

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी** (राजस्थान): सर, मेरा एक प्वाइंट आफ ऑर्डर है। एक मिनट सुन लीजिए, मैं ज्यादा समय नहीं लूँगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Under which rule?

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी**: सर, शब्दों का निकाला जाना - अगर आपको लगे कि कोई शब्द unparliamentary है, तो आप उसे निकाल देंगे, लिख देंगे और कहेंगे कि यह कार्यवाही में नहीं रहेगा। लेकिन सर, जिस तरह page by page, 10-10 मिनट की speeches निकाली जा रही हैं, राज्य सभा में ऐसा कभी नहीं होता था।

**श्री सभापति**: प्रमोद जी, प्लीज़।

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी**: पार्लियामेंट में वह word निकाला जाता है, पूरा reference नहीं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Pramodji, the Leader of the Opposition had very firmly, categorically put across his point. If you want my tentative response, you have the book; read Rule 238A proviso. What does the proviso say? "Provided the Chairman may at any time prohibit any Member from making any such allegation if he is of the opinion that such allegation is derogatory to the dignity of the Council.. " -- not some individual - - " .. or that no public interest is served by making such an allegation." ...*(Interruptions)*... We are not having a discussion on this. I have reserved my ruling. I will come with it. The House will have the benefit of it, I will have the benefit of it. We will now take up matters raised with permission of Chair. Shri Kartikeya Sharma.

---

### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will now take up matters raised with permission of Chair. Shri Kartikeya Sharma.

#### **Concern over refusal by hospitals to release dead bodies due to pending bills**

SHRI KARTIKEYA SHARMA (HARYANA): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to speak on this important issue which is the concern over refusal by hospitals to release dead bodies due to pending bills. ...*(Interruptions)*...

There are umpteen saddening stories narrating the insensitive instances of refusal by a hospital to release the dead body to the family due to outstanding bills.

...(Interruptions)... The aggrieved families, already traumatized with the loss are subjected to further distress for immediate commercial recovery. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record except Shri Kartikeya Sharma's speech. Shri Kartikeya Sharma, now you can start from the beginning.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी (राजस्थान) :** \*

SHRI KARTIKEYA SHARMA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for giving me this opportunity to speak on this important issue which is the concern over refusal by hospitals to release dead bodies due to pending bills. The aggrieved family, already traumatized with the loss are subjected to further distress for immediate commercial recovery. A report by the Lancet Commission on the value of death published in the year, 2022 states, "In situations where a family is unable to pay hospital medical bill, hospital staff will often refuse to release the body of the deceased until the payment is made." The Geneva Convention and the U.N. Commission on Human Rights, making it legally binding, provide for explicit provisions relating to the proper management, dignified treatment and disposal of dead bodies as well as respect for the needs of families. Earlier, answering my question, the hon. Minister informed this House that there is no such legal provision authorising any hospital to withhold dead body in lieu of pending bills. Therefore, I urge this august House to deliberate on this situation that will bring some relief to the mourning families. I also request the Minister concerned to evaluate and issue guidelines for immediate release of dead bodies and subsequent period of clearing the dues. Suggestively, penalties for the defaulting hospitals that violate the said guidelines should also be incorporated for ensuring strict compliance. There is a growing consensus at international level that all patients must enjoy certain basic rights. In other words, the patient is entitled to certain amount of protection to be ensured by physicians, healthcare providers and the State, which have been codified in various societies and countries in the form of Charters of Patients' Rights. The Patients' Rights Charter, as approved by National Council for Clinical Establishments, is available in public domain and needs to be promoted in good spirit. Further, we can collectively implement a few steps. 1. Spread awareness about the Patients Rights Charter and the rights that the families of the deceased have in such situations. The Patient Rights Charter enlists 17 rights of a patient including Right to Information whereby every patient has a right to adequate

---

\* Not recorded.

relevant information about the disease: Right to records and reports; Right to emergency medical care; Right to informed consent; Right to confidentiality; Right to second opinion; Right to take discharge of patient, or receive body of deceased from hospital and more. 2. Enforce hospitals to display the charter in important areas of the hospital so that accountability is held. 3. Treat violation of the Charter with firm laws, as non-release of dead bodies be treated akin to violation of habeas corpus. 4. Create a national helpline to assist the mourning families in such unfortunate times and 5. Create a national corpus fund and, more importantly, let us incentivise the hospitals and doctor community so that they are encouraged to follow the Patients' Rights Charter. Thank you very much.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The following hon. Members associated themselves with the matter raised by Shri Kartikeya Sharma: Shri Sandosh Kumar P (Kerala), Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi (Maharashtra), Shri Sant Balbir Singh (Punjab), Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha), Dr. Santanu Sen (West Bengal), Shri P. Wilson (Tamil Nadu), Dr. Fauzia Khan (Maharashtra), Shri Rambhai Mokariya (Gujarat), Shri Neeraj Dangi (Rajasthan), Shri Dhananjay Mahadik (Maharashtra), Shri Pabitra Margherita (Assam), Shrimati Jebi Mather Hisham (Kerala), Shri Sujeet Kumar (Odisha), Shrimati Sulata Deo (Odisha), Shri Niranjana Bishi (Odisha), Dr. John Brittas (Kerala), Shri R. Girirajan (Tamil Nadu), Shri Vandana Chavan (Maharashtra) and Shrimati Mahua Maji (Jharkhand). श्री प्रमोद तिवारी।

**विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे):** सर, एक मिनट। मैंने एक मुद्दा उठाया और आपसे कहा भी कि इसमें अनपार्लियामेंटरी क्या है!

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have reserved it. You have had your say. It was with utmost respect.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, रिज़र्व के बाद ही आप adjourn करने वाले हैं, फिर कहाँ रूलिंग होगी?

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. You will have it during the course of the day. It will be during the course of the day. Before I rise for the day, you will have a ruling perfectly on this. Mr. Pramod Tiwari, do you want to avail the opportunity?

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, दो बजे के onwards जो भाषण हुआ, 110 पेज पर ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record now. I gave you an opportunity. ...*(Interruptions)*... How many times will I see it? I have read it. ...*(Interruptions)*... You had sent a communication. I have gone through it. I have heard everyone carefully. I will give a ruling on it. Now, Shri Pramod Tiwari. ...*(Interruptions)*... Do you change it? I will correct if there is an error. I will look into it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, कृपया मेरा टाइम अब शुरू किया जाए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your time starts now, Mr. Pramod Tiwari.

### Steady politicisation of religion in the country

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI (Rajasthan): Thank you, Sir, for wishing me.

सर, मैं एक महत्वपूर्ण विषय को उठा रहा हूँ कि राजनीति का एक धर्म होना चाहिए, धर्म की राजनीति नहीं होनी चाहिए। मौजूदा हालात पर चिंता व्यक्त करते हुए मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि आज हम अपने देश में धर्म के राजनीतिकरण की उल्लेखनीय वृद्धि देख रहे हैं। यह हमारे देश के संविधान और लोकतंत्र के लिए घातक खतरा पैदा करता है। एक देश के रूप में हमने हमेशा दुनिया को 'वसुधैव कुटुंबकम्' का नारा दिया है। हमारे धर्म ने दुनिया को सहिष्णुता और सार्वभौमिक स्वीकृति, दोनों सिखाई है। यह हमारा संवैधानिक, धार्मिक और व्यक्तिगत दायित्व है कि हम यह सुनिश्चित करें कि हमारे पूर्वजों ने जो धर्मनिरपेक्षता, एकता, अखंडता और समानता का संदेश दिया है, उसे कायम रखा जाए और उसका पालन किया जाए। हमारे लिए यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है कि भारत को विश्व गुरु बनाने के अपने हरसंभव प्रयास में धर्मनिरपेक्षता, सहिष्णुता और एकता की अपनी सदियों पुरानी संपत्ति को दांव पर न लगाएँ। यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है कि हम इस मुद्दे को हल करने के लिए एक देश के रूप में मिलकर काम करें और एक बार दुनिया को 'वसुधैव कुटुंबकम्' का वास्तविक अर्थ समझाएं। जब मैं अपनी बात कह रहा हूँ तो इसका आशय यह भी है कि राष्ट्र प्रथम होता है, दल द्वितीय होते हैं। आज मैं देख रहा हूँ कि अपने दल के हित को साधने के लिए जिम्मेदार पदों पर बैठे लोग भी सांप्रदायिक भाषा का इस्तेमाल कर रहे हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** बहुत से लोगों को उनके अधिकारों से वंचित किया जा रहा है। अब संवैधानिक पदों पर बैठे लोग ही अगर अपने संवैधानिक दायित्वों का निर्वाह अपनी पार्टी के हित में करेंगे, तो निःसंदेह वह देश के लिए घातक होगा।

( उपसभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए )

**श्री उपसभापति:** धन्यवाद। प्रमोद जी, आपका समय खत्म हो गया है।