

## GENERAL DISCUSSION

\*The Union Budget, 2024-25

&amp;

\*The Budget of Union territory of Jammu and Kashmir, 2024-25

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Union Budget 2024-25 and the Budget of Union Territory of Jammu & Kashmir 2024-25 to be discussed together.

I call upon former Finance Minister, Shri P. Chidambaram, to raise the discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*....

AN HON. MEMBER: The best Finance Minister ever! ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to thank the hon. Finance Minister for the Employment-Linked Incentive Scheme and other ideas incorporated in the early part of her speech. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please hear him patiently. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: I am particularly happy that she had an opportunity to read the Congress Manifesto and she picks the good ideas on page 11, page 30, and page 31. I would respectfully urge my hon. friends in the Treasury Benches, especially the External Affairs Minister, to read the Congress manifesto so that in your party meetings you can persuade the hon. Prime Minister and the hon. Finance Minister to take some more ideas from our manifesto. We will be very, very happy to support you if you take those ideas. Copying is not prohibited in this House. In fact, copying is encouraged, copying is rewarded in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. If you will address the Chair, it will give a soothing feeling to me also. And, that will be more appropriate, Mr. Chidambaram. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: Copying is encouraged and copying is rewarded in this House. So, please copy a little more.

---

\* Discussed together.

Sir, I have four major things. And, I think, I should be able to complete my submissions on each of these things in about four or five minutes. The first is jobs. Unemployment is the biggest challenge today. The Centre for monitoring Indian economy has estimated all-India unemployment rate, in June 2024, as 9.2 per cent. It may have come down. Earlier, there was a Production-Linked Incentive. When you introduce the Employment-Linked Incentive, it must be for some reason. And, I suspect, the reason was that the Production-Linked Incentive Scheme did not create the kind of jobs that you wanted to create. So, will the hon. Finance Minister tell this House what is the outcome of the PLI? Once we know the outcome of the PLI, we can look ahead to what can be expected of the ELI. In fact, from paragraphs 20, 21, and 22, read with paragraph 51 of her speech, neither I nor any of my learned colleagues are able to get a whole picture of the ELI. It seems to us that paragraph 20 talks about the same target industries, like paragraph 21. And, paragraph 21 talks about the same target industries as paragraph 22. But in paragraph 51, we were suddenly let down when you said, "Only 500 industries are selected." The numbers do not gel; the numbers do not match. Anyway, you have a ELI. It is an interesting idea, but it does not inspire confidence and let me go on record to say it does not inspire confidence that you will be able to place 290 lakhs people under the ELI, that you have described. It should not turn out to be another election *jumla* like your two crore jobs a year. ...*(Interruptions)*.. Now, look at the magnitude of the unemployment problem. The Uttar Pradesh Police Department conducted an examination for 60,244 vacancies. About 48 lakh persons applied and wrote that examination. It was cancelled a couple of days later. The Air India wanted to fill 2,216 vacancies for handyman to do diverse jobs like repair and maintenance. About 25,000 people thronged Mumbai airport for a walk-in interview and the police had been called to restore law and order. A private company in Gujarat sought to fill five positions. About 1,000 persons barged into that company. Madhya Pradesh advertised 15 low-skilled Government jobs; 11,000 applications were received. Among them were post-graduates, engineers, MBAs and I am sad to say, even one of them was a person who had just written an examination to be a judge in the Madhya Pradesh Courts. The best illustration is of the Staff Selection Commission. There are Staff Selection Commissions of the Centre and the States. Uttar Pradesh conducted an examination for 7,500 posts. About 24,74,030 people applied for those jobs. And, yet, the RBI, about two or three weeks ago said, "There is no job crisis in India". Exact words are "No job crisis in India." Why didn't anyone from the Ministry or any officer stand up and say, we reject this statement! The RBI is supposed to be cautious, conservative and neutral. You are cautious, you are conservative but you are not neutral at all. I

suggest that unemployment be taken seriously, and we will wait for the outcome of your ELI scheme. It is an interesting scheme. At the moment, I am not impressed, I am not convinced; the outcome alone will judge whether your intentions are good, whether you really want to tackle unemployment.

Sir, the second broad subject is inflation. The hon. Finance Minister, in Para 3 of her speech dismissed the subject in ten words. And, I am not exaggerating. Please go through the speech - exactly 10 words. Is inflation such a trivial subject that you can deal with it casually and dismiss it in ten words? The WPI inflation is 3.4 per cent; the CPI inflation is 5.1 per cent and food inflation is 9.4 per cent. From where do you collect data? Mostly, along towns and villages abutting the national highway; at best, the State Highways and at best, the District Highway. But go into the hinterland of India, go into the KBK districts of Odisha, go into the interiors of Dharmapuri or Ramanathapuram, the inflation is much higher than your 3.4 per cent or 5.1 per cent or 9.4 per cent. And the Chief Economic Advisor who may be cautious, conservative -- he has a degree of autonomy which no other officer of the Government of India has -- said in his Economic Survey, "India's inflation continues to be low, stable and moving towards the four per cent target." It has been moving for the last four years. When will it arrive at the four per cent target? Is inflation low? Is it stable? Is it moving towards the four per cent target? If it is moving towards the four per cent target, why has the RBI not revised downward the bank rate fixed in June, 2023? This is the thirteenth month of a 6.5 per cent bank rate. Bank rate is the good measure of where inflation is moving. If inflation is moving towards the four per cent target, — four per cent target is actually four plus or minus two; it is not four per cent — assuming that four per cent is the target, why is the RBI keeping the bank rate at 6.5 per cent for the last thirteen months? Why is the MPC, the Monetary Policy Committee, not willing to revise it downwards? And, I think, what the Chief Economic Advisor said in his Economic Survey is injury, and the hon. Finance Minister, dismissing the subject in ten words, is adding insult to injury. Inflation is a humiliating situation because every family is hit by inflation. I warn this Government. You are taking inflation not seriously. The last set of by-elections punished you. You will not agree. But I think the last set of by-elections where out of 13 seats, 10 seats were won by the India bloc is a punishment, the warning administered to you, and if you don't take inflation seriously, you will be punished more. If you want to suffer the punishment, you are welcome to suffer the punishment. And, in this situation, you claim that the growth last year was 8.2 per cent, and, this year, it will be 6.5 per cent or 7 per cent. I am not going into the macro-economic analysis. Some of my colleagues will do that. I ask you, how do you arrive at this growth rate? You take the nominal growth rate and apply a deflator

and arrive at the GDP. Sir, the House and you must know that the deflator that they have adopted for the manufacturing sector for last year is 1.7. When wholesale inflation is 3.4, when CPI inflation is 5.1, food inflation is 9.4, how do you adopt a deflator of 1.7? In fact, I want the hon. Finance Minister to tell us what is the deflator you have adopted for manufacturing industry, what is the deflator you have adopted for industry and for agriculture and what is the deflator you have adopted for services. Nominal growth is measurable. But your GDP, in real terms, is simply by adopting a deflator. And if you adopt a deflator, which several knowledgeable economists and experts throughout the world have severely criticized for the last three or four years, you will arrive at this rosy picture. If you would have adopted a deflator less than 1.7, you would not have arrived at 8.2; you would have arrived at 9.2. If you adopt a deflator of 0.5, you will even cross 10 per cent. So, please tell us, what is the deflator you are adopting, why you are adopting it and tell us what is the nominal growth rate and how do you arrive at these growth rates. These growth rates cannot be seen, but these growth rates can be felt by the people. Anyone moving among the people will know. The growth rate can be felt by the people. When there is impressive growth, when there are more goods and services, when prices are affordable, when there is money floating around in the market, when your pockets are jingling with coins or currency notes, you get the feeling that things are going alright in this country. Do you get that feeling? I travel at least 500-1,000 kilometers every month by road; I don't get that feeling. Does any hon. Member from his constituency or State get the feeling, or do people tell him that 'things are very good', please go and tell the Prime Minister in Delhi that things are very good and we are very happy?' Does anyone get that feeling?

Sir, the third subject is wages. Now, this is a serious matter. The hon. Finance Minister said, 'I have given relief'. Who has she given relief to? I don't grudge the relief. She has given relief, but to whom? In 2022-23, the last figure I was able to access, the number of taxpayers was 7.4 crore. It may have increased to 8 or 8.5 crore. Out of that, 65 per cent had zero tax liability. They file a return, but no tax is paid. Assuming that the 65 per cent remains constant, out of, say, eight or nine crore tax payers today, five-and-a-half to six crore people would have zero tax liability. You have given relief to people who moved to the new tax regime. I have seen various calculations in the new tax regime. Each paper has got a calculation. I have a Chartered Accountant who has given me a calculation from Gujarat, and he is very knowledgeable. He says that the relief given is between Rs. 9,651 to Rs. 17,651. To whom -- to these two to three crore people. India does not consist of just these two to three crore people. There are 142 crore people in this country. Out of 142 crore

people, let us assume you have given relief to two-three crore people. What about the rest? Do you know the conditions of the rest? The household consumption expenditure survey of the Government of India, read with that the bottom 50 per cent have three per cent of the national wealth, 13 per cent of the national income, the monthly consumption of a person in the rural areas is Rs. 3,094. Multiply it by 12, you would arrive at about Rs. 37,000 a year. In urban areas it is Rs. 4,963. Multiply it by 12, it comes to Rs. 60,000 a year. So, we have 50 per cent of the population, that is 71 crore, having an annual consumption expenditure between Rs. 36,000 and Rs. 50,000. Are they rich or poor? This is the bottom 50, below the median. If you go down to the bottom 20, or go down to the bottom 10, they are even poorer. What is the relief for them? And, the Chief Executive Officer of the NITI Aayog says, India has virtually abolished poverty. Poverty cannot be more than five per cent. Poverty cannot be more than five per cent when you are talking about 71 crore people? Thankfully, 71 crore is not five per cent. Then India's population would be 1,400 crore. India's population is 142 crore. One-half is 71 crore, and they are below the median, and this is the median income. I ask the hon. Finance Minister: what is the relief given to them? Do you know that most of them are daily labourers? Thirty crore daily labourers are there in this country. The others are doing irregular jobs. The regular jobs are only for about 17 to 25 per cent people of this country. All the rest are doing irregular jobs or daily labour. What is the relief given to them? In the World Hunger Index of 125 countries, we are at 111<sup>th</sup> place. You may not accept the World Hunger Index, but the action that the Government has taken, namely, giving free foodgrain to 81 crore people, is a tacit admission that on the Hunger Index, we are very, very low. Look at the Hunger Index, your own action shows that 81 crore people cannot afford food.

Sir, my last subject is federalism. What do we see around this country? All-India Service officers defy the directions and orders of the Council of Ministers of an elected Government in Delhi. Funds are withheld from Kerala and West Bengal on one pretext or the other. Borrowing limits of non-BJP State Governments have been slashed. Tamil Nadu has been denied Disaster Relief Assistance. I ask: why does the UPSC have to play a role in the appointment of the DGP of a State? Why should a State Government not appoint the Vice-Chancellors of State Universities? And, how did this Government treat Andhra Pradesh, Bihar and Odisha before April? The same demand was there. The same Andhra Pradesh Re-organisation Act was there. The Chief Minister was a different person. The same Act was there, but for ten years, how did you treat them? For ten years, how did you treat Bihar? When a leader wears one cap, you treat him one way, but when he changes that cap and he wears another

cap, you treat him another way. I don't grudge at all if you are giving relief to Andhra Pradesh or Bihar, but what about the other States? We are a federal country. This is the death knell of federalism, if you pick and choose amongst the States. You are the Union of India. You are the Union Government. You are the Government of all the States. You cannot pick and choose one State and deny relief to another State.

Finally, I thought the hon. Finance Minister loved Tamil. I missed her quotes from either Thiruvalluvar or any another other classic literature. Maybe she did not have time to quote from a classic poet in Telugu or in Bhojpuri. Maybe she will quote in the course of time. I want her to remember that she was born in Madurai, she had her schooling in Villupuram and she did her college in Tiruchirappalli and it is very painful, as the Chief Minister of Tamil Nadu pointed out, that not in one place in her 60-page speech, did she mention the word 'Tamil Nadu' or 'Tamil'. I am not saying, mention only Tamil Nadu; mention all the States or mention all the States grouped together. How many times have you mentioned Bihar? How many times have you mentioned Andhra Pradesh? I have no grudge, but please remember that there are other States in India. Other States have people. Other States elect other Governments. They voted against you. Please remember that.

Finally, Sir, I have five demands, and, I would urge the hon. Finance Minister to copy from our manifesto. Sir, I demand this and I respectfully ask the hon. Finance Minister to give us answers. If you do not answer this today or in the course of this Session or subsequently, it is not as if these demands will die down. These demands will echo everywhere in India where the INDIA bloc has the right to speak and write.

Our first demand is Minimum Wage of Rs. 400/- per day for every kind of employment. Two, we demand a legally-guaranteed MSP. Three, we demand a write-off of the unpaid balance of interest or instalment of educational loans given up to March, 2024. Four, we demand abolition, complete abolition, of the Agniveer Scheme, and, five, we demand that NEET be scrapped, and, if some States want to keep NEET, exempt all other States which do not want NEET. These five demands will echo not only in this Chamber but these will echo throughout the country until you concede these demands. I demand that the hon. Finance Minister reply to my demand that she should reply to these issues. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Dr. Radha Mohan Das Agrawal.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल** (उत्तर प्रदेश): माननीय सभापति महोदय, मैं माननीय राष्ट्रीय अध्यक्ष और सभा के नेता जगत प्रकाश नड्डा जी का आभारी हूँ, जिन्होंने मुझे पार्टी की ओर से विचार रखने की अनुमति प्रदान की है।

(उपसभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए।)

महोदय, हम लोग जब वित्त के बारे में बोलना शुरू करते हैं, तो हमारे सामने बिम्ब होते हैं। एक बिम्ब होता है भारत का - वह भारत जिसे हम अपनी मां मानते हैं, जिसके बारे में हमारे शास्त्र कहते हैं -

"माता भूमिः पुत्रोऽहं पृथिव्याः।"

हज़ारों साल पहले जिसके बारे में लिखा गया -

"उत्तरं यत् समुद्रस्य हिमाद्रेश्चैव दक्षिणम्।  
वर्षं तद् भारतं नाम भारती यत्र सन्ततिः ॥"

समुद्र के उत्तर में और हिमालय के दक्षिण में जो देश है उसे भारत कहते हैं और हम भारत के पुत्र हैं, भारत के बच्चे हैं, इसलिए भारतीय कहे जाते हैं।

दूसरा बिम्ब होता है हमारे प्रधान मंत्री जी का। 26 मई, 2014 को उन्होंने पहली बार शपथ ली और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि दुनिया की अकेली शख्सियत स्वर्गीय नेहरू जी के बाद, जिन्होंने लगातार तीसरी बार शपथ लेने का काम सफलता के साथ किया। महोदय, माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी जब शपथ ले रहे थे, तो दो प्रकार की शपथ ले रहे थे। एक संवैधानिक शपथ, जो इस देश के महामहिम राष्ट्रपति दिलवा रहे थे, एक दूसरी भी शपथ वे ले रहे थे - मैं अगर प्रधानमंत्री बना हूँ तो मेरे काम करने की दृष्टि क्या होगी, मेरी आर्थिक नीतियां क्या होंगी - और वह शपथ उन्हें नरेंद्र नाम का एक दूसरा नौजवान दिला रहा था, उसका नाम था नरेंद्रनाथ दत्त विवेकानंद। विवेकानंद बोल रहे थे और माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी मन में ही उनके शब्दों को दोहरा रहे थे। प्रधान मंत्री जी कह रहे थे, 'मैं नहीं भूलूंगा कि मेरा विवाह, कि मेरी संपत्ति, कि मेरा जीवन मेरे व्यक्तिगत भोग विलास के लिए या इंद्रिय सुखों के लिए हुआ है, मेरे व्यक्तिगत सुख के लिए हुआ है, मैं नहीं भूलूंगा कि मेरा यह समाज उस विराट महामाया की एक छाया मात्र है, मैं नहीं भूलूंगा कि भारत के जितने भी नागरिक हैं, चाहे वे अशिक्षित हों, गरीब हों, दलित हों, पिछड़े हों - मैं भारतवासी हूँ और ये सारे नागरिक भारतवासी हैं, ये हमारे परिवार के सदस्य हैं, इनका सुख और दुःख हमारा सुख और दुःख होगा। मैं नहीं भूलूंगा इस बात को कि जब तक यह जीवन है, यह धरती हमारे लिए स्वर्ग है और भारत का कल्याण ही हमारा कल्याण है।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़ सीट पर बैठ कर न बोलें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** इसी सपने को लेकर मैं गर्व के साथ कह सकता हूँ जिस यात्रा को माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने वर्ष 2014 में शुरू किया, हम गर्व के साथ कहते हैं कि तब से 2024 तक वह यात्रा उनकी अनवरत जारी है। महोदय, आज माननीय वित्त मंत्री जी बात कर रहे थे। आज से 60 साल पहले रामधारी सिंह दिनकर ने देश की अर्थव्यवस्था के बारे में कि लिखा था कि-

"कुछ समझ नहीं पड़ता, रहस्य यह क्या है!  
 जानें, भारत में बहती कौन हवा है  
 धरती के सब पेड़ दीन-दुर्बल हैं  
 गमलों के ही पेड़ सुदम्य-सुदल हैं,  
 जब तक है यह वैषम्य समाज सड़ेगा,  
 किस तरह एक हो कर यह देश लड़ेगा।  
 सबसे पहले यह दुरित-मूल काटो रे!  
 समतल पीटो, खाइयां-खड़ पाटो रे!  
 बहु पाद बटों की शीरा शोर छांटों रे।  
 जो मिले अमृत, सब को समान बांटो रे!"

माननीय पूर्व वित्त मंत्री भाषण दे रहे थे। वे वर्तमान की नीतियों के बारे में बता रहे थे। 1960 में रामधारी सिंह दिनकर भारत की स्थिति के बारे में बखान कर रहे थे और ऐसा लग रहा था कि वर्तमान से इनका कोई संबंध ही न हो। इन्होंने 65 साल राज किया। 65 सालों के रहते हुए रामधारी सिंह दिनकर की इस पीढ़ा को किंचित मात्र भी अगर इन्होंने बदला होता, तो शायद आज ये बातें इन्हें दोहराने की जरूरत नहीं पड़ती। इसलिए माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी जब सत्ता पर आए, तो उनकी प्राथमिकता थे- देश का गरीब हमारी प्राथमिकता होगी, देश का नौजवान हमारी प्राथमिकता होगा, देश की बहनें हमारी प्राथमिकता होंगी, देश का किसान हमारी प्राथमिकता होगा और हम सब गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि जितनी नीतियां उन्होंने बनाई, हम नाम पर नाम ले सकते हैं, उनकी उपलब्धियों को गिना सकते हैं। पहली बार जब वे 'जन धन योजना' लेकर आए थे, आप तो 65 सालों में नहीं ला पाए, आप तो इस बात की चिंता नहीं कर पाए कि इस देश में 53 परसेंट ऐसे लोग हैं, जिन्होंने बैंक का मुंह तक नहीं देखा था। इस देश को हमारे प्रधान मंत्री का आभारी होना चाहिए, जिन्होंने इस बात को तय किया कि भारत का एक भी नागरिक, जिसके पास एक पैसा नहीं होगा, हम उसे बैंक तक पहुंचाएंगे, बिना ब्याज के पहुंचाएंगे, जीरो बैलेंस पर अकाउंट खोलेंगे, उसके अकाउंट में पांच हजार रुपये डालेंगे, उसे बचत करने की कला सिखाएंगे और देश के विकास में उसकी हिस्सेदारी करेंगे।...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज, पीछे बैठकर न बोलें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** सर, इन्होंने 65 सालों में अपने देश के नागरिकों को, बहनों को गांव में रात के अंधेरे में शौचालय में जाने के लिए मजबूर किया। अपनी इज्जत बचाने के लिए, विभिन्न प्रकार की समस्याओं का सामना करने के लिए मजबूर किया। आप इस मंच पर खड़े होकर आज भाषण देते हो। महिलाओं की जो बेइज्जती आपने 65 साल में इस देश में की है, तो भारत \* । आपको माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी का एहसान मानना चाहिए, जिन्होंने इस देश में 'स्वच्छ भारत योजना' प्रारंभ की और आज हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत की कोई भी

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.



महिला, कोई भी बच्चा, कोई भी बूढ़ा आज अपने घर से निकलकर रात के अंधेरे में सड़कों पर शौचालय जाने के लिए बाध्य नहीं हो सकता है। आपको \* आनी चाहिए, आप 65 साल सत्ता में रहे। सर, 3,70,000,00 ऐसे घर थे, जिन तक आप पीने का पानी पहुंचा सके। आप बात करते हैं आधे लोगों की, आप 140 करोड़ जनसंख्या की बताते हैं। आपने 3,70,000,00 घरों को पीने का पानी पहुंचाया था। आपको प्रधान मंत्री जी का आभारी होना चाहिए, जिन्होंने 'जल जीवन मिशन' शुरू किया। जिनके नेतृत्व में आज हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि 14 करोड़ घरों में हमने पीने का पानी पहुंचाने का काम किया है। आपको \* नहीं आती कि इस देश की 90 प्रतिशत जनता ईलाज नहीं करा पाती थी, चिकित्सा तक उसकी पहुंच नहीं होती थी। ईलाज कराने में वह गरीबी रेखा के नीचे चली जाती थी, उनके घर तक बिक जाते थे, उनकी जमीने बिक जाती थी। आप उनकी चिंता नहीं करते थे। अगर किसी ने चिंता की, तो भारत के प्रधान मंत्री, नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने की। जिन्होंने यह तय किया कि इस देश का कोई भी गरीब पैसे की कमी के नाते नहीं मरेगा। उसके लिए 'आयुष्मान भारत' योजना शुरू हुई। 50 करोड़ नागरिकों को आच्छादित किया गया और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि पिछले पांच सालों के अंदर 7 करोड़ 34 लाख लोगों ने अस्पताल में अपना ईलाज करवाया।

महोदय, मैं आपके सामने एक रिपोर्ट प्रस्तुत करता हूं। यह रिपोर्ट Standard & Poor की है। जब चुनाव चल रहे थे और निर्णय आने वाला था, तो 29 मई को यह रिपोर्ट आई थी। यह छोटी-मोटी संस्था नहीं है। पूर्व वित्त मंत्री जी इसको नकार नहीं सकते हैं। महत्वपूर्ण यह नहीं है कि उन्होंने भारत की रेटिंग बढ़ा दी। 2009 में भारत की रेटिंग -BBB थी, जब आपकी सरकार थी। 2012 में भारत की रेटिंग -BBB थी, जब भी आपकी सरकार थी। वर्ष 2014 में नरेन्द्र मोदी जी सरकार में आये और आते ही भारत की रेटिंग चार महीने के अंदर बदल गई तथा यह बीबी माइनस से बीबी स्टेबल हो गई। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि 29 मई, 2014 को Standard and Poor's ने घोषणा की और भारत की रेटिंग बीबी माइनस, बीबी स्टेबल से बदलकर बीबी पॉजिटिव हो गई। महोदय, यह महत्वपूर्ण नहीं है, महत्वपूर्ण यह है कि ऐसा करते हुए, Standard and Poor's ने अपनी रिपोर्ट में क्या कहा। मैं उस रिपोर्ट को पढ़ना चाहूंगा। उन्होंने लिखा कि भारत के मजबूत आर्थिक विकास ने, भारत की ऋणग्राहिता पर सकारात्मक प्रभाव डाला है। इस सुदृढ़ आर्थिक ढांचे का आने वाले दो-तीन सालों में विकास की गति पर बहुत प्रभावी असर पड़ने वाला है। उन्होंने लिखा कि सरकार ने अपने खर्चे के स्वरूप और उसके वितरण को पूरी तरह से बदल दिया है और बढ़ता हुआ हिस्सा, अवस्थापन विकास पर खर्च किया जा रहा है। आने वाले समय में यह भारत की जड़ता को समाप्त कर देगा और भारत को विकास की बहुत ऊंचाइयों पर लेकर जाएगा। उन्होंने लिखा कि लगातार नीतिगत स्थायित्व से, गहराते हुए आर्थिक सुधारों से और उच्च दर की अवस्थापन सुविधाओं के निवेश से, भारत लम्बे समय तक विकास की संभावनाओं को बनाता रहेगा। भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था का पहला तमाचा, जो आपके ऊपर है, जो आरोप आप लोग हमारे ऊपर लगाते हैं, उस कम्पनी ने लिखा है कि भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था ने कोविड की आपदा के बाद बहुत प्रभावशाली ढंग से वापसी की है। पिछले तीन साल में भारत के

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

वास्तविक आर्थिक विकास की दर और सकल घरेलू उत्पादन के क्षेत्र में सर्वाधिक 8.1 प्रतिशत की औसत से वृद्धि हुई है। भारत एशिया पैसिफिक क्षेत्र में सर्वाधिक विकासशील है। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज, सीट पर बैठकर बात न करें। प्लीज, अपनी-अपनी सीटों पर जाकर बैठ जाइए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** आने वाले तीन सालों में यह विकास की दिशा और गति बनी रहेगी। भारत 7 प्रतिशत की विकास दर से विकास करता रहेगा। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please move to your seats. This is my request. आप बैठकर आपस में बात न करें। Please go to your seat. Priyanka ji, go to your seat. Please go to your seat.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** भारत के सकल घरेलू उत्पादन और ऋण के अनुपात में इसका प्रभावी प्रभाव पड़ेगा। महोदय, दूसरा तमाचा इनके गाल पर Standard and Poor's ने मारा है। उसने लिखा है, यह उनके शब्द हैं, वर्ष 2024-25 में मोदी सरकार ने अवस्थापना के विकास में 11 लाख 11 हजार करोड़ रुपए खर्च किए हैं अर्थात् जीडीपी का 3.4 परसेंट है। अगला वाक्य उन्होंने लिखा है, यह हम नहीं कह रहे हैं, भारतीय जनता पार्टी के लोग नहीं कर रहे हैं, हमारे अर्थशास्त्री नहीं कह रहे हैं, Standard and Poor's ने लिखा, आज से 10 साल पहले किसकी सरकार थी, आप ध्यान दीजिएगा। आज से 10 साल पहले खर्च से यह साढ़े चार गुना अधिक है और भारत इमर्जिंग एंड डेवलपिंग इकोनॉमी का 'Best Performing State' है। उनकी अगली टिप्पणी यह थी कि आप ईपीएफओ को नहीं मानते, आपको एक निजी संस्था सीएमआई की रिपोर्ट समझ में आती है। मुझे आश्चर्य होता है कि आप भारत सरकार के वित्त मंत्री रहे हैं, आपने शासन किया है, लेकिन आप आरबीआई को नकारते हैं। उसी आरबीआई के सहारे, वे वित्त मंत्री बने रहे होंगे। आज कितनी अनैतिकता है कि उसी आरबीआई के आधार पर — इन्होंने ही आरबीआई के गवर्नर बनाए होंगे, आज उसी आरबीआई की रिपोर्ट को चुनौती दे रहे हैं। आरबीआई और ईपीएफओ आज रोजगार की बात करते हैं। वर्ष 2017 के पहले यह सरकार रोजगार की गणना ही नहीं कराती थी, वे सामने बैठे हैं, हिम्मत होगी तो खुद ही जबाब देंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री जयराम रमेश (कर्नाटक):** सर, वे गलत बोल रहे हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप चेयर को एड्रेस करिए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** पांच साल में एक बार रोजगार की गणना होती थी। ...**(व्यवधान)**... आज हम गर्व कर सकते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** सिर्फ डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी की बात रिकॉर्ड पर जाएगी।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** 2017 के बाद भारत के प्रधान मंत्री जी ने तय किया कि हर तीन महीने में रोजगार की गणना की जाएगी। ईपीएफओ के आंकड़ों को आप निकालिएगा। Standard and Poor's की रिपोर्ट को दुनिया की सारी संस्थाएं मानती हैं। वे सीएमआई के फर्जी आंकड़ों को नहीं मानती, वे ईपीएफओ के आंकड़ों को ही मानती हैं। उन्होंने ईपीएफओ के आंकड़ों के आधार पर लिखा कि ईपीएफओ के आंकड़े से पता चलता है, आप ध्यान से सुनिएगा, ईपीएफओ के आंकड़े से पता चलता है कि मजदूरों की शक्ति बढ़ी है, फारमर्स के रोजगार में 11.4 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि हुई है। स्वाभाविक रूप से आने वाले समय में भारत की मांग बढ़ने वाली है। महोदय, मैं अब चौथी टिप्पणी पर कहूंगा।

महोदय, जीएसटी लाने वाले ये ही थे। ये लागू नहीं कर पाए, हमने लागू कर दिया, तो आज जीएसटी को विकास विरोधी बताते हैं। क्या कहा था स्टैंडर्ड्स एंड पुअर्स ने? उसने जीएसटी की आलोचना करने वालों को सही जवाब दिया। भारत ने 2017 में जीएसटी इम्प्लिमेंट किया और तब से इसका मीठा फल खा रहा है। 2024 में 11.07 प्रतिशत की वृद्धि से 20 लाख करोड़ रुपये जीएसटी में इकट्ठा हुआ है, यह राजस्व बढ़ता रहेगा और भारत का विकास भी बढ़ता रहेगा। माननीय पूर्व वित्त मंत्री महोदय PLI स्कीम पर टिप्पणी कर रहे थे। स्टैंडर्ड्स एंड पुअर्स में पीएलआई (Productivity Linked Incentive) का उल्लेख किया है। उन्होंने लिखा है कि पीएलआई स्कीम ने भारत में electronics, information technology, automobile और उसके कंपोनेंट पर बहुत अधिक धन आवंटित किया है। इससे भारत के उत्पादन सेक्टर में विदेशी निवेश बढ़ा है और बहुत-सी विदेशी फर्में भारत की ओर आकर्षित हुई हैं। उन्होंने भारत के आपदा काल के बारे में लिखा है। आप भारत के फिस्कल डेफिसिट की चिंता कर रहे थे, 2012-13 में, जब आपने वित्त मंत्री के रूप में सरकार छोड़ी थी, तो भारत का फिस्कल डेफिसिट 10.05 परसेंट था। आपको आंकड़े बहुत याद रहते हैं, इसलिए आप याद कीजिएगा कि 2012-13 में भारत का फिस्कल डेफिसिट 10.05 परसेंट था। यदि नहीं होगा, तो आप खड़े होकर चुनौती दीजिएगा। महोदय, उन्होंने लिखा है कि भारत का फिस्कल डेफिसिट आपदा काल में 9 से 13 परसेंट था, 2024 में 5 से 5.07 परसेंट हुआ, 2025 में 5.01 परसेंट और 2028 तक 4.05 परसेंट होगा और लगता है कि 2028 में यह घाटा घटकर 4.02 प्रतिशत हो जाएगा।

उपसभापति महोदय, इनकी एक और बहुत प्रिय संस्था है। 1991 में जब इनकी सरकार थी, तब उसी सत्ता के दबाव में इन्होंने क्या-क्या पाप किए थे, इतिहास इसका गवाह है। वह भारत के इतिहास का सबसे काला दिन था, जो हममें से किसी भी नागरिक को नहीं भूलना चाहिए। महोदय, कांग्रेस की सरकार थी, एक सरकार इन्होंने चन्द्रशेखर जी के साथ चलाई, जैसी इनकी आदत है, चार महीने बाद उनको \* दे दिया। इन्होंने दूसरी सरकार नरसिम्हा राव जी की चलाई और जैसी इनकी आदत है, बेचारे नरसिम्हा राव मरे, उनकी शवयात्रा निकली, कांग्रेस के कार्यालय के गेट पर आधे घंटे तक खुली खड़ी रही, लेकिन इन लोगों ने अपने प्रधान मंत्री की लाश को अपने कार्यालय के अंदर नहीं घुसने दिया। ...(व्यवधान)... इतिहास के पन्ने गवाह हैं, जवाब देना पड़ेगा। ...(व्यवधान)...

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

उपसभापति महोदय, यह IMF अर्थात International Monetary Fund की रिपोर्टिंग है। IMF ने भारत की मजबूत आर्थिक उपलब्धि की प्रशंसा की है। Asia Pacific के निदेशक श्री कृष्णा श्रीनिवासन ने कहा कि भारत के macro fundamentals बहुत अच्छे हैं, देश की अर्थव्यवस्था बहुत अच्छा परफॉर्म कर रही है, 6.08 प्रतिशत की विकास दर बहुत अच्छी है। आप ध्यान से सुनिएगा - महंगाई पर नियंत्रण हो रहा है - यह भारत सरकार नहीं कह रही है, बल्कि वह संस्था कह रही है, जिसके दबाव में आकर आपने भारत को गिरवी रख दिया था। महोदय, मैं उस विषय पर आने वाला हूँ।

महोदय, महंगाई पर नियंत्रण हो रहा है, अपने इस टारगेट के भीतर भारत को स्वयं को और लाना होगा। मेरा अगला शब्द यह है कि 2023, यानी पिछले वर्ष, वित्त मंत्री जी बैठी थीं और 2023 की दूसरी छमाही में हुई आर्थिक वृद्धि ने सबको आश्चर्यचकित कर दिया। भारत की मजबूत घरेलू मांग आर्थिक गति को बढ़ा रही है। उन्होंने कहा कि भारत के विकास के अनुपात को बदलना होगा। उन्होंने अप्रैल में भारत की विकास दर 6.05 प्रतिशत से बढ़कर 6.08 प्रतिशत की थी। ये जीडीपी को चुनौती देने बैठे हैं, सात साल रहे हैं, इसी जीडीपी को बनाते रहे हैं और इसी पर भाषण देते रहे हैं। आईएमएफ ने कहा कि हम दोबारा भारत के अनुमान को बदल रहे हैं और भारत की विकास दर को 6.08 प्रतिशत के बढ़ाकर सेव कर रहे हैं।

उपसभापति महोदय, उन्होंने सिर्फ भारत का ही विकास नहीं बताया, बल्कि उन्होंने पूरी दुनिया के विकास का खाका खींच दिया। अमरीका की विकास दर 2.07 परसेंट, जर्मनी की विकास दर 0.02 परसेंट, फ्रांस की विकास दर 0.07 परसेंट। इटली की विकास दर 0.7 प्रतिशत, स्पेन की विकास दर 1.9 प्रतिशत, यूके की विकास दर 0.5 प्रतिशत, जापान की विकास दर 0.9 प्रतिशत, रूस की विकास दर 3.2 प्रतिशत, ब्राजील की विकास दर 2.2 प्रतिशत, मेक्सिको की विकास दर 2.4 प्रतिशत, साउथ अफ्रीका की विकास दर 0.9 प्रतिशत और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत की विकास दर को आईएमएफ की संस्था ने सात प्रतिशत का आंकड़ा दिया है। यह आईएमएफ कौन है? प्रमोद जी, 1991 में आप ही की सरकार थी। आपके पास तीन हफ्ते का फोरन रिज़र्व नहीं था, आपके पास तीन हफ्ते का पैसा नहीं था। मूडीज़ ने आपको डाउनग्रेड कर दिया था। आईएमएफ ने आपको लोन देने से मना कर दिया था। वर्ल्ड बैंक ने आपका पैसा रोक लिया था। आपके पास पूरी की पूरी व्यवस्था फेल कर रही थी। आप मजबूर हुए। आपने दो बार - एक जुलाई और तीन जुलाई को भारत की मुद्रा का उन्मूलन किया और सबसे घटिया काम किया। सोना गिरवी रखा तो रखा, लेकिन अगर आपका दिल साफ था, तो खुलेआम सामने से रखते। चोरी से सोना गिरवी रखने काम दुनिया की किसी सरकार ने किया, तो भारत सरकार ने किया ...**(व्यवधान)**... भारत का 67 टन सोना इन लोगों ने दो बार - एक बार 20 टन सोना, एक बार 43 टन सोना... **(व्यवधान)**... मुझे कोई असर नहीं पड़ता है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... बैठ जाइए, नहीं तो चिल्लाते रह जाओगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़ आप चेयर को एड्रेस करिए। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** एक बार 20 टन सोना और एक बार 43 टन सोना इन लोगों ने गिरवी रखा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... रात के अंधेरे में रखा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... उपसभापति महोदय, हुआ

क्या? एक बहुत नामी पत्रकार हैं - शंकर अय्यर। वे बेचारे किसी काम से एयरपोर्ट गए थे। उन्होंने देखा कि एक ट्रक का पहिया फट गया है। जब पहिया फट गया, तो वे देखने पहुंचे और पता चला कि उसके अंदर सोना भरा हुआ है, तब जाकर दूसरे दिन खबर छपी कि भारत ने अपने 142 करोड़ नागरिक, जिनकी चर्चा कर रहे हैं, उनसे छिपाकर भारत का सोना गिरवी रख दिया। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि हमारे पास एक प्रधान मंत्री हैं। यह चुनाव की गहमागहमी में छिप गया। 31 मई, 2024 को हमारे मोदी जी के नेतृत्व में इस देश ने अपना सौ किलो टन सोना भारत में वापस मंगवाया है और उसे भारत के स्वर्ण भंडार में रखा गया है।

उपसभापति महोदय, ये आर्थिक आंकड़ों की चर्चा कर रहे थे, तो मैं भी इन्हें कुछ आंकड़े बता देना चाहता हूँ। इन्होंने ऋण के ऊपर चर्चा की। आज भारत का ऋण जीडीपी का 85 परसेंट है, यह मैं मानता हूँ। पूरी दुनिया के क्या आंकड़े हैं? अमेरिका का ऋण जीडीपी का 129 परसेंट है। जापान का ऋण जीडीपी का 264 परसेंट है। इटली का ऋण 142 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। फ्रांस का ऋण 112 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। यूके का ऋण 97 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। भारत का ऋण 85 परसेंट ऑफ जीडीपी है। पूरी दुनिया में भारत ने विकास भी सर्वाधिक गति से किया है और भारत की ऋण ग्रस्तता भी पूरी दुनिया में उसके सकल घरेलू उत्पादन के मुकाबले सबसे कम है। यह विकास हमने तब किया है, जब हम इस देश के नागरिकों से सबसे कम टैक्स लेते हैं। आप इनकम टैक्स की बात कर रहे हैं! हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि भारत अकेला ऐसा देश है, पूरी दुनिया का अकेला देश है, जो पूरी दुनिया में अपने नागरिकों से सबसे कम टैक्स लेने का काम करता है। ब्रिटेन अपने नागरिकों से 33 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। नॉर्वे 31 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। ऑस्ट्रेलिया 30 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। स्विट्ज़रलैंड साढ़े 27 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। इजरायल 24 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। यूरोपियन यूनियन 26 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। जर्मनी 22 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। स्वीडन 21 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है। अमेरिका साढ़े 16 परसेंट टैक्स लेता है और हमने पूरी दुनिया में जो यह ऐतिहासिक विकास की गति पाई है, वह सिर्फ और सिर्फ 7.6 परसेंट टैक्स ऑफ जीडीपी के आधार पर पाई है। उपसभापति महोदय ...(व्यवधान)... सर, अभी रुकिए, बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... ये आरबीआई की रिपोर्ट ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी, आप चेयर को संबोधित कीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** पूर्व वित्त मंत्री आरबीआई की अधूरी रिपोर्ट पेश कर रहे थे ...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** आपस में बात मत कीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)... प्लीज़, चेयर को संबोधित कीजिए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति महोदय, मैं पूरी रिपोर्ट पेश कर देता हूँ। ...(व्यवधान)... 2011 में भारत के नागरिकों की जीडीपी की नेट वर्थ 85.7 प्रतिशत था। ये आंकड़े हैं, आपने क्वोट किया है, तो आप पूरी तरह इन्हें पढ़िएगा। मार्च 2014 में तीन साल के कार्यकाल में यह 85.7 परसेंट से घटकर 78.5 प्रतिशत आ गया। तीन साल के अंदर आपने देश के नागरिकों

की 7 प्रतिशत पूंजी \* ली। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि मार्च 2014 में मोदी जी सरकार आई और हमारा नेट फैमिली वर्थ 78.5 प्रतिशत से बढ़कर 97.2 परसेंट हो गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You will get opportunity to speak. ...**(Interruptions)**...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** अर्थात् कुल मिलाकर हमने 19 परसेंट अतिरिक्त पूंजी इस देश के नागरिकों की जेब में पहुंचाने का काम किया है। 2014 में इनकी सरकार थी, तो प्रति व्यक्ति आय 86 हजार थी। ये आपके आंकड़े हैं, महाशय! 50 परसेंट नागरिक, 70 परसेंट नागरिक - जब उस समय आंकड़े देते थे, तो आपको 50 परसेंट और 70 परसेंट नहीं दिखता था! उस समय आपको औसत दिखता था! आपने 86 हजार की आय देकर छोड़ा था। आज भारत की प्रति व्यक्ति आय कितनी है - कहां आपने 86 हजार पर छोड़ा था और हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि आज भारत का आम नागरिक 2 लाख 12 हजार रुपया कमाता है। 2 लाख 12 हजार रुपये इस देश की प्रति व्यक्ति आय है। ये गरीबों की बात कर रहे थे, ये बात कर रहे थे देश की आर्थिक व्यवस्था की, ये बात कर रहे थे कि लोगों के पास धन नहीं है कि वे बेचारे खर्च कर सकें। उपसभापति महोदय, मैं आपके संज्ञान में सिर्फ एक आंकड़ा लाना चाहता हूं। आरबीआई, वे माने या न माने, सरकार तो वे उसी से चलाते थे। आरबीआई, देश के पास कितना पैसा है, कितना पैसा खर्च करती है, नागरिकों को अपने विकास का अंदाजा कैसे लगता है, उनके पास पैसा नहीं है, तो वे काम कैसे करते हैं, इसीलिए वे हाई-फ्रीक्वेंसी इंडिकेटर्स निकालते हैं। ये वहीं आंकड़े हैं, जिनके बारे में अपनी सरकार में रहते समय ये भाषण देते रहते होंगे। मैं इन्हें इनके चेहरे पर दिखा देता हूं। ग्रामीण एरिया में टू व्हीलर्स की सेल 21.3 परसेंट बढ़ गई। क्या यह बिना पैसे के बढ़ गई? थ्री व्हीलर्स की सेल 12.3 प्रतिशत बढ़ गई। ...**(व्यवधान)**... क्या आपने जेब में पैसा डाला था? ट्रैक्टर की सेल 3.7 परसेंट बढ़ गई। आदमी के पास पैसा नहीं था, तो क्या वह ट्रैक्टर खरीद रहा था? टोल कलेक्शन पिछले एक साल में 37.5 परसेंट बढ़ा है। क्या ये गाड़ियां बिना पेट्रोल, बिना डीजल के चलती हैं? अभी आपने कितना किलोमीटर बताया - 5000 in one month. My God! He only can move, nobody else can move. Nobody else can move. He only can move. मैं तो आश्चर्यचकित हूं! ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति महोदय, टोल कलेक्शन 37 परसेंट बढ़ गया। पैसेंजर व्हीकल की सेल 4.9 प्रतिशत बढ़ गई। डोमेस्टिक एयर ट्रैफिक 6.6 प्रतिशत बढ़ गया। डोमेस्टिक एयर कारगो ट्रैफिक 6.7 प्रतिशत बढ़ गया। इंटरनेशनल पैसेंजर्स 13.2 प्रतिशत बढ़ गए। रेलवे फ्रेट ट्रैफिक 10.1 प्रतिशत बढ़ गया। होटल ऑक्यूपेंसी 60 परसेंट बढ़ गई। सीमेंट का प्रोडक्शन 10.6 परसेंट बढ़ गया। मकान नहीं बन रहे थे, निर्माण नहीं हो रहा था, तो सीमेंट का क्या कर रहे थे, महाराज! कभी तो इन आंकड़ों को देखने की कोशिश करिए। स्टील का प्रोडक्शन 19.1 प्रतिशत

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

बढ़ गया। ऑटोमोबाइल की सेल 18.2 प्रतिशत बढ़ गई। कॉमर्शियल व्हीकल की सेल 3.5 परसेंट बढ़ गई। ...**(व्यवधान)**... जीएसटी का ई-वे बिल 16.3 परसेंट बढ़ गया। जीएसटी का कलेक्शन 11.4 परसेंट बढ़ गया। उपसभापति महोदय, नागरिकों के पास पैसा नहीं था - मकान की खरीद नागरिकों के बीच में 33 परसेंट बढ़ गई। 33 परसेंट अधिक लोगों ने इस साल अतिरिक्त मकान खरीदे हैं। ये कहते हैं कि देश में पैसा नहीं है! आप देख नहीं पाते, देखना नहीं चाहते, jaundiced eye है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... ठीक है, ठीक है।

उपसभापति महोदय, इनका एक दूसरा आर्थिक आँकड़ा आता है, वह जानना बहुत जरूरी है। उस आँकड़े को कहते हैं - Purchasing Managers' Index. इस बार इन्होंने अपने भाषण में नहीं कहा, लेकिन पिछली बार जब ये खड़े हुए थे, तो Purchasing Managers' Index की बात कर रहे थे। इनका जवाब देते समय मैंने कहा था कि आप \* बोल रहे हैं, आपने गलत आँकड़े प्रस्तुत किए हैं। आज मैं सही आँकड़ा प्रस्तुत कर देता हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति:** कृपया बोलते वक्त संसदीय शब्द का इस्तेमाल करें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** हाँ, इसको असत्य कह लीजिए, भ्रम कह लीजिए, जो चाहे कह लीजिए।

उपसभापति महोदय, मैनुफैक्चरिंग क्षेत्र में Purchasing Managers' Index देख लीजिए। Purchasing Managers' Index का मतलब होता है कि देश की विकास गति...**(व्यवधान)**... समझ लीजिए, नहीं तो फिर ये लोग उल्टा बोलेंगे। समझाना भी तो जरूरी है न! इसका मतलब होता है कि विकास की धारा कैसी है!

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. अग्रवाल, आपके पास एक मिनट समय है।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** अगर यह 50 से नीचे है, तो इसका मतलब देश का विकास कम हो रहा है और अगर यह 50 से ऊपर है, तो इसका मतलब देश का विकास बढ़ रहा है। माननीय नेता प्रतिपक्ष, 24 घंटे तो आप बोलते हैं, कभी हम लोगों को भी बोलने का मौका दे दीजिए। मैनुफैक्चरिंग में Purchasing Managers' Index, ऑस्ट्रेलिया का मूल्य है 47.2; जापान का मूल्य है 50; अमेरिका का मूल्य है 51; चीन का मूल्य है 51; यूनाइटेड किंगडम का मूल्य है 50; दुनिया का औसत है 50 और मैनुफैक्चरिंग के क्षेत्र में भारत का Purchasing Managers' Index 58.3 प्रतिशत है। यह किस बात का द्योतक है!

उपसभापति महोदय, ...**(समय की घंटी)**... ऐसे ही सर्विस के क्षेत्र में एक Managers' Index निकाला जाता है। पिछले भाषण में इन्होंने उसको भी quote किया।

**श्री उपसभापति:** आपका समय खत्म हुआ, अब आप जो भी बोलेंगे, उसका समय पार्टी के टाइम में से जाएगा।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति जी, मेरे नेता यहाँ बैठे हैं, वे मुझे जितना समय देंगे, मैं बोल लूँगा और आदेश होते ही मैं बैठ जाऊँगा। उपसभापति महोदय, यह भाजपा का समय है।

महोदय, एक सर्विस मैनुफैक्चरिंग इंडेक्स होता है। इस बार इन्होंने नहीं बोला, क्योंकि थोड़ा पढ़-लिख लिए होंगे, जान गए होंगे कि पिछली बार \* बोल दिया था। मैं उसका आँकड़ा बता देता हूँ।

**श्री उपसभापति:** कृपया संसदीय शब्द का ही इस्तेमाल करें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** हाँ, उपसभापति महोदय, \* शब्द हटा दीजिएगा। बोलने के क्रम में आ गया होगा, मैं उसे वापस लेता हूँ। सर्विस क्षेत्र में रूस का Purchasing Managers' Index 47.6; जापान का 49.4; यानी सब 50 से कम; ऑस्ट्रेलिया का ... (व्यवधान)... #

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़। व्यक्तिगत टिप्पणी रिकॉर्ड पर नहीं जाएगी। प्लीज़, आप चेयर को देख कर बोलें।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** महोदय, ऑस्ट्रेलिया 51 परसेंट; चीन 51 परसेंट, यूनाइटेड किंगडम 52 परसेंट, यूएसए 53 परसेंट, जबकि उपसभापति महोदय, भारत के सर्विस क्षेत्र का PMI 60.5 प्रतिशत है, जो पूरी दुनिया में अकेला है।

महोदय, एक तीसरा आँकड़ा भी है, जिसके बारे में ये पिछली बार नहीं बोले थे- Composite Managers' Index. जापान 49.7, अब ये लोग सुन नहीं रहे हैं। सुन सब रहे हैं, लेकिन न सुनने का नाटक कर रहे हैं। इन्होंने कान इधर कर लिए हैं और मुँह उधर कर लिए हैं।

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़, प्लीज़। डा. साहब, आप अपने समय से अधिक बोल रहे हैं, आप पार्टी का अधिक समय ले रहे हैं।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** जापान 49.7; रूस 49.7; ऑस्ट्रेलिया 50 परसेंट, यूनाइटेड किंगडम 52 परसेंट; पूरी दुनिया का औसत 53 परसेंट और भारत का 60.9 प्रतिशत का आँकड़ा है। उपसभापति महोदय, कुछ और बातें हैं। ... (समय की घंटी)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** ऑलरेडी, आपकी पार्टी ने जो समय दिया था, आप उससे अधिक बोल चुके हैं। Please conclude.

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** उपसभापति महोदय, एक दूसरा आर्थिक आँकड़ा निकलता है, जिसे ये निकाला करते थे। ये भी 7 साल वित्त मंत्री रहे हैं, हालाँकि ये टुकड़े-टुकड़े में रहे हैं।

---

\* Withdrawn by hon. Member.

# Not recorded.



हमारी वित्त मंत्री तो लगातार हैं, एक continuity है। ये बेचारे आते थे, भगा दिए जाते थे। ये रह-रह कर रहते थे, इसलिए इनका स्थायित्व नहीं आ पाता था। हमारी वित्त मंत्री का 7 साल का स्थायित्व है।

उपसभापति महोदय, Professional Forecasters का assessment किया गया है। सारे के सारे आँकड़े तैयार हैं।

3.00 P.M.

उपसभापति महोदय, real GDP 6.8 per cent - IMF मानेगा, Standard and Poor मानेगा, भारत सरकार मानेगी, World Bank मानेगा, भारत के लोग मानेंगे, लेकिन अगर नहीं मानेंगे, तो यही बेचारे नहीं मानेंगे। ...**(व्यवधान)**... Private Final Consumption Expenditure, 6 per cent; Gross Fixed Capital Formation, 8.6 per cent; Gross Value Added, 6.6 per cent. महोदय, इनके कार्यकाल में Current Account Deficit (CAD) 4.5 per cent था। कल हमारी वित्त मंत्री जी ने बजट प्रस्तुत किया। हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि हमारा CAD 4.5 प्रतिशत से घट कर 0.7 प्रतिशत पर आ गया है।

उपसभापति महोदय, ये लोग एक और आंकड़ा निकलवाते हैं। ये वित्त मंत्री रहे हैं। ये भूल गये होंगे। इनको याद करा देना जरूरी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... महोदय, इनको याद करा देना जरूरी है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इनको अपने जमाने का सब याद रहता था। महोदय, actually जब ये लोग अंग्रेजी में बोलते हैं, तो हम उत्तर भारत के लोग थोड़ा दब-दब से जाते हैं।

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़, आप सब्जेक्ट पर बोलिए।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** ये ज़रा हिन्दी में सुन लें और हिन्दी में जवाब दे देंगे। RBI ने calculation किया। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**एक माननीय सदस्य:** वे भोजपुरी में भी जवाब दे सकते हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** हम तो उनके दे ली, मनोज झा के, उनके त देवे के पड़ी। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

**श्री उपसभापति:** प्लीज़।

**डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल:** Current Situation Index - भारत का Current Situation Index, जो रोजगार के आधार पर बनता है, आर्थिक परिस्थितियों के आधार पर बनता है, मूल्य के आधार पर बनता है, आय के आधार पर बनता है और नागरिकों के खर्च करने की क्षमता के आधार पर बनता है, 100 के मुकाबले इसका मूल्य 97.1 प्रतिशत है। एक साल बाद भारत की आर्थिक व्यवस्था कैसी होगी, इन विशेषज्ञों के मन में आज से आने वाले एक साल के बाद भारत आर्थिक रूप से

कैसा मजबूत होगा, उसके लिए वे लोग Future Expectation Index निकालते हैं। महोदय, 100 के Index में भारत का मूल्य 124.7 प्रतिशत है। ...**(समय की घंटी)**...

उपसभापति महोदय, ये गरीबी की बात कर रहे थे। \* ये per capita income से गरीबी देखते हैं। भारत के प्रधान मंत्री ने तय किया। वे गरीबी से उठे थे। उन्हें मालूम था कि अगर गरीबों की आय थोड़ी सी बढ़ा दी जाए, तो भी आर्थिक सुविधाओं तक उनकी पहुँच नहीं होती, सामाजिक सुविधाओं तक उनकी पहुँच नहीं होती, शैक्षणिक सुविधाओं तक उनकी पहुँच नहीं होती। उसकी जेब में पैसा होता है, लेकिन विभिन्न सामाजिक पूर्वाग्रहों के नाते इन सुविधाओं को वह खरीद नहीं पाता। इसलिए आपने गौर किया होगा कि माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने गरीबों के अमीर बनने का इंतजार नहीं किया, उनकी जेब में पैसा आएगा, तब वे यह सुविधा पाएँगे, इसका इंतजार नहीं किया। उन्होंने उनको 4 करोड़ मकान बनाकर दे दिए, निःशुल्क दे दिए; घरों में शौचालय दे दिए, निःशुल्क दे दिए; घरों में बिजली दे दी, निःशुल्क दे दिया; बीमारों का इलाज करा दिया, निःशुल्क करा दिया; गैस दे दिया, निःशुल्क दे दिया और फिर, आय को 86,000 से बढ़ा कर 2 लाख 12 हजार कर दिया। ...**(समय की घंटी)**... महोदय, मैं समाप्त कर रहा हूँ। ...**(व्यवधान)**... मैं समाप्त कर रहा हूँ।

महोदय, ये नीति आयोग की आलोचना कर रहे थे। ये क्या करें? ये प्लानिंग कमीशन चलाया करते थे। \* हमारी सरकार आई, तो हमने तय किया। हम federal cooperation में विश्वास करते हैं। हम प्रधान मंत्री हैं, तो हमारा मुख्य मंत्री भी अपने प्रदेश का सम्मानित अधिकारी है। हम अपने अधिकारियों को, हम अपने मुख्य मंत्रियों को और राजनैतिक जनप्रतिनिधियों को IAS और PCS के अधिकारियों के सामने attendance लगाने के लिए मजबूर नहीं करेंगे। प्लानिंग कमीशन को समाप्त करके माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी ने इस देश के हरेक मुख्य मंत्री के सम्मान की रक्षा की है। ...**(समय की घंटी)**... महोदय, नीति आयोग का एक Multi-dimensional Poverty Index है, जो यह बताता है कि पिछले 10 सालों में हमने 24 करोड़ 10 लाख लोगों को सिर्फ गरीबी रेखा से ऊपर ही नहीं उठाया है, बल्कि जीवन की जितनी जरूरतें होती हैं - आप लोग तो अमर्त्य सेन के बहुत बड़े भक्त हैं, चूँकि वे भाजपा के विरोधी हैं। आप लोग अमर्त्य सेन का गुण गाते हैं। अमर्त्य सेन भी Multi-dimensional Poverty Index को लेकर आए थे। आपने नहीं लागू किया, क्योंकि आपका चेहरा बेनकाब हो जाता। आपने नागरिकों को सुविधाएँ दी नहीं थीं, खाली फर्जी पर-कैपिटा, पर-कैपिटा बताया करते थे, इसलिए आपने इस देश में मल्टीडायमेंशनल पॉवर्टी इंडेक्स को कभी नहीं लागू किया। भारत के प्रधान मंत्री ने यह काम किया, नागरिकों तक सुविधा पहुँचाई। चुनाव चुनौती के साथ उन्होंने कहा कि जब तक एक-एक नागरिक के चेहरे पर खुशी नहीं आएगी, गाँधी जी का वह सपना पूरा नहीं होगा कि जब तुम नीतियाँ बनाते हो, तो यह देखो कि तुम्हारी नीतियों से गरीबों के आँसू साफ होते हैं या नहीं।...**(समय की घंटी)**... हम गर्व के साथ कह सकते हैं कि पिछले दस सालों में हमने 24 करोड़, 10 लाख नागरिकों के आँसू पोंछे।...**(समय की घंटी)**... उपसभापति महोदय, मैं अभी बहुत कुछ कहना चाहता था, लेकिन आपने रोका है, इसलिए मैं रुक रहा हूँ, मौका दीजिए, तो फिर अपनी बातें रखूँगा, धन्यवाद।

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

**श्री उपसभापति:** डा. राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी, आपने अपने लिए तय समय से जितना अधिक समय लिया, वह समय आपकी पार्टी से जाएगा। माननीय श्री जवाहर सरकार। ...*(व्यवधान)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY (West Bengal): Sir, I invite your kind attention to Rule 261. Rule 261 says, "If the Chairman is of opinion that a word or words has or have been used in debate which is or are defamatory or indecent or unparliamentary or undignified, he may in his discretion, order that such word or words be expunged from the proceedings of the Council."

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It has already been done.

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, only one word, आदरणीय राधा मोहन दास अग्रवाल जी जोश से बोल रहे थे, तो उस जोश में यह लफ़्ज आ गया - 'आप लोग \* रहे थे', This is unparliamentary, according to the Parliamentary publications book on Unparliamentary Expressions, 2021.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is right. ...*(Interruptions)*... यह असंसदीय शब्द है, इसलिए वह निकलेगा। आप यह सही कह रहे हैं।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: I am referring to a book. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are right. I have already indicated. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: Sir, I am referring to a book which is a publication of the Parliament.

**श्री उपसभापति:** आप सही हैं।

SHRI SUKHENDU SEKHAR RAY: The name of the book is Unparliamentary Expressions, 2021. उसको जरा आप देख लीजिए।

**श्री उपसभापति:** माननीय सुखेंदु शेखर रॉय जी, you are correct, I have already instructed about it. ...*(Interruptions)*...

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

The next speaker is Shri Jawhar Sircar; you have fifteen minutes.

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR (West Bengal): Sir, I would like... please आप बैठें।  
...(व्यवधान)...

**श्री उपसभापति:** यह सिर्फ दो शब्दों पर था, जो उन्होंने कहा है।...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Sir, I would like to thank you first. I would like to thank the Chairperson of our party. I would like to thank the National General Secretary and the Leader of the House for giving me an opportunity to state certain facts. Before that, I would like to make one comment to my hon. Friend. He has mentioned 'paisa' around 40 times in his speech. 'पैसा' डा. अग्रवाल नहीं जानेंगे, तो कौन जानेंगे?

Secondly, he has made a lot of statements that are really defamatory in nature. I would say if he really believes, if he really believed in... ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have to speak on the subject, Mr. Jawhar Sircar. ... (Interruptions)...

**श्री जवाहर सरकार:** सर, इनकी बात छोड़िए।...(व्यवधान)... मुझे अपनी बात पर आने दीजिए।  
...(व्यवधान)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have taken his name. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI JAWHAR SIRCAR: Sir, I would like to start by expressing my deep sorrow at the wasted opportunity of a Finance Minister who has been there for seven years. I came into the Budget process some 21 years ago and have drawn and helped execute budgets. I have not seen such a lacklustre budget, such an absolutely atrocious Budget. This is the Budget that is a fig leaf for plutocracy and for a rule by the rich. I will give just a few examples. Hon. Finance Minister starts off by saying, 'I let off gold, silver and platinum.' This is a fact. Sir, gold, silver and platinum is her priority! When I talk of silver, the first thing that comes to my mind is a scandal in the GIFT City, in a particularly favoured State. There is a huge scandal about import of silver. Then she says, 'I let off cruise ships.' सर, बजट में लगजरी कूज शिप्स की भी कोई बात होती है! I gave up the Angel Tax. Angel Tax, Sir, is meant for high investment by high investors. This has nothing to do with the common man. She said, 'I removed the Angel Tax.' तो हमारे लिए क्या Devil Tax है, बाकी क्या devil tax छोड़ा? She has let off Angel Tax! Have you thought even once about small savings? Sir, there is not a word about small

savings! Not a word about the common man. The tragedy of the hon. Finance Minister is that she does not understand the subject and rains from a high hog!

She has, deliberately, avoided the names of all the important States that voted against her. Sir, West Bengal has not been uttered once; Punjab never, Tamil Nadu never; Kerala never and none of the States she uttered! We do not exist in her scheme of things. That is what I am trying to say.

She starts up saying, 'We are the fifth largest GDP.' हम यह कब तक सुनेंगे? You are supposed to have made it US\$5 trillion by this year. You have not; so, you have \* to the nation. You have not been able to manage even US\$4 trillion. As Mr. Chidambaram said, it is all jugglery of deflation. If you have come to close to US\$4 trillion, it is not thanks to you, it has happened because of the people of India. As people say, it happened in spite of the Government; it didn't happen because of the Government.

Sir, her Economic Survey suddenly brings out one word of truth. I am quoting that sentence. It says, 'The Indian corporate sector profits are at a fifteen year high.' I don't grudge it. I grudge the 75 year low through which the poor are going. That is what my grudge is.

The Budget talks of youth, women, poor and farmer. But, what did it do in reality? In reality, it has turned itself into a user-friendly political weapon. It has created monopolies and oligopolies. It has created crony raj and we can go on giving a number of examples, whether it be airport, port, coal, solar and even foreign contract dalal.

Now, I come back to taxation structure. It was always around 40 per cent of the personal income tax of poor people and 60 per cent was from corporate tax. Sir, 60 per cent used to be the corporate tax. Today, they are equal. Now we are totally unequal. Personal income tax has gone up from 40 per cent to 55-60 per cent and corporate tax has come down/slashed down deliberately, to give them some benefit which they never returned to the nation through any investment. The present calculation is that the present hon. Finance Minister and the hon. Prime Minister have let off Rs. 8 lakh crores — it is a lot of money - it is the Budget of five States put together — of corporate tax, along with a write-off of Rs. 16 lakh crores of banks' bad debt! Sir, out of Rs. 16 lakh crores of banks' bad debt (NPAs), she has given me, in writing, that around Rs. 9 lakh crores are on account of Modi, — sorry, Nirav Modi — on account of Jatin Shah, and on account of other big frauds and corporate losses.

---

\* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Sir, with a cumulation of such a plutocratic, such an absolutely openly capitalist Budget, we have landed into an inequality that is one-and-a-half times worse than colonial times. ...(*Interruptions*)... अगर इनके पास इतना पैसा है, तो कैपिटल फॉर्मेशन तो करें। But, the Private Capital Formation has declined steadily during this regime. Let them contest it. Those officers, who give them such papers, should also give them such truths, once in a while ताकि अपने खाब तो तोड़ें। This has happened consistently.

This Budget is the most anti-federal Budget that we have seen in the last 20 years. The most deliberate anti-federal Budget. I will come to my State. They declared an economic war on Bengal because Bengal refuses to subscribe to their principle of hatred. We do not believe in the hatred against minorities. आप हमें मार डालिए, फिर भी हम minority के खिलाफ कोई काम नहीं करेंगे। We do not believe in casteism. So, don't come and introduce the poison of casteism in my State and say, "हमें वोट दो - हमें वोट दो।" And, for that, we have to pay a penalty that is higher than many other States. We have been stopped funding on MNREGA, Aawas Yojana, Gram Sadak Yojana, and even on health to the poorest. And, our dues are Rs. 1.72 lakh crores. ...(*Interruptions*)... 1.72 lakh crores! We are doing Awaas Yojana on our own. We are doing MNREGA on our own. नरेगा पर इतना गुस्सा क्यों है, उसका नाम बदल दीजिए न, महात्मा गांधी जी का नाम हटा कर किसी और का नाम रख दीजिए, पर पैसा तो दीजिए। उसको नरेन्द्र मोदी रूरल डेवलपमेंट बनाइए। West Bengal is the only State that has been deprived for three years. You have declared a special war of vendetta. The Prime Minister and the Finance Minister have declared a special war against us. Please, please look at history. In this sub-continent, if you take out a particular region or a particular State and declare a war of vindictiveness, you are playing with fire. You are playing with fire, with the emotions of the people. You have even stopped kerosene quota. यह क्या हो रहा है? You talk of giving e-vouchers for financial support to one lakh students. Bengal has already given it to eleven lakh students. आप हमें क्या सिखाएंगे? On Finance Commission grants, as you know, there are no conditions possible. But, you have started putting conditions here too. You have started it and it is anti-federal because you are increasing your tax budget through surcharges and additional duties. And, you are not distributing this. You are keeping this to reward those States that prop you up.

You have talked of inflation. The one that matters the most is the food inflation, which is over nine per cent — 9.2 to 9.5 per cent. Vegetable market is on fire. But, you look only at the fire of the stock market.

(MR. CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

Now, I come to the household consumption expenditure. Your report will not show that 43 per cent Indians are skipping a meal. Your national account 36 or 24 shows that household incomes have crashed by rupees nine lakh crores in two years. I am repeating, crashed by nine lakh crore rupees in two years! The household savings have come down as a percentage of GDP. The household consumption expenditure has been shattered because of inflation.

We come to Budget. When you talk of so many things that you are giving, you are not mentioning that this is on borrowed money. Never before have we relied on rupees fourteen lakh crores of borrowal. You are putting the nation into a debt. Remember, 67 years and 13 Prime Ministers borrowed 55.8 lakh crores of rupees. But, one Prime Minister alone has borrowed three times more. It is a fact; let them refute it. And, now you talk of increased budget, मैं यह दे रहा हूँ, वह दे रहा हूँ। Our debt, as a part of the GDP, you say, is lower than that of the USA or Japan. उनके पास क्षमता है। They have the capacity to repay. They do not have such a huge burden of the poor to carry on. So, do not compare incomparables.

You have cut down even on subsidy. You have cut down even on subsidy on every account. On unemployment, you are on complete denial mode. Unemployment has already burnt you. The gentleman who spoke before me, his State has come down to half, where his party is concerned. When I talk, my State, my party has gone up by 20 per cent in my State. So, these are the results. Do not fool yourself. Unemployment will blow up on your face.

The labour force reports are based on mythical things. You worked for one hour, it is taken as a week employment. You worked for one month, it is taken as your annual employment. अपने आपसे असत्य बोलना बंद कीजिए और कभी-कभी सच का मुंह देखिए। Now, employment linked subsidy is a new step. Before I come to that, I will tell you that we demand a White Paper on PLI. On PLI, I feel there is something that we all need to look at because almost all of it is going to one State. In that State, Micron industry charges Rs. 3.2 crores per job. This is a racket. You have to take a look into it. And, if the Government has the capacity, let it put up a white paper on who got PLI, where and for what purpose, in which State, cornering of all industries into one State, just one State, favouring a couple of other States.

On health, our Budget has slashed. We need three per cent of the GDP, we are spending less than one. (*Time-bell rings.*) सर, यह क्या हो रहा है? इतनी बड़ी-बड़ी बातें करते हैं कि मैं यह कर रहा हूँ, वह कर रहा हूँ। On health alone, we have crashed. On education, we have crashed. From our six per cent of GDP target, we are nowhere near three percent.

This is a Budget meant for the rich, only for the rich and it is a completely anti-federal, anti-poor Budget and needs to be junked out. I completely believe that this is a motivated one that is meant against the poor man, against the citizens. Look at small savings, look at the over-centralisation of the NEET, look at the over-centralisation at every level and you know what I mean. With these words, Sir, I strongly condemn the Budget and the points that I have raised, I hope, the hon. Finance Minister replies in a soft, decent manner with logical facts, not in anger. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Now, Shri N.R. Elango. You have 12 minutes.

SHRI N.R. ELANGO (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for this opportunity. My response on this Budget is going to be only political, not on any finance, economy or data because the Budget itself is political, not on any finance or economy. The Tamil Nadu had so many demands. We were expecting so many things. We were hopeful of something from the Government but we got nothing. That is because the BJP got nothing from Tamil Nadu. Sir, I have read in the newspapers, the hon. Prime Minister spoke to the Press saying and I quote: "Now it is the responsibility of all elected representatives and of all political parties who have fought for their respective parties, that now for the next five years, we have to fight for the country and strive for it." Unfortunately, this was not brought to the knowledge of the hon. Finance Minister. This Budget, in my opinion, is not for the country but it is to appease very few. This Budget is not for the stability of the country but for the stability of this Government. I want to refer to only two portions of the Budget speech. The first line says, 'the people of India have reposed their faith in the Government and elected it for the third term.' With great respect to the Finance Minister, I say, it is not correct. Only two persons have reposed faith on you; only two persons. And, you say that 'you are grateful for their support.' This is correct because you are grateful to those two who are supporting you, and nobody else.

Sir, the fault in the Budget is that it has great amount of regional disparities. Purvodaya Project is covering Bihar, Jharkhand, West Bengal, Odisha and Andhra Pradesh. The height of the tragedy is that you have included Andhra Pradesh in the Eastern region. Maybe, because the rising Sun is shining well in the South, you thought, Andhra Pradesh is in the East. We don't envy these States. They are our brothers. But we strongly condemn the step-motherly attitude of the Union. Our leader, great *arignar* Anna said, 'North flourishes and South deteriorates'. Because of the well-planned governance of our leader, Dr. Kalaignar, and Mr. Muthuvel



Karunanidhi Stalin, Tamil Nadu is performing as one of the best States in terms of every parameter. But we are punished for our best performance. Our contributions are not even returned by due devolution of funds. Now, it may be not wholly unjustified if we say, North is flourishing because of the South.

Sir, Tamil Nadu is excelling in industry, in agriculture and in every other field. As per Niti Aayog's report, 2023-24, in achieving the goals of low poverty, zero hunger, good health and well-being, quality education, gender equality, clean water and sanitation, clean energy and every other field, Tamil Nadu has excelled the average of India. Sir, the overall performance of Tamil Nadu was at 74 per cent in 2020-21, and India was at 68 per cent. Tamil Nadu is at 78 per cent in 2023-24, and India is at 71 per cent. For the information of my learned friend, Dr. Radha Mohan Das Agrawal, I may have to say that these figures were only at 60 per cent and 67 per cent during the period 2020-21 and 2023-24 respectively for the State of Uttar Pradesh.

Sir, Tamil Nadu being one of the well developed States often receives less Central transfers compared to the less-developed States. Regarding the infrastructure projects, as far as the Metro Rail Phase-2 Project is concerned, the Metro Rail Project Phase-2, is on the 50:50 contribution of the State and the Centre. Though approval of every stage was granted, now the project is awaiting CCEA approval from the Central Cabinet. It is not being given. The State has commenced its work. We are having funds' deficiency. I request the Union to consider this and to give the CCEA approval and to release necessary funds. The four new rail projects are imminent for the State and we request the Union to consider them and clear those projects expeditiously.

Sir, two disasters happened in Tamil Nadu -- one, in Chennai and neighbouring districts; and number two, in the Southern-most part of the State. We requested about Rs. 37,907 crores as relief but the Centre, so far, released only Rs. 276 crores, a meagre sum of Rs. 276 crores. The State is fighting very much financially to take the relief measures. We request the Union to immediately release Rs. 3,000 crores towards this disaster management. Sir, as far as *Samagra Siksha* is concerned, Tamil Nadu has its own reservations about the New Education Policy. Though we have contributed our 40 per cent towards this project, the Centre is not releasing its share of 60 per cent, which is around Rs. 2,152 crore. We have our own reservations about the New Education Policy, but that is the State's autonomy. You cannot withhold funds because of that. On the education front, we have been opposing NEET right from its introduction. Now it is very clear that the NEET examinations are not being conducted properly, that NEET is not really required and there is a great scam involved. Hence, we would request that the Bill that was

unanimously passed in the State Legislature and pending assent by the President of India, should be cleared by the Union Government at the earliest.

Sir, it is important to note that the financial relationship between the Central Government and the State is dynamic and can change based on various factors including economic conditions, political alignments and policy priorities. We, being a significant economic contributor, urge the Union Government to give a fair share and greater autonomy to us in financial matters. The attitude of the Union is leading to doubts about fiscal federalism. Moreover, we call for a broader reassessment of fiscal federalism in India. The current trend of centralization is unsustainable and detrimental to the diverse needs of our States.

Sir, let us remember that India's strength lies in its diversity. Our federal structure is not a weakness to be overcome, but strength to be harnessed. By empowering States, we empower India. Never forget, by penalizing the people of Tamil Nadu for not voting for you, you are derailing federalism and the nation as well.

Sir, to conclude, this Budget missed a great opportunity to strengthen our federal structure and to drive equitable growth across all regions. We, in Tamil Nadu, stand ready to contribute our fair share but we also demand our fair due. It is time for a new fiscal federalism that respects State autonomy, rewards performance and works towards the collective progress of our nation. Let us work together to build an India where every State can thrive, where diversity is celebrated and where the spirit of cooperative federalism truly prevails.

Sir, you have forgotten Tamil Nadu, Tamil and *Thirukkural* because the elections are over. Since the Prime Minister and the hon. Finance Minister were fond of *Thirukkural* before the Elections, I would like to conclude by quoting *Thirukkural*. Recently, everybody talked about *Sengol*, the scepter. Somebody has misinformed them that the scepter is translated into Tamil as *Sengol*. That is not so. Scepter is only known as *kol*. If they actually read chapters 55 and 56 of the *Thirukkural*, they would find the words *sengol* and *kodungol*. When you deliver a good government, it is called *sengol*. If you deliver a bad, worse or tyrannical government, it is called *kodungol*. Sir, let me quote, with your permission, one *Thirukkural* -- the English translation of which says: "the Government of a nation would get spoilt every day if the Government does not do justice every other day." In the matter of finance, in the matter of governance, in every walk of life, if the Government does not act in a just manner, the Government will be spoilt every day.

Sir, I want to bring one more thing to the attention of the Chair. On page 2, paragraph 4 -- I would be finishing it, Sir -- there is a sentence. It is mentioned in the interim Budget, on page 2, first line. It reads, "We need to focus on four major

castes, namely, poor, women, youth and farmers." These are not castes. These are the sections of people. I do not know how the Finance Ministry terms them as 'castes' of this country. I conclude by saying that the Budget and the attitude of the Union Government show who you are. The people of India will decide whether you are having a Sengol or kodungol. According to us, your rule is a Kodungol. People will teach a proper lesson to you. Thank you, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sanjeev Arora. You have five minutes.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA (Punjab): Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for giving me a chance to speak on the Budget, especially today. I would like to speak on health sector vis-a-vis this Budget. India is ranked at 158<sup>th</sup> place out of 196 countries on Government health expenditure. The source of this information is the 134<sup>th</sup> Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Health and Family Welfare. If we see globally, healthcare expenditure in most of the countries, on an average, is 8-12 per cent of the GDP, whereas we, in India, where it is needed the most, are still below two per cent. It goes up to 17 per cent in the U.S.A. There could be some exceptions. I have taken most of the countries in the world where expenditure on health is 8-12 per cent. It was NDA Government's target in 2017 that by 2025, the expenditure on health would be 2.5 per cent of the GDP, and it was also mentioned in the National Health Policy drafted by the NDA Government. But, here we stand in 2024-25, and it is still less than 2 per cent.

Then, out-of-pocket expenditure, as per Government record or Government report, is around 50 per cent. This is as per the National Health Accounts Estimates, but this is far from truth for one reason that there is much of expenditure being incurred in the form of OPD charges, radiology, pathology and purchase of medicines which happens in cash, which is not reported, but the other part is reported fully. So, there is a private report which states that if we take into account all these expenditures, the total out-of-pocket expenditure comes to 60 per cent, which is very high. The world average of out-of-pocket expenditure is 18 per cent. In a State like Uttar Pradesh, which is bigger than many countries, the out-of-pocket expenditure - - this is again as per a Government report -- is more than 70 per cent. So, in India, out-of-pocket expenditure is more than three times than the global average, which is pushing many people into poverty.

Now, coming to the allocation for health in Budget, in 2023-24, the Budget Estimate was Rs.86,175 crores, whereas the Revised Estimate was Rs.77,624 crores, which means, as it is, it is less than 2 per cent of the GDP and then the amount being

spent is even lesser than what is being shown in the Budget. It is not like Rs.1,000 or Rs.500 crore less, but it is a gap of Rs.10,000 crores. This time, the Budget Estimate for 2024-25 is Rs.87,656 crores which is only 1 per cent increase in the total health expenditure from the last year's Budget. I mean, it is not even close to the inflation.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have used 80 per cent of your time already.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: Why Sir?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Only one minute is left.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: No, Sir, don't say that. Sir, your clock runs fast.

MR. CHAIRMAN: You are talking of those figures and you are losing your own track. Please conclude.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: I will be quick. I am thankful to Shri Sanjay Singh. He gave me his turn. I do not want to take much time and I will be quick.

Coming to the issue of Research and Development in the medical field, we need to spend a lot because some of the medicines, which are being imported, cost crores of rupees. ...(*Time-bell rings.*)... Forget about cancer medicines, there are many other medicines. Sir, under Pradhan Mantri Ayushman Bharat Health Infrastructure Mission, the Budget Estimate of last year was Rs. 645 crores and only Rs. 200 crores were spent. Why is it that in the health sector, which is required the most, the amounts are not being spent?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Arora, you are already over time.

SHRI SANJEEV ARORA: I am concluding, Sir. I have not finished all my points but I am concluding. I will straightway come to the last point.

To take care of all the issues, which I mentioned and which I could not, the only way forward is to increase the Budget allocation for health sector and make healthcare affordable for all. To begin with, I would request the hon. Finance Minister to increase Budget allocation to 2.5 per cent as mentioned in 2017 Report of National Health Policy.

Sir, I would also like to request the hon. Health Minister, Nadda ji, to use his good offices and get the needful done for ailing health care sector. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Sujeet Kumar. You have 25 minutes.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR (Odisha): Mr. Chairman, Sir, at the outset, I would like to convey a message from my Party President, Shri Naveen Patnaik, with regard to the Budget, and, I quote: "BJP had put Special Category Status in their manifesto as a promise to the people of Odisha. However, this promise has not been considered for Odisha whereas special packages allocating crores of rupees have been announced for Andhra Pradesh and Bihar. Along with this, the demand of Odisha for revision of coal royalty, which has been pending for years with the Central Government, has been rejected, because of which the State will lose thousands of crores of revenue every year. During the election campaign, a lot of big promises were made to the people of Odisha in different sectors, especially, agriculture, MSME and industry. There is no mention of any promise being fulfilled in this Budget. This is a complete neglect of Odisha and its people. Today, the most serious issue being faced by the common public is inflation or price rise and unemployment. This Budget does not have any considerable intervention to address these two major issues. I am happy to see that there is a focus on tourism in Odisha. I hope, this is substantial and we shall await the details. I would say that along with people of Odisha, I feel disappointed at the continued neglect of Odisha while the State contributes so much to the country.

Sir, people across the country are feeling disappointed with this Budget, and, particularly, the people of Odisha are feeling let down with this Budget pronouncement. Andhra Pradesh and Bihar have received huge Budget bonanza. Let me give you some examples. An outlay of Rs. 26,000 crore has been given to Bihar for road projects. About Rs. 15,000 crores this fiscal -- and more in the coming years -- has been given for the development of capital city of Amravati.

The Central Government has announced that it will support loans from multilateral agencies for Bihar and Andhra Pradesh. The Minister has also announced a Backward Region Grant for three Districts of Odisha. Lest I am misunderstood, I would like to clarify that we do not grudge this Budget bonanza for Bihar and Andhra Pradesh. In fact, we are happy for our brothers and sisters of Andhra Pradesh and Bihar that they have got this budgetary support. But why has this step-motherly treatment given to Odisha? Why have we been neglected? Are we not part of '*Purvodaya*', which the hon. Prime Minister has been talking about? Why is this appeasement to allies at the cost of States like Odisha, Jharkhand and others? Can we have a *Viksit Bharat* without having a *Viksit Odisha and Viksit Jharkhand*?

Sir, a mention was made of the KBK region of Odisha. I come from that part of Odisha, which is probably as backward as the three Districts for which special grant

has been announced in this Budget. Why is there no special grant for the KBK? Don't other States need loans and support from multilateral agencies? Will the Central Government support the other States also when they apply for loans from multilateral bodies?

Sir, I shall be failing in my duty if I do not share the concerns that I have from this Budget. Because this is the Council of States, it is my duty to also highlight the concerns and the neglect of Odisha in the Budget of 2024-25. The first concern that I have is regarding R&D. As a nation, we spend less than 0.7 per cent of our GDP on R&D, which is abysmally low. In comparison to this, China spends 2 per cent, the USA spends 3.06 per cent, South Korea spends 4.6 per cent and Israel spends 4.9 per cent of its GDP on R&D. How can we become a *Viksit Bharat* without focussing on innovation and R&D? I am so disappointed that this Budget does not have adequate focus and priority for R&D.

The second concern I have is with regard to education. When it comes to spending on education and health, I am reminded of the French Literature Laureate, Andre Gide, who said, "Everything that needs to be said has already been said but since no one was listening, everything must be said again."

[THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON, (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU) *in the Chair.*]

In her Budget speech last year, the hon. Finance Minister listed out seven priorities, which she called *Saptarishis*. I was very disappointed last year as well, Madam, that Education was not one of the *Saptarishis*. This year, she has articulated nine priorities, and again, Education is not one of the priorities in her list. We all know that investment in Education is the foundation of a nation. Way back, in the 1960s, the Kothari Commission and now the New Education Policy of 2020 have been talking of investing at least 6 per cent of our GDP on Education. We are nowhere close to that. We are, at best, spending 3 per cent of our GDP. If you add the State Budget, it will probably become 4 per cent of the GDP. But it is nowhere near 6 per cent of the GDP, which has been recommended by the Kothari Commission and also our New Education Policy. Madam, a small State like Odisha, last year, under the leadership of the then Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, allocated 13.2 per cent of the State's GDP on Education, which shows the commitment of the BJD Government and conviction of the BJD party towards Education. Madam, let me quote a few lines from the New Education Policy itself. "The aim must be for India to have an education system by 2040 that is second to none with equitable access to the highest quality education for all learners regardless of socio-economic background." Inadequate

allocation to education does not match with these lofty goals of the NEP. I am afraid that the journey to 2040, which the NEP talks about, has started with a fractured leg. Instead of galloping to 2040, we will probably limp to 2040.

Again, the Government has grossly under-prioritized spending on food and nutrition, particularly for children. "PM POSHAN 2" and "Saksham Anganwadi" are two of the flagship schemes of the WCD Ministry of the Government of India. The Revised Estimates for the financial year 2023-24 was Rs. 21,523 crore for these two flagship schemes, which has been reduced to Rs. 21,200 crore in this year's Budget Estimates, a deduction of over Rs. 300 crore from last year's allocation. Will this not show up in poorer learning and education outcome? If you reduce the allocation for the Mid Day Meal Scheme for POSHAN, for Saksham Anganwadi, will that not reflect in poor learning outcome for our children?

The third concern that I have is regarding Defence. As a regional party, Biju Janata Dal, and our party president, Shri Naveen Patnaik, have always stood with successive Governments when it comes to the nation's security, unity and integrity. We have always stood with the Government in Delhi when it comes to defending our borders, when it comes to the unity and integrity of our country. Madam, at 6.22 lakh crore which is roughly 75 billion US dollar, the total allocation for Defence marks a marginal hike of 4.79 per cent from the BE of last year. According to the Stockholm-based policy think tank called SIPRI, China spends over 300 billion dollars on defence every year. And this is not even the official number. Because the official numbers from China are unreliable. They are fudged. Unofficial estimates claim that China spends over 700 billion dollars on Defence. That is the difference we are talking about. The number is 75 billion dollars for India whereas for China, it is over 300 billion dollars officially and unofficially it is 700 billion dollars. This accounts for less than two per cent of our GDP. Less than two per cent of the GDP is spent on Defence. Many Parliamentary Standing Committees on Defence have recommended that as a nation we should spend at least over three per cent of our GDP on Defence. We are extremely proud of our Armed Forces who are guarding our borders and giving us this safety net. Our Armed Forces have to be battle ready. They have to be constantly ready to meet any eventuality, particularly when we have a very belligerent, aggressive and hostile nation called China in our Indo-Tibet border. This is why I urge the Finance Minister to ensure that adequate funding is allocated to the Defence. I hope that they have done the math but I want to ensure that adequate funding is allocated to the Defence.

My fourth concern is with regard to sports. At Rs.3,442.32 crore, the budget for the sports Ministry has been marginally hiked by 45.36 crore from the previous

year. It is only a marginal increase of 45 crore. With this lousy focus on sports, no wonder we are not in the top 30 sporting countries in the world. A country aspiring to be a five-trillion dollar economy spending less than half a billion dollar on sports is certainly not encouraging. We are talking of becoming a five-trillion dollar economy in the next one or two years but we are spending less than half a billion dollars on sports. It would not be out of place to bring to the attention of this House how Odisha has emerged as the sports hub of the country. Under the leadership of our visionary former Chief Minister, Shri Naveen Patnaik, Odisha successfully hosted two Men's Hockey World Cups twice in a row. We built the world's largest hockey stadium, in terms of seating capacity, called the Birsā Munda Hockey Stadium in Rourkela which has made the entire nation proud. Odisha is the first and the only State to sponsor both the men's hockey team and the women's hockey team of the country.

The fifth concern is with regard to unemployment. Unemployment, as everyone would agree, is a very urgent and pressing issue facing the country. In fact, the Economic Survey, which came out a couple of days ago, has estimated that the Indian economy needs 78.5 lakh jobs every year on an average until 2030 in the non-farm sector to cater to the rising workforce. We need 78.5 lakh jobs every year in the non-farm sector to meet the rising demand of employment. Which sector creates jobs? It is the MSMEs that create jobs for the country. It is the MSMEs that create wealth for the country. But, unfortunately, we did not see adequate focus on MSMEs in this Budget. I will give you some examples, Madam. I am happy that MUDRA Loan ceiling has been hiked from Rs.10 lakh to Rs.20 lakh. But talk to any rural entrepreneur and talk to any woman entrepreneur in the country, you will come to know how difficult it is to access a MUDRA loan. They will tell you horror stories. It is so difficult to access MUDRA loan. So this hike in ceiling from Rs.10 lakh to Rs.20 lakh unfortunately will not do much for rural entrepreneurs and women entrepreneurs. We recommend that the Government should give preference to local MSMEs in Government contracts and tenders up to Rs.20 crore. That will boost the local economy and the local ecosystem. We urge the Government of India to hike the GST waiver for companies, which is Rs.20 lakh now, to Rs.2 crore. MSMEs need relief from the compliance burden that they face. I am so glad that the hon. Finance Minister spoke about Jan Vishwas Bill 2.0. I request her and the Government to expedite such a Bill which will ensure that our MSMEs are not burdened with compliances.

Madam, I would like to make a mention of gig workers. Today, we have about 15 million gig workers in the country. Some estimates say that by 2030, we will have 90 million, that is, nine crore gig workers in the country. We were expecting that in the



Budget Speech, hon. Finance Minister will announce a platform for gig workers, a fund for gig workers, where gig workers can register themselves. Today, we do not know because companies are not mandated to register gig workers. Companies like Zomato, Ola, Uber, etc. are not mandated to register gig workers. So, we do not know whether gig workers are employed or not. I sincerely had hoped that the hon. Finance Minister would have announced a fund and a platform where gig workers could have been registered. If numbers are to be believed, today, less than nine lakh gig workers are registered whereas we have about 1.5 crore which will increase to about nine crore by 2030. The reason I speak about gig workers is because they not only help generate employment but the best part is that they bridge the gap in terms of gender unemployment. Because of the flexible working hours, more women are able to join as gig workers. And if we focus on such a database or on a fund for gig workers, then I think we can empower more women to enter our workforce.

Madam, the sixth concern I have is with regard to internship and CSR issue. In the Budget Speech, the hon. Finance Minister called for Top 500 Corporations to bear 10 per cent of the internship cost from CSR kitty. This is neither desirable nor is it acceptable from a legal point of view because internship is something which benefits the company directly or indirectly. To allow a company to adjust that amount against CSR fund is not ethical. It is not desirable because less money will be available from CSR kitty to be spent on social sector, charitable activities, etc. So, if you allow a company, which will benefit from internship, to adjust that CSR money, then less money will be available for other activities, which is not desirable. Again, from a legal point of view, I think, there is an ambiguity in the legal regime. I would read the General Statutory Rules, 2021. It says, 'The CSR projects or programmes or activities that benefit the employees of a company and their families shall not be considered as CSR activities in accordance with Section 135 of the Companies Act.' I am reading from the General Statutory Rules of 2021. Section 135 of the Companies Act is very clear that anything that benefits the employees of the company or their family members cannot be considered as CSR. So, I do not know how this budgetary pronouncement will be on the right side of the law. Rather, what the Government could have done is to mandate that the companies contribute from their actual salary expenditure and could have paid the interns.

Madam, the seventh concern that I have is with regard to tourism. Now, all of us know that tourism is a growth engine of the economy; tourism creates jobs; it brings in foreign exchange; it has multiplier effect. Some studies have estimated that it contributes about 2.8 per cent to our GDP directly and close to nine per cent to our GDP indirectly. About four crore jobs are generated because of tourism industry

which is roughly eight per cent of the total employment of the country. I am also heartened to note that the hon. Finance Minister spoke of Odisha. She spoke of the abundant natural beauty; she spoke of the rich cultural legacy in Odisha, majestic temple architecture, classical dance, music, pristine beaches, wildlife, etc. So, I would really thank her on behalf of the people of Odisha for that. But similar to the announcement for Bihar, we were expecting a specific and structured package for development of tourism in Odisha which was not there in the Budget. I have a couple of suggestions.

#### 4.00 P.M.

First is about the Bali Yatra. Madam, the erstwhile name of Odisha is Kalinga and Kalinga had a very rich and illustrious tradition of maritime history. The seafarers of Kalinga used to go as far as Java, Sumatra and Bali to trade and to commemorate this glorious tradition of maritime history, every year, in the month of November, a festival called Bali Yatra is celebrated in the historic city of Cuttack. Our leader, Shri Naveen Patnaik, has many a time urged the Centre to accord the status of national maritime heritage to Odisha's Bali Yatra festival. In fact, when hon. Prime Minister was in Bali for the G-20 Summit in 2022, he made a mention of Bali Yatra. So, that is the importance and significance of this festival but it has not been accorded the status of national maritime heritage festival. I urge the Government to consider this request.

Second is Dhanu Yatra. Dhanu Yatra is the world's largest open air theatre. It is a theatrical festival celebrating *Ras Leela*, celebrating the life of Lord Krishna and it is the world's largest open air theatre. It should be recognized as a national festival and included in the list of fairs and festivals of India.

Odisha is the place that gave birth to a new religious cult called the Mahima Dharma which talks of international well being. It was popularized by Sant Bhima Bhoi with his immortal words "Witnessing the plethora of plights on earth how one could bear with; let the world get redeemed at my cost." It means, "how could one witness and bear with the plethora of plights of fellow human beings? Let the world get redeemed at my cost." Madam, these immortal words are inscribed on the walls of the United Nations in different languages. So, the place of birth of Sant Bhima Bhoi should also be developed.

India is the origin of Buddhism. We all know and we are proud of this fact that India is the motherland of Buddhism. There are many Buddhist sites in India like

---

\* English translation of the original speech delivered in Odia.

Lalitgiri, Udayagiri and Ratnagiri where you had Pushpagiri and Parimalgiri Universities as recorded by the Chinese Scholar Hiuen Tsang. Now, this could be developed to attract tourists from East Asia and South East Asia particularly. Also, a Central University for the study of Buddhism and Buddhist philosophy should be established in Odisha.

Madam, my eighth concern is with regards to fiscal federalism. A lot has already been said about it but I would just quickly repeat. The size of the divisible pool of taxes has been going down. The Fifteenth Finance Commission had recommended that 41 per cent of the divisible pool should be devolved to the States but the actual share received by the States has been decreasing. In F.Y. 2022-23, it was 35.1 per cent. In the R.E. of F.Y. 2023-24, it was 36 per cent. In this year's B.E., it is 35.5 per cent which is against the spirit of the federal structure of the Constitution.

Madam, finally, I would come to the neglect of Odisha. My Party President Shri Naveen Patnaik has time and again raised these issues of negligence with the past and the present Central Government when it comes to tele-density, national highways, coastal highways, railway, banking and cutting of funds for the scheduled areas and for KBK. We have been urging that special consideration should be given to Odisha when it comes to the Disaster Response Fund. It is a known fact that almost every year now Odisha witnesses super cyclones or cyclones. So, we request that the sharing pattern under the Disaster Response Fund should be 90:10 at par with the Himalayan States against the 60:40 that is there today. Secondly, the Finance Commission has also recommended that a devolution of Rs.100 crores toward Odisha for drought prevention measures and Rs. 800 crores for strengthening the Early Warning System should be sanctioned.

Number two demand from Odisha is this. We have a 480 kilometres long coastline but today we have only three ports, a major port in Paradeep and two minor ports in Gopalpur and Dhamara. There is possibility of developing many other ports, particularly, in places like Astaranga, Subarnarekha and a riverine port in Mahakalpada. This would boost the economy of the State hugely and also stimulate and create jobs.

The third demand is with regard to the GST on *Kendu* leaves. *Kendu* leaf, under the Forest Right Act of 2006, can be collected by the tribal population. It has been categorized as a Minor Forest Produce (MFP). Sir, today 18 per cent GST is levied on *Kendu* leaf which is putting a huge burden on the *Kendu* leaf pluckers, on the seasonal workers and on the binders who are largely tribals. Ten lakh tribal population is dependent on these *Kendu* leaf economy. We demand that this 18 per cent GST should be waived off on *Kendu* leaves and this demand has also been

raised many a times by our hon. Party President in different fora. He has also written to the Union Government many a times on this.

Madam, the fourth demand is with regard to revision of coal royalty. Odisha being a coal-bearing State is at the forefront of coal production in the country thereby, helping and assisting in the energy security for our nation. But, I am sorry to point out that the coal royalty rate has remained stuck at 14 per cent since May of 2012. For the last 12 years, there has been no revision in the coal royalty despite the inflation and despite the changing economic circumstances. Many a time, Shri Naveen Patnaik has written to the Union of India and many a time, he has spoken to different Union Ministers for revision in the coal royalty structure but it has fallen into deaf ears. Hence, it is urgently essential that we need to revise and review this coal royalty structure.

Madam, regarding banking facilities today, 65 per cent of Gram Panchayats in Odisha do not have a banking facility. If I talk of the KBK region from where I come from, close to 75 per cent of the Gram Panchayats (GPs) do not have banking facility. We need support there.

Madam, regarding Railways, you will be shocked to know that the rail density in Odisha is 18 whereas the national rail density is close to 22. Our neighbouring States have much better rail density. We are very happy for them. But, we also demand that railway network should be enhanced in Odisha. East Coast Railways generate Rs. 20,000 crore revenue from Odisha but still our rail density is much lower and I come to the KBK area which is a cluster of eight districts, seven of which are part of the Aspirational District Programme of NITI *Aayog*. These eight districts are largely tribal and largely LWE -affected. (*Time-bell rings.*) The rail density is less than ten in single digit.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Please wind up. Your time is over.

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Madam, I will wind up in one minute. So, I and my party demand that there should be massive expansion of the rail network in Odisha and in the KBK region particularly. It is because connectivity is the lifeline of a nation and connectivity is the backbone of the economy.

Now, Madam, we have some specific demands with regard to Railways, Malkangiri to Bhadrachalam, Jeypore-Malkangiri, Jeypore-Nabarangpur, Theruvali-Gunupur, Kantibanji to Jeypore, Bargarh to Nuopada and Lanjigarh road to Phulbani are some of the railway projects that need immediate attention.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Kindly wind up. (*Time-bell rings.*)

SHRI SUJEET KUMAR: Madam, last point. I am winding up. There is an announcement of construction of a Loco workshop in a place called Narla in Kalahandi District. We are clueless as to what is happening with that. There is no progress on that. So, that is the final request.

Madam, I conclude by saying that in the last two decades, Odisha has witnessed remarkable transformation, remarkable socio-economic transformation but we are still not getting our dues. (*Time-bell rings.*)

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Shri Sanjay Yadav. He is not present. Shri Birendra Prasad Baishya. He is not present. Now, Shri Milind Murlu Deora; you have five minutes to speak.

SHRI MILIND MURLI DEORA (Maharashtra): Madam, for the time, from the hon. Parliamentary Affairs Minister, from the BJP's time, they have agreed to give me some time. Time is very flexible. ...(*Interruptions*)... महोदया, आपने मुझे इस वर्ष के केंद्रीय बजट पर बोलने का मौका दिया, इसके लिए मैं आपको धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ। क्योंकि समय कम है, इसलिए मैं अपने भाषण के माध्यम से सरकार को महत्वपूर्ण सुझाव देना चाहूंगा, बहुत ही प्वाइंटेड सजेसंस देना चाहूंगा। During the Motion of Thanks Speech, all of us spoke on various issues which were very political in nature. I would like to be very specific on issues going beyond politics. I am giving some very valuable suggestions to the Finance Ministry on issues that concern everybody in this House. For one, in my opinion, I firmly believe that every expenditure incentive subsidy of the Government of India should be directed towards one goal of achieving three very, very important objectives. The first objective is to create as much employment as possible, to on shore jobs that were lost to China and bring them to India. मैं मानता हूँ कि रोजगार ऐसा मुद्दा है, जिस पर पूरे सदन में आम सहमति या सर्वसम्मति होगी। Everybody wants to ensure we get the youth of India employed as quickly as possible. The second strategic objective for India in my opinion is to rework our supply chains and, again, reduce our dependence on countries that can become hostile towards us. The third very crucial objective is, while achieving and solving the unemployment problem, and while reworking and bringing supply chains to India, simultaneously, greening our economy. People have spoken about, in the Budget as well and in the Economy Survey also, how supply chains are being brought back. Madam, world over, the western countries which for the last two or three decades, moved their manufacturing

to a country like China are now adopting what is called the 'China Plus One' strategy. They are adding countries like India to their manufacturing mix. They are also adopting something called 'ABC' 'Anywhere But China'. ...(*Interruptions*)...

Madam, my limited point is, bringing manufacturing to India is very, very crucial. Yesterday in television debates, even some Members of the Opposition praised PLIs. With regard to PLIs or Production Linked Incentives, statistics aside, if you look at one important example, a company like Apple which manufactures iPhones, today, 14 per cent of Apple's global production worth 14 Billion Dollars is happening in India; thanks to Production Linked Incentives. Therefore, suggestion number one is, we must direct Production Linked Incentives to industries that create the maximum amount of employment. I also congratulate this Government for various initiatives that have led to the increase of women in the workforce. As a woman, you will also appreciate, from 23 per cent seven years ago, today, the number of women in our workforce has gone up to 37 per cent. People spoke about competitive federalism. I also believe this is very, very critical. The more is the competition between States, the more India will become competitive globally. Artificial Intelligence/data revolution is another area we need to focus on. I believe if we use incentives in the right direction, we can create indigenous capabilities in Artificial Intelligence and we can also green our economy. With regard to green transition-- Bhupender Yadav ji is here-- I would like to say that while India's goal is to become net zero by 2070, how do we use these incentives to benefit industries like offshore wind energy? Green data centres will be a game-changer. I am also glad that the Finance Minister spoke about investing in small modular reactors. Nuclear energy is an area we should all be open-minded about. Every country in the world, from western countries to China, to green their economy, are increasingly now going nuclear. In fact, one eye-opening statistics is, by 2035, China will double its share of nuclear power in electricity generation, and by 2060, it will reach almost 20 per cent. A very good example of that is a country called Sweden. Thirty years ago, they began greening their economy. Everyone said, "You would lose jobs". In three decades, they have reduced their carbon emissions by 80 per cent and they have also grown their economy two-fold.

Madam, I have a few quick suggestions. I come from Mumbai, which is the financial, commercial capital of this country. Today, increasingly, young people, some of whom who have no idea, have no investing experience, are increasingly investing in the F&O (Futures & Options) segment of the Indian stock market. SEBI, which is the regulator, has made repeated warnings that nine out of ten trades will lose money. I believe a better way to incentivize people to invest for the long term

and not to become day traders, is to reduce the Long-Term Capital Gains. One suggestion that I would give to this Government and to the hon. Finance Minister, LTCG or Long-Term Capital Gains have been increased from 10 to 12.5%. I would urge the Finance Minister to review that.

An important point I would like to make again about Mumbai. मैं सबसे पहले महाराष्ट्र की ओर से गर्वनमेंट ऑफ इंडिया और खासकर कैबिनेट कमेटी को बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद देना चाहता हूँ कि गर्वनमेंट ऑफ इंडिया ने 76 हजार करोड़ रुपये की वधावन पोर्ट को मंजूरी दी है। This will be an economic game changer for Maharashtra, for the Mumbai metropolitan region. But, I would like to say that today GIFT City in Gujarat is growing well. We are all very happy about it. But I firmly believe that today India has the depth to have another international finance center in a city like Mumbai. This is very important for us to understand that cities like Mumbai and GIFT are not competing against Bengaluru or against Hyderabad or against Chennai. Our competition is Dubai to the West and Singapore to the East. One last point very quickly. We talk about investments, we talk about statistics, we are talking about creating jobs. I want to give one very good example. In the last few years, and I have seen this with my own eyes in the last few months, मैं महाराष्ट्र गर्वनमेंट के मुख्य मंत्री और उप मुख्य मंत्री जी को बधाई देना चाहूंगा। मैं Home Minister को बधाई देना चाहूंगा, Gadchiroli was a naxal hotbed. Today, because of the efforts of the Government of India and the State Government, recently a *bhumi puja* was done for a 10,000 crores steel project, which will bring 7,000 jobs to Gadchiroli. It is very easy to talk about development; it is very easy to talk about creating jobs, but how you actually implement it, is very important. And, these are my limited suggestions. I was hoping to give more suggestions. But, I hope the Finance Minister will take these suggestions up. One is LTCG, second is Mumbai, the third is again to use all our incentives, expenditures, subsidies to achieve three primary objectives - creating jobs, reworking our supply chains and greening our economy. Thank you very much.

THE VICE-CHAIRPERSON (DR. KANIMOZHI NVN SOMU): Thank you very much.

[THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD) *in the Chair.*]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD): First of all, I thank hon. Chairman and our House leaders for giving me this opportunity. The next speaker is Mr. Birendra Prasad Baishya. You have five minutes to speak.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA (Assam): Sir, I, on behalf of my party, Asom Gana Parishad and President of my party, Shri Atul Bora, rise here to welcome the Budget and to support the Budget proposed by the hon. Finance Minister. I must compliment hon. Finance Minister for her presentation of Budget continuously for the seventh term. This is the achievement of the Madam Finance Minister. Sir, we are getting very little time. I hope BJP will give me some extra time.

Sir, I would like to draw the attention to the few points of this Budget. Firstly, everyone who has assembled here must admit that this Budget is for mothers and sisters of our country because this Budget proposes three lakhs crores for the beneficiaries of women and girls of our country. Secondly, success of any economic policy depends upon the three factors - agriculture, service and manufacturing. Under the leadership of Shri Narendra Modi's Government, this Government equally give importance to manufacturing sector, agricultural sector and servicing sector. So, we have continuously achieved seven per cent growth. This Budget is for the welfare of the farmers. It is the farmer's friendly Budget. This Budget has allocated Rs. 1.27 lakh crores for the farmers' welfare and the agriculture sector of our country. Sir, this Budget is a job-oriented budget. This Budget is going to invest Rs. 2.78 lakh crores for the infrastructure development, for the road and transport development of our country. This Budget has proposed Rs. 2.55 lakh crores for the development of Railways. It means more money will be flowing in the market and capital expenditure will increase. Capital expenditure increase means new Railway Stations will come, new jobs for Railway porters will come, new routes will come up and that means job creation is also coming up in our country. This Budget has given equal importance to job creation in our country.

Sir, one of the basic things that I have seen in this Budget is that this Budget has proposed to give Rs. 6000 per month to 1.5 crore youths to get the training for skill development. It will be helpful to reduce the unemployment in our country. Sir, I would like to draw the attention of this House to one more thing which is very important. Many people have talked about federalism; yes, this Budget has given Rs. 1.27 lakh crores as interest-free loans to the State Government for their infrastructure development. This is the spirit of federalism which is supported by the Narendra Modi Government. Sir, I am very happy that Madam Finance Minister announced in the House that this Government is going to help the flood-affected people of Assam. Madam Finance Minister in her Budget speech categorically said that they will help the flood situation in Assam. The per capita income of Assamese people has been higher than any part of the country before Independence. But, due to floods, our economy is going down. So, we want permanent solution for floods. During the discussion on



Motion of Thanks on the President's Address also, I have spoken about this issue that we want long-term and short-term projects from the Government to resolve the flood situation.

Sir, I know that long-term projects will take time. Recently, a steel plant is coming up in Assam. Thirty four districts of Assam are flood-affected, 34 districts of Assam today are under floods. Out of 34 districts, 7,279 villages of Assam are badly affected. The roads, the school and the colleges all are badly affected. So, this is the worst situation in Assam. But, I am very grateful to hon. Chief Minister of my State. (*Time-bell rings.*)

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (DR. BHAGWAT KARAD): Thirty seconds left, four-and-a half minutes of your time have been finished.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING; AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. L. MURUGAN): Sir, give some more time to the hon. Member.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Sir, hon. Chief Minister of my State, Shri Himanta Biswa Sarma, has physically visited each and every relief camp not aerially, but physically. So, this is the spirit of the State Government and State Government is taking all the possible measures to help the flood-affected people. I humbly request Government of India to look after the issue and give us handsome money to help the poor and flood-affected people.

Secondly, hon. Finance Minister categorically said in the House that flood is due to overseas issue. This flow of water is coming from China. So, a permanent solution is required. I request Government of India to include External Affairs Ministry and take up the issue with the Government of China to help us, to protect us from the floods. Sir, I must compliment Shri Narendra Modi because, for the first time, this Government is going to invest more than Rs. 27,000 crores for semiconductor in Assam. This is the first time it is going to happen in Assam. Sir, Rs. 27,000 crores are going to be invested.

I would like to say one more thing. This is the Government, under the leadership of Shri Narendra Modi, invested Rs. 35,000 crore for petroleum sector development in Assam. We are here for the development of Assam.

Sir, one of the major problems that Assam is facing today is relating to Assam Tea. Sir, Assam Tea is known to everybody. To boost our economy and to earn foreign exchange, Assam Tea industry plays a very important role in our country. This

tea industry, today, is suffering with a lot of problems. We are getting challenge from Kenya and Sri Lanka. So, to boost and save the tea industry of Assam, the Government of India should give some special package.

I would like to say one more thing. Small-tree growers play a very important role in addressing unemployment issue. They play a very important role. But, these small tea-growers, today, face serious problem. So, I would like to request, in the interest of unemployment situation in the country, because they are small tea-growers who play a very important and significant role not only in Assam's economy but also provide self-employment, help from the Government of India. The Government of Assam is making some better arrangement. It has already done some better arrangement to resolve the issue.

Another issue is that the Government of Assam is introducing mobile tea testing labs. Sir, small people cannot set up tea testing units. So, they are suffering a lot. And, without testing, their tea is not taken by big companies. So, I request the hon. Minister of Commerce and Industry give some money to permanently set up tea testing laboratories in the interest of small tea-growers. I hope this Government will provide this benefit as it will help to resolve the problem.

With these words, I thank you very much again for giving me this opportunity to speak on the Budget.

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश (झारखंड):** उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आपका बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद कि आपने मुझे महत्वपूर्ण विषय पर बोलने का अवसर प्रदान किया। सबसे पहले मैं अच्छा बजट, संतुलित बजट लाने के लिए देश के यशस्वी प्रधान मंत्री, नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का और वित्त मंत्री, निर्मला सीतारमण जी का दिल की गहराई से अभिनन्दन करना चाहता हूँ और उनको साधुवाद देना चाहता हूँ। यह बजट 144 करोड़ जनता की आकांक्षा का प्रतीक है। यह बजट अमृत काल में समाज के सभी वर्गों में अमृत वर्षा करने वाला बजट है। यह बजट विकसित भारत की नींव का पत्थर साबित होगा। यह विकसित भारत का रोडमैप है और यह बजट देश को आगे बढ़ाने वाला बजट साबित होगा। यह बजट नेशन फर्स्ट की भावनाओं से ओत-प्रोत बजट है। मैं इस सदन में स्वामी विवेकानन्द जी को स्मरण करना चाहता हूँ। 125 वर्ष पहले मिशिगन विश्वविद्यालय में स्वामी विवेकानन्द जी ने कहा था कि यह सभी आपका है, लेकिन 21वीं सदी भारत की होगी। यह सौभाग्य की बात है और ईश्वरीय प्रदत्त चीज़ है कि स्वामी विवेकानन्द का भी नाम नरेन्द्र था और नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का नाम भी नरेन्द्र है। इसलिए स्वामी विवेकानन्द ने भारत के बारे में संकल्प लिया था और उस संकल्प को नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने सिद्धि तक पहुंचाने का काम किया है। इसीलिए मैं नरेन्द्र मोदी जी का दिल की गहराई से अभिनन्दन करना चाहता हूँ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं जिस पार्टी का कार्यकर्ता हूँ, उस पार्टी की देश को समृद्धशाली बनाने की प्रतिबद्धता है। यह संकल्प कोई भारतीय जनता पार्टी के कालखंड में नहीं लिया गया है। जनसंघ के 1954 के अधिवेशन में भारत को समृद्धशाली बनाने का प्रस्ताव पारित होता है। 1969 में जनसंघ का जब अधिवेशन होता है, तो उसमें भारत को आर्थिक और सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण से

मजबूत बनाने का संकल्प लिया गया। जब 1980 में भारतीय जनता पार्टी की स्थापना होती है, तो भारत को समृद्धशाली, समर्थ भारत, स्वाभिमानी भारत और आत्मनिर्भर भारत बनाने का संकल्प भारतीय जनता पार्टी के स्थापना काल में लिया जाता है। इसलिए भारतीय जनता पार्टी के नेतृत्व में जब सरकारें रहती हैं, तब वे भारत का मान, सम्मान और स्वाभिमान बढ़ाने का काम करती हैं। कोरोना कालखंड के बाद से दुनिया की अर्थव्यवस्था वास्तव में बद से बदतर हो गई है। ऐसी विपरीत परिस्थिति में न केवल हमारे भारत ने स्थिति को संयम से संभाला, बल्कि आर्थिक गति को दशा और दिशा देते हुए देश की उन्नति का मार्ग प्रशस्त करने का कार्य सफलतापूर्वक किया और इस काम को करने वाले दुनिया के सर्वाधिक लोकप्रिय नेता का नाम नरेन्द्र मोदी जी है।

महोदय, आज देश की 144 करोड़ जनता का मान, सम्मान और स्वाभिमान केवल भारत में ही नहीं बढ़ा है, बल्कि दुनिया आज हर भारतीय को अच्छी नजर से देखने का काम करती है। यह है भारत का सामर्थ्य और इस सामर्थ्य को अगर किसी ने पहचाना है, तो देश के यशस्वी प्रधान मंत्री नरेन्द्र मोदी जी ने पहचाना है। केवल देश ही नहीं, बल्कि दुनिया की कई संस्थाएं भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था के संदर्भ में जो विचार प्रकट करती हैं, तो उससे देश की 144 करोड़ जनता का मस्तक ऊंचा हो जाता है। महोदय, मैं कुछ बातों को आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। भारत में विश्व बैंक के जो केंद्रीय डायरेक्टर हैं - Auguste Tano Kouamé, उन्होंने कहा कि भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था - भारी दबावों के बावजूद भारत के सेवा निर्यात में वृद्धि जारी है और चालू खाते का घाटा कम हो रहा है। इसके अलावा वर्ल्ड बैंक ने अपनी एक रिपोर्ट में कहा है कि दक्षिण एशिया की कुल अर्थव्यवस्था में भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था सबसे बड़ी है। भारत की विकास दर में सबसे अहम सेवा क्षेत्र और औद्योगिक विकास होगा।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, इंटरनेशनल मॉनिटरी फंड ने क्या कहा - राजकोषीय अनुशासन बनाए रखने के लिए भारतीय अर्थव्यवस्था की सराहना की जानी चाहिए और क्या कहा - भारत वैश्विक वृद्धि में 17 प्रतिशत का योगदान करेगा। भारत में महंगाई लगातार कम हो रही है। भले ही उनको जानकारी नहीं हो, लेकिन दुनिया को मालूम है कि कांग्रेस को छोड़कर, विपक्षियों को छोड़कर दुनिया मानती है कि दुनिया में महंगाई बढ़ रही है और भारत में महंगाई दर कम हो रही है। **...(व्यवधान)...** आईएमएफ ने और क्या कहा? आईएमएफ ने दुनिया में भारत की अर्थव्यवस्था को स्टार परफॉर्मर की संज्ञा दी।

डिजिटलीकरण और बुनियादी ढाँचे जैसे प्रमुख क्षेत्रों में आर्थिक सुधारों के कारण भारत की विकास दर मजबूती से बनी हुई है। आईएमएफ का और भी कहना है कि भारत में घरेलू माँग लगातार मजबूत बनी हुई है, नौजवान आबादी बढ़ रही है, जो उत्पादन बढ़ाने में सहयोग देगी और भारत को आर्थिक विकास करने से कोई रोक नहीं सकता है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपके माध्यम से कुछ योजनाएँ, जो बजट में आई हैं, उनका अभिनंदन करना चाहता हूँ। मैं झारखंड का निवासी हूँ और मुझे गर्व है कि मैं झारखंड का निवासी हूँ। भारत सरकार ने झारखंड को आगे बढ़ाने में कोई कसर नहीं छोड़ी है और उसके तहत बजट में जो 'पूर्वोदय योजना' है, उस 'पूर्वोदय योजना' के लिए प्रधान मंत्री जी का अभिनंदन करना चाहता हूँ। इस योजना के द्वारा झारखंड सहित पूर्वी भारत के विकास को बढ़ावा मिलेगा, जिससे बुनियादी ढाँचे, उद्योग तथा अन्य योजनाओं से विकास की किरणें तेज होंगी और झारखंड ही

नहीं, बल्कि पश्चिमी बंगाल, बिहार, ओडिशा जैसे राज्य, जहाँ कांग्रेस के कालखंड में विकास की किरणें पहुँच नहीं पाई थीं, वहाँ इस बजट के माध्यम से विकास की किरणें धरातल तक पहुँचेंगी।

मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट में संघीय ढाँचे के बारे में उल्लेख किया गया है, राज्य के आर्थिक विकास में संघीय सहायता का उल्लेख किया गया है, राज्यों के लेनदेन की प्रणाली को लचीला बनाया गया है। मेरी सरकार की मान्यता है, केंद्र सरकार की मान्यता है, मोदी जी की सरकार की मान्यता है कि केंद्र और राज्य, दोनों एक दूसरे के पूरक हैं और दोनों के संबंध अन्योन्याश्रय होने चाहिए। किंतु उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, आज मुझे बड़ी पीड़ा हुई। आज सुबह जब मैं यहाँ पर आया, तो एक प्रकार से कांग्रेस और विपक्षी दलों की भूमिका देखने से हमारे जैसे लोगों की आत्मा को वास्तव में बहुत तकलीफ हुई। मैं इस बात का उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ कि इस बजट में देश के सभी राज्यों को आर्थिक सहायता देने का उल्लेख किया गया है। बिहार को अगर सड़कों के निर्माण के लिए कुछ अलग से योजना दी गई है, तो विपक्षियों को भी खुशी होनी चाहिए, लेकिन जिस प्रकार से कांग्रेसियों ने बिहार को आर्थिक सहायता देने पर सदन से वॉकआउट करने का काम किया, उससे वास्तव में बिहार के सभी बिहारी ही नहीं, बल्कि देश के अंदर जो बिहार के निवासी हैं, कांग्रेस ने उनकी आत्मा पर प्रहार करने का काम किया है। इसलिए बिहार के निवासी और बिहार के वे लोग, जो दूसरे प्रदेश में रहते हैं, कांग्रेस ने उनकी आत्मा पर जो प्रहार करने का काम किया है, यह सबसे दुखद बात है। अगर बिहार को कोई अतिरिक्त सहायता मिलती है, तो आपको परेशानी किस बात की है! आपके कलेजे पर साँप क्यों लोटता है! और तो और, जब मैं बिहार जाता हूँ, तो वहाँ पर आपके दल के लोग कहते हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपके दल के लोग कहते हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**... आपके दल के लोग कहते हैं, ...**(व्यवधान)**... कहते हैं कि केंद्र सरकार से क्या सहयोग मिला। जब केंद्र की सरकार सहयोग करती है, तो आपके पसीने क्यों छूटते हैं? 'पसीना' शब्द तो *unparliamentary* नहीं है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... साँप भी नहीं है। यह मुहावरा है। बहुत ही आपत्तिजनक है। ...**(व्यवधान)**... इसी कारण से आज आप उस पक्ष में हैं और हम इस पक्ष में हैं। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

महोदय, इस बजट में रोजगार के संदर्भ में - वास्तव में यह पहली सरकार है, केन्द्र में मोदी जी की सरकार, जो रोजगार देने के लिए कृतसंकल्प है। मेरे ख्याल से शायद यह पहली बार हुआ होगा कि रोजगार पाने वाला भी लाभार्थी होगा और रोजगार देने वाला भी लाभार्थी होगा। यह इस बजट का सबसे बड़ा खूबसूरत पहलू है। नौकरी में प्रवेश करने वाले 50 लाख युवाओं को 1 महीने का PFI - क्या यह कोई छोटी बात है? 25,000 नौजवानों को जॉब की ट्रेनिंग दी जाएगी। क्या यह कोई छोटी बात है? अपने कालखंड में तो आपने इसका विचार नहीं किया। पहली बार जो नौकरी पाएगा, उसको 1 महीने का वेतन - मुझे तो 1974 के आंदोलन को पढ़ने पर स्मरण आता है कि उस वक्त देश की जनता ने आपके खिलाफ बेरोजगारी के सवाल पर, महंगाई के सवाल पर, भ्रष्टाचार के सवाल पर आंदोलन किया था और साथ-साथ तानाशाही के खिलाफ आंदोलन किया था।

इस बजट में मोदी जी की सरकार ने आर्थिक विकास के संदर्भ में भी एक लक्ष्य रखने का काम किया है। इसमें आर्थिक विकास को 10.5 प्रतिशत तक बढ़ाने का लक्ष्य रखा गया है। इस बजट के अंदर निवेश को बढ़ाने का संकल्प है और इस बजट में निवेश को बढ़ा कर, व्यापार को

सुगम बनाकर, रोजगार का सृजन करने का संकल्प लिया गया है। यह एक ऐसी पहली सरकार है, जो मोदी जी की सरकार है।

महोदय, मैं आपसे निवेदन करते हुए कुछ तुलनात्मक विवरण भी रखना चाहता हूँ। आपके कालखंड में जीडीपी का जो रेट था, जो विकास दर थी, वह 6.7 परसेंट थी और आज जब एनडीए की सरकार है, तो यह 7.3 प्रतिशत है। आपके पूर्व वित्त मंत्री जी ने इन्फ्लेशन के बारे में खूब भाषण दिया। असत्य आंकड़े खड़ा करने का काम किया। मैं मुद्रास्फीति के बारे में उल्लेख करना चाहता हूँ। इन्फ्लेशन का जो रेट यूपीए के कालखंड में 10.1 प्रतिशत था, आज एनडीए गठबंधन की सरकार में, मोदी जी के सरकार के नेतृत्व में इन्फ्लेशन का रेट 4.6 प्रतिशत है। ये आंकड़े हमारे नहीं हैं, ये आंकड़े आपके भी नहीं हैं, ये स्टैटिस्टिकल आंकड़े हैं। आंकड़े सच बोलते हैं और आपको इन आंकड़ों का सामना करना पड़ेगा। अगर आपके समय के इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर की बात की जाए, तो सड़कों के निर्माण में, आपके समय में प्रत्येक दिन 12 किलोमीटर सड़क बनाने का काम होता था, यह आपने किया था और आज एनडीए के सरकार में, वर्तमान में प्रत्येक दिन 28 किलोमीटर सड़क बनती है। यूपीए के कालखंड में आपने एलपीजी के एक करोड़ कनेक्शंस का वितरण किया था और एनडीए की सरकार में, मोदी जी की सरकार में 13 करोड़ एलपीजी कनेक्शंस हमारी माताओं और बहनों के घरों तक पहुंचाने का काम किया गया। ...**(व्यवधान)**... हाँ, आप ठीक कह रही हैं, उनके घरों में भी पहुंचा। ...**(व्यवधान)**... अटल जी के शासन के बाद आप सत्ता में आए और आपको तो एक अच्छी विरासत मिली थी।

**(सभापति महोदय पीठासीन हुए)**

उस समय आपको एक अच्छी अर्थव्यवस्था विरासत के रूप में मिली थी, लेकिन आपने 2014 में मोदी जी को एक ऐसी अर्थव्यवस्था विरासत में देने का काम किया, जिसके बारे में बोलने में भारत का हर व्यक्ति शर्मसार होता है। आपने भारत को पूरी तरह से घोटालों का देश बनाने का काम किया। आपने जंगल, जमीन तथा आकाश से लेकर पाताल तक घोटालों का रिकॉर्ड खड़ा करने का काम किया। आपके शासन काल में पूरी तरह से financial anarchism था। बैंकिंग सिस्टम पूरी तरह से collapsed था और आज भारत का बैंकिंग सिस्टम पूरी दुनिया में सबसे बेहतर है। आपने इसको किस हाल में छोड़ दिया था? आपके मंत्री तथा आपके लोग पूँजीपतियों को चुटके देते थे और चुटकों के सहारे आप लोगों ने बैंक को खाली करने का काम किया, इसलिए आज आप पर से लोगों का विश्वास उठ चुका है।

महोदय, यह बजट ज्ञान पर आधारित है और गरीब, यूथ, अन्नदाता, नारी और मध्यम वर्ग पर आधारित है। यह बजट वास्तव में एक अनोखा बजट है और इस बजट में मैनुफैक्चरिंग, इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर और सर्विस सेक्टर के माध्यम से, सस्टेनेबल डेवलपमेंट, सस्टेनेबल ग्रोथ के माध्यम से समाज के सभी वर्गों का उत्थान करने का लक्ष्य रखा गया है।...**(समय की घंटी)**...

सभापति महोदय, मुझे एक मिनट का और समय दीजिए। मैं मानता हूँ कि जिस प्रकार से भारत ने हेल्थ सेक्टर में एक युगांतकारी परिवर्तन लाने का काम किया है, उसी तरह से स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं को और बेहतर करने के लिए केन्द्र की सरकार लगातार काम कर रही है, लेकिन मैं आज इस सदन में एक रोचक प्रसंग रखना चाहता हूँ। वह रोचक प्रसंग यह है कि मैं झारखंड से आता हूँ

और वहाँ पर कोडरमा जिला है और उस जिला में एक महिला को 12 बार बच्चा होना दिखाया गया है।...(समय की घंटी)... महोदय, सामाजिक सुरक्षा अभियान का कैसा लूट-पाट होता है, मैं उस संबंध में झारखंड की एक प्रसंग का उल्लेख करके अपनी बात खत्म करूँगा।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, you are already over time.

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश:** सर, मैं अपनी बात खत्म कर रहा हूँ। झारखंड में 'जननी सुरक्षा योजना' का किस प्रकार से लूट-पाट है, वह मैं बताना चाहता हूँ। वहाँ पर काँग्रेस की सरकार है, झारखंड मुक्ति मोर्चा की सरकार है, आरजेडी की सरकार है। वहाँ पर एक महिला को एक दिन में 12 बार बच्चा पैदा होना दिखाया गया है। इतना ही नहीं, बल्कि एक पुरुष को भी बच्चा पैदा होना दिखाया गया है। इससे दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण और क्या हो सकता है? यह इनकी सरकार, झारखंड की सरकार का कृत है। कमाल है, कई वैज्ञानिक आज इस खोज में लगे हुए हैं, लेकिन झारखंड की सरकार...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, you were concluding; you were concluding. Please conclude. Take half a minute.

**श्री दीपक प्रकाश:** सर, मैं आधा मिनट में अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ। मैं मानता हूँ कि देश की आजादी के बाद जब 1951 में फर्स्ट फाइव ईयर प्लान बना था, उसी में कहीं न कहीं खोटा था।...(समय की घंटी)... सर, इसी के साथ मैं अपनी बात समाप्त करता हूँ, धन्यवाद।

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. No, you are not rounding up. Hon. Members, after Shrimati Sagarika Ghose concludes her address, we will be taking up all the Special Mentions. Shrimati Sagarika Ghose - 15 minutes.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE (West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I rise to speak on behalf of my Party, the All-India Trinamool Congress, on the Union Budget presented by the hon. Finance Minister.

Inequality, inequality, inequality - this is the fundamental crisis facing our country today. This inequality crisis has not been addressed by this Budget, nor has it been addressed by the previous 10 Budgets of this Government. The Government is constantly telling us that it is pushing us into more and more growth, but it is pushing us into more and more inequality. This Government is pushing us into what I call "The Inequality Trap". The Paris-based World Inequality Lab has said, in its 2024 Report, that India's 'Billionaire Raj' has replaced the 'British Raj'. India is more unequal now than what it was in 1920s, in the colonial period. Sir, I want to repeat that India in 2024 is more unequal than what it was under the colonial rule in the 1920s. That is the catastrophe of inequality facing us. That is why the Budget needs to be about the real

people, the real India, the real issues and not about fantasy land, not about Disney land.

Here are some facts about inequality. The top one per cent of India controls 40 per cent of the country's wealth. Real earnings of regular salaried and self-employed have declined or remained stagnant. The hon. Finance Minister claimed that the GST has benefited the common man. But the truth is that 67 per cent of the GST is paid by the poorest 50 per cent of India. India is a country where 800 million people still depend on free food. The Budget needed to challenge, needed to address this inequality trap. It needed to tackle The Inequality Trap. It has failed to do so.

I wanted to present five examples of the inequality trap. The first is The Inequality Trap with regard to the States. The second is The Inequality Trap with regard to the rural areas. The third is The Inequality Trap with regard to jobs. The fourth is The Inequality Trap with regard to wealth and income. And, the fifth is The Inequality Trap with regard to health and education. First, I will speak regarding inequality trap on States. This is a Union Budget meant for 28 States and 8 Union Territories, but a specific focus on Andhra Pradesh and Bihar shows that this Government is looking to appease its new-found allies. Look at the allotments made for Andhra Pradesh. The allotments made for Bihar and the huge financial package for Andhra Pradesh. We wish the people of Bihar and Andhra Pradesh the best, but can you discriminate against some States and make special provision only for two States simply because you have forged a coalition with these States at the Centre? I have to remind that this is the same Government that went back on its promise of special status for Andhra Pradesh and Bihar. Now, for political convenience, the Government is bestowing largesse on these States. ...*(Interruptions)*... This unequal allotment is against constitutional democracy. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is constitutionally immoral. It is ethically repugnant. It is economically ruinous. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not co-operative federalism. This is discriminatory federalism.

The Finance Minister talked about *Purvodaya*, Look East, Act East. But what is the Government doing in the largest State of eastern India? Bengal is under siege. Bengal is facing an economic blockade. Bengal has not received NREGA funds since December 26, 2021. A massive amount of over rupees one lakh crore is due from the Centre to Bengal. The Finance Minister talked about the PM Awas Yojana, but for Bengal, funds have been withheld under the PM Awas Yojana for 11 lakh sanctioned homes. An amount of Rs.7,000 crore has been withheld from Bengal under the National Food Security Act simply because the Centre wants certain pictures and logos on those centres. Why this economic siege of Bengal? It is not just about Bengal -- my friends from the DMK are here -- it is about Tamil Nadu, it is about

Karnataka, it is about Kerala. My friends from the Shiv Sena (Uddhav Thackeray faction) are here. It is also about Maharashtra. Every citizen, whether he is from Manipur, Maharashtra, Punjab or Kerala, has equal rights on the funds of the Government of India. Why is the federal spirit being compromised? I would like to make a suggestion here. What is needed is a time-bound transparent audit of all the Centrally-sponsored Schemes of the Centre. ...*(Interruptions)*... Will the Government give an assurance to this House of a transparent time-bound audit of all Centrally-sponsored schemes across States? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Samik Bhattacharya, please. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: Sir, the second example of the inequality trap is... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is this? ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: Sir, the second example of the inequality trap ...*(Interruptions)*... The inequality trap in the rural areas... ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, when the Government is asked about legal guarantee for the Minimum Support Price... ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: The Government's economic managers say that it will cost 17 lakh crore of rupees. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second. Hold on. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: Sir, no viability concerns are made ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Samik Bhattacharya. I urge the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to control the Member. This is not the way. ...*(Interruptions)*... Hon. Member, please take your seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is not the way. Why are you interrupting? ...*(Interruptions)*... I do not appreciate interruption. This will not happen. This will



not happen from either side. Please go ahead. She is making her point. It is a well-prepared speech. We may agree, we may not agree. Please go ahead.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: When the Government is asked about the legal guarantee for the Minimum Support Price, the Government's economic managers say, we can't do this; it will cost 17 lakh crores of rupees. But what about the fact that in 2019, the Government gave corporate India tax relief of about one lakh crore of rupees per year. The Home Minister is urging people to invest in the stock market but the poor labourer in Bengal is waiting for his NREGA wages. He does not get his NREGA wages.

No practical steps have been taken in this Budget to make agriculture buoyant. Allocations to agriculture and allied sectors have been reduced to only 3.15 per cent of the total Budget. Subsidies on fuel, food and fertilizers have been slashed. No permanent structure has been created for debt-relief for the farmers. When farmers agitated for the Minimum Support Price, the Government refused to have a dialogue with them. Mr. Chairman, Sir, do you know that just this year alone, 1,200 farmers in Maharashtra have committed suicide and have lost their lives. Why does the Finance Minister not recognize this reality? Today, in spite of the Jal Jeevan Mission hype, 22.5 per cent of the rural households only have access to piped water within their plot and yards throughout the year.

Sir, the third example of The Inequality Trap is jobs and unemployment. It has taken ten years for the Government to wake up to the reality of unemployment. *Amrit Kaal* and *Viksit Bharat* cannot happen without *rojgar*. In this speech, the hon. Finance Minister mentioned 'employment' 23 times. In the Budget for the year 2023-24, she had mentioned 'employment' just three times. At last, she has mentioned the word 'employment'. This is what a rebuff from the voter can do. Since the 2020 lockdown, millions have lost jobs but the Government is in a '*sab changa hai*' mindset. The internship and skilling programme is simply not good enough. It is way too inadequate. It does not address the scale of the problem. A Centrally-sponsored scheme for providing paid internship opportunities in 500 top companies or some rupees as benefit to first time employees is pure advertising and tokenism. It is not going to solve this mammoth problem of unemployment.

Sir, 42 per cent of graduates under the age of 25 can't find a job. The youth make up 80 per cent of India's unemployed. This year, as the hon. Member, Mr. Chidambaram also said, 47 lakh candidates applied for 60,000 constable jobs and 27,000 candidates applied for 600 jobs in Air India. There has not been no massive

push on education to make sure that money is pumped into education, without which lakhs of Indians will remain unemployed.

Sir, hatred, religious hatred is bad for the economy. Religious hatred cannot produce growth. Recently, orders were given to deny livelihood to people on the basis of food habits.

#### **5.00 P.M.**

The Supreme Court has struck it down, but India can only provide jobs when we build social harmony. Joblessness is very high among the disadvantaged communities, among *dalits*, among Muslims. In under privileged groups, joblessness is skyrocketing. There is nothing in this Budget that provides an assurance that the Government of India is standing by India's most disadvantaged citizens. This brings me to my fourth inequality trap, inequality of wealth and income. The Government talks of competition, but we only have oligarchy. We have a booming airline industry but only two operators of note; over a billion mobile subscribers but only three telecom companies. Sir, the rich have lavish celebrations, the rich have lavish weddings, lasting days. But only 50 per cent Indians can afford three square meals. We are at 142 out of 197 in per capita income. The biggest catastrophe of this Government has been the systematic destruction of the MSME sector. According to the Government's own data, more than 35,000 MSMEs have closed down since the Covid pandemic. How does the Government intend to address the income gap when those who are the most vulnerable to changing economic tides are the least protected? What protection is there for the MSMEs in this Budget? None! There has been no change or relief on the 45-day payment rule which is hurting MSMEs, as it is leading to cancellation of orders. Other than a sketchy sentence on rationalizing GST rates, no specific measure has been outlined in this Budget for the revival of the MSMEs. What stops the Government from cushioning MSMEs the way it is cushioning India's top corporates? Income will not rise until the unorganized sector is given the greatest, the top, foremost priority. Prioritize the unorganized sector now. Do it now.

To add to the woes of the ordinary citizens, the Budget has abolished the benefit of indexation, which now means a huge tax burden on all assets acquired before 2001. The burdens of real people have only increased. Wage earners and salaried taxpayers have been given little relief. Three words are not mentioned in this Budget — Railways, minimum support price for farmers and MGNREGA. Why has the Finance Minister not mentioned these three words fundamental to the real people of

India -- MGNREGA, Railways and minimum support price? I propose, as a solution, a dignity index. Let the Government create a dignity index to measure how many are living a life of dignity and aim to create an economy where the maximum number can live a life of dignity.

Sir, the fifth Inequality Trap is of health and education, stagnating or declining allocations to health and education. Health at one per cent and education hovering around two per cent of the GDP. In this Budget, health and education allocations have only gone down. Sir, a shocking statistics for you! The UNICEF has said that India is the second largest country with zero vaccinated children. In 2023, 1.6 million children did not receive any vaccine at all. ...(*Interruptions*)... A UNICEF Report says India is the second largest country of zero vaccinated children. On education, the state of education report says that 25 per cent of 14 to 18 year olds cannot read class 2 texts. An eighteen year old cannot read a class 2 text. That is the reality of education. The Budget shows no awareness of this demographic disaster that is threatening to take over our demographic dividend. Sir, Amartya Sen has said that economic development cannot be sustained without an educated and healthy workforce. A Budget is much more than just numbers. A Budget should reflect the ideals of this august House. This august House reflects the ideals of the constitution of dignity and equality of all. (*Time-bell rings.*) In Bengal, we are respecting dignity, but the Government is not. The Government has to wake up from this bubble and smell the coffee, or rather the *chai*, but without sugar because Indians cannot afford sugar. Sir, we were wanting a Budget for the people. We have got a Budget for the privileged. (*Time-bell rings.*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: This Budget, the Budget of 2024, remains trapped in the inequality trap. Thank you, Sir.

---

### SPECIAL MENTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Special Mentions. Shri H.D. Devegowda. Concern over natural calamities in Karnataka, its neighbouring States and other parts of our country. Shri H.D. Devegowda.