

India -- MGNREGA, Railways and minimum support price? I propose, as a solution, a dignity index. Let the Government create a dignity index to measure how many are living a life of dignity and aim to create an economy where the maximum number can live a life of dignity.

Sir, the fifth Inequality Trap is of health and education, stagnating or declining allocations to health and education. Health at one per cent and education hovering around two per cent of the GDP. In this Budget, health and education allocations have only gone down. Sir, a shocking statistics for you! The UNICEF has said that India is the second largest country with zero vaccinated children. In 2023, 1.6 million children did not receive any vaccine at all. ...*(Interruptions)*... A UNICEF Report says India is the second largest country of zero vaccinated children. On education, the state of education report says that 25 per cent of 14 to 18 year olds cannot read class 2 texts. An eighteen year old cannot read a class 2 text. That is the reality of education. The Budget shows no awareness of this demographic disaster that is threatening to take over our demographic dividend. Sir, Amartya Sen has said that economic development cannot be sustained without an educated and healthy workforce. A Budget is much more than just numbers. A Budget should reflect the ideals of this august House. This august House reflects the ideals of the constitution of dignity and equality of all. *(Time-bell rings.)* In Bengal, we are respecting dignity, but the Government is not. The Government has to wake up from this bubble and smell the coffee, or rather the *chai*, but without sugar because Indians cannot afford sugar. Sir, we were wanting a Budget for the people. We have got a Budget for the privileged. *(Time-bell rings.)*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRIMATI SAGARIKA GHOSE: This Budget, the Budget of 2024, remains trapped in the inequality trap. Thank you, Sir.

---

### SPECIAL MENTIONS

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Special Mentions. Shri H.D. Devegowda. Concern over natural calamities in Karnataka, its neighbouring States and other parts of our country. Shri H.D. Devegowda.

**Concern over natural calamities in Karnataka, its neighbouring States and other parts of the country**

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA (Karnataka): Mr. Chairman, Sir, with your kind permission, I would like to mention about the natural calamity that occurred not only in Karnataka but also in other parts of the country.

In this particular incident, nine people died in Shirur village in Ankola Taluk in Karnataka last week. When this incident took place -- my Congress friends are there -- no Government Minister went to this place. When people died, nobody went there and there was traffic jam. I was watching the proceedings of the House since morning. Sir, I don't want to raise the issue of politics. Politics is a different matter. Tomorrow, I will speak on how coalition Governments functioned in the past. I draw the attention of the House, since you are all elders, only to this issue. Sir, I requested you that tomorrow I will speak on the Budget. Because today I wanted to raise this issue. My friends are sitting here. Today, in the morning, one issue was raised with your kind permission. Somebody raised a point of order. Your good self has said, 'I will give the ruling tomorrow'. I know why you have permitted and with what background, and for the ruling which you are going to give tomorrow, we are waiting. When the hill collapsed, nine people died. It blocked the entire highway. Nobody from the State Government went there for six days. The Heavy Industries and Steel Minister of the Union Government went there. After his visit, the Military was sent by the Union Government. Then the Indian Navy, Fire Brigade, SDRF, NDRF and all these organisations were sent there after the Union Minister visited that part. Sorry! My friends are there. I am not blaming them. You are equally interested. Kharge ji is not here. No State Government Minister went to that part. ...*(Interruptions)*... Only the Union Minister went there with all these organisations and sent them there to remove the dead bodies after the sixth day. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH (Karnataka) : Sir, he is making a political speech here. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: The Chief Minister of Karnataka, after six days, went there. ...*(Interruptions)*... See the fun! This is how Karnataka is functioning. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am not blaming you. I am sorry. ...*(Interruptions)*... I would like to request the hon. Members. You are all senior leaders. You must ask your leader, Khargeji. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is not for me. ...*(Interruptions)*... This is how the Government is functioning.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, we will hear you tomorrow on Budget.

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: Now, my friends, I would like to tell you very frankly that it is not politics. ...*(Interruptions)*... When people died, what was the State Government doing? ...*(Interruptions)*... What is the State Government doing? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Sir, we will hear you tomorrow. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री ईरण्ण कडाडी (कर्नाटक):** वही तो बोल रहे हैं। ..*(व्यवधान)*..

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: I thank the Union Government for sending all the NDRF, Indian Navy, fire brigade, etc. ...*(Interruptions)*... I thank the Union Government for taking necessary steps for the people who were suffering and to have the dead bodies removed. ...*(Interruptions)*... Today evening, it has been allowed after ten days. This is the position. ...*(Interruptions)*... Through hon. Chairman, Sir, I would like to bring this to the notice of the hon. House. I am grateful to you for having allowed me to speak. Thank you very much. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The hon. Member, Dr. Sasmit Patra (Odisha) associated himself with the Special Mention raised by the hon. Member, Shri H.D. Devegowda. ...*(Interruptions)*...

I will allow you. ...*(Interruptions)*... First, everyone has to take seat. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take your seats. I will call you. Mr. Tiruchi Siva wants to raise a point of order. Please raise it.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA (Tamil Nadu): Sir, Special Mention means that we have to give it in writing well before and it is vetted and approved by the Secretariat. No word other than what is there in the admitted Special Mention should be read or spoken but he is giving a speech. All those things should be expunged other than what has been in the Special Mention.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी (राजस्थान):** सभापति जी, इस पर एक स्पेसिफिक प्रोविज़न है।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You read the provision. Mr. Pramod Tiwari, you raise your point of order and read the provision which you are invoking.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** ठीक है।

सभापति जी, मैं सिर्फ यह कह रहा हूँ कि मैंने जो बुक में पढ़ा है, वही बता रहा हूँ।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You will have to read. ...*(Interruptions)*... Pramodji, you will have to. ...*(Interruptions)*... Okay. He is raising a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Saket, please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Are you raising a point of order?

SHRI SANDOSH KUMAR P (Kerala): Sir, actually, I would like to associate myself with Mr. Tiruchi Siva. Provisions and procedures are equal to all the Members. What is so special about the former Prime Minister? When the question of Special Mention comes, it is equally applicable to all the Members and we all follow that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order?

SHRI SANDOSH KUMAR P: Sir, I am just associating myself with Mr. Tiruchi Siva.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So, it is very simple. You are supporting Mr. Tiruchi Siva, a senior Member of the House. So, this is not a point of order. This can be summarily decided right now. ...*(Interruptions)*... No. Mr. Randeep, you will have to avail the opportunity in your own right. You are getting a support. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA (Rajasthan): Sir, you said that you will give me a chance. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: With your kind permission, Sir, .....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes; one minute. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE (WEST BENGAL): Sir, point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: He is raising first. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Sir, we all respect the office of the former Prime Minister.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. Mr. Randeep, you are raising a point of order.

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Absolutely, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Raise the point of order.

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Yes, Sir. Sir, my point of order...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Number one, specify the rule and give the situation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JAIRAM RAMESH: Sir, you know the rule, you know the situation. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: Sir, with your kind permission, we all respect the office of the former Prime Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... In this case, he has been elected with the support of the Congress Party. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: This is an allegation. ...*(Interruptions)*... Don't make.. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, Mr. Surjewala. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record unless you raise a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Surjewala, you will have to raise the point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI RANDEEP SINGH SURJEWALA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Nothing will go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes, Mr. Pramod Tiwari. ...*(Interruptions)*... He is on his

---

\* Not recorded.

legs. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sit down, I am here. ...*(Interruptions)*... Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, Rule 180A. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, it is Rule 180A. ...*(Interruptions)*... Please take the book. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The book is with me, Mr. Tiwari. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Sir, please read Rule 180.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, Rule 180.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** "कोई सूचना ग्राह्य हो सके, इसके लिए उसमें निम्नलिखित शर्तें पूरी की जाएंगी, अर्थात् :

- (i) इसके साथ विशेष उल्लेख का पाठ, जो कि 250 शब्दों से अधिक न हो, संलग्न होगा;
- (ii) वह किसी ऐसे विषय से संबंधित नहीं होगा जो मुख्यतः भारत सरकार का विषय न हो;
- (iii) उसमें किसी ऐसे विषय का उल्लेख नहीं होगा जिस पर उसी सत्र में चर्चा हो चुकी हो अथवा जो सत्र के दौरान इस नियम के अधीन किसी सदस्य द्वारा पहले ही उठाये गये...

MR. CHAIRMAN: You come to the point. I have read the Rule. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI PRAMOD TIWARI: Let me read, Sir. You insisted.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, I insisted. You have indicated the Rule. Now, come to the fact situation. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will give you opportunity. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, आपकी रूलिंग सबके ऊपर होती है। इस पर भी आपकी रूलिंग रही है कि जो लिखा गया है, सिर्फ वही पढ़ा जाएगा। न उसमें कुछ ऐड किया जा सकता है, न डिलीट किया जा सकता है। मान्यवर, मैं बड़ी देर से, ध्यान से फॉर्मर प्राइम मिनिस्टर को सुन रहा था। जो लिखा है, वह उन्होंने पढ़ा नहीं। \*

---

\* Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: This will not go on record. ...*(Interruptions)*... Pramodji. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** मेरा मेन ऑब्जेक्शन यह है कि जो लिखा नहीं था, वह पढ़ कैसे रहे थे?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay. ...*(Interruptions)*... Do you want to say? ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** दूसरी बात, स्टेट गवर्नमेंट के बारे में है। How can he mention? मेरा एक अनुरोध है कि इसे एक्सपंज किया जाए, कार्यवाही से निकाला जाए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: One minute. ...*(Interruptions)*... You have had your way and say, both. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** ठीक है, सर।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You have had your way and say, both. Now, Mr. Saket Gokhale, before you use your lung power and vocal chords.....*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: No, no. I have a mic now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Do one thing. Specify a rule.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Yes, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: And, in all dignity, raise your point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Sir,.....*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: I will decide. ...*(Interruptions)*... I will decide, don't bother. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am getting everybody's views. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री साकेत गोखले:** सर, आप मुझे बोलने से पहले करेक्ट करते हैं। बोलने के बाद कीजिए न।

**श्री सभापति:** मेरे को डायरेक्शन मत दीजिए न! It will be better for you to go by my direction. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Sir, Rule 180B. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Rule 180B? Is it the same as Mr. Pramod Tiwari read?  
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: No, no. I am coming to a specific point, Sir.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes. Which provision of it are you invoking?

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: It is the first one, the sub-clause (i).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: It is about Special Mentions: "It shall be accompanied by a text of the special mention not exceeding 250 words." That is (i) I am referring to. उसके बाद में number (iv), "It shall not raise more than one issue and the issue shall not pertain to trivial matters;"

MR. CHAIRMAN: Yes, fine.

**श्री साकेत गोखले:** उसके बाद में number (v), "It shall not contain arguments, inferences, ironical expressions, imputations, epithets or defamatory statements;"

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have read it. Come to your point now.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Now, the point is, in terms of average word per minute of an average speaker, 250 words is roughly about four minutes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Three.

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: It is two to three minutes. This is number one. Number two, about the text, we all submit Special Mentions. The text has to be adhered too. So, with due respect, I would like to request you to kindly expunge the remarks made by the hon. former Prime Minister, Mr. Devegowda.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Is it a point of order?

SHRI SAKET GOKHALE: Yes, Sir.



MR. CHAIRMAN: Okay, heard it. Now, Shri Bhupender Yadav, hon. Minister. Bhupenderji, Shri Pramod Tiwari, a very experienced Member, has made his reflections. I expect on an issue.... *...(Interruptions)...* One minute. *...(Interruptions)...* Can't you have patience? I allowed all who wanted to speak. Hon. Minister, I said... *...(Interruptions)...* Mr. Tiruchi Siva has raised a point which is very important that an hon. Minister of the Union cannot, even with the permission of the Chair, reflect on an issue. *...(Interruptions)...* So, I have called him. Yes, Mr. Bhupender Yadav. *...(Interruptions)...*

**पर्यावरण, वन और जलवायु परिवर्तन मंत्री (श्री भूपेन्द्र यादव) :** सर, आप बहुत अच्छे तरीके से संचालन करते हैं और आप एक लंबे समय के लिए नियम प्रतिपादित कर सकते हैं। मैं आपसे निवेदन करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूँ। सर, रूल 235 से 238 में यह बताया गया है कि सदस्य जब बोलें, तो कैसा व्यवहार करना चाहिए। जो खुद ही किसी सदस्य को डिस्टर्ब कर रहे हों, क्या उनको प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर मांगने का अधिकार है, इसको स्पष्ट कीजिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: One second.

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** सर, जो मैंने बोला है, वह आपकी परमिशन से बोला है। किसी मंत्री को यह अधिकार नहीं है कि वह चेयरमैन की रूलिंग पर सवाल उठाए। ये आपकी रूलिंग पर, जो आपने परमिट किया था और बोला था, उस पर सवाल उठा रहे हैं। इसलिए आप इनको डांटिए। *...(व्यवधान)...* सर, इनको डांटिए।

MR. CHAIRMAN: You want me to decide this also! *...(Interruptions)...*

**श्री प्रमोद तिवारी:** साहब, इनको डांटिए। *...(व्यवधान)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: No; Mr. Tiwari, you want me to decide this also. One second. *...(Interruptions)...* Yes, Devegowdaji. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: The hon. Minister will co-operate.

**श्री सभापति:** देवेगौड़ा जी, आप बैठकर बोलिए, we have respect for your age.

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: Sir, with your kind permission... *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: But, please speak while sitting. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI H.D. DEVEGOWDA: Sir, in the 60 years of political career, I have never used unparliamentary language either in the Assembly or in the Lok Sabha or in the Rajya Sabha. I know my limitations. I have not hurt anybody. I have only spoken facts. ...*(Interruptions)*... Even after six days, the State Government, the Chief Minister or the Minister nobody has gone there. Is it an unparliamentary word? Let the hon. Chairman give the ruling on this issue. If at all, I have made any mistake, I withdraw. I have no hesitation. I don't want to learn from these friends. Let me be honest. I know my limitations. I never hurt anybody. I only mention the facts. I have never used unparliamentary words. I am so sorry. I would like to submit this for your kind permission. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: \*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing will be going on record. ...*(Interruptions)*...

Mr. Nagar, don't address the Chair while sitting. You are a physically fit person and you have on your right side someone who knows the rules in and out. So, please don't. ...*(Interruptions)*... It is a serious matter. Therefore,... ...*(Interruptions)*... Now, Mr. Tiruchi Siva.

SHRI TIRUCHI SIVA: Sir, we have not said that he has mentioned any unparliamentary words. We said that it didn't confine with the rules. Rule 180B (v) says, "It shall not contain arguments, inferences, ironical expressions, imputations, epithets or defamatory statements." That is Special Mention. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I have looked into everything and hon. Members are, particularly, agitated on one aspect that Special Mention is a mechanism whereby a Member has to adhere to the script. What hon. Members, perhaps, missed in this case, you will get in my decision on this point of order. Secondly, all Members of this House are respectable. They deserve respect. But to make an observation at former Prime Minister is unfortunate. We have leaders in all parties, we respect them. We respect them not because others are not equal to them. We respect them; we have a civilization, we believe in a culture. If Mr. Pramod Tiwari rises, I look at him because he has nine years continued membership in the Assembly and here. I look at Mr. Mukul Wasnik. I look at Mr. Digvijaya Singh as Chief Minister for ten years. I look at Mr. Praful Patel having had...*(Interruptions)*... Mr. Jairam is

---

\* Not recorded.

young. Mr. Jairam is young enough not to get into this big league. ...*(Interruptions)*... As a matter of fact, this issue was raised, in my Chamber and otherwise, by Mr. Raghav Chadha, who is raising the hand, and he wanted to claim parity. Now, let me tell you with my little experience. All are equal in the family also. All are equal when you go to cast vote also. But in the family, you know whose respect is more. You don't expect me, when the hon. former Prime Minister, before saying anything, had sought my leave. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, he sought my leave and he is fully aware of the authority of the Chairman. Now I will give my ruling. I *prima facie* find no transgression. But I will give my ruling when I have to tie my hands and tie my feet and run this House, even when I feel that there is a person of stature. There are occasions when ignoring the rule and invoking my authority, I granted permission to Khargeji. Now would you ask me under what rule, I granted him permission today? ...*(Interruptions)*... It was not a point of order. It was granted because he is entitled, and this is what I had said in the very beginning. So hon. Members, bear with me. You will get a ruling day after. Now Shri Ayodhya Rami Reddy Alla; demand for unified law on industrial accidents in India.

### **Demand for Unified Law on Industrial Accidents in India**

SHRI AYODHYA RAMI REDDY ALLA (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, industrial workers are the backbone of industrialized India, and their safety must be a top priority. The consequences of industrial accidents are devastating, including loss of life, environmental damage, economic disruptions and psychological trauma.

(MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN *in the Chair.*)

Incidents like the Bhopal Gas Tragedy and the recent Thane explosion that claimed eleven lives underscore the need for a comprehensive regulatory reform. According to the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA), there have been over 130 significant chemical accidents in the last decade, resulting in more than 250 fatalities. These incidents reveal serious gaps in our safety regulations and enforcement. Currently, industrial safety is governed by 15 acts and 19 rules, leading to overlapping jurisdictions and weak enforcement. This fragmented approach results in significant gaps in oversight and safety measures. Moreover, the absence of a comprehensive chemical risk database hampers effective hazard assessment and the development of safety protocols. Insufficient worker training and poor investment in safety infrastructure, often due to cost-cutting measures, further exacerbate the