

Shri Khan Ghufuran Zahidi associated with the Special Mention of Shrimati Ambika Soni.

Prof. M. Sankaralingam-Demand for erecting enclave structure to stop sea erosion.

Prof. Saif-Ud-Din Soz- Request for resuming regular flights to and from Srinagar.

Shri C.Perumal-Need to convert Salem-Tirupathur-Vaniyambadi State Highway into National Highway.

Shrimati Saroj Dubey- Absent.

Shri Suresh Pachouri-Malnourishment among children in the country.

Shri B.J. Panda- Absent.

Dr. T. Subbarami Reddy- Absent.

Shri A. Vijaya Raghavan- Absent.

---

#### MATTERS RAISED WITH PERMISSION OF CHAIR

##### **Reported Interview given by the erstwhile Chairman of the JPC on Stock**

##### **Market Scam**

**श्री सभापति:** माननीय सदस्यगण, मुझे विपक्ष के नेता ने और बाकी सदस्यों ने कहा है कि JPC की रिपोर्ट के संबंध में कुछ बातें वे कहना चाहते हैं। JPC की रिपोर्ट कल यहां पेश हो चुकी है, अब JPC का न कोई मेंबर है, न कोई चेयरमैन है, जो मेंबर हैं, वे दूसरे हाऊस के हैं। अगर आप लोग इस बारे में कुछ कहना चाहते हैं तो मुझे कोई आपत्ति नहीं है। आप संक्षेप में इस संबंध में अपनी टिप्पणी कर सकते हैं।

**श्री संजय निरूपम (महाराष्ट्र):** सभापति महोदय, कृपया और भी सदस्यों को इस पर बोलने की अनुमति दें।

**श्री सभापति:** जब JPC की रिपोर्ट पर चर्चा होगी, तब सभी लोग बोल सकते हैं।

**श्री संजय निरूपम:** सभापति जी, हम भी उस रिपोर्ट पर कुछ महत्वपूर्ण प्वाइंट यहां रखना चाहते हैं। हमें इसकी अनुमति प्रदान करें।

**श्री सभापति:** जब रिपोर्ट पर चर्चा होगी, तब महत्वपूर्ण प्वाइंट सामने आएगा ... (व्यवधान)...यहां तो क्वेश्चन बिल्कुल छोटा सा है, जो आप सुनें तो पता लग जाएगा।

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL (Bihar) : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am grateful to you for having given me the opportunity to raise this particular issue. As we saw on the electronic media yesterday, as well as in the print media this morning, the erstwhile Chairman of the JPC seems to have stated publicly that the JPC has given a clean chit to the former Minister of Finance, Shri Yashwant Sinha. I just want to clarify and state for the record that the JPC has done nothing of the kind. In fact, Mr. Chairman, the report is replete with instances of the acts of commission and omission by the Ministry of Finance. And, as you know, Mr. Chairman Sir, there cannot be a Ministry without a Minister. There is no ghost over the Ministry of Finance, he is a real person, and he happens to be Shri Yashwant Sinha, who was the then Minister of Finance....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI BALBIR K. PUNJ (Uttar Pradesh) : Mr. Chairman, he is saying  
that based on the newspaper report.....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL : I have heard it myself.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let him speak.

**श्री संजय निरूपम:** चेयरमेन सर, इसका अर्थ यह है कि ..... (**व्यवधान**)...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया** झारखंड : सर, मुझे भी बोलने की अनुमति दी जाए। इसमें मुझे .....(**व्यवधान**)

**श्री सभापति:** आप बैठिए।....(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL : Mr. Chairman Sir, I don't say this myself. We are governed by the principles of Cabinet responsibility, ministerial responsibility, and I only quote for the record, the statement and the finding, and the principle set out in the report itself. I will quote paragraphs 2.8, 13.46 and 13.47 of the report, on ministerial responsibility, so that ..... (*Interruptions*) ..

MR. CHAIRMAN : When the report is taken up for discussion, the matter should be raised at that point of time.

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL : Sir, I am not raising a contentious issue. I am only.... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM (Uttaranchal) : You are quoting from  
the report.

SHRI KAPIL SIBAL : For the erstwhile Chairman to say that we have given a clean chit to the erstwhile Finance Minister, is contrary to the

record, because we have not given a clean chit. The fact is that we have held the Ministry directly responsible for the acts of omission and commission. And therefore, the point that I am making is this-- I quote just one sentence - "the Ministry of Finance, in our scheme of constitutional jurisprudence, is responsible for the financial health of the economy, including sectors regulated by statutory and other regulators." The regulators are accountable to the Ministry of Finance, which, in turn, is responsible to Parliament. Accountability must go hand-in-hand with autonomy, and the principles governing the responsibility of the Minister of Finance.

All I am saying, Sir, is for the erstwhile Chairman to say -- when the Ministry is responsible to Parliament, through the Minister - that we have not named the Minister, is, in fact, Sir, accepting the report, that the Ministry is responsible, and the Minister is responsible. And, contrary to the report, to go public, shows that there is an utter disregard of the principles, which the committee itself accepted in its report.

श्री एस०एस० अहलुवालिया: मुझे भी कुछ बात करनी है। (व्यवधान)...

श्री सभापति: क्या बात करेंगे आप। आप बात मत करिए। (व्यवधान)...

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया: मैं भी कई समितियों का (व्यवधान)...

**MR. CHAIRMAN :** : मैं ऐसा समझता हूँ कि ऐसी कोई बात करने की आवश्यकता नहीं है। ....(व्यवधान) The matter ends *there....*{*Interruptions*}

.....

#### **Opening of Retail Sector to F.D.I**

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Sir, I am very thankful to you for giving me the opportunity to speak. I am constrained to raise this issue at this point in time, because I got the report last night, and there was no scope for a Special Mention. Sir, I draw the attention of the House, through you, to the very serious development regarding opening up of the retail sector to FDI. We have pointed out during the mid-year review discussion also, that employment is a major concern of this country. But the Government, it appears, is changing its stand. The Special Group of Planning Commission, headed by Dr. S. P. Gupta, recommended in May, 2002, that no FDI in retail trade should be allowed, as it would have an adverse impact on employment. This is on page 123 of the report, which says, "Special Group on targeting 10 million employment opportunities per year, Government of India, Planning Commission." Then, the Group of Ministers, based itself on the recommendations of Ministry of Consumer