

[श्री प्रभात झा]

हैं। ऐसे ही उन 9 एम्स में स्वीकृत 2,002 पदों में से 850 पद भरे हैं, बाकी सब खाली हैं। इनमें तमाम parameters के लोग हैं। मुझे लगता है कि देश में एम्स की एक छवि है। यहाँ लोड कम होना चाहिए और जहाँ एम्स खुल रहे हैं, वहाँ उनकी छवि बननी चाहिए, उन पर भरोसा होना चाहिए। वहाँ ऐसा हो रहा है कि देश के विभिन्न राज्यों में जो एम्स खुले हैं, उनमें आज 57 फीसदी डॉक्टर्स नहीं हैं। वे एम्स के मानक से कोसों दूर चले गए हैं।

**श्री सभापति:** आपकी माँग क्या है?

**श्री प्रभात झा:** मेरा कहना यह है कि अगर वहाँ विभाग है, तो डॉक्टर्स नहीं हैं, अगर डॉक्टर्स हैं, तो वहाँ पर facilities नहीं हैं, अगर facilities हैं, तो वहाँ पर paramedical लोग नहीं हैं। इसलिए मेरी माँग है कि भारत सरकार का स्वास्थ्य मंत्रालय इस पर चिन्ता करे, ताकि उन एम्स को देख कर देश के राज्यों में लोगों को भरोसा हो।...

**श्री सभापति:** आपका समय समाप्त हो गया। Now, Shri Swapan Dasgupta. Beyond that time, I have no alternative because it will not be recorded. Keep that in mind.

**श्री अहमद अशफाक करीम (बिहार):** महोदय, मैं स्वयं को माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करता हूँ।

† جناب احمد اشفاق کریم (بہار): مہودے، می خود کو ماننے سدسے کے ذریعے اٹھائے گئے اس وشے کے ساتھ سمبڈھ کرتا ہوں۔

**श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन (बिहार):** महोदय, मैं भी स्वयं को माननीय सदस्य द्वारा उठाए गए विषय के साथ सम्बद्ध करती हूँ।

† محترمہ کہکشاں پروین (بہار): مہودے، می بھی خود کو ماننے سدسے کے ذریعے اٹھائے گئے اس وشے کے ساتھ سمبڈھ کرتی ہوں۔

#### **Reports of commission paid to "brokers" by beneficiaries of Central Government schemes in West Bengal**

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA (Nominated): Sir, we are all looking forward to the Budget tomorrow, which the hon. Finance Minister will present. One of the major facets of the Budget, which we will look forward to, is the designing and the implementation of welfare schemes. I think all of us are concerned that these welfare schemes, which cost a lot of money, which are paid for by the tax-payers, actually, get to the intended beneficiaries. Sir, I would like to draw your attention to a massive stir, a *jan andolan*,

†Transliteration in Urdu Script.

which is going on in \* on the ...(Interruptions)... issue of the misuse of Central schemes. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, he cannot mention the name of the State. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am just clarifying it. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, it is your rule. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I am clarifying. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I am talking about Central schemes. ...(Interruptions)... We are talking about Central schemes. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: The hon. Chairman has said that you cannot mention the name of the State. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Please. ...(Interruptions)... Hear him; I am going to say something.

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: We have received reports, which have been widely publicised in the media that a systematic account of leakages, which go by the name of cut money is, actually, being prevalent there. And we have reports, Sir. Sir, if some people feel guilty about it, I cannot help it. Sir, look at it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Swapanji, you have every right to bring the facts to the notice. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Yes, I am bringing. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: But don't make any allegation against any State. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I have not made a single allegation.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, you have said that the name of the State will not be mentioned. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You see, I am going to say something. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: We have received reports which have been widely publicised in the Media that a systematic account of leakages, which go by the name

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

of cut money, is actually being prevalent there, and we have reports, Sir ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, if some people feel guilty about it, I can't help it.

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: He is levelling a wild allegation about\* ...*(Interruptions)*... What is the basis? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Swapanji, you have every right to bring the facts to the notice of the House. But, don't make any allegation against the State ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir, I have not made a single allegation.\*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Derek, you are a senior Member. My point is, no Member has got a right to make an allegation against the State because the State is not here to defend. That is the observation which I made. That does not mean that you should not take the name. Drought is there in Odisha. That interpretation is given by some Media. I want to clarify that no allegation should be made against any State Government which is not here to defend itself. But, facts can be brought to the notice of the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: \*

SHRI DEREK O'BRIEN: Sir, how can all this go on record? What is the source?\*

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: Sir,\*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Swapanji, your time is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... It will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have already said that it will not go on record. You are a very sensible Member. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SWAPAN DASGUPTA: I have not made any allegation against any Government. There are Media reports. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. Swapanji, your time is over. ...*(Interruptions)*... Manishji, you are a very seasoned Member. Please sit down. No allegation against any State by any Member will go on record. This is for all, and not for a particular State. My suggestion is, that does not mean that you cannot talk about a situation in a State, about drought, about flood, about some dam breach, or about some other issues. Issues have to be highlighted and I have given permission. But, the only thing is, while the issue is being highlighted, you should not make allegation against a particular State Government because the Government is not there to defend itself. And also, you are

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

not supposed to make allegations against the persons who are not here to defend themselves. That is the clarity. I hope, Members understand it.

SHRI G. V. L. NARASIMHA RAO (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, I associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SHRI VINAY DINU TENDULAR (Goa): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SHRI MAHESH PODDAR (Jharkhand): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SHRI SHAMSHER SINGH DULLO (Punjab): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SHRI LAL SINH VADODIA (Gujarat): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA (Assam): Sir, I also associate myself with the matter raised by the hon. Member, Shri Swapan Dasgupta.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You please sit down. आप बैठ जाइए, प्लीज़। ...*(व्यवधान)*... प्लीज़, मंत्री जी, सुनिए, मैं अपना सुझाव रिपीट करता हूँ। अगर किसी भी सदस्य को मंत्री जी से कुछ काम है, तो वहीं जाकर, उनकी बगल में बैठकर, प्यार से, without sound, जो communicate करना है, करिए। नहीं तो, अगर important मामला है, तो रिक्वेस्ट करके, बाहर जाकर, आपस में बात करके, फिर दोबारा हाउस में आकर बैठ सकते हैं। दूसरा, आज कुछ अखबारों में लिखा है, 'no State name should be mentioned.' That is not the intention. Let me clarify once again in the House. The intention is very clear. Some people have the habit of taking the name of the State and making allegations. This observation is only aimed at such things because I have seen a number of times, a number of people, when it is convenient to them, they take the name of a State. When it is inconvenient to them, they object saying, Sir, 'why are you taking the name of a State?' So, let us see to it that we all follow the same pattern for the future. ...*(Interruptions)*... Swapanji, why are you getting agitated? Any comments made against Shri Swapan Dasgupta also will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have allowed him in Special Mentions, not in this. Now, Special Mentions. Dr. Vikas Mahatme —not present. Shri Jairam Ramesh. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have already said that I have allowed him. Derekji. I know that both of you are friends. You go outside. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---