

DR. K. V. P. RAMACHANDRA RAO (Telangana): \*

*(At this stage, the hon. Member left the Chamber)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: No commentary will go on record. No discussion on this. No statement made by Dr. Ramachandra Rao will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... A Member coming into the well of the House is very unfortunate. Nothing will go on record. No camera to be focused on this because the disorderly conduct will send a wrong message. ...*(Interruptions)*... We are here to do justice. Justice can be arrived at by debate, discussion and decision and not by disruption. Now, Shri Vivek Tankha to associate.

---

### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

#### **Deteriorating security situation in Jammu and Kashmir — *Contd.***

SHRI VIVEK K. TANKHA (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I am associating myself with the Leader of the Opposition on the Kashmir issue for three very good reasons. Firstly, we must act on Kashmir because it is demoralising our security forces. We can't let this happen indefinitely. Otherwise, the security forces will get demoralised. Secondly, the people of Kashmir are tired. They want peace. There has to be a dialogue. I want to see the start of a dialogue. Otherwise, it will be unending. Thirdly, the very important thing is, Kashmiri Pandits who had left Kashmir in the 90s are wanting to go back to Kashmir. We have to create a situation where the Kashmiri Pandits go back.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Normally, the associating Member is not allowed to speak. But, he raised an important issue. That is why I allowed.

SHRI VIVEK K. TANKHA: These were the important three points, Sir. Thank you.

#### **Issue of involvement of a former Union Minister in the 1984 anti-Sikh riots in Delhi as revealed in a recent sting operation by a news channel**

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा (पंजाब): सभापति महोदय, मैं आज ऐसा इश्यू आपके सामने और हाउस के सामने उठाना चाहता हूँ, जो 34 साल पहले सिखों के साथ नरसंहार हुआ, genocide हुआ, इतने समय बाद अभी तक उनको कोई इंसाफ नहीं मिला, लेकिन जो श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी ने "नानावती कमीशन" बनाया था, उन्होंने कांग्रेस के कुछ लीडर्स के बारे में कहा कि इसमें इनका हाथ है। उसमें दो आदमी ऐसे हैं जो अभी यहां पर हैं। वे \*\* और \*\* ...*(व्यवधान)*...

---

\* Not recorded

\*\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**कुछ माननीय सदस्य:** यहां नाम नहीं ले सकते। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** चलो, मैं नाम नहीं लेता हूं, लेकिन एक नया ...**(व्यवधान)**... चलो ठीक है, मैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Name will not go on record. ...**(Interruptions)**... But we have to follow this rule in all cases. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** सर, एक नया एविडेंस आया है। उस एविडेंस को मैं यहां पेश करना चाहता हूं, जिसकी सीडी भी हमारे पास है। हमारे प्रेजिडेंट, दिल्ली सिख गुरुद्वारा मैनेजमेंट कमेटी के चेयरमैन को देकर गया था। वह सभी चैनल्स पर भी कल चला और पेपर्स में भी आया है। इसको मैं टेबल पर भी रखूंगा, लेकिन उस इंसान ने जो कहा, वह मैं इस हाउस के सामने रखना चाहता हूं। वह कहता है कि मैंने सौ सिख मारे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): He shall have to authenticate it. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** जी, मैं यह सीडी टेबल पर रख रहा हूं, आप देख सकते हैं। यह कल भी सारे दिन चली है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उसमें वह गाली भी बहुत निकालता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Sir, I am on a point of order. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** मुझे कम्प्लीट कर लेने दीजिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will give you time. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Dhindsaji can continue, but hear me out. Sir, the rules of the House do not allow two things (a) when a matter is *sub judice* and the matter is actually *sub judice*, and the evidence as such can only be presented in the court; the court has taken cognizance to whatever is being alleged; (b) this House cannot convert itself into a trial court, and (c) a person being named, individual, irrespective of...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right, I understand what you are trying to say. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: A person who cannot come and clarify the fact, he cannot be included ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please stop. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: It is a *sub judice* matter. ...**(Interruptions)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. You have made your point; now leave it to the Chair. I do agree that we should not name the Member that is why I suggested that it will

[Mr. Chairman]

not go on record. ...(Interruptions)... Any person who is not a Member of the House and not present in the House, his name will not go on record. ...(Interruptions)... That is one stand taken by them. See it in the future also. But the point is that the hon. Member and two other Members came to me, met me in my Chamber and showed me the CD – it is not my duty to see the CD – I told them to authenticate it. He said it in the floor of the House now that he is submitting the same CD with authentication to the House. So, I don't find any objection to that. Please go ahead.

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** सर, उसका अपना confession है। यह कैसे कह दिया, जबकि कल सारे टीवी चैनल्स पर चला है। पेपर्स में भी है और मैं इसको यहां पर रख रहा हूं। यह उसका confession है, तो शर्मा जी कह रहे हैं कि उससे क्या होता है। उसमें वह गाली भी निकालता है और वह कहता है कि मैंने सौ सिखों को मारा। पहले तो यह बताएं कि एक आदमी तो सौ सिखों को नहीं मार सकता। उसके साथ कौन-कौन थे? दूसरा वह कहते हैं कि मैंने चीफ जस्टिस को टेलीफोन किया और दो जज \* और \* लगवाए और मैंने उनको बोल दिया है और उन्होंने ही \* की जमानत की है, जो कभी भी नहीं हो सकती थी। यहां बड़े-बड़े लीगल फील्ड के आदमी बैठे हैं, वे बताएं कि क्या इस प्रकार किसी की जमानत हो सकती है? महोदय, दूसरा यह है ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please no commentary. ...(Interruptions)... मैटर गंभीर है, Please try to understand. Mr. Anand Sharmaji, I have not called you, please. ...(Interruptions)... I have not called you. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: There are rules ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I know what is there in Rajya Sabha rules.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: There are rules ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL (Punjab): Sir, for 33 years, where were these rules and regulations? Where were the rules when Sikhs were massacred? Have they forgotten the rules? Is it a rule that Sikhs should be massacred and no justice should be given? ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Anand Sharma, please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... No rule is being allowed to be violated as long as I am here. You don't worry on that count. ...(Interruptions)... They have a serious issue. They have every right to raise it in the House. I have permitted them. Once the Chair permits, you cannot object. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

---

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: What Shri Anand Sharma is saying will not go on record. Whatever Sardar Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa is saying will go on record. Others should sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please sit down. प्लीज़, आप बैठ जाइए। ...(व्यवधान)...

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा: सरकार की रिपोर्ट है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is an emotional issue.

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा: सरकार की अपनी रिपोर्ट है कि 2,733 सिख हैं, जिनका सिर्फ दिल्ली में कत्ल हुआ। ये उनकी figures हैं, लेकिन 5,000 से ज्यादा सिखों का यहां पर कत्लेआम हुआ। तीन दिन तक यह सब होता रहा। इनको उस वक्त रूल्स मालूम नहीं थे, \*\* तीन दिन तक न पुलिस बुलवाई गयी ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: आपको क्या कहना है?

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा: न पुलिस बुलायी गयी और न फौज को बुलाया गया। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What do you want to say?

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: क्या रूल्स यह कहते हैं? ...(व्यवधान)...

सरदार बलविंदर सिंह भुंडर (पंजाब): यह National TV पर आया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

National TV पर सब आया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, it cannot be permitted. ...(Interruptions)... You have to expunge it.

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा: यह National TV पर आता रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

National TV पर आता रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is not the way to behave. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Please conclude, Sardar Dhindsa. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री श्वेत मलिक (पंजाब): इनको क्षमा याचना करनी चाहिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा: सर, ये लोग मुझे बोलने नहीं दे रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Except Sardar Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa's speech, nothing else will on record. Any reference to persons, name and position who are not here should be avoided. It should be removed from the record.

---

\* Not recorded.

\*\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** आप बताएं कि क्या हमें 34 साल में कोई इंसाफ मिला है? ...(व्यवधान)... आप सब लोगों में से क्या कोई इंसाफ की बात कर रहा है? क्या सिखों को कभी इंसाफ मिलेगा या नहीं मिलेगा? अगर वे खुद confess करते हैं तो उसे भी आप सुनने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**सरदार बलविंदर सिंह भुंडर:** ये अभी भी कातिलों की हिमायत कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... 34 साल हो गए हैं, अभी भी हिमायत कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** ये अभी भी उनकी हिमायत कर रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... अभी भी सुनने के लिए तैयार नहीं हैं। अभी भी ऐसा बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** आपका टाइम समाप्त हो गया है। ...(व्यवधान)... Let me make it clear once again. The reference to a particular name earlier, the reference to the former Prime Minister will not be part of the record. Other things will go on. Thank you, Dhindsaji, please sit down. I have to give an opportunity to others. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL:** Some hon. Members were disrupting him, Sir. Please allow him to speak.

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** That is why I gave him time. आप एक लाइन में conclude करिए। ...(व्यवधान)... आप लोग बैठ जाइए, प्लीज़। ...(Interruptions)... If you want to associate, you can associate afterwards.

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** एक तो उसके confession की बात है। ...(व्यवधान)... मैं एक और चीज़ बताना चाहता हूं। वह कहता है कि ...(व्यवधान)... यह क्या बात है? ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** आप conclude कीजिए। Please conclude. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD:** Sir, are we having a discussion here? He has already taken nine minutes. This is not the discussion time. ...(Interruptions)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN:** I am asking him to conclude. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** मेरे सारे मिनट तो आप लोग खा गए हैं, आपने मुझे बोलने नहीं दिया। ...(व्यवधान)... मेरा सारा वक्त तो ये लोग खा गए हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** आप लोग बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**SHRI ANAND SHARMA:** Sir, I am on a point of order. Please allow me. ...(Interruptions)...

**SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI (Uttar Pradesh):** Sir, how much time can he take? ...(Interruptions)...

**सरदार सुखदेव सिंह ढिंडसा:** जिस जनरल से बांग्लादेश बनाया था, जनरल अरोड़ा, उन्हें कैसे अपनी जान बचानी पड़ी, वह भी सभी जानते हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... गुजराल साहब बता सकते हैं

कि उन्होंने कैसे अपनी जान बचायी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जो हिन्दुस्तान का हीरो था, उसको गुजराल साहब के घर में जाकर अपनी जान बचानी पड़ी। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्रीमती रूपा गांगुली** (नाम निर्देशित): महोदय, मैं माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करती हूँ।

**श्री अजय संचेती** (महाराष्ट्र): महोदय, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री भूपेंद्र यादव** (राजस्थान): महोदय, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री नारायण लाल पंचारिया** (राजस्थान): महोदय, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**श्री श्वेत मलिक**: महोदय, मैं भी माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय से स्वयं को संबद्ध करता हूँ।

**SARDAR BALWINDER SINGH BHUNDER**: Sir, I associate myself with the concern expressed by Sardar Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa.

**SHRI NARESH GUJRAL**: Sir, I also associate myself with the concern expressed by Sardar Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa.

**SHRI LA. GANESAN** (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, I also associate myself with the concern expressed by Sardar Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa.

**SOME HON. MEMBERS**: Sir, we also associate ourselves with the concern expressed by Sardar Sukhdev Singh Dhindsa.

**MR. CHAIRMAN**: Okay. Now, Shrimati Vandana Chavan, not present. Shri Manish Gupta. I am not allowing a discussion. I have already given the ruling. So, please go by that. ...**(Interruptions)**... Shri Manish Gupta. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV**: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...**(Interruptions)**... Sir, I am on a point of order. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**MR. CHAIRMAN**: No, no. We have been discussing in this House issues which are *sub judice* for years together. It is everybody's knowledge. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**SHRI BHUPENDER YADAV**: Sir, I am on a point of order. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**MR. CHAIRMAN**: No, no. I have already called him. Mr. Bhupender Yadav, please, you are from the ruling party. Please sit down. I have already told you.

**SHRI MANISH GUPTA** (West Bengal): Sir, I rise to flag the issue of abhorrent practice of manual scavenging. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, you should take care of what is happening. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am keeping a watch on what is happening, Sukhendu ji. I have taken note of it.

**Need to eliminate manual scavenging in the country**

SHRI MANISH GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I rise to flag the issue of manual scavenging in India.

After more than seventy years, more than 2.6 million dry latrines still exist in this country! And, more than 7 lakh of those latrines are manually serviced!

Now, the problem is, the people engaged in this particular profession are from poor and disadvantaged sections. Although, there is legislation in 1993 and 2013 to look after the interests of this particular section of people, action taken by the Government – whether it is Central Government or State Governments – has not been adequate.

The two-pronged strategy of the Government to identify manual scavengers as well as to provide them alternative livelihoods is still at a nascent stage. What we need to do at this hour is to find a way to bring in stricter laws to see that these people are properly identified.

There was a proposal to set up a survey to identify the manual scavengers. But, it has not taken off. As a result, this particular practice is still continuing in many parts of the country.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Gupta, what is your conclusion?

SHRI MANISH GUPTA: Also, we have noticed, some cases of death in manual scavenging are filed. More than 400 people have died due to manual scavenging in the last 3-4 years. It is a very serious matter. But, when cases are filed, we find that FIRs cite negligence and other acts, instead of saying that it is an act of not only negligence but also violation of law by those people who employ these manual scavengers. Sir, not a single person has been punished in the last 10 years! It means, the law is very weak. We need to amend law and provide a comprehensive rehabilitation package for these manual scavengers. Thank you.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, we all associate ourselves with the Zero Hour submission made by Manishji.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Names of all the hon. Members be recorded as associations. One is, raising your hand; subsequently, you also send a slip, because it may not