

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Lt. Gen. (Dr.) D. P. Vats (Retd.) from Lok Sabha chamber, please ask your question.

LT. GEN. (DR.) D.P. VATS (RETD.): Sir, through you, I would like to ask the hon. Minister about the action against the people who come on media and use the filthy language. The channels which give fake news, I would like to know whether only the action was initiated or it culminated into punishment also.

DR. L. MURUGAN: Sir, I want to convey, through this august House, to the Member again that we are concerned about the freedom of speech and freedom of expression. Sir, the Press Council of India is there. A three-tier mechanism is there.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please do not talk while sitting; it is not going on record.

DR. L. MURUGAN: Sir, a three-tier mechanism is there, one is self-regulatory. Then, self regulating bodies can take. Then, if the grievances are not sorted out, then, only inter-Departmental Committee is going to take the grievances, and sort it out. I want to tell that we initiated 160 cases against the TV Channels.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, the Question Hour is over.

[Written Answers to Starred and Unstarred Questions are available as Part-1 to this Debate, published electronically on the Rajya Sabha website under the link <https://rajyasabha.nic.in/Debates/OfficialDebatesDateWise>]

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS[£]

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we shall take up discussion on Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. ...*(Interruptions)*... Honourable M. Thambidurai ji. ...*(Interruptions)*... you please speak, only your speech shall go on record.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY) *in the Chair.*]

DR. M. THAMBIDURAI (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak on this subject. ...*(Interruptions)*... On behalf of AIADMK Party, I rise to thank the hon. President for his Address to the Parliament, which listed the achievements of Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modiji and the Government led by him, including the achievements in healthcare, infrastructure,

[£] Further discussion continued from 2.02.2022

defence, farming, and start-ups among others. At the outset, I congratulate the Modi's Government for its successful fight against the COVID-19 pandemic and thank the Central Government for extending a meaningful support to the efforts of all the State Governments in India. Sir, I want to once again thank our hon. Prime Minister that when AIADMK Government was in power and when the first phase of pandemic took place, at that time, the Government extended assistance to our former Chief Minister, Edappadi Palaniswami, who did marvelous work to tackle the pandemic situation at that time. Sir, at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic, we were all caught unaware about what is going to happen. Even most of the developed countries were worried how to tackle this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*... At that time, our hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi, took quick decisions and firm measures in containing the spread of virus. As the hon. President mentioned in his Address, the proof of India's capability to fight against COVID-19 epidemic has been witnessed in the vaccination drive. Sir, with Rs. 64,000 crores, Prime Minister Ayushman Bharat Mission is preparing the country for future healthcare crisis. I should like to make a special mention of the wonderful action taken by the AIADMK Government in Tamil Nadu under the leadership of Thiru Edappadi Palaniswamy and Thiru O. Panneerselvam to protect the lives and livelihood of our almost eight crore population of Tamil Nadu at that time. Sir, the AIADMK Government during the period of pandemic situation provided cash assistance of Rs. 5,500, made provision of foodgrains for more than 1.2 crore families for eight months. A separate payment of Rs. 2,000 was made to Labour Welfare Board members, weavers and several lakh migrant workers. For several months, nutritious food, cooked and prepared well was given free of cost to hundreds of people through Amma Canteens in the major towns and cities of Tamil Nadu. Medical help was made readily available to millions of COVID affected people in Tamil Nadu. An excellent treatment was provided to all in need. Indeed, an exemplary work was in force during the time of AIADMK Government, headed by Thiru Edappadi Palaniswami. I take this opportunity to thank the Central Government for the support it provided to us at that time. Sir, we have administered 150 crore vaccines in less than a year. More than 90 per cent of adults have received at least one dose of vaccine while more than 70 per cent have been fully vaccinated and the third dose of vaccine is being administered effectively. I must congratulate Prime Minister, Narendra Modi's Government for this monumental work executed effectively.

Sir, India has emerged as a role model for the world in providing health care and affordable medicines to the people through the Pradhan Mantri Bhartiya

Janaushadhi Pariyojana, as it has set up 8,000 kendras to provide the poor with affordable medicines. It is very important to note that our country has exported AYUSH products worth Rs. 11,000 crores to foreign countries. Also, you know very well, even though we faced a lot of epidemic problems during Narendra Modiji's period, in eight months between April and November, 2021, Foreign Direct Investment of 48 billion dollars was made in India. Our foreign exchange reserves exceed 630 billion US dollars. Because of the Jan Dhan accounts, Aadhaar and mobile connectivity, people have benefited from direct cash transfer during the pandemic. More than 44 crore people have joined the banking system. These are all not small achievements. In the area of agriculture and food distribution, our country has set new records. Under the Pradhan Mantri Kisan Samman Nidhi Scheme, Rs. 1.8 lakh crores have been transferred to more than 11 crore farmer families. More than one lakh crore rupees has been paid as compensation to around eight crore farmers. Sixty four lakh hectares of land has been developed with irrigation facilities under various schemes of the Central Government and I register my appreciation on this historic achievement as I am also the son of a rural small farmer from a remote village of Tamil Nadu. The collateral-free loan given to 13.5 lakh medium, small and micro industries have helped to keep the economy and core sector's production moving. A huge emphasis of this Government for the development of infrastructure and transport will accelerate the overall growth of the country and generate new job opportunities for several workers. I must specially appreciate this Government that Rs. 65,000 crores, financed through our banks, have been given to 25 lakh women's Self Help Groups. In line with the policies mentioned by our hon. President, our Finance Minister, Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman has announced that the Godavari-Krishna, Krishna-Pennar and Pennar-Cauvery river-linking has been finalised. This proposal of interlinking of rivers to transfer surplus waters from Godavari-Krishna-Cauvery is a right decision. Our AIADMK Government has worked hard for it. I thank the Central Government for accepting our proposal and I hope the project will be successfully completed in the next few years. At this juncture, I draw the attention of the Government of India to the plight of the Indian fishermen from my State who are continuously harassed, attacked, looted and brutalized by the Gulf of Mannar. I plead that our Government should take a firm policy decision to safeguard the interests of our fishermen and protect the livelihood of lakhs of poor fisher folks. Sir, you know very well that recently the Sri Lankan Government seized the boats of the Tamil Nadu fishermen. They are going to announce that they will auction it. This is very unfair because our poor fishermen have gone and without their knowledge, something would have happened. I request the Central Government to take

necessary steps to get back the fishing boats of Tamil fishermen. Also, Sir, this is the only way to settle this issue. You know very well. One way of stopping this menace could be retrieving the Katchatheevu. You know very well, Sir, that in West Bengal also, a certain island was given to Bangladesh. At that time, this was brought before the Parliament, but Katchatheevu is not done like that. It was arbitrarily given, at that time, when Madam Indira Gandhi was the Prime Minister, but not ratified by the Parliament. But still, Katchatheevu is a part of the Indian territory. Therefore, it is high-time that we fight and get back Katchatheevu to solve the fishermen issue. Otherwise, you know, Sri Lanka is moving towards China. Relations are developing between the two countries. It is a threat to India's security. And, Sir, what Chinese Government doing in Arunachal and in other places, is doing the same thing in Sri Lanka and it is a threat to India's security. Therefore, it is high-time that we take action on this Island.

Sir, hon. President mentioned in his Address about 150th birth anniversary of V.O. Chidambaram Pillai, 125th birth anniversary of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose and said that the country is celebrating these sacred occasions. I am very thankful to the Central Government for coming forward to honour Shri V.O. Chidambaram Pillai, a freedom fighter, who navigated ships during the British period and lost his wealth and finally his life. So, I appreciate for that.

I, now, come to NEET examination. Sir, you know about this issue very well. We, especially parties from Tamil Nadu, are all raising to get exemption for NEET examination, because it is affecting aspiring medical students, particularly from rural areas. As long as 'Education' is under the Concurrent List, this problem will remain. You know very well when 'Education' was brought under the Concurrent List. Sir, in 1976-77 i.e., during Emergency, former Prime Minister, Smt. Indira Gandhi, brought 'Education' from the State List to the Concurrent List. After that, Shri Morarji Desai's Government came to power. His Government changed many things, but allowed 'Education' to continue under the Concurrent List. Since the subject is under the Concurrent List, our hands are tied. The Central Government has been enacting many laws under Concurrent List resulting in supersession of laws made by the State Legislatures. Therefore, it is high time that I request the Government of India to revisit the issue. I am requesting this because the hon. President announced in his Address that the Government is going to start 200 TV channels to give education to the people and also they are going to conduct professional programmes, for example on engineering, in regional languages. When this is the case, when you are going to promote other languages under the Eighth Schedule, including Tamil, Bengali, etc., I appeal that all must be made as a national language and official language of this

country. This is our demand. We will continue to raise this demand. This has to be done. It is only then we will get equal opportunity. Also, when you are conducting examination at all India level, States must be given more powers to see that admission in professional courses, such as medical, are taken up by the State Governments. That is why our AIADMK party go on requesting this. We met the Central Ministers and the hon. Prime Minister many times requesting to help rural people, especially students. Otherwise, what is going to happen now is private coaching centres will mushroom, special coaching centres start and people pay lakhs and lakhs of rupees to get the kind of education and get admission in medical courses. But, Sir, poor people cannot do that. That is why we are asking for exemption. Therefore, I think, the Central Government will consider all these demands.

Hon. President has mentioned hon. Prime Minister's vision that the Government is moving fast on building a strong foundation for the next 25 years following the mantra of *Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas aur Sabka Prayas*. We have to create India where all benefits are given to people and the country becomes self-sufficient. I am very happy to note that our hon. Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi, has come forward with this kind of a vision which is going to help our country. Therefore, I am very thankful for this opportunity to express my views. I once again thank NDA Government, Modi and others who have taken various steps to see that India is going to develop further. I thank the hon. President once again for his Address. Thank you.

SHRI A.D. SINGH (Bihar): Thank you, Vice-Chairman Sir for having given me this opportunity to speak here. I rise to thank the respected *Rashtrapati ji* for his very comprehensive listing of the achievements of the present Government, and the way forward. Indeed, the catalogue of success and achievements are impressive. I congratulate the hon. Prime Minister and his team for these successes, and also for the work in progress. This success will even be better if it was accompanied by social cohesion and unity.

Unfortunately, the nation's progress is slowed down by divisions that we see emerging in the society. This needs immediate course correction. This reminds of an anecdote from Gandhiji's visit to St. Stephens College, as reported in the college magazine of 1915. According to this story, a *sadhu* came to another iconic leader of our freedom struggle, Shri Gopalkrishna Gokhale to make some suggestions that would suppress a minority community. Gokhale rejected this specious religious

reasoning by saying that if to be a Hindu he has to do what was being suggested, then, he better be known as a non-Hindu.

Rashtrapati ji said that the Government is committed to counter the forces challenging the sovereignty and unity of the country, at every level, and that strict action will be taken against the forces initiating violence. I urge the Government to inform the House about the actions that have been taken so far against those who publicly called for genocide and targeting of specific communities. The House will support strictest of action against all such individuals, irrespective of their political affiliations. A strong Government cannot be seen as cowing down to a handful of fringe elements who are sowing discord in our society on a daily basis.

We pay tribute to the 20 bravehearts who made the ultimate sacrifice to defend every inch of our land in June 2020. But the threats have not diminished. More conflict points have arisen and, despite regular talks, there are no signs of illegal occupation of our land ending any time soon. The famous 'salami slicing policy' is in action, and our response has been muted. I need not remind the Government that such silence only encourages the aggressor who sees this as a sign of weakness. In addition, our half-hearted economic counter measures have been ineffective. Our trade deficit with our main challenger has reached a new high last year.

Protection of unity and sovereignty of the nation is not the work of one individual. It is also not about seeking personal glory. It is a national duty.

I would like to pay tribute to late Gen. Rawat, our first CDS, but I am disappointed that such a sensitive post has been lying vacant since his tragic accident. I would urge the Government to find out his successor quickly. It appears that the Government has no succession plan or proper personnel planning if one sees the number of high-level posts lying vacant in the Executive and the Judiciary.

In the speech dealing with Foreign Policy, I noticed a significant omission: Momentous changes took place in our neighbourhood when a Government in Afghanistan was toppled and its friendly people had been brought under an extremist regime that denies all human and basic rights and has dragged the country into an unprecedented humanitarian crisis.

Historically, and also under this Government, India has always stood with the people of Afghanistan and has helped them in all possible manner, rather generously. Our humanitarian assistance is still reaching Kabul. Given our traditionally-close relations and the brotherhood that Afghans feel for India, we would urge the Government of India to stand firmly with the people of Afghanistan and facilitate travel and trade, and continue education of Afghans in India. The policy has so far been left much to be desired. In fact, even today, scores of Afghan students are stranded in

Kabul without a visa, denying them the possibility of coming back to their colleges. Their future has been put on hold.

Our policies will need to focus on the people and we should be using our influence to ensure that the regime in Kabul works towards forming an inclusive national Government. Otherwise, it is feared that Afghanistan will become a playground for radical and anti-India groups. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI A.D. SINGH: Sir, India will have to learn to stand with its friends, if not, we will be repeating the historic mistake of once letting down the friendly people of Tibet. It is well documented that the Tibetans never accepted the sovereignty and suzerainty of China. Even Nehru, who is much loved by the current Government, advised them to approach the UN and had sent a young military officer, Zorawar Bakshi, to undertake strategic military reconnaissance in Tibet in 1949. Things did not turn out as planned and the rest is history.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Please conclude.

SHRI A.D. SINGH: However, the nation faces long-term consequences of both action and inaction. In this increasingly multi-polar world, India will have to align itself firmly with its own national interests in its own neighbourhood and beyond. Thank you very much.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Thank you, Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, for allowing me to speak on this subject. I rise here to thank His Excellency, the President of India, for his Address. In his presentation, the President very rightly mentioned about our development during this period in the health sector, infrastructure, agriculture sector, sports arena, etc. The hon. President has described about everything in his Address. I must compliment the Prime Minister, Narendra Modi ji, and his Government because within a year our Government successfully vaccinated 70 per cent of adult population. India is a big country and within a short span of time, 150 crore vaccinations have been given to the Indian citizens. When the vaccination started, every part of world was discussing how it will be possible for India to implement this project because India has a huge population. But this Government, under the leadership of the Prime Minister, Narendra Modi ji,

clearly justified that India is doing everything, India can do anything and it is a great success for the Indian Government that more than 70 per cent adult citizens of the country have been vaccinated. In the health sector, within this year, our country has made developments in a marvellous way. As you remember, in the first wave of Covid, India was crying for sanitizers. There was a shortage of masks and medicines. But, Sir, within a year, India started manufacturing everything. We produced sufficient masks and now, we can even export them. We have manufactured vaccines and now we are even exporting them. We are producing medicines also. This is the success of this Government. I must compliment the health sector and I must salute all the health workers for their great success.

Sir, another great achievement of this Government is in the agriculture sector. The Government has given priority to the agriculture sector. During this year, in the Covid period, an unprecedented situation was faced by our people in the urban areas, rural areas, by farmers, workers, etc. Everybody faced the problem. Even though it was Covid period, agricultural produce has increased by 30 per cent. Not only this, horticulture production also increased by 33 per cent. I must compliment the Government on this. The Government procured more than 433 lakh metric tonnes of wheat during the Rabi season, which has benefitted about 50 lakh farmers. Record quantity of about 90 lakh metric tonnes of paddy was procured during Kharif season, which benefitted about one crore thirty lakh people. This is the achievement of the Government, not only production has increased but farmers are also getting benefitted. Farmers are getting the right price for their crops. Instead of farmerls going to other places with their crops, the Government has procured them and paid enough money to them. The Government has also procured many products. I must compliment Narendra Modi *ji* for this achievement. Not only that, Sir, the country should remember one thing. During the Covid period, the Indian agricultural products increased like anything. This is one of the greatest achievements.

Sir, one more thing. I come from Assam. During this period, Assam also exported agricultural products to the neighbouring foreign countries. This is the achievement of our Government. The other thing that I would like to mention is the infrastructure development. We are always speaking about the infrastructural development. Through the Bharatmala Pariyojana, the infrastructure development is achieved in every part of the country.

Sir, if I do not speak about the Tokyo Olympics, it will be incomplete. I am happy to say that I led the Indian Contingent in the Tokya Olympic Games. I was the Chef de Mission for Indian Contingent, and, for the first time, India made the history.

India got all-time record medals in Tokyo Olympic Games. Earlier, our Bindra got the medal in shooting. In Athletics, for the first time, an Indian Athlete got the Gold Medal. I must congratulate him.

Sir, North-Eastern Region is a very integral part of our country. It is long way from Delhi. From Delhi to Guwahati, it is more than 2,000 kilometres; and from other North-Eastern Regions, it is more than 2,700 kilometres. But, Sir, this Narendra Modi Government has given a well developed transportation system, railway system to the North Eastern Region and today, I am proudly saying, Sir, that in all the Capitals of North-Eastern Region, today, the railway connectivity is there. All parts of the North-Eastern Region have a railway connectivity. A better air connectivity is there and, recently, the Shipping Minister has announced that waterways connectivity will be started there very soon.

Sir, Assam is famous for tea production. India is getting a huge foreign currency from tea, and small tea-growers of Assam play a very important role in the tea production. These small tea growers not only produce tea, but they successfully protect certain sections from unemployment problem in Assam. So, to encourage tea industry, to encourage more tea growers is the call of the hour. Although the Government took some initiatives to develop the tea industry of Assam, through this President's Address, and, through you, Sir, I request the Government to look into this issue and it should give topmost priority to the small tea growers of our country in the interest of the Indian economy, in the interest of the North-Eastern Region's economy, in the interest of the Assam's economy and, especially, in the interest of curbing the unemployment in our country.

Sir, I would like to say one more thing. Assam is an oil-producing State, and Assam has a huge quantity of oil and natural gas. I would like to request the Government, through you, Sir, to please take some special initiatives. This Government is taking a lot of initiatives. This Government has given more than Rs. 3,000 crores for the expansion of Numaligarh Refinery. This Government has taken the initiative to produce bio fuel gas in Numaligarh Refinery to export oil products from Numaligarh Refinery to the other parts of the world. But I would like to request you that more social activity through the Petroleum Ministry should be started in Assam because we are an oil-producing State. This oil sector has a huge amount of money and they have a Corporate Social Responsibility fund. Though you, Sir, I would like to request the Government to take some initiatives, give some more money under the social responsibility scheme to the North-Eastern Region to build some more hospitals, infrastructure projects, etc. According to a report of the World Health Organization, the maximum number of cancer patients in our country are from Assam

and the North-eastern Region. I would request the Government, through you, Sir, to set up a modern super-specialty hospital, especially in upper Assam. If that is done, it would benefit not just Assam but the entire North-eastern Region.

With these words, I support the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. Thank you for giving me this opportunity, Sir.

THE MINISTER OF MINORITY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI): Vice-Chairman Sir, thank you for giving me the opportunity to speak on the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. The country has also seen many such moments, many such occasions in its successful journey of these seven decades, which have been a witness to the glorious history of this country. I do not want to go into the history, geography of these seven decades; I am trying to draw your attention through the changes that happened within these eight years, the changes that have come.

Vice-Chairman Sir, it is said that today India has become two, today two India function in this country. In my understanding, our Hindustan, our India is one India, the great India. I have never heard or seen the concept of two India, but to understand Hindustan, to understand the civilization of India, to understand the culture, to understand the resolve and to understand the inclusive thinking, we have to get over the exhilaration and ideology of 'India is Indira and Indira is India', 'Congress is country and country is Congress'. As long as we live in the hangover of India is Indira and Indira is India, Congress is the country and country is Congress, I think we would not be able to understand that glorious culture of our India, that Sanatani culture, that resolve. Today we are proud of this, we are all proud, whether someone belongs to any political party or any political ideology, but we are all proud of our India and this soil of our India. We take pride that our journey of crisis, obstacles, has been successful and today India has made a mark in the world. Out of the changes that took place in these eight years, 28 such changes have come to my notice. There are many other changes, which the rest of the comrades will also notice. The biggest change that this country has felt since 2014 is the restoration of the dignity, credibility and respect of the institution of the post of Prime Minister in this democracy, the world's largest democracy. There is a couplet which you understand very well-

"Lihaz aankh ka rishton ka dar nahin hota
Jab ek shaks ke hathon mein ghar nahin hota"

What was the situation eight years ago today - the Prime Minister's office used to run from somewhere else and not just that, the Prime Minister used to get instructions from somewhere else, and not only this, the decision taken by the cabinet was torn down as nonsense and nuisance. The change that has taken place today, there is no forced prime minister in this country, but a strong Prime Minister.

He is such a Prime Minister in whose hands the security of the country, the honour of the country, the prosperity of the country are completely safe and strong. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): You sit down... you sit down.

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Sir, I want to mention the second change which has come. The tales, stories that we used to hear eight years ago, we all have seen that atmosphere in this House, we have also realized that every day there were different types of discussions - from corruption to this and that and so on and so forth, several other unimportant topics, all this could be heard. Today, when we are talking positively, you are saying that there have been two Hindustans in India. One Hindustan is of Sanatani ideology and one Hindustan is of feudal ideology, this is the difference between vision and viewpoint.

Sir, the third change is very important which we have realized. Honourable Leader of the Opposition party has also come. I had heard his entire speech. The legacy of cuts, corruption and commission and the politics of appeasement have been banned. The deceit of political appeasement has been demolished by the force of national empowerment, this is the fifth change.

Sir, the sixth change is very important. We all have been living in Delhi for many years. We used to hear that sahib, the National Licensing Office in Delhi is an International Licensing Office, if you want to get any work done by any government, then you can get it done from the International Licensing Office. Today, from the corridors of power in Delhi, there has been a ban on power brokers and a lockdown on looting - this is the difference since Modi ji has arrived.

Sir, the seventh difference is a very important difference. Today there has been a big change in the politics of this country and the political culture of this country. Today, there is no need to be yes man around a political family, but a culture of hard work and bravery has taken birth. Today, the politics of the country are not being decided, on the basis of sycophancy around political families, the governments of the country and but on the basis of hard work and performance, hard work and results, Hon'ble Narendra Modi has changed the political culture and culture of this country. There is a ninth difference.

Sir, what is the tenth difference - what used to be the red-light culture, the syndrome, its threat and its fear had started irritating the common man. The common man used to think that here comes the tinkering of red light on the vehicles to boss around others, as if he is some superman among us, that red-light culture has been ended by Narendra Modi ji and the politics of this syndrome, the politics of intimidation has been put to an end, this is the tenth difference.

Sir, it was said that a particular sect has the right over the resources of this country. I am saying this because they knew that they were not the provider of authority, but they certainly used to say so. That is why I said that we have destroyed the trick of political appeasement with the power of inclusive and all-touching empowerment. A sect has the right over the resources of this country - Modi ji has made this change in this, "Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas and Sabka Prayas" i.e. the first right on the resources of the country belongs to the person standing on the last rung. There should be happiness in his life, there should be bliss in his life, Sir, this is the 11th change.

Sir, there is one more change. Those quotas, permits, controls, what all secrets were used, the money that should reach the poor of this entire country, the money that should reach for the development of the poor, the villages, the poor and the farmers, for the progress of the slum-dwellers. Honourable Late Rajiv Gandhi ji had once said that money from Delhi gets worn out in movement and how much of it remains, so today that pace of wear has ended. Direct benefit is being given through DBT. Be it farmers, labourers, women, elders or any section of the society, but one difference has come that the mess of siphoning off money has been stopped. Sir, you must have seen a great change in our country. Sir, I am telling you the 12th one.

Sir, we kept making laws in our country, also used to fight a lot that this Bill should not be discussed, this Bill will be discussed for two hours, for five hours, it will be discussed for ten hours and the Bill was made. Bills were piled up due to this, laws were made. Ten criminal laws were made on the same thing. Sir, when I was handling the work of the Ministry of Parliamentary Affairs, I found out the fact that Parliament has passed this Bill, took a lot of time, our honorable Members have given their own suggestions on it and the Standing Committee or Select committee may have also expressed its opinion on it, but what happened to it? Then it came to knowledge that the Bill had already been made 12 or 13 years ago, but the rules have not been framed on it, it is lying as it is. That is, it was discussed in the Parliament, both the Houses of the Parliament had passed it, but it could not be effective. More than 1,500 such Bills, which were not in effect but remained part of the books in the form of Bills, were repealed. After his arrival, Modi ji made the law where it was needed and also abolished the law which was not needed. Sir, this is the 14th change.

Sir, another change which I consider to be a big change and which is going to make every countryman proud is that the week of riots and the month of terrorist attacks has been stopped. Vice-Chairman Sir, I am calling them a week of riots and the month of terrorist blasts because in any part of the country - you see from Bhagalpur to Bhiwandi, from Guwahati to Varanasi, riots, tumult, killing of innocents kept happening in some or other part of the country and the nation was restless in the flames of these riots. Terrorism was also there along with this. There was no part of the country in a month where those terrorists did not carry out blasts. Sometimes there used to be blasts in Lajpat Nagar of Delhi, at times there used to be blasts in

Mumbai, sometimes there were blasts in Guwahati, and sometimes there were blasts in Hyderabad. There was no part of the country where terrorists did not carry out their plans fearlessly in a month or two. A big change that came after the arrival of Narendra Modi ji, he took the pledge that:

'Suraksha par jo aa jaye, to takrana zaruri hai,
Jo Zinda ho, to zinda nazar aana bhi zaruri hai'

He has shown the whole world that India is brimming, full of resolve to protect its country, its people and its country's borders. In the meantime, a country in our neighborhood had dared to act stupidly. Our security forces infiltrated and conducted surgical strikes, went in there and destroyed the terrorists by removing them from their safe zones. Regrettably, it happened at that time when the country which had sponsored it, was asking us for proof. Some of our friends here were asking questions. Even at that time, the duet of evidence and questions on issues like national security had started. Sir, this has changed.

Sir, the 18th change was that all the great men, great heroes of our country, who had sacrificed for India, for the construction of our country, for the independence of the country were given respect. Today, if we are breathing this open air with ease, then this country is indebted to all the great men who have made sacrifices. They have sacrificed families after families. We sing the song that "Zara aankh mein bhar lo pani, zara yaad karo kurbani" (With welled up eyes, let's remember the sacrifice). But the problem surfaced that even the sacrifice for this country of ours was kept in the cradle of the family. The sacrifices made by the great heroes of the country were limited. After the arrival of Modi ji, there was a difference that there were millions of our great heroes, heroes who were ignored somewhere in the pages of history, they were given respect and the coming generation was told that earlier heroes remain so but these also exist who have shed blood for the country, have sacrificed for the country. Today you are proudly calling yourself Hindustani in this country, so you are indebted to them. You can see the statue of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose at India Gate. Statue of Sardar Vallabhbhai Patel, the world's largest life size statue is in Gujarat. There is a national memorial of Babasaheb Bhimrao Ambedkar in Mhow. It is a long chain. We took the heroes and great heroes of this country out of the family circle and kept them in the circle of India and told the coming generation that earlier heroes remain so but these also exist who have sacrificed for the country. Sir, this has changed.

Sir, there is one more important change. I was listening yesterday that there are constitutional institutions, judiciary, election commission, so on and so forth, they have become completely useless, they have become hostages, in a way this is what the statement was. Sir, you have a lot of experience, honourable Leader of the Opposition party has a lot of experience in the history of the Parliament of this

country. There was a time when decisions of Supreme Court were made and majority was used to nullify the decisions of the Supreme Court. There are many such decisions. Let me tell you about a latest verdict, triple talaq. The Supreme Court said that this triple talaq is a criminal evil, it is a practice, a law should be made on it and it must end. At that time, under the pressure of some people, to nullify the decision of the Supreme Court, the government of that time in this Parliament, that is, the government of the Congress Party, made a law and said that no, they will not accept the verdict of the Supreme Court which was a matter of equal opportunity, a matter related to the safety and dignity of women in the Constitution. They did not agree. Sir, what did Modi ji do, that brought changes! The Supreme Court considered triple talaq as a legal crime, considered it a malpractice, considered it a misdeed and to make the decision of the Supreme Court effective, we brought a law in this Parliament. Who respects the Parliament? Although there are many incidents, there is no need to tell anyone what happened after the decision of the Allahabad High Court against the Prime Minister of that time. I have a list, at least 312 such...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, we kept using it to make it effective. Sir, with this another very important change has been seen by the country and that change...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RIPUN BORA (Assam): Sir, this Allahabad High Court judgement was quashed by the Supreme Court. ..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Jammu and Kashmir is the crown of our country. Earlier we used to think, talk amongst ourselves that Article 370 can never end. In all the Bills we used to pass or make laws from the centre, it was written - 'except Jammu and Kashmir'. If the Parliament makes a law, electricity will reach the entire country, but not Jammu and Kashmir, a law will be made for water, it will not be for the people of Jammu and Kashmir, a law will be made for employment but it will not be for the people of Jammu and Kashmir. If there will be any decision on reservation for the backward or weaker sections, then 'except Jammu and Kashmir' will be written on it, if there is any decision related to education, then 'except Jammu and Kashmir' will be written on it. The change to abolish this Article 370, which has cut Jammu and Kashmir from the stream of progress of the country, was brought during the rule of Modi ji. Today, the Parliament does not need to write on any Bill or any law that this law of education, this law of employment, this law of electricity, water or road, it is 'except Jammu and Kashmir' and this is a huge change.

Sir, in addition to this, you have also observed CAA. A lot of confusion and fear was created regarding CAA. In the time of Mrs. Indira Gandhi and Bhutto saheb, a decision was taken that the security of minorities who belong to Bangladesh, Afghanistan or Pakistan, is the responsibility of India, India will protect their honour, their culture and their religious freedom. That agreement is known as the Pant-Mirza Agreement.

Sir, this is a time of crisis, when the Talibani mentality has engulfed these countries. The minority people belonging there, when I am talking about the minority people, then those who are Hindus, who are Sikh brothers and sisters, who are Christians, who are Jains or whatever minority community people live there, their honour, their culture and their religious rights were completely under threat. At that time it was the need of the country, need of Parliament, the decision taken by the Congress party at that time, there was a need to give effect to that decision, so at that time an amendment was brought in CAA which you all had passed, although some people also protested. At the time when Talibani torture was going on in Afghanistan, because of this CAA, due to the amendment made in CAA, because of that all the Hindus, Sikhs and even those who were Muslim brothers and sisters, all of them were brought safely to India and were given protection. This change came after the arrival of Modi ji and the 10 years before him.

Sir, another change has been brought, as the country is passing through a period of great crisis and disaster, the crisis of Corona has come upon all of us. No prophet had said when corona will come, how it will come and how many people it will kill, how many people it will not. No scientist knew this and this great disaster hit our country.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, 100 years ago when there was a similar calamity, it was known as the Spanish Flu. At that time the population of our country was only 30 crores, Bangladesh and Pakistan together had a population of 30 crores, but 100 years ago, more than 20 million people died in that Spanish flu, it is there in the documents. Today, our population is around 140-150 crores. At the time when this crisis came in January-February, 2020, not only did we have the facilities, even the well-equipped countries of the whole world did not have any facilities for the health and well-being of the people. All the people of our country, who were living abroad in lakhs, were being asked by the people of that country to vacate their country, because at that time every country was worried about the health and well-being of the people of their country.

The first thing that Modi ji immediately did after his arrival was for those who were in UAE, in Britain, in America, in Iran, in Iraq, in Saudi Arabia or in different parts of the world. By making special arrangements to bring them to India, then to make arrangements for their stay here, some of the institutions of the people of our army were deployed, some more institutions were made. All this was happening in a hurry, bringing millions of people safely to India was necessary for their health and well-being and the safety and well-being of crores of Indians was necessary.

Sir, the two crore people who had died unfortunate deaths, about 80 percent of those two crore people died of starvation, due to non-availability of medicine according to the documents. What did Modi ji do after coming - Modi ji firstly arranged food, foodgrains and food etc. for the poor, who belonged to weaker sections for more than 80 crore people in such a crisis, which is going on till date.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Now you please conclude, your time is up.

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: This is a big change and a major change. I am talking about the past years, what was eight years ago and what is today. Apart from this, there is another important change; I am concluding my speech very quickly.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY): Your team has too many speakers and your time is up.

SHRI MUKHTAR ABBAS NAQVI: Sir, when this government was formed, people gave the mandate in 2014, then there was a noise in the whole country - someone shouted intolerance, someone said that our country will be shunned down by all countries, especially Islamic countries would not even glance at us. All these challenges were in front of us and not only this, the political lynching of this country's civilization, this country's culture, this country's constitution and the nationalism of this country and the heights of it and it has been conspired and schemed to defame India all over the world after such incidents took place one after the other.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN) *in the Chair*]

The craze of Modi bashing started taking the form of a conspiracy to bash India. But despite that, the strength of this country, the power of India, the respect of India and Indians was not affected by the strong nationalist will-power of Narendra Modi, did not let it to do any harm, this is the 28th change. This has happened between the last ten years and these eight years.

Sir, I will conclude my statement by saying one thing that in the time of this crisis and obstacle, when there was havoc of Corona, we saw the gust of storms, we saw the attack of locusts, we also saw the attack of laggards, inspite of this Narendra Modi ji had made a commitment to the people of the country, he did not let his resolve weaken for the respect of the people of this country, the security of the people of this country, the prosperity of the people of this country.

'jab hausla bana liya unchi udaan ka,
Tab dekhna fizul hai kad aasman ka'

This government has worked with this resolve and I have told you 28 changes that I can recall in these eight years, apart from this, I have a very long list.

Sir, I thank you for giving me the time to speak.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Shri Sanjay Raut -- Absent. Shri Kanakamedala Ravindra Kumar -- Absent. Shri Abdul Wahab, please speak.

SHRI ABDUL WAHAB (Kerala): Madam Vice-Chairman, thank you very much for giving me a chance. First of all, I rise to oppose this Motion. I listened to the Minister, Naqvi Saheb, where he has given 28 reasons to support this Government. Out of these, I have seen two which you have not mentioned. I am supporting only on two. Maybe, you can make it 30. Except skilling and some work on waqf, everything that he mentioned was done by the previous Government also. Any Government will do that. He is only repeating and praising Modiji. He did not mention about the increasing hate speeches and communal attacks against minority communities, particularly Muslims and Christians. Young Muslim women professionals are auctioned online. Statues of Jesus Christ were smashed and churches were attacked during Christmas. This House should unanimously condemn such incidents happening in our great country. About unemployment, nobody mentioned anything; not even the President. It is observed that there are more than eight lakh vacancies in the Central Government. Why is the Central Government not filling up these vacancies? I urge the Government to immediately fill, at least, the vacancies in the Central Government institutions.

Hon. Chairperson, I take this opportunity to appreciate the Government and Prime Minister, Mr. Narendra Modi, for Pradhan Mantri Kaushal Vikas Yojana. It is the Skill Development Programme and the way it is promoting startups. I sincerely appreciate the Department and the Minister for the same. However, I am concerned about the decline of India's global stature. It was a dream of our former President, Abdul Kalamji, to convert our country into a super power by 2020. He was very hopeful of the youth and the power of education. Today, a large section of our youth is unemployed and uneducated. The Government under Dr. Manmohan Singh was taking the country into the right direction. All of a sudden, our growth and development have taken a U-turn. Our economic growth index, sensex index, etc. must be moving upwards. But, surely, a significant section of our society is being left out of our growth. There is an increasing inequality in our society both in social and economic terms.

Hon. Chairperson, India's image as a champion of democracy and human rights is diminishing due to its increasing intolerance to minorities and intellectuals. The world respects Mahatma Gandhi and Jawaharlal Nehru for their values. But today a section of our society is disrespecting our Mahatma Gandhiji. This disrespectful

attitude towards Gandhiji should stop. This House needs to take a lead in fixing these issues which I have raised.

Now, I come to the last point which I want to mention. MPLADS fund was stopped because of corona. I agree with that. When I came here as a Member of Parliament in 2004, the amount was Rs.5 crore. At that point of time, I could make a minimum of 1,000 classrooms with that amount of Rs.5 crore. Now, I can make only 200 classrooms. I was not only making classrooms. At that point of time, I could buy a computer for Rs.50,000; now, it is okay with Rs.20,000. But, the Government should increase the MPLADS funds from Rs.5 crore to a minimum of Rs.20 crore. Actually, it is the inflation rate. So, I urge the Government to raise the MPLADS fund. That money is going to the public. I am raising this issue for BJP members also. It is common. It is not only for me or that I am the only one. So, I urge the Government to do that. I oppose this Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. He was just reading an Address given by the Prime Minister. Thank you very much.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Thank you Wahabji. Now, Dr. Fauzia Khan, not present. We may go to the next speaker. Shri Ramdas Athawale, not present. Now, Shri Ram Nath Thakur.

SHRI RAM NATH THAKUR (Bihar): Hon'ble Vice-Chairman Madam, I am speaking from Lok Sabha chambers.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN) : Shri Ram Nath Thakur ji, if you want to, you may speak while being seated.

SHRI RAM NATH THAKUR: Hon'ble Vice-Chairman Madam, thank you very much for giving me the time to speak on the address of the Hon'ble President. First of all, we express our heartfelt condolences to all those who are no more among us during the third wave of Corona pandemic and their families and request you to convey our condolences to their families.

Vice-Chairman Madam, firstly, I would like to all congratulate the government for the fact that for the first time India has been a pioneer in making medicine for corona pandemic and succeeded in supplying medicine to not only in our country but also abroad and in saving millions of lives. I also congratulate the scientists and the Ministers of the Government of India for this that they have succeeded in making this medicine and in saving millions of people. I would like to make a request regarding the address of the Hon'ble President. I would like to congratulate that for the first time the Ministry of Defense worked on manufacturing the equipment in India. The goods which used to come from abroad earlier, were not brought from abroad but were made in our own country to make India prosperous and to protect it from touts, so I

appreciate the President's address. Secondly, I want to say that in the matter of agriculture that the Government of India has decided to plant green trees on the banks of the Ganga River, which joins Bihar through nine states, to cultivate maize, grow green vegetables and enhance tourism and we would like to congratulate them for the unique work they have done. Thirdly, I want to say that Jan Dhan accounts have been opened. Right now it takes a day for rural women to go to a bank and they have to face trouble at the hands of touts, so we want to request the Government of India to open a bank in rural panchayats, in villages and enrich 6 lakh, 66 thousand villages with the bank. Along with this, we also want to request the Government of India that rural women should get the facilities so that they do not have to stay in the bank all day, so we want to request to open a bank in every panchayat.

I want to request the Government of India that since we always suffer from the problem of flood in Bihar, the Government of India should talk to the Government of Nepal to solve the problem of flood and try to build a high dam. We would like to request the Government of India that the Government should work towards getting rid of the problem of flood in Bihar. Bihar is backward in many aspects, so we demand a special package for Bihar and we request that the Government of India should help the government of Bihar and work to solve the problem of Bihar.

I want to mention the fourth thing that through 'Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Anna Yojana', an effort was made that no poor and destitute person should die of hunger. The work done by the Government of India for this is commendable and work should be done to take it further.

An amount of more than Rs 1,80,000 crore rupees has been provided to more than 11 crore farmer families through 'Kisan Samman Nidhi Yojana' and its positive impact is also visible. Changes have also been made in the 'Crop Insurance Scheme' so that their claims are not rejected on the basis of technology. As a result, more than one lakh crore rupees have been given as compensation to more than 8 crore farmers, so that their hardships can be reduced. Now the plan of the government is to directly purchase the produce of the farmers under DBT and the money should be deposited directly into their accounts. I have already requested for opening of banks in most of the villages.

Madam, it is a matter of satisfaction that the government has started 'Pradhan Mantri Gati Shakti Yojana' for the development of infrastructure in the country. In future, rail, highway and air transport will not be developed separately, but a master plan will be prepared for their development. It is also satisfying that in the year 2020-21, more than 36,000 km of roads have been constructed in rural areas at the speed of more than 100 meters per day. I would request the government to focus on those states which are backward in this matter while implementing such schemes. I would like to request that the highway projects and culverts being constructed in Bihar

should be completed expeditiously. Till now these works have been going on for years. I also request that the government to work with special efforts to fulfill the aspirations of the farmers, youth and provide them the means of employment, so that there will be prosperity in the country. Only then we will be able to fulfill the true spirit mentioned in the Constitution as well as the appeal of the Hon'ble President to build a glorious India.

I was listening to the Leader of Opposition yesterday. I remember, in 1963-64, when Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia had won from Farrukhabad in Lok Sabha, he brought a No-confidence motion against the Union government, against the Congress. He stated in it that the party in power needs to leave the government because they can succeed in getting back rights of the farmers, dalits, downtrodden and backward which they had usurped. Dr. Lohia stated this in his No-confidence motion. When the Leader of the Opposition was speaking, he started a flurry of complaints but did not give a single solution that by doing this work, the youth, farmers, labourers, backward and dalits would benefit, so we would like to request that they stack up the parcel of things not done, but accept the work that was done and positively request the Government of India to work upon things which did not happen. When trust will be created in your mind, then good thoughts will be formed in the mind of the government as well as in the mind of the general public.

I would like to request through you that the Government should definitely do the restoration of judges on the basis of reservation in courts. The posts which are vacant, more than eight lakh vacancies are to be filled in the Government of India, you should fill them. With these words, I would like to request you -

"Sirf hungama khada karna mera maqsad nahin,
sari koshish hai ki ye surat badalni chahiye,
mere seene mein nahin to tere seene mein sahi,
hai kahin bhi aag, lekin aag jalni chahiye"

With these words, I conclude my speech and express my empathy with the President, Jai Hind, Jai Bharat!

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Now, Shri Ajit Kumar Bhuyan.

SHRI AJIT KUMAR BHUYAN (Assam): Hon. Vice-Chairman Madam, I thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. As I stand up to speak against the motion, I would like to know as to what happened to doubling the farm income. When I was going through, I did not find any indications of how Government is planning for the

welfare of farmers. I would like to know what happened to disinvestment targets, 10 crore jobs and \$5 trillion economy. The normal salaried class got Mahabharat quotes, whereas corporate taxes got reduced. The pandemic has exhausted the nations but what is the relief to come out from such agonies. But as usual, Government chooses to ignore the shrinking middle and lower income class. Eighty lakh affordable houses will be completed at Rs.44,000 crore under PM Awas Yojana in 2022-23. This means Rs.55,000 for each House. I don't understand what kind of house will be of Rs.55,000, especially, in the hilly areas of the North-East region. Agriculture and allied activities which still employ the largest bulk of the population have been left without any mention in the speech. Madam, in 2021, the income of 84 per cent of households has gone down, whereas the Government's income increases 64.9 per cent more in comparison to 2020. The nation is facing terrible inflation and there is no mention of how to give relief to the middle and lower-middle classes. There is a reflection in the speech that the mirage of '*Achche Din*' has been conceived but the truth is even farther away. I feel the nation must wait for 25 more years for '*Achche Din*' to arrive. It will not be an exaggeration if I say that I sense it is anti-federalist policy and approach of the Government of the day. The subsidies on several schemes which directly benefit the common people, roughly 80 per cent of it has been reduced. The core of the core schemes, including Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme, faces a cut. I had a high expectation that the President's speech would refer to rural jobs and their avenues but the funds had been cut by 25 per cent.

Madam Vice-Chairman, I would like to say, in 2014, the 'promise of *achche din*', in 2017, the promise of 'New India, 2022', and now the promise of '*Amrit Kaal* in 25 years', the goal posts keep changing; the timeline keeps changing, as the promises keep changing. Promises are good but delivery is better. 4.6 crores people have been pushed into poverty and 84 per cent of households have suffered a loss of income and India ranks 104 out of 116 countries in the Global Hunger Index. I didn't find any capsules on how to recover from these agonies in the Speech. Sixty-six lakhs MSMEs were closed and this has strained the people to go back to their native places but there has been no scope and incentives to employ those people at their respective places. Madam, I represent Assam in the Upper House and the Government has claimed that peace and tranquillity prevail in the North-Eastern States. The Government has not spelt out on the Naga Peace Solution as the hon. Members of the House know that the Naga conflict is the mother of all other conflicts of the region. The framework agreement was signed in August, 2015 in the presence of the Prime Minister of India and the Prime Minister had subsequently claimed that

the long-pending Naga conflict would be resolved in no time. More than six years had gone but what is the latest update of the Naga conflict is still a mystery. I am of the strong view that unless the Naga conflict gets resolved, the peace process in the region will be just an eyewash and a piecemeal approach will continue to disturb the region. Manipur and Assam's peace-loving people are still longing for a resolution of the conflict and the Government of India is yet to start a dialogue with several outfits. I am confident that peace and development should move simultaneously and the Government of India should take bold initiative in this direction as the region has been strategically very important and have 98 per cent of international border. Thank you very much for giving me the opportunity to speak a few words.

SHRI RIPUN BORA (Assam): Madam, first of all, I would like to say that the entire country was looking at the President's Address with high expectations. We have already passed three pandemics. The entire economy of our country has been badly devastated by the pandemic. The people of this country wanted that since the President's Address is the roadmap of the Government for the coming years, so, definitely, there should be some ways and means as to how to recover, how to develop, how to rebuild our economy, but, nothing has been mentioned. Madam, we have a population of 130 crores in our country and out of that, the income of about 84 crore people has come down drastically during this pandemic period. But, in the President's Address, not a single word has been mentioned about it. Madam, during our UPA Government, when Dr. Manmohan Singh was the Prime Minister, 27 crore people had been upgraded from below poverty line to above poverty line. This is not my report; this is the NITI Aayog's report. You are saying that we are leading our country to five trillion dollar economy, but, during these seven years, nearly five crore people have again gone below the poverty line. Madam, we are saying that we are "*vishwaguru*", but it is very shame that in the global poverty, India's poverty is the half of the global poverty. Madam, the present burning problem of our country is the problem of unemployment and sky-rocketing prices, but, not a single word has been mentioned in the President's Address as to how to tackle the problem of unemployment and the price rise. Apart from that, the purchasing power of the people of our country has been hugely declined. The individual consumption has been hugely declined. But, in the roadmap, as BJP say that it is a roadmap of the Government, but, in the roadmap, nowhere the road is mentioned as to how to tackle this situation. In the para 15 of President's Address, the Government has very proudly said that during pandemic period, we have done a great thing-- what great thing-- that not a single citizen was left hungry. It is said, but, what is the reality? They say

that 80 crore people have been given free rice under Pradhan Mantri Garib Kalyan Yojana, but, what is the reality? The reality is that in the world global hunger index, India's number has come to 101 from 94. In 2020, it was 94 and now it has come to 101. Madam, we are far behind the countries like Bangladesh, Pakistan and Nepal. The Government claims that this is the largest food distribution programme in the world, but, this is the position. Not only that Madam, yesterday our LoP had also said that all the time we are hearing one complaint that what did you do in 70 years, what did you do in 70 years! Yes, we did not do anything in 70 years, but what did BJP do? Madam, there is a saying in our village. There is a saying that the useless son of a father is unable to earn any income, then he sells all the property of the father one after the other and when all the property of the father is sold, then he accuses his father of what he has given him - such is the situation.

1.00 P.M.

So this is it. Madam, you see, this is NITI Aayog's data, not mine, when the first Prime Minister of India Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru was there, he created 33 number of PSUs, no privatization; Lal Bahadur Shastri, he created 5 number of PSUs, no privatization; Indira Gandhi created 66 number of PSUs, no privatization; Morarji Desai created 9 number of PSUs, no privatization; Rajiv Gandhi created 16 number of PSUs, no privatization; V.P. Singh created 2 number of PSUs, no privatization; P.V. Narasimaha Rao created 14 number of PSUs, no privatization; I.K. Gujral and H.D. Deve Gowda created 3 number of PSUs, no privatization; then Atal Bihari Vajpayee, he created 17 number of PSUs, there were seven privatization; Dr. Manmohan Singh created 23 number of PSUs, only 3 privatization, and our Vishwaguru, Prime Minister, Narendra Modi, during eight years, he created not a single PSU and he privatized 23 number of PSUs. ...*(Interruptions)*... So, this is what we have done in 70 years and what you have done in eight years. Not only that, Madam, one more important thing in para 31 of the Address is about women empowerment. It says that 85 per cent of the household women have been given Ujjawala gas. Yes, it is the data. But simply giving Ujjawala gas, there is no women empowerment. There cannot be empowerment but the Government is not taking the feedback. There is no monitoring. The Ujjawala gas you have given. The first cylinder the women have taken but the Government has no knowledge and they are not taking this information that after taking the first cylinder, the women have not been able to afford to take the second cylinder at the cost of Rs.1,000/-*(Interruptions)*... The cylinder is lying in the kitchen of poor women. Is this women empowerment? Not only that, Madam,

our Congress Government was for women empowerment. We had made 33 per cent reservation in Panchayati Raj, 50 per cent reservation in Urban Local Bodies. We had passed Bill for reservation of women in Parliament. But what have you done? What about that? It is lying there. Not only that, in NCRB Report of 2020, what happened is that there is crime against women; 3,87,997 cases in 2019, and in 2020, there are 3,57,360 cases of crime against women. If our women are not protected, how can we say 'women empowerment'? What is the meaning of women empowerment if we cannot protect our women? Not only that, so far the 'Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao' is a very popular slogan. But what is 'Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao'? ...*(Interruptions)*...Prime Minister has said it, but we are not saying. ...*(Interruptions)*...So, here you see, Madam, large number of children from 14 to 18 years committed suicide. In 2019, 9,613 children committed suicide and in 2020, the number is 11,326, that is, in one year, there is 18 per cent increase of suicide of girl children in the age from 14 to 18. Is this 'Beti Bachao, Beti Padhao'? This is not my data. This is your data. It is NCRB data. Madam, we are now coming to another point. I am from Assam. I am from North-East and my friend Ajit Bhuyan has already spoken about North-East also. I am also going to speak. In para 74 of the President's Address there is a mention that we are giving top priority for the development of North-Eastern Region. My friend, Rijiju is also here. In Assam, two private sector undertakings, two paper mills have been closed down. Not only that, from 2014 till today, not a single mega project was sanctioned for the North-Eastern Region. Simply having one airport in Hollongi is not enough. Rijijuji, only one airport for Hollongi! That was the decision of the UPA Government. Except that, the other airport, in the name of Bharat Ratna Gopinath Bordolai, has been sold to the Adani Group. This is happening. The Armed Forces Special Power Act has been grossly misused. In the North-Eastern Region, recently in Nagaland, on December 4th the military had killed 14 civilians which is a very shameful thing. Normally our military is used against foreign aggression, but our military has killed our own people and nothing has been done. So, the Naga people are going for long agitation. The ULFA problem in Assam, the other extremist problem in Assam, the Naga peace talk has not been done and no mention has been there. Then how can you improve the North-Eastern Region? Madam, I now want to come to para 14. In para 14, it is said that Government is giving top priority to Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and OBCs, but what is the reality? If we again come to the NCRB Report, we have seen that the crime against Scheduled Castes is 50,221 in 2020 and there is an increase of 9.4 per cent of crime against the Scheduled Castes in comparison to 2019 and there

is crime against the Scheduled Tribes which is about 8,272. That is 9.3 per cent increase against them, comparing to 2019.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Kindly conclude.

SHRI RIPUN BORA: One minute, Madam. If we cannot protect the Scheduled castes and Scheduled tribes, then, where is empowerment? Where is development? You have cut their Budget. You have not given scholarships to the Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribes students for the last several years. Now you are giving priority to the Scheduled Castes. Finally, Madam, I would have been very glad to extend our thanks, to extend our gratefulness to the President of India and to the President's Address had there been a mention of this thing. What is that? Your slogan is *Sabka Saath-Sabka Vishwas*, but not your trust. You do not have trust in your Ministers, you do not trust the judges, you do not have trust in army officers and you do not have trust in the leaders of the opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Shri Ripun Bora, please conclude.

SHRI RIPUN BORA: You do not trust your Ministers, so what you did was to order tools, spyware from foreign countries and installed Pegasus. Our India is being defamed in this world,...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Hon. Member, please wind up. Otherwise, I will have to call the next speaker. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RIPUN BORA: You claim that India is the largest democratic country. But, what you have done here is disgrace to democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Hon. Member, I am calling the next speaker.

SHRI RIPUN BORA: You have violated our rights by applying Pegasus. ...*(Interruptions)*...The Prime Minister has to pay the price. ...*(Interruptions)*...The Prime Minister misled the country. ...*(Interruptions)*...He said, 'We have not taken Pegasus.' ...*(Interruptions)*...But, Madam, this is the report from the New York Times. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Thank you, Boraji. ...*(Interruptions)*...Now, Shri Jawhar Sircar. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RIPUN BORA: Madam, the recent New York Times report says that the Government has purchased Pegasus. ...*(Interruptions)*...Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Thank you, Boraji.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR (West Bengal): Thank you Madam Vice-Chairperson. This is my maiden speech. This is the first speech I am going to make in Parliament after a patient wait for six months.

AN HON. MEMBER: Madam, I want to make a point.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): I have already called Jawhar Sircarji. You can reply to it when you speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...You can react then. ...*(Interruptions)*...Now, Shri Jawhar Sircarji.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Madam Chairperson, thank you for the opportunity given to speak before this august House. I celebrate the sixth month of my oath taking. I have not spoken a single word in 6 months. So, I thank you very much for this first opportunity to speak in six months. I hope you would be gracious enough to give me the time allotted to maiden speeches. We have heard a lot of *Modinama* for the last couple of days in a manner that puts anyone with certain amount of self-respect to disgrace.

India, today, is at the crossroads as it has never been through before. Indian history is going to be judged on what we do today and what we do for tomorrow. Our polity is shattered. Our political framework has never been so threatened. This political framework was created by those who fought for India's freedom, not by those who ran away from India's freedom struggle. Our society is fractured; brother is against brother, and it is now a credit to discredit someone else. Our economy has never gone through such a bad patch. I have worked for forty-one years in Government and I know that we have never, never gone through such a bad patch, not even in 1991. And, Madam, much of the destruction of the economy is thanks to deliberate policies, the meaning of which has not been understood by government.

The first two problems that I would highlight are inequality or inequity and joblessness. For God's sake, as representatives of the people of India, we need to understand that printed words and flowery phrases do not mean much to those who go hungry, and to those who are without jobs. As we stand and talk today, the labour force in the age group between 15 and 64 years is 100 crore. The Government has said that there are 100 crore people between the age group of 15 and 64 years. It is the Government, CMIE and others have admitted that only 40 per cent is the labour participation ratio. This means, in effect, 60 crore Indians have no job security. We need not quibble over the exact number of unemployed. Those who are without jobs, whatsoever, will require security. Unemployed could be around 6 crores. The rate of unemployment has never reached such a devastating portion as it reached today. On the other hand, we see, in this inequitable system, in this open capitalist system that has been ushered in by a person in 2014, never before in the history of India have we seen such naked capitalism. We see that somebody who flew him in a plane has shot up his wealth from US \$ 14 billion to US \$ 41 billion! The bottom half of India have lost what they had and they are now holding on to 13 per cent of the national wealth. Madam, just 13 per cent of the national wealth is held by the bottom of India, while the top 10 per cent alone, the number I suggest is only a handful, have arrogated 22 per cent!

We can go on with figures of poverty because poverty itself is open to definition. One reliable statistic says that about 15 crore Indians were lifted out of poverty in ten years, from 2006 onwards. If you go by that figure, 15 crore people were lifted out of poverty. But, along with that, we will also have to see that 14 crores have now been pushed into poverty in the last two years. Whose credit is it that they have again been pushed back into poverty? I have already touched on joblessness. So, without an equitable economy, what does it matter whether the Indian economy reaches 3 trillion or 30 trillion? All of this will be going in the pockets of a few, while the others will go hungry. 'Hunger' has already been mentioned. To give effect to this, what I would say a misconstrued game plan, the private sector has been given much more emphasis than ever before in Indian history. The disinvestment budget for 2021-22 is Rs. 1.75 lakh crores. I wonder how much they have been able to get. But, over and above this, disinvestment is getting even deeper. The Government has come up with a new ploy, called, the National Monetization Pipeline (NMP). This NMP targets rupees six lakh crores over a period of five to six years. And, this year itself, I think, the target is Rs. 88,000 crores. Twenty categories of national assets -- roads, freight corridors, railway lines, six lakh crore watts of power, eight thousand kilometers of gas, twenty-five airports, and I can go on with a list -- would be handed

over for a lease period to those who will return them after extracting whatever was there in them. What guarantee do we have that after the so-called lease period we shall be getting back those assets that we gave them, if at all we have to get them? There are a large number of coal projects. And, we know who the largest coal-handler in India is. Again, we come to the same question for whose benefit we are going for massive privatization? You have not put up any public asset. Who has authorized you to sell our family silver? You have not earned it. All these assets were developed by visionary leaders, with the earnings of the taxpayers. And, you have now tasked yourself with selling them over to people who are friendly with you. When I use a term like that, let me give you an example. Six airports were privatized. They were privatized and given to a friend. That is all I need to say. The procedures were tuned accordingly, as bureaucrats would say. All those six airports went to a person who has never handled an airport in his life; may have only travelled in an airport as a passenger. What happens if he puts on captive rates now?

The LIC is the crown jewel of India. Its worth is around rupees forty lakh crores. It has six lakh agents and employees. And, do you know what rupees forty lakh crores mean? Our Budget is normally around the range of rupees thirty-five lakh crores. The LIC, which had been built such a solid institution, is now being diluted in favour of American insurance companies. I am putting it bluntly. Banks have, over the last twelve years, given us Rs. 16,55,000 crores of operating profit. What you show as actuals depends on what you have forced them to deduct for NPAs. While the inflation rate is at six per cent, the fixed-deposit rate of interest is below six per cent -- at 5.5 per cent, or 5 per cent. So, we, as a Government, are actually stealing one per cent from the depositors' money, by eroding his value every year. Never before has this happened.

I look upon just two sectors which ensure that the next generation of Indians are better than what we are, and what we were.

Coming to education, the figure given by the Education Minister yesterday in reply to a question, said that five years ago, the contribution of the Central Government to education was 1.07 per cent of the GDP. The Education Minister's reply is that Mr. Modi's Government has now brought it down this year to 0.9 per cent. It has come down below even that shameful one per cent, to 0.9 per cent. I understand that you don't understand education. It is all right; you don't need to understand. But you can flaunt degrees. But the poor States, the cash-strapped States, have contributed 3.31 per cent of their money. What they have contributed to education amounts to 3.31 per cent of the GDP. Therefore, India's total contribution to education to GDP comes to 4.30 per cent, thanks only to States.

But, then, I find that in this Government, the left hand does not know what the right hand is doing. The Economic Survey gives, at page 352, that education as percentage of GDP was 2.8 per cent. Just now, the Education Minister has said that it is 4.3 per cent. On page 352 of the Economic Survey, you say, it is 2.8 per cent has gone upto 3.1 per cent. Bhai sahib, there is a lot of difference between 3.1 per cent of the GDP and 4.30 per cent of the GDP. There is a difference of thousands, crores of rupees. Education as a percentage of the GDP is, as I said, been going down year after year, and you are doing nothing about it. I was checking the major schemes in higher education and they have replied that the allocation in the major scheme for higher education known as Rashtriya Uchchatar Shiksha Abhiyan (RUSA) has come down from Rs.1,400 crores five years ago to Rs.165 crores this year. This is just an example.

I move on to health. When we talk about health, India will not forget those devastating scenes of corpses being burnt on pavements and in parks, corpses being thrown into rivers, to hide figures. The figures that the Government of India has given, and is repeatedly giving, of deaths is challenged by every country in the world, including Burkina Faso. Our statistics have no value whatsoever. We are beating China where credibility is concerned. So, we will not forget the massive number of deaths that happened, despite all the drum beating that you undertake now. Why did you not order for vaccines, when they were being made in India? Why were you going around the world as a *vishwa guru*, as somebody, who is a pharmacy of the world, when your own vaccine companies were moving from pillar to post in Delhi asking for a purchase policy. When they booked these vaccines for a foreign market, you clamped down upon them, and, thankfully, you did not declare them anti-nationals, but you got very late. Your late entry into the vaccine market caused immense number of deaths, for which India will never forgive you. On health, our total expenditure is just 1.2 per cent. It is one of the most shameful things, for which we bow our heads in shame when we talk in international forums. It may have gone up from 1.2 to 1.8 but even 1.8 is no percentage. Brazil spends 9.2, Bhutan spends 2.5, Russia spends 5.3, and the advanced countries spend at least five plus. Do not look only at 'India Shining'. You will get the same fate that the person who spoke of 'India Shining' got. Look back, look into ourselves, look into these factors like health and education. You talk of Ayushman Bharat, you talk of insurance covered. As somebody said, all the money has gone to insurance companies. To look at it differently, come to West Bengal and see the scheme that we have initiated called Swasthya Sathi. You will see that everyone has got a card and can walk into a private hospital free of cost. He or she doesn't pay for it, because the Bengal Government pays for them. Look at where things are working more positively, instead of spending

hours and hours in devising alphabets and putting fancy names on your schemes, with acronyms.

Look at the state of institutions, the public institutions that uphold democracy, TRAI, Telecom Regulatory Authority of India. That's where the game started. Within a week of his coming, *That is where the rot begins. Subsequent Chairmen of TRAI have facilitated the growth of one telecom empire, and have devastated all other telecom companies, to the extent that Government of India is forced to buy up the major shares in one limping company.

Look at the Election Commission of India. I will not comment about the present Commission, because we have not had sufficient interaction with them. But the previous Commission, consisted of a Chief Election Commissioner, was an * His partisanship is a matter that is listed in stone in Nirvachan Sadan. He tampered with everything in favour of the Ruling Party. To give another example of how elections were run, the Central Armed Police Forces sent to Bengal outnumbered the Bengal Police. Can you imagine if in Kerala or any other State, that the number of Central persons, Central Armed Forces, sent to you are double that, or 150 per cent of your own forces? Are you trying to run a colonial state? So then, the people gave their verdict. The people's verdict must be remembered.

VVPAT is the paper trail of EVM votes. VVPAT was introduced and forced by the Supreme Court to be operationalized. That VVPAT use is today undergoing a feet-dragging, with the consent of one particular Chief Justice, who has now switched on to the other side. Anyway, our humble submission is that when the 2024 Election comes, please be bold enough to utilize the hundreds of crores that you have spent on VVPATs and let two results emanate, one from EVMs and the other from VVPATs. Why do we have to force you? What do you have to hide? Use the VVPAT, use the paper trail; and I challenge the * affidavit before the Supreme Court. It was said in Supreme Court that it takes five to six days to count paper trails. I have counted I don't know how many election results, on paper. It never takes that long. Why do you mislead * and why do you connive *?

Election bonds are another institutionalized lacuna*. Look at the institutions that we talk about, Prasar Bharati that I happened to serve in a very difficult period. The last two years that I served there under this regime is something that I leave for

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

my biography. It was one of the worst. Look at what they have done to CBI and ED, as just instruments of political vendetta. The CBI and ED were excellent professional services. Let me tell for even those who are angry with them. Their professionalism is being destroyed by putting henchmen at the top, and giving them extension after extension, in collusion with legislation. The Judiciary, I will not mention.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Hon. Member, you will have to start winding up.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Okay. As a maiden speech, please give me a few more minutes.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): You have already consumed your time. Because it is your maiden speech, we continue to give you another two-three minutes.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Thirty-two minutes is what I am entitled. But anyway, I will wind it up. In honour of the Chair, I will wind it up.

Look at the CAG. Look at the conduct of the CAGs. The last two under this regime compromised to such an extent, that the nation never came to know the cost of demonetization. The nation never came to know the cost of the Rafale deal and what was proper and improper about it. And, one of them has got a *Padma Bhushan* for it. Maybe, the other should also be given one. The original mastermind, who actually felled the Government in 2014, has procured more rewards than a gentleman would ever do. In any case, we move on. We come to the last major critical point of federal relations. Remember that, the Indian federation and the Indian civilization came together in an act of unison voluntarily, through their own consensus. We have been ruled by a Central authority for less than 500 years. The Mauryas ruled for about 200 years, the Mughals' effective rule was 120 years, the effective rule of the British was 150 years. So, 70 to 80 per cent of India was ruled for just 500 years by Central powers. Our civilization has, at least, 5,500 years of recorded history, the historical period, and 500 years or less of this period was when Central authorities have ruled. This means that for the remaining 5,000 years Indians have still coalesced together, come together as a civilization, because they volunteered, because they felt it was conducive. Do not turn that volition into an instrument of hegemony.

Look at how the BSF's jurisdiction has been extended without consulting the State. Look at how economic grants to the States are being dealt with. Look at the

last blow, to the Indian Administrative Service. The Indian Administrative Service shuttle officers between the Centre and the States. It is not the fault of Officers that they don't want to serve the Centre now. Ten years ago, some 309 IAS officers served the Centre; today, it should have been 409 against 309. But the number has come down to 223. Can't you get the message that they don't want to come and serve under you? You can't use force now to draw them out from the States and work under you. Force does not work everywhere. Out of the 6,500 IAS posts, 1,500 posts are lying vacant. For God's sake, you have had seven-eight years to fill them up! Fill them up. Don't hegemonise. Don't bully the States. Don't bully the States.

I come now to the last lap of my presentation on the President's Address. The entire system is being run on controls and arrogance. Even the linking of Aadhaar to Voter ID is another indication of this control freak mentality. The Central Vista is an arrogant display of hubris. There was no need. Members, please go and see Rajpath. This Rajpath as it was, was perfectly fine. It has cost Rs. 606 crore to redo the Rajpath and put a few lampshades, lamp-posts and visitors' seats. What sort of nonsense is this! It is just hubris. It would have been much better if they had renamed Rajpath in somebody's name. Six buildings will come up on two sides; six unimaginative buildings, six unaesthetic buildings will be coming up on the two sides of Rajpath as a grand plan of the Central Vista, by breaking down the National Museum, Vigyan Bhawan, National Archives of India and the National Cultural Centre. Everything would be shattered so that six buildings can come up. I have served in the Central bureaucracy, Mr. Modi; you have not served. I know that there was no need for it. Because, even if you bring them down to your *Modi Nagar*, there would still be people who would be working outside.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Kindly wind up, hon. Member.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: This Draconian rule extends now to low snooping and Pegasus is the greatest example of how this State has become a surveillance State. All evidence points out to this surveillance, but the Government does not have the guts to come out and say, 'no'. They also send Governors with the sole intention of disturbing the constitutional mechanism of the States, and the one that we have got, the less said the better.

As we celebrate 75 years of India's Independence, all Indians remember with pride the Quit India Movement that was led by Mahatma Gandhi. That was opposed by those who are now monopolizing its celebration. We remember those went to jail.

Those who had been jailed for 15 years are abused on a daily basis, by those who never saw the insides of a jail. We are proud of our flag, but this was opposed in writing in the *Organizer*, the mouthpiece of the RSS. Their allegiance to the Flag was brought in at gunpoint by Sardar Patel, who jailed these people for one-and-a-half years. For one-and-a-half years, he put the RSS people in jail.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRIMATI VANDANA CHAVAN): Hon. Member, I am sorry, but you will have to wind up.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: We are now told that they are the monopolists of patriotism. This Government is not worthy of further discussions, because every act that it has undertaken is an act that spells out some deep hubris, and a tendency to homogenise our country that is necessarily heterogeneous. Indian civilization will thrive on its heterogeneity, not on any enforced homogeneity. Thank you.

SHRI R.S. BHARATHI (Tamil Nadu): Madam Vice-Chairman, on behalf of DMK Party, my floor leader, Shri Tiruchi Siva, sitting in the chair once occupied by our founder leader, Anna, spoke very-well. He described vividly about the non-performance of this Government. He also pointed out the failures of this Government.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

He also suggested so many measures to be taken up by this Government. Otherwise, the people of this country will teach you a lesson in 2024. So, I would like to endorse the statement made by my floor leader who has occupied the auspicious and historical chair of my founder leader, Anna. He pointed out so many failures of this Government. The Covid-19 pandemic situation was mismanaged and mishandled by this Government. The President has said that we have to learn lessons from the past. When the first Covid wave was there, this Government should have learnt lessons from that and should have implemented safeguard measures during the second wave. Did they do it? One fine morning, without notice, this Government imposed a complete lockdown. What happened? Migrant workers had to walk for kilometres from Delhi. They were jobless, without shelter and they didn't even get drinking water from the capital city. When we saw it on TV, it was a sorry sight. We saw women carrying their children on their shoulders and carrying baggage in their hands. We saw them walking on foot without slippers for kilometres together. Many of them died on their way. Who is responsible for all this? It was because of the

failure of this Government because you did not take lessons from the first Covid wave. So many failures have been pointed out by previous speakers.

The President has said about the empowerment of women. I would like to remind this House that this House, Rajya Sabha, has passed the Bill for 33 per cent reservation for women. What has happened to it? Where is it? You have got a road-roller majority in the Lok Sabha. What prevents this Government from passing that Bill? You are cheating the public. You are misleading the public. You are making a false propaganda that women are being empowered. Rajya Sabha has passed the Bill, but it is still pending in the Lok Sabha. Why are you agitating when we say that you have got scant respect for the women of this country? In Tamil Nadu, we are giving 50 per cent reservation in the local bodies, both in the Panchayats and the Municipal corporations, and due reservations have also been given to the Scheduled Castes.

Now, Sir, I would like to talk about my own State. Tamil Nadu is a land of social justice. We were the pioneers of social justice. Previously, in our State, there used to be a fight between the upper classes and the backward classes. Because of efforts of our Dravidian leaders like Periyar Anna, today, Tamil Nadu happens to be the medical hub because of reservation. Who is responsible for that? It is because of the Dravidian movement. In 1920, Communal G.O. was passed in the Provincial State of Tamil Nadu. What was the reason? Out of 100 seats in the medical college, 95 seats used to be occupied by the upper caste people. No representation was given to the backward classes and the Scheduled Caste people in the Government offices. I would like to remind this House about a historical event. When the Justice Party was in power, the then Chief Minister, who belonged to the Dravidian Movement, visited a Tehsildar office in Nellore, which was a part of Tamil Nadu at that time. He visited and inspected the office. From Tehsildar downwards, there were about 47 people occupying different positions in that office. All the 47 people belonged to one particular community and one particular family. Only the *dawali* belonged to the backward community. This came into the mind of the then Chief Minister of the Justice Party and then they formed the Madras Public Service Commission, which gave representation to the people of backward classes also. This is the history of our State.

Now, the NEET exam has been introduced. Why have I narrated all these instances? I want to say that because of this reservation, our people, after 70 years, they have been able to come into the medical field and we have Judges, advocates and engineers. In 1950, when the Constitution was framed, the first victims were the

people of Tamil Nadu. The Communal G.O. was challenged on the basis of equality. One of the framers of the Constitution, Alladi Krishnaswamy Iyer, appeared for the petitioner and the Madras High Court struck down the Communal G.O. The State Government went in appeal. The Supreme Court also struck that down. I would like to remind this House about Periyar Anna and our great Kamaraj and the Congress Party. All of them revolted against the judgment passed by the Supreme Court. Our former Prime Minister, Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, was magnanimous. He accepted the will of the people of Tamil Nadu and Tamil Nadu was the State which was responsible for giving the first Amendment to the Constitution of India. In 1951, we, the people of Tamil Nadu, because of the revolt and the voice raised by the leaders of our Dravidian movement, led the first Constitution Amendment. Today, Sir, regarding NEET exam, I would like to say that earlier, we were fighting with the upper classes. After 70 years of struggle, a lot of doctors from all classes of society have come up and Tamil Nadu has become a medical hub. But, to stop this, now the NEET exam has been introduced. Now, the fight is between the haves and the have-nots. Previously, it was between the upper classes and the backward classes. Today, in Tamil Nadu, it is the fight between the haves and the have-nots. Who are successful in NEET exam? What has this Government achieved by imposing this NEET exam? It has resulted in scandal after scandal, impersonation, question papers being leaked, corruption in question papers, and collusion between the paper setters and the coaching institutions. So, in Tamil Nadu, 13 students of the backward communities and poor people, who are below poverty line, have committed suicide. One student, who scored 1,059 out of 1,200 marks, did not get a seat in the medical college. She committed suicide because of this NEET examination. Children are going to the coaching centres. Those who go to the coaching centres get the opportunity to pass the NEET examination. Therefore, our Chief Minister, Shri M.K. Stalin, during the elections of 2021, gave an assurance to the people of Tamil Nadu that once we come to power, we will scrap the NEET examination. To scrap this NEET or to exempt Tamil Nadu from NEET examination...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI R.S. BHARATHI: I am concluding in a minute, Sir. It was passed by the State Legislature. It was unanimously passed and was sent to the Governor but the Governor is sitting over it for the last four months. Is it fair, Sir? Since education is in the Concurrent List, it has to be necessarily sent to the President. But the Governor has neither sent it to the President nor has he passed any comments on it. He is just

sitting over it. So, this sort of injustice should not happen. We are in a federal set up. Our great leader, Anna, once said in Tamil -- with these words, I am concluding -- "*why does a goat need a beard, why does a State need a Governor.*" It means there is no necessity for the goat to have a beard; likewise, there is no necessity for the State to have a Governor. I think, it is going to be true in the days to come. Thank you.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Dr. Sasmit Patra.

DR. SASMIT PATRA (Odisha): Hon'ble Deputy Chairman, I am thankful to you for giving me the opportunity to make my statement on the Motion of Thanks to the Hon'ble President's address. On behalf of my leader Hon'ble Chief Minister Shri Naveen Patnaik ji, Biju Janata Dal and my party, we support this vote of thanks. Sir, while supporting the Motion of thanks, today I have to say with a heavy heart that the matter of equality, equality of thought, what is ideal, the structure of federalism, which is the federal system we discuss. Today, the discussion of that federal system seems to be declining somewhere. Before delving into the reasons as to why I am saying this, I would like to draw your attention to Paragraph No.-14 of Hon'ble President's Address, in which he has expressed the statement of Babasaheb Dr. Bhimrao Ambedkar in which Ambedkar ji had said - "My ideal would be a society based on liberty, equality and fraternity." Equality i.e. fairness- All the states are equal, no more, no less, no one is loved more, no one is loved less and equality for all. The description of Babasaheb Dr. Bhimrao's thinking that the Hon'ble President has given is very beautiful but is it happening in reality today? This is not happening in reality. I want to discuss about why this is not happening in reality.

Hon'ble Deputy Chairman ji, our Hon'ble Chief Minister Shri Naveen Patnaik ji writes three letters to the Central Government in 2019, 2020 and 2021 and demands from them that 6 lakh houses for 6 lakh families, which mostly belong to tribal brothers and sisters, should be given to them. Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana should be included in rural areas too. What has to be done for that? Sir, there is a housing portal of the Central Government, that housing portal will have to be opened but this housing portal is not functioning for three years. This window is closed and it is not opening. But for whom does this window open - this window is open for those states, which the central government probably loves more. When this window opened on the 13th of January, 2022 this year, for whom did this window open? The state of Odisha has been demanding for three years, our honourable Chief Minister Shri Naveen Patnaik ji has been demanding this for three years, but it is not open for him, but for whom is it open for - for Karnataka. This window is open for the people of Karnataka, for their 2.5 million families - it is a good thing. But what is the crime committed by 6

lakh tribal brothers and sisters of Odisha that the window is not opening for them for three years, this reality is not understood by me.

Sir, the Hon'ble President has said in paragraph 19 that under 'Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana - Gramin', one crore seventeen lakh houses have been sanctioned in the last three years at a cost of about 1.5 lakh crore rupees. If you can include one crore seventeen lakh houses under this, then why are you not able to include the houses of 6 lakh tribal brothers and sisters for these three years? What is the problem with that? What wrong they have done? If 25 lakh houses of Karnataka can be constructed in January, then why are these 6 lakh houses not being constructed today? This is an issue. Today in Zero Hour also I have demanded that this housing portal of 'Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana' should be opened so that 6 lakh tribal families of Odisha can be benefited from it. I hope if the government is listening, the government will look into it.

Sir, I would like to draw your attention to paragraph 5. Paragraph 5 says, 'Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas, Sabka Vishwas, and Sabka Prayas'. I feel that today in this federal system somewhere 'Sabka Saath' is not being thought of, some states are being thought of together. 'Vikas for all' is not being thought - You think about the development of Karnataka, it is a good thing, but think of development of Odisha too, nothing is wrong in it. Take 'Sabka Vishwas' too, but why are you taking the trust of only a few states? Also have our trust. I want to say in the context of 'Sabka Prayas' that today all the states are making efforts, all the states are trying to move forward. The state of Odisha is moving ahead with perseverance under the leadership of honorable Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik. If the Hockey World Cup happens anywhere, it happens in Odisha today. If anyone pays maximum in GST, then it is Odisha. If someone gives 20 thousand crore rupees to the railways, then it is Odisha. If anyone gives minerals to the country today, it is Odisha. But when it comes to Odisha, why do you deny it? You want GST, Mines-Minerals from Odisha, but why is Odisha not getting what it deserves? Now I want to come to what is written in paragraph 22. Paragraph 22 says, 'empowerment of farmers and rural economy.' The farmers have been empowered — that is also a good thing. Government did record procurement to match record production - This is also a good thing. Record production took place in the country. This was done by the farmers and the central government did the record procurement, this is a good thing. You procured 900 lakh metric tonnes and benefitted one crore farmers, it is a good thing. If you can procure 900 lakh metric tonnes, why are you refusing to procure 22 lakh metric tonnes parboiled rice from Odisha? You can take 900 lakh metric tonnes, then why can't you take 22 lakh metric tonnes of parboiled rice from Odisha? Food procurement is the responsibility of Food Corporation of India, the responsibility of the Central Government. Food procurement is not the responsibility of the state government. Constitutionally the central government will have to procure food, the state government only helps. But the central government is stepping back. Food

Corporation of India states that they will not procure your parboiled rice, which we call "Usna Rice" in Odia. This time the target is to procure 52 lakh metric tonnes. Our consumption is 30 lakh metric tonnes and yet another 22 lakh metric tonnes of rice is yet to be procured. Last year, till this time four lakh metric tonnes was procured. So far only 12 thousand metric tonnes have been procured. Why such behavior? If all the states are the same, all the subjects are the same, all the people are the same, then why there is a different ideology for Karnataka and different for Odisha? Why the attitude is different for one crore farmers and a different stance for the farmers of Odisha? Why such an alternate policy?

Sir, I will say only one thing in the end. I will repeat the same point of Babasaheb again and then I will conclude my statement. 'My ideal would be a society based on liberty, equality and fraternity.' If we really believe this thought of the speech, then this thinking tells us that there should be equality, there should be fairness. The central government will have to think on this.

Sir, I was looking for the word federalism in it, but I did not see this word anywhere in it. Maybe it is my ignorance that I did not see it.

PROF. MANOJ KUMAR JHA : Yes, it is not. They do not even need it.

DR. SASMIT PATRA: Sir, federalism word is not there in this, federal system word is not there. Is there no need for a federal system or is the federal system today has become out of context, out of syllabus, out of date? In the end I would like to tell you that this topic is very important. This is not just a subject of Odisha, it will raise a question mark on the federal system in the coming days. I hope that if the government is alert, the government is thinking, listening, then it should act on these demands, thank you very much.

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO (Telangana): Sir, I hope you will empathise with my discordant note. Because I speak with a discordant note for some reasons, not without reasons. One, we are disappointed with the Address. This is what is expected. After having seen you for seven years, nobody expected that you would do better. What you say could be seen on Google or anywhere else. There is nothing new. Yesterday, I was hearing a leader saying it in the Lok Sabha that what we expect in the President's Address is some kind of a strategic vision of the ruling party, because what has been done has been done which has both plus points and minus points. But what is to be done is something on which you throw the discussion open.

Today, I rise to speak, as I earlier said, with a heavy heart. Even Patra ji while welcoming the Address said that he was speaking with a heavy heart. Everyone today who is speaking on it, even if they are supporting it, they are speaking with a heavy heart because something pains them. Today, our very polity, the idea of India,

is under threat. Today, you are all talking about unity. He has quoted Ambedkar. But I will quote Ambedkar in separate context. Economically we are divided, as yesterday one leader said. But what about our basic secular and cultural values? It is eating into our very body politic. It is not only dividing the persons. But it is corrupting their minds, so much so that tomorrow you will find two differently-thinking people on the "idea of India". This is not a new thing. But ever since the ruling party had come to power, this division of secular Indians and radical Hindu nationalists has sharpened. The conflict between these two identities forms the core of polarization in India. And the greatest threat today to this country is the politics of polarization. This is very important. I am a little older than a lot of people in this House. So as an elder brother I can tell you this that today it might pay us, it might pay us in some project, but tomorrow when it reaches the hearts and starts corrupting the very body, then you would find two nations, not persons. Persons can be divided and they can be brought together. But the minds will be so divided that they can never be brought together. This I am not speaking because of politics. I am speaking to you out of my concern and that is why I said I am speaking with a discordant note. The majoritarian-backed politics of polarization is at its highest level during the NDA. You must excuse me. This is NDTV's hate speech analysis. There is an increase of 1,013 per cent in hate speeches of which 80 per cent are from Sangh Parivar Members. This is what they found in the report. I am saying it with a heavy heart, as Patra ji said it with a heavy heart, what exactly is going to happen. We need to correct our own people. I do not want to go into the specifics. But it clearly shows the path of hate towards which the BJP Government is heading. Hate politics and communal disharmony is against the very idea of India advocated by Mahatma Gandhi and all other great leaders. There is an urgent need to bring a special law to tackle the problem of hate speech as recommended by the hon. Supreme Court and the Viswanathan Committee.

2.00 P.M.

Sir, the partisan attacks on India's independent political institutions have intensified. Opposition parties have become extremely wary of defending pluralism and secularism which needs to be done but is not being done. Hatred and violence against minority communities have flared up. Although various actors have launched efforts to counter the country's majoritarian turn and improve civic dialogue, they have failed. Polarization in India is more toxic today than it has ever been in the past, and it shows no signs of abating. We also got ignored. This does not mean that by talking

about only this, I am ignoring the caste division, the division which is possible in the name of caste and language. We must also be aware of that. The divide over Hindu nationalism is seriously endangering liberal freedoms and pluralist democracy in India. The current wave of polarization has its roots in the colonial period and the two clashing visions of the 'idea of India' that emerged then. One strain of thinking envisioned India as a secular nation, in which membership was defined not by one's faith but by one's place of birth. The most important proponent of this view was Mahatma Gandhi. Though a devout Hindu himself, Gandhi viewed the Indian nation as a harmonious collection of religious communities. Speaking about the Indian society, I would quote what Dr. Patra said but in different context. Ambedkarji spoke about this during the debate on federalism and the unity which was being sought. We are a multinational nation. We have never been a nation at all. The word 'nation' is not used in the Constitution. It is 'Union of States'. All right, let us go into ideology also. Even if you are talking of a nation, we are trying to build and make a nation. How do we do it? We had been 600 nations and I belong to an entirely different culture known as Dravidian culture. In Onam, we think that Bali Chakravarthi will come back. Whom do you glorify or gloat over for killing him? See, these are differences. We are trying for all these years and centuries to see how we can find some kind of unity, a set of unity in these diversities. When we are making such efforts, you are coming up with something else. For example, today morning, when I asked one of the most sober and very matured Minister, the Labour Minister, that a particular Member wants the answer in English because he is not able to get the answer, he said that he will speak in Hindi only and the Member can look forward to translation. This kind of attitude must go. This kind of thinking and mindset should go. We see it today. Today, the Southern States feel neglected; don't take them easily. I belong to one of the Southern States. Though I come from a Central State where I can speak Hindi, a lot of people here from Tamil Nadu and Kerala do not understand Hindi at all. Try to accommodate them. Their culture is different from yours'. My dress is different from you; my food is different from you; my marriage is different from you; many things are different from you. Yet, we want to be one because we have been brought in and we are trying to do it. This is exactly what is under threat today. So, if you read Ambedkar, what he says is "That my ideal would be a society based on liberty, equality and fraternity". He stressed on fraternity. Democracy is not merely a form of Government. Only because you have power, you are taking away all the powers of the State Governments and say that you are running the Government and have the figures. I not only thank but congratulate Mr. Jawhar Sircar from West Bengal, who spoke just now. He punctured every statistic of yours. Statistics are

static tricks. These static tricks of yours have been punctured by him when he quoted you one by one point and how they have gone down although you are claiming otherwise. I am not getting into that. Here, I am quoting and saying that democracy is not merely a form of Government. It is primarily more of an associated living. How you take us all together is important which we have never seen in the BJP. If a Chief Minister from Telangana writes a letter to you asking people to revolt against the Centre, it comes in banners and special issues are taken out, there is something wrong.

Why this pass? Why did we come to that kind of a pass where a Chief Minister has to put a big fight against you? He was speaking on agricultural distress, no doubt. He was speaking about federalism, no doubt, because you are trying to take away its powers; but he was also speaking about your mindset; because he has been very close to you. He has been advising, we have been voting with you. Today, we have decided that we should not be with you. We would say, never be with you. Why? Why this pass? Why this kind of a change? You must ask yourself, not to us. Whatever it is, as far as the Constitution is concerned; Article 5 of the Indian Constitution deals with the provisions related to Citizenship. The BJP Government has attempted to destroy the secular nature of the Indian Constitution by changing the Citizenship Law and communalized through the passage of CAA and NRC. This is what exactly we are trying to talk to you. You might have passed the Bill. People have protested, might have told you against it, but you are not taking advice on it.

Whatever it is, this is taking me to Centre trying to usurp all the powers. The federal structure is also under threat like the very idea of India. The Central Government, through the passage of several Bills, is trying to destroy the essence of Indian Federalism. Although word 'federalism' is not there but we think we are a federal Government and we strongly believe it is a federal Government.

I would give you an example of electricity power Bill which is coming. That proposed legislation not only takes away the power vested in the State Governments but also gives an undue advantage to those States that have the BJP Government as the ruling party. Please look into the clauses, you would find. I would have asked Mr. Patra to make a study and tell you. One-size-fits-all Central schemes with centralization in decision-making with no choice for States to implement is relevant and useful to analyze. This is what exactly is happening. As I said, the proposed amendment in electricity Bill allows the entry of private players in the power sector. The amendment seeks to improve the economic efficiency of power distributors. It is likely to have negative repercussions for consumers and State-owned power outlets alike. The private entrants would supply power through the infrastructure developed

by the State-owned PSUs while the profit-making areas would be poached by the private players, the obligation to provide the electricity to rural areas would solely fall on the State-owned distribution. This is a power electricity Bill which is coming. Since the creation of our State Telangana, the power capacity has increased multiple times. It is further expected that within the next few years, this capacity of the State would go to 10,000 Megawatts. The effective Governance shown by TRS Party in Telangana has not only electrified villages but also provided quality power. I am not trying to score a point here. What I am trying to tell you is that the States are doing their best. When they are doing best -- when we are giving free power 24x7 to our farmers -- now, this Bill would attempt to put meters at every pump set. It means that there is a threat lingering over these people, lingering over our farmers that one day or the other, the meters would be fixed and charges levied. I just want to talk about South India; but please understand the spirit of my agony, not the words. The Southern States are being ignored according to me. The Central Government's persistent efforts to sideline Southern States in the distribution of tax avenues is evident. The South Indian States have taken numerous policy measures to ensure population control yet collecting a higher portion of taxes. However, the distribution of funds to the States by the BJP-led Central Government fails to provide any incentive to States who have performed well economically. Our State of Telangana expected Rs.38,000 odd crore grant-in-aid from 2021-2022 but, however, we received only a meagre amount of Rs.5,155 crore till date. I am quoting this only as an example to you. I would like to state that Telangana is the fourth largest contributor to the exchequer and the Centre. We are the fourth largest after Calcutta and Bombay and other.

Sir, but, what is happening is non-allocation. The Telangana does not get a single institution. Although the State Re-organization Act provides for certain institutions and names certain institutions which will go to Telangana, they have not come. We have been writing letters on that. The discrimination and neglect of Telangana are blatant in the distribution of Higher Education Institutions like IITs, IIM and Navodaya Vidyalaya. I quote and tell you while all the States in the country got an institution, the Telangana Government drew a blank. Seven IIMs, Seven IITs, Four NIDs, 16 IIITs and 157 medical colleges are allocated to various States but Telangana drew a blank. Thus, the Indian federal structure is under threat. Now, this takes me to the crisis that the farmers are facing. And on it our Chief Minister writes a letter to the Prime Minister. We have had a bitter experience of eleven months of agitation by the farmers of Punjab. It is not the farmers of Punjab perhaps it has happened somewhere near Punjab and Delhi but all the farming community in the country was

with them. Their hearts were with them. What happened was you brought the Farm Bills without consulting the States. We had said during the discussion on Farm Bills also that this subject of Agriculture belonged to the States. It is not only violating the constitutional provision but your audacity is so much that you allowed it for 11 months and 700 people died and not a single word is mentioned in the Speech! It went on for 14 months, and not a single word is mentioned about it. This is what exactly bothers us. We, in Telangana, today are the second largest producers of grain, after Punjab. We have attained that because of our irrigation facilities, power and, naturally, the farmers. We go to this side of the farmers who are on agitation. The Centre passed the Farms Laws without consultation with the State Governments. These Acts were against the federal structure of the country as Agriculture falls under the State List. Furthermore, these Acts neglected the long-standing demands of the farmers that sought implementation of the legal regime of MSP. Although you had asked them to withdraw and promised for MSP; but the other day we saw that there was no mention of MSP in the law, and there is no legal backing to MSP, and even the Speech does not make any mention of this issue even after so much of agitation. Sir, that brings to me their love for agriculture. Sir, a day before the 2016 Budget, Modi ji announced that he would double the income of the farmers. I do not know whether he has doubled it or not, but he has certainly doubled the cost of the inputs. Today, the cost of inputs has gone up according to your own statistics. They have gone up, but you are saying that you will double the income, which is nothing but a joke. The allocation of funds from the Union Budget has substantially declined and reached less than two per cent at one stage. Understand this as to what is happening. Today, the growth rate is 3.9 per cent. If you want to reach the double figure, you must go from 12 per cent to 14 per cent growth rate. Where is 12 per cent and 14 per cent and where is this 3.9 per cent this year; otherwise, you had never reached 3.3 per cent. The highest that you reached was 3.3 per cent.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Keshava Rao ji, your time is already over.

DR. K. KESHAVA RAO: Then, I will have to mention the important ones. I will take one to two minutes. Everybody and even the world knew that unemployment is the greatest challenge that the nation is facing, but is there a single mention about unemployment in this Speech? It means that you are totally blind and you are totally oblivious of what is needed in this country and what the people are asking for. So, about the employment, I would say that there are closure of business houses, because I head one of the Standing Committees which is concerned with

employment, the MSME, which is the employment-giver. The closure of business houses and laying off of employees has led to a sharp increase in the unemployment rate. India's unemployment rate went up to 7.91 per cent in December, 2021. In urban areas, it reached up to 9.30 per cent in December, 2021, while in rural areas, it went up to 7.28 per cent.

So it is important to note that the unemployment rate was already quite high, that is, 6.3 even before the advent of Covid. So you cannot take the excuse of Covid at this point of time. The frustration of unemployment can be understood. People still say that we have 11 lakhs vacancies in jobs and what is taken out today is, 60 lakhs. Believe me, it is not 7 lakh, it is 60 lakhs. The unorganized sector also needs to be taken into consideration. Sixty lakh of people have gone out of the jobs in this area. It will be much more. As I said, there is not a single agency for statistics which has the credibility as to what exactly the position today in the country is. Sir, this takes me to one sentence that is about the failure to 'Make in India'. Is it a scheme, a slogan or a *jumla*? However, 'Make in India' is in manufacturing that you are saying. MSME is a manufacturing unit. It is a manufacturing unit, which are in lakhs. We are giving lakhs of jobs there and you should have encouraged them. And yesterday, the Minister said about the Credit Guarantee Scheme. The Credit Guarantee Scheme is there for the last two years. You only brought it, I am telling you, agreed. But still don't quote them as your new speech quote.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now.

DR. K. KESHAHA RAO: Lastly, our Chief Minister and it is not out of frustration, after spending very thoughtful hours, has decided to throw open the idea of a new Constitution for this country because we know, under you, even the basic structure of secularism, basic structure of our commitment to the nation, basic structure like Governor's office, like State List and also the Directive Principles, which need to get...*(Interruptions)*... are under a threat...*(Interruptions)*... So he has thrown open.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Keshava Rao ji. ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE): With all respect to you, I respect you, and you are a senior Member, you also know me and I know you for nearly 40-50 years. If you speak of changing of the Constitution, we are the first people to oppose it. You can suggest for an Amendment, but you cannot say

that the basic Constitution is going to change...*(Interruptions)*... And they want to do it, and it is favourable to them. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. KESHAHA RAO: I thank him ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE): The RSS people want a change to our Constitution. ...*(Interruptions)*... They demanded. ...*(Interruptions)*... If you too speak on the same tune, we are not going to agree...*(Interruptions)*...and we will fight tooth and nail. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. KESHAHA RAO: The Congress leaders, today, see no need for a new Constitution. I have never said it will be thrust on...*(Interruptions)*... This is one idea, a proposal that is brought to you, ...*(Interruptions)*...you may agree or not agree. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*... Keshava Rao ji, please conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. K. KESHAHA RAO: I am telling you. So we are giving it, we are saying it. We have tried, we have undergone 105 Amendments, Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir. 105 Amendments and they are not satisfied. So, one idea has come, why don't you go in for a change. Like you, I also agree. What exactly...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Keshava Rao ji.

DR. K. KESHAHA RAO: So this is the new Constitution that we are proposing to a nation for debate, for a discussion, not for forceful acceptance. We will debate it. ..*(Interruptions)*... Thank you very much.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble Members, request has come from two hon'ble senior Members. They will not be available tomorrow and thereafter. If you all agree, I would like to invite Hon'ble Digvijaya Singh ji and then Shri Kamakhya Prasad Tasa ji to speak. Shri Digvijaya Singh ji.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Madhya Pradesh): Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, thank you very much. I conditionally support the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. If you accept our Amendments, I will have no objection.

Deputy Chairman Sir, the policies of the Government, the action taken regarding that policies and the future plan are mentioned in it. In a democracy, the policies of the Government depend on the ideology of the party that in the power. In the year 2014, when Modi ji's Government came to power, he made many promises that black money would come back, inflation would be decreased and unemployment would be reduced. Amit Shah Ji had said regarding Rupees 15 lakh that it was a *jumla*, then you should consider it a *jumla*, but where you have fulfilled the things that you have mentioned in the President's Address of 2014, 2015 and 2016? Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, I want to mention their socio-economic policies in brief. Our Leader of the Opposition has mentioned this in a great detail. The gap between the rich and the poor has widened in seven years. The rich got richer and the poor got poorer. Alongwith this, you will notice that due to bigotry in the society, the bitterness kept growing. On one hand, where you have not done any work in the interest of the poor in economic policies, on the other hand you have disturbed the harmony of society and the unity in Diversity, for which I will present another evidence before you.

Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, if you examine the tax revenues of any Government, then you collect direct tax from the capable people and indirect tax from the general public. I want to present some details about the tax collection before you that in 2014-15, the 55.39 percent of the total tax collection was direct tax, it means that during the UPA Government, we used to take more tax from the rich and 44.61 percent from the general public, i.e. 10.78 percent was collected from the rich and less was collected from the poor. I am providing the figures of 2021-22 when "*Suit-Boot Ki Sarkar*" came to power and during that time the direct tax decreased from 55.39 percent to 46.43 percent and indirect tax increased from 44.61 per cent to 53.57 per cent. It means that less tax is collected from the rich and more tax is collected from the poor, the general public - this is basically the ideology of the economic policies of the Modi Government. In 2014, the unemployment rate was 5.6 percent and as Dr.K. Keshav Rao sahib said that before COVID it had reached to 6.3 percent and today it is 7.55 percent, it means that unemployment kept on rising. There is no mention of this either. Not only this, just look at the differences between the poor and the rich, you may find that the wealth that the one percent of the top population controls and the wealth that the bottom of the fifty percent does. If we largely speak, the Gini Coefficient is the highest among the world's developed countries or among the main five global economies, the biggest difference between the rich and the poor can be seen in India. You will see how the Government increased the indirect tax. You kept increasing petrol and diesel prices and reducing subsidies. By reducing subsidies, you are putting a burden on the common man by

increasing taxes. You will find in this Budget that 27 percent subsidy has been reduced by the Modi Government. Whom the subsidy was granted to — it was granted to the common man. It did not have any effect on corporate tax. We say that even in the time of COVID, the people who have earned more and more money, whose wealth has increased, why don't you impose super rich tax on them? You collect tax from the poor and you are putting a burden on the general public and providing everything to the general public by making things expensive, this is your policy.

Sir, yesterday Rahul Gandhi ji just mentioned that the UPA Government has uplifted about 23 crore people living below the poverty line. After that, when your Government came to power, about 20 crore people again went back to below the poverty line, it means that this Government has not been working for the interest of the poor. This Government is also anti-farmer - while it is anti-poor Government, it is also anti-farmer Government, as soon as the Government came to power, the first step was to bring an Ordinance, according to which the Land Acquisition Act was abolished, but Modi ji forgets that the farmers' organization is strong and he ignores the power of the farmers. Modi ji brought the Ordinance for the Land Acquisition Act without understanding the power of the farmers, but it had to be withdrawn due to protest from our side i.e. the opposition. The same situation happened with the three anti-farmer Bills. When the three anti-farmer Bills came, those Bills were also opposed by the farmers and finally he had to withdraw those three Bills also. The Government had talked about doubling the income of farmers and now 2022 has come, but it is not mentioned anywhere.

Sir, in the same way, 29 labor laws of meant for laborers were also abolished. The discussion was not allowed on those laws and in return you came with 4 labor laws. You did not discuss any of these with the trade unions and denied the rights of the workers. You denied the rights to the poor, the farmers, the laborers and this makes us to understand your attitude. You have acted contrary to parliamentary conventions. It is the policy of the Central Government that if any law comes under pre-legislative consultation, before that you should discuss with the stakeholders, but you did not allow it to be implemented. It would have been better if you had discussed the anti-farmer Bill as per the pre-consultation policy. What was our proposal, what was our amendment; our amendment was that you should send these Bills to the Select Committee. The UPA Government always constituted the Select Committee and did not make any negligence with that process, the way you got those three anti-farmer Bills passed without sending those Bills to the Select Committee, has been contrary to the democratic traditions, so we ask you that this Government is anti-poor, anti-schedule caste, anti-tribal people, anti-farmer and anti-labour.

Sir, I want to say regarding social harmony that the diversity that exists in India, will not find in any other country, but from the very beginning your thinking and thoughts have been to label a section as anti-national and seditious. This has

increased social animosity and encouraged the spread of religious hysteria. What kind of speeches are being spoken in our country, Dharma Sansad is being organized, Dharma Sansad was held at Haridwar, pick up the pistol, a call was made for Genocide -today the situation is that if someone gets hurt in his or her finger, Hon'ble Prime Minister tweets, but does not utter a word against those who spread such hysteria. It shows his mindset. The mindset of Modi ji is the same, basically the organization with which he is associated; it is an ideology of that organization. The organization that learned the policy of 'Divide and Rule' from the British rule - today that organization is spreading hatred in this country by dividing them.

Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, I told you that whatever policies are formulated, the Government takes action accordingly and it is based on its ideology. Now where does this ideology originate from? Basically, this ideology is related to that organization, which is spreading hatred and bigotry in this country, in a whole way.

That organization does not believe in democracy. The ideology that you are talking about, on the basis of which you are forming policies, is unregistered and it does not have any membership nor any account. It opposed the Constitution, it opposed Babasaheb Ambedkar. You have quoted Babasaheb Ambedkar regarding fraternity and equality, but this organisation, I do not want to name that organisation, the views of this organisation are completely contrary to the Constitution and the democratic values of this country. Because this institution does not have faith in democracy. Along with this, this ideology had proclaimed from the very beginning that *Manu Smriti* has not been followed, that's why it burnt the Constitution, opposed the Constitution and burnt the *Tricolour*. They want to spread confusion. You are talking of '*Amrit Mahotsav*', but you have not even mentioned Indian freedom fighter in '*Amrit Mahotsav*'...(Interruptions)...Well, you hate Congress, you hate Mahatma Gandhi and Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, you may also hate Sardar Patel, but at least you could have taken the name of Shaheed Bhagat Singh. ...(Interruptions)...You could have taken the name of Ashfaqulla Khan ji, you could have taken the name of Chandrashekhar Azad ji, but may be that you hated him too. It is said about Shyama Prasad Mukherjee that he had opposed Article 370 regarding the issues of Kashmir. Yes, he protested in 1952, but when Article 370 became a part of the Constitution, he was in the Cabinet. He had support in the Cabinet, so you are wrong to say that Article 370 was opposed. ...(Interruptions)...Dr. Syama Prasad Mukherjee supported it. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble Digvijaya Singh Ji, please conclude your speech.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: I will take two-three minutes, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

Sir, this is the fascist thinking and the way this thinking primarily works, is that framing a particular person or a particular community as being enemy to the nation

and the one who is against that enemy, is a patriot and the one who supports the enemy, is a traitor. Hon'ble Sir, if you see the case of anti-national, you will find that how it happened in Bhima Koregaon case. Let me give you an example how a conspiracy was hatched in Bhima Koregaon that some people gathered to assassinate Narendra Modi ji and cases were filed against 17 social activists. Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, it has been three and a half years, but till date the charge sheet has not even been presented. This is the way the National Investigating Agency works. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Two-three minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have already taken four minutes.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: Let me conclude. ...*(Interruptions)*.. I would like to tell you that Hon'ble President Sir, what you are advocating for this Government, it has violated every democratic value. Hon'ble Deputy Chairman Sir, today the person who is the Prime Minister, has the responsibility of governance. *When he came here after being elected. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not yielding. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not yielding. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: When you got elected, you came to the House and bowed down to the doorsteps, you bowed down to the Constitution ...*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude now. ...*(Interruptions)*...You have already taken five minutes. ...*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: I request you that the Hon'ble Minister is sitting here, so you will give an advice to the Hon'ble Prime Minister with folded hands on our behalf that he should accept our some advice too, because in a democratic system unless we work with consultation, the autocracy cannot work. That's why I say to you, I request you all - Hon'ble Deputy Chairman ji, please listen, this is very important, I want to request you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Your all points are important..*(Interruptions)*..Your time is over. ..*(Interruptions)*..

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: It is completely a single man Cabinet. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: And as it has been said *Nindak niyare rakhiye*, we all are critics indeed - '*Nindak niyare rakhiye, Aangan kuti chhaway*'.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...Digvijaya Singh ji. ..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: If he follows our points and advice, then he will not make a mistake. ..*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: But if you don't follow our advice, the way you keep making mistakes..*(Interruptions)*..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Digvijay Singh ji, thank you. ..*(Interruptions)*..

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: You are destroying this country; it is going to harm you. Deputy Chairman Sir, thank you very much.

SHRI RAKESH SINHA (Nominated): Sir, I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Rakesh Sinha ji, please you speak on point of order.

SHRI RAKESH SINHA: Sir, using such unparliamentary words for *Prime Minister, ...*(Interruptions)*... you are using such inappropriate words. ...*(Interruptions)*... you cannot challenge parliamentary democracy. You do not have faith in parliamentary democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*... that's why he wants to break the parliamentary democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: It is said by Advani ji that he is a good event manager. ...*(Interruptions)*... Advani ji has said this, I have not said it.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing is going on record except what Rakesh Sinha is speaking. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAKESH SINHA: Using such words is like spreading anarchy in the country. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: &

SHRI RAKESH SINHA: *

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Rakesh ji, please sit down. It will be examined. Hon'ble Kamakhya Prasad Tasa ji.

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA (Assam): Deputy Chairman Sir, I am grateful to you for giving me an opportunity to speak. I also thank my party and my Minister for giving an opportunity to speak here.

Deputy Chairman Sir, I stand in support of the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address. I thank the President for providing complete details of our Government. There are many senior leaders here, who are sitting in the opposition. After sitting here and listening to the speeches of those people, it seems that our Modi ji has done everything wrong and they have done everything correct. I thank the President for what he has said, because our Modi ji also listens to the opposition leaders, he calls those people. Yesterday, Prime Minister also heard the complete speech of the Leader of the Opposition here. I was also in the Lok Sabha with the Leader of the Opposition. I did not feel that he could say anything constructive yesterday. Whatever it is, there will be criticism, but we had expected from the Leader of the Opposition that he would speak more value based things, which would give a direction to the Government, but I belong to new generation, I did not think so.

Sir, when we are celebrating *Amrit Mahotsav* at the time of celebration of 75 years of independence, we completely support the work of Prime Minister, Narendra Modi ji and the whole world supports his work. There are some leaders who have insulted for terming someone as '*Vishwa Guru*'. They don't know what it means by saying '*Vishwa Guru*'. The way the Prime Minister has gone on the path of '*Vishwa Guru*', they should also follow that.

I do not want to criticize anyone, but while saluting the 130 crore people, the Prime Minister talked about vaccine. Today, I heard that an MP asked why the vaccine was not brought earlier. The vaccine is not such a thing that a vaccine should be given by adding water. It took time to research for this. I thank the Prime Minister

& Not recorded.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

that the vaccine which has been made under Made in India, has been approved by the World Health Organization. We have crossed 100 crore vaccine doses. The Vaccination took a long time.

Deputy Chairman Sir, we had some hon'ble Prime Ministers who also worked in war time, there was India-Pakistan, Indo-Bangladesh war. But there is only one Prime Minister who run the country during the Corona period and that person is our Prime Minister, Narendra Modi ji. In such a silent time, which is a silent killer, we all thank the Prime Minister for the courage shown by him. He himself says that he is the Prime Servant, not the Prime Minister. We all believe in this.

Deputy Chairman Sir, I am in full support of what the President has said, because from Yoga to Ayurveda, from traditional medicines to infrastructure development, the President has said about everything. We have just seen that Health Infrastructure Mission is being covered under '*Ayushman Bharat Yojana*' by spending 64 crores, which will become an asset for us not only for today but for future also. The matter of treatment has been discussed in the '*Ayushman Bharat Yojana*'. Currently, an MP of West Bengal was saying that look at West Bengal. The State Government is responsible for the treatment in '*Ayushman Bharat Yojana*'. If there is any problem, it will be looked after by the Health Department of the State Government. Since, we are also associated with some medical college; we also visit the medical college to solve those problems. How to get the benefit of '*Ayushman Bharat*', Modi ji will not notice it from here or it is not that our Health Minister will notice it from here. That is a responsibility. The Prime Minister always emphasizes on '*Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas*' and everyone's effort should also be there. What's the problem if we all make an *effort*? What's the problem if the opposition makes an effort? You may also see what the exact problem is, because the people support us, the voters are there for us, so efforts should be made by everyone. It is not that everyone's effort should mean BJP's effort only; it should be NDA's effort.

You should also make an effort towards this. You are just looking for where the problem lies. You just look for an opportunity to raise the problem or finding a fault and ask for nothing else. You atleast help us. You are not going to come to power before 2024. There is no chance of your coming to power till 2024, it will come thereafter. You see even street vendors have got work in "*Pradhan Mantri Svanidhi Yojana*". You people only say that there is a problem of unemployment, we also believe that. We are also politicians. All the people who are sitting here are connected with the common man. Everyone knows where the problem of unemployment exists. We all politicians are concerned about this. Are only the opposition parties serious about it? But you tell whether the problem of unemployment has been created by Modi ji or by NDA? Who was in power before Modi ji? Who has created this problem? The National Food Security Act (NFSA) has also been introduced. LoP sir, you are also here, you also spoke on this, Anand Sharma ji is also present here. When NFSA came, we were told that in our country, more than 80 percent of the BPL people will

be included in it. When you brought the National Food Security Act, at that time more than 82% of the people were below poverty line. What you have done after that, you converted 27% of that into APL. The result of converting them into the APL was that many people's names were abrogated from the list of NFSA. Their names were not included in the "*Ayushman Bharat Yojana*", which had an impact on the socio-economic census. After that, those who were about to get the benefit; that benefit is not being provided to them. This is a very serious issue. You are speaking on this, but you have increased it by 27%. You please go outside and see; go to my state Assam, you will see that after converting 27% into APL, lakhs of people are being deprived of that facility. This is a very serious matter and needs to be inquired into. You are very knowledgeable person, I do not know anything, I live in the village, so I get to know many things there. Those who do not have a house, but still their names are not included in the socio-economic census. Why their names have not been included in the socio-economic census? Their names are not there because at that time you had converted 27 percent of the people into APL and after coming to APL they are not getting the benefit of it.

Prime Minister Narendra Modi launched "*PM Garib Kalyan Yojana*". You were laughing yesterday when he was speaking on this. Our Government has never opposed MGNREGA. Many people were talking about it, but we did not stop it, we are running it. The funds of MGNREGA have decreased, it is a different matter, but it is not that we have asked to discontinue MGNREGA and run something else. This cannot be done. It is not that we have discontinued the policies initiated by the previous government after its exit. You talk about seventy years. I am from Assam, you also visit Assam, Digvijay Singh ji is also sitting here, he also goes and the others also visit. You all know why so many extremists were born in Assam? Today, you were talking about Manipur; tell me why did 40 extremist organizations come to Manipur? Why did it originate in Nagaland? Ripun Bora ji was speaking, but you tell why there are extremists in Nagaland? Ripun Bora ji, you also know that when ULFA originated, why all this happened in Assam and why did extremists come there? Is it because of BJP, Modi ji or Vajpayee ji? You are indeed responsible for that, whether you accept it or not. You can speak, you have a lot of facts, you speak with lots of papers, but you tell us why did they come there? I want an answer to this. What is happening in Manipur today? Today, after 75 years of independence, the railway line is reaching there. There was such a condition in Manipur that no one could go there. Even a person from Asam was not ready to go to Manipur of its being a tensed and disturbed state. But now, Prime Minister Narendra Modi has gone to Manipur many times, after him Amit Shah also visited there. Today there is an atmosphere of peace in Manipur, elections are being held properly there, this should also be seen. How did this happen? You are talking about Nagaland; Nagaland is very near to my house. Earlier, one used to feel scared while going there as if he/she would ever come back or not. Right now Prime Minister Narendra Modi has created such an environment there that now we can go to Nagaland and return back safely. Has it not happened

there now? It is your call if you admit it or not. Did BJP create extremists there? Today, you find that Amit Shah ji visited there under the leadership of the Chief Minister of Assam Government and the Prime Minister also visited there. For the first time, under his guidance, not a single extremist organization threw any bomb during cease fire. You should also see how this all happened and why? Why did they surrender before NDA? What had happened in Bodoland? Why did the extremists of Karbi Anglong do all this? They did this because now the environment there is like the youths realise that the extremists are not longer relevant there, now everyone should go towards democratic way. The land which was locked earlier towards North East, now the people are shifting to that side. Not many people live in the North East. All in all, there are only may be 5 to 6 crore people. Even in a district of Uttar Pradesh, there will be more people than that. But how much tension we had in the North-East? Just as there was Jammu and Kashmir State in our country, so was the North-East. On going from the North-East, people used to ask us where do we live? Do you people live in the forest? We also have a town named Jorhat; I don't live in the forest. And how many ULFA extremists are there; every one used to ask such things here, but now the flight is going there everyday. There is a flight going to Imphal everyday. Why is such an environment coming there? Trains are now operational in Nagaland. I will request the Government that inter-state buses should also be run there.

The Inter-state bus services which were halted earlier should also be resumed here. The Ministry of Railway has just mentioned that they are going to connect North-South East by rail lines. We went to Rani Gaidinliu station. I want to tell you this because we should teach you people this thing, we should also teach the opposition, have I only spoken wrong so far? Right now the road to my village is getting better. *Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas* is taking place. *Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas* means my Panchayat's number is 57, it belongs to BJP, but Congress stood at number 54. An amount of Rupees Two Crores is being provided to the Congress Panchayat there, but even an amount of Rupees one crore is not going to our BJP's Panchayat, what does that mean? Does that happen in *Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas* that just give to BJP and not to the Congress, it doesn't happen like that? You go to the minority areas in Assam; people don't let them to cast their vote there because of them suspected to be Bangladeshis, but even the Panchayat is working there. If this is not the development for all, then what it is? Give us such an example that during the tenure of our Government, even a single ration card of a minority or a poor person who does not vote us, has been reduced. Have they lost even a single house, have they lost even a single facility? As the Prime Minister says - *Sabka Saath, Sabka Vikas*, when we asked him about the passbook, the Prime Minister said - No, this work will be done by the bank, let the bank do this work; else it will look biased if done by us. The BPL account holder will himself/herself collect the pass book after opening the account. Right now, the Direct Benefit Transfer transaction for them is going on from there.

You mentioned about the farmer. Who will work for them, how will their agricultural production double? Hon'ble Prime Minister can only appeal to the farmers, he appealed to double the agricultural production, he is providing MSP, what is the problem with you getting MSP? We don't have that much MSP here. For the first time in Assam, the grains are being procured by the FCI and five other organizations, on the instructions of the Hon'ble Prime Minister. You should note it. This is happening for the first time, it has never happened before. The MPs of Assam are sitting here; right now the FCI and five other organizations are procuring rice. We thank the Government for having bound it. What used to happen earlier that they did not purchase this grain just by saying that this grain is long, it is short, it has more moisture. Right now, they are purchasing and giving a price of Rs 1,940 a quintal. This is the first time that there has been a change. For the first time after independence, a national organization is making purchases.

Sir, I am speaking about Assam because Bihar remained dominant, the matter of Uttar Pradesh is a different thing. I tell you about Manipur, where I live - from where Mary Kom, Lovlina Borgohain and weightlifter, Mirabai Chanu came and they were praised by the Prime Minister and target to the Podium Scheme was also appreciated.

I think Anand Sharma ji will speak, although Kharge *sahib* has already spoken on this. While watching Kharge ji's speech, it seems that he is very angry and I will faint by being near him, I feel so. At times, you should laugh too. Looking at you, it seems that you tend to get very angry, it scares me. You tell me what would you have done if you were the Prime Minister? You people will not become the Prime Minister, that is a different thing, but what would you have done if you were the Prime Minister at the time of COVID-19 ?...(Interruptions)... Now the poor man gets rice even when everything was closed. You are repeatedly talking about demonetisation, no poor person is unhappy with demonetisation. The one who had black money is unhappy, I don't know about others. You repeatedly talk about demonetisation, so we laugh. Why do we laugh because we didn't have black money? Those who had black money were unhappy. They were sad because perhaps they would open their cupboards to see what they would do with that much money - they would put it here and there or throw it in the water. Our BJP people did not have that money, so everyone is happy. All our BJP men are happy. Have you ever been told by any poor person that demonetisation is bad? You should do a survey on this. I did not find anyone on any place, saying demonetization is bad, rather people said that it is good, they did not give it on our demand, now they are giving it to the bank. Small notes were in circulation during demonetisation. I thank the Hon'ble Prime Minister and then Finance Minister, Shrimati Nirmala Sitharaman ji that the ten lakhs workers engaged in 800 tea gardens used to get cash, the small denomination notes at the time of demonetisation.

Deputy Chairman Sir, if we look at the infrastructural development, then we will notice that for the first time after independence, the railway line is reaching Manipur. Now this is such a big thing and it is a matter of happiness. It is running between Jiribam to Rani Gaidinliu Station. The train is running there for the first time. Today, Huri in Arunachal Pradesh has been connected with rail line. Today, in the Indian railway system, the Yellow Board is being installed in Nagaland and Arunachal Pradesh which we used to like to see and which is present all over India. While watching the Yellow Board, it seems that we have entered all over India. Otherwise, it seemed that we are not in India. It used to feel like that too. I felt the same way when I was in Assam. When you go to Dibrugarh on your way back from Guwahati or when you enter the much interior area by going from Dibrugarh, you will feel more like that, because it was not like that earlier.

A few days ago, a boy went missing near the China border. Through the efforts of this Government, that boy came back from there. Jaishankar ji is present here. For this, we should appreciate the Government's efforts. What a good thing this is! If this is not *Vishwaguru*, then what it is? Earlier, if something used to happen like that, then he or she would have disappeared. There used to be a fight on that matter. A boy went missing there and came back from there, for this I also thank MP of Lok Sabha, Shri Tapir Gaon ji.

If you see it in Imphal, then you should also thank our Government for the Moreh railway line which is being laid from there now. It will connect South-East. We will provide you the data of North-East, you must go through that. Earlier, it was the most economically viable state. Later on, it got cut off. After independence, everything had come to a halt, and then it has restarted now. Currently, the Shatabdi Express is running from Agartala to Jiribam. The two bridges, which have been built on the Macau and Barak Rivers, were inaugurated by the Prime Minister. At present, medical colleges are running in Manipur at Churachandpur, Thoubal and Chandel. Why am I talking about Manipur like this? Something always used to take place in Manipur. One litre of petrol used to cost Rs. 500 there. Sometimes, the road was closed and sometimes, some other issues used to happen, nothing was normal there. At least, a peaceful environment has been maintained there. At least, you should think about the efforts made by Prime Minister Narendra Modi to bring peace there. He walks around wearing a *Gamachha*. He knows so well about the entire North-East. It's not a bad thing. Manmohan ji was from our Guwahati*. You should have advised him too. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RIPUN BORA: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*... It is personal. ...*(Interruptions)*... It should be expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: Okay, I apologize. ...*(Interruptions)*... I apologize. ...*(Interruptions)*... why did I say so? ...*(Interruptions)*... I compared it because. ...*(Interruptions)*...

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Mr. Deputy Chairman, ...(*Interruptions*)... one minute. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: Anand ji, I told you...(*Interruptions*)... listen to me. ...(*Interruptions*)... Anand ji, I am speaking because we are proud of Manmohan Singh ji. ...(*Interruptions*)... We feel proud of Manmohan Singh ji. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)... Manmohan Singh ji is a Member of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)... He is a Member of the House. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: I feel proud that Manmohan Singh ji was from our Assam. I have come from his seat. ...(*Interruptions*)... I did not speak. ...(*Interruptions*)... He is such a learned person. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Sir ...(*Interruptions*)... This is wrong. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: He is such a learned person. ...(*Interruptions*)... He was the Prime Minister who belonged to Assam, what can be more proud than that, say? ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI RAJANI ASHOKRAO PATIL (Maharashtra): It should not go on record. ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be examined. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: I am not saying any thing bad. ...(*Interruptions*)... He was the Prime Minister coming from Assam. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Sir, ...(*Interruptions*)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be examined. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: What I mean by speaking is that now someone from Gujarat became the Prime Minister. ...(*Interruptions*)... A prime minister coming from Gujarat can go to Manipur, he can go to Nagaland, he can go to Tripura, he can go to Arunachal Pradesh, why didn't he go from there? Why didn't you advise him? ...(*Interruptions*)... why didn't you speak then? ...(*Interruptions*)... at that time why extremism did not abolish, I would like to say that. That is why I am repeatedly talking about Manipur....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI RAJANI ASHOKRAO PATIL: It should not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RIPUN BORA: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: It is my request that ...*(Interruptions)*... Ripun Bora Ji, You don't raise this point. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have told a lie....*(Interruptions)*... You have misled the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Rajani ji, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... You are not allowed to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*.... It is not going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI RAJANI ASHOKRAO PATIL: *

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: The Minister of Education is sitting here. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Minister of Education is sitting here. ...*(Interruptions)*... you said that regarding scheduled castes our Government...*(Interruptions)*... how much lies you can tell. I am speaking in the House ...*(Interruptions)*... Today, MP Ripun Bora ji said that we are not providing anything to the Scheduled Castes' students. I just got the figures that 5 lakh 32 thousand Scheduled Castes' students are getting stipend meant for scheduled castes now. The 69,311 scholarships - that is, an amount of Rs 1,600 crores is being provided to the Scheduled Castes in the National Fellowships. If you mislead the House by providing the information regarding 2021-22 i.e. 46,150 scholarships, then what will you say to the general public? ...*(Interruptions)*... A Minister is sitting here, the Minister of Education is sitting here, in such a situation you can tell a lie. You said that we did everything wrong for Scheduled Castes. How many Scheduled Castes Members are sitting here? Many of our Members from Scheduled Castes are sitting here. I told you because you had spoken a little earlier.

Sir, today our capable former Chief Minister of Assam is a Minister here. He is the Minister in AYUSH. Hon'ble Minister of Ayush is going there and making North-East a complete organic hub of AYUSH, making North-East a complete organic hub of AYUSH. As the Prime Minister said, he is making the North-East a complete organic hub and he is determined to making it an important capital of Ayurveda or AYUSH. Sarbananda Sonowal ji is a Minister here, he is working over there. Sir, there is such a situation that now peace has come to my area and we are talking about Ayush over there. If we talk about river-linking, earlier Bangladesh was connected to the Ganges River and it used to come to the Brahmaputra River via Bangladesh. Right now, this transportation system has been introduced there. Earlier, Shri Gadkari ji

* Not recorded

was in this Ministry, then Dr. Mansukh Mandaviya ji came and now Shri Sarbananda Sonowal ji is giving strength and momentum to this work. The '*Gati Shakti*' program launched by the Hon'ble Prime Minister has been arranged to make India a Vital India in a true sense. You should believe this. Whether you believe it or not, but we agree with this, the whole nation is acknowledging this. We want that there should not be any extremism related activity. Right now, our Chief Minister is saying that we should not roam there with PSOs; this type of situation has come in Assam, whereas the condition in Assam was such that bombs were getting exploded there anytime, anything used to happen anytime, but you also know that now it has been appealed not to take PSOs. We have not foresaken the facility of PSOs thinking that we are eminent people and now PSOs have been engaged. I will leave it after consultations with the Ministry of Home Affairs, but some adverse situation has come there, whereas in the past there was such a situation that no one knows where the bomb will explode, so I am repeating again and again who is to blame. You are big leaders, whose fault is this, why our region was not connected to the country, why it was left cut off and why the whole nation was concerned about it? We thank Hon'ble Prime Minister Shri Narendra Modi ji for eliminating this tension. The agreement was signed with the Bodo people during the government of Shri Vajpayee ji, now an agreement is being signed with the Karbi and Dimasas groups during the government of Hon'ble Shri Narendra Modi. You know how much is being spent, do you know that it is Rs 4,203 crore. How much extra money did he put in it? Recently, Shri Amit Shah Ji made a visit there, he was given a salute, an agreement was signed with NLFT. In Manipur, currently 35 organizations believe that the government is doing a good job.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Kamakhya Prasad ji, you please conclude now.

SHRI KAMAKHYA PRASAD TASA: Sir, one AIIMS is being built over there. Sir, how much additional funds we keep on allotting for construction of AIIMS in South? Hon'ble Prime Minister had laid the foundation stone of AIIMS here and its construction is about to complete. I think after a few days, it will be inaugurated by Hon'ble Prime Minister himself. A medicinal hub is also being constructed for medicine there. I want to say that Manipur, Tripura, which were like a dead body, have now regained and strongly emerged on the map of the entire country, so I thank the Government, I thank the President. Mr. Deputy Chairman Sir, in the Presidential Address, the matter of our North-East has been given in writing; it will be recorded in history. I end my speech by supporting the Hon'ble Prime Minister, Shri Narendra Modi Ji's Government for its praiseworthy works that the President has mentioned here.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: Whatever he said about Dr. Manmohan Singh ji is...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will be examined.

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: No, please expunge it because he is a Member of this House.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Hon'ble LoP, we will examine what you said. ...*(Interruptions)*... We will examine it. ...*(Interruptions)*... As per the procedure, we will examine it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: When he is present here, only then you speak. ..*(Interruptions)*... Manmohan Singh ji has not done anything? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... This has been discussed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: The train you are seeing today is the gift of Shri Manmohan Singh ji. Thousands of crores have been provided to the North-East. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Special Mentions.*(Interruptions)*... Nothing else is going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MALLIKARJUN KHARGE: *

&SPECIAL MENTIONS

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Special Mentions. ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. V. Sivadasan. ...*(Interruptions)*... Just lay it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. SIVADASAN: Respected Chair*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Lay it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Only Special Mentions will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. V. SIVADASAN: Sir, the state of Anganwadis in India*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, your time will be over. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please lay it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Only lay it. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sivadasanji, you lay only. ...*(Interruptions)*...

* Not recorded.

& Laid on the Table.