

जाएगा, वह कभी भी नहीं होना चाहिए। सभापति जी, यह बात कह कर मैं अपनी स्पीच समाप्त करता हूँ - जय हिंद and thank you very much.

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, today morning, the Business Advisory Committee met, discussed and came to the conclusion that the discussion on Budget and reply will be completed by tomorrow. The sitting on Saturday will not be there. Third, there is no Private Members' Business Bill. Fourth, today, we will sit up to 3 o'clock so that Members may get an opportunity. Reply by the Minister will also be tomorrow so that Members may be ready. At what time exactly, we will decide. Then, about Discussion on Ministries. After tomorrow's sitting, there will be a gap and thereafter the House will meet again. Certain suggestions were given. They are being discussed with other parties. Who will initiate which subject is also under discussion. Once it is finalized, it will be informed.

THE UNION BUDGET 2021-22 - *Contd.*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shrimati Vandana Chavan.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN (Maharashtra): Sir, this Budget 2021-22 comes at an extremely crucial time when the world and our country are going through very, very trying times.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY) *in the Chair.*]

Sadly, the year 2020 was a complete washout and, therefore, the people of this country look at this Budget with great hopes and aspirations. Covid taught us several life lessons. At the same time, on the one side, we witnessed that nature was blooming because man was imprisoned in his own home; on the other side, in spite of being in our own homes, we saw that there were several climate events which happened in our country. Super cyclone Amphan had a speed of 260 kilometres per hour which actually razed Odisha, your State, and West Bengal. Then, there was Nisarga on western coast, having a speed of 118 kilometres per hour which affected Maharashtra and, Mumbai the most, where we had the maximum Covid cases in the country. There was an observation made by Yuval Noah Harari, the historian and

philosopher, and author of a famous book. I would like to quote him because I feel what he said is very relevant. During the lockdown, he said that the storm will pass but the choices we make now could change our lives for the years to come. I think as far as India is concerned, this Budget is the first ever document after Covid which really sets a roadmap as to how our country needs to go ahead and what are the choices that we are going to make.

Sir, climate change poses one of the biggest challenges to mankind. It challenges our very existence; our future is at stake. Countries all over the world are declaring climate emergencies. India is one of the hotspots and vulnerable to climate change. Sir, I feel sad that there is no mention of this impending danger in the Budget Speech or the book that we have got. In the short time that I have been allocated, I wish to focus my interventions on the issue of environment and climate change. I wish to flag four observations which go to expose our missing sensitivity to the impending issue and show that our choices are blatantly out of place. On the one side, where environment is failing us or we are failing the environment, it is an irony that we have reduced the Budget allocation for the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change. Sir, the total budgetary allocation for the Ministry is Rs.2,869.93 crore this year as against Rs.3,100 crore last year. So, there is a drastic reduction of Rs.230 crore. It is extremely disappointing.

The second point, which I want to make, is about air pollution. We know and keep reading that our cities, the Indian cities, are becoming gas chambers. According to the Lancet Planetary Health Report released in December, 2020, air pollution claimed 1.7 million lives in India in 2018. Another Report -- Global Burden of Disease Report in 2017 -- says that air pollution kills one child every three minutes in India. In this Budget, the Government has allocated Rs.2,217 crores to tackle pollution in 42 cities. Last year, it had accounted for Rs.4,400 crores for clean air. We do not know how that amount was utilized and even if it was utilized, it is sad to see that amongst the worst polluted countries over the world, 15 cities are housed in India. According to the Greenpeace India's Annual Report 2020, 231 out of 287 major cities, which were studied, had PM10 levels exceeding the 60 unit level prescribed by the CPCB under the National Ambient Air Quality Standards. So, we have 231 cities which are already killing people and, here, we only try to address 42 cities which, again, is a matter of great concern.

My third point, is regarding the loss of GDP. According to the Lancet Planetary Health Report, India has lost 1.4 per cent of the GDP due to premature deaths and morbidity from air pollution. To understand this better, because one does not understand how much 1.4 per cent of GDP means in monetary terms, this is

equivalent to Rs.2,60,000 crores in monetary terms. And to understand it still better, it means more than four times of the allocation for Healthcare in the last year's Budget. So, this is something again which is a matter of great concern. If we have to see the loss percentage of GDP in the States, U.P. tops it with 2.2 per cent loss and Bihar has 2 per cent loss of GDP.

Sir, my fourth point is regarding the economic loss due to climate change. According to the Global Climate Risk Index 2020, India suffered an economic loss of 37 billion dollars due to climate change in 2018 alone. Apart from several climate disasters in various parts of our country, the glaring ones were the worst ever flood in hundred years in Kerala which claimed 324 lives, damaged 20,000 houses and 80 dams. There was a migration of 2,20,000 people. They were forced to migrate out of their habitats. Losses due to these amounted to 2.8 billion dollars. In the same year, India also experienced heat waves with temperatures above 50 degree centigrade in various parts of our country. ...(Time bell rings)... Sir, I have some eight minutes, I was told.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): No, no. It is seven minutes.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN: Sir, in how many minutes do I have to finish it?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Only one minute is left.

SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN: Sir, please let me finish it. Chennai, which has a million population, ran out of water and it had to be transported from outside. The message is loud and clear. We know that all these are results of reckless damage to the environment. We have been alarmed time and again by experts and scientists but sadly we do not pay heed. And worst, still we continue to carry destruction unabated even today. To cite a few projects, the Char Dham Pariyojana in Uttarakhand side, where a massive 900 kilometre length road is being made in the Himalayan ecological sensitive region with blatant violations of the law, the declassification of salt pans into wetlands. We are diluting the EIA norms, the NGT norms, the CRZ norms, the National Forest Policy. The dense forests in the country, especially, Chhattisgarh, are being opened up for coal mines. The Government is hoping to denotify the Kachhua Wildlife Sanctuary and several other sanctuaries. ...(Time- bell rings)...

Sir, this is my last point. I urge the Government to ponder, introspect, analyze and decide what is the path that we need to take. And this is something that is

absolutely important. I would end my speech by quoting a paragraph from the book 'Hot, Flat and Crowded' authored by Thomas Friedman. He says: "Imagine a world without forests. Imagine a world without corals. Imagine a world without fish. Imagine a world where rivers flow only in the rainy season. Not only is that possible in more and more places, it is possible in our lifetime."

So, Sir, I urge the Ministry and the Minister, let us wake up. Let us bring the issue of climate change at centre-stage. Only then the State Governments, local Governments, the private sector and individuals would really wake up to this need. There is no time to lose. We have to act now for the future of our generations. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, for allowing me to speak on the Union Budget. Due to the effect of the COVID-19, the country is passing through a very critical time. Madam Finance Minister, I must compliment you in this critical juncture, you placed a wonderful and a good Budget. Madam Finance Minister and Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, the Budget is a growth-oriented Budget. The Budget is for *Atmanirbhar Bharat* Budget. The Budget is for infrastructural development in our country. The Budget is also going to give and create new job opportunities which should be helpful for the unemployment youth of our country. When Budget has decided to expand the capital expenditure, automatically, it will reduce inflation in our country. Madam Finance Minister, in her Budget, proposed 137 per cent hike in the health sector, and the Government is going to spend near about Rs. 2,23,846 crores in this year, which is higher by 137 per cent when compared with the previous year. Our India is a welfare country. It is the duty of the Government to protect life of every Indian citizen. Under the leadership of *Pradhan Mantri Narendra Modi ji*, the Government is working in this right direction.

Sir, I am Indian, and I am proud to be an Indian. Our Government is going to spend Rs. 35,000 crores for Covid vaccines, and fifty crore people of our country will be covered through the Covid vaccines, which are produced by our country. I remembered when Covid had started, people were trying to get masks and people were trying to get sanitizers, etc. But, today, India is not only producing masks, India is also exporting that, and India is also producing the Covid vaccine, and that is the great example of *Atmanirbhar Bharat*. So, I compliment the hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi for this. Unemployment is one of the greatest challenges for the nation. The Government has decided to increase the capital expenditure. When the capital expenditure is going to be increased, automatically, there will be new railway stations, new airports and new shipping ports are coming up, which means,

automatically, jobs will be created there. When capital expenditure is increased, automatically, jobs will be there and, to some extent, it will be helpful in curbing unemployment in our country.

Sir, the capital expenditure is going up. When capital expenditure goes up, automatically inflation comes down. One of the great opportunities I have seen in this Budget is, the Government has given topmost priority for the infrastructure development of the country, for the road and transport development of the country. The National Infrastructure Pipeline project will be expanded to cover 7,400 projects and 217 projects have already been completed at the cost of more than Rs.1.10 lakh crores. Under the proposed Rs.5,35,000 crores Bharatmala Pariyojana, more than 13,000 kilometres of road will be constructed at the cost of Rs.3.3 lakh crores. Sir, I come from the State of Assam. I am very happy that in this Budget, the hon. Finance Minister has awarded Rs.34,000 crores to construct 1,300 kilometres of National Highway in Assam. I am very happy about it. In addition, Rs.1,000 crores is awarded for the infrastructure development of Assam. I welcome it, Assam is an economically backward State. Madam Finance Minister, I am happy that you successfully brought into focus the needs of the people of Assam. I now come to one more thing. We have talked a lot about the migrant workers. What is the Government doing for the migrant workers? During the Covid pandemic, we have seen what problems were faced by the migrant workers. They were not getting food. They were not getting shelter or home. But introducing 'One Nation One Ration Card' system will help the migrant workers. These migrant workers may be in Kerala, may be in Assam, wherever they may be or from whichever State they may have migrated, under this provision, he will get food at cheap price from any part of the country. This is a great goal of this Budget. I thank the Finance Minister for this. Sir, please give me two minutes more. I come from the north-eastern region and in the interest of the north-eastern region, please allow me to speak for two minutes more. Madam Finance Minister, through you, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Railway Minister. Railway electrification is a dream of the people of north-eastern region. Forget about railway electrification, all parts of the north-eastern region are not yet connected with railways.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Please conclude.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, give me one minute more. At various times, every Railway Minister has announced that there will be electrification of NF Railways. But no Government has done anything. But I am happy and I compliment the hon.

Railway Minister that in 2021, the Railway Ministry took an ambitious plan to electrify 50 per cent of the NF Railways, both the rail lines. I welcome it and I am sure that this target will be fulfilled within time. I am hopeful about it. Also, Sir, through you, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Minister that according to the World Health Organisation, the highest numbers of cancer patients in our country come from the north-eastern region. So, this is in the interest of the cancer patients.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): You are from the North-Eastern Region. That is why I have extended two minutes.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, I would like to give one small example. Every day, hundreds of cancer patients visit Mumbai from Guwahati, from the north-eastern part to get Cancer treatment. Madam Finance Minister, through you, I request the hon. Railway Minister, in the interest of the Cancer patients, please give us a Bullet Train between Guwahati and Mumbai. There are more than 10,000 posts lying vacant in the NF Railways. I request the hon. Minister to fill up these posts from amongst the unemployed youth of the North-Eastern Region. Thank you very much.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Now, Shri P. Chidambaram.

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Maharashtra): Mr. Vice-Chairman, I am grateful to you for this opportunity. I am grateful to the hon. Finance Minister for being present here, when I have an opportunity to speak on the Budget. I will be very brief. Let me first recall about last year. Dr. Arvind Subramanian who had just demitted office as Chief Economic Adviser, said, 'Pre-Covid, Pre-Budget, the economy was in the intensive care unit'. Dr. Abhijit Banerjee, the Noble Laureate, said, 'Pre-Covid, pre-Budget, the economy was doing badly'. The country had witnessed eight quarters of slowdown. The eighth quarter was underway but we knew that the economy will slow down further. It started at 8 per cent in the beginning of 2018-19, and ultimately, it ended with 3 per cent or so in 2019. In my intervention last year, I had pointed out that. The Government was in denial. The Government was refusing to accept the reality of a slowing economy and the Government believed wrongly that the problem of India's economy was cyclical and not structural. The hon. Finance Minister and other spokespersons of the Government flatly refused to accept our arguments, brushed aside our contentions and continued to pretend that all was well. And, I remember the dates and the occasions when they said that the revival would happen

next quarter. Be that as it may, two years of slowdown is a reality. Then the Covid struck. We pleaded that while you addressed the basic issues that are afflicting the economy, please do two things. One, transfer money to the poor people; do a cash transfer. Secondly, use your mountains of foodgrain to give free rations to poor people. Even this morning, a distinguished economist has said, 'Whatever may be said about the Budget of 2021-22, it fails on the fact that even a small amount of cash transfer is not being given to the poor and the rations are not being continued for the poor'. Be that as it may, this Government continues to believe that supply side responses will turn the economy around. I think there are five fingers in one hand. I can count, who those supply side theorists are. One is the hon. Finance Minister herself. The other is the Chief Economic Advisor. The third is the distinguished economist who presides over the NITI Aayog. And, the fourth is the hon. Prime Minister's speech writer. And, I am still looking for the fifth who wants to be counted on that side. Every economist in the world has said, we have to stimulate demand. The best way to stimulate demand is to put money in the hands of the people. This Government has failed on that account. I repeat the charge, you are still not learning the lessons of the last thirty-six months and I am afraid, as a result of your not learning the lessons, another twelve months will be lost, where the poor will suffer and suffer greatly.

Sir, in the year 2004-05, in constant prices, the GDP was about Rs. 32.42 lakh crores. I will leave the decimals out; let us take as Rs. 32 lakh crores. In 2013-14, when UPA demitted office, it was Rs. 105 lakh crores, a little more than three times. Since then, what is happening? In 2017-18, it was Rs. 131 lakh crores; in 2018-19, it crept up to Rs. 139 lakh crores; in 2019-20, it was a slower crawl to Rs. 145 lakh crores and in 2020-21, the year which is about to end, in the first half, it was about Rs. 60 lakh crores and the year may end with about Rs. 130 lakh crores, which means we are back to where we were in 2017-18. Sir, three years of incompetent economic management and the hon. Finance Minister took exception to my using the word 'incompetent', I can't use a harsher word in Parliament. I am using the mildest word available to me. Three years of incompetent economic management will mean that at the end of the year 2021, we will be exactly where we were in 2017-18. Please remember, Sir, in the last year, not entirely because of the Government, because of the pandemic too, 120 million people lost their jobs, that is, 12 crore; 64.7 million dropped out of the labour-force and out of that, 22 per cent are women. Only one out of eleven jobs are held by women, but, four out of eleven who dropped out are women; 28 million people have today registered in the employment exchanges actively seeking jobs; 35 per cent of MSMEs are closed. Come to Tirupur, come to

my town, where is the bakery, closed; where is the workshop, closed; where is the laundry, closed. The reality is that there is no demand in the bulk of India. I am talking about a relatively advanced State like Tamil Nadu. Imagine what will be the situation in relatively backward States like Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, Odisha, etc. My heart pains for them. I am not happy they are backward, but, it will be worse in those States. Sir, the answer to India's economic situation is to take the advice of well-meaning critics, distinguished Indian economists, who may be in India or abroad, and address the structural issues facing the economy and immediately address the needs of the poor people. This is what my colleague, Mr. Sibal said yesterday. You have ignored the poor; you have ignored the unemployed; you have ignored those who have lost their jobs and still looking for those jobs; you have ignored the MSMEs which are closed down; you have ignored the jobs that were lost in the closed down MSMEs. If you ignore the bulk of India, then, who is this Budget for? Before I answer the question, 'who is this Budget for', let me give you some numbers. Sir, major numbers are suspect in this Budget, like last year's Budget. Of course, you will always say the numbers unravel because of the pandemic. You won't have the excuse this year. These numbers are going to unravel, and like last year, the Finance Minister will have to make mini Budgets.

Let us look at the reality of the numbers. You said that you raised about Rs.10 lakh cores for additional borrowing. Where does this additional borrowing go? On the capital account, you are spending Rs.27,078 crores. Let us add the grants-in-aid of capital investment, another Rs.23,876 crores, the total additional capital investment in the current year, which will end on 31st March is Rs.50,954 crore; let us say, Rs.51,000 crore. Where did the rest of money go? Not for new investment, not for capital investment, where did it go because you have three large holes? On the revenue side, your expenditure increased by Rs.3,80,997 crore. On the revenue side, you have a revenue shortfall of Rs.4,65,773 crore and in the disinvestment you have a shortfall of Rs.1,78,000 crores. That adds up to Rs.10,24,770 crores. So, your money that you borrowed is only going to fill the gaps. The huge craters that are there in the economy today, next year would not be any better. The additional borrowing will go under the same heads. Mark my words today, and we will come back next year. Mark my words, the revenue projections for next year are ambitious. There will be a shortfall. The disinvestment projections are ambitious. There will be a shortfall, and your revenue expenditure will increase more than what you have provided for because you have under-provided under a large number of heads, including defence and health. Next year the total expenditure increases only by Rs.32,931 crore. I have complimented you in writing and I compliment you here. You are spending on capital

account an addition of Rs.1,15,000 crore. But what is Rs.1,15,000 crore in a GDP which you estimate will be Rs.220 lakh crore? Your estimate says that your GDP next year will increase by Rs.28 lakh crore, but you are spending an additional only Rs.1,00,000 crore on capital account. While I have given you half a compliment and I have to hold back the other half of the compliment because just not enough is being spent on capital expenditure. Sir, let me point out another number that will unravel. You have projected a nominal GDP growth of about 14.8 or 14.9 per cent. Then you say, 'It will still grow by 11 per cent.' The math is bewildering. Inflation next year, will be, at least five per cent, maybe, even six per cent. If your nominal GDP growth is 14.4 per cent and inflation is 5 or 6 per cent, the arithmetic I have says that your growth will be only 9.4 or 8.4 per cent. This year will end at minus 10, minus 11 and next year will grow by 8 or 9. This is what Dr. Gita Gopinath said, it is mechanical. Don't claim credit for that growth. If the decline in the previous year is minus 10, the mechanical rise will be plus 8 or 9. So, don't go by boasting about these numbers. The real test is when will you come back to a constant GDP which is higher than your highest, namely, Rs.145 lakh crore. I am afraid, it will take you two to three years, which is why Dr. Gopinath said, 'to reach pre-COVID levels, we will have to wait until 2025.' There are three numbers on which I must comment. One is Defence. The first time, I think, in the history of Parliament, the word 'defence' was not mentioned in the Budget Speech. Please correct me, if I am wrong. The word 'defence' was not mentioned in the Budget Speech. On health, the numbers have unraveled again. Everybody has blown a hole into the numbers claimed by the Finance Minister that she had increased the health expenditure by an astronomical figure. The Budget Division which prepares 'Budget at a Glance' has blown a hole into that by revealing the true figures. The true figures are clear on page 10 of the 'Budget at a Glance'. For health, in the current year, the Revised Estimate is Rs.82,445 crores and, for the next year, it is only Rs.74,602 crores. You have actually reduced the allocation in the Budget, according to page 10 of the 'Budget at a Glance'.

The third is, 'petrol and diesel prices will not increase because you have reduced the excise and comparably increased the cess.' There is a proverb in Tamil, which means to say, "A bluff will only have a short life." The bluff has been called three days later. Prices of petrol are increased by 36 paise and 26 paise. Believe me, it will rise again. What you have done by imposing cess is to deny the State Governments their share. Many numbers will unravel. I don't want to alarm or disappoint the hon. Finance Minister for, I am afraid, many numbers will unravel.

Finally, Sir, I want to point out what the text of the speech is. The text is prosaic, bureaucratic. What is the pretext of the speech? The pretext is, 'We have a

pandemic.' Let me tell you, we don't hold you responsible for the pandemic afflicting India nor do we hold you responsible, nor give you credit for the pandemic leaving India. The Corona virus came to India and the Corona virus is leaving India. You don't take the blame for Corona virus coming into India and you don't take the credit for the Corona virus leaving India. But, that is a separate debate on a separate occasion. The pretext is, we have a pandemic and the answer is supply side measures. The context is a slowing down economy, pushed into a deep recession, minus 10 per cent, thanks to the Pandemic and thanks to incompetent economic management. But, more than the text, more than the pretext, more than the context, what is important is the sub-text. The sub-text is, this is a Budget prepared for the rich, of the rich and by the rich. This Budget has done nothing for the poor of India who continue to suffer. The unemployed, those who are looking for employment, those who have lost jobs, the MSMEs who have closed down, the migrant workers, those who are waiting for rations to be given to them for a few more months, all of them have been neglected in this Budget. The sub-text is, this is a Budget prepared for the rich, of the rich and by the rich.

We must, therefore, record our strongest protest and dissent against the Budget. Because we dissent, we will be called *Andolan Jeevi* and *Par Jeevi*. Who are the *Par Jeevis* of the country? The *Par Jeevis* of the country are those one per cent who control 73 per cent of India's wealth. This is a Budget for that one per cent who already control 73 per cent of India's wealth. We reject this Budget in the name of the people. We appeal to you to amend this Budget and provide cash transfers, rations and succour to the poor. You may get away with this kind of a Budget. But, as long as the poor continue to suffer, one day or the other, the poor will wake up and, in a non-violent, peaceful manner, show the Government what it has done and what it should have done. I don't know when that will happen, but it will happen. The poor continue to suffer before your Budget and after your Budget, and, therefore, we reject this Budget and record our strongest protest against the Budget.

श्री अरुण सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): उपसभापति महोदय, आपने मुझे बजट पर बोलने का मौका दिया, उसके लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देता हूँ।

महोदय, पहली बार जो पेपरलेस बजट पेश किया गया, वह पर्यावरण फ्रेंडली भी है। वास्तव में अगर देखा जाए, तो जिस प्रकार की विश्व की परिस्थिति बनी थी, वह अकल्पनीय थी। किसी ने कभी सोचा भी नहीं था कि कोविड-19 के दौरान इस प्रकार का दृश्य होगा और ऐसा दृश्य बनेगा। उसके दौरान भारत सरकार द्वारा FRBM को ध्यान में रखकर, fiscal deficit को ध्यान में रखकर, साथ ही देश की चुनौतियों और आवश्यकताओं को भी ध्यान में रखकर जिस प्रकार से बजट बनाया गया और बजट में घोषणाएं की गईं, वे प्रशंसनीय हैं। साढ़े पांच लाख करोड़ रुपये के

capital expenditure का allocation किया गया, ताकि देश का आर्थिक पहिया भी चलता रहे और लोगों को रोजगार भी मिलता रहे। लोगों के मन में आशंकाएं थीं, लोग अलग-अलग प्रकार की शंका लगा रहे थे कि इतना बड़ा संकट आया है तो किसी न किसी प्रकार से टैक्स जरूर लगेगा, लेकिन मैं वित्त मंत्री जी का अभिनन्दन करना चाहूंगा कि इस बजट के माध्यम से किसी भी प्रकार का एक रुपये का भी टैक्स नहीं लगाया गया।

महोदय, मैंने सोचा था कि मैं यूपीए के समय के बारे में चर्चा नहीं करूंगा, लेकिन कल जब उधर के एक वरिष्ठ सदस्य यूपीए के समय के आर्थिक कुप्रबंधन की गौरव गाथा कर रहे थे और अभी थोड़ी देर पहले भी उस समय के कुप्रबंधन की गौरवगाथा कर रहे थे, तो मुझे लगा कि उनके समय की भी थोड़ी बात करना जरूरी है। उस समय किस प्रकार से चारों ओर भ्रष्टाचार था, लोग जेल जा रहे थे, dispute के cases बढ़ते जा रहे थे, देश ही नहीं, बल्कि विश्व के लोग भी भारत में आने को मना कर रहे थे, साथ ही हमारा current account deficit -4.8 per cent में चला गया था। वर्ष 2009-2010 में inflation rate लगभग 13 per cent होता था और अभी जो माननीय सदस्य बोल रहे थे, उन्होंने लगातार इन दोनों सदनों में कहा कि हम महंगाई की दर को 100 दिनों में कम करेंगे, लेकिन वह कम नहीं हुई। वर्ष 2009-2010 का inflation rate लगभग 13 per cent ही रहा, वे उसको संभाल नहीं पाए। उस समय भयंकर भय का वातावरण था और उनके समय कोई निर्णय होता ही नहीं था। मान्यवर, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि निर्णय लेने के लिए कोई अधिकृत नहीं था। 30 Groups of Ministers बने थे, Empowered Groups of Ministers, एक-एक मंत्री 7 से 27 गुप्स का मेम्बर होता था, लेकिन फिर भी उनको निर्णय लेने का अधिकार नहीं था, निर्णय कोई अदृश्य शक्ति लेती थी, बाहर से कोई व्यक्ति उसका निर्णय लेता था, यह स्थिति थी। उसका नतीजा यह हुआ कि झगड़े बढ़ते रहे, dispute बढ़ते रहे। गवर्नमेंट के जो सेंट्रल सेक्टर के 301 प्रोजेक्ट्स थे, जो डेढ़ सौ करोड़ रुपये से अधिक के प्रोजेक्ट्स थे, वे इतने delay हुए कि उस समय की Ministry of Statistical and Program Implementation की रिपोर्ट के अनुसार 1 लाख 74 हजार करोड़ रुपये की भारी-भरकम बढ़ोतरी हुई। इस प्रकार की स्थिति थी कि विवाद, कोर्ट में केसेज उलझते चले जा रहे थे। वर्ष 2011 में यूपीए के समय में इतने झगड़े होते थे कि 4.5 ट्रिलियन रुपये के केसेज कोर्ट में पेंडिंग थे और यही देखकर यहां के उद्योगपति उद्योग नहीं लगाते थे, साथ ही बाहर के लोग भी उद्योग लगाने के लिए और investment करने के लिए नहीं आते थे।

महोदय, मैं एक बात और बताना चाहूंगा कि नतीजा यह होता था कि अगस्त, 2013 में यूपीए की सरकार ने सोचा कि हम बाहर से कॉरपोरेट बॉन्ड्स के माध्यम से कुछ पैसा collect करते हैं। पैसा इकट्ठा करने के लिए उन्होंने एक व्यवस्था बनाई और टारगेट यह रखा कि हम फॉरेन से 25 बिलियन डॉलर कॉरपोरेट बॉन्ड्स के माध्यम से collect करेंगे। उस समय तो स्थिति बिल्कुल भिन्न थी और बाहर के लोग हम पर विश्वास ही नहीं करते थे। फिर स्थिति यह हुई कि उसमें यूपीए ने पूरी ताकत लगाई और उसके लिए मार्केटिंग भी की, लेकिन वे इन्फ्रास्ट्रक्चर बॉन्ड के लिए केवल 15 per cent ही पैसा जुटा पाए। यूपीए के समय में देश की यह हालत थी और आज मोदी गवर्नमेंट है। अभी आज के दिन में 74 बिलियन डॉलर देश में आया है -- highest ever! आज फॉरेक्स रिज़र्व भी 590 बिलियन डॉलर है। देश के इतिहास में आज यह सबसे अधिक रिज़र्व है। सर, यह उस समय का दौर था। PEW रिसर्च ग्रुप एजेंसी ने फरवरी, 2014 में व्यापक रिसर्च की और रिसर्च करने के बाद यह कहा कि आज भारत में दस में से सात लोग नाखुश हैं। वे इस

सरकार को पसंद नहीं करते हैं और इसकी नीतियों को भी पसंद नहीं करते हैं। इसी का यह नतीजा रहा कि 2014 में जब चुनाव हुए तो 70 per cent लोगों ने उस सरकार को reject कर दिया, तब एक स्थिति वह बनी थी। दूसरी, स्थिति आज की देखिए कि अभी पिछले महीने पूरे विश्व में रैंकिंग और रेटिंग की गई।

(उपसभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए)

जब अप्रूवल रेटिंग हुई, तो उसमें हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी को विश्व में नम्बर वन स्थान दिया गया। यह माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी की credibility और उनकी policy का ही नतीजा है।

महोदय, मैं एक चीज़ और कहना चाहूंगा। आपने बोला है, तो मैं यहां पर गरीब, किसान और देश के एक-एक वर्ग के लिए बताना चाहूंगा। यहां पर लोग बोलकर तो निकल जाते हैं, यदि कुछ सुनना ही है, तो कम से यह भी सुन लें। यदि वे महाज्ञानी हैं, तो उनको थोड़ा और ज्ञान मिल जाएगा, लेकिन सुनेंगे नहीं, क्या करें! महोदय, 2013-14 में किसानों की केवल 42 लाख हेक्टेयर ही भूमि सिंचित होती थी। 'Per Drop More Crop' के माध्यम से जो बजट में भी उसके लिए fund allocate किया जाता है, 56 लाख हेक्टेयर से अधिक किसानों के लिए भूमि सिंचित होती है। 'पीएम सम्मान किसान निधि' के लिए हमारे बजट में भी पैसे का प्रावधान है। आप एक बार 50 हजार करोड़ रुपए का किसानों का कर्जा माफ करने की घोषणा करके ढिंढोरे पे ढिंढोरा पीटते रहते हैं, वह भी चुनाव के समय में। हमारी सरकार ने चुनाव को ध्यान में रखकर नहीं, बल्कि हर वर्ष किसानों को 60 हजार करोड़ रुपए देने का वायदा किया है और दे भी दिया। आप कहते हैं कि आपने किसानों के लिए बहुत काम किया है, हमने तो कुछ काम किया नहीं है। महोदय, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि जब यूपीए की सरकार थी, तो किसानों की जो ओवरऑल क्रेडिट लिमिट होती थी, वह केवल सात लाख करोड़ रुपए होती थी। आज यह सात लाख से दस लाख करोड़ रुपए नहीं, बल्कि आज उनकी जो ओवरऑल क्रेडिट लिमिट है, वह साढ़े 16 लाख करोड़ रुपए हो गई है। इस बजट में उसका उल्लेख किया गया है। आप बताइए कि किसान खुशहाल होंगे या नहीं होंगे? यदि कुल मिलाकर देखा जाए तो आप मध्यम वर्ग को ही ले लीजिए। आप कहते हैं कि मध्यम वर्ग भी नाराज़ है, मध्यम वर्ग की आमदनी भी नहीं बढ़ रही है। आप पचास-साठ साल से जोड़ लीजिए, मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि 2013-14 में इनकम टैक्स रिटर्न्स 1 करोड़, 31 लाख फाइल होती थीं, आज के दिन में 3 करोड़, 31 लाख से बढ़कर दो गुना, यानी 6 करोड़, 48 लाख रिटर्न्स फाइल होती हैं। अब बताइए कि मध्यम वर्ग के लोगों की आय बढ़ रही है या नहीं बढ़ रही है, वे खुश हैं या नहीं हैं? आप के लोग तो जनता को गुमराह करते हैं। जब भी स्थानीय निकाय के चुनाव होते हैं, चाहे प्रदेशों के चुनाव हों, उनमें भी आपको जनता गुमराह कर देती है और भारतीय जनता पार्टी को जीत दिला देती है! आप लंबे समय तक उनको गुमराह नहीं कर सकते हैं। अभी चिदम्बरम साहब चले गए हैं। मैं बताना चाहता हूं कि आपने वर्ष 2007-08 में यह कहा था कि जीएसटी ले आएंगे। चिदम्बरम साहब यहां बैठे थे, उन्होंने ही कहा था। फिर वर्ष 2013-14 के बजट में बड़े दुखी मन से यह कहा था कि वर्ष 2007-08 में हमने कहा था कि जीएसटी ले आएंगे। फिर हमने सोचा कि वर्ष 2010 आ जाएगा, लेकिन हम जीएसटी नहीं ला पाए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा (हिमाचल प्रदेश): वह मोदी जी ने नहीं लाने दिया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण सिंह : आप अगर-मगर ...**(व्यवधान)**... I am not yielding. ...**(Interruptions)**...

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि ...**(व्यवधान)**... उस समय के गुजरात के मुख्यमंत्री जी ने ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण सिंह : सर, आप सुनिए तो...**(व्यवधान)**... आप सुनिए तो...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: कृपया आपस में बात न करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अरुण जी आप चेयर को एड्रेस करें।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण सिंह: सर, अगर-मगर कुछ नहीं...**(व्यवधान)**... आपका कारवां लुट गया।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: कृपया आपस में बात न करें। ...**(व्यवधान)**... प्लीज़, बैठकर बात न करें।...**(व्यवधान)**...माननीय चेयरमैन साहब ने आप सबको कहा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण सिंह: अगर-मगर कुछ नहीं, इनका कारवां लुट गया। अगर-मगर करते रहेंगे, तो कुछ नहीं होगा। मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि हमारी मोदी सरकार जीएसटी ले भी आई और यह जीएसटी का ही नतीजा है कि सभी लोग ईमानदारी से रिटर्न फाइल कर रहे हैं। कोविड संक्रमण के बाद भी पिछले महीने 1,20,000 करोड़ रुपये का जीएसटी कलेक्शन हुआ है, जिसमें आपके प्रदेशों को भी पैसा मिलेगा। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि आपका सपना क्या था। आपने वर्ष 2013-14 के बजट में क्या कहा था? आपने यह कहा था कि हम 10वीं largest Economy है। हम सातवीं हैं और आठवीं पर जाना चाहते हैं- ऐसा ही कहा था। आपने वर्ष 2013-14 के बजट में यह कहा था कि वर्ष 2025 तक हम पांचवीं अर्थव्यवस्था पर जाने का सपना देख रहे हैं। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूँ कि 2025 तक नहीं, मोदी जी ने तो दो साल पहले ही भारत को पांचवी अर्थव्यवस्था बना दिया, यह स्थिति है।

श्री आनन्द शर्मा: क्या कह रहे हैं? ...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री उपसभापति: प्लीज़, प्लीज़ आपस में बातचीत न करें।...**(व्यवधान)**...

श्री अरुण सिंह: मान्यवर, मैं रोजगार के बारे में जरूर बताना चाहूंगा। पहले की जो सरकारें थीं, वे 'मनरेगा' और दिहाड़ी को ही रोजगार मानती थीं। भारत सबसे युवा देश है। अगर विश्व का कोई सबसे युवा देश है, तो वह भारत है। भारत में रोजगार के अवसर उपलब्ध होने चाहिए।

केवल मजदूरी के रोजगार नहीं, बल्कि ऐसे रोजगार, जिनमें स्वरोजगार भी हो, जो दूसरों को भी रोजगार दे सकें और रोजगार के अवसर उत्पन्न करें, यह आवश्यक है। इस बात को यदि किसी ने महसूस किया, तो हमारे प्रधान मंत्री श्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने महसूस किया। जब उन्होंने 'मुद्रा योजना' की शुरुआत की, तो मैं बताना चाहूंगा कि आज 25 करोड़ लोगों को 'मुद्रा योजना' के अंतर्गत लोन दिया गया है। अब जब 25 करोड़ लोगों को 'मुद्रा योजना' के अंतर्गत लोन दिया गया है, तो वे कहीं न कहीं दो, चार, छह लोगों को रोजगार देते ही होंगे। आप सोचिए कि रोजगार उत्पन्न हुआ या नहीं हुआ! सर, 66 लाख सेल्फ हेल्प ग्रुप्स से 7 करोड़ महिलाएं जुड़ी हुई हैं। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूं कि 3,40,000 करोड़ रुपये 'सेल्फ हेल्प ग्रुप्स' को दिए गए हैं, जिससे 7 करोड़ महिलाओं को लाभ मिलता है। वे कुछ न कुछ तो रोजगार कर ही रहे होंगे। आप केवल लेबर को ही रोजगार मानते हैं। इसी के साथ-साथ माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने शुरू में कहा कि स्किल डेवपलमेंट को बढ़ावा देना चाहिए। भारत में जिस प्रकार प्रतिभावान और talented लोग हैं, वे विश्व में जाकर छा सकते हैं। आज यह बताते हुए हर्ष हो रहा है कि स्टार्ट-अप के क्षेत्र में थर्ड इको-सिस्टम अगर कोई है, तो वह भारत है। आज भारत में 27,000 नए स्टार्ट-अप्स लगे हैं। जब स्टार्ट-अप होगा, तो लोगों को रोजगार मिलेगा और वे औरों को रोजगार भी दे सकेंगे। मैं वित्त मंत्री जी को इसलिए भी बधाई देना चाहूंगा कि स्टार्ट-अप में जो पैसा लगाते हैं, उन पर कैपिटल गेन को exempt करने की घोषणा भी की गई है और उसके साथ-साथ स्टार्ट-अप का tax exemption भी एक साल के लिए बढ़ाया गया है, इसलिए मैं आपका अभिनन्दन करता हूं और माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी का भी अभिनन्दन करता हूं।

1.00 P.M.

आप भारत की तस्वीर तो ज़रा देखिए। हम जानते हैं कि जब तक research innovation नहीं होगा, तब तक कोई देश बहुत आगे नहीं बढ़ सकता है। आज क्या स्थिति है? आपके समय से हमारे समय तक, इस वक्त चार गुणा पेटेंट बढ़ चुके हैं। ट्रेडमार्क में यह स्थिति है कि आज भारत में पांच गुणा से अधिक ट्रेडमार्क रजिस्टर हो रहे हैं। इसके साथ ही research को बढ़ावा देने के लिए R&D होना चाहिए, रिसर्च होनी चाहिए और रिसर्च में नई-नई चीज़ों का innovation होना चाहिए। National Research Foundation बनाने की घोषणा हुई है और कोई छोटा-मोटा नहीं, अगले पांच सालों में 50 हजार करोड़ रुपये खर्च होंगे, यह बजट में घोषणा की गई है। इसके माध्यम से रोजगार मिलेगा। देश भर में तीन करोड़ से अधिक CSCs हैं, उनके माध्यम से लोगों को रोजगार मिल रहा है। Stand-Ups, जिनमें मुख्य रूप से महिलाएं हैं, एससी, एसटी के लोग हैं, अगर उनको 24 हजार करोड़ रुपये से अधिक पैसा मिल रहा है, तो यह बताइए कि लोगों को, युवाओं को कुछ न कुछ काम करने के अवसर प्रदान हो रहे हैं या नहीं हो रहे हैं, इसलिए मैं कहना चाहूंगा कि स्थिति यही है। शुरू से प्रधान मंत्री जी युवाओं को आगे बढ़ाना चाहते हैं, युवाओं को अवसर देना चाहते हैं और अगर देश का युवा आज कहीं खड़ा है, तो वह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी और उनकी नीतियों के साथ खड़ा है। आपने एक बात कही कि गरीबों के लिए कुछ नहीं किया है। गरीबों के बारे में तो मैं बता ही दूंगा, हमारे बहुत सारे मित्र भी गरीबों के बारे में बोलेंगे और बताने के लिए बहुत कुछ है। अभी आप बोल रहे थे कि एमएसएमई के लिए कुछ नहीं किया। कैसे नहीं

किया? पिछले बजट में 7,572 करोड़ रुपया था। आप सब लोगों ने क्या किया - इस साल का बजट, जो असामान्य परिस्थितियों में बना, जिसमें सब कुछ बंद था, पूरे देश में, विश्व भर में लॉकडाउन था - उनके आंकड़ों को लेकर जादूगरी के हिसाब से आपने बोलने का काम किया है, तो यह बताइए कि आपने कौन सा तीर मार दिया? मतलब adverse स्थिति थी, स्थिति विषम थी, उसको लेकर कहा गया कि ऐसा किया है, वैसा किया है, आप खुद खुश हो जाइए, लेकिन देश की जनता तो आपके भाषणों से खुश होने वाली नहीं है। इसके बावजूद भी पिछले बजट में, इस सेक्टर के लिए जो 7,572 करोड़ रुपये रखे थे, उसे इस बजट में माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी ने डबल करके 15,700 करोड़ रुपये करने का काम किया है। लगातार एमएसएमई की definition बदलना - एमएसएमई सेक्टर जो है, छोटे और लघु उद्योगों को लगातार कुछ न कुछ राहत मिलनी चाहिए, ताकि उनके प्रति अन्याय भी न हो, उनको छूट का दायरा भी मिलता रहे, इसलिए लगातार उनकी definition बदलकर, उनको अधिक से अधिक छूट देने का काम किया है और compliances में भी उसको राहत देने का काम किया है। अभी 50 लाख से अधिक 2 करोड़ paid-up capital की जो घोषणा की है और 2 करोड़ से 20 करोड़ turnover की जो घोषणा की है, इससे हमारे एमएसएमई सेक्टर के जो लोग हैं, उनको बहुत बड़ा लाभ मिलेगा, क्योंकि जब turnover की सीमा बढ़ जाएगी, तो बहुत सारी छूट उनको मिलेगी और सारे compliances में भी उनको राहत मिलेगी। Emergency Credit Line Guarantee Scheme चल रही है, इस सेक्टर को अपनी property mortgage किए बिना लोन मिल रहा है। तीन लाख करोड़ रुपये की योजना है। एमएसएमई सेक्टर, स्मॉल और लघु उद्योग के जो लोग मुश्किल में हैं, उनको भी 20 हजार करोड़ रुपये से अधिक की राहत फंड के माध्यम से दी गई है। आप बताइए, आपने तो यह काम किया नहीं। हमारे इन छोटे और लघु उद्योगों को लाभ देने के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी ने यह निर्णय लिया कि 200 करोड़ से जो कम के टेंडर होंगे, उसमें कोई विदेशी participate नहीं करेगा, उसमें केवल भारत के उद्योग participate करेंगे। हजारों की संख्या में ऐसे कानून थे, जो redundant थे, उन कानूनों का अता-पता ही नहीं था, लेकिन धीरे-धीरे करके हजारों की संख्या में उन कानूनों को समाप्त किया। उससे एमएसएमई सेक्टर को राहत मिल रही है। उसके अलावा कंपनीज़ ऐक्ट में बहुत सारे क्रिमिनल ऐक्ट्स थे, उनको decriminalisation करने का काम किया और इस बजट में जो बचे हुए भी थे, उसमें भी कहा गया है कि जो Limited Liability Partnership (LLP) Act, 2008 है, उसमें भी जो criminal Sections हैं, उनको भी हम decriminalisation करने का काम करेंगे। हमारा यह उद्देश्य है। प्रधान मंत्री जी ने लाल किले की प्राचीर से भी बोला था कि हमें वैल्यू क्रिएटर का सम्मान करना चाहिए। वैल्यू क्रिएटर लोगों को नौकरी देता है, देश के assets creation में अपना योगदान देता है।

श्री उपसभापति: माननीय अरुण जी, आपके बोलने का समय खत्म हो गया है, जो आपकी पार्टी ने दिया है। आप अपनी बात खत्म करिए।

श्री अरुण सिंह: मान्यवर, मेरे पास कहने को तो बहुत कुछ है, लेकिन मैं इतना कहना चाहता हूँ कि हम सभी को सम्मान देने का काम कर रहे हैं। इसके अलावा बहुत सारे रिफॉर्म्स हैं - faceless assessment के साथ-साथ अब फेसलेस इन्कम टैक्स का ट्रिब्यूनल भी होगा। मैं एक चीज़ और

बता देना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट में आदिवासियों के लिए भी बहुत अधिक घोषणाएं हुई हैं। उनके लिए 750 एकलव्य विद्यालय बनाए जाएंगे। मान्यवर, मैं अंत में कहना चाहूंगा कि अगर पूरा बजट पढ़ेंगे, तो इसमें एक बात स्पष्ट है कि जो five trillion dollar इकोनॉमी का लक्ष्य माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने रखा है, उसको पूरा करने की दिशा में यह बजट है। हम आत्मनिर्भर भारत बने और आत्मनिर्भर भारत के साथ, नये भारत की संकल्पना भी पूरी हो, उसे हम इस बजट के माध्यम से अवश्य प्राप्त करेंगे, धन्यवाद।

श्री उपसभापति: धन्यवाद। श्री सुखेन्दु शेखर राय जी।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, according to me, this Budget reflects the bankruptcy in the state of economy of our country. सर, लोगों के मन में अच्छे सपने जगाने के लिए इस बजट में कुछ ऐसी बातें कही गई हैं, जिनको इकोनॉमिक सर्वे में भी नहीं बताया गया है। इकोनॉमिक सर्वे में 11 परसेंट ग्रोथ रेट वर्ष 2021-22 के लिए बताया गया है, लेकिन इस बजट में उससे भी आगे बढ़ गए हैं। बजट में 14.4 परसेंट का projection है। इस 14.4 परसेंट के आधार पर बजट में सारी कहानियां सुनाई गई हैं। इस पर हमें एक पुराना गीत याद आ रहा है। उसको लता जी और मुकेश जी ने अलग-अलग गाया था। मैं उस गीत के दो-चार लफ्ज़ बोलना चाहता हूँ। फिल्म का नाम 'शोर' था और म्यूज़िक डायरेक्टर लक्ष्मीकांत प्यारेलाल जी थे।

"जिंदगी और कुछ भी नहीं, तेरी मेरी कहानी है।"

इसमें न तो तेरी कहानी है और न मेरी कहानी है - आम जनता की कहानी इसमें नहीं है, बाकी जो है, वह सब दर्द भरी कहानी है। उसकी ही अब मैं चर्चा करना चाहता हूँ। पहले तो आपको बजट में यह बोलना जरूरी था कि आप जो बजट में 14.4 परसेंट ग्रोथ रेट बता रहे हैं, इसका बेसिस क्या है? अगर हम वास्तविक चित्र देखते हैं, तो in 2019-20, our economy contracted by 4.1 per cent, and it further contracted by 7.1 per cent in 2020-21. And, on 4th January, this year, the World Bank Global Report estimated India's GDP to plunge 9.6 per cent. However, the spokespersons of the Government say that such report should not be relied upon. हमें अभी तक Revised Estimate का कुछ पता नहीं है, तो कैसे हम वर्ल्ड बैंक की रिपोर्ट को खारिज करेंगे और कैसे आपके आंकड़ों पर भरोसा रखेंगे? खैर ये सारे statics कुछ भी हों, सरकार अपनी कहानी पर खड़ी है और 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' का सपना भी लोगों को दिखा रही है कि "PLI schemes to create manufacturing global champions for Atmanirbhar Bharat. This will help bring scale and size in key sectors and provide jobs to our youth. It will provide jobs to our youth. आत्मनिर्भर भारत का जो प्रधान लक्ष्य है, उसमें यह भी बताया गया है, लेकिन सर, मेरे विचार से this is nothing but empty promises, क्योंकि एग्रीकल्चर के बाद सबसे ज्यादा MSME में जॉब क्रिएट होता है, लेकिन millions of MSMEs are still shut down. जैसा कि चिदम्बरम जी कुछ बता रहे थे, उसके बारे में सब जानते हैं, हर मेम्बर अपने-अपने क्षेत्र में देख रहा है कि MSME की हालत क्या है। The Government believes

that they would take loans from banks and start running their units once again as before. But loan off-take in the MSME sector even without any collateral guarantee is at a record low. सरकार बोल रही है कि आप आओ, लोन लेकर जाओ, आपको गारंटी नहीं देनी पड़ेगी, collateral नहीं देना पड़ेगा, लेकिन फिर भी लोन लेने के लिए कोई नहीं आ रहा है। बैंक ने दरवाज़ा खोलकर रखा है, ऐसी हालत हमारी है। यह वास्तविक चित्र है, इसको किसी को अस्वीकार नहीं करना चाहिए और कैसे सुधार लाना चाहिए, इसके बारे में ज्यादा ध्यान देना चाहिए।

महोदय, मैं आपको एग्रीकल्चर के बारे में क्या बताऊँ? आपकी पार्टी का 2014 का जो इलेक्शन मैनिफेस्टो था, आपने उसी में बताया था कि हम पाँच साल के अंदर किसानों की इनकम डबल कर देंगे, लेकिन आपने उसको 2022 तक फिर बढ़ाया है। अभी एक साल बाकी है, लेकिन आप समझ गए हैं कि आप किसान की इनकम एक साल में भी दोगुनी नहीं कर पाएंगे, इसलिए आपने क्या किया? आप तीन फार्म्स बिल्स लेकर आए और the whole agricultural sector would now be a playground of the corporates.

महोदय, हमारी आज़ादी को करीबन 75 साल हो गए हैं। In the last 75 years किसी ने कभी नहीं सोचा होगा कि एग्रीकल्चर सेक्टर का पूरा दरवाज़ा कॉरपोरेट के लिए इस ढंग से खोल दिया जाएगा कि जिसका reflection इन तीन किसान बिलों में दिख रहा है। आपने वह कर दिया है। तीन महीने से किसान हज़ारों की संख्या में, लाखों की संख्या में राजधानी दिल्ली के नज़दीक 2 डिग्री टेम्परेचर में अपने परिवार को लेकर, अपने बीवी, बच्चों को लेकर धरने पर बैठे हुए हैं। वहाँ कोई पोलिटिकल पार्टी नहीं है। उन्होंने साफ़ कह दिया है कि हमें किसी पोलिटिकल पार्टी की मदद भी नहीं चाहिए। सरकार ने अभी उनसे चर्चा शुरू की, लेकिन तारीख़ पर तारीख़, तारीख़ पर तारीख़ - जैसे अदालत में होता है, वैसे ही सरकार भी उनके साथ चर्चा करने के लिए, discussion करने के लिए तारीख़ पर तारीख़ दे रही है, जिसका कोई नतीजा नहीं निकला है। उसका कोई नतीजा निकला नहीं है, क्योंकि वे लोग इतने खफ़ा हैं और उनके खफ़ा होने के बहुत सारे कारण जायज़ हैं, क्योंकि जिस ढंग से इन बिल्स को बनाया गया, उन पर पहले किसी से कोई चर्चा नहीं हुई। रवि शंकर प्रसाद जी ने, कृषि मंत्री जी ने publicly बयान दिया कि लाखों आदमियों से चर्चा हुई है। इलेक्ट्रॉनिक मीडिया में एक RTI दी गई थी कि क्या किसान संगठनों के साथ सरकार ने कोई चर्चा की है या नहीं की है? अगर की है, तो उसका नाम दिया जाए? जो RTI Information Commissioner हैं, उन्होंने बताया कि हमारे पास कोई रिकॉर्ड नहीं है कि कोई चर्चा हुई है या नहीं हुई है। मैं किसकी बात को सच समझूँ? मंत्रियों की या RTI Information Commissioner की? यह सब चल रहा है। आप देखिए कि अगर देश के किसान इस तरह से खफ़ा होते हैं तो इसका हमारी economy पर क्या असर पड़ता है, मुझे यह समझाने की ज़रूरत नहीं है, क्योंकि हमारे आदरणीय वित्त मंत्री जी दुनिया के एक जाने-माने economist हैं, लेकिन मेरा अनुरोध है कि वे इस बारे में ज़रूर सोचें।

महोदय, "मनरेगा" की बात करें तो, in this Budget, Rs. 73,000 crores have been allocated for MNREGA, which is 34.52 per cent less than the Revised Estimate of Rs. 1,11,500 crore for 2020-21. "मनरेगा" के लिए पिछले साल से 1 लाख, 11 हज़ार, 5 सौ करोड़ घटा दिए गए हैं। ये बोल रहे हैं कि job creation होगा। इन्होंने लेबर लॉज को इस तरह से अमेंड

किया है कि जो 6 लेबर लॉज अमेंड किए गए हैं, that is an anti-labour step on the part of the Government because the labour laws have been amended to the benefit of the corporates, and the policy of hire and fire shall prevail upon the working conditions of the workers. Even the eight-hour duty at the working place shall be extended up to 12 hours at the diktats of the corporates. This is going to happen when the labour laws are implemented. वे बोलेंगे कि नहीं, वह तो लेबर की consent लेकर होगा। Consent कौन नहीं देगा? यदि वह consent नहीं देगा, तो उसको नौकरी से हटा दिया जाएगा। Amendment to labour laws हो गया।

महोदय, unemployment पर कहूं तो यह बताया गया था कि हम साल में 2 करोड़ job create करेंगे। हर साल 2 करोड़ बेरोजगार लोगों को रोजगार मिलेगा। छह साल तो बीत चुके हैं, अब सात साल होने वाले हैं, इस मई महीने में सात साल complete होंगे, इस बीच 14 करोड़ रोजगार सृजित हो जाने चाहिए थे। अभी चिदम्बरम जी ने आंकड़े दिए थे, वे सब जानते हैं। In April, 2020, 12 crore people lost their jobs due to the pandemic, and not just the pandemic, but also because of the recession that started from the time of announcement of *notebandi*. It started from there, and actually, the pandemic added salt to the injury. We are having this situation where a vast army of unemployed people is roaming around. हर जगह, आप किसी शहर में जाइए, गाँव में जाइए, जो मोहल्ले में बैठे हुए हैं, उनकी हताशा देखिए, सारे हिन्दुस्तान की यह जो हमारी स्थिति है, इसको आप कहाँ तक ले जा रहे हैं! अगले दिन law and order problem भी हो सकती है।

Roads and highways, infrastructure development के बारे में बताया गया। Some people say that whatever has been announced in regard to allocation of roads and highways infrastructure is essentially meant for the Assembly-poll-bound States of Assam, Kerala, Tamil Nadu and West Bengal. यह जो चुनाव होने वाला है, इसको मद्देनजर रखते हुए इस बजट में roads and highways के लिए कुछ announcements की गई हैं and West Bengal has, as usual, got the lowest allocation of Rs.25,000 crore for 675 kilometers of Highway works. The Central Government failed to widen and maintain the National Highway Nos. 31 and 34 for the past one decade. They could not do anything, and now they say that they will spend Rs.25,000 crore for 675 kilometers of highway. But what has the Bengal Government done? The West Bengal Government has successfully constructed 88,841 kilometers of rural roads and 5,111 kilometers of State Highways in the past ten years. 10 साल में सिर्फ कोलकाता से सिलिगुड़ी का जो हाईवे है, केन्द्र सरकार उसको ठीक से maintain नहीं कर पाई, widen नहीं कर पाई, जबकि उसी 10 साल में हमारी राज्य सरकार ने 88,841 किलोमीटर रूरल रोड्स बनाई और 5,111 किलोमीटर स्टेट हाईवे बनाया। अभी चुनाव आ रहा है, तो the Centre is offering a lollipop of 675 kilometers highway works for West Bengal. महोदय, बंगाल के खिलाफ यह जो step-motherly attitude है, हम बंगला में कहते हैं - 'विमात्री सुलभ आचरण', यानी step-motherly attitude और यह writ large on the pages of this Budget. The devolution

of funds, till December last year, so far as West Bengal is concerned, had been Rs.10,000 crore less and there is no reflection about this in the Budget. Why is there less devolution of Rs.10,000 crore? There should be some justification, isn't it? No. Nothing has been murmured.

सर, पिछले साल, जबकि हम Corona pandemic में फँसे हुए थे, उसी समय अम्फान तूफान आया, सब जानते हैं। Odisha also partly damaged और वैस्ट बंगाल के चार जिलों में एकदम बरबादी हो गई। आदरणीय प्रधान मंत्री जी भी वहाँ देखने के लिए गए, उन्होंने खूब देखा। He visited the affected areas through aerial visit. उस समय एक हजार करोड़ interim relief announce की गई थी। उसके बाद आज तक केन्द्र सरकार ने अम्फान relief के लिए एक पैसा भी नहीं दिया, हालाँकि जो assessment हुआ था, वह यह था कि वहाँ जो क्षति पहुँची है, वह 1 लाख 2 हजार करोड़ की है। अम्फान में 1 लाख 2 हजार करोड़ की क्षति assess की गई थी, उसमें सिर्फ 1 हजार करोड़ की interim relief की घोषणा हुई। बस हो गया, उसके बाद अभी तक एक पैसा भी नहीं आया। No Government in free India had ever shown such cruelty to any State on the issue of natural calamity. This is the most unfortunate part.

इसके अलावा, Rs.85,700 crore is due to West Bengal on account of GST, 100-day work, infrastructure projects, ICDC, etc. इसके बारे में एक शब्द भी यहाँ पर नहीं बताया गया है।

Sir, at page 14, para 16, the hon. Finance Minister has said about natural gas. The heading is 'Petroleum and Natural Gas'. But I don't know why a single word has not been mentioned about petroleum. Not a single word! लेकिन हमारी इस सभा के एक पुराने नेता ने एक ट्वीट किया। उन्होंने ट्वीट करके जो बताया, सबने उसको देखा। लोग social sites पर इसको बहुत मज़ाक में ले रहे हैं, लेकिन यह मज़ाक की बात नहीं है। उन्होंने यह बात किस ढंग से बोली, यह मैं मेन्शन करना चाहता हूँ। 'राम के भारत में पेट्रोल 93 रुपये प्रति लीटर है, सीता के नेपाल में पेट्रोल 53 रुपये है और रावण की लंका में 51 रुपये है।' यह हकीकत है, लेकिन इसे किस ढंग से पेश किया गया, यह आप देखिए। In our neighbouring countries, the price of petrol is around Rs.51 or Rs.53 per litre, but in our country, it is around Rs.91 or Rs.93. इसमें एक संतोष की बात यह है कि रूलिंग पार्टी के किसी भी लीडर ने अभी तक उस नेता को, जिन्होंने यह राम-रावण वाली कहानी सुनाई, वहाँ जाकर बसने के लिए नहीं बोला है। एक बार पहले किसी ने इस तरह की बात बोली थी, तो उनको इन्होंने बोला था कि आप भी जाकर पाकिस्तान में बस जाओ। यह खुशी की बात है कि अभी तक उन नेता को यह नहीं बोला गया है कि आप नेपाल में या श्रीलंका में चले जाओ।

सर, बजट में बैंकों के बारे में बहुत चर्चा हुई है। 14 nationalised banks थे, इस बात को सब लोग जानते हैं, शायद अब इनकी संख्या 12 है। लेकिन जैसा hon. Finance Minister ने अपनी बजट स्पीच में बताया है, घटते-घटते अब केवल 2 nationalised banks रह जाएंगे। उन्होंने ठीक से यह नहीं बताया कि दो रह जाएंगे या चार रह जाएंगे, लेकिन जिस दिन बजट पेश हुआ, उससे अगले दिन हमारे जो Chief Economic Advisor हैं, उन्होंने 2 फरवरी को एक newspaper - 'Bloomberg' में एक इंटरव्यू दिया था, जिसमें उन्होंने बताया था, "Banking will

be a strategic sector where there will be four or less PSBs, but the rest will slowly be unwound and put into the private sector." इस तरह 12 से घटकर सिर्फ दो nationalised banks रह जाएंगे। यहां पर यह भी बताया गया है, 'Two public sector banks would be privatised in the upcoming financial year.' इस तरह बैंकों की संख्या को घटाते-घटाते ये दो या चार तक ले आएंगे और बाकी सब बैंकों को प्राइवेट सेक्टर को बेच देंगे। यह बात मैं नहीं कह रहा हूं, यह बात Chief Economic Advisor ने कही है।

हम लोग NPA के बारे में बहुत चर्चा करते हैं, उसके बारे में कहा गया है कि एक private bad bank बनाया जाएगा। हमने कभी अपनी पूरी जिन्दगी में यह नहीं सुना होगा कि यह bad bank क्या होता है? मैं economist तो नहीं हूं, लेकिन आजकल bad bank बनाने की बात कही जा रही है। जो लोग बैंकों का पैसा लेकर भाग गए हैं और बाहर जाकर पैसा इधर-उधर कर दिया है, उन सारे NPA accounts को bad bank में भेज दिया जाएगा। वे लोग यह तय करेंगे कि उस पैसे को किस तरह वसूल किया जाएगा या नहीं किया जाएगा। यह काम भी private sector के पास जाएगा, सरकार का उस पर कोई नियन्त्रण नहीं रहेगा। वह bad bank सरकार का नहीं होगा, वह bad bank भी private sector के हाथों में रहेगा और वही यह तय करेगा कि NPA को कैसे वसूल किया जाएगा। मुझे कुछ समझ में नहीं आ रहा है कि यह इस देश में क्या हो रहा है?

एक सदस्य ने बोला कि हमने Companies Act में decriminalisation किया है। ऐसा क्यों किया है? आप इतना सारा decriminalisation क्यों कर रहे हैं? जिन लोगों ने हमारी आम जनता का पैसा लूटा, they are criminals and criminal action should be taken against them. Why are you going for decriminalisation all the time? What for? आपको इस देश को यह बताना चाहिए कि आप किसके स्वार्थ की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं? आप आम जनता के हित की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं, जिनका रुपया अमानत के रूप में बैंकों में था और जिसे इन लोगों ने लूट लिया या फिर आप उन criminals के स्वार्थ की रक्षा करना चाहते हैं? यह one after another decriminalization करके तो आप उन लोगों को हेल्प कर रहे हैं। यह सिलसिला तीन-चार साल पहले शुरू हुआ था और अब तक चलता जा रहा है। आप उनके खिलाफ कोई criminal action नहीं ले सकते हैं, क्योंकि पैर से सिर तक आपका सब कुछ बिका हुआ है। आप कुछ नहीं कर सकते हैं, क्योंकि आप एक विक्रेता सरकार हैं। सर, public sector undertakings के बारे में मैं सिर्फ दो-तीन लाइनें बोलना चाहता हूं, क्योंकि मेरी पार्टी से अभी एक स्पीकर और हैं। Hon. Finance Minister has announced that there will be only four key strategic sectors and in these key segments, there will be a maximum of three or four public sector units. There are more than 400 public sector units and it will be reduced to three to four public sector units only. 1900 में जब बंगाल में ब्रिटिश लोगों के खिलाफ anti-partition movement शुरू हुआ था, उस समय एक scientist, एक Professor of Chemistry, Acharya Prafulla Chandra Ray ने अपने रोजगार से Bengal Chemicals & Pharmaceuticals Ltd. को बनाया था। सौ साल से ज्यादा पुरानी वह कम्पनी है - वह लॉस में किंग कम्पनी नहीं है। हर साल वह चार करोड़, पांच करोड़ और छः करोड़ रुपये का प्रॉफिट कर रही है, लेकिन उसे भी बेचने का निर्णय सरकार ले चुकी है, इसी साल उसे बेच दिया जाएगा, लिस्ट में उसका नाम है। देश की पहली स्वदेशी कम्पनी, उसे भी इन्होंने छोड़ा नहीं, क्यों? क्योंकि इस कम्पनी की मुम्बई के

प्रभादेवी में, उत्तर प्रदेश के कानपुर में और बंगाल की दो जगहों में बहुत सारी प्रॉपर्टी है - उस प्रॉपर्टी को बेचना है। वह 45 हजार करोड़ रुपये की प्रॉपर्टी है - उस 45 हजार करोड़ की प्रॉपर्टी को लूटने के लिए प्राइवेट कम्पनी ने जो नक्शा तैयार किया है, सरकार ने उसे मदद देने के लिए यह एलान किया है। अब चुनाव आ गया है, वे कुछ नहीं बोल रहे हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि ऑनरेबल फाइनेन्स मिनिस्टर इसके ऊपर कुछ हमें बतायें।

It further said, "In all other areas -- I mean, other than the four key strategic areas -- where there are PSUs, the Union Government will move out." नॉन-स्ट्रेटेजिक एरिया में यूनियन गवर्नमेन्ट नहीं रहेगी। महोदय, यह टाइम्स ऑफ इंडिया की न्यूज है, जो कि गवर्नमेन्ट सोर्स की बताई हुई है।

महोदय, अब मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करना चाहता हूँ, चूंकि हमारे दूसरे स्पीकर मेरे छोटे भाई जैसे हैं। Finance Minister quoted Rabindranath Tagore from 'Fireflies — A Collection of Aphorisms'. मैं भी टैगोर साहब की गीतांजलि से, जिस गीतांजलि के लिए उन्हें नोबल पुरस्कार मिला था, उसमें से दो-चार लाइनें बोलना चाहता हूँ।

** "Oh my wretched country!*

You will be humiliated in the same way you humiliated others for so long.

Those whom you deprived of basic humanity

Whom you zealously excluded, despite being in the same boat

You will be humiliated in the same way you humiliated others for so long.

You ostracized and cornered them

With your own your own strength you labelled them with your disdain

You trampled them under your feet

You will have to come down to their status one day for salvation; there is no other way out

You too will have to experience their humiliation, one day."

इसका मतलब है कि "Oh, my wretched country, you will be humiliated in the same way, you humiliated others for so long. You ostracized and cornered them, with your own strength, you levelled them with your disdain. You trampled them under your feet. You will have to come down to their status one day for salvation. There is no other way out. You too will have to experience their humiliation one day". Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sukhendu Sekhar Ray ji. Now, Dr. M. Thambidurai.

* English translation of the original speech delivered in Bangla.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I am very happy to participate in the discussion on the General Budget presented by the hon. Finance Minister. Sir, before starting the discussion, I would like to mention about the Covid issue because it is a pandemic and needs a mention. To begin with, I would say let us view this year's Budget considering that the entire world had been in the grip of Covid pandemic and every country on the world map had been taking measures to deal with this situation. It has already affected the world economy as also India's economy.

As far as vaccine is concerned, you will find that India's vaccine is much sought for throughout the world. I appreciate the scientific community for having come out with the vaccine within a short time. Sir, in this connection, I would like to appreciate the hon. Prime Minister. He has taken a lot of efforts. He visited all the vaccine-producing labs, taking the risk for the nation. Hon. Prime Minister has taken so many steps to see that we can get the Made in India vaccine quickly. Prime Minister always stresses the need of 'Make in India'. That is his slogan. On that basis, to solve the pandemic, he has taken a lot of efforts and visited the labs at a risk to his life to save the nation. We are proud that most of the countries of the world have sought the Indian vaccine. That is the contribution India has now made. Because of the hon. Prime Minister, we have achieved this.

Before coming to other issues, I want to say about the budget provided for Tamil Nadu. Our hon. Finance Minister hails from Tamil Nadu. I have to congratulate her and also thank her for giving so much importance to Tamil Nadu while allocating funds.

The Union Government has announced a package of Rs. 35,000 crores for nationwide vaccination programme to combat Covid-19. This will definitely help all the States, including Tamil Nadu, to recover from the pandemic. In this connection, I would request the Centre to enhance the financial assistance being provided to Tamil Nadu to continue our efforts to save the lives of the people.

There is an announcement in the Union Budget stating that 3,500 kilometres of national highways will be built in Tamil Nadu. The construction of the national highways at the cost of Rs. 1.03 lakh crore, which would include Madurai-Kollam and Chittoor-Thatchur, would boost economic growth in Tamil Nadu. In this regard, as assured by the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, Mr. Edappadi Palaniswami, the Government would put in all the efforts to implement this project. While thanking the Centre for having approved the projects sent by the Government of Tamil Nadu to upgrade the fishing ports and for the establishment of seaweed park, I would further

request to give funds to Tamil Nadu to develop other small fishing ports in Tamil Nadu.

Sir, I was also the Surface Transport Minister in the Vajpayee Government when we had taken up so many projects in India. Connecting nationwide Golden Quadrilateral project was one of them. At that time, Vajpayee *ji* encouraged me to implement that project. I request the hon. Finance Minister now to take up one more project, which is connecting Coimbatore to Tiruchirappalli via Karur. Our hon. Finance Minister studied in Tiruchirappalli. She knows the importance of Tiruchirappalli and Coimbatore. Therefore, that corridor must be connected. That project has already been conceived by the National Highways Authority. We have been waiting for more than five years. Therefore, if you allocate the funds and take up the project, within two hours, we can go from Coimbatore to Tiruchirappalli. We can get that kind of a facility. I hope our hon. Finance Minister will consider this.

Coming to the metro rail project, as requested by the hon. Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu, I plead with the Central Government to immediately release 50 per cent share for expanding the second phase of the CMRL project. At the same time, I also request the Centre to accord approval for implementation of the new metro projects for the cities of Coimbatore and Madurai.

Sir, since she also presented the Rail Budget, I request her one more important project from Jolarpettai to Bengaluru via Krishnagiri. We have been waiting for this for a very long time. For 30-40 years, we have been fighting for that kind of a new railway line. I request the hon. Finance Minister, in consultation with the hon. Railway Minister, to take up this project connecting Jollarpettai-Bengaluru via Krishnagiri-Hosur because Hosur is a corridor now. Therefore, I request you to take up that kind of a project.

The Finance Minister announced a planned revamp of public transport system and allocated an amount of Rs. 18,000 crores to purchase 20,000 new buses. This is a welcome step. In Tamil Nadu, you will be very happy to know that the public transport facilities reach people at the power plant areas of the State. I request the Central Government to provide financial assistance to the Tamil Nadu State Transport Corporation.

I am thankful to the Union Government for making adequate financial allocation in the current Budget for scholarships for the students belonging to the Scheduled Castes and the Scheduled Tribes. I am also thankful to you for having favourably considered the request of Tamil Nadu for schemes in higher education.

One very, very important thing that I want to say is this. The Government of Tamil Nadu headed by hon. Chief Minister Edappadi K. Palaniswami has already

waived the loans to the extent of about Rs.12,500 crore taken by the farmers from cooperative banks benefiting lakhs of farmers of Tamil Nadu. Similarly, I request the Central Government to waive the loans taken by the farmers from nationalised banks. It will be a great boon to the farmers who are hit hard by COVID pandemic and pushed to a low ebb.

Now I come to certain points which our hon. Finance Minister made in the Budget for 2021-22. The Budget rests on six pillars. She has said it very nicely. I appreciate that. First is, 'Health and Wellbeing'. Second is, 'Physical and Financial Capital and Infrastructure'. Third is, 'Inclusive Development for Aspirational India'. Fourth is, 'Reinvigorating Human Capital'. Fifth is, 'Innovation and Research and Development'. Sixth is, 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance'. I differ with it. As you know, India is a developing country and it needs a lot of things. It is not like the United States where President Ronald Reagan in early 80s said about this concept of 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance'. It won't suit us. It may be suitable for America. I can say that this concept of 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance' is a borrowed concept. It won't suit Indian conditions. As you know very well, we cannot apply 'Minimum Government, Maximum Governance' blindly. We need 'Maximum Government' for poverty eradication, equality, social justice, transforming rural India, just to name a few, and the Central Government and the State Government must enable it rather than just regulate it. We have to think of poor people. The Government has come forward with many projects. Not just governance, the Government must come forward with many projects. You cannot close down the public sector immediately. That is what the Budget says. I differ with it.

I would like to quote Ramon Magsaysay, former President of the Philippines. He said, 'Those who have less in life should have more in the law.' How beautiful! In his memory, the Ramon Magsaysay Award, which is considered Asia's Nobel Prize, is given annually. We still have more than two-thirds of the poor people in the country. We are a developing country. We know about the sufferings of the people. We have to think of uplifting them. We have to think of their emancipation. And for that, we need 'Maximum Government'. The concept of 'Minimum Governance' will not help our country. We should constantly keep a watch so that 'social justice' is not compromised. It is important to remember that 'Minimum Government' is suffixed by 'Maximum Governance'. With India's level of per capita income, the Central Government and the State Governments cannot retreat together. The Government must, with enormous force, prevent exploitation of the majority of the poor by traditionally advantaged people. Ultimately, for the whole of India, the effect of

'Maximum Governance' comes from embracing 'cooperative and competitive federalism'. Unequal relationship between the Centre and the States will take us nowhere. Let us not forget that India is governed by States also.

Sir, most of the Members talked about MGNREGA. MGNREGA is very important. This project will give a lot of money flow to the rural areas. Poor will get money and the purchasing power will increase. There may be some kind of inefficiency also. I am not denying that. Because of that, we cannot neglect that project. You have to give more money. What does the Keynes theory say? It says that when you want to create demand, you have to pump more money. Then only, the purchasing power of the people will increase. And, your production will increase then. That is the economic theory; everybody knows that. Our Finance Minister is an economist. She has studied in Tiruchirappalli, JNU and London. She knows very well about the Indian economic conditions. She has to apply the theory that to create more employment, she has to spend a lot of money, especially for rural people.

Now, I come to MPLADS fund. I was Chairman of that Committee. Now, as Deputy Chairman of Rajya Sabha, you are the Chairman of MPLADS Committee. At that time, I was Deputy Speaker, Lok Sabha; so, I was Chairman of MPLADS Committee. Most of our MPs, irrespective of political parties, gave their signatures on a paper and demanded from our hon. Prime Minister to reconsider increasing the MPLADS fund, that instead of Rs.5 crore, it should be Rs.25 crore. Why am I saying this? MPLADS funds are not used by MPs. It is only for projects. In Tamil Nadu, for example, each MLA is getting Rs.5 crore from MLA funds. In Kerala, they are getting Rs.13 crore. It is for projects, earmarked projects; the Central Government which projects are there or are going to be implemented. Let MPs also play a role. MPs cannot come every day, sit here and make legislation. Those days have gone. We are in public life as MPs and we have to meet the public. They are asking for so many things to be done. Elections happen at different places and different times. There are Lok Sabha elections, State Assembly elections and local body elections. Whenever you go there, people ask what we have done. They are asking what we have done.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude, Dr. Thambidurai.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, now, you are Chairman of MPLADS Committee. You may know that you are going to face the same problem. Our MPs are going to make the same demand. So, I request the hon. Finance Minister and the hon. Prime Minister to have a rethink over it. Don't give the money to us. You start these

projects. The Central Government is spending money. You are marking projects. MPs are recommending projects for roads, school buildings, water facilities, etc. Let them earmark so that this fund can be used. We would like that it is not given to MPs straightaway to sanction certain things. Anyhow, you are going to implement the projects.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, I am concluding. Our Finance Minister hails from Tamil Nadu, like R.K. Shanmukham Chetty, who presented the first Budget in Parliament. Now, it is women's empowerment. After Shrimati Indira Gandhi, she is the first lady who has come from Tamil Nadu and presented the Budget many times. She knows about the household needs of a woman. I will not elaborate. I request once again to consider MGNREGA programme. Therefore, I appreciate.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you now.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, I am concluding.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your time is over. I am calling the next speaker.

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI: Sir, for the initiatives taken in the current Budget, once again, I thank the Finance Minister. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sujeet Kumar; you have ten minutes.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Sir, it is indeed a great honour for a new Member like me to speak on a very important topic like Budget and for this, I thank you. I also profusely thank my leader, Shri Naveen Patnaik, for this opportunity.

Sir, at the outset, I would like to convey the message of the hon. Chief Minister of Odisha, who has appreciated the growth focus of this Budget. I quote him, "The Union Budget 2021-22 speaks of a medium to long term vision for self-reliant India, which is good for the country. The Union Government has presented the Budget 2021-22 in digital form for the first time. We welcome the green initiative as we have already switched over to digital mode of presentation of the Odisha Budget from last year itself." Sir, increased capital expenditure for improving the physical infrastructure in our country, higher priority to health and drinking water, higher allocation under

National Livelihood Mission, steps to boost the startup eco-system of the country, etc. are some of the very laudable and praiseworthy initiatives in this Budget which will definitely help India march towards prosperity. There are many more but I am limiting myself because of paucity of time. However, my Chief Minister has also flagged the inadequate support provided to Odisha in this Budget and I would like to share some of the concerns and disappointment of Odisha and its people.

Before I do that, I would like to highlight a small concern regarding very marginal hike in the Defence Budget. At Rs.4.78 lakh crore, the total Defence Budget Estimates, B.E. for F.Y.2021-22 is only 1.4 per cent higher over last year's Rs.4.71 lakh crore. While we face two hostile nations, Pakistan and China, Pakistan has increased its recent 2020-21 Defence Budget with 5 per cent hike in comparison to 2019-20 and China has increased its 2020-21 Defence Budget by 6.6 per cent compared to 2019-20. Defence accounted for 15.5 per cent of India's Budget Estimates last year but this year, it is only 13.9 per cent. Even as a percentage of GDP, it is quite low at only 2 per cent while Pakistan spends 3.9 per cent of its GDP on defence and, again, it is largely India-focused. China's Defence Budget in 2020 was declared as 179 billion US dollars which is three times than ours in absolute numbers. Independent sources like Stockholm Peace Research Institute put this number even higher at 240 billion US dollars which is four times our Defence Budget. Hon. Defence Minister, Raj Nath Singhji also spoke this morning about the behaviour of China which we know is very aggressive, expansionist and hostile. It is trying to bully us. I am aware that a large allocation to Defence would minimize investment in social sector. This is a tricky balance to achieve between the gun and the bullet, between the missiles and the mid-day meals. I am sure that while increasing the Defence Budget only modestly, the Government has adequately applied its mind and thought it through well enough. I just wanted to flag it, as the regional party, Biju Janata Dal and our hon. Party President, Shri Naveen Patnaik, have always stood with successive Governments in matters of national security, unity and integrity of our country.

Sir, I now share my concern about the reduced allocation for the education sector because it is an area which is of extreme interest and passion to me. Hon. Member Manoj Kumar Jha ji also flagged it off. We all know how Covid pandemic has severely affected and challenged the education ecosystem of our country because schools and colleges were closed for more than a year or have been closed for almost a year. There is a real risk of increase in school dropout, particularly, in rural India. Gap between children with access to digital learning aids and those without online learning opportunities cannot be starker. In this context, it is very surprising and

saddening to note that education allocation has been decreased in this Budget. Is it not ironical, especially, in a year when the new education policy, NEP, is to be rolled out? Let me quote a few lines from the NEP itself. "The aim must be for India to have an education system by 2040 that is second-to-none with equitable access to the highest-quality education for all learners regardless of their socio-economic background." It is a very lofty goal but does it match with the allocation? The Kothari Commission in 1964 had recommended allocation of 6 per cent of GDP on education. It has never happened so far. In this very first year of NEP and in the post-COVID scenario, the Education Budget has been reduced by 6 per cent over the last year. Sir, I feel the journey to 2040 has started with a fractured leg and I am afraid instead of galloping to 2040 we would all limp there. The saddest part is that out of Rs.6,000 odd crore of reduction over last year in education, Rs.5,000 crores have been deducted towards school education. And we all know, school education is the foundation of the education system. In fact, it is the foundation of a nation. What message are we giving? Does it not give the wrong signal that the Government is not serious about education and not serious about the implementation of NEP?

Sir, now, let me come to my home State Odisha. My Chief Minister has, time and again, raised issues of negligence with the past and present Central Governments, in areas of tele-density, banking, highways, coal royalty, drinking water and irrigation and cutting off funds for scheduled areas like the KBK Scheme. The funds meant for repair and renewal of national highways are routinely delayed. Sir, because of the paucity of time, I will not have the opportunity to dwell into all these areas, so, I restrict myself to just one aspect, that is, Railways. I would like to place some facts. There are six districts in Odisha with no Railways and it is not even a hilly State. It is not even a hilly terrain. In the last seven years, only one additional district of Odisha has got railway connectivity. In the last 7 years, Odisha has got only one new railway line. East Coast Railway does 70 per cent of its loading and unloading in Odisha making it one of the most profitable railway zones in the country. Odisha generates annually Rs. 20,000 crore for Indian Railways; yet the rail density in Odisha is only 15, when the national average is 19 and our neighbouring State of West Bengal has a rail density of 44. We do not grumble our neighbours having a better Railway density, indeed we are happy for them; but should we not also be given fair treatment?

The Odisha Government had requested for Rs. 7,200 crore in this year's Budget for Railways with a detailed analysis, break-up & justification; but we got only Rs. 5,528 crores. ...(Interruptions)... I could go on and on but I am constrained by time. So, all I will say is, I request the Government that there is an urgent need for

expanding rail network in the State to improve our rail density. The Government of Odisha is committed to extend all help to the Railway Ministry for implementation of Railway projects in the State, including filling the viability gap, offering free land, forming Special Purpose Vehicles (SPVs), if required, and so on.

Sir, now, I would like to talk about my favourite place on earth- a place called Kalahandi because it is my home district and I hail from Kalahandi. Many hon. Members here may have heard of Kalahandi. Let me take you to pre-2000. Kalahandi had shaken the nation's conscience because of absolute poverty, famine, starvation, inaccessibility and some of the worst socio- economic indicators in the country.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, give me two-three minutes more.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Not three minutes, but just one minute more.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, you had said I have ten minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Only one minute.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, it has become infamous as the hunger capital of India. People compared Kalahandi with sub-Saharan Africa and the term 'Kalahandi Syndrome' was made popular in developmental studies. It was called the "BhokaraBhogala", meaning 'The Geography of Hunger'.

Sir, come Year 2021, you will be very happy to note that today Kalahandi has emerged as a remarkable development success story. The other day, hon. Member, Shri Rakesh Sinha, was mentioning about Kalahandi. I am not sure, if he has been there but, through you, I urge and invite all hon. Members to visit Kalahandi and see for yourself...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, give me one minute.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, time is over. ...(*Interruptions*)... I have already given you one minute.

श्री सुजीत कुमार : सर, 10 मिनट नहीं हुए।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, why I am talking about Kalahandi in this Budget discussion is because of two reasons. It is because the world must and, particularly, our nation must know about this Kalahandi model of Development; this amazing transformational story of last 20 years; and because how despite this remarkable journey, we are still not getting our due; instead of acknowledging our success and rewarding us, we have to struggle and fight for increased budgetary support.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji. Thank you.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, I need thirty seconds more.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, we, the people of Kalahandi, and the wider KBK Region, of which Kalahandi is a part -- Kalahandi, Bolangir and Koraput are a cluster of 8 districts in western and southern Odisha -- are not stupid and are not lazy. We have been deprived of opportunities by successive Governments both Central and State.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Now, Sir, when we are trying to increase our infrastructure, we are not getting adequate support from the Central Government.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Sujeetji. I will be calling the next speaker.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Sir, last line, before I conclude. The hon. Finance Minister herself mentioned "Inclusive Development for Aspirational India" as one of the 6 pillars of the Union Budget. Thank you, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you. I am calling the next speaker. Shri T.K.S. Elangovan.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I thank you for allowing me to speak on the Budget. I can understand the plight of any Finance Minister that during Covid time and the world's economic scenario, presenting the Budget is not an easy thing. She has tried to present a Budget which will do good to the nation. But I do not know whether this will bear fruit because there is a contradiction in the Government among the Ministers, among the Ministries. Yesterday, a Minister while talking about ports, he was telling that this Government could not give pension to the employees. So this Government has many difficulties. With these difficulties, I do not know how a Budget is going to help the people. The frontline workers of this country, the doctors, the nurses, have done a tremendous job during this pandemic and I join the hon. Finance Minister in praising their work because they even laid down their lives to save the citizens of India. But who are the most affected because of this pandemic? This Government has not cared about them. They are the daily wagers, who constitute about more than 60 per cent of our population. They are the most affected. What the Central Government, State Governments, individuals, MPs, political parties, could do is that they could feed them. They could give them rice, they could give them something to eat for a day. Eating is not the whole life. They need education. Their children have to be educated. They should be given healthcare. There are many things. What did the Government do? Even in this Budget, these daily wagers were not cared for, there is no programme at all in this Budget to take care of the daily wagers who had been suffering for the last one-and-a-half year and who will still continue to suffer. They constitute 60 per cent-plus population. The Budget should address the country's population. My dear colleague, Dr. Thambidurai, also spoke about minimum Government and maximum governance. He failed to tell one thing which I wanted to add, that is, minimum Government by the elected Government, maximum governance by the rich people of this country. He has not added that. That is the USA model. An eagle can fly high because it is an eagle. A peacock can only dance on its feet, which looks nice. We are the peacock and they are the eagle. Don't think that the eagle is flying high and so we must also fly high. This country needs care. The people of this country need care. The USA has an area that is three times that of India with a population of one-third of that of India. So in this condition, what the Government should do is to take care of the people of our country. Minimum Government and maximum governance: Who governs or by whom is the maximum governance? This is the question. For everything, the Government says, "We cannot do." One Minister says that this is not their duty; to run petroleum companies is not their duty. The other Minister says that insurance is not their duty. It was our duty. Without all these things, India would have gone elsewhere; India

would not have been a country like this. The Government protects its people. You are selling most of the things today, which were created 50-60 years back during the Congress Government. They created wealth by which this Government is gaining. The Budget will not deliver what the Government expects because the Government's attitude is different from what is present in this Budget. Sir, there are a few things which I wanted to point out; the increase in electronic gadgets. Hon. Prime Minister's slogan is 'Make in India'. There are companies coming from outside and most of the companies are electronic companies. There are certain products which have to come from outside.

2.00 P.M.

If they have to pay more customs duty, the cost will be more. In China, the product costs very less. And, if in India, the product costs more, these companies will once again go out of India. So, you cannot achieve 'Make in India'. Secondly, about green energy, the Prime Minister's assurance is that by 2022, there will be the 120 gigawatts of green energy. But, you have increased tax, customs duty on solar panel, solar inverters, etc., which means by 2022, we cannot achieve that 120 gigawatts of green energy, solar energy or hydel energy. You cannot achieve that. So, what the Finance Minister says is not agreeable to even to the other Ministers and other Departments. There is no coordination amongst various Ministries in the Government. That is the problem here. Now, regarding air pollution, already the amount allocated for air pollution has decreased. This is one area where we have to take steps. We are keeping social distancing and all. Most of the hospital wastes; they are putting in the dustbins on the streets. There is no proper system of disposal of hospital wastes. The Environment Ministry had certain rules as to how to dispose of hospital wastes. But, hospitals are not following that. They are just throwing it in the dustbins which are bound to spread diseases. The Government should take steps to ensure that something is done in respect of disposal of hospital wastes. Last year, the National Sample Survey Organization had stated that domestic consumption has come down. The National Sample Survey Organisation is the Government Agency. They have stated that the domestic consumption has come down. Now, for MGNREGA, you have reduced the expenditure by around Rs.50,000 crores. Why has the allocation been reduced? What happens then? The domestic consumption will further go down. How will it help the people? Daily wagers are suffering. And, this will increase the suffering of the large number of daily wagers who are already suffering. The reduction in MGNREGA allocation will further increase the suffering of

the daily wagers. What is the use in giving money to the rich when the people could not purchase? Their purchasing capacity has come down. So, there is still a misunderstanding between this Ministry and that Ministry. Your plan should be targeted towards all people, not a few. Your plan should be targeted towards suffering people who have no money. You must help them. You must provide them employment or they should somehow be made to live comfortably. There are certain things which I think are just a make-up, like applying powder and all. This is the 75th year of Independence. And, we are helping the pensioners, people who are aged above 75 years, that they need not file return. Those who are getting pension and interest alone, need not file returns. But, the tax will be deducted by the bank itself. If there is a concession in tax rates, that is a help. That will make them celebrate. Already, there is a scheme for faceless filing of IT returns. Now, you say that they need not come to the IT office and file their returns.

There are two or three things which I wanted to list out. One is their Five Year Plans. Around Rs.64,000 crores has been allocated for PM Atmanirbhar Swasth Bharat Yojana. It is just to show that this Government is spending more on people. Likewise two or three things which I had seen. So, this Budget itself is to show that this Government is doing a lot to the people, but, ultimately, it does not do anything to the people. It is not helping the people at all.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now; your time is over.

SHRI T.K.S. ELANGO VAN: I am completing, Sir. Minimum Governance by the elected people, people on whom the people of India had faith and elected them to the Government; maximum Governance by the people who are ruling them, who are the rich, who are affable, who can purchase anything; not by the representatives of the people. Sir, with these words, I conclude.

श्री उपसभापति: श्रीमती झरना दास बैद्य। आप बैठकर बोलें, आपकी आवाज़ आएगी। आपके पास बोलने के लिए तीन मिनट का समय है।

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA (Tripura): Sir, the economy in India is in dire straits. I do agree with the opinion expressed by hon. Members that the Budget is a total failure in addressing the present economic crisis. Hon. Minister is giving more concessions to the rich. But, at the same time, you are not taking any step to enhance the purchasing power of the common people. The Budget reflects

intensification of neo-liberal policies and exploitation. It is a direct attack on the basic rights of women, and reflects the conservative and anti-women attitude.

The Budget has been formulated in the context of the worsening hunger and malnutrition which is reflected in the fall in ratings of India on the Global Hunger Index. Workers like Anganwadi, ASHA and Mid-Day Meal workers are the grass root level workers delivering the essential services to the people.

The Budget which was full of rhetoric about the 'Atmanirbhar Bharat' and the \$5 trillion economy has cut down the budget allocation for the Mid-Day Meal scheme by Rs.1,400 crores.

The allocation for MNREGA is reduced by 41 per cent from the last year's revised estimates. There is only a nominal increase in the allocation for National Health Mission.

Sir, considering the unemployment scenario in rural India....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude, Madam; please conclude; your time is over. Please conclude in one minute.

SHRIMATI JHARNA DAS BAIDYA: Yes, Sir. In order to strengthen the situation of the people of State, it is humbly requested to provide extra budget to Tripura Tribal Areas Autonomous District Council (TTAADC) so that State will witness maximum development throughout and to introduce special schemes to Tripura State tea workers, as there are 48 Tea Gardens in Tripura.

Altogether, there is no increase in other welfare schemes in the Budget. Their only objective is to help the corporates.

To sum up, this Budget clearly upholds the interests of the market. It has no place for women. It is once again a blatant attack on the poor and the oppressed. This is a budget to appease the rich accentuating the problems of unemployment and rising inequality.

SHRI ANIL DESAI (Maharashtra): Sir, the people of India had great hopes on the hon. Finance Minister, Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman, when she presented the Union Budget for the year 2021-22. Sir, to put India back on a recovery path following a deep recession induced by COVID-19 and the consequent lockdowns, the Budget this year had to be one 'like never before' as was promised by the hon. Finance Minister. But the Budget has belied the expectations of the people of India. The Budget was presented in a new format with six pillars to create an Atamanirbhar Bharat. Huge outlay of expenditure has been made under these six pillars. Sir, my

State of Maharashtra was the worst hit State and Mumbai had the highest number of COVID afflicted cases as the pandemic had attacked India. But the way and with the deft hands, the hon. Chief Minister, Udhav Thakareji, handled the situation and controlled the pandemic from spreading further, it has been acclaimed by the WHO and Washington Post also took note of it and later on the surveys which were conducted all over the country, my Chief Minister happened to figure in the first five Chief Ministers of the country. Sir, now Rs.35,000 crores have been provided in this Budget for COVID-19 vaccine. It is expected by the States that they will be provided COVID-19 vaccine free of cost by the Central Government as most of the States are cash strapped due to the onslaught of pandemic. I hope the Finance Minister assures the House on this count in her reply. Under the head financial capital, all out support for the development of world class Fin-Tech hub at GIFT -IFSC has been declared under this Budget. Sir, initially Mumbai was declared and is still an international financial services centre as Mumbai is financial capital of the country and also globally known as India's financial centre. With great regret, I would mention here that it looks like with an objective to sideline Mumbai and deprive its pride of place, the Government seems to have accelerated the pace of developing IFSC at Ahmedabad which is reflected in this Budget. Further, the push to create new infrastructure is appreciable but certainly not at the cost of doing away with the national assets, that is, by selling or privatising profit-making public sector companies. It's shocking that the monetisation project included sale of valuable land held by public sector companies. The increase in FDI in insurance from 49 per cent to 74 per cent is highly objectionable. It is as good as handing over the profit-making insurance sector to foreign players and corporates. This step has resulted into a widespread anger and resentment among the insurance employees.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA) *in the Chair.*]

I would urge upon the Government to review this decision in the interest of insurance industry and the people of India. Sir, disinvestment and strategic sale of BPCL, Air India, Shipping Corporation of India, Container Corporation of India, BEML and Pawan Hans, need to be reviewed by the Government. Similarly, the proposal to privatise two public sector banks and one general insurance company, should be scrapped as these are profit making national assets which also create job opportunities to the unemployed youth. The LIC is the richest corporation which has profit base and serves the interest of crores of Indian policy holders. It has been playing key role in the financial market and also pays handsome annual dividend to

the Government of India. The proposal to bring IPO in LIC would be an unwelcome step as it would lose its glory to the utter disappointment of lakhs of Indians. Sir, under inclusive development for aspirational India, agriculture credit target has been enhanced to 16.5 lakh crores, but this huge outlay is far from satisfying the expectation of farmers. All that the farmer needs is inclusion of MSP in the farm laws and not oral assurance. Farmers have been demanding the MSP based on Swaminathan Commission's formula of C2 plus 50 per cent. But ensuring 1.5 times the cost of production on crops will not help in addressing farmers' plight as it does not provide a remunerative price. Farmers demand that the farm laws enacted by the Government be withdrawn and they are given opportunity for hearing. I hope the Prime Minister would give them the opportunity and resolve their contentious issues as more than 75 days have gone and the farming community is agitating at the borders of Delhi. Sir, Rs.300 crores have been provided to the Government of Goa for Diamond Jubilee Celebrations of the State's liberation from Portuguese. Sir, my State of Maharashtra has just celebrated its Diamond Jubilee in 2020. So, why Maharashtra was dropped? Sir, during COVID pandemic, hon. Prime Minister had declared Rs.20,000 crore package to overcome the depressive situation in the country and revive the economy by creating jobs and giving thrust to MSMEs. But nothing seemed to have worked on the ground. There is no mention about this in the Budget. What evolved out of this package? Still the demand is sluggish; though banks and financial institutions are flushed with money, there is no credit off take. Unemployment is rampant due to non-availability of jobs. Under the situation, the Government should put money in the hands of the people to create demand and thus revive the economy. The falling Rupee and ever-rising fuel prices have broken the backbone of the common man. The Government needs to take immediate corrective steps in this direction.

Sir, in the entire Budget, hardly anything substantial is being budgeted for my State of Maharashtra. It is with great regret that I would state that Mumbai, the financial capital of India, contributes maximum to the exchequer by way of taxes and, in return, Mumbai hardly gets anything. Moreover, the rightful dues of GST, amounting to around Rs.25,000 crores have also remained in arrears. It was expected that Maharashtra will be provided substantially but nothing has come our way. But, the States which are going for elections have been provided liberally with an eye on elections. Sir, spirit of cooperative federalism should be reflected in the Budget, in a better way in times to come. Thank you.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL(Punjab): Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I rise to oppose the Budget. But, at the same time, as a chartered accountant, I commend the Finance Minister for being very transparent. I have been in this House for 14 years and, for the first time at least, the figures are honest. However, Sir, the problem is with the fiscal deficit. The pandemic played havoc with our economy. We have a huge fiscal deficit this year and next year. My worry is that with this huge fiscal deficit, the prices will go out of hand. There will be a huge inflation. We saw once before, after the Lehman crisis that when the Government relaxed the fiscal policies how prices went up, especially food prices. This is going to be a double whammy for the poor person of the country who has also lost his job.

Sir, I would like to say that this Government talks always of cooperative federalism. But, at the same time, if you see, in all the States which are going to the polls, lakhs of crores of rupees are planned to be spent except the State of Punjab, perhaps because, I feel, they will not get any seat there. But, I think, it is extremely unfair.

Sir, the Finance Minister gave the figures of how much procurement has been done, how the figures have gone up two times and three times. I commend this Government for that and it is a fact that the MSP was raised, direct benefits to kisans have been given, soil cards were given and insurance has been improved. But, then the question arises as to why our farmers are on the street. Why are our farmers committing suicide? Why are our farmers in debt? I think, this Government needs to look at that issue because the main reason is that this Government is not thinking out of the box. Sir, this is the Council of States. I talk of my State, the State of Punjab. My farmer is on the street because he feels that the market is going to be snatched away from him.

For that, one will have to go into the history, a little bit. The State of Punjab included Haryana at that time. It came to the country's rescue when we were begging for food from America under PL-480, etc. As a result, when the window opens, both for wheat and paddy, FCI would procure everything that the farmer had to offer. So, the farmer had a market at his doorstep. Sir, the Prime Minister himself said that 80 per cent of our farmers have less than one hectare of land. These farmers have a market at the doorstep today. That is why they are stuck in this wheat and rice cycle. They can take the production risk but they can't take the marketing risk. Now they fear that with the opening up of these three black laws, private sector will come in. They will have to go to the private *mandis* with their surplus stock and they will not get MSP. The Prime Minister said yesterday, both in the Lok Sabha and before that in this House, "MSP was there, MSP will be there, MSP is there." But who is procuring

at MSP? It is only the State agencies. The private sector is not procuring at MSP, and that is what the farmer says. He wants MSP is to be enshrined in the law. You do that and the farmer will go back tomorrow morning, but you are reluctant to do that. Now, the question arises as to what you are going to do to create a market at the doorstep of the farmers. The Prime Minister said, 'Look at the milk farmer. He is doing so well.' Yesterday he said strawberry farmers are doing so well. Look at Gujarat. The milk farmer is doing well because he has a market at his doorstep. Whatever he produces, the next day Amul picks it up, Mother Dairy picks it up, some private cooperatives will pick it up. Our farmers lack that and that is why they are stuck, -- I would, at least, speak for Punjab and Haryana -- in the wheat-rice cycle. Now, this Government has now said, and, I commend them that Rs. 20,000 crores will be given to create a new institution which will fund long term infra. It is required because short term funds were being used for financing long term requirements or infrastructure projects. But why could they not think of something for the farm sector on similar lines? Why should a banking institution be created which will fund these cooperatives, the food processing plants and such things? This is to ensure that the farmer finds a market at his doorstep, and till such time you that provide a market at the doorstep, please do not take away what they already have. Sir, in an answer to my question in this House, the Minister had said, Rs. 90,000 crores of fruits and vegetables are wasted post-harvest. Why? It is because there is no market at their doorstep. You can tell a farmer, 'please grow strawberries', but if the strawberries are going to rot on his farm, what does he do with them? He needs to live and I have...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Sir, give me five minutes at least. I have just spoken for three minutes.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You are going to speak for another one or two minutes.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Why can't they create a wheat board, why can't they create a rice board, why can't they create a vegetable board and why can't they create a fruit board. Sir, I want to say one more thing and I will end. Give me 2-3 minutes. One is, Defence expenditure has gone up, which is good. We are faced with serious threat, but buying most modern aircraft or guns is not enough. You have to ensure

that your soldiers are motivated, that their morale is high. And the way their spokespersons are abusing the farmers whose children are on the borders, demotivates them. I don't know what they are trying to do. Sometimes they are called anti-nationals, sometimes they are called *Khalistanis*, sometimes they are called terrorists. I hope it will percolate down and all their spokespersons will now stop this nonsense which has been going on for so long. Sir, one more thing I would like to say. Please do not use force with these farmers who are agitating. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have just one minute. Please don't interrupt. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, then you must give me extra time if they are going to interrupt.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please carry on. Your time is already over.

SHRI NARESH GUJRAL: Sir, I have one thing to say that *lathis*, water cannons, barbed fences are not going to do anything because those farmers are inspired by our Gurus. They are inspired by Shaheed Bhagat Singh and today every farmer is saying,

*"सरफ़रोशी की तमन्ना अब हमारे दिल में है,
देखना है ज़ोर कितना बाज़ु-ए-कातिल में है।"*

And I can tell you, Sir, these farmers will only go home when they can go home and say, फ़तह, फ़तह, फ़तह। They will not go home otherwise and I am telling you, either you withdraw these black laws or you provide them MSP for everything that they produce. Thank you very much.

SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR(Andhra Pradesh): Hon. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I am very delighted for the opportunity given to me to take part in the discussion.

Sir, this Budget has not provided any hope to 5 crore people of the State of Andhra Pradesh. No allocations in the Budget in order to implement the provisions of the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act, 2014.

Till now territorial jurisdiction of Vizag South Coast Railway Zone has not been specified, no funds have been allocated and no revenue deficit relief given. The Centre needs to generously support Andhra Pradesh which has been suffering due to bifurcation of the State.

The proposal of the Central Government to privatize Visakhapatnam Steel Plant leads to an uproar in the State of Andhra Pradesh. The Visakhapatnam Steel Plant is

now worth about Rs. 2 lakh crores. The steel plant bagged the National Energy Leader Award and Excellent Energy Efficient Unit Award consecutively till 2020. It is going to generate employment opportunities to one lakh people. The interesting development is that POSCO has evinced interest to set up a steel plant in Visakhapatnam in RINL lands. A joint team of RINL and POSCO visited the RINL, Visakhapatnam, and participated in a meeting with their representative. Subsequently, the officials visited on 09-07-2019 and 20-02-2020 in connection with setting up the plant. In the same connection, they met the hon. Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh. But, till now, this issue has been kept in dark. I don't know why the people of Andhra Pradesh were not informed about this for the reasons best known to them. It appears that the Government initiated the process much earlier. Now, the State Government is also shedding crocodile tears about the proposal. This has come to light vide reply given to an Unstarred Question No. 1109 raised by one of my colleagues belonging to the Ruling Party. It created further doubts. However, we request the hon. Minister to drop the proposal of disinvestment.

It is reported that the hon. Chief Minister, Andhra Pradesh, has visited Delhi and requested the hon. Prime Minister and hon. Home Minister for funds and resolving bifurcation issues. It yielded no fruits. We do not know whether the Delhi trips of our hon. Chief Minister are for that purpose or any other known purposes since there is no reflection in the Budget.

SHRI AYODHYA RAMI REDDY(Andhra Pradesh): Please don't mention the hon. Chief Minister. It is not a fact. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KANAKAMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: But the fact remains. After June, 2019, in Andhra Pradesh, about 140 temples were attacked. * still are going on. An hon. Member from YSRCP in his speech earlier referred to our TDP and made allegations against us. In fact, no action on Antarvedi burning of chariot has been taken. Recently, Lord Ram was attacked in Ramateertham Temple. Instead of taking action against culprits, the State Government registered false cases against the opposition TDP leaders and made a statement that BJP is also involved in it. There is no proper investigation. The State itself is encouraging these types of attacks. However, we demand a CBI probe into these attacks. There is a total lawlessness in the State. Political victimization is going on. The Government machinery and police is being misused and abused by the present State Government.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, the present party came to power in Andhra Pradesh by campaigning and made a request to the people of Andhra Pradesh to give 25 MPs so that he will get Special Category Status. Though they have given 22 seats, nothing has happened so far for the reasons known to the public. But, the State of Andhra Pradesh is not even turning a single stone for upliftment of the State. All the canons of democracy are flouted. Sir, even the print and electronic media is not spared! Media has also become victim in the State of Andhra Pradesh!

For construction of Amaravati, which is the Capital of new born State, no funds have been allocated. Sir, the hon. Prime Minister laid the foundation-stone and granted Rs. 1,500 crores. Already Rs. 10,000 crores have been invested. The construction was abruptly stopped by the present Government. Assembly, Secretariat, High Court and other respective institutions have also been functioning there for the last several years. The present Government of Andhra Pradesh has decided to create three capitals, contrary to the provisions of the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act.

The present hon. Chief Minister made a statement in the Assembly earlier that he will support Amaravati and now contrary to that he has taken a decision. The farmers of Amaravati have been agitating for the last 422 days. The decision of the present Government is contrary to the provisions of the Andhra Pradesh Reorganisation Act.

Sir, Polavaram Project expenditure is estimated at Rs. 55,548 crores. But, no funds have been allocated. For getting funds, the present Government did not take any steps. The expenditure on Polavaram Project is estimated at Rs. 55,548 crores. But, no funds have been allocated. The present State Government did not take any steps to get the funds. It was no surprise to me, being aware of the manner in which the YSRCP and the Government of AP have been attacking the constitutional institutions, like, the Legislative Council, the State Election Commission, the High Court, etc. All canons of democracy are being brazenly flouted. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please conclude.

SHRI KANAKMEDALA RAVINDRA KUMAR: The State Government is filing false cases to suppress the dissent. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Central Government should immediately intervene in the present state of Andhra Pradesh where the situation is very alarming; lawlessness is rampant everywhere; false cases are being filed against the critics; political opponents are being suppressed. I request the hon. Minister and the Central Government to allocate funds in order to fulfill the demands of Andhra

Pradesh Reorganization Act. I request the Central Government to immediately take special steps in order to protect and save the people of Andhra Pradesh from the oppressive and suppressive acts of the State Government. Thank you, Sir.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL (Rajasthan): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman Sir, for having given me this opportunity to speak here. As we all know, we are discussing this year's Budget in an extraordinary situation. On one side, there has been COVID Pandemic and its impact; on the other, our *anna data* are in a historical fight against the anti-farmer laws passed by the Central Government. They are on the streets for the last seventy-five days even in extremely cold weather. Around seventy farmers have lost their lives during this agitation. I salute their uncompromising historic struggle to save the present and future. I extend my solidarity with their peaceful and non-violent struggle. I pay my homage to our *kisan* brothers who lost their lives during this agitation.

Coming to the Budget, many of my colleagues have already made their points. Unemployment is today a burning issue. We are remembering the words of our hon. Prime Minister. He had promised creation of two crore jobs every year. But, today, he is totally silent on the rising unemployment in our country. According to the Centre for Monitoring Indian Economy (CMIE), about 21 million salaried people lost their jobs from April to August, 2020. There were 86 million salaried jobs in Indian during the year 2019-20. But, in August 2020, this figure drastically went down to 65 million. Rural unemployment too remains at a worrying level of 9.15 per cent, in December 2020, as per the CMIE.

As per the information provided by the Ministry of Tourism to the Standing Committee, the pandemic led to revenue loss of around rupees one lakh crore in the tourism industry alone. There was also a loss of 225 crore jobs in the tourism sector. What is the way forward to address this concern? How are we going to compensate in this issue of unemployment? The banks are also now very reluctant to give loans to the tourism sector. This was informed by the Secretary (Tourism) in the Standing Committee. Even in the measures, which the Government has announced in the Budget to meet these extraordinary challenges, there is nothing to revive the sector or to generate more revenue. The youth is asking where the jobs are. In the Budget Speech, or, in the Budget documents, there is no roadmap to generate more employment opportunities. The Budget is totally silent on creating employment opportunities.

Coming to *per capita* income, now, we are behind even to Bangladesh in terms of *per capita* income. The SBI Ecowrap, June 23, 2020, has projected that *per*

capita income in India will fall in a severe manner post Covid. It is estimated that the *per capita* income will decline by 5.4 per cent in Financial Year, 2020-21, to Rs.1.43 lakh. The Economic Survey itself has pointed out that the GDP registered a shocking 23.9 percentage collapse between April-June, 2020, the first contraction in 50 years. The daily wage earners, street vendors, migrant labourers and unorganized workers are still in an unexplainable crisis. What roadmap is this Government providing to them? As you all know, this type of extraordinary situation needs extraordinary measures. The people in this country had a great hope and expectation from the first Budget after the Covid-19 pandemic outbreak. They were eagerly waiting to get relief to revive their livelihood, business, and their economic activities. It is very sad to state that the Budget unfortunately failed to give confidence to the people of this country. It is not the effect of pandemic alone! Before the Covid, the GDP projection for 2020-21 was already bad. The pandemic has only deepened the pre-existing economic crisis. The GDP growth has already hit a 11 year low in 2019-20. Even, now, the Government is arguing that the economy is on V-shape recovery. But how that recovery is possible is not answered in the Budget. Curiously, one mantra is behind you, which we are all seeing, and that *mantra* is privatisation. The Budget has included every measure to sell out our public enterprises. Disinvestment is the only source of income as far as this Government is concerned. Earlier, it was the airports, now it is the shipping sector, and again, it is the insurance sector. Every sector is being sold out for the benefit of a handful crony, capitalist friends. The Government has already sold airports. Now, the Airports Authority of India has become the Airports Authority of Adani. Now, the Shipping Corporation of India is also going in the same way. Yes! everything is going in the same way. And the buyers are two, three persons only! That is, India is now under him.

Sir, MSME is the major sector for reviving our economy. It is the backbone of our economy. The number of MSME employees is about 12 crore. It is responsible for about 48 percentage exports. What is happening in the MSME sector, already, Chidambaramji has pointed out. That has totally collapsed. About 35 percentage of the MSME sector have shut down. It has totally collapsed. What is the roadmap for reviving the MSME, which is a major area for providing jobs? You did not have any vision and you did not have any programme. Then, how can you revive the MSME sector? The Government offered credit access, ignoring the MSME sector's demand for a stimulus to address working capital requirements. Everybody pointed out MNREGA. The only hope for crores of Indian households was the Rural Employment Scheme. Even though the hon. Prime Minister in the other House has called it as a monumental corruption of the UPA Government, everybody is now

saying that it is the only one scheme which is providing jobs in the rural sector. But what is happening now? As per the records, nearly 120 million people have asked for jobs under the Scheme during this financial year. The total work demanded under MNREGA in 2020-21 is 53 percentage higher than that of the last year. Nearly 35 million people have requested MNREGA work in the months of December and January, 2020. This is a clear sign that there is a high demand for jobs in the rural sector. In spite of the demand from the people and suggestion from experts, MNREGA allocation for 2021-22 did not cross Rs.1,00,000 crore mark and stands at Rs.73,000 crores only. This is a 34.5 percentage reduction from 2020-21. From this reduced amount, it is clear how the Government is going to revive unemployment in the rural sector. We have discussed migrant labourers' issues many times. We saw their plight. Poor migrant workers died while walking to their homes. It is also a concern that there is no immediate relief to the migrant labourers and unorganized sector in the Budget. The enrolment of 25 crore workers in the proposed portal will take, at least, five years which is announced in the Budget. What are the immediate measures that the Government has taken? Nothing is there.

Now, I come to the petroleum prices. That is also discussed here. Yesterday, the hon. Minister has given a reply to my supplementary question. Actually, with utmost respect, I am trying to say that this is totally a misleading statement. With all my respect, I would like to say that the hon. Minister was misleading this House. Let me give some details in this regard. In May, 2014, at the end of the UPA-2 Government term, the petrol price in Delhi was about Rs. 71 per litre and the global crude oil price average was US dollar 101.10. Today, the crude oil price is at 58 US dollar and petrol price in Delhi is at Rs. 87.30. How is it happening like this? On April 21, 2020, the crude oil price fell to its lowest level since 1999. It was the lowest price in 21 years. The price was at 16.38 US dollars. Then what did the Government do? Was the benefit of the lowest price passed to the common people of the country? No. What the Government did is, within a week, on May 5, 2020, the Government increased the excise duty on petrol and diesel. The excise duty was increased by Rs. 10 per litre on petrol and Rs. 13 per litre on diesel, a record hike. It has to be remembered that the hike was happening during the Covid period; and since June 7, 2020, the petrol and diesel prices were increased for 22 consecutive days. It didn't stop there. Since November 19, 2020, the Government has increased the petrol and diesel prices 15 to 16 times.

Excise duty on petrol. In May, 2014, the excise duty on petrol was Rs. 9.20 when the UPA was in power and on diesel, it was Rs. 3.46 per litre. In the last six years, you have increased the excise duty on petrol by additional Rs. 23.78 per litre,

and on diesel by an addition of Rs. 28.37 per litre. You have hiked the excise duty 13 times and have earned Rs. 19 lakh crore in last six-and-a-half years by increasing excise duty on petrol and diesel alone. What have you done with that Rs. 19 lakh crores? The people are suffering again and again. They are in much pain. But nothing has happened.

In addition to this, now you have decided to impose an agricultural infrastructure development cess also. Therefore, this is the situation in petrol and diesel. Therefore, I think, the Minister has totally misled the House while saying that this is only because of the crude oil price in the international market. That is a totally irresponsible statement. I would like to tell that.

Then, Sir, regarding defence. Today we discussed about that also. Chidambaramji pointed out that even there is no mention of the word 'defence' in the Budget itself. You are very much nationalized. We saw the nationalism; the leakage of a WhatsApp message. We saw the nationalism. The Balakot incident was leaked to one of your media friends. The country witnessed the nationalism of the BJP. You are talking about nationalism every time. What is your defence preparedness? Nothing is there. There is no additional thing. I will tell you. In 2018, Indian Army Vice-Chief, Lieutenant General Sarath Chand, had informed the Standing Committee on Defence that 68 per cent of the army equipment was in the vintage category, 24 per cent in the current and 8 per cent in the start-of-art category. What the Government is doing? What is your action for modernization of defence forces? Is there any mention of that in the Budget? We didn't see any mention of that in this Budget. Now hon. Raj Nath Singhji today has given a statement about the border issues. We are all with you on this issue. On fighting our enemy countries, we are all with you. But you are not giving enough information to the political parties of the country. You are not taking all political parties into confidence. That is what the country is lagging in. You are doing things at your level to show that you are the master in all such things. This is not going to help us.

Sir, many announcements were made. My friend, Shri Muraleedharan, is here. When was the announcement for the Kerala National Highway made? We all know that hon. Nitin Gadkari had announced five months earlier that the National Highway in Kerala was going to be widened into six lanes. Now, they have said in this Budget that Rs. 65,000 crores have been announced for road development in Kerala. That is a package of the NHAI. Everybody knows about that. Many announcements were made even earlier. In 2015, the hon. Prime Minister announced a Rs. 1.25 lakh crore package for Bihar. It was a big package. That was a poll promise. But schemes worth only Rs. 1,559 crore out of the total package were executed in Bihar

till 2020. Out of Rs. 1,25,000 crore, projects worth just Rs. 1,559 crore were executed. These are promises that you made. In the last Bihar elections, you announced free vaccination for the poor. We didn't find any mention of vaccination in this Budget.

श्री सुशील कुमार मोदी (बिहार): सर, माननीय सदस्य बिहार के बारे में गलत बोल रहे हैं कि केवल 1,000 करोड़ मिले हैं। इन्हें जानकारी नहीं है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please don't interrupt. Let him speak.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, farmers are protesting. Our *annadatas* are in a historical struggle and they have been protesting on the streets for so many days now. Our Prime Minister used the term '*aandolanjeevis*'. I don't understand this term '*aandolanjeevis*'. We saw some *aandolan* in 2014 also. Were they also *aandolanjeevis* who promoted agitation? Before the Government came to power in Delhi, our National Capital witnessed so many *aandolans*. My humble question to the hon. Prime Minister is, were they too prompted or instigated by *aandolanjeevis*?

एक माननीय सांसद : आंदोलनकारी और आंदोलनजीवी में फ़र्क होता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Yes, brother, there would be *aandolans*. The political system in the country itself is based on *aandolans*. ...**(Interruptions)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Venugopal, you don't have to reply to them. Please, address the Chair. ...**(Interruptions)**...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, the political system in the country is like that. What do you mean by '*aandolan*'? India got freedom through *aandolan*. * because he did *aandolan* to get us freedom from British *Raaj*. Even the Indian National Congress did that. Mahatma Gandhi was Leader of the Indian National Congress.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI V. MURALEEDHARAN): Sir, please don't denigrate the...

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the record and if it is denigrating, then I would expunge it from the records. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Every time such *aandolans* have taken place. ...(*Interruptions*)... Sir, my question is, when the poor farmers are fighting for their livelihood, when they are fighting for their present and future, how can they abuse them like this? ...(*Interruptions*)... How can they abuse them like this? ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री शिव प्रताप शुक्ल (उत्तर प्रदेश): सर, ...(*व्यवधान*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the records. If it is.. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, they are branded as *Khalistanis*. They are branded as terrorists. They are branded as Pakistani agents. Every day somebody appears in some evening debate on TV channels and abuses our farmers badly.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You may conclude now.

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: Sir, I am about to conclude.

Sir, this is the fate that our *annadatas* are facing due to the attitude of this Government. Therefore, the farmers need an answer from the Government.

I would like to end my speech quoting the same *Thirukkural* that the hon. Finance Minister quoted in her Speech -- "*Uzhuvaar Ulagattharkku Aaniaathattradu ezhavarai ellam porutthu.*" This quote from *Thirukkural* means that farmers are the linchpin of the world. They support others who cannot plough the land. So, listen to the farmers. Show some concern. Withdraw this *kaala kanoon*. Withdraw this *kaala kanoon*. Thank you very much, Sir.

वित्त मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री; तथा कारपोरेट कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर): उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आपने मुझे बजट पर intervene करने का अवसर दिया, इसके लिए आपका धन्यवाद। मैं कल से लगातार विपक्षी दलों के सांसदों के तर्क भी सुन रहा हूँ, लेकिन मुझे एक बात की सबसे ज्यादा पीड़ा हुई। देखिए, बजट पर कोई आलोचना करे, यह उनका हक है।

कोई सुझाव दे, तो बहुत अच्छी बात है, लेकिन मैंने कभी यह उम्मीद नहीं की थी कि * इससे बड़ा दुर्भाग्य और क्या है? ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: No. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री सैयद नासिर हुसैन : ये झूठ बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: No, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री दीपेन्द्र सिंह हुड्डा (हरियाणा): सर, ये झूठ बोल रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please carry on. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): If something is wrong, I will look into the record. ...(Interruptions).... I will look into the record. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने बड़े स्पष्ट तौर पर यह कहा कि आंदोलनकारी और आंदोलनजीवियों में क्या अंतर है। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the record. ...(Interruptions).. If something is unparliamentary, it will be corrected. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI K.C. VENUGOPAL: It should be expunged. ...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : अगर उनसे जोड़ दिया जाए, जो इतना बड़ा ...(व्यवधान)...

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... If anything is unparliamentary, I will look into it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, दो बातें बड़ी स्पष्ट हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, यह जो बजट है, यह एक आशा है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

SHRI DEEPENDER SINGH HOODA: Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : इस बजट में आशा की किरण दिखती है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please, go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : इसमें आशा है - नए भारत के निर्माण की, इसमें आशा है 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' की। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : मैं माननीय वित्त मंत्री, निर्मला सीतारमण जी को धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I have said, if anything is unparliamentary, it will be looked into. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' बनाने के लिए उनके द्वारा जो बजट लाया गया है, उसकी पूरे देश ने भूरि-भूरि प्रशंसा की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, समाज के सभी वर्गों ने इस बजट की प्रशंसा की है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will check the records. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, मैं यह भी कहना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट के बाद किस तरह से मार्केट ने भी रिएक्ट किया है। एक दिन नहीं, दो दिन नहीं, बल्कि मार्केट में लगातार positive response आया और सेंसेक्स में 51,000 प्वाइंट्स से ज्यादा का उछाल आया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह भी अपने आप में दिखाता है कि पूरे देश और दुनिया में इस बजट की किस तरह से प्रशंसा की

गई है। यह मोदी जी की वह सोच है कि भारत को 'सशक्त भारत' भी बनाना है और 'आत्मनिर्भर भारत' बनाने का काम भी इस बजट के माध्यम से करना है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, खुशी की बात इसलिए भी है कि विपक्ष के नेता भी कहते हैं कि 70 वर्षों में पहली बार इतना पारदर्शी बजट आया है। इसके लिए भी उनका मैं बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद करता हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

सर, अगर extra budgetary resources की बात की जाए, तो वह ज़ीरो है। इतनी पारदर्शिता इसमें लाई गई! ...**(व्यवधान)**... इस बार डिजिटल बजट रखा गया और 'मेक इन इंडिया' टैबलेट पर इसको पेश किया गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... वही भारत, जहाँ पहले केवल दो mobile manufacturing units थे, आज मोदी जी की नीतियों के कारण दुनिया के सबसे बड़े दो mobile manufacturing निर्माता हमारे हिन्दुस्तान में आए हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**... यह हिन्दुस्तान की एक बहुत बड़ी उपलब्धि है, यह भारत की उपलब्धि है, यह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी के नेतृत्व की उपलब्धि है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

सर, यहाँ पर विपक्ष के कुछ सांसदों ने कहा कि यह आम बजट नहीं, यह खास बजट है।...**(व्यवधान)**...सर, मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि ये जो नारा लगाते थे, ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, ये नारा लगाते थे, ये कहते थे कि गरीबी मिटाएँगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... सर, इनके समय में गरीबी नहीं मिटी, गरीब मिटने पर मजबूर हो गया था। ...**(व्यवधान)**... लेकिन, पिछले छः वर्षों में मोदी सरकार की नीतियों के कारण हिन्दुस्तान के इतिहास में यह पहली बार हुआ कि हिन्दुस्तान में सबसे ज्यादा गरीबों को 'गरीबी रेखा' से बाहर निकलने का अवसर अगर किसी ने दिया, तो वह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने दिया है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I had allowed Mr. K.C. Venugopal. He has already spoken. So, you can go to your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : महोदय, सबसे ज्यादा गरीबों को गरीबी रेखा से बाहर निकलने का अवसर नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने दिया है।...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): When your turn comes, you can speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : महोदय, यहां पर हमारी महिला एवं बाल विकास मंत्री, श्रीमती स्मृति ज़ूबिन इरानी जी यहां पर मौजूद हैं।...**(व्यवधान)**...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): When his turn comes, he will speak. ...(*Interruptions*)... You have given name. ...(*Interruptions*)... Go to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि महिलाओं और बाल विकास के लिए भी हमारी सरकार ने 16 प्रतिशत बजट की वृद्धि की है। यह भी महिलाओं और बच्चों के उत्थान और विकास के लिए है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): You can't interrupt like this. Please go back to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : सर, समाज के अनुसूचित जाति वर्ग के कल्याण के लिए अलग-अलग मंत्रालयों में कुल मिलाकर 51.65 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि की गई है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Minister, just one minute. ...(*Interruptions*)... Mr. Nasir Hussain, I did not want to take your name, but you cannot challenge the Chair. You are a new Member. Learn something...(*Interruptions*)...learn something and then you say. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please go back to your seat now. ...(*Interruptions*)... You go to your seat now. ...(*Interruptions*)... You cannot challenge the Chair, Mr. Nasir Hussain. Go and learn something from your senior Members. ...(*Interruptions*)... Please go to your seat. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं एक बार फिर से आग्रह करना चाहता हूँ, बड़ी गम्भीरता के साथ कहना चाहता हूँ कि जो आम बजट और खास बजट की बात करते थे, मैं उन्हें बताना चाहता हूँ कि आम बजट यही होता है कि महिला और बाल विकास के लिए 16 प्रतिशत ज्यादा दिया। ...(**व्यवधान**)... हमने अनुसूचित जाति के लिए 51.65 प्रतिशत की बजट की वृद्धि की है। इसी तरह सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय में 28 परसेंट की वृद्धि की है, जो नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने की है।

महोदय, मैं आपके सामने कुछ और बातें रखना चाहता हूँ। आप जिन गरीबों के लिए कहते थे कि 'गरीबी हटाओ', आप उनको न पक्का मकान दे पाए और न गाँव-गाँव तक बिजली पहुंचा पाए। देश के हर गाँव और हर परिवार को बिजली देने का काम अगर किसी ने किया है तो वह नरेन्द्र मोदी जी की सरकार ने किया है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Mr. Thakur, please conclude now because it is going to be 3 o'clock now.

श्री अनुराग सिंह ठाकुर : महोदय, पांच मिनट में तो नहीं हो पाएगा, जब तक मेरी बात पूरी न हो, तब तक आप सदन को extend कर दीजिए।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): I will have to take the sense of the House in that case. Please try to conclude before 3 o'clock.

SHRI ANURAG SINGH THAKUR: Sir, I am trying to conclude. I am not going into details of the scheme. ...(Interruptions)... हिन्दुस्तान के गरीब से गरीब परिवार के लिए शौचालय बनाने का काम, गाँव-गाँव में हर घर को बिजली देने का काम, चार-चार एलईडी बल्ब देने का काम, पक्का मकान देने का काम, बैंक खाते खोलने और उन खातों में पैसे जमा करने का काम और यही नहीं, अब हर घर को नल(व्यवधान).....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI BHUBANESWAR KALITA): Please sit down now. Now, we will take up the Special Mentions. Shri Anil Desai, not present. ...(Interruptions)... Dr. Santanu Sen, not present. ...(Interruptions)...

Now, the House is adjourned till 9 a.m. on Friday, the 12th February, 2021.

The House then adjourned at fifty-nine minutes past two of the clock till nine of the clock on Friday, the 12th February, 2021.