

REGARDING A RECENT JUDGEMENT OF SUPREME COURT ON RESERVATION

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have received notice from Shri K.K. Ragesh, Shri P.L. Punia and Shri Binoy Viswam regarding the recent Supreme Court judgement on reservation. You know that we do not have Question Hour and other things today. They can mention it during their Budget. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just hear me. ...*(Interruptions)*... They can just mention the issue before the Budget discussion. Then, we can move on because we have no chance of going through the judgement and also understand its implications and all, and, it is not the practice also to immediately comment on the Supreme Court judgement. So, Mr. Ragesh, just make a mention; no comments. Just mention the issue.

SHRI K.K. RAGESH (Kerala): Sir, I will take a minute only. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, the Supreme Court has recently ...*(Interruptions)*...

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद): सर, मैं इसमें डिस्टर्ब नहीं करूँगा, लेकिन मैं एक मिनट में अपनी बात बताना चाहूँगा।

सर, पहली दफा किसी स्टेट गवर्नमेंट ने यह कहा कि एससी-एसटी को रिज़र्वेशन का फंडामेंटल राइट नहीं है।...*(व्यवधान)*...

†قائد حزب اختلاف (جناب غلام نبی آزاد): سر، میں اس میں ڈسٹرب نہی کروں گا، لیکن
میں ایک منٹ میں اپنی بات بتانا چاہوں گا۔
سر، پہلی دفعہ کسری اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ نے یہ کہا کہ ایس۔سی۔ایس۔ٹی کو
رزرویشن کا فنڈامینٹل رائٹ نہی ہے۔۔۔*(مداخلت)*...

पर्यावरण, वन और जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्री; सूचना और प्रसारण मंत्री; तथा भारी उद्योग और लोक उद्यम मंत्री (श्री प्रकाश जावडेकर): सर, * ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Javadekar, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Then, I have to stop this and go to the Budget discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... What is the point? ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, * ...*(व्यवधान)*...

†Transliteration in Urdu script.

*Not recorded

श्री सभापति: इतना detail में नहीं जाना है। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, इन्होंने कहा न? ... (व्यवधान)...

†جناب غلام نبی آزاد : سر، انہوں نے کہا نا؟ --- (مداخلت)---

श्री सभापति: उन्होंने जो कहा, तो फिर वह भी रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जाएगा। ... (व्यवधान)...

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: सर, उन्होंने उत्तराखंड सरकार की तरफ से सुप्रीम कोर्ट में कहा कि एससी-एसटी के लिए सर्विसेज़ में रिज़र्वेशन फंडामेंटल राइट नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)...

†جناب غلام نبی آزاد : سر، انہوں نے اتر اکھنڈ سرکار کی طرف سے سپریم کورٹ می کہا کہ ایس-سی۔ ایس-ٹی کے لئے سروسز می رزرویشن فنڈامینٹل رائٹ نہی ہے --- (مداخلت)---

MR. CHAIRMAN: When we take up that issue then we can discuss it. ... (Interruptions)... I have not allowed discussion on that issue. ... (Interruptions)... As the Leader of the Opposition, you have a right to mention it, and I permitted you to just mention it.

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: और दुर्भाग्य से सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने भी यही कहा कि ये स्टेट गवर्नमेंट का jurisdiction है कि वह रिज़र्वेशन देगी। ... (व्यवधान)...

†جناب غلام نبی آزاد : اور بدقسمتی سے سپریم کورٹ نے بھی کہا کہ یہ اسٹیٹ گورنمنٹ کا jurisdiction ہے کہ وہ رزرویشن دے گی --- (مداخلت)---

MR. CHAIRMAN: Somebody may raise some issue but the Court is free to make its own observation. ... (Interruptions)... Shri K.K. Ragesh.

श्री गुलाम नबी आज़ाद: यह बहुत दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण बात है कि एससी और एसटीज़ को रिज़र्वेशन से वंचित किया जा रहा है। ... (व्यवधान)...

†جناب غلام نبی آزاد : یہ بہت بدقسمتی کی بات ہے کہ ایس-سی۔ اور ایس-ٹی کو رزرویشن سے ونچت کی جا رہا ہے --- (مداخلت)---

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ghulam Nabi ji, please. इसमें हम लोगों ने अभी तक कोई मोशन एडमिट नहीं किया है। Just mention it to bring it to the notice.

SHRI K.K. RAGESH: Sir, the Supreme Court's recent decision is very serious. The verdict saying that the States are not bound to provide reservation and in promotions

†Transliteration in Urdu script.

also.. It is a constitutional mandate, constitutional right. OBCs and SCs and STs are provided reservation. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Right. So you want this issue to be discussed. Right. Shri Satish Chandra Misra. Shri Ragesh and Shri Binoy Viswam. ...(Interruptions)... No comment. ...(Interruptions)... I will not allow any comment to be made against the Supreme Court. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI P.L. PUNIA: Sir, ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your Leader has spoken. ...(Interruptions)... Punia ji, please. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SATISH CHANDRA MISRA (Uttar Pradesh): Sir, on account of this judgment, which says that it is not a fundamental right...(Interruptions)... It is in Part III of the Constitution. ...(Interruptions)... Article 16 is part of it. ...(Interruptions)... That is why we are demanding that there should be reservation in higher judiciary, including the Supreme Court and High Court. ...(Interruptions)... At least they may be heard. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, Misra ji. ...(Interruptions)... Right. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray. ...(Interruptions)... No comment against the Supreme Court will go on record. ...(Interruptions)... Without my admitting a motion and also permission for discussion...(Interruptions)... I have allowed just to mention it. ...(Interruptions)... Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray. ...(Interruptions)... He has to raise another issue. ...(Interruptions)...

प्रो. राम गोपाल यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश): यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Ram Gopal ji, please. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, मैंने नोटिस दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House has to be adjourned and then you decide whatever...(Interruptions)... If ten Members stand up and then shout at me...(Interruptions)...

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया: सर, मैंने नोटिस दिया है। ...(व्यवधान)... Sir, I have given a notice. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, you have called my name. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have called the Leader of the Opposition...*(Interruptions)*... He is from your party. ...*(Interruptions)*... प्लीज़, आप बैठ जाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... I will not allow. ...*(Interruptions)*... बैठ जाइए। ...*(व्यवधान)*... This will not go on record. Today is Budget discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is important. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, this is altogether a different thing. This is a humanitarian cause.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Quickly. The issue on which you are speaking has not been admitted.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, 160 Indian crew members, including Binay Kumar Sarkar, a resident of Uttar Dinajpur in West Bengal, have sent an SOS from a private cruise liner Diamond Princess which was quarantined at Yokohama Port in Japan as 62 passengers, including some crew members, have been diagnosed with coronavirus. These Indian crew members are required to be shifted from the ship immediately to an isolated place, so that they can avoid getting infected with the virus. And if they are tested negative after proper medical examination, arrangement should be made for their return to India. I appeal to the Government, through you, Sir, on humanitarian ground to avoid any loss of life and to take an initiative. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You can send your slips for associating with it.

SHRI MANAS RANJAN BHUNIA (West Bengal): Sir, I associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member.

SHRIMATI SHANTA CHHETRI (West Bengal): Sir, I also associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member.

SHRI MD. NADIMUL HAQUE (West Bengal): Sir, I also associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member.

MS. DOLA SEN (West Bengal): Sir, I also associate myself with the mention made by the hon. Member.

श्री पी.एल. पुनिया: सर, मैंने नोटिस दिया है। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have not permitted. Once the Leader of a particular party speaks, that mean the party view has come.

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्री (श्री थावरचंद गहलोत): माननीय सभापति महोदय, सुप्रीम कोर्ट के सात फरवरी, 2020 के फैसले के तारतम्य में जो विषय अभी सदन में उठाया गया, मैं माननीय सदस्यों को यह बताना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार इस निर्णय पर, इस फैसले पर गंभीरता से विचार कर रही है और इस संबंध में हम आज ही दो बजे सरकार का मंतव्य सदन के सामने प्रस्तुत करेंगे।

MR. CHAIRMAN: General Discussion on the Union Budget. Shri P. Chidambaram ji. ...*(Interruptions)*... You cannot dictate to me. I have said I have not admitted the motion. He said that he would be going to respond at 2 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*... At 2 o'clock, when he makes Government statement, you can seek clarifications. ...*(Interruptions)*.. You and Mr. Viswam and others also can seek clarifications. Punia ji, I have been allowing you on each and every issue. Today also I was intending to allow you but the Leader of the Opposition asked for it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will be allowing you at 2 o'clock. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI BINOY VISWAM (Kerala): Sir,...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Viswam, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... It will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sometimes you want me to do it like this. Now, General Discussion on Union Budget, 2020-21. Shri P. Chidambaram to initiate the Discussion.

THE UNION BUDGET, 2020-21

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Maharashtra): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have listened to the hon. Finance Minister very carefully on television when she read out her Budget Speech.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair*)

At the end of 160 minutes, she was tired; so were we, tired and exhausted. I hope that she has recovered from her exhaustion. The question that remains in my mind is: What was the hon. Finance Minister trying to say? If you take 160 minutes to read a speech and then a few pages of that speech are left unread, what is the narrative or what is the story that you are trying to say? I was happy that she did not, at any point, in her speech say, "अच्छे दिन आने वाले हैं।" It is good that they have forgotten that