

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्री (श्री थावरचंद गहलोत): माननीय सभापति महोदय, सुप्रीम कोर्ट के सात फरवरी, 2020 के फैसले के तारतम्य में जो विषय अभी सदन में उठाया गया, मैं माननीय सदस्यों को यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार इस निर्णय पर, इस फैसले पर गंभीरता से विचार कर रही है और इस संबंध में हम आज ही दो बजे सरकार का मंतव्य सदन के सामने प्रस्तुत करेंगे।

MR. CHAIRMAN: General Discussion on the Union Budget. Shri P. Chidambaram ji. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot dictate to me. I have said I have not admitted the motion. He said that he would be going to respond at 2 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*... At 2 o'clock, when he makes Government statement, you can seek clarifications. ...*(Interruptions)*.. You and Mr. Viswam and others also can seek clarifications. Punia ji, I have been allowing you on each and every issue. Today also I was intending to allow you but the Leader of the Opposition asked for it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will be allowing you at 2 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BINOY VISWAM (Kerala): Sir,...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Viswam, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... It will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sometimes you want me to do it like this. Now, General Discussion on Union Budget, 2020-21. Shri P. Chidambaram to initiate the Discussion.

THE UNION BUDGET, 2020-21

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Maharashtra): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have listened to the hon. Finance Minister very carefully on television when she read out her Budget Speech.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair*)

At the end of 160 minutes, she was tired; so were we, tired and exhausted. I hope that she has recovered from her exhaustion. The question that remains in my mind is: What was the hon. Finance Minister trying to say? If you take 160 minutes to read a speech and then a few pages of that speech are left unread, what is the narrative or what is the story that you are trying to say? I was happy that she did not, at any point, in her speech say, "अच्छे दिन आने वाले हैं।" It is good that they have forgotten that

[Shri P. Chidambaram]

empty slogan. But she repeated more than once the new slogan, "सबका साथ, सबका विकास, सबका विश्वास।" We will know tomorrow whether the people accept that, whether this slogan resonates with the people. Tomorrow, we will know. At least, one part of India will decide whether this slogan resonates with the people of India.

I will come to the state of economy presently, but let me list the problems with this Government and I mean this sincerely and quite seriously. The first problem with this Government is that it refuses to admit its mistakes. I am not denying that earlier Governments also refused to admit their mistakes. But this Government has a particular penchant for not admitting mistakes. Demonetisation was a monumental blunder. Then, there was hurried implementation of a flawed GST — the design was wrong, the rates were wrong, the structure was wrong, the procedures were wrong and the system was unprepared. That was another monumental blunder. But, that is in the past. At least, in the future, when we point out mistakes of this Government, the Government must have an open mind to debate it with us and, if it is a mistake, admit it saying that yes, perhaps we have made a mistake. The second problem with this Government is that it is living in denial. It simply will not accept that the state of economy is extremely bad and I will give data presently. For six quarters, growth has declined. I cannot recall, unless the hon. Finance Minister corrects me, whether there has been any other period of six successive quarters where the growth rate has declined. Yet, the Government says that the upturn will happen in the next quarter, the upturn will happen in the next quarter. We have had six quarters now. The seventh quarter results will come shortly. It is like an astrologer saying that your fortunes will turn when this planet moves from this house to that house. And then, when we find that the fortunes have not turned, he will say, "No, no, wait, the next planet will move from this house to that house." Sir, the third problem with this Government is its pre-dispositions and this is an important point. The Government believes that the problems are cyclical and not structural. Their own Chief Economic Advisor, for nearly four years, had repeatedly said and he said it again four days ago, 'the problems are more structural than cyclical.' If the problems are cyclical that requires one kind of answer. If the problems are structural that requires a very different kind of answer. I can list a number of things this Government is pre-disposed to. For example, it is pre-disposed to protectionism; it is pre-disposed against bilateral and multilateral trade agreements. It is pre-disposed towards the rupee being "strong"; whatever that word "strong" means. It is pre-

disposed to a number of things which, according to me, are outdated philosophies. It is because of its refusal to admit mistakes; because it lives in denial and because of pre-dispositions, the Government either does not know or if it knows, it is not willing to make it clear that this is the state of the economy.

Sir, the Budget is preceded by an Economic Survey. I concede that the Economic Survey does not always reflect what the Government believes in but there must be some idea in the Economic Survey which is acceptable to the Government. How can a Chief Economic Advisor and its team write two Volumes and then the Finance Minister does not pick a single idea from the Economic Survey. Then, why have an Economic Survey at all? An Economic Survey is to prepare the nation for a debate on some ideas. So, in course of time, the Government begins to implement the idea. Unfortunately, the Budget Speech did not refer to the Economic Survey and did not pick a single idea out of the Economic Survey. There were some good ideas on Economic Survey, not one has been accepted and not one has been even discussed. At least, I would have been happy if the hon. Finance Minister initiated a discussion on one or two ideas in the Economic Survey so that it can be implemented later this year or next year.

So, what is the state of the economy? I mentioned already six quarters of declining growth rate. Agriculture is growing at two per cent. Consumer Price Index Inflation which was 1.9 per cent in January, 2019 rose to 7.4 per cent in December, 2019. In a matter of 11 months, CPI Inflation has increased from 1.9 per cent to 7.4 per cent. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Food Inflation today is 12.2 per cent. Bank credit is growing at 8 per cent of which non-food credit is at 7 per cent, maybe it has touched 8 per cent in January! Credit to Industry is growing at 2.7 per cent. Credit to Agriculture over the period December, 2014 to December, 2019, a five year period, the growth rate has declined from 18.3 per cent to 5.3 per cent. Credit to MSMEs has declined from 6.7 per cent to 1.6 per cent. So, we don't have credit to Agriculture and we don't have credit to MSMEs. Credit to Industry is at a limping rate. Overall credit is only about 8 or 9 per cent. The result is, it shows up in the quantifiable numbers, and I will read to you quantifiable numbers. During the period April-November, 2019, the period for which we have data,—maybe, the Government has data for December, we don't have data for December yet—just look at these numbers. Electricity is growing at 0.8 per

[Shri P. Chidambaram]

cent; manufacturing is growing at 0.9 per cent; mining is negative 0.1 per cent; refinery is negative 1.1 per cent; natural gas is negative 3.1 per cent; coal is negative 5.3 per cent, and crude oil is negative 5.9 per cent. What is left out? If every major industry, that keeps your economy a robust economy, is either near zero or negative like electricity, manufacturing, mining, refinery, natural gas, coal, crude oil, and if overall IIP (Index of Industrial Production) is 0.6 per cent, that gives you a good picture of the state of the economy. You don't require an MRI machine to study the state of the economy. It is visible to the naked eye. In manufacturing capacity in India across all industries, the capacity utilisation is an average 70 per cent. Some are less, some are more, but the average is 70 per cent. Kindly remember this number, I am going to come back to it with some other reason later. The plant load factor of thermal power plants for electricity is 55 per cent, which means 45 per cent of your thermal capacity is idle, not because they cannot produce electricity, but there is no consumption of electricity. Nobody wants electricity. If factories are closed, if new factories don't start, why would you consume electricity? In fact, world over, among the markers for the health of the economy, one of the most important markers is electricity. Lenin said that electricity and education are the two eyes-Es. It is a good marker. If your plant load factor rises to 80 per cent, it means your economy is running on all four engines. But if your plant load factor is 55 per cent, it means nearly half of your economy is not running. For the last six months, export growth, year on year, is negative. For the last eight months, import growth, year on year, is negative. What do you make out of this economy? Is this a healthy economy?

Now let us come to the management of the economy. In fact, for the first couple of years after they came to power, they said, "These are legacy issues, we inherited bad economy", which is factually wrong. But I won't get into that argument now. I think I dealt with it last year. You are in management for the last six years. How long can you blame the previous managers? Can the UPA turn around and blame Mr. Vajpayee's Government? Can Mr. Vajpayee turn around and blame Mr. Narasimha Rao's Government? How long can this go on? You are in management of the economy for the last six years, please answer. People are asking questions of the current managers, not the past managers. Now, look at the management of the economy. There could be a bad situation, but you must know how to manage it. We had bad situations in 1997. We had a very bad situation in 2008. We had a difficult situation in 2013, but they were managed. There were some ups and downs, but we managed them. Now look at your

management of the economy. In the current year, that is 2019-20, you promised a nominal GDP growth of 12 per cent. The year ended with about 8.5 per cent. You promised a fiscal deficit of 3.3 per cent; the year will end, according to the Budget document, at 3.8 per cent, but, even that has a big question mark around it. Revenue deficit, you promised 2.3 per cent, the year will end with 2.4 per cent. If this is worrying, what is projected for next year is even more worrying, although, this is a little technical, I think, it is worthwhile explaining it. Fiscal deficit will rise to 3.8 per cent this year, but, it will fall only to 3.5 per cent next year, a compression of 0.3. But, the revenue deficit from 2.3 per cent will rise this year to 2.4 per cent, and next year, it will not be compressed. It will rise further to 2.8 per cent. Now, what is the philosophy behind this? The difference between fiscal deficit and revenue deficit, it is what is available for capital expenditure. This year, you will have, according to your numbers, about 1.4 per cent for capital expenditure, but, next year, you will have only 0.7 per cent as capital expenditure. Assuming these numbers are correct, going forward, just as you compress or plan to compress fiscal deficit, should you not compress revenue deficit also? The revenue deficit is rising next year, and people are noting it. Analysts the world over will note the fact that you will have less money next year for capital expenditure than this year. You promised to collect net tax revenue of ₹ 16,49,582 crore. I will leave out the last digit. Let me give the broad numbers, ₹ 16, 49,000 crore. Up to December, you have only collected ₹ 9,00,000 crore, and you ask us to believe that at the end of the year, you will collect ₹ 15,00,000 crore. Total expenditure you promised to spend in the current year is ₹ 27,86,000 crore. Up to December, you have spent only ₹ 11,78,000 crore, and you ask us to believe that at the end of the year, you will spend ₹ 27,00,000 crore. This strains our credulity, however, and knowing who is sitting as Secretary Expenditure, I doubt he will let you spend it in the first place. You have no money to spend. The first order which the new Secretary Expenditure passed, obviously, with the consent of the hon. Finance Minister, is that departing from the earlier rule that in the last quarter, you can spend up to 33 per cent of your Budget, the first order that he passed was, you can only spend this year 25 per cent of your Budget, which means, you have no money. You have run out of money. You have masked your situation by numbers. These numbers are not credible. What you have collected by December, does not give us the confidence that you will collect the remaining by March; what you have spent by December, does not give me the confidence that you will spend it by March.

[Shri P. Chidambaram]

Now, look at the shortfalls in tax collections. I can understand if there is a shortfall in one head. But, look at the shortfalls in tax collection. Corporation Tax is short by ₹ 1,56,000 crore; personal income tax by ₹ 10,000 crore, Customs by ₹ 30,000 crore, Union Excise by ₹ 52,000 crore, and GST by ₹ 51,000 crore, and on every head, you are falling short of collections. And this despite, what everybody in the business believes, you have given extraordinary powers even to the lowest rung officer of the Income Tax Department, Excise Department, Customs Department, DRI, not to speak of CBI, ED, and SFIO, and they are issuing notice after notice. This is popularly called tax terrorism. Despite that kind of powers you have vested, you are falling short on every head. On disinvestment, you set a target of ₹1,05,000 crore. On the date of the Budget, you have collected ₹ 18,000 crore. You promise to collect, by the end of the year, another ₹ 47,000 crore. You will still be ₹ 40,000 crore short. Again, it strains credulity. These numbers are not easily acceptable or easily believable. What is the real state of affairs? The hon. Finance Minister's speech did not refer to the state of the economy nor the management of the economy. It just assumed that everything was fine and they are going forward. The problem with this economy or the state of economy is that it is a demand-constrained economy. And it is an investment starved economy. These are the two problems of this economy today. There is a demand constraint and it is investment starved. There are answers which can be suggested for a demand constrained economy and there are answers which can be suggested for an investment starved economy. But, what is important is the question as to why you are unwilling to share with the country the real state of the economy.

Sir, there are two reports and both are extremely important for the people of India. There was a report in 2018 called the Periodic Labour Force Survey. It found that the unemployment rate was a 45 year-old high at 6.1 per cent at the end of 2017-18. Contrary to popular belief, urban unemployment rate was also bad. The 6.1 per cent is made of 5.3 per cent of rural unemployment and 7.8 per cent of urban unemployment. In rural areas, unemployment is disguised employment. It is not really employment, but disguised employment which is why the numbers are a little depressed. But, in urban areas, the numbers shows up at 7.8 per cent. You suppress the report. But it was leaked out in one of the newspapers. You still refuse to release it.

In one of the answers, one of the hon. Ministers has said, 'Yes, unemployment rate is at 6.1 per cent.' Why did you suppress this report? Because it was on the eve

of elections and you did not want the people of India to know the true state of affairs as far as employment is concerned.

There is an even more worrying report and I want the hon. Members to pay attention to that. I beg you. Even more worrying a report! The 75th round of NSSO did a survey of consumer expenditure. It has to be quarterly updated. The finding is that between 2011-12 and 2017-18, consumption fell by 3.7 per cent. The rural consumption fell by 8.8 per cent. The rural food consumption fell by 10 per cent. 40 per cent of our children are already undernourished. ...*(Interruptions)*... Stunted and wasted. You know that data. Rural consumption has fallen by 10 per cent. What did the Ministry say? 'We can't release this report because there is a high degree of divergence with administrative data.' What is this 'administrative data'? Who collects this administrative data? This administrative data is collected by your own officers. When there was a scientific survey done by an organization like NSSO, which shows that consumption has fallen in this country, food consumption has fallen by 10 per cent, you withhold that information by saying that it is contrary to administrative data. Consumption surveys are critical to monitor poverty and inequality. It is done in every country of the world. And you refuse to disclose the findings of your consumption survey.

Let me give you an example of administrative data. What did you say? 'India is open defecation free. We have built millions of toilets.' What is the report today? What does Mr. Ajit Tiwari, Deputy Director of Swachh Bharat Mission (Rural) say today? Sir, 4.5 lakh of toilets in Madhya Pradesh have vanished, ₹ 540 crores have gone down the drain. If 4.5 lakh toilets have vanished, where is your ODF? How does India become ODF? This is your administrative data. On the one hand your Secretary of the Department says, 'Swachh Bharat is a great success. We have declared India ODF.' But your Swachh Bharat Mission's Deputy Director, Mr. Ajit Tiwari says today that 4.5 lakh toilets are not there. What did they do? They took pictures of one toilet and uploaded it saying, 'I have built this here. I have built this here. I have built this here.' This is about one State; I make bold to say, based on my observation when I travel. If you do it for all over the country, you will find this is ten times more. We all know that these claims are wrong. Administrative data is based on what your officers collect and tell you what you want to hear. You are living in an echo chamber. You want to hear your own voice. When the NSSO does a survey, you suppress it. What do we have today? We have falling consumption, rising unemployment. With rising unemployment and falling consumption, do you call this a state of economy, an acceptable state of

[Shri P. Chidambaram]

economy? A group of 103 academics issued a statement on 21st of November, 2019 demanding that the 75th round of the NSSO's consumer expenditure survey and the 76th round of the NSSO survey of drinking water, sanitation, hygiene and housing be released. I want to say on behalf of my party, and I am sure the entire House supports me, we demand that these reports be laid on the Table of the House. Let us have a debate. You have the numbers, you can debate us. Let us have the reports on the Table of House. Let us debate whether these reports are correct or credible or should be acceptable and corrective action should be taken.

Sir, I am going to wind up now. The Chief Economic Advisor says that the economy is in an ICU. These are not my words, but his words. Nobel Laureate, Abhijit Banerjee said that the economy is doing very badly. All that he said was economy is doing very badly, the Ministers pounced upon him. Be that as it may, the Chief Economic Advisor of your Government of four years says, 'the economy is in an ICU.' I disagree. I think the patient has to be wheeled into the ICU. Unfortunately, the patient is being kept out of the ICU and incompetent doctors are now looking at the patient. Of course, you will not consult the Opposition Parties. The Congress, of course, is untouchable. The rest of the Opposition is looked upon with great contempt. So, you will not consult anyone. You will not even go across to Dr. Manmohan Singh and ask him, 'What do you have to say?' I think it is dangerous to have the patient outside the ICU. We know what will happen if the patient who has to be wheeled in an ICU is kept outside the ICU and looked after by incompetent doctors. Now, what is the purpose of standing around the patient and chanting Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas? The patient is not going to revive. The patient will revive only if competent doctors attend to the patient and administer medicine. Every competent doctor, that you identified and appointed, has left the country. You made sure Dr. Raghuram Rajan left. You made sure that Dr. Arvind Subramanian left. You made sure Dr. Urjit Patel left. You made sure Dr. Arvind Panagaria could not stay on longer, although he is willing and even now he is willing, I am told. All right, you get rid of these doctors. Who are your doctors? Who are your doctors, I want to know? Don't you need competent doctors to treat this patient who is on the ICU today? Sir, there are obvious solutions which escape the Government. I am winding up in a couple of minutes. There are obvious solutions which escape the Government. The obvious solution is to revive aggregate demand. The other obvious solution is to incentivize investment. I found nothing in the Budget. With great respect, I say that I found nothing in the Budget

which would revive demand. The way to revive demand is to put money in the hands of the masses; not put money in the hands of the classes. That is what you did last year. ...(*Time-bell rings*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA (Himachal Pradesh): Sir, our party has time.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your party has given thirty minutes to Shri Chidambaram. I am reminding him.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: I understand, Sir. I am winding it up. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: We will readjust our time. ...(*Interruptions*)... We will re-apportion our time. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You send it in writing.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Just a moment. I am winding up.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: No, no. Don't wind up. You continue.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: We have to put money in the hands of the masses. Last year, you held a gun to the RBI Governor and asked him to declare a special dividend. And, he declared a special dividend of about ₹ 1.6 lakh crores. What did you do with the money? You should have put bulk of that money in the hands of the masses. Instead of that, you put the money in the hands of 200 corporate by giving them a corporate tax rate cut! And, we warned you that this will not translate into investment. And, that is what exactly happened it did not translate to investment.

The second thing is to revive investment. Today, the CII has come out with a statement — in fact, I am glad that they are all finding their voice after five-and-a-half years — that you have criminalized most laws and you have given extraordinary powers to the officers. They have come up with a list of thirty-seven laws which have to be decriminalized. Everything in this country is criminal! Now, you talk about a charter of rights of taxpayers. Let me appeal to the hon. Finance Minister. We don't want a charter; just take away these extraordinary powers given to the officers. Take away the carte blanche given to them is good enough. We don't want a charter for taxpayers. Today, there is no money in the hands of the people and there is no incentive for anyone to invest. On the contrary, there is fear and uncertainty prevailing all over this country and under this fear and this uncertainty nobody will invest in India.

[Shri P. Chidambaram]

Finally, Sir, you talked about a caring Government. I will tell you how much this Government cares. I will give you a list of heads under which you spent less than the Budget in the current year. On food subsidy, you promised to spend ₹ 1,84,000 crores, but you will spend only ₹ 1,08,000 crores! We want the hon. Finance Minister to explain what happened to the remaining ₹ 76,000 crores! On agriculture, you promised to spend ₹ 1,51,000 crores, you spent only ₹ 1,20,000 cores. What happened to the remaining ₹ 31,000 crores? Under PM-KISAN, you promised to spend ₹ 75,000 crores, you will spend only ₹ 54,000 crores! Under PMGSY, you promised to spend ₹ 19,000 crores, but you will be spending only ₹ 14,000 crores! Sir, I come to the Mid-Day Meal Scheme. Is there anything more important than the Mid-Day Meal Scheme? You promised to spend, but you will spend only ₹ 9,900 crores! Are the children saying, 'we don't want Mid-Day Meal?' For ICDS, of the ₹ 27,000 crores assured, you will spend only ₹ 25,000 crores. On skill development — you talk about jobs being created — you promised to spend ₹ 7,260 crores, you will spend only ₹ 5,749 crores! On Ayushman Bharat, a favourite of the Government, you promised to spend ₹ 6,556 crores, you will spend only ₹ 3,384 crores! On the ICDS, which goes along with Mid Day Meal Scheme, you had promised to spend ₹ 27,585 crores, but you will spend only ₹ 24,025 crores. Each of these critical programmes — food subsidy, agriculture, PM Kisan, Gram Sadak Yojana, Mid Day Meal Scheme, ICDS, skill development — you are not spending the money that you had promised to spend. And, next year, you would be allocating the money, why should I believe that you will spend the money, or, in the first place, you will have the money?

Let's talk about the 'revolutions'; you call these 'Green', 'Blue', and 'White'. On the Green Revolution, you had promised to spend ₹ 12,561 crores, but you will spend only ₹ 9,965 crores. On the White Revolution, you had promised to spend ₹ 2,240 crores, but you will spend only ₹ 1,799 crores. On the Blue Revolution, you had promised to spend ₹ 560 crores, but you will spend only ₹ 455 crores. Is this the attention that you are paying to agriculture, which is growing at 2 per cent, which is the mainstay for 60 per cent of our people?

For next year, the allocations are insufficient under critical heads. At least, in six critical heads, the allocations are hopelessly insufficient. For Defence, you have increased it by ₹ 7,000 crores. I don't know why the Chief of Defence Staff, Secretary of the newly-created Department of Military Affairs is not protesting. He should protest loudly. For

fertilizers, you have reduced it by ₹ 8,500 crores. On rural development, you have increased it by ₹ 1,400 crores. On MGNREGA, you have reduced it by ₹ 10,000 crores. On Railways, your budgetary support goes up by ₹ 2,200 crores. But, on the modernisation of police forces, you have cut it by ₹ 1,000 crores. What is your philosophy? These are critical areas that require money. You don't have the money; you don't provide the money. And, what you provide, you don't spend.

Last point, Sir, the States are also being cheated. We are the Council of the States. The States are being cheated. In the beginning of the current year, you promised to transfer ₹ 8,09,133 crores, the Budget Estimate. At the end of the year, you will transfer only ₹ 6,56,046 crores. There is a cut of ₹ 1,53,000 crores. Divide it among thirty States. On an average, every State will lose ₹ 5,000 crores. Ask your own Chief Ministers, if every State loses, on an average, ₹ 5,000 crores, how does the State Finance Minister balance his Budget? And, the next year, you promised to give ₹ 784 lakh crores. I don't believe your numbers.

So, the net result today is, we have an economy which is perilously close to collapse. It has to be attended to by very competent doctors. In the last few years, we have found that the doctors are not so competent. They are living in denial. And, they are ignoring the two big elephants in the room — the rising unemployment and the falling consumption. Your unemployment rises and the consumption falls. India is becoming poorer; Indians are becoming poorer, not rich.

On the 2nd of November, 2013, a very distinguished political leader had said, I quote, "The economy is in trouble, youths want jobs, devote more time to economics, not petty politics. Please focus on the job at hand." It was a very wise advice. The economy is in trouble; the youths want jobs; devote more time to economics, not petty politics; please focus on the job at hand. ...(*Interruptions*)... A very distinguished political leader had said this on the 2nd of November, 2013. I can't do any better than read this piece of advice to the hon. Finance Minister. Thank you.

श्री अरुण सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, भारत सरकार की वित्त मंत्री, आदरणीया श्रीमती निर्मला सीतारमण जी ने जो बजट रखा है, मैं उसके समर्थन में बोलने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। मैं वित्त मंत्री महोदया को बधाई देता हूँ और उनका अभिनन्दन करता हूँ, क्योंकि जिस प्रकार से उन्होंने यह बजट रखा है, इसमें सभी वर्गों के लिए कुछ न कुछ रखा गया है और साथ ही साथ 'New India' का जो सपना हमने देखा है, उसे साकार करने के लिए इसमें बहुत सारे प्रावधान रखे गए हैं। आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने five trillion dollars की economy को प्राप्त करने का जो लक्ष्य रखा है, उसके लिए भी इसमें ढेर सारे कदम उठाए गए हैं।

[श्री अरुण सिंह]

उपसभापति महोदय, जब लम्बी छलांग लगानी होती है, तो उसके लिए धीरे-धीरे और सधा हुआ कदम होना चाहिए, इस तरह से यह दूरदृष्टि वाला बजट है और निश्चित तौर पर इसके माध्यम से हम लम्बी छलांग लगाने वाले हैं। यह लोगों की आकांक्षाओं को पूरा करने वाला बजट है।

उपसभापति महोदय, अभी भूतपूर्व वित्त मंत्री, माननीय चिदम्बरम जी बोल रहे थे, मैं उनकी बात ध्यान से सुन रहा था। वे कह रहे थे कि कई डॉक्टर छोड़ कर चले गए और आज इकोनॉमी ICU में हैं। मैं उन्हें बताना चाहूंगा कि जब यूपीए का 10 साल का शासनकाल था, तो उस समय डा. शंकर आचार्य, मुख्य आर्थिक सलाहकार रहा करते थे। उन्होंने यूपीए के शासनकाल में कहा था कि अभी जो यूपीए का शासनकाल चल रहा है, इस समय में आर्थिक विकास की जो गति है, वह आर्थिक, सामाजिक एवं प्रशासनिक सुधार के मोर्चों पर बुरे तरीके से विफल रही है। यह इनके समय में डा. शंकर आचार्य जी का कहना था।

महोदय, अभी थोड़ी देर पहले economic parameters की बात बताई गई। माननीय मोदी जी के नेतृत्व में हमारी जो सरकार चल रही है, हर parameters पर हम पहले से अच्छे हैं और आर्थिक गति से तेज चल रहे हैं। महंगाई दर के बारे में भी मैं कुछ बताना चाहूंगा। अभी थोड़ी देर पहले हमारे भूतपूर्व वित्त मंत्री बोल रहे थे कि महंगाई दर बढ़ती जा रही है। हम लोगों को UPA के समय की बात याद है, जब महंगाई दर लगातार बढ़ती जा रही थी, repo rate बढ़ाए जा रहे थे, CRR rate भी बढ़ाए जा रहे थे और उस समय जब UPA-II की सरकार आई, तो यह कहा गया कि 100 दिन के अंदर हम महंगाई कम कर देंगे। दोनों सदनों में इसके लिए बाकायदा प्रस्ताव भी पारित किया गया कि हम महंगाई कम करेंगे, लेकिन महंगाई कम नहीं हुई, बल्कि बढ़ती ही रही और double-digit inflation पर रही। यूपीए के समय में अगर हम महंगाई दर का एवरेज देखें, तो वह 7.93% था, वहीं मोदी सरकार के नेतृत्व में, पिछले साढ़े पांच वर्ष की महंगाई दर का एवरेज देखें, तो वह average 5.0% से कम रहा है, जो अभी तक का सबसे कम inflation rate है।

वे economic parameters में fiscal deficit के बारे में भी बता रहे थे। मैं वित्त मंत्री महोदय को बधाई देना चाहूंगा कि तमाम लोक कल्याण की योजनाओं और गरीबों के कल्याण की अलग-अलग योजनाओं पर पैसा खर्च करने के बावजूद भी fiscal deficit 3.8% रखा गया। यूपीए के समय में fiscal deficit 5.1% था, और वह भी तब जब बहुत सारे खर्चों की under-provisioning की गई थी। अगर ढंग से उसकी provisioning कर दी गई होती, तो उस समय fiscal deficit 7.0% या 8.0% से भी अधिक होता।

मोदी सरकार के नेतृत्व में हमारा average GDP 7.9% है और यूपीए के समय में average GDP 4.8% था। NDA-I के समय में हम 8.5% का average GDP रेट छोड़ कर गए थे, लेकिन इन्होंने उसका भट्ठा बैठा दिया और इस सरकार को विरासत में 4.8% GDP दर को लाकर देने का काम किया है।

फिर Export-Import की बात की जा रही थी। अभी हमारा Current Account Deficit 0.8% है, लेकिन उस समय क्या था, मैं ज़रा इसके संबंध में भी आईना दिखाना चाहूंगा। उस समय हमारा CAD 48% तक पहुँच गया था। स्थिति यह थी कि अगर हम देश का सोना गिरवी रखते, तभी जाकर हमें तेल मिलता। यह स्थिति उस समय थी, जब आर्थिक कुशासन का कुचक्र इन्होंने चलाया था। इस समय मोदी जी के नेतृत्व में चल रही सरकार का forex reserves आज तक का record highest forex reserves है, जो 471 billion dollar है। सरकारी कर्ज GDP के अनुपात में लगातार गिर रहा है। आज यह 48.7 परसेंट है। यह यूपीए के समय में 52.2 परसेंट था। इंटररेस्ट रेट में भी धीरे-धीरे काफी कटौती हो रही है। जो रेपो रेट उस समय, यूपीए के समय में 8 परसेंट हो गया था, धीरे-धीरे हमारे वित्त मंत्री जी की कोशिश से, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी के नेतृत्व में आज वह 5.15 परसेंट पर आ गया है।

मान्यवर, किसानों के बारे में इस बजट में जो कहा गया है, मैं वह जरूर बताना चाहूंगा। मैं भी किसान परिवार से आता हूँ। मेरा बचपन भी खेत और खलिहान में ही बीता है। किसान इस देश का अन्नदाता है। यदि कहें तो इस देश का अगर कोई भाग्यविधाता है, तो वह हमारे देश का किसान ही है। किसान के लिए ऐतिहासिक रूप से इस सेक्टर में 2 लाख 83 हजार करोड़ रुपये का प्रावधान इस बजट में रखा गया है। यह एक ऐतिहासिक बात है। इसके साथ-साथ किसानों की आमदनी दोगुनी कैसे हो? पहले की भी जो सरकारें होती थीं, वे कहती थीं कि हम अपने किसानों की चिन्ता करते हैं, लेकिन किसान की चिन्ता कभी नहीं करती थीं, बजट में किसानों के लिए कुछ होता नहीं था। किसान की आमदनी दोगुनी कैसे हो, इसके लिए सरकार 16 action points लेकर, ठोस points लेकर आयी है। किसानों के उत्पादन में वृद्धि आये, वृद्धि के साथ-साथ किसानों का जो उत्पादन है, उसका ढंग से ट्रांसपोर्टेशन हो, ट्रांसपोर्टेशन के बाद उनके उत्पाद की जो बिक्री हो, बिक्री के बाद उनको पूरा का पूरा पैसा मिले, इसके माध्यम से ही किसानों की आमदनी दोगुनी हो सकती है।

मैं देश के प्रधान मंत्री मोदी जी का अभिनन्दन भी करना चाहूंगा। Soil Health Card के माध्यम से जहाँ 21.95 करोड़ लोगों को Health Card मिला है, वहीं प्रधान मंत्री फसल बीमा योजना में, 2019-20 में 5.41 करोड़ लोगों ने अपना बीमा कराया है। इसके साथ-साथ पहले की जो सरकारें होती थीं, वे MSP के दाम कभी 50 रुपये, तो कभी 100 रुपये, ऐसे दाम बढ़ाती थीं। यह हमारी मोदी सरकार ही है, जिसने Minimum Support Price को डेढ़ गुना करने का काम किया है। इसके साथ-साथ horticulture sector को बढ़ावा देने के लिए 'one product, one district' के अन्तर्गत एक योजना लेकर आये हैं। वास्तव में जब horticulture का production बढ़ेगा, उसका सही दाम मिलेगा, तो वह किसान की आमदनी दोगुनी करने में जरूर सहायक होगा। 20 लाख किसानों को जहाँ solar pump लगाने की पीएम कुसुम योजना के अन्तर्गत व्यवस्था है, वहीं 5 लाख किसानों को ग्रिड के माध्यम से solar connection देने का इस बजट में प्रावधान है। किसानों के जो perishable nature के items हैं, जैसे टमाटर, गोभी, फूल इत्यादि हैं-- उपसभापति जी, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि एक बार मैं जमशेदपुर से राँची जा रहा था। रास्ते में देखा कि ढेर सारे

12.00 Noon

[श्री अरुण सिंह]

टमाटर सड़क पर फेंके हुए हैं। मेरे मन में चिन्ता हुई। मैंने पूछा कि भाई, टमाटर को ले जाकर शहर में क्यों नहीं बेचते, तो उन्होंने बोला कि टमाटर को कैसे ले जाकर शहर में बेचें? मैंने कहा दिल्ली पहुँचाओ, मुम्बई पहुँचाओ, तो उन्होंने कहा कि इस टमाटर को वहाँ कैसे लेकर जाएँ, क्योंकि यह perishable nature का item है। एक दिन, दो दिन के अन्दर, तीन दिन के अन्दर ये जो गोभी और टमाटर हैं, ये सब खराब हो जायेंगे और यहाँ एक रुपये में भी लेने वाला कोई नहीं है। अब बताइए, किसान इतनी मेहनत के बाद जी-जान लगाकर अगर फसल का उत्पादन करता है, लेकिन उसकी बिक्री नहीं होती, तो इससे बड़े दुख की बात क्या हो सकती है? यह मोदी सरकार ही है, जिसने कहा कि कृषि ट्रेन और कृषि उड़ान की सुविधा हम लेकर आ रहे हैं, refrigerated trains भी चलेंगी। अब जमशेदपुर का टमाटर मुम्बई भी पहुँचेगा, जमशेदपुर का टमाटर यहाँ दिल्ली भी पहुँचेगा, टमाटर खराब नहीं होगा, किसानों को उसकी पूरी आमदनी मिलेगी, पूरा दाम मिलेगा। यह मोदी सरकार ही है, जिसने इस दिशा में सोचा है। पहले की सरकारों ने कभी इस प्रकार से नहीं सोचा था। कृषि ट्रेन और कृषि उड़ान की सुविधा की जो announcement इस बजट में की गयी है, इसके लिए मैं अभिनन्दन करना चाहूँगा। इस बजट का अगर focus देखें, theme देखें, तो गरीब कल्याण, Ease of Living -- Ease of Living के लिए इस बजट में पूरा ... (व्यवधान).. यह इसकी theme है।

अब कोई भी सरकार हो, हर सरकार का उद्देश्य यही होता है कि गरीबों का उत्थान हो, गरीबों के जीवन में खुशहाली आए, गरीब अच्छे तरीके से रहें, उनको अच्छी गवर्नेन्स, सुशासन का लाभ मिले। इसके साथ-साथ जो बहुत सारी फाइनेन्शियल सर्विसेज़ हैं, उनका भी उसको लाभ मिले, तो ईज ऑफ लिविंग के साथ - साथ गुड गवर्नेन्स का थीम और उसके साथ-साथ एक इफेक्टिव, इफिशिएन्ट फाइनेन्शियल सिस्टम हो, उसके लिए माननीय वित्त मंत्री इस बजट में प्रावधान लेकर आई हैं।

देश की आजादी के बाद पांच दशकों से ऊपर काँग्रेस की सरकार का शासन रहा। वह गरीबी हटाओ, गरीब हटाओ का नारा देते रहे और गरीबी हटाओ का नारा देते-देते कई बार शासन में भी आए, लेकिन अभी थोड़ी देर पहले तब के वित्त मंत्री जी पूछ रहे थे कि इसमें अच्छे दिन के लिए कुछ क्यों नहीं है ? मैं अच्छे दिन के लिए बताना चाहूँगा कि ग्रोथ में देश का विकास इनक्लूसिव ही होना चाहिए और फाइनेन्शियल इनक्लूजन का पूरा ध्यान दिया जाना चाहिए। देश की आजादी के बाद गरीबों के बैंक एकाउन्ट्स नहीं खुले थे, आज 37 करोड़ लोगों के बैंक एकाउन्ट्स खोलने का काम, उनका फाइनेन्शियल इनक्लूजन करने का काम मोदी सरकार ने किया है।

इसके साथ-साथ जो गरीब लोग हैं, उनके लिए जीवन-बीमा और जीवन सुरक्षा का प्रावधान किया गया है। यदि गरीब के घर में कुछ हो जाए, उसका एक्सिडेंट हो जाए तो उसके लिए किसी प्रकार की सुरक्षा का कवच नहीं था। आज 17 करोड़ लोगों को पीएम सुरक्षा योजना के

अन्तर्गत कवर किया गया और 6 करोड़, 51 लाख लोगों को प्रधान मंत्री जीवन ज्योति योजना के अन्तर्गत शामिल किया गया।

प्रधान मंत्री आवास योजना, पहले हम गांवों में जाते थे तो देखते थे कि रोड के किनारे प्रधान मंत्री आवास योजना के अन्तर्गत इन्दिरा आवास योजना के मकान बने होते थे। उनमें या तो भूसा रखा होता था या गाय, बैल आदि बांधे जाते थे, उनमें लोग नहीं रहते थे। इसका सबसे बड़ा कारण यह था कि उनमें अनुदान भी कम था और उसके अलावा उनमें करप्शन बहुत था। आज प्रधान मंत्री आवास योजना के अन्तर्गत जो 2 करोड़ मकान बनाए गए हैं, उनमें लोग लाइट जलाकर रह रहे हैं और प्रधान मंत्री जी को धन्यवाद दे रहे हैं।

मान्यवर, सबका साथ, सबका विकास और सबका विश्वास पर अभी हमारे विपक्ष के मित्र ने चुटकियां लीं। गरीबों को गैस कनेक्शन्स देने का काम अगर किसी ने किया है तो वह मोदी सरकार ने किया है। इस बजट में उसका प्रावधान भी है। हम गरीबों की बात तो करते रहते थे, लेकिन गरीबों को किस प्रकार से दवाई मिले, गरीबों का किस प्रकार से इलाज हो, मैंने खुद गांवों में देखा है। एक बार मैं गांव में गया। वहां एक गरीब नीचे बैठा था। हमने उनसे पूछा कि आप क्यों कांप रहे हो, आप जाकर डाक्टर से दवाई क्यों नहीं लेते हो, वह कितनी फीस लेते हैं? वह पूछते हैं कि कितना पैसा तोहरे पास बा? हम कहित हैं कि दस पैसा, दस रुपये, बीस रुपये हैं, तो जितना पैसा होता है, उसके हिसाब से वह दवाई देते हैं। अब बताइए, उस गरीब की चिन्ता करने वाला कोई नहीं था। अगर गरीब को अस्पताल में जाकर ऑपरेशन कराना होता था तो जब तक वह अपने मकान या जमीन को गिरवी नहीं रखता, तब तक वह अपना ऑपरेशन नहीं करा सकता और वह तड़प-तड़प कर मर जाता। यह मोदी सरकार ही है, जिन्होंने आयुष्मान भारत के अन्तर्गत इनके इलाज की चिन्ता की और इस बजट में उसका प्रावधान भी है। सरकार ने आयुष्मान भारत के अन्तर्गत 50 करोड़ लोगों को 5 लाख रुपये का हैल्थ कार्ड्स देने की योजना लागू की है। इसके साथ-साथ हैल्थ केयर की समृद्धि के लिए 69 हजार करोड़ रुपये का इस बजट में आवंटन है। 20 हजार अस्पताल जन-आरोग्य योजना के अन्तर्गत एम्पेनलड हो चुके हैं। अब गरीब को कहीं जाने की जरूरत नहीं है, वह सरकारी या प्राइवेट अस्पताल में इलाज करायेगा, यह मोदी सरकार की जो केयरिंग सोसाइटी की बजट में व्यवस्था है, यह उसे दर्शाता है।

जन-औषधि केन्द्रों पर ढेर सारी दवाइयां उपलब्ध हैं और आने वाले समय में दो हजार दवाइयां और तीन सौ सर्जिकल इन्स्ट्रुमेन्ट्स वर्ष 2024 तक पूरे देश में मिलेंगे, इस बजट में इसका भी उल्लेख है। मान्यवर, मैं आपके समक्ष कुछ और बिन्दु रखना चाहूंगा। जहाँ तक वित्तीय स्थिति की बात है, उस संबंध में मैं यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि अगर किसी भी देश को विकास के लक्ष्य को प्राप्त करना हो, तो वह अच्छे बैंकिंग सिस्टम, strong banking system, efficient banking system of financial sector or institution के बिना संभव नहीं है। जो nationalized banks थे, उनकी 50वीं स्वर्ण जयंती अभी 2019 में पूरी हुई। मान्यवर, इतने साल शासन करने के बाद भी आज तक विश्व के जो top hundred banks हैं, उनमें भारत का केवल स्टेट बैंक ऑफ

[श्री अरुण सिंह]

इंडिया था यानी टॉप बैंक्स में भारत का एक ही बैंक है, जब कि छोटे-छोटे जो देश हैं, जैसे स्वीडन, सिंगापुर, नीदरलैंड, ये छोटे-छोटे देश हैं और यहाँ के तीन-तीन बैंक top 100 में हैं। अमेरिका के तो 12, जापान के 8, चीन के 18 बैंक्स top fifty में शामिल हैं और top 50 में भारत का एक भी बैंक शामिल नहीं था। ऐसे में हम किस प्रकार से अपने आर्थिक विकास और 21वीं शताब्दी के भारत की कल्पना कर सकते हैं? यह यूपीए सरकार की दस साल का शासनकाल और पाँच दशक से अधिक काँग्रेस के शासन का नतीजा सबके सामने देखने को मिला और उस समय ढेर सारे अर्थशास्त्री और डॉक्टर्स थे। उस समय यह स्थिति थी।

सर, मैं वित्त मंत्री जी को और माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी को बधाई देना चाहूँगा कि अब बैंकों का consolidation हो रहा है, बैंकों का मर्जर हो रहा है, इस मर्जर के माध्यम से अभी 10 बैंकों को चार बैंकों में merged किया गया है। इससे बैंकों की efficiency भी बढ़ेगी और बैंक्स financial technology का उपयोग करेंगे। इससे operating profit भी बढ़ेगा। एक बिल्डिंग होती थी और तीन-तीन, चार-चार बैंक्स आपस में competition करते थे। जब कोई इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर या अन्य बड़े प्रोजेक्ट के लिए लोन की जरूरत पड़ती थी, तो उसके लिए बाहर जाकर लोन लेने की जरूरत पड़ती थी, क्योंकि भारत का कोई भी बैंक इस काबिल नहीं था कि वह इस तरह का लोन दे सके। यह जो मर्जर है, यह 5 trillion dollar की इकनॉमी का जो लक्ष्य रखा है, उस लक्ष्य को प्राप्त करने के लिए बहुत ही उपयोगी साबित होगा। अभी साढ़े तीन लाख करोड़ रुपए तक बैंकों के कैपिटल में infusion कर दिया गया और यह किसकी गलती थी? यह गलती यूपीए के दस साल के शासनकाल के अर्थशास्त्री और बहुत सारे जो पीएचडी, डॉक्टरेट थे, उनकी advice के आधार पर हुई थी। उस समय क्या स्थिति थी? 2008 में loan 18 लाख करोड़ रुपए था, 2014 में 52 लाख करोड़ रुपए, इस तरह से portfolio बढ़ गया। यह कैसे बढ़ गया?

मान्यवर, मैं 2013 का उदाहरण देना चाहूँगा। 2013 में पब्लिक सेक्टर की लेंडिंग की जो ग्रोथ थी, वह 30 परसेंट थी और जीडीपी 6.7 परसेंट था। यह तो बारहवीं class का भी कोई बच्चा समझ सकता है कि जीडीपी 6 या 7 परसेंट है और जो लोन की फंडिंग है, उसमें 30 परसेंट की ग्रोथ हो रही है, तो इतना बड़ा मिसमैच कभी भी नहीं होना चाहिए। यह पैसा कहाँ जा रहा था? यह पैसा यहाँ जा रहा था, या तो टोपी घूम रही थी, नंबर एक, दूसरा, फंड diversion हो रहा था, तीसरा, कुछ फंड विदेश में भी जा रहा था। यह मोदी सरकार है, ऐसे जो diversion किए हुए लोग हैं, जिन्होंने fraud किए हैं, उनको पकड़ कर ला रही है, उनके ऊपर केस कर रही है और पैसा रिकवर करने का काम कर रही है। इस प्रकार का काम किसके समय में होता था? फोन बैंकिंग का काम किसके समय में होता था? हाँ, यह ठीक है कि आपने जो किया और हमारी सरकार उसको सुधारने का काम कर रही है। समय जरूर लगेगा और जो कदम उठाए जा रहे हैं, वे उस दिशा में बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण हैं।

महोदय, आए दिनों छोटे निवेशक का पैसा डूब जाता था। वह बेचारा परेशान रहता था। वह अपनी कमाई बैंक में डालता था और उसका पैसा डूब जाता था। इसके लिए वह दर-दर

की ठोकरें खाता था। मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी का अभिनंदन करना चाहूँगा कि उन्होंने डिपॉजिट पर जो एक लाख रुपए तक का इंश्योरेंस था, उसको बढ़ा कर अब पाँच लाख रुपए करने का काम किया है। अभी टैक्स रिफॉर्म के बारे में बात कर रहे थे। मान्यवर, हमारी सरकार का मूलमंत्र ही है कि *minimum government, maximum governance*. हम अब *minimum government* और *maximum governance* में विश्वास रखना चाहते हैं। देश का सबसे बड़ा रिफॉर्म जीएसटी के रूप में हुआ, जिसके लिए लोग कई वर्षों से सोच रहे थे, लेकिन उसको लाने का काम मोदी सरकार ने किया, जिसको विपक्ष के लोगों ने यह कह कर बदनाम करने की कोशिश की कि यह गब्बर सिंह टैक्स है। आपने गब्बर सिंह टैक्स कहा, लेकिन अब आप उसका रिजल्ट देखिए। उसका रिजल्ट यह है कि 60 लाख नए करदाता जीएसटी के तहत जुड़े हैं, यह जीएसटी का कमाल है। इसके साथ-साथ जो टैक्स कलेक्शन प्रति माह है, उसके लिए पहले कहते थे कि गिर जाएगा, गिर जाएगा। किसी एक महीने में यह 90 हजार करोड़ हुआ, तो बड़े खुश हुए कि देखो *what's the GST result*, लेकिन अब हर माह एक लाख करोड़ रुपए जीएसटी कलेक्शन बढ़ रहा है। यह जीएसटी लागू होने का परिणाम रहा है, इसलिए हम इस बात के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी का अभिनंदन करते हैं। ट्रकों की जो क्षमता है, रोड का रोटेशन है, उनकी *efficiency* 20 परसेंट बढ़ी है, यह जीएसटी का ही कमाल है। सर, दो वर्षों में 105 करोड़ ई-बिल जेनरेट हुए हैं। यह सब जीएसटी के कारण ही संभव हुआ है। इस बजट में *new charter for taxpayers* ले आया गया है। हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जो लाल किले की प्राचीर से बोलते हैं, देशवासियों को संबोधित करते हैं कि *wealth creator* का सम्मान होना चाहिए, *wealth creator* की रिस्पेक्ट होनी चाहिए और *wealth creator* की बहुत बड़ी भूमिका देश के आर्थिक विकास को बढ़ाने में रहती है। उसी के अनुरूप अभी *taxpayer charter* लाने का काम पहली बार हमारी वित्त मंत्री जी ने बजट में किया है, इसलिए मैं आपका अभिनंदन करता हूँ। इससे करोड़ों लोगों के मन में एक शांति, करोड़ों लोगों के मन में एक *confidence* बढ़ेगा और वे आगे और तेज गति से बिज़नेस करेंगे। यह इसलिए लाने की भी आवश्यकता पड़ी, क्योंकि जब एक आम *taxpayer return* छापा डालता है, तो उसके लिए तो प्रावधान होता है कि आप इतने समय के अंदर अपनी अपीलस फाइल करेंगे, लेकिन टैक्स अधिकारियों की कोई *responsibility* नहीं होती थी, टाइम लिमिट नहीं होती थी कि वहे केसेज़ को कब तक सैटल करने का काम करेंगे। ऐसे बहुत सारे केसेज़ थे। उदाहरण के लिए, इनकम टैक्स एक्ट के *Section 154, 251* में, जहाँ हमारे *assesses* के लिए तो टाइम लिमिट थी, लेकिन ऑफिसर्स के लिए कोई टाइम लिमिट नहीं होती थी। इसके माध्यम से उस टाइम लिमिट का प्रावधान आ रहा है। इसके साथ-साथ मैं वित्त मंत्री जी का इसलिए भी अभिनंदन करना चाहूँगा। उन्होंने कहा था कि *harassment* के रूप में, जो सिविल नेचर की गलती होती थी, उसको *criminal proceeding* के अंतर्गत ट्रीट करते थे, लेकिन अब क्रिमिनल नेचर की जो *proceedings* हैं, उनको हटाने का काम किया है। यह कंपनीज़ एक्ट में से भी हटेगा और इनकम टैक्स में से भी हटेगा, इसलिए मैं करोड़ों व्यापारियों की तरफ से प्रधान मंत्री जी का और वित्त मंत्री जी का अभिनंदन करता हूँ। प्रधान मंत्री जी का डिजिटल इंडिया का लक्ष्य लेकर और डिजिटल

[श्री अरुण सिंह]

इंडिया के माध्यम से हम 21वीं शताब्दी के भारत की कल्पना देख रहे हैं, यह प्रधान मंत्री जी का ही फोकस है। उन्होंने पहले faceless scrutiny की बात कही थी, अब faceless appeal भी होगी। यह इस बजट के माध्यम से लाया गया है। जब जीएसटी की स्कीम लाई गई, तो उसका बहुत सारे लोगों ने लाभ लिया। इसके माध्यम से आज 4 लाख, 83 हजार disputes cares विभिन्न टैक्स authorities में, अपीलस में पड़े हुए हैं, उनमें भी राहत मिलेगी, लोग जाएंगे, विवाद से विश्वास में अपनी रिटर्न डालेंगे और उनको इसका लाभ मिलने वाला है, इसलिए मैं इस बात के लिए भी अभिनंदन करना चाहूँगा। पाँच ट्रिलियन डॉलर इकोनॉमी के लिए बहुत जरूरी है कि टैक्स की रेट में कटौती हो। सर, नए उद्योग लग रहे हैं। अगर कहीं 15 परसेंट कॉरपोरेट टैक्स रेट है, तो भारत में है। पूरे विश्व भर में सबसे कम रेट, 15 परसेंट भारत में है। यह हमारी इकोनॉमी को बढ़ाने के लिए उठाया गया कदम है और अभी कह रहे थे कि कदम ही नहीं उठाया गया। इस साहसिक निर्णय के लिए मैं बधाई देता हूँ। पाँच ट्रिलियन डॉलर इकोनॉमी के लिए बहुत बार विपक्ष के लोग कहते हैं कि यह कैसे होगा, क्या होगा, कुछ तो कर ही नहीं रहे हैं? मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि इसके लिए हम काम कर रहे हैं, करते ही रहे हैं, आने वाले पाँच सालों में केवल इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर सेक्टर में 100 लाख करोड़ रुपए खर्च होने वाले हैं, जिससे employment भी मिलेगा, ग्रोथ भी होगी और लोगों की आमदनी भी बढ़ेगी। हम आज विश्व की पाँचवीं आर्थिक शक्ति हैं। जहाँ अमेरिका की 21.4 ट्रिलियन डॉलर की इकोनॉमी है, वहीं चौथे नंबर पर जर्मनी की 3.9 ट्रिलियन डॉलर की इकोनॉमी है। जर्मनी की 3.9 ट्रिलियन डॉलर की इकोनॉमी है, जो कि चौथे नम्बर पर है। भारत की इकोनॉमी 2.9 ट्रिलियन डॉलर की है। उपसभापति जी, मैं बताना चाहूँगा कि जिस प्रकार के कदम उठाए गए हैं, उनसे वह समय बहुत दूर नहीं है, बल्कि आने वाले एक-दो साल में ही हम पाँचवीं से चौथी आर्थिक शक्ति बन जाएँगे। जब हम चौथी आर्थिक शक्ति बन जाएँगे, तब हम तीसरी की ओर बढ़ेंगे।

महोदय, 150 अलग-अलग नई ट्रेनें पीपीपी मॉडल के माध्यम से हम चलाने वाले हैं और 103 लाख करोड़ रुपये इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर सेक्टर में खर्च होने वाले हैं। जहाँ तक गाँवों की बात है, तो अब "डिजिटल इंडिया" के माध्यम से गाँवों को भी जोड़ना चाहिए। इस दिशा में बहुत सारे कदम उठाए गए हैं और उनके अच्छे परिणाम भी सामने आ रहे हैं। अब गाँव शहर से दूर नहीं हैं, क्योंकि जिस प्रकार की टेक्नोलॉजी यहाँ पर है, वही टेक्नोलॉजी गाँवों में भी है। बिना ग्रामीण विकास के हम अपने लक्ष्य को प्राप्त नहीं कर सकते हैं। पहले के समय में इसको पूरे तरीके से छोड़ दिया गया था। अब यहाँ यह लक्ष्य रखा गया है कि एक लाख ग्राम पंचायतों को ऑप्टिकल फाइबर के माध्यम से लिंक किया जाएगा, इसका बजट में प्रोविज़न है।

महोदय, 150 हायर एजुकेशनल इंस्टिट्यूट्स में डिप्लोमा के कोर्स चलाए जाएँगे। पहले यहाँ से लोग बाहर पढ़ने के लिए जाते थे और बाहर के विद्यार्थी भी यहाँ आते थे, लेकिन उनको यह पता नहीं होता था कि कौन-सा एग्जाम दें, किस प्रकार का एग्जाम दें, कहाँ पर पढ़ाई करें, इसलिए यह घोषणा की गई है और बजट में इसके लिए प्रावधान भी है। इसके लिए Ind-SAT की शुरुआत

की गई, जिसमें विश्व भर के विद्यार्थी परीक्षा देंगे। इस तरह, उसमें परीक्षा देने के बाद वे भारत में आकर पढ़ सकते हैं। इसके लिए भी हम सरकार को ढेर सारी बधाई देते हैं। महोदय, हमारा यह मानना है कि जो इंजीनियर्स हैं उनकी प्रैक्टिकल ट्रेनिंग होनी चाहिए। हमको यह मालूम है कि उनके लिए थ्योरेटिकल ट्रेनिंग तो ठीक है, लेकिन उसके साथ-साथ अगर नये इंजीनियर्स को प्रैक्टिकल ट्रेनिंग नहीं दी जाएगी, तो वे किस प्रकार से काम करेंगे? इसलिए जो लोकल बॉडीज़ हैं, उनको भी उनकी एक साल तक की ट्रेनिंग का प्रावधान किया गया है।

महोदय, आज तेजस ट्रेनों की पूरे तरीके से तारीफ हो रही है। जब देश तेज गति से चल रहा है, तब ट्रेनों की स्पीड भी बढ़नी चाहिए। जो नई तेजस ट्रेनें चलाई जाएंगी, उनके माध्यम से यहाँ ढेर सारे पर्यटक आएँगे और उससे देश में रेवेन्यू बढ़ेगा, इस बात का भी बजट में पूरा प्रावधान है, जिसके लिए मैं सरकार को बधाई देना चाहता हूँ।

देश के एससीज़-एसटीज़ के लिए इस बजट में पहले से अधिक प्रावधान हैं। इसमें अनुसूचित जाति और पिछड़े वर्ग के कल्याण-कार्य के लिए 85,000 करोड़ रुपये खर्च करने का लक्ष्य रखा गया है।

मान्यवर, अभी "स्वच्छ भारत अभियान" के संबंध में यह बात हो रही थी कि बहुत सारे टॉयलेट्स बन्द हैं। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि यह मोदी सरकार है, जो पूज्य बापू जी के सपनों को लेकर आगे बढ़ रही है, ताकि भारत स्वच्छ हो। जब देश के प्रधान मंत्री झाड़ू लेकर निकलते हैं, तो देश के 130 करोड़ लोग भी उनके पीछे-पीछे झाड़ू लेकर निकल पड़ते हैं। इस प्रकार, प्रधान मंत्री जी का जो संदेश है, उसे देशवासियों ने पूरा किया है। देश भर में "स्वच्छ भारत अभियान" के अंतर्गत करोड़ों टॉयलेट्स बने हैं और सभी सरकारी स्कूल्स ओडीएफ हो चुके हैं। अभी कहा जा रहा था कि मध्य प्रदेश में बहुत सारे टॉयलेट्स बन्द हैं। मध्य प्रदेश में तो काँग्रेस की सरकार है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अब तो आप कोशिश कीजिए! ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: प्लीज, आप चेयर को ऐड्रेस करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कृपया बैठकर न बोलें। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण सिंह: यह मोदी सरकार है, जो यहाँ से पैसे देने का काम कर रही है। अगर आप उसको इम्प्लिमेंट नहीं कर रहे हैं, तो उसमें कौन दोषी है, कौन जिम्मेदार है? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: कृपया सीट पर बैठकर बात न करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... कोई अन्य बात रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जा रही है।

श्री अरुण सिंह: मान्यवर, मैं मध्य प्रदेश के बारे में कहना चाहूँगा कि मध्य प्रदेश की स्थिति बहुत ही खराब है। वहाँ इस मुद्दे और इस वादे के आधार पर सरकार आई है कि हम किसानों का कर्जा माफ करेंगे, उन्होंने कर्जा माफ नहीं किया। इसके अलावा, उनका वादा था कि हम लोगों को बेरोजगारी भत्ता देंगे, लेकिन आज वहाँ का युवा दर-दर की ठोकरें खा रहा है, क्योंकि उसको बेरोजगारी भत्ता नहीं मिला है। वहाँ सरकारी आदमियों को तनखाह नहीं मिल रही है।

[श्री अरुण सिंह]

इसलिए, आप मध्य प्रदेश, छत्तीसगढ़ और राजस्थान के बारे में न बुलवाइए, तो ठीक है, नहीं तो जिस प्रकार का कुशासन वहाँ पर है, अगर मैं उसके बारे में बोलना शुरू करूँगा तो उसमें आधा घंटा लग जाएगा। इसलिए आप आगे चलिए।

मान्यवर, इस "स्वच्छ भारत अभियान" के अंतर्गत इस बजट में 12,300 करोड़ रुपये का एलोकेशन "स्वच्छ भारत मिशन" के लिए किया गया है, जिसके लिए मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी की तारीफ करता हूँ और वित्त मंत्री जी का अभिनंदन करता हूँ। स्टार्टअप इंडिया, स्टैंडअप इंडिया, डिजिटल इंडिया आदि का प्रोत्साहन करने के लिए बजट में प्रावधान किया गया है, इसलिए मैं इस बजट की तारीफ करता हूँ। हमारे जो बहुत सारे *redundant sections* थे, जिनका कोई महत्व नहीं था, वे सेक्शंस धीरे-धीरे समाप्त हो रहे हैं।

श्री उपसभापति: माननीय अरुण जी, आपका समय समाप्त हो रहा है।

श्री अरुण सिंह: माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, मैं अंत में एक लाइन ज़रूर कहूँगा कि जिस प्रकार से प्रधान मंत्री जी इस देश को आगे बढ़ा रहे हैं और जिस प्रकार से यह बजट लाया गया है, विवेकानंद जी ने जिस 21वीं शताब्दी के भारत की बात की थी, वैसी शताब्दी भारत की ज़रूर होगी। मैं दिनकर जी की कविता के साथ अपनी बात को समाप्त करना चाहूँगा। दिनकर जी ने कहा था कि:-

"वसुधा का नेता कौन हुआ?
भूखण्ड-विजेता कौन हुआ?
अतुलित यश क्रेता कौन हुआ?
नव-धर्म प्रणेता कौन हुआ?
जिसने न कभी आराम किया,
विघ्नों में रहकर नाम किया।"

महोदय, ऐसे हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी हैं, जो देश को 21वीं शताब्दी में ले जा रहे हैं।

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA (West Bengal): Hon. Deputy Chairman, Sir, this august House is witnessing the deliberations on the General Budget presented by hon. Finance Minister, Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman. It was the longest Budget Speech spanning 2 hours 40 minutes. It was an unprecedented presentation in the Parliament. The people of India expected as well as waited for her deliberation, and, they wanted to see how the Budget would save them from the serious economic crisis precipitated for the last few years under the regime of this Government. Apart from the farmers, labourers, youth, students and women, the industry, trade and every other sector, be it mining or whatever, were waiting what Madam Sitharamanji will offer to revive the

Indian economy, which is in deep crisis, which is in the ICU. I was listening to the Shri Chidambaram who was very categorically explaining every bit of the Budget deficiency and the way the Indian economy is suffering. The three themes of the Budget are, (i) Aspirational India, (ii) Economic Development, and, (iii) Caring Society. On these three doctrines, the hon. Finance Minister has planned out the entire Budget presentation in different columns in her two-hour-forty-minute speech.

Now, let us analyse the real state of affairs of the Indian economy. Shri Chidambaram has spoken very widely but, still, I will try my best to focus on the point how Indian economy is reeling in different sectors. The most important contributing factor of Indian economy is agriculture. India lives in villages. The villagers and farmers grow food for the entire nation, due to which we survive. What is the state of affairs of the Indian farmers? For the last few years, due to debt burden, in different States, more than 65,000 farmers have committed suicide; the highest was in Maharashtra during the regime of the BJP.

Sir, let me talk about my State, West Bengal. When I was studying the state of affairs of farmers of West Bengal, comparatively, I found that hon. Chief Minister, Mamata Banerjee, offered so many beneficial schemes, economically beneficial schemes, which are sustainable and helpful for survival of the farmers in a good way. What was that? We contributed *Krishak Bandhu* which is not present in the Indian budgetary provision. We provided ₹2,00,000 compensation to the family member of any deceased farmer. This is non-existent in the Indian budgetary provision.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN, (SHRIMATI KAHKASHAN PERWEEN), *in the Chair*]

We provided totally ₹5,000, ₹2,500 each in two episodes, in a year to the farmers which is non-significant in the Indian budgetary provision. We provided that no farmer should give any mutation charge and he or she is relieved from land revenue in West Bengal which is non-existent in Indian budgetary provision and in most of the States. She provided all sorts of assurances and protective measures for MSP to sell paddy at the centres which is non-existent in the Indian budgetary provision.

Madam, the agricultural contribution to the GDP growth has come down to 2.1 per cent. This is a serious situation. India and its economy are reeling along with agriculture sector.

Coming to industry, the industrial health is in a serious situation. Most of the traders and industrialists, numbering 28, looted India and banks and flew away from

[Shri Manas Ranjan Bhunia]

the country and the Government could not do anything or could not touch a single person. The contribution of banks to industry is slowing down and as a result the industrial contribution of GDP has come down to 4.1 per cent. The result is that unemployment is rising and it is at its peak. What is that? In the last 45 years, it is the highest unemployment percentage observed which is 6.1 per cent. This Government in its first term assured and declared that 2 crore jobs would be given to Indian unemployed youths per year. Then at the end of sixth year, this Government should come out with the figures of 12 crore jobs offered to the Indian unemployed youths. What is the situation? The situation, according to the Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy Report, is that one crore people have become jobless from their services and there was no job offered to the unemployed youths in the last few years. The unemployed youths who expected something from this Government and the Budget did not get a single point. The situation is serious on economic front in relation to the employment situation.

Mining, electricity, all these sectors, as elaborated by Mr. Chidambaram, have come down precipitately. This includes the picture how Indian economy is drowning. What is the reflection? The reflection is that the GDP has come down from their expectation of 6.1 per cent to 4.5 per cent. Is it the healthy economic situation projected by the hon. Finance Minister in her Budget speech? The growth of real GDP for the second quarter of 2019-20 was 4.5 per cent as compared to 7 per cent in the corresponding period of previous year. Consumer price inflation stood at 5.5 per cent. In November 2019, as compared to 4.6 per cent in October in 2019, as per the the Index of Industrial Production, growth contracted. I repeat, the Index of Industrial Production growth contracted by 3.8 per cent during October, 2019 as compared to 8.4 per cent during October, 2018.

Madam, food inflation based on Consumer Food Price Index, CFPI, increased to 10 per cent in November, 2019 as compared to 7.9 per cent in October, 2019. It is mainly due to increase in inflation of cereals, milk products, oils, fats, vegetables, pulses, spices, sugar and confectionery. These materials are used by all households in India, may it be in villages or may it be in urban areas. This is the situation. So, what is the effect? The growth rate in all sectors has come down and reached its precipitating level. In the second quarter of 2019, agriculture was 2.1 per cent, service was 6.8 per cent and GDP has reached 4.5 per cent. As a result, the projected revenue mop-up by

different tax collection, direct and indirect, has come down. The revenue deficit has reached 13 per cent. It has reached 13 per cent. Fiscal deficit has reached 12.7 per cent. As a result, the entire economic process, the entire budgetary provision, is in a dreamline, not in reality. It touched the dreamline but it did not touch the reality. As a result, Indian economy is contracting.

Madam, an economic picture is reflected by its performance. What is the performance? The Finance Minister mentioned aspirational India, development and caring society. What is the aspiration of India? It is that the youth will get jobs; they are not getting. It is that farmers will get advantageous loans; they did not get. Unemployed youths, proceedings towards business and trade forums, are deprived. The labourers are laid off; they are not getting jobs in the future planning of the economy under the Indian budgetary provision. So, our country is heading towards a situation of complete economic collapse, which needs a real doctor to supervise its revival and which is not at all noticed by us in the Budget Speech of the Finance Minister.

Madam, why is there a situation of lack of revenue mop-up in different sectors? If we understand and analyse, we will find how we were lagging behind and how we are marching towards the negative phase. The Budget target was ₹24,61,195 crore. What was mopped up as gross tax revenue? It was ₹21,63,483 crore. So, what is the revenue deficit? The revenue deficit is more than ₹6.50 lakh crore. Fiscal deficit is coming down to ₹7 lakh crore. How can the Indian economy stand with healthy figures, healthy signs and symptoms to run the country and to cover up the entire economic deficits of our country? It cannot; it cannot. It cannot be an aspirational economy.

It cannot be a developmental economy. It cannot be a caring society economy as desired by Madam Sitharamanji in her Budget speech.

Madam, let us look at the contribution of the Central Government to the States on different sectors. The caring society economy! How they are very much careful and sensitive to the economic support and financial support to the State Governments. For the Central sector schemes, the budget provision was ₹8,70,794 crore. It has come down to revised ₹7,73,196 crores. It has come down. The Centrally-sponsored schemes were targeted at ₹3,31,610 crores. It has also come down. The Finance Commission's grant was targeted at ₹1,20,456 crores. It has also come down. I am very surprised that the Fifteenth Finance Commission has advised that 42 per cent of the Central share to the

[Shri Manas Ranjan Bhunia]

States would be slashed to 41 per cent. How can it be? How would the State Governments survive? It is not a question of this Government or that Government. It is a question of the right of the Government constitutionally. It is the constitutional right of the State Government. From the side of Finance Commission, they are, in advance, speaking in a negative way that we cannot support you with 42 per cent of our sources, that it would be slashed to 41 per cent. Can it be accepted by all the State Governments cutting across political lines? Can it be? So, this is the situation. The subsidy on food has been cut down. In respect of the farmers, who produce the paddy, *gehun* and other cereals and which, in turn, are going to the recipients in the village, in the city, in the urban area, the National Food Security Act has been challenged by this Government. It has been belittled by this Government. Poorest of the poor people would be taking less food at high prices. What is the situation? For the food subsidy, the budgeted provision was ₹1,84,220 crores. It has come down to ₹1,15,570 crores. What is the situation? The people of India would get less food at high prices simultaneously. Would it be accepted by the people of India? Is it the reflection of a caring society symbol? Can it be like that? So, it should not be.

Madam, regarding the Ministry of Rural Development, the main engine of employment generation in rural areas and urban areas is MGNREGA Government and MGNREGA are one. What is the situation? ₹71,000 crores was spent this financial year. What has been suggested for MGNREGA? It is ₹61,500 crores and ₹9,500 crores has been cut down from this firing engine of employment generation in whole of India, may it be in the rural India, may it be in urban India. What is the explanation of the hon. Finance Minister? What is the explanation? ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR): You want me to respond to it now or do you want me to respond to it later?

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA: No, no. You can respond during your speech.

SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR: Okay.

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA: What is the explanation? It is a clear symbol and reflects on that. ...(*Interruptions*)... This Government has tremendously neglected on MGNREGA Project which is ultimately depriving the people of India, people of rural

India and people of urban India. ...(*Interruptions*)... What is this? It is the main firing engine of employment generation in the Indian economy.

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर: उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, मैं इस संबंध में एक स्पष्टीकरण देना चाहता हूँ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन): नहीं-नहीं। आप अपने जवाब में दे दीजिएगा।

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA: Madam, Pradhan Mantri-Kisan, what is the effect? An amount of rupees Seventy Five Thousand Crores was allocated to provide financial help to the *Kisans* of India. Where we landed? We landed at ₹ 54,000 crores and it has ended in this financial year. Is it the proper attentive project of this Government of India to put the farmers of India in a very beautiful situation and in a caring society mode? The answer is 'No'.

Madam, regarding industry, since Independence, so many public sector undertakings were built to grow the economy; to provide employment; to stabilize the Indian economic situation; to be independent and to be more sovereign in our attitude for industrialization. What is going on? What is going on is every profit-making PSU is going to be disinvested. What was the target of disinvestment, and how much disinvestment was done last year? It reached only ₹ 65,000 crores, out of ₹ 1 lakh crore. This year, in Budget, the Government has targeted ₹ 2,10,000 crores for disinvestment mop-up. What are the industries which are being included in their disinvestment list to fulfill the financial hunger of this Government? This Government is tremendously hungry financially. They cannot do anything positive. They want to destroy the basic structure of industrialization through disinvestment of the Central PSUs in our country. LIC provides life insurance before the death and after the death also to the family. But, a situation has been created by this Government for LIC that LIC has no life insurance. It has to be finished by this Government. It is the most valuable company of our country. ...(*Interruptions*)... Madam, they are going to sell out Air India. They are going to sell out BSNL. They are going to sell out MTNL. They are, I read it a few days back, going to have 5 per cent sell out disinvestment even in SAIL. Where do we stand? How is the Government proceeding towards future to revive the economic situation of our country? Can it be like that? The answer is 'No'.

Madam, now, I will come to the allocation and revised allocation of the different Departments. What is the situation? The situation is that for the National Education Mission, the allocation was ₹ 38,547 crores. In the Revised Estimates, it has come down

[Shri Manas Ranjan Bhunia]

to ₹ 37,000 crores. Education is also hit. It did not pay much attention to it. And, Madam, provision of ₹ 33,661 crores for the National Health Mission. The allocation for *Pradhan Mantri Fasal Bima Yojana*, that is किसानों के लिए, was ₹14,000 crore. It has come down to ₹13,641 crore, that is, for AMRUT and Smart City Mission, the allocation was ₹13,750 crore. It has come down to ₹9,842 crores. For *Swachh Bharat Mission*, the allocation was ₹12,561 crores. It has come down to ₹9,965 crores. For *Pradhan Mantri Krishi Sinchayee Yojana*, for farmers, it was estimated to ₹9,682 crores. In the revised estimate, it has come down to ₹7,896 crores. For Mid-Day Meal programme, it was ₹11,000 crores. It has come down to ₹9,912 crores. In this way, if I read out, there are 46 departmental budgetary provisions which in their revised estimates have come down to the bottom level creating economic instability and social unrest in our Indian economy. This is a very serious situation. A very serious situation is going on. Mr. Arun Singh spoke in his Budget speech that the previous Government raised the slogan "गरीबी हटाओ"। गरीबी नहीं हटी, गरीबी बढ़ गई। Sitaramanji told in her Budget speech that from 2006 to 2016, 270 million people came above the poverty line through different schemes. What is the base of her argument and speech? She spoke about the growth engine of the Indian economy. Almost no growth engine is firing; consumption is slowing with new jobs difficult to find, CAPEX continues to slip despite the famed Ease of Doing Business and exports are actually contracting due to India's lack of competitiveness and big infra-bureaucratic bottlenecks. Madam, this is the situation. The 'Make in India' slogan has been converted to the heading 'Assemble in India'. Where is the 'Make in India' slogan? It has been evaporated. Now, the 'Make in India' slogan has been leading towards 'Assemble in India' and I apprehend, in my own analysis, after the episode of US-China relationship and its aftermath effects of the economy in industrial production, may it be 'make in' or may it be 'assemble in', India cannot take advantage of the situation of post US-China economic confrontation. It should be addressed properly. Dr. Manmohan Singh, the former Prime Minister and Finance Minister is sitting here. He knows and he repeatedly said that demonetisation is a monumental blunder. The people of India said and our leader, Chief Minister, Mamata Banerjee first raised her voice that it is a serious situation created by demonetisation by this Government. The effect of demonetisation was that more than 150 people committed suicides, standing on the roads, in front of the banks. So many farmers committed suicides on the fields and in the houses, and it had been followed by the hasty decision of the GST implementation. It was celebrated in the mid night

in Parliament saying that we are going to 'One Nation, One Tax regime.' What is the effect? Lakhs of crores of rupees are not paid to the State Governments, and all the State Governments have been suffering for the economic crisis due to non-cooperation, non distribution, and non-allocation of the GST cess to the State Governments by the Central Government. What is the situation? The situation is, GST mop up is less; CGST mop up is less, and IGST mop up is also less. Is it the reflection of the economy? Nobody can deny what is happening now at this moment.

Now, come to the banks. This is the 50th year of the bank nationalization which was done by Shrimati Indira Gandhi in 1969. Today, standing on the present situation, what is the situation? The NPAs of the banks are ₹ 7,64,000 crore. The amount of fraudulent loans given to the fraudsters, who looted the country and flew away from our country, and settled in different countries of the world, the Government could not do anything to them, is to the tune of ₹ 6,00,000 crore. And after that, the Government has planned to merge ten banks into four banks, according to their economic idea. I do not know what purpose will be served by this merger. So many scams are there. The bank employees are protesting; bank officers are protesting; they are threatened, and psychologically, they have become fear-psychotic patients and do not know what to do. They are not signing any bank papers. Every time, they are at the gun point, for enquiry and punishment. In this situation, we are watching the collapse of entire economy in front of us day by day, but, the Government is not in a mood to admit it. Mr. P. Chidambaram has said it correctly that it would be better if the Government admit the mistake committed by it, but, they are not in that mood to admit the mistake. They say, "We are like a Spanish Bull. We will move in the future with our own agenda. Country's future, country's prosperity, country's economic development is the second agenda." ...(*Time-bell rings*)... So, I fear that novel Coronavirus has created a pandemic situation in China and will engulf the population of 29 countries. ...(*Interruptions*)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन): मानस जी, आप कृपया समाप्त करें, क्योंकि आपकी पार्टी से एक और सदस्य को बोलना है।

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA: Madam, I suspect another virus in our country, that is, financial coronavirus, which originated from North Block, is destroying the entire economy of our country. Who will save our country? I do not know. It is the people who will save our country and the Indian economy will be resilient enough in future. Thank you, Madam.

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN (Tamil Nadu): Thank you, Madam, for giving me this opportunity to speak. I welcome this Budget. It is really a growth-oriented Budget. The internationally well-known financial expert, Dr. Manmohan Singh, is present here. I am thankful to him. Because I don't know finance or economics. I know a little bit of law. I am in the learning process. My views are not subject to correction, but the facts are subject to correction. My reading of the newspapers is that the entire world is suffering from slowdown. There is unemployment in America and banks have collapsed in China; also, there is no rule of law over there. These were the only two countries which were in the forefront, but they are now competing with India, as I have understood. The slowdown or the banking crisis, unemployment are all global factors also. It is not only specific to India.

My humble submission is, on aspirational India, our hon. Prime Minister has created an awareness among all the citizens of India about the potential of the Indian economy. It is the greatest achievement. Under Jan Dhan Yojana, bank accounts got opened for the rural people, empowering the poor and illiterate Indians. Now, they have come to understand that one should have a bank account to get benefits and to prosper. In the economic terms, it is called financial inclusion. I think, creating awareness is privy to real economic empowerment of Indian citizens. From what are the Indian citizens suffering? It is ignorance. It is not money; it is not the want of skills in the corporate parlance. But, they are suffering from ignorance and there was a psychological barrier of thinking, 'We cannot reach that; we cannot go there; we cannot meet it.' But, that psychological barrier has now been removed, totally removed. There is a transparent India. Any citizen can get any particulars. The press is also free to write whatever it thinks is right.

So, my humble submission is, this is transparent India. Now it is 'Aware Indian'. The credit goes to our hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi, because he is really the one and the only world leader. China now is suffering from virus. America is afraid of Trump himself. There is no other enemy to America. He says that he wants to protect the American citizens. From whom? What are the problems that the Americans are suffering from? Why does Trump want to protect America? America is the number one economy in the whole world. It is dictating terms. Why is he taking such protective steps? Our hon. Prime Minister, rightly, has not signed the RCEP. By that way, our Prime Minister protected Indian agriculturists and dairy farmers. He understood because our Prime Minister thinks like a common man. He understands things from a common man's

1.00 P.M.

point of view. On that basis, he is taking decisions and implementing them. He is travelling all over the world and exhibiting the Indian greatness. There is no doubt about it. The Indian spirit cannot be brought down by any force on this earth. Each and every country is undergoing a crisis of leadership. But, it is not so in the case of India. This is my humble opinion. That is why I am saying this.

I think, it is also an innovation to identify Aspirational Districts. The Aspirational Districts have been identified by the Union of India. It is empowering the Aspirational Districts in all aspects. Our Finance Minister has introduced a scheme, 'One district, one product.' ...(Interruptions)... In her Budget Speech, the Finance Minister has introduced one district one product. That is very much needed. What is decentralization, in fact? What is the administrative action? These are all empowering the common man. So, we must educate the common man. That is the real empowerment.

Now, Madam, I would like to request the Central Government on behalf of the Government of Tamil Nadu.

So, my humble submission would be, there is no. ...(Time-bell rings)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन): नवनीत जी...

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: One minute, Madam. How many minutes have I taken?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्रीमती कहकशां परवीन): अभी lunch break होगा। उसके बाद आप continue करेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)... Lunch break के बाद आप continue करेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI A. NAVANEETHAKRISHNAN: I will continue then, Madam. Three minutes of my time should be extended.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI KAHKASHAN PERWEEN): The House stands adjourned till 2.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned for lunch at one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at two of the clock,

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair*