

**MOTION FOR NOMINATION TO THE COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Dr. L. Murugan to move the Motion for nomination of seven Members to the Committee on Public Undertakings.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, I move the following Motion:

"That this House concurs in the recommendation of the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate seven Members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Undertakings for the term ending on 30.04.2025, and do proceed to elect, in such manner as directed by the Chairman, seven Members from amongst the Members of the House to serve on the said Committee."

*The question was put and the Motion was adopted.*

---

**OBSERVATIONS BY THE CHAIR**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, this is regarding Rule 267; for your benefit, my observations on Rule 267 have been uploaded today for your consideration. I call upon you and I strongly urge you to seriously bestow your attention on the same. I reiterate that the leaders of the political parties need to take a call on the issue as it is becoming a routine, daily affair in every sitting of the House. I had already indicated that in the last 36 years, this mechanism has been allowed only on six occasions. It is only in exceptional circumstances that the same may be allowed. I need not emphasise that seeking suspension of the proceedings of the House for taking business indicated is indeed a very serious matter. The notices filed today do not conform to the directives imparted by the Chair in this behalf and the same are not admitted.

---

**REGARDING MENTIONING OF STATES IN THE BUDGET AND OTHER MATTERS**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Matters raised with Permission. Do you want to say something? Yes, the Leader of the Opposition. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**विपक्ष के नेता (श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे):** सभापति महोदय, मैं रूल 267 की बहस में नहीं जाना चाहता हूँ, क्योंकि अब की स्थिति क्या है, आज किस ढंग से लोक सभा और राज्य सभा चल रही हैं और उसके बारे में बाहर हमारा इम्प्रेशन कैसा है, यह बात आप भी जानते हैं और हम सब लोग भी जानते हैं, तो मैं उसमें जाना नहीं चाहता हूँ।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** प्लीज ...

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** महोदय, मैं सिर्फ आपसे यही रिक्वेस्ट करूंगा कि कल जो बजट पेश हुआ, उस बजट में किसी स्टेट को कुछ नहीं मिला, सबकी थाली खाली है और केवल दो की थाली में ही पकौड़े और जलेबी है।...(व्यवधान).... इन दोनों को छोड़कर किसी को कुछ नहीं मिला है। सर, न तमिलनाडु को कुछ मिला, न केरल को कुछ मिला, न कर्णाटक, महाराष्ट्र, पंजाब, हरियाणा, राजस्थान, छत्तीसगढ़ और न ही दिल्ली को कुछ मिला। मैं कितनी स्टेट्स बताऊँ। ओडिशा को भी कुछ नहीं दिया गया है। मैंने ऐसा बजट कभी नहीं देखा है और यह सिर्फ किसी को खुश करने के लिए, कुर्सी बचाने के लिए यह सब हुआ है। इसका हम खंडन करते हैं। यदि इस ढंग से बजट पेश होगा... मैं समझता हूँ कि वे कर्णाटक से आई हैं, ...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, let the hon. Finance Minister speak.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, वे कर्णाटक से आई हैं, तो हमारी अपेक्षा ऐसी थी कि सबसे ज्यादा हमें ही मिलेगा, लेकिन हमें कुछ नहीं मिला, तो इसका हम खंडन करेंगे, प्रोटेस्ट करेंगे और सारी इंडिया पार्टी एलायन्स, सारे कन्याकुमारी से लेकर कश्मीर तक...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, let the hon. Finance Minister speak.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** सर, मैं बोल देता हूँ...(व्यवधान).... माताजी बोलने में एक्सपर्ट हैं, मुझे मालूम है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री सभापति:** खरगे जी, ये माताजी नहीं, बल्कि ये तो आपकी बेटी के बराबर हैं।

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** इसलिए, मैं इसका खंडन करता हूँ। जिस-जिस जगह अपोजिशन पार्टी चुनकर आई है, जिस-जिस जगह आपको नेगलेक्ट किया गया है या लोगों ने आपको नकार दिया है, उस जगह कुछ नहीं मिला। अगर आप ऐसा ही करते गए, अगर बैलेंस नहीं होगा, तो डेवलेपमेंट कैसे होगा?...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have made your point, Sir.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** आज लोग आपके साथ हैं, कल लोग दूसरे के साथ होंगे।...(व्यवधान)...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the hon. Finance Minister speak.

**श्री मल्लिकार्जुन खरगे:** लोग तो अलग-अलग समय में अलग-अलग के साथ होते हैं, इसलिए मैं इसका खंडन करता हूं। हम सभी पार्टी के लोग इस टाइप के attitude का खंडन करते हैं।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. Now, hon. Finance Minister.

*(At this stage, some hon. Members left the Chamber.)*

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE; AND THE MINISTER OF CORPORATE AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN): Sir, thank you for giving me an opportunity to respond. ...*(Interruptions)*... Much before I respond, they would like to make a lot of noise and go away. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Finance Minister.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: In the true spirit of democracy ...*(Interruptions)*... They don't even want...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, please. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, discussion on the Budget was listed for today. I gave floor to the Leader of the Opposition in the expectation that rules will be followed. I find that it has been used as a ploy and a strategy. Hon. Members, I strongly plead with you that democracy will be seriously threatened if disruption and disturbance are weaponised as a political strategy as has been done now. Parliament is the citadel of constitutional and democratic values and liberties. I am aghast. As a matter of fact, during the day and the days following, we will have ample opportunities to reflect on the Budget presented by the hon. Finance Minister. There was absolutely no occasion, justification, even remotely, to avail the facility accorded by me for this purpose. I cannot persuade myself but take serious exception to this unwholesome practice adopted by a senior Member, the Leader of the Opposition. I will call upon Leaders of the Parties to soul-search on my reflections on Rule 267 that in more than three decades, it has been availed only on half a dozen occasions. And every day of the sitting, I get a number of such requests. It is being taken as a routine exercise. As a habit, it has reduced itself to a farcical exercise. In spite of my serious observations

yesterday, since no focus has taken place, I have again uploaded the same on your portal. Now, hon. Finance Minister, on the observations made.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, thank you very much for giving me this opportunity. It is unfortunate. A senior leader, the Leader of the Opposition, Shri Mallikarjun Kharge, stood up to say his views on what he heard of the Budget yesterday. I would think and maybe it is a bit too much to expect that in the honour of democracy, at least, the Opposition would have stayed here to listen to what I have to respond. The Leader of the Opposition raised issues on the Budget, which was presented yesterday and tabled in this House yesterday. Just to the point that he raised that I have not named many States and probably spoke about only two States, there are a few points which I have to table here with your permission, Sir. I have to voice a few points here, Sir, as to what happens in a speech. The Congress Party has been in power for a very long time in this country. They presented so many different Budgets. And they would know clearly that in every Budget, you don't get an opportunity to name every State of this country. I will take this example. Between Vote on Account, which was presented on 1<sup>st</sup> February this year, and now the full Budget, which was presented yesterday, for this year, I have not named very many States but let me take the name of Maharashtra, for instance. In Vote on Account and yesterday's Budget, I had not named Maharashtra. Hence, I will take that as an example. Under the leadership of Prime Minister Modi, the Cabinet has passed a very important decision. It has taken a decision to set up a very big port in Vadhavan in Maharashtra. Did Maharashtra get ignored because I did not mention the name of Maharashtra? An amount of Rs.76,000 crore has been announced for that project. Maharashtra's name was not taken in the Vote on Account; nor was it taken yesterday. But does it mean that we have ignored Maharashtra? I can take the names of so many other different States where we have major projects. That is one. Second, if the speech does not mention the name of a particular State, does it mean that the benefits of schemes of the Government of India, programmes of the Government of India and the Externally Aided schemes, which we obtain from the World Bank, ADB, AIIB and such institutions like that, do not go to these States? They go as per routine and actually the Expenditure Statement of the Government, the Department-wise allocation of the Government, clearly mentions all these item-wise. This is a deliberate attempt, and I am saying this with responsibility. This is a deliberate attempt of the Opposition parties led by the Congress Party to give an impression to the people that nothing has been given to our States, that it has been given only to two States. I would challenge the Congress Party, for all the Budget

Speeches that they have delivered, that in each of the Budget Speeches, have they named every State of this country? This is an outrageous allegation. ...*(Interruptions)*... And now that they have come here, now that TMC has come here, I would like to say...*(Interruptions)*... Now that there is a Member trying to disrupt me, I would like to say that even the schemes which have been given to Bengal...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, please allow me to say this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record and no one should shout. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Even the schemes which were allocated to Bengal...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, you have allowed me to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please don't shout. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not a shouting place. ...*(Interruptions)*... Is it a shouting place? ...*(Interruptions)*... Dr. John Brittas, Shrimati Priyanka Chaturvedi, Ms. Dola Sen, you are senior Members. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, let me complete. ...*(Interruptions)*... I hope I am allowed to finish. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, please take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Take your seats. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Members, please.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Sir, let me finish.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. Finish it in two minutes.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Yes, I will speak on Bengal. I have already spoken on Maharashtra for the Members who chose to walk out of the House without

even listening to my reply. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, let me have some order in the House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Finance Minister, you will have ample opportunity to respond to each of them when you finally respond.

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Yes, Sir, but this kind of a statement by a very senior Member of the House, the Leader of the Opposition, I think, is not acceptable. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me answer the Members from TMC. ...*(Interruptions)*... Even yesterday, TMC questioned the Budget saying that nothing has been given to Bengal. ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me just highlight the fact that several schemes given by the hon. Prime Minister in the last ten years have not even been implemented in West Bengal. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay Madam, thank you. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Health insurance! ...*(Interruptions)*... And you have the audacity to ask me now. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI NIRMALA SITHARAMAN: Bengal should correct its course. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, 'Matters Raised with Permission'. ...*(Interruptions)*... Shrimati Mausam Noor. ...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. JOHN BRITTAS: Sir, one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MAUSAM NOOR (West Bengal): Sir, my Zero Hour today is 'Demand to take necessary steps to stop erosion by the Ganga river in Malda, West Bengal'. ..*(Interruptions)*...