانوج کुमار ج्ञा। آپکے پاس پانچ مینٹ ہیں।

پرو. مانوج کुमار ج्ञा (बिहार): سभاپति مہودی، مुझے بولنے کا اवসار دے دے کے لیے شुکریا। ...**(વ्यवधान)**... Sir, at the outset, hon. Minister, this intent, the purpose is very good, provided we also touch base with some of the crude realities which actually doesn't figure out. I shall come out with important suggestions in the process.

سر، میں بگیر کیسی شیکوا-شیکایت کے کوچ بارت کھونگا، کیونکہ اس ویسی کو میں نے پہلے بھی سار کے سنجھاں میں لانا کی کوشش کی تھی۔ میں اس سادن کا اک نیا سادسی ہوں، مुझے پتا نہیں ہے کہ اس سادن نے پانچ ور्ष پورے کیتنی بار لینچنگ پر چرچا کی تھی۔ مुझے نہیں پتا کہ اس سے پہلے لینچنگ، ماؤب لینچنگ ہماری vocabulary کے روکارے کی ...**(व्यवधान)**...

संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय के राज्य मंत्री तथा सांख्यिकी और कार्यक्रम कार्यान्वयन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री विजय गोयल): यह چर्चा सोशल میڈیا پर है या لینचنگ पर है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री देरेक ओब्राइन (पश्चिमी बंगाल): सर, ...**(व्यवधान)**... لینچنग پर भी होगी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सोशल میڈیا پर भी ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री सभापति: प्लीज, اسکو بولنے دیجیए। ...**(व्यवधान)**... آप اپنا ویسی رکھی�।

प्रो. मनोज कुमार ज्ञा: مہودی، میں اپنا ویسی رکھونگا। ترکوणमیتی میں LHS=RHS ہوتا ہے। Left Hand Side is equal to Right Hand Side. اوپر سے چلی� یا نیچے سے چلیए، میں وہاں پر آ رہا ہوں।

سر، میں آپکے مادھیم سے بس اک آگرہ کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ سوशال میڈیا کا use, mob lynching, violence, یہ ہماری روکارے کی جنبدگی کا ہیسسا ہو رہا ہے۔ کہہ لے گوں کو یہ سوگا لتا ہے کہ آج بھی ڈھنکے نیونٹری میں ہے، لے کین بھی ڈھنکیسی کے نیونٹری میں نہیں ہوتی ہے، بھی ڈھنکیسی نیونٹری میں لے لے لے گی۔ جینکو آج یہ سماں میں آ رہا ہے کہ بھی ڈھنکے پر عنا کی پوری پکڑ ہے، میں یکین دیلاتا ہوں کہ Le Bon کے تائیم سے Zimbardo تک، تکنیک چاہے جو بھی رہی ہو، بھی ڈھنکیسی نے سبھتاؤں کو لیل لیا ہے، تو یہ کیا ہے؟ سب آئے گے اور ختم ہو جائے گے۔ سادن کے مادھیم سے مera سیر اک آگرہ ہے کہ پریٹیڈیت پدؤں پر بیٹھے ہوئے یہ کیا ہے؟ اگر اپنے پد کی گامبیرتائی نہیں سماں رہے ہے — آپ مانک دے دے کو دے دے ہے، ہمارا آپکا راجنیتیک ویرोධ ہو سکتا

[†]Transliteration in Urdu script.

[प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा]

है, लेकिन हम एक-दूसरे के राजनीतिक दुश्मन नहीं हैं। सर, यह दुश्मनी की ज़ुबान सोशल मीडिया में प्रमोट होती है। मैं माफी के साथ कहना चाहता हूं कि प्रतिष्ठित पदों पर बैठे हुए लोग उसकी तसदीक करते हैं। प्रतिष्ठित पदों पर बैठे लोग उसकी तसदीक करते हैं, उसे forward करते हैं, उस पर tweet करते हैं। अगर भाषाई हिंसा पर लगाम नहीं लगाई गई, तो जो भौतिक हिंसा होती है, जो physical violence होता है, वह भाषाई हिंसा की परिणति होती है। आप हमारी शब्दावली पर गौर करिए। मैं 4 वर्ष पूर्व 45-46 साल का था, लेकिन इतनी हिंसा हमारे समाज में नहीं थी। इतनी सख्त ज़ुबान से हम एक-दूसरे से बात नहीं करते थे। माननीय मंत्री महोदय कह रहे थे कि social media पर कोई tweet आता है - गलत है। फिर कोई मैसेज forward होकर आता है, वह television channels पर भी चलता है। जब वह television channels पर चलता है तो शहर के शहर जल उठते हैं, गली कूचों में दीवार खड़ी हो जाती है। जब भी चुनाव आएंगे, राजनीतिक अपनी जगह है, लेकिन अगर हमने इसका कोई साझा हल नहीं निकाला, तो मैं बता रहा हूं कि वह दिन दूर नहीं, पड़ोस में हमने देखा था, हमारे ही पड़ोस का मामला है, आज वह हमारी vocabulary में आ गया है। जब आप तालिबान बोलते हैं तो उसके भाव अलग हो जाते हैं। हमारा मुल्क कभी वैसा नहीं होना चाहिए, चाहे उधर आप बैठे या हम बैठें। इसलिए हम सबको एक साझा संकल्प लेना होगा।

मुझे यहां एक और चीज़ कहनी है, ज्यादा वक्त न लेते हुए, मैं कह देना चाहता हूं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मुझे पता है कि अभी वक्त है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हम सब एक बार अपनी दिनचर्या को देखें। यह trolling शब्द चार वर्ष पूर्व तक मुझे तो कम से कम पता नहीं था। अचानक trolling कहाँ से आ गया? अब तो मंत्री तक troll हो जाते हैं। यह कौन-सा दौर आ गया है? आपने सच कह दिया तो आप troll हो गए, कोई ज़ुबान बोल दी तो troll हो गए। यह उचित नहीं है। माननीय मंत्री महोदय, इसमें हम सबका सहयोग रहेगा। हमें यह तय करना होगा कि हिंसा की ज़ुबान, बात-बात पर कौमों के बीच में जो दीवार खड़ी हो जाती है; वह न हो। लोग गाय की बात करते हैं लेकिन आज गाय मसला नहीं है। मैं सदन से कहूँगा कि सबसे बड़े गौ-रक्षक महात्मा गांधी थे, जिनकी 1954 में एक किताब publish हुई थी - "How to serve the cow." ...**(व्यवधान)**... जिसमें उन्होंने गाय को लेकर अपने विचार रखे थे। आपको वह किताब पूरे सदन में तमाम लोगों को बंटवानी चाहिए। उससे पता चलेगा कि हिन्दू धर्म और गौ-रक्षा का क्या ताल्लुक है। उसमें वह कहते हैं कि अगर गाय की रक्षा इस तरीके से करोगे तो वह हमारे धर्म को शैतान में तब्दील कर देगी। आज हमने बापू को कहां भुला दिया? ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, मुझे सिर्फ़ एक मिनट और दे दीजिए।

श्री सभापति: मेरे हाथ में कुछ नहीं है। अब आप conclude कीजिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

प्रो. मनोज कुमार झा: मैं आखिरी बात कहकर conclude कर रहा हूं। एक अहम गोंडवी साहब गोंडा के थे। उन्होंने कहा था-

'हिन्दु या मुसलमान के अहसासात को मत छेड़िए,
कुर्सी के लिए इस जजबात को मत छेड़िए,
हममें कोई हूण, कोई शक कोई मंगोल है,
दफन है जो बात, उस बात को मत छेड़िए।'

शुक्रिया सर।

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have a list of 13 Members to speak and then we have reply by the Minister and all this has to be completed in one hour.

SHRI D. RAJA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, at the outset, I take this opportunity to appreciate the hon. Minister for making such a comprehensive statement. But, it also lacks in certain respects. Sir, social media has become a great forum. It has brought people close. But, at the same time, it is being used to create strains among human and social relations. In a country like ours, we are witnessing a situation which is unprecedented. Sir, social tensions and social conflicts have increased by many fold and hatred and intolerance has become the order of the day. Social media contributes to this. In fact, social media can play a positive role in building public opinion, in questioning the Government, in criticising the Government, in exposing the failures of the Government and, at the same time, mobilizing people for common good of the society and nation. Here, Sir, I would like to give one small example and after that I shall conclude. I live in Vitthalbhai Patel House. There is one Mavalanker Hall. One national political party organized a national meet of social activists. They called it 'Social Media Warriors Meet'. It forced me to think as to what they meant by 'Social Media Warriors'. Who are these warriors? Against whom are they fighting? That is where the problem lies. There are extremist organizations, the Right Wing Extremist Organization for that matter. They spread falsehood. They indulge in character assassination. They spread. ...*(Interruptions)*... They intimidate political opponents by spreading falsehood and hatred. This is what the Government should touch upon. The parties, in power, should be very responsible and sensitive to such issues. I am telling you, Sir, that the hon. Minister is a sensitive person. You know, whom I mean. All this is happening. I don't want to get personal. But, I am also one of the victims. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI D. RAJA: I am also one of the victims of fake news, falsehood, and character assassination. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is precisely run by ...*(Interruptions)*... This is where the Minister will have to address this question.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, since this is a Calling Attention Motion, I have four specific questions to the Minister. And, I hope, he will answer those. But, before that, I Have got three sentences.

It is the party which came to power in 2014 which created the culture of digital mobs. We have to understand this. It is the party which came to power in 2014 which used

[Shri Derek O'Brien]

the social media to condition minds. It is the party which came to power in 2014 which has made fake news their master hobby. We have to understand this.

I have four specific questions. I hope, these will be answered at the end of this debate. One, what the Minister did not tell you, in his so-called comprehensive review, which the largest Facebook account is that was brought down by Facebook. That was called 'Postcard News'. The Postcard News was brought down. Look at the contents of the Postcard News. It is one hundred per cent Right Wing * contents. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; no. * will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Has * become an unparliamentary expression, Sir? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: If you name parties and organizations here, then, they will say something else. ...*(Interruptions)*... B.K. Hariprasadji, please do not spread rumours here in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing shall go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing shall go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing shall go on record.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I did not mean to hurt anyone. In my book, it means 'Rumour Spreading Society'. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He may be having his own book, why are you worried? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, my first question is if the Postcard News was brought down, we know the contents, why are the MLAs, MPs and Ministers of the BJP are demanding to Facebook that it should be brought back? Why?

My second question is, if we know India's most bilious and hatred-spreading twitter handle '@Ippatel' — India's most bilious and hatred-spreading monger — why was he called to the BJP President's social media network ...*(Interruptions)*... last week? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shall we really discuss all these things in the Parliament? ...*(Interruptions)*... Which party is meeting whom, shall we discuss all these things? ...*(Interruptions)*... You have to conclude, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I want to make just two more points. A lot of India lives in villages, a lot of India lives in cities and towns. But, I live a lot on internet. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just two more points, Sir.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Mr. Minister, if you think that WhatsApp groups are creating all these problems — yes, you are right they are creating all these problems — please get WhatsApp to disclose to you, at least, one thousand such groups, and that will be very useful to you to find out who they are. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, my fourth point is on Facebook. Facebook's largest advertiser in India today, with 19 sponsored ads for the last six months, is 'Nation with NaMo'. My question is: Who is paying for this?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Javed Ali Khan.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, let me finish.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Javed Ali Khan.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: No, Sir. Let me conclude.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have no speciality. All are equal.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I have asked four questions. Let me finish.

MR. CHAIRMAN: That has nothing to do with this.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I have asked relevant questions. I have asked four questions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have the capacity to conclude in two minutes, but you went beyond that.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, I am concluding with only one sentence. Please allow me.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, if I am not making a relevant point, I can sit down immediately. I have asked four questions. I want those answers, because I believe, the Trinamool Congress believes that 'digital India' is really 'divisive India'. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Shri Javed Ali Khan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please don't make allegations against each other; the debate will get diluted and diverted.

श्री जावेद अली खान (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय सभापति जी, मैं पिछले तीन वर्षों में पहली बार यह देख रहा हूं कि मंत्री जी का वक्तव्य सिर्फ अंग्रेजी में दिया गया है, जिसे मैं पूरी तरह से नहीं समझ

[श्री जावेद अली खान]

पाया। मुझे लगता है कि आपका यह स्टेटमेंट बौद्धिक विमर्श के लिए बहुत बेहतर हो सकता है, लेकिन आपका आखिरी पैराग्राफ, जो conclusion के नाम से लिखा हुआ है, उसे मैं ठीक तरह से समझ पाया हूँ। वह यह है कि "The Government does not regulate content appealing on social network platform." यानी आपने अपना पल्ला झाड़ लिया। आप इसे रेगुलेट नहीं करते, इसलिए शायद आप इसे कंट्रोल भी नहीं कर सकते। इस Calling Attention की विषय-वस्तु में violence और lynching का भी जिक्र है। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि बेहतर यह होता कि इस विषय-वस्तु का Calling Attention या ध्यानार्करण प्रस्ताव हमारे बीच में गृह मंत्रालय के साथ क्लब होकर आता।

सभापति महोदय, जहां तक सोशल मीडिया के misuse का सवाल है, यह आज निश्चित रूप से चिंता का विषय है। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूं कि सोशल मीडिया में अफवाहें फैलाई जाती हैं, झूठे समाचार चलते हैं, झूठी खबरें चलती हैं। इसमें कोई दो राय नहीं है, लेकिन वह खबरें कहां तक हमारे रोजमर्रा के जीवन को प्रभावित करती हैं, हमारे राजनीतिक जीवन को प्रभावित करती हैं, हमारे समाज के सांप्रदायिक सौहार्द को प्रभावित करती हैं, मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि जब इसका विपरीत प्रभाव पड़ता है, तब वह चिंता का विषय बन जाता है। उसमें भी सबसे ज्यादा खतरनाक बात यह है कि सगठित रूप से राजनीतिक दल या राजनीतिक विचारधारा से प्रेरित संगठन अफवाहें फैलाने का काम करते हैं, और सामाजिक सौहार्द को बिगाड़ने का काम करते हैं, तब यह अत्यधिक चिंता का विषय बन जाता है। मेरी यादाश्त में..

جناب جاوید علی خان (ائزپرنس) : ملینے سہلپتی جی، میں پچھلے تین سالوں میں پہلی باری بے دیکھ رہا ہوں کہ منتری جی کا وکٹوبہ صرف انگریزی میں دیا گیا ہے، جسے میں پوری طرح سے نہیں سمجھ پایا مجھے لگتا ہے کہ اپ کا یہ امیڈیونٹ یونک شرما کے لئے بہتر ہو سکتا ہے، لیکن اپ کا آخری پرائگراف، جو کنکلوژن کے نام سے لکھا ہوا ہے، اسے میں ٹھیک طرح سے سمجھ پایا ہوں۔ وہ بے کہ "The Government does not regulate content appearing on social network platform." یعنی اپ نے اپنا ٹھیک اسے ریگولیٹ نہیں کرتے، اس لئے شاید اپ اسے کنٹرول بھی نہیں کر سکتے۔ اس کالنگ اپیشن کی وشنے وسو میں واپیلیں اور لنجنگ کا بھی ذکر ہے۔ میں کہنا جاتا ہوں کہ بہتر بہوتا کہ اس وشنے وسو کا کالنگ اپیشن یا دھیانکرشن پرستاز بمارے بیج میں گردہ منتقلی کے ساتھ کلب بکر آتا۔

سبھائی مہودے، جہل نک سوٹل میڈیا کے مس بوز کا سوال ہے، یہ اچ بشjet روب سے چنا کا وشنے ہے۔ میں اپ کو بتانا چلتا ہوں کہ سوٹل میڈیا میں افواہیں پھیلانی جاتی ہیں، جھوٹے سماچار چلتے ہیں، جھوٹی خبریں چلتی ہیں۔ اس میں کوئی دو رائے نہیں ہے، لیکن وہ خبریں کہاں نک بمارے روز مرزہ کے جیون کو متاثر کرتی ہیں، بمارے راجنیتک جیون کو متاثر کرتی ہیں، بمارے سماج کے سلیبریڈائلک سوبارڈ کو متاثر کرتی ہیں، میں کہنا چلتا ہوں اس میں بھی سب سے زیادہ خطرناک بٹ ہے کہ سنگھٹ روب سے سیاسی دل یا سیاسی وچار دھارا سے متاثر سنگھٹ افواہیں پھیلانے کا کام کرتے ہیں اور سماچار سوبارڈ کو پگلائے کا کام کرتے ہیں، تب یہ مزید فکر کا وشنے بن جاتا ہے۔ میری پانڈاشت میں۔

[†]Transliteration in Urdu script.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. conclude.

شی جاودہ اپنی خان: سभا پتی مہودے، پہلے اس میں تین منٹ ملا کرنے تھے، اب نہیں تو منٹ کر دئے۔

[†]جناب جاوید علی خان: سہا پتی مہودے، پہلے اس میں تین منٹ ملا کرنے تھے، اب نہیں تو منٹ کر دئے۔
Zero Hour میں بھی تین منٹ وقت ملائیا، اب نہیں اس میں بھی تو منٹ کر دئے۔

شی سभاپतی: اس میں کوچ نہیں کر سکتا ہے۔ سماج-سیما اک ڈنٹا ہی ہے، آپ دیکھی� کہ already 55 مینٹس ہو گئے ہیں۔ ...**(વ्यवधान)**... پلیٹز اب آپ سماپ्त کریں۔ ...**(व्यवधान)**... اب آپ سماپ्त کریں۔ اسے چار لوگوں کے بولنے سے کوچ نہیں ہو گا۔ ...**(व्यवधान)**... میں پیछلے 20 سال سے یہاں پر ہوں، کہا ہو گا یہ مुझے بھی مالوں ہے۔ ...**(व्यवधान)**...

شی جاودہ اپنی خان: سر، میں یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ ...**(مدخلت)**... میری یادداشت بار افواہوں فللانے کا کام ورس 2013 میں ہو گیا۔ جب اسے پر دیش کی مغربی حصے میں دنگے ہوئے تھے۔ وہاں پر پہلی بار سو شل میڈیا کے ذریعے افواہوں پھیلا کر مغربی اتر پر دیش کو دنگوں کی آگ میں جھونکا گیا۔ ...**(مدخلت)**... پھر ان دنگانیوں کو بہت بڑے منج پر کھڑا کر کے سماں کیا گیا۔ ...**(مدخلت)**...

[†]جناب جاوید علی خان: سر، میں یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ ...**(مدخلت)**... میری یادداشت میں پہلی بار افواہوں پھیلانے کا کام سال 2013 میں ہوا تھا، جب اسے پر دیش کی مغربی حصے میں دنگے ہوئے تھے۔ وہاں پر پہلی بار سو شل میڈیا کے ذریعے افواہوں پھیلا کر مغربی اتر پر دیش کو دنگوں کی آگ میں جھونکا گیا۔ ...**(مدخلت)**... پھر ان دنگانیوں کو بہت بڑے منج پر کھڑا کر کے سماں کیا گیا۔ ...**(مدخلت)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Shri Vijaysai Reddy. ...**(व्यवधान)**... آپ جو بھی بول رہے ہیں، یہ ریکارڈ میں نہیں جائے گا۔ ...**(व्यवधान)**... یہ ریکارڈ میں نہیں جائے گا۔

شی جاودہ اپنی خان: *

* [†]جناب جاوید علی خان :

شی سभاپतی: شی جاودہ اپنی خان، آپ سنجن آدمی ہیں۔ پلیٹز بیٹھیں।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vijaysai Reddy.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, the social media is a phenomenon world-wide and it has come to stay in India. ...**(Interruptions)**...

سنسدیی کار्य مंत्रालय میں راج्य मंत्रی (شی विजय गोयल): * ...**(व्यवधान)**...

شی سभاپतی: رہنگی جی، آپ بولیں، آپ بولیں।

[†]Transliteration in Urdu script.

*Not recorded.

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: *

श्री सभापति: प्लीज, आप बैठ जाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... बैठ जाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Time is running out. ...*(व्यवधान)*... Time is running out. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: *

श्री सभापति: आनन्द शर्मा जी, आप बैठिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... यह रिकॉर्ड में नहीं जा रहा है, unnecessary आप ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: *

श्री सभापति: जिनका नाम मैं नहीं लेता हूँ, वह रिकॉर्ड में नहीं जाता। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: *

श्री सभापति: श्री वि. विजयसाई रेड्डी। ...*(व्यवधान)*... उन्होंने जो कहा, रिकॉर्ड पर वह नहीं जाएगा, यह भी नहीं आएगा। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Vijayasai Reddy. ...*(Interruptions)*... If you people don't want the discussion, thank you. आप लोगों को बहस नहीं चाहिए, तो धन्यवाद। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Sir, social media is a phenomenon world-wide and it has come to stay in India and it enables the people to be connected on real-time basis and the information is flown as it happens and keeping them connected and engaged like people never-before.

Sir, there are several issues in social media, be it WhatsApp, be it Instagram or Facebook or Twitter, whatever it is. The first danger is the danger of mass hysteria and our communal reactions. The second is, the Government has to draw a line between the freedom of speech and the content what comprises of derogatory and seditious. In fact, the real news or information is increasingly getting buried in the avalanche of false information.

Sir, studies show that there are about 3.55 million users. It means approximately 35 crores of people in India are using this Internet, roughly about 27 per cent of the Indian population. So, it is very difficult to do away with the social media.

Therefore, firstly, I suggest the Government of India and the hon. Minister in this regard that there has to be a continuous, constant vigilance and monitoring without affecting the right of speech and without getting any allegation that we are encroaching upon the individual freedom because they can't tap the telephones or they can't intervene.

*Not recorded.

3.00 p.m.

The second point is, it is imperative for the Government of India to get together all stakeholders, the civil society and try to address this issue.

The third suggestion that I would like to make in this regard is ...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI V. VIJAYASAI REDDY: Yes, Sir.

Sir, all these applications and service providers depend upon the advertisements. That is the only revenue that they have got. So, if the Government of India can work out and wherever the applicant-owner or promoter crosses the line, they can think of imposing some curbs on Indian companies giving advertisement lease to these applications. Thanking you very much.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA (Nominated): Sir, I am very glad that the Minister started his address by referring to the IT industry. It is important to note that the IT industry grew in India not because of the Government but despite the Government. And it is also important to note that social media has arisen not because of any Government, not because of any political parties but by itself. The reasons why it has grown is because people use technology to form communities. Ninety-five per cent of social media is used for most innocuous things like using for family exchanges, for family photographs, sharing dog photographs, exchanging news about stamp collections and things like that.

The reason why it is now on the verge of eclipsing the mainstream media is partly because the mainstream media had developed a certain arrogance which made sure that certain perspectives were kept out, and those perspectives are now sought to be filled in by social media. It is very, very important to realise that it has democratized the voice of the people. It has enabled alternative voices to creep in and that is because these voices were not being heard earlier. It is interesting to note also, Sir, that the term 'fake news' came into vogue only during the American Presidential Elections, when the social media was used because most of the mainstream media did not endorse one particular candidate, who ended up winning. So, here again, Sir, it is important and we must keep in mind that any attempt to regulate social media amounts to actually curtailing a facet of democracy. Now, because these are new voices, because these are alternative voices, there is a degree of insolence and sometimes there is also an absence of vocabulary, which has resulted in some of the articulation being certainly crude, etc. We must keep that in mind.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Therefore, while we are talking about threats to law and order, I think enough propagations exist, as they have said, which would enable us to do this, but we cannot take into account certain things because any attempt to monitor social media becomes an infringement on civil liberties. At the same time, we want a complete crackdown on that. Both of these cannot happen together. There are enough laws. Let the Minister and the Ministry of Home Affairs use these intelligently.

SHRI K.K. RAGESH (Kerala): Hon. Chairman, Sir, at the outset, I would like to say that it is not social media that is responsible for the incidents of mass lynching taking place in our country, but it is the politics of hate that has resulted in the increasing incidents of mass lynching in our country. That is the issue to be addressed. It is a fact that the social media is being misused mainly by communal outfits. If you look at the fake IDs created by certain sections, mainly communal propaganda is being unleashed by these IDs. It could be in favour of the majority community, the saffron brigade or in favour of minority fundamentalists. So, social media is mainly being used and misused by these forces. I think this is a very serious issue that needs to be addressed.

Sir, the hon. Member here was referring to a certain hartal that happened in Kerala. The Member must also be aware of the fact that recently the *Facebook* has removed a fake ID of the saffron brigade, which is called *post-cargills*. Please let us know who created that ID. That ID was propagating a malicious campaign which, in fact, intended to affect the secular fabric of the State of Kerala and divide the people on communal lines. Again, who had initiated that call for a *hartal*? The call for *hartal* was initiated by the Right Wing forces through their IDs and it was carried forward by the minority communal forces in the State of Kerala.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ragesh, please conclude.

SHRI K.K. RAGESH: Sir, they had initiated it and their counterpart had taken that forward. That has happened. Another thing is that cyber crimes are increasing day-by-day in our country. It needs to be addressed separately. I would demand from the hon. Minister to set up special courts manned with trained Judges — that is very important — to deal with cyber crimes because that is a separate issue that needs to be dealt with separately. Of course, social media plays a very important role in ensuring democracy of our country. Freedom of speech and expression is extremely important. So, we have to

hail the importance of social media. At the same time, we should come up with certain stringent provisions in IT Act for preventing the misuse of social media by the communal forces. Thank you.

श्री राम चन्द्र प्रसाद सिंह (बिहार): सभापति महोदय, सबसे पहले नेता विपक्ष ने बिहार के नवादा के बारे में चर्चा की। चूंकि मैं बिहार को रिप्रेजेंट करता हूं, इसलिए मैं उस पर बोलना चाहूंगा। इन्होंने बताया कि एक मंत्री जेल में मिलने गए। इनको पता होना चाहिए कि वे जेल में मिलने तो गए, मैं इनका बहुत सम्मान करता हूं, लेकिन जिन लोगों पर कार्रवाई की गई, क्या उनके साथ किसी प्रकार की नरमी बरती गई है? मैं स्पष्ट कर देना चाहता हूं कि बिहार में कहीं भी जाति के नाम पर, धर्म के नाम पर अगर लोग सांप्रदायिक तनाव पैदा करते हैं, तो सरकार उनके साथ सख्ती से पेश आती है। अभी लिंचिंग के बारे में चर्चा हो रही थी। यह सही बात है कि हम सब लोग उसकी भर्त्ता करते हैं। लेकिन मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि हमारा प्रदेश बिहार ही है जिसमें भागलपुर ब्लाइंडिंग केस भी हुआ था। वह किसके समय में हुआ था? हम सब लोगों को इन चीजों में नहीं जाना चाहिए, लेकिन हमारे मंत्री महोदय ने जिस प्रकार से इस चीज को कवर करने के लिए बात रखी है, हम लोग उसका समर्थन करते हैं और खासकर के जहां-जहां से इस तरह की फेक न्यूज आती है, उसके लिए ग्रीवांस ऑफिसर्स की पोस्टिंग के बारे में जो बात की है, उसका स्वागत किया जाना चाहिए। हमारा जो सोशल मीडिया है, इसकी जो अच्छाई है उसका फायदा लेना चाहिए और यदि बुराई है तो सब लोगों को उससे बचना चाहिए, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद।

SHRI K.T.S. TULSI (Nominated): Thank you, Sir, for giving me an opportunity of placing my views. Sir, I believe that social media, in fact, is most valuable piece of evidence by which the perpetrators can be brought to book. It is the greatest friend of the Police, the prosecutor and the Court; it is irrefutable evidence. I don't understand when it is used in 90 per cent cases for solving the crime and used as most valuable evidence, why the Police are not using this in these cases. I believe that fake news and social media are poor-*alibi*. This only exposes that the police are hand in glove with the perpetrators of crime-instead of doing their duty. I don't know whether there is a direction not to take action, or there is a design or there is an assurance also to perpetrators that no action will be taken against them. All this shows that when such valuable evidence is not being used, there is something fishy. I also want to submit that I don't know how many people have been arrested when they can be identified on the videos that are available. How many people have been prosecuted on the basis of contemporaneous audio-visual record? Also, I want to submit, Sir, that this is a special kind of violence, not just like any violence. What is this special violence? There is no personal motive in these crimes; there is no personal enmity in these crimes. Therefore, all that we can assume is that it is done to strike terror in the minds of the society, and if it is to strike terror, it is not only terrorism, it is terrorism with a difference. Terrorism only uses secretive methods for killing but, here,

[Shri K.T.S. Tulsi]

it is being done in front of everybody in broad daylight and yet no action is being taken.
...(Interruptions)... I believe, Sir, that it is one hundred times more brutal and dangerous than terrorism. Thank you.

DR. NARENDRA JADHAV (Nominated): For the first time in the history of our country, we are experiencing an age of information overload which has given rise to the phenomenon of fake news. To an extent, the increased use of social media has led to what sociologists and psychologists refer to as an 'Echo Chamber'. Sir, an Echo Chamber is a metaphorical description of a situation in which beliefs are amplified or reinforced by communication and repetition inside a closed system. By visiting an echo chamber as an online forum of similarly prejudiced groups of people, for instance, individuals are able to seek out information which reinforces their existing views, potentially as an unconscious exercise of confirmation bias. This may increase political and social polarization and extremism. The inherent prejudices that people have against dalits, adivasis and the religious minorities are further reinforced by their online friend circles who ascribe to the same set of predispositions. This further leads to strengthening of existing biases. Therefore, the oppression of the already oppressed class has now been instilled with a reinvigorated sense of resentment and hatred towards the oppressed. Since May, 2018, at least 22 people have been lynched, and numerous others have been critically injured in mob lynchings.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Jadhavji, please conclude. Time is over.

DR. NARENDRA JADHAV: Sir, I will take just 30 seconds.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Nominated Members were given only limited time.

DR. NARENDRA JADHAV: As an Indian, I hang my head in shame to admit...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is already three o'clock. Your time is over.

DR. NARENDRA JADHAV: As an Indian, I hang my head in shame to admit that mob lynchings are a new kind of hate crime in our country. I appeal to this august House, let us put our heads together and evolve a code of conduct. Let us work out a framework that removes this ugly blot on our great civilisation. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, the time was from two o'clock to three o'clock. Now, it is ten past three o'clock, so the hon. Minister will respond briefly. From each party, one name is given, that is, whoever has given notice. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have not given on time. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I need only one minute.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You can take one minute only. ...*(Interruptions)*... You know the position of rules. ...*(Interruptions)*... Members should follow it. They should give notice before time. Then, I could have adjusted everybody. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: Sir, '*epporul yaar, yaar vaai ketpinum, apporul maiporul kaanbadhu arivu*'. It means, duty is cast upon the citizens to find out the truth of any statement available in any media. So, I thank the hon. Chairman and the hon. Minister. Thank you.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGOVAN (Tamil Nadu): I have only one point to make, Sir. Sir, people holding high offices should not resort to making opinions in the social media. That will include the hon. President, the Governor, the Chief Ministers and people who are responsible to the entire population. Social media covers only about 20 to 25 per cent of the population. That leads to various comments. So, my request is that such steps should be taken, where people holding high offices make opinions through mass media and social media because that leads to various discussions. I have seen *

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please don't quote Governor here. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Elangovanji, Please. No reference to Governor will go on record. Now, Hon. Minister please, Shri Ravi Shankar Prasad.... आप भी संक्षिप्त में कहिए...*(व्यवधान)*...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद: सभापति महोदय, मैं पांच-सात मिनट में समाप्त कर दूँगा।

श्री सभापति: जी, संक्षेप में कहिए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... Don't get into arguments. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA (Assam): Mr. Chairman, Sir, this is my motion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You came and told me that the other name is of Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad. The BJP has also given only one name. Only one name from each party is allowed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Anand Sharmaji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... You know the rules about Calling Attention Motion. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have been here for twenty years. The time allotted to Calling Attention Motion is one hour. It is already past one hour-and-fifteen minutes. Then, the hon. Minister also has to reply, as per the rules. You cannot have different rules for different tenures. Anand Sharmaji, please bear with me. Please, let him complete. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let us discuss and then change the rules. I have no problem afterwards.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Then, Sir, you please accept the Short Duration Notice that we have given. It does not refer to social media. Let us have a full discussion. ...*(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has already mentioned it. You cannot expect answer here now. You already made your suggestion. ...*(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. मंत्री जी, आप बोलिए।

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसादः माननीय सभापति जी, इस विषय पर बहुत ही गंभीर और व्यापक चर्चा हुई है। मैं सभी माननीय सदस्यों को हृदय से धन्यवाद देता हूं कि उन्होंने अपने बहुत ही सार्थक सुझाव दिए हैं। सभापति जी, एक चुनौती आई है और उस चुनौती के आलोक में, हम social media के व्यक्तित्व को समाप्त नहीं करेंगे। यह भारत का एक बहुत बड़ा नया दौर डिजिटल पावर का आया है, जहां हिन्दुस्तान के आम आदमी के हाथ में सूचना की ताकत है और सवाल पूछने की हिम्मत है। हमें इसके दोनों पक्षों को समझना चाहिए। आज इस सोशल मीडिया का प्रयोग करके बहुत से बच्चे पढ़ रहे हैं, उनको नई-नई सूचनाएं मिल रही हैं। बहुत से लोग अपने कम्प्युटरिशन की तैयारी भी कर रहे हैं। मैं कई जगह पर जाता हूं, तो देखता हूं कि कई छोटे-छोटे ग्रुप्स आजकल exchange of information कर रहे हैं। बड़ी संख्या में किसान इस प्लेटफार्म का सदुपयोग कर रहे हैं। मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि इस देश में कैसा बीज उपयोग किया जाए, ये सरकारें उनको बता रही हैं। सोशल मीडिया की सार्थकता पर अगर आप इस तरह से सवाल करेंगे, तो इस पर पुनः सोचने की आवश्यकता है।

दूसरी बात, मुझे याद है कि सुषमा जी के पास ट्रीट आता है, कई बार उन्होंने भारतीय बेटियों को बचाया है, जो फंसी हुई थीं, न उनकी जाति देखी, न धर्म देखा, न ईमान देखा। मैं संचार मंत्री था, तो पोस्टल डिपार्टमेंट में मेरे पास एक मैसेज आया।

श्री सभापति: प्लीज़, शांति बनाए रखिए।

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसादः एक व्यक्ति का फार्म दूसरी जगह पर चला गया था, उसने कहा कि मंत्री जी कल लास्ट डेट है, क्या आप मेरी मदद करेंगे? एक दिन में उसका फार्म शायद लखनऊ से भोपाल पहुंचाया गया, ताकि वह डेडलाइन न मिस करे।

सर, एक बात और है। आज हिन्दुस्तान का लोकतंत्र 70 साल का हो गया है, तो लोगों को सवाल करने का अधिकार है। सवाल हमसे भी है, सवाल सम्पादकों से भी है। कई बार सवाल पूछने पर आपत्ति होती है। अगर कोई सवाल उठता है, तो सभी को उसके बारे में पूछना चाहिए। मेरे सम्माननीय देरेक साहब ने मुझसे सवाल किया है, मैं उसका उत्तर दूंगा। लेकिन कुछ लोगों को कार्टून से परेशानी होती है। मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि fun, pun, cartoon लोकतंत्र का गहना होता है। इसलिए कुछ लोगों को cartoon से परेशानी नहीं होनी चाहिए। यह भी एक सच्चाई है। हमने देखा कि एक cartoon के कारण किसी को जेल में बंद कर दिया गया। भारत के लोकतंत्र में ऐसा हो रहा है, तो counter narrative को इस तरह से विचारधारा के खंडों में बांधना ठीक नहीं है। यह सही कहा कि किसी को Right Wing से परेशानी है, तो किसी को Left Wing से है। अगर आज हमारी विचारधारा पर जनता की इतनी बड़ी मुहर लगती है, तो उसका मूवमेंट भी बड़ा होगा। अब उसको warrior कहिए या उसको आप activist

कहिए। मेरे ख्याल में देश के लोकतंत्र में इन प्रश्नों का उत्तर थोड़ा सार्थक तरीके से सोचकर देना पड़ेगा, क्योंकि सोशल मीडिया ने देश की empower करने में मदद की है, हमें यह देखना पड़ेगा। माननीय सभापति जी, आज का दिन क्यों आवश्यक है! आज का दिन इसलिए आवश्यक है कि सोशल मीडिया के एक aspect का दुरुपयोग करके हिंसा को बढ़ाया जा रहा है। इसलिए मैंने स्वयं कहा कि हम सभी इस चुनौती का संज्ञान लेते हैं। We take cognisance of all these mischievous designs to provoke violence. सर, मैंने एक बात बहुत सोच-समझ कर कही है और मैंने इस पर सदन का एक प्रकार से मार्गदर्शन भी चाहा है। देखिए, एक बात को समझिए। कहीं पर violence होती है, तो SP active होते हैं, DM active होते हैं, local action लेते हैं, केबल टी.वी. को बंद करते हैं, इंटरनेट को बंद करते हैं। अभी एक phenomena इसलिए relevant हुआ है, क्योंकि बड़ी संख्या में सोशल मीडिया पर एक प्रकार से unsubstantiated news आती हैं और fake news बनकर circulate होती हैं, लोगों को provoke करती हैं, तो law and order अपना काम करेगा। बहुत से लोग जेल गए हैं, conviction भी हुई है, झारखंड में तो convicted भी हुए हैं। लेकिन सोशल मीडिया का यह कहना है कि हम प्लेटफार्म हैं, हमने सिर्फ प्लेटफार्म बनाया है, यह नहीं चलेगा। जैसे एक अखबार में अगर provocative लेख आएंगे, तो अखबार यह नहीं कह सकता है कि हमारी जिम्मेदारी नहीं है, उसी प्रकार से सोशल मीडिया के ऊपर अगर इस तरह की fake unconfirmed news से लोग मरते हैं या मरने के लिए instigate होते हैं, तो आपकी भी जिम्मेदारी है। ये बड़े सवाल हैं। इसीलिए हमने पूरी स्पीच में इसका जिक्र किया है। उपसभापति जी, हम आपको बताना चाहेंगे कि मेरी स्टेटमेंट हिन्दी में भी सर्कुलेट हो गई है, उसमें थोड़ा विलम्ब हुआ, उसके लिए मैं आपसे क्षमा चाहता हूं। लेकिन बड़ी बात यह है कि पूरे हाऊस को एक स्वर में बोलना पड़ेगा। मैंने अपने भाषण में यह बात कही थी कि एक balance होना चाहिए, balance between freedom of speech, right to inform, right to awaken and right to enlighten. That is what the right of expression under Article 19(1) of the Constitution is. And, secondly, there has to be balance between sovereignty of India, public order, decency, morality and other part of the security of the State. यह जो भारत का संविधान है, उसको balance करना बहुत जरूरी है। जहां तक lynching की बात है, उस पर अलग से चर्चा होने वाली है, मैं उसका उत्तर अभी नहीं दूंगा, क्योंकि वह होम मिनिस्ट्री का विषय है। Lynching कहीं पर भी हो, वह दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण है, उस पर कार्रवाई होनी चाहिए। प्रदेश सरकारों को अपना काम करना चाहिए, यू.टी.ज़. को अपना काम करना चाहिए। भारत सरकार ने इस पर विस्तार से अपनी बात रखी है। महोदय, मुझसे कुछ specific सवाल पूछे गए हैं। केरल के बारे में एक particular instance के बारे में पूछा गया है।

I will have to enquire into those things, as to what has happened. My very distinguished friend, Mr. Derek O' Brien has raised many questions.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: I have raised four questions.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Those fours questions are illustrative of the profound knowledge of your vocabulary and understanding of social media.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: But answer my four questions.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have checked up. This postcard was removed by the Facebook. But there is no evidence to suggest that it was propagating a particular ideology which was the reason for that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please go ahead.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: He has got the right to laugh. Yes, we are popular. We are ruling 20 States of India and the entire country and we have got large support base. That should not unnerve you. Go to the people and get the support. My point is, in this case, they have downloaded without any reason. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री सभापति: इसमें कुछ होने वाला है क्या?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir the second question which he has asked is about certain particular gentleman as to why he attended a meeting. I think, India is free Mr. Derek O'Brien. Now, you will ask question as to why someone attends a meeting.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: He should be prosecuted.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I am not yielding.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let him complete.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, you please see the content what the person has written. Of course, India is a free country but you see the content.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Derek, you are a very senior leader of a party. ...*(Interruptions)*... Anand Sharma ji, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please confine to the issues, Mr. Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I am only saying that if Mr. Derek O'Brien is offended against any particular observation or comments of any individual, there is a provision in law, you take action, and, if that is the case then a lot of entries are emanating from West Bengal would also be subject to great scrutiny. I have got them in abundance. But I do not want to make it a political issue. I am sorry to say that. Sir, regarding the third issue about a particular application, I do not know what name we have given to that. If you could please repeat the name of the application, I was not able to hear the name.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, it is not an application. An application is something different. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would request the Minister, do not refer to any individuals, whatever you want to say, say.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: With due respect, I want to say that I have asked four questions, he has answered only two of them. Answer the other two questions.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am telling you to focus on the issue itself.

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD: Sir, the Member wants clarification from the Minister.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, about Nation with Namo part, I will make my enquiry and then revert to him separately. Sir, what is important? If India's digital profile is rising. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: But I have raised four questions.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Whatever I have understood, I have replied. Now, with regard to the other point, we can have a political debate on this point *ad nauseam*. I will have one view, you will have one view that is what democracy is all about and if we can have this debate on the floor of the House, why should we deny Indians to have this debate on social media. That is the larger question involved. That freedom we need to acknowledge. Sir, the other measures, which I have already outlined in my speech, and it is there. Sir, one last question which Shri Ghulam Nabi ji raised. I take your point. The concerned Minister has explained. It is also a public statement. I think, let us leave it these because if that is the question to be considered, I also remember the late Prime Minister as saying "जब बड़ा पेड़ गिरता है, तो धरती हिलती है!" in the case of 1984 riots. No one condemns that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let us close it now.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Let us not do like that. It is a serious debate. Let us acknowledge that.

GOVERNMENT BILLS

The National Trust for Welfare of Persons with Autism, Cerebral Palsy, Mental Retardation and Multiple Disabilities (Amendment) Bill, 2018

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, let us take up The National Trust for Welfare of Persons with Autism, Cerebral Palsy, Mental Retardation and Multiple Disabilities (Amendment) Bill, 2018. Shri Thaawarchand Gehlot to move a motion for consideration of the National Trust for the Welfare of Persons with Autism, Cerebral Palsy, Mental Retardation and Multiple Disabilities (Amendment) Bill, 2018.